### POLICY AND INTERGOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS COMMITTEE

**Council of the County of Maui** 

#### **MINUTES**

### **January 31, 2014**

### Council Chamber, 8th Floor

**RECONVENE:** 9:05 a.m.

**PRESENT:** Councilmember G. Riki Hokama, Chair

Councilmember Donald G. Couch, Jr., Vice-Chair (In 1:30 p.m.)

Councilmember Gladys C. Baisa, Member Councilmember Elle Cochran, Member

Councilmember Stacy Crivello, Member (Out 1:30 p.m.)

Councilmember Don S. Guzman, Member

Councilmember Mike White, Member (Out 12:00 p.m.)

**EXCUSED:** Councilmember Robert Carroll, Member

Councilmember Michael P. Victorino, Member

**STAFF:** Carla Nakata, Legislative Attorney

Tammy M. Frias, Committee Secretary

Ella Alcon, Council Aide, Molokai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

Tina Thompson, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Crivello, assisting at Molokai

Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

Denise Fernandez, Council Aide, Lanai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

Dawn Lono, Council Aide, Hana Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

**ADMIN.:** Richelle M. Thomson, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation

Counsel

Edward S. Kushi, Jr., First Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation

Counsel

**OTHERS:** Maui testifiers:

Sunny Savage-Luskin

Wesley Bissen, Hawaiian Commercial & Sugar Co.

John Fitzpatrick Valerie Sapourn

Lucienne de Naie, Conservation Chair, Sierra Club Hawaii

Leona R. Wilson Ryan Brooke Shayne Edelhertz Astrid Senturia Faith Eubank Ann Evans

Unmani Cynthia Groves

#### January 31, 2014

Courtney Bruch, Director, GMO Free Maui

Amy Chang

Dr. Joe Ritter

Benny Ramos, Jr.

Jerry Edlao

Stephen West

Olaf Behrendt

Stephanie Constantino

Michelle Kwik

Kelley A. Janes, Aloha Food Scapes

Bill Greenleaf, President, Maui Farmers Union

**Gerry Ross** 

Jim Smith

Mark Strathmann

David Fisher, Principal, Maui Venture Consulting, LLC

Claire Florio

Lloyd Fischel, Secretary, Maui Beekeepers Association

Courtney Swanson

Paul Garrett Hugel, Maui Scientific Analysis & Visualization of the Environment Program

Malia Cahill

Lorrin Pang

Gerry Dameron, Vice President of Business Development, Bright Energy

Glenda Frederick

Joseph Kohn

Glenn Larson, President, Maui Beekeepers Association

Sierra Knight

Carol Reimann, Community & Governmental Affairs Manager, Monsanto Co.

Officer Aylett Wallwork, Department of Police

Officer Marjorie-Ann Kahookele-Pea, Department of Police

Additional attendees on Maui: Approximately 20 individuals

<u>Hana testifier (via telephone conference bridge)</u>:

Eileen Comeaux

Molokai testifiers (via telephone conference bridge):

Kali Arce

David K. Makaiwi III

Johnathan Kauwenaole

Bronson Manaba

Cory Jones

Kalai Maliu

Carl Healani Adolpho III

Mapuana Kansana

#### January 31, 2014

Liane Kalima

Helena Miguel

Collette "Coco" Augustiro

Jason Matayoshi

**Audwin Calairo** 

William Casino

Alex Mangayayam

Melvin Spencer, Jr.

Felipe Ragonton

Jose Avila

Christopher Kaauwai

Jolenta Duvauchelle

Eric Lacar

Aristotle Oamil

Andrew K. Arce

Phyllis A. Starkey

Tyra Reyes

Jae Won Perez

Iponohea Nahoopii-Kaauawai

Lionel Adachi

Timothy O. Crawford

Gene Albino

Jay Duquette

Keola mau loa o Hawaiiloa Mowat

Hoala Davis

Moses Phillips, Jr.

Keith Suafoa

Roshani Nash

Kanoe Davis

Cherie Dudoit-Galam

Mercy Ritte

Jireh Torres-Umi

Charlton Wallace, Jr.

Walter Ritte

Loretta Ritte

Maria Balangatan

Juliet Tangonan

Leanda Duvauchelle-Rawlins

Delfin Rabara Sr.

Sid Bicoy

Wanette Lee

Cheryl Pritchard

Judy Caparida

#### January 31, 2014

**PRESS:** Melissa Tanji, *The Maui News* 

Akaku--Maui County Community Television, Inc.

------

#### ITEM PIA-58: PESTICIDES AND GENETICALLY MODIFIED ORGANISMS (CC 13-381)

CHAIR HOKAMA: ...(gavel)... This meeting shall return to order. This is the continuation of a recessed meeting that we started I believe on January 29<sup>th</sup>...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Twenty-eighth.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Twenty-eighth. I stand corrected. This is...today the 31<sup>st</sup> of January 2014. So this is the 4,712<sup>th</sup> year in our Chinese calendar. So Kung Hei Fat Choy.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Kung Hei Fat Choy.

CHAIR HOKAMA: ...(inaudible)...

#### ...CONTINUATION OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY...

CHAIR HOKAMA: So as we start the New Year on the Asian calendar, let us start again anew with this item, Policy 58. We'll check with our Hana Office. Ms. Lono, is there anyone wishing to provide testimony at the Hana Office, please?

MS. LONO: Good morning, Chair. This is Dawn Lono at the Hana Office. I have no one at this time but I have had several people indicate they will be coming in today.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much. Lanai, any testifiers?

MS. FERNANDEZ: Good morning, Chair. This is Denise Fernandez on Lanai and there is no one waiting to testify.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much. Molokai, do you have testifiers available, please?

MS. ALCON: Good morning, Chair. This is Ella Alcon on Molokai and my first testifier is Kali Arce.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

MS. ARCE: Good morning and aloha, Committee Chair Hokama, Vice-Chair Couch and respected Council members. My name is Kali Arce. I am here in opposition of the bill. I have been around agriculture all my life. Sugar cane grew behind our Ewa Beach house. I spent summers on Molokai with my grandparents who worked in the pineapple plantations. My father and brothers worked in the pineapple plantations on both Lanai and Molokai. My bachelor's degree is in agriculture. What better career to go into but agriculture. I have worked in this industry for

#### January 31, 2014

30 years in many capacities. Twenty-one of those years I worked right here on Molokai where I've lived most of my life. Today I work for Monsanto. Monsanto uses chemicals responsibly and comply with the State of Hawaii and Federal government regulations. Every day there's verbal notification given to our employees of chemical application and the restricted entry interval times. Our 30-day log is always current and displayed in a central area for anyone to see because it is a State law. All our employees are trained annually in worker protection standards which is an EPA regulation. Our spray applicators are properly licensed with the State of Hawaii. We only use pesticides, herbicides and fungicides licensed with the State of Hawaii. Everything we use can be found on the store shelf. This bill will be duplicating what is already in place with the State of Hawaii, Department of Agriculture. The creation and implementation of a County agency would cost enormous money. This bill is also discriminatory. We produce seeds. We do not test chemicals. Genetically modified crops require less pesticides, less herbicides, less water and are more resistant to diseases. There is no scientific data that proves these crops are harmful. What is wrong with feeding the world? Our crops are also used in most products such as clothing, soda, popcorn, tofu, tires, toothpaste, drywall, cosmetics, oils and animal feed, to name a few. This bill is not pono for Maui County. It is anti-agriculture. Please consider those of us who work in the agriculture industry. Again, I ask that you please do not pass this bill. Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Do I see any questions for the testifier, Members? Having none, thank you very much for your thoughts this morning. Ella, next testifier, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is David Makaiwi.

MR. MAKAIWI: Aloha, Committee Chair Hokama, Vice-Chair Couch and Council members. My name is David K. Makaiwa III, and I'm a fifth generation Hoolehua homesteader and farmer and I am proud to work and farm for Monsanto Molokai. I oppose the bill. And with that said, I would like to say is that this bill is ridiculous. It is my opinion that pesticides are used safely every day for all farmers. They are only dangerous when misused and used improperly. Some of the supporters of this bill trespass in our fields with their families and children. Why are they doing this if they are so afraid of pesticides? Agriculture is the life of Molokai. That's why we are all known...that's why we are known as the Molokai Farmers. GMO is a product of science and I feel that this bill is a big putdown to science and the children who would like to become scientists and to learn and study biotechnology. They must create and come up with new ideas for the future. Science is the past, the present and the future and I stand up for the seed companies and agriculture. Kill this bill. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your comments this morning. Any questions, Members? Having none, thank you very much. Ms. Alcon, next Molokai testifier.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Jonathan Kauwenaole.

MR. KAUWENAOLE: Honorable Committee Chair Hokama, Vice-Chair Couch and respected Council members. Aloha, my name is Jonathan Kauwenaole. I have been a resident of Molokai for more

#### January 31, 2014

than 34 years. Monsanto is my employer and I'm a licensed restricted-use pesticide applicator. I hold the title of Sprayer Operator. I work with pesticides every day. Are they dangerous? Of course they are if used improperly. Monsanto is diligent in making sure that their Sprayer Operators are well-educated and trained in order to exercise properly handling of all pesticides being used. Every Sprayer Operator employed at Monsanto has passed an exam that is given by the State of Hawaii in order to perform their job duties efficiently. It's essential for all Sprayer Operators to know the laws and regulations of every chemical being used. Our knowledge and good judgment allows us to do our jobs safely. We are aware of wind factors and we never spray when drift is a potential hazard. We never overapply what is needed and always read every label to exercise professional handling of chemicals. Chemical companies are mandated to place labels on every product they make. This is why labels are very important. Labels are there for a reason, to ensure our safety. It allows us to use products that could be harmful to us in a safe manner. One label that is often overlooked and ignored is cigarettes. On every cigarette box there's a Surgeon General's warning telling consumers that cigarettes cause lung cancer, heart disease, emphysema and may complicate pregnancies. Yet people still smoke and purchase cigarettes on a daily basis. They smoke in their homes, cars, around children, in the community or while pregnant. Common household products such as batteries, jewelry, energy efficient light bulbs, flashlights and toys are known to contain harmful chemicals to humans. Yet people still allow them in their homes. As a licensed pesticide applicator, I am trained to be in compliance with every label on every chemical that I spray. I never overlook or ignore any label when it comes to applications. I'm responsible for the safety and welfare of my coworkers, our community and myself. Every application is in compliance with the laws and regulations under the State of Hawaii, documented and reported on the State and Federal level. Why should it be reported to the County? Can the County afford to pass this bill?

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. KAUWENAOLE: Where is the funding for this bill going to come from? Taxpayers, budget cuts, furloughs? Try buy local. I hear it all the time. Try buy local, try buy local. If this bill is passed, it will eliminate local farmers. They won't be able to downsize because of the buffer zone. This would jeopardize their operations because it is not feasible. If you pass this bill, say goodbye to the local farmers. Imported produce will be on its way. Imported produce will mean higher costs for consumers.

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

- MR. KAUWENAOLE: Who are the consumers that will pay the price? It's us, it's our community. Is this the risk we are willing to take? I humbly ask you that you do not pass this bill and keep local farmers in business. Thank you.
- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your thoughts this morning. Any questions for the testifier, Members? Having none, thank you very much for being on Molokai this morning. Ella, one more, please?

#### January 31, 2014

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Bronson Manaba.

MR. MANABA: Good morning all. I'd like to thank you for your patience and this opportunity to speak. I've worked with chemicals before including muriatic acid and small fumigation pesticides for killing roaches in my home. And haven't we all used Windex or Clorox and filled the tank with fossil fuels or gasoline? Haven't we swam in public pools containing chlorine? We all live with poison every day, yet more of us walk every day. People get sick today and people got sick thousand years before which lead to the creation of modern medicine. There are people allergic to peanuts and shellfish but no bill aims to eliminate them. It's possible that some could be allergic to small amounts of chemicals. If that's so, medication should be developed to aid their immune system in this growing age. I waited months to finally hear that I was accepted to Monsanto, a company that cares a lot for the safety of their employees be it pesticides, heavy machinery, et cetera. There are enough rules and regulations regarding pesticides used by farmers and the proof is the trillions of products consumed and the good health of my fellow employees...coworkers. I love my job which helps me support my family. Please consider us, the farmers. Sincerely, Bronson Manaba.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank very much for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman, Members? Having none, thank you very much. We'll start with the Chambers. Sunny Savage-Luskin? And following Ms. Luskin is a Wesley Bissen.

MS. SAVAGE-LUSKIN: Good morning.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Good morning.

MS. SAVAGE-LUSKIN: Good morning. Thank you, Chair, for having me. Everyone else, good morning. I am in strong support of this bill, the amended version. For many years, I have been harvesting from a wild plant called elder. After eating this tree, making medicine, herbal medicine from this tree and educating multiple people in my community about this tree, it was recently heavily sprayed. And I lost the elder. I didn't need a bachelor's of science degree in Dietetics which I have. I didn't need a master's degree in Nutrition Education which I have and I didn't need an Environmental and Public Health Impact Study to know that those chemicals would harm my unborn child and myself. There was death there and, you know, if we poison the land, we poison ourselves. So I only share that story not to diverge from this bill's vision of simply allowing for our right to know, accountability and buffer zones to sensitive areas but as the common sense that I have as a mother that tells me that restricted-use pesticides that are applied in large quantities in full-body suits and that have serious health risk warnings on their labels will have long-term seriously negative impacts during not only our lifetime but that of my unborn child's. My degrees' work at the Center for Food Safety in Washington, D.C. and personal research have revealed numerous peer-reviewed journal articles exposing the deleterious effects of these chemicals and GMOs. Many will provide you with specific journals to support this and please feel free to contact me if you'd like any more information. But I came here as a mother today of this unborn child. I have other children but for this one and I just...I feel that this is a multi-billion dollar industry. In particular Monsanto is, you know, paying their

#### January 31, 2014

employees to testify and I just...I wonder, you know, did they provide research that showed DDT was safe? Was there research that showed Orange Agent was safe? We can't always rely on the research. And so I'm really imploring you to use common sense in realizing that your oath to protect the land and its people is real. And it's more about, you know, it's more than economics and job security which is incredibly important. I mean I grow a lot of my own food. I go to the farmers' market every weekend and it pains me to hear this reaching out that this is harmful to agriculture. I mean how much sugar cane...

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. SAVAGE-LUSKIN: Could I request a little bit more time?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Sure.

MS. SAVAGE-LUSKIN: How much sugar cane, how much GMO seed and how many pineapples can we eat? That's not local food security. That's exports, some that stays here and it doesn't really account for real sustainability. So anyways, I just, you know, for this unborn child, for future generations and for all of us, I just really implore you to use common sense when making your decisions. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Any questions for the lady on her testimony, Members? Thank you very much for being here this morning.

MS. SAVAGE-LUSKIN: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Wesley Bissen, please. And following Mr. Bissen is a John Fitzpatrick.

MR. BISSEN: Good morning.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Good morning.

MR. BISSEN: Thank you for the opportunity to speak on this bill. I know that some of the supporters of this bill have said that employees of the farm and plantation that the proposed restrictions will impact are just parrots or have been threatened with our jobs unless we oppose this bill. I try not to let these negative comments affect me, but I thought it was important to look Council members in the face and tell you that I'm not a parrot. I'm proud of...to be an employee of HC&S, Hawaiian Commercial and Sugar. HC&S did not threaten me with my job. The people who support this bill are threatening me. And if I'm going to be criticized for my loyalty to my company, then that's fine. Please don't dismiss what the people who work in the farms, fields, factories and ranches have to say. We're here because the Council has asked us to come forward and let them know how this bill affects us. It's hard for working people to come here to express our views and I would hope that everyone in this room could show a little more aloha. Thank you.

#### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony, Mr. Bissen. Any questions for the gentlemen? Having none, thank you very much for being here. Okay, let's...this is, again, not an arena. Keep that applause down. Mr. Fitzgerald [sic] and after him we have a Valerie Sapourn, S-A-P-O-U-R-N.

MR. FITZPATRICK: Aloha, my name is John Fitzpatrick. I was born and raised here on the island. I went to Makawao Elementary School. I graduated from St. Anthony. I have my B.S. in Marine Biology and my Master's in Zoology. I currently...for the last four years I've been teaching Oceanography, Biology, Environmental Ecology and Conservation at the College and a few of my students are here today and I'm really proud of that. Okay, I'm here today to represent myself though and to speak for the health of my family, my friends, my community and my unborn children and grandchildren that will face the decisions you make here today. I'm here to raise my voice in strong support of any bill that allows me to know what chemicals are being sprayed, when they're being sprayed and how much are being sprayed on our aina and what genetically modified organisms are being grown here. We deserve to know. Furthermore, I fully support buffer zones that prevent companies from spraying these harmful, restricted-use pesticides within 500 feet of schools, residential housing, hospitals, our families and our children. If you guys wanna do an alternative, learn how to grow organic in these buffer zones. You can still grow organic there. I feel this way because it is common sense. Go home and ask your children, nieces and nephews and grandchildren if they want to be sprayed by harmful chemicals or forced to drink them. First I'd like to address pesticide use. The problem is real. Pesticides are endocrine disrupters designed to kill insects and plants. Humans are also affected by them. If you don't believe me, ask yourself why the Haiku Well is open...is not open to drinking or applicators wear suits. One of my oceanography students was directly affected by the exposure to atrazine and had to have her ovaries which were riddled with tumors removed. This problem's real and HC&S still uses atrazine on our fields right here in our backyard. To Mr. Watanabe, just because the water is already contaminated with pesticides doesn't mean we should be able to add more pesticides to it. To those who work for Mycogen on Molokai, ignorance is bliss until you're the one that has a child born with fetal gastroschisis, you have prostate cancer or you have ovarian cancer and you or your children are deathly ill. Just so you know, when your child is born with gastroschisis, their intestines are outside their body. Here's a few pictures of it. It's not pretty, okay. There was a testimony on Kauai with a person affected with this same disease. Second, although GMOs have potential for feeding the world --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. FITZPATRICK: --reducing malnutrition, I'd like to express my opposition to them because the pros don't outweigh the cons. The fact is that Monsanto can't control their GMOs. Do a Google search. Their GMO crops have contaminated organic crops worldwide. In addition they have sued 144 farmers and settled out of court with 700 other farmers which say they steal...they stole their intellectual property and after accidentally contaminating a farm. I can go on and on about this subject but simply don't have the time.

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

#### January 31, 2014

MR. FITZPATRICK: To our small farmers on this island and Molokai that oppose this bill despite not being affected at all by this bill, this bill would not put you out of business but Monsanto suing you will. To those of you who think Mycogen, Monsanto, or HC&S will go out of business because of this bill, I assure you they will not. Do you remember when you were a teenager? Well, when I was a teenager I had to tell my parents when I was going...or where I was going, what I was doing and when I was going. Oftentimes I was going to the beach. Telling them did not prevent me from going to the beach. Unfortunately, these large corporations telling us when they're poisoning us, where they're poisoning us and how much poison they're using will not prevent these companies from making us deathly ill. But it's a good start. Lastly, I'd like to make sure Councilmembers Baisa, Carroll, Couch, White and Mayor Alan Arakawa get this vote right unlike the Olowalu vote they fumbled a little over a year ago when over 60 percent of us testified against that project, they passed it anyways. Don, you're not here. I live in Kihei and love my position at the college. But I guarantee you --

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MR. FITZPATRICK: --if you vote this bill down --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony.

MR. FITZPATRICK: --I'll be running against you and I'll win because unlike you I have foresight.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony.

MR. FITZPATRICK: I know what's right from wrong.

CHAIR HOKAMA: ...(gavel)...

MR. FITZPATRICK: And most importantly I care about my . . . (inaudible). . .

CHAIR HOKAMA: ...(gavel). . . This meeting is in recess.

**RECESS:** 9:27 a.m.

RECONVENE: 9:44 a.m.

CHAIR HOKAMA: ...(gavel)... This meeting will return to order. The Chair will make these comments before we ask our next person to testify. I shall repeat, under testimony when your name is called, please come forward. If you represent an entity or organization, share that with us, please. You have three minutes according to the rules to give your testimony. So after you state your name, we'll assist you with the timing of the lights so when you start, it'll be a green light. At the two-minute, thirty-second mark, the yellow light goes on. So like the intersection, it's a caution. At the three-minute mark the red light goes on and we ask that you conclude. If

#### January 31, 2014

you need a few moments to finish, as by our rules, we allow you to take no more than one additional minute. That is the maximum you have and when that four-minute mark arrives, you will stop your comments to the Committee. Sharing that, the Chair's concerned about two things if we're going to continue to proceed, the maintaining of order and the subject of safety. The Chair will not tolerate anything where safety becomes an issue for any party that participates in this proceedings whether in this Chamber or at any other site within the County that receives official testimony. If safety becomes an issue, the Chair has no problems adjourning proceedings and not continuing until I can be satisfied that we have addressed the safety issue as well as the ability to \_\_\_\_\_\_ order in the meeting at all times. Is there any questions, Members, to the Chair regarding how we're gonna proceed? You may not ask a question. You are not a Member of the Council. Members, anything else?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, that is how we are going to proceed unless you have a question for the Chair. Also the Chair has no problem as informed by County attorneys to use the State statute to maintain decorum and order. If need be, after a warning, I will advise the representative from the Police Department to use their powers and arrest and remove such disturbing individuals from this meeting or any meeting that I conduct. Any questions on the Chair on that matter? Okay, we shall proceed. John Fitzpatrick?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: He's done.

CHAIR HOKAMA: He was done. Thank you. Valerie...I believe I mentioned Valerie S-A-P-O-U-R-N.

MS. SAPOURN: Aloha and mahalo for your service and your time. My name is Valerie Sapourn. I'm a Maui resident, a mother, a volunteer and an entrepreneur. I support jobs. I support farmers. I support families and profits, Maui, the aina. And I support choice. I support the right for all of the residents and the keiki of Maui to breathe clean air, to drink clean water, grow food in clean soil and swim in a clean ocean, basically, the way of living that existed for centuries prior to the chemical companies. I support the right and the freedom for people to have a choice of what food they feed their families. If they wish to feed GMOs and pesticides to their families, that's their choice. When it starts to go overflow onto my family, that's not my choice. It's without my consent that my land is getting sprayed and runoff when the rain comes. This example is perfect with the late weather that we've had. We can see the runoff. There is no control. These companies do not have control of what they spray. It...it's...there's no safe zones. It washes off into the reefs. The reefs are dying. What about the tourism industry? What about those people's jobs that will be lost when nobody comes to Maui anymore because the reefs are dead and the beaches are dead and the turtles have tumors? They do not have control. This is a very emotional issue for me. I have a friend who just had a baby with a hole in his heart. He's lived here on Maui all his life and after listening to the testimony on Wednesday about their congenital heart defects being more prevalent here, he's in San Diego right now getting his heart sewed back together. What if these pesticides caused that? You have the power, you have the right and

#### January 31, 2014

the responsibility to protect these babies. They don't have a voice. We are the voice of these babies, okay. It's not okay what people are doing to our planet. It's not okay what these giant chemical companies are doing. It's wrong. It's absolutely wrong. And I wrote all this stuff down and I'm not saying it. I'm saying what's coming from my heart, okay. Monsanto is responsible for DDT. Monsanto is responsible for dioxins. They're responsible for Agent Orange.

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. SAPOURN: They're responsible for saccharin, cancer, poison, okay. This idea of chemicals being allowed to be safe until proven harmful is a flawed logic. That is not how we should regulate these chemical companies. They need to be tested. They need to have long-term studies. These people...I do not want you to lose your jobs, people. Nobody wants anybody to lose a job. But we don't want you to be so sick and so unhealthy that you can't have a job. You understand?

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. SAPOURN: I support this bill. I support the amended version of the bill and I ask you to ask your heart what will it take for you to say yes to this bill? Will it take you being sick? Will it take your child being sick? Will...if this is a result of chemicals, will it take your baby or your grandchildren having this and then having a wake-up call? We don't want it to be too late, okay. You have the power. I'm begging you please use it, use your heart, use your common sense. This is a good bill. It's not...it's a start, okay. It's not the whole thing but at least it's a start in the right direction to keep us safe without...we don't want to be sprayed without our consent. We don't want to drink this water that's poisoned. This stuff is poison. So please, please, please, please support this bill. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the lady on her testimony, Members? Having none, thank you very much for your testimony this morning. Hana Office, is there anyone caring to share information this morning testifying?

MS. LONO: The Hana Office has no one waiting to testify.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Ms. Lono. Lanai, Ms. Fernandez, anyone wishing to share testimony?

MS. FERNANDEZ: The Lanai Office has no one waiting to testify.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Alcon, please call your next Molokai testifier.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Cory Jones.

MR. JONES: Good morning, Council Members. My name is Cory Jones and I would like to express my concerns in opposition to this GMO/pesticide bill as it unfairly targets large agricultural industries and does not apply to all pesticide use in the County. If this bill is passed, it could

#### January 31, 2014

have major impacts on the hard-working smaller farmers-producers in Maui County. They will not expand their farms for fear that the increase in land or increased pest pressure will cause them to exceed the threshold amount of pesticide spelled out in this bill, therefore will be subject to buffer zones where they cannot grow and cultivate parts of their land. With all the talk around...about wanting a self-sufficient food Hawaii and a sustainable ag Hawaii, this bill would be detrimental to that. Users of restricted-use pesticides are governed by stringent Federal law and State regulations, all of which regulate the certification in training regulations that require pesticide applicators to meet before they apply pesticides labeled for restricted use. There also...they also enforce strict recordkeeping guidelines that pesticide users must submit to State and Federal agencies. Their records...these records contain all of the use information listed in this bill. All of these regulations are in place to keep the farmers, workers and surrounding communities safe. I do not see the need for County level interaction when this is already in place and controlled by State and Federal levels. If the County sees this as a broken system at the State level, I feel they should work with the State to improve it and not add additional regulations. Recently Mayor Alan Arakawa negotiated a Memorandum of Understanding with Monsanto to voluntarily provide information about our pesticide use and farming operations. That is above the State and Federal legal requirements. This agreement offers information to our County and its residents. It will not cost taxpayers' money to fund. I believe this Memorandum of Understanding should be given a chance and should be extended out to other farmers that would be affected by this bill.

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. JONES: I've listed just a few reasons why this bill is not good for Maui County and I respectfully ask that your decisions are based on facts and evidence and to think about the farmers and producers who will suffer the consequences if this anti-agriculture bill is passed. Thank you for your time and consideration and I humbly ask that you do not pass this bill. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman? Having none, thank you very much. Ms. Alcon, next Molokai testifier, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Kalai Maliu.

MS. MALIU: Aloha, my name is Kalai Maliu, born and raised on the island of Molokai. Now pesticides, it's been used for more than 30 years plus. But what I don't understand, it seems that they only pinpointing Monsanto and other farmers. And that's their livelihood. Is that fair? With my own eyes I see the State and County spraying chemical along the highway when cars are passing. Where's the buffer zone? Now GMO, wow! I work for...I work here for more than 40 years and I love it, from nursery research to a tractor operator. The Lord above sent Monsanto on this earth for a reason, to improve our food source. That's what GMO means to me. Farmer...farming and agriculture is a many-splendored thing. Mahalo for your time. Domo arigato, salamat, aloha.

#### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your comments. Any questions for the lady, Members? Having none, thank you very much for sharing your thoughts with us. Ms. Alcon, next testifier, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Carl Adolpho III.

MR. ADOLPHO: Aloha, Council members. My name is Carl Adolpho and like so many of the other testimonies you have heard from Molokai, I am an employee of a seed company more specifically Monsanto. I have recently had the opportunity of being moved into the sprayer program within the company and would like to share some of my experiences with you. On my first day in the program, I was handed a thick manila envelope almost two inches thick. Within it contained the information I needed to pass the pesticide license test which in turn would allow me to apply restricted-use pesticides, the topic at hand. As I looked through the packet, I found the study material to be extremely specific. Every aspect of pesticide handling is included without exception. A large majority of this deals exclusively with the safety of the workers, of the community and the environment. As I listened to some of the concerns over the past few days concerning pesticide use, things like drift, the water table being contaminated and long-term environmental impact, I can personally tell you that all these concerns are addressed in the manual. These are things that every sprayer needs to be aware of and internalize before he even goes out. As a side note, I would like to also mention that these manuals are not written by the State but by the EPA and the Federal Department of Agriculture. I personally know people with degrees in agriculture who have failed the pesticide license test multiple times. I don't know the exact pass rate but I believe it is below 50 percent. Even though I am here today as an employee and as a community member, I am also a farmer in my own right. And I know, if nothing more, that this bill is wrong. I know as a farmer that if this bill is passed it will not only devastate the island of Molokai but would deeply affect this County as well. But most of all I know that when done correctly these farming practices are completely safe, safe for you and me, safe for our families, safe for our schools and our homes, and safe for our community. I do not base these statements on something that I found on Google. I don't say it because of an article that I read on Facebook or a video I watched on YouTube. I am basing my statements...I am not basing my statements on a theoretical concept that is lightly debated among scientists . . . (inaudible). . . --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. ADOLPHO: --...(inaudible)... than most of us in this hearing. I base it off of what I have studied and what I have seen with my own eyes. This bill is prejudiced in all ways...this bill is prejudiced in all the ways that have been repeated over and over again in this hearing. I would like to reiterate one as a final statement that I feel holds the most significance. This bill loses its right to any claim of good intentions when it excludes all other entities that use restricted-use pesticides --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

#### January 31, 2014

MR. ADOLPHO: --in close proximity to the public. This includes landscaping, golf courses, home fumigation, public pools and many other different State and County functions. Agriculture should be the last function...the last faction to be targeted since it provides the most benefits. I thank you for your time and I hope that you do the right thing in ending this bill. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Members, any questions for the gentleman? Having none, thank you very much for your thoughts this morning. Ms. Alcon, next Molokai testifier.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Mapuana Kansana.

MS. KANSANA: Good morning, Chair --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Good morning.

MS. KANSANA: --and Members. My name is Mapuana Kansana, born and raised on Molokai. I'm employed as a seasonal with Monsanto Molokai and I am proud to be part of Monsanto company. You know, they talk highly about safety at work and at home. They also care for their workers in everything they do. I wouldn't be working for Monsanto if it was unsafe. Furthermore, they hire Molokai residents and they give back to the Molokai community. As you all know, jobs here is very scarce. So I ask of you to really consider in opposing this bill. Thank you. I'm done.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for taking the time. We appreciate your testimony. Any questions for the lady, Members? Having none, thank you very much. One more and then we'll return to Maui, Ella, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Liane Kalima.

MS. KALIMA: Good morning. I'd like to thank you for letting me give my testimony. My name is Liane Kalima. I am a resident of Molokai, born and raised, and I'm proud to say I work for Monsanto. As you know, jobs are very scarce on this island and it's very hard to find a job. I've been there for four and a half years. It's...and I love it. I love my job. You know, it's a lot of work but sometimes when you have a job, it's like you taking responsibility for your life, yeah. And finally I got that opportunity to do it. Monsanto is...their main priority for the job is safety. They provide you with everything you need for that specific job, everything you need, from head to toe. You have everything you need, you know. And I think that that is so awesome. They also have buses to pick up their workers to take them to and from work, you know, which is...I think is very good because a lot of us don't have too many cars. So...and the price of gas has gone up, you know. They've...I would consider Monsanto like a big family, you know, as to where when one person is down, they're there to help pick you up, you know, no matter what, you know, the consequence, whatever. I love my job and I ask that you give your consideration to oppose this bill because whatever affects Monsanto will affect us which is at least 10 percent of this island. You know, they employ so many people on this island, you know, and it's sad that

#### January 31, 2014

we have all of this pilikia, I guess, you call it, you know, that's going on because, you know, all we're trying to do is get ahead in life, you know. But that's even harder because how can you get ahead if you can't even get along, you know, on this island which is really, really sad, you know. Anyway, I ask for your consideration to oppose the bill. Thank you very much.

- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your thoughts this morning. Any questions for the lady? Having none, thank you very much for your testimony. We'll ask if Lucienne de Naie is present, if you would come forward, please? And after Ms. de Naie, Leona Wilson.
- MS. de NAIE: Aloha, Committee Chair Hokama and Members of the Committee. My name is I'm testifying on behalf of Sierra Club Maui Group today as their Lucienne de Naie. Conservation Chair. Sierra Club has long considered the effects of pesticides, herbicides and genetically modified organisms on the ecological landscape. Our national board of directors has adopted a very thorough policy statement which specifically defines genetic engineering as "the direct molecular manipulation of the genetic structure of organisms or viruses, including additions of foreign genes, transgenes, gene alterations, duplications or deletions." This is to differentiate the potential effects from the more natural process of...traditional plant and animal breeding. And this Sierra Club policy is reviewed by top scientists. It goes through several committees and it goes to the national board of directors who all serve as volunteers but are people of, you know, stature in the national community. The Sierra Club urges full public disclosure and discussion and evaluation of the potential hazards and the potential benefits and policy options for genetic engineering research and the development and use of products from that research. We urge the development of adequate regulatory, legislative and other controls that these decisions be based on a reverence for nature, for life, as well as socioeconomic equity. Now the Sierra Club here in Hawaii has been an active player in calling for greater review and research on the effects of some of the numerous agricultural chemicals that are utilized here in Hawaii. And this is based on, you know, our factual experience. Sierra Club was a leading voice in calling for the ban on the nematode-killing DBCP in early the '80s, late 1970s. Our volunteers were told that DBCP was being applied according to the manufacturer's instructions, and it was I'm sure by Maui Land and Pine and others. And because of that it would cause no harm and would certainly not migrate into the island's water table. It turned out that more research was needed because the DBCP did migrate, did contaminate the water supply and was eventually banned throughout the United States because it did cause birth defects. My point here is EPA regulates these things but it's an ongoing process and we need to be aware of that. And, you know, we need to be thoughtful about it. I...we all remember when cigarettes were fine and all the research showed they did no harm but unfortunately that's not true. We support...
- MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.
- MS. de NAIE: Thank you. Sierra Club supports the intent of this bill. We know it has a long way to go before it would be in its final form. We know it needs to be carefully worded to avoid impacts to small farmers struggling to make a living who depend upon a modest use of regulated pesticides and herbicides to bring in their crop. We know that maybe it should be separate, the two issues,

#### January 31, 2014

pesticides and GMO. There's a lot of...there's a lot of ground to cover here. But the fact is the conversation has begun. And we...may I conclude?

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. de NAIE: Thank you. We live in a world that's far more complex than the one our parents and grandparents occupied. And we deserve to have...our families deserve to have the information about what new technologies are being employed by agricultural corporations. We deserve to know when and where regulated substances are being applied to the earth as long as it's a reasonable matter. Ms. Chun referred to an app that could be used. There could be a sign posted. There could be way to do this so that people have the information they need. As time and technology are changing, the human need to know what is in the environment that surrounds our houses and schools should be respected. And this ordinance is a very good first step. Also, I might say that I believe that Monsanto and others are trying to use pesticides safely. So if they are, then posting a sign or something, it shouldn't be a big deal. It's like they're being used safely and you let people know that they're being used. But I don't think people will attack as much if they knew more of what was going on. I'm gonna turn in some --

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MS. de NAIE: --pictures of runoff because these things run off into the ocean too. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you, Ms. de Naie. Any questions for Ms. de Naie on her testimony provided? Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair, and thank you, Ms. de Naie, for being here and sharing I believe a well-rounded, you know, perspective on this bill. As you mentioned, you know, it's a start, a work in progress. I just wanted to get a little more information. You mentioned the Sierra Club nationally has gone through scientists and people, you know, in figuring out...researches for pros and cons in regards to, I guess, pesticides, chemicals and whatnot.

MS. de NAIE: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: So...'cause I'm hearing from the community that there isn't any, you know, scientific facts and data and things.

MS. de NAIE: There are a lot of scientific projects that do consider the use of both pesticides and GMOs. Some of these are, you know, long term and some are more, you know, shorter term. Mostly they are peer reviewed. The ones...the Sierra Club national committees recruit top people from universities and so forth of volunteers. Sierra Club has over a million members so there's a lot of people to choose from. And there's lively debate. You know, there are people in Sierra Club that feel that things are strongly one way and strongly another. So the policies come out of this debate. These are not like committees of everyone that always sees everything exactly

#### January 31, 2014

on the same playing field. So it is a...it's a robust process. But I didn't bring, you know, those kinds of things here today. I believe other people have made reference to them. Ms. Christine Andrews who's a Sierra Club member brought...referred to many studies that have been done on the various effects. And the information is out there just like it was about cigarettes, but, you know, there was a campaign that we need to ignore that because cigarettes were very profitable. Eventually every dog has his day and we knew the truth about cigarettes.

So I think some of the pesticides and chemicals we will know more as time progresses.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Ms. de Naie. And Chair, if I can follow up on her handout? The runoff...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, can you ask for...

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: A question.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, a question for clarification.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yes. Okay, thank you. And Ms. de Naie, your handout in regards to soil erosion. And so you do...I mean there's studies that have been proven that the pesticides that were once used upon these...the dirt sticks and I guess runs off and now is going to harm the reef.

MS. de NAIE: Yes, it is. In fact, Australia banned for a while diuron which is a pesticide that's widely used here in our fields because it affects the reefs. They...and then, of course, commercial pressures sort of pressed back and it was a temporary ban for about a year. But our own studies, we commissioned, Sierra Club and Surfrider and a few other organizations commissioned an independent review of runoff during that last big storm, Flossie, in the Maalaea area. Diuron was running through the drainage ditches and on its way to the ocean. There was plenty of it. It was highly detectable limits. A retired professor did the study and, you know, we all funded to have the lab work done. So there's a lot more to know. Citizens do need to get involved to, I think, promote the safety of their own environment.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, thank you, Ms. de Naie.

MS. de NAIE: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Any other questions for Ms. de Naie? Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. de Naie, for coming forth this morning giving a...

#### January 31, 2014

- MS. de NAIE: Thank you, guys, all. This is a tough subject and, you know, it shouldn't put anybody out of business. This needs to be done right.
- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: You mentioned earlier about the national committee and its policies. Do they happen to have the fundings to maybe do some type of cooperative or...partnership studies here on Maui? Is that something that you could go back and ask in terms of ...(inaudible)...
- MS. de NAIE: Well, we are all on our own. National Sierra Club makes policies for the entire membership. There's like, you know, 80 different chapters of Sierra Club. We are one here in Hawaii. And then each chapter has to raise their own funds to do things. The small amount of research we were able to do on this one little pesticide was in response to our Maalaea Defense Fund. We raised money for years to stop the destruction of the reefs at Maalaea Harbor. The Army Corps eventually said it was a bad project and so we had a fund that we could use for things that could be, you know, proactive and beneficial for that Maalaea area. And so we voted to use \$1,200 from that fund to cover the lab work for this one particular research. It is possible and I think, you know, it's a great idea to pursue. It probably wouldn't come from national Sierra Club because they just encourage each chapter to like do things on their own but follow national policy.
- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay, thank you. Yeah, just, Chair, it's such an important issue in terms of our businesses and our families that we, you know, we ...(inaudible)... we are not Kauai, we're not Big Island. We just need to find --

MS. de NAIE: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: --...(inaudible)...legislation that fits Maui. And that's if anything that we can do in terms of asking partnerships in other organizations to come and help us provide us information is welcomed. Thank you so much.

MS. de NAIE: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, any other questions for Ms. de Naie? Having none, thank you very much for being here this morning.

MS. de NAIE: Thank you all.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Leona Wilson, please? And following Ms. Wilton [sic] is a Ryan Brooke.

MS. WILSON: This is somebody else's.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, yeah, Staff will take care of that. Thank you.

#### January 31, 2014

MS. WILSON: I just need a minute. I have to bring a couple things. This one is disgusting. Okay, hi, sorry but I...this is not quite as heavy duty as the last testifier as you can see. But I...my name, first of all, is Leona Rocha Wilson. My family has been here since the 1800s. They came from Portugal to work in the sugar plantation. And we still have family members that are working here on Maui in different fields, police force and HC&S and...not Monsanto yet. But maybe we'll get someone to get there. In any case, I am opposed to the present...to the bill. And I had two events that happened recently which is why I wanted to be here today. The first event was I had some teachers at my home and there were three of them. And the three teachers were sitting around and we got to talking about pesticides. And the pesticide issue came up and one of the teachers said I don't buy anywhere else other than Whole Foods. And I said why? She said I'm against pesticides. So I turned to the other two teachers and I said do you buy foods from wholesale...from Whole Foods? And they said no, we can't afford it. We go and buy food wherever we can find it the cheapest to feed our families. And then I thought is this the future? Is this what we're looking at? That one in three people will be privileged enough to buy food? I mean it really...it just...it hit me that was just amazing, the difference. And so my thought was what will happen if the farmers disappear? What will happen if we have less food? Is this where we're going that only the privileged will be able to buy food? That was the first event that took place that I realized I was really against this bill. The second one was --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. WILSON: --we have eight million...oh, the second was, which is why we have here, I have a guava tree, okay. I have couple guava trees and I wanted to eat the guavas ripe. Well, I brought it. These are still green, okay. There's a big puka in there. This one's still green and it's rotten. This one has been bitten. Now for those of us that know about pickled plums, do you know why we pickle the plums? We have to pick the plums green before they get eaten --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. WILSON: --by the bugs. Just one more minute. And they get eaten by the bugs, okay. So guess what? The only way I can eat my guavas--I can't wait for them to get ripe--I have to pickle them. So guess what? Next year when the crop comes around, I'm going to use pesticides. So let me add the conclusion. I'm here really to support the farmers. I'm here to support Monsanto and I'm definitely against this bill. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Ms. Wilson. Any questions for the lady on her testimony, Members? Ms. Cochran?

MS. WILSON: ... (Inaudible). . .

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Wilson.

MS. WILSON: ... (Inaudible). . . pickled guava for you, Gladys.

#### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. Ms. Wilson, we have a question for clarification from Ms. Cochran, please.

MS. WILSON: Sure. Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Ms. Wilson, for your show and tell. This reminds me of school and...speaking of the three teachers that you were, I guess, with one day and you shared your story.

MS. WILSON: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: I'm looking at a petition and it looks like the Hawaii State Teachers Association signed on to the petition to support this. So I was just wondering how the three teachers are in reference to this overall association's take on the bill.

MS. WILSON: Elle, I can't...I have...I cannot comment on your question. I can comment on what I experienced, okay. And that experience had an effect on me. And so whatever happens to your other petitions, I cannot speak to. I have no idea.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Any other questions for Ms. Wilson on testimony presented? Having none, thank you very much for sharing your thoughts today with us.

MS. WILSON: Gotta clean up.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Portuguese.

MS. WILSON: Portuguese.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ryan Brooke? B-R-O-O-K-E. Okay, last call, Ryan Brooke. Okay, we'll go next to Shayne Edelhertz. E-D-E-L-H-E-R-T-Z.

MR. EDELHERTZ: Good morning, Council.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Good morning.

MR. EDELHERTZ: Thank you. Thank you very much for allowing us to provide testimony. This is a very important bill which will provide disclosure and buffer zones to the community and it is long overdue. Never underestimate a few committed people to change the outcome of the world. Indeed, it is the only thing that ever has. These few people have turned into millions around the world asking for the same thing. My name is Shayne Edelhertz. I'm a Maui resident for over 25 years, graduated from Maui High and I'm a currently licensed contractor. I install wastewater systems and drain lines and have come into contact with numerous lots of old agricultural land mainly Upcountry and mainly Maui Land and Pine. That land has been filled with waste,

#### January 31, 2014

plastics, pesticides, irrigation lines and anything that was used to grow these products. They've left this land and abandoned it and sold it to people that were unaware or only found out after they started digging up their land to install plants or systems. All these leftover elements are known to have carcinogens and have leaked into the water table proven by many wells that have been drilled Upcountry and proven to be unreliable for drinking. These islands have been under a shadow of grief for way too long. The powers that have responsibility for this know what they are doing and actively ignore the facts and put profits over people. The Hawaii motto states perpetuate the life of the land in righteousness. To say it in Hawaiian, ua mau ke ika [sic] aina, i ka pono. I may need some help with that. This has not been happening at all by these companies or by our governmental representatives. Instead continued exploitation of the land for profit has been the priority. Ag practices and altering of plants' DNA, GMOs have not been proven safe. In fact, they have proven to be very dangerous and uncontrollable. Corporation studies that have paid for this have dissuaded the public with lies funded by their own corporations for their own profits. Another topic of concern is the loss of over 80 percent of the wild bee --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. EDELHERTZ: --population in North America. Bees are responsible for pollinating major crops such as corn, soy, almonds, et cetera. The decline of this population has been linked to many of these pesticides that are being unregulated and used in excess to grow these genetic crops. The bees are dying. What really catalyzes my support for this bill is my responsibility as a father to provide a safe environment --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MR. EDELHERTZ: --for my child to grow up in. My child was born with a tumor and had to have this removed. This is affected by these pesticides by this island and this area. I have no doubt in that. Once again Molokai's testimony is paid for by Monsanto who purchased Blackwater mercenaries to protect their special interest, purchased bee laboratories that were threatening to leak the truth about these pesticides and also to provide Federal immunity against GMO labeling and any sort of restrictions to their products. This is...should be alarming to the population and we should be standing up for the truth and not allowing these corporations to lie to us anymore. Maui is a very special place. It's a beautiful island and these islands respect...and deserve the respect.

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MR. EDELHERTZ: Thank you very much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman on testimony shared this morning, Members? Okay, having none, thank you very much for your thoughts.

MR. EDELHERTZ: Thank you.

#### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: We'll go to Molokai now. Molokai, Ms. Alcon, your next Molokai testifier, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Helena Miguel.

- MS. MIGUEL Good morning, Council Chair and Council members. Thank you for letting me voice my opinion on this GMO and pesticide bill. And my opinion is that I'm opposed to the bill. My name is Helena Miguel and I was born and raised here on Molokai. I am currently an employee of Monsanto Molokai and have been with them for little over 20 years. In my years at Monsanto I have held many positions, from receiving seed and to the harvesting of ears. But two of the most significant positions I've held are Environmental Safety and Health Technician for four years and a Sprayer Supervisor for five years. In these roles, I've become familiar with the requirements from the Federal and State regulations regarding pesticides. Is it not good enough for you that we, as certified pesticides applicators, are required to follow USDA, the EPA and WPS regulations? Is it not good enough for you that we, as pesticide applicators, are required to follow the State of Hawaii Department of Ag regulations? Is it not good enough for you that in order for us to become certified applicators in the State of Hawaii, we are required to attend a pesticide class given to us by the University of Hawaii and take and pass an intensive written test? I think approximately one out of ten people pass this test on their first try. As a certified pesticide applicator license holder for the past six years, I take offense to this bill. To me the bill is saying that I don't know what I'm doing when it comes to spraying pesticides. I took the required courses I needed and I studied my butt off in order for me to get my license. And I continue to take refresher and continuing education classes to keep my license current. In order for anyone to purchase a restricted-use pesticide, they need to have a certified applicator's license. Pesticide labels for all pesticides whether or not it's a restricted-use pesticide gives us specific instructions in order to use it. The label tells us when we can and cannot spray. The label also tells us where we can and cannot spray. The label even gives us buffer zones. The pesticide label is the law. Having a certified applicator's license to me is kinda like having a driver's license. Anyone who holds a driver's license is required by law to follow and obey the rules of the road. It's the same thing with those who have a certified applicator's license. They are required by law to follow and obey the rules and regulations --
- MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.
- MS. MIGUEL: --of the EPA, WPS and HDOA. If any of these licensed holders misuse or do not follow the laws, then they too are given warnings and then fined. And some licenses are even taken away. As I asked before, is it not good enough for you that we as certified pesticide applicators are required by law to follow all USDA, EPA and WPS regulations? Is it not good enough for you that we as certified pesticide applicators --
- MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.
- MS. MIGUEL: --are required by law to follow the State of Hawaii, Department of Ag regulations? Anyone who applies restricted-use pesticides, one, has been trained and passed the intense

#### January 31, 2014

license exam, and two, applies it according to the pesticide label. My name is Helena Miguel and I ask that when you cast your vote on this bill, you oppose it. Thank you.

- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony this morning. Any questions for the lady on her testimony, Members? Having none, thank you very much. Next testifier, Ms. Alcon.
- MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Coco Augustiro.
- MS. AUGUSTIRO: Aloha, Council Members, and thank you for giving me this opportunity. My name is Collette Augustiro. People know me as Coco. Born, raised and lived here for 38 years, or just say my whole life. I live no more than 100 yards from a corn field and play in fields all of my child life. My aunty's house was less than 100 feet from a corn field and that's where we went after school and slept over on weekends. We fed our chickens, pigs and baited our bird traps with corn that we harvest from the old fields. I was brought up around all these fields all my life. And, yes, pesticides were being applied back then. And now all you hear is pesticides cause respiratory problems. To who? I for one have a respiratory problem that I had when I was born. And no, it don't...it's not from pesticides nor does pesticides bother it. I can say I'm a living proof that pesticides and GMO crop doesn't harm or affect my asthma. I work here in this same place but just different name, Monsanto, for 20 years going on 21 years. I worked in the field as a Hand Pollinator, Field Laborer, \_\_\_\_\_ Operator, Spray Applicator and Supervisor for Field Operation. I work in these fields five to six days a week, eight to ten hours a day. Pesticides still does not bother my asthma. I get an example. What's the difference from a 15-feet buffer zone, calling, letting your neighbors around you know what you're spraying and when you're spraying versus 15 feet from your bedroom window, house and your next door neighbor starts to spray or fumigate their house and they don't have to let you know what they're doing. Why? Because they don't have to because they own their yard and their house. Why waste taxpayers' money to make other laws when the State and Federal has laws. As a well-known community volunteer, a resident of Molokai and a proud employee of Monsanto, I oppose this bill. Thank you.
- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the lady, Members? Having none, thank you very much for being there this morning. Next person please, Ms. Alcon.
- MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Jason Matayoshi.
- MR. MATAYOSHI: Good morning, Maui County Council members and Chair. My name is Jason Matayoshi and I would like to thank you for giving me the opportunity to express my feelings about this GMO/pesticides bill. I strongly oppose Maui County's GMO/pesticides bill. This bill targets only our industry and will make unnecessary regulations that are already in place for us. Our biotech products are already regulated by our Federal and State governments before they are able to reach farmers' fields. Our company and employees who apply pesticides go through routine inspection, testing and updating of applicators' licensing by our State government. Our spray equipment is one of the best around for spray accuracy. Not only will this bill make repetitive enforcements and obstacles on our business, it will add a significant amount to our County's already rising expense. As a taxpayer, I surely do not want my tax

#### January 31, 2014

dollars wasted on something I'm already paying for. We are no different from any farmer. We need to protect our crops, pests that threaten our business. Farming is a very hard occupation with many challenges. My grandparents were farmers in the 1940s and they worked extremely hard to make a living. Fighting pests with what little they had was the hardest battle. I strongly feel that biotechnology and the proper use of pesticides are greatly needed to help overcome these challenges to optimize crop yield for food production. Also, the continuing study and research of newer biotech crops will be needed to ensure there will be enough food for the present and the future. This bill could end the ongoing research and production of biotech crops in Maui County. I would never support nor work for a company that I knew was out to do harm for our community and County. I was born and raised here on Molokai and have been a resident since. And I don't want to live anywhere else. Molokai is my home and I proudly work for Monsanto, a company that truly does good things for our community, our County and our world. Please oppose this bill to help farming continue to strive in Maui County. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions, Members, for the gentleman? Thank you very much for your thoughts this morning. One more, please, Ms. Alcon.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Audwin Calairo.

MR. CALAIRO: Good morning, Council Chair Hokama and Maui County Council members. My name is Audwin Calairo. I currently work for Monsanto Molokai. I'm a former employee of Molokai Ranch. I've seen the effect it had on Molokai when people lost their jobs and had to look for other work off-island. I was fortunate to have the opportunity to work for a company like Monsanto. Monsanto care about their workers. The workers follow all guidelines when it comes to pesticide use. All of our applicators go through a lot of training and tests before doing applications. I am against the bill because the State and Federal already have laws pertaining to pesticide use. The farmers on Kauai is already taking this issue to court. Let them finish their battle, then make...then you can make your decision. Don't let something like that happen to Maui County. We don't need wasted money being spent. I ask that you oppose this bill. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman, Members? Having none, thank you very much for being there. Members, do you need a short break? Okay, we'll take a break 'til 10:45. This Committee will be in recess 'til 10:45. . . . (gavel). . .

**RECESS:** 10:35 a.m.

RECONVENE: 10:52 a.m.

CHAIR HOKAMA: ...(gavel)... We shall return to order and continue receiving testimony on Policy Item 58. Before we return to the Chamber and the next person in the Chamber would be an Astrid Senturia, S-E-N-T-U-R-A...I-A, excuse me. Now we do have a testifier ...we do have a testifier in our Hana Office, our first one so we're gonna take the Hana testifier first since

#### January 31, 2014

there's one and then we'll return to the Chambers, Members. So Ms. Lono, if you would ask your Hana testifier to identify him or herself.

MS. LONO: Our first testifier is Eileen Comeaux.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much.

MS. COMEAUX: Aloha. Thank you for your time, to the Council. My name is Eileen Comeaux and I'm from Hana. I would like...I've got a few concerns here about the GMO that accidentally contain...contaminates seeds that are blown by the wind and it contaminates other farmers' seeds. I don't understand how the farmer could be sued for something that the wind does. And how do we protect the farmer that doesn't want...GMO seeds? How do we protect that farmer? It seems to me like the...if the farmer who doesn't want this seed and his seed gets contaminated by GMO, it seems like they should maybe have the right to sue for contaminating their organic seeds. So I think we need to think about how do we protect that farmer that does not want the GMO seeds. I've also had questions about the EPA adequately monitoring and allowing the contamination of our waters and it's killing the bees and the beetles and the butterflies. I just think that there's inadequacy in what the EPA is doing in its monitoring and I think that should be really addressed. I also am concerned about the next generation. We don't know what is going to happen with the next generation and as a grandmother I'm very concerned about my grandkids and I'm sure you guys have grandkids too. So we don't know health wise what's gonna happen to our next generation and it's them that we're experimenting on. Do we really want to chance that? Do we really want to chance our kids eating food that we really aren't really sure that probably has pesticides in the seeds that are...I don't know. I just don't like chancing my grandkids on that. They're just too special. And I'm really, really, really worried about that. Over...over the time we see that it's just not a safe thing to do and many people feel that the genetically modified engineering is a invalid way of the future. And we --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. COMEAUX: --cannot afford to ignore the technology of such enormous potential benefits of the GMO. However, we must proceed with caution to avoid causing unintentional harm to human health. The environment is a result of this powerful technology. We need to really be careful with what we're doing here. If we could just slow down --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. COMEAUX: --and really think about what we're doing. Let's see...those are kind of my points that I wanted to make. Thank you very much for your time and let's just really think about what we're doing. Okay, thank you very much. Aloha.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for taking the time to testify. Any questions for the lady in Hana, Ms. Comeaux, on her testimony, Members? Having none, thank you very much for taking the time to testify this morning. Ms. Lono, anyone else in the Hana Office? Ms. Lono?

#### January 31, 2014

MS. LONO: There is no one else waiting at the Hana Office to testify.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Lanai, anyone else?

MS. FERNANDEZ: There is no one waiting to testify on Lanai.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. We'll ask Ms. Astrid Senturia if she would share her thoughts with us, please?

MS. SENTURIA: Aloha. Thank you for listening to my testimony. I'm here today not only as a concerned Maui resident but also as a mother and a healthcare practitioner in the community. Just shy of being two months old my daughter, Persephone, who you've heard and maybe seen today, was diagnosed with brain cancer. This is a heart-wrenching ordeal that no parent should have to go through and no baby this small should have to deal with. When Persephone was three months old, she had surgery to successfully remove a tumor that was lodged in her brain and it was larger than a golf ball. We are extremely grateful for every day that we have with her. Shane and I are both very healthy people and we spend a lot of time outside and in the water enjoying all that Maui has to offer. One of our favorite spots is Hookipa which is very...which is located very close in proximity to poisoned ag lands and it's also very close to water runoff from these lands. This is evident in the reef that is dying and the turtles that are there that also are suffering from tumors. The research is out. It doesn't take much. A low amount of low levels of exposure have been linked to an increase in birth defects and brain cancer. I know of three other babies that were born this last year with heart defects. That's on Maui. We are a small population. Secondly, as a licensed acupuncturist I have seen an increase in the number of patients I treat for infertility issues and this is continuing to rise. Seemingly healthy men and women who really should have no trouble conceiving are unable to start the families they wish to without enlisting costly supportive methods which are not always successful either. This is also due to environmental toxins. If the farmers, workers and corporate members feel so threatened by the possibility of disclosing what is really going on, then obviously there's something to be concerned about. If this bill does not pass, the quality of life on this island will continue to decline and healthcare costs will surge as more and more cancers, disease and defects start occurring. How can we deny our children and their children the chance at a healthy life here in beautiful Hawaii. In closing, I would like to say that I strongly support --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. SENTURIA: --this bill. It is our right to know what is being sprayed, when and where and to have allotted safe buffer zones. Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for the lady, Members? Thank you very much for being here this morning. Faith Eubank, E-U-B-A-N-K. Faith Eubank? Okay, we'll go to the next individual, Ann Evans, E-V-A-N-S. Faith...excuse me, Ann Evans. Ann Evans? Okay, thank you. Unmani Groves?

#### January 31, 2014

MS. GROVES: Aloha, Chair and Committee Members. Mahalo to Elle Cochran for doing this bill. September 29<sup>th</sup>, I had a number of different pesticide exposures downwind from an ag company in South Kihei. And I pleaded actually for this bill, so I'm incredibly thankful. I learned a lot through the experience. First off, I am a practiced management consultant to healthcare practitioners and on health and environment. I'm also an organic gardener. I have...had a third of an acre property in South Kihei. As a result of the pesticide exposures, it was scary enough and a thousand dollars' worth of treatment that I was very clear I needed to sell my property. And it was a property I put a lot of love and attention into and...over five years. I did not know that I was downwind from an ag...a big ag company. It was not disclosed and to me disclosure is very important. Right now I have five storage units. I'm in a furnished place. Already and...I need to know, disclosure-wise, that I'm not going to be near experimental pesticides. The kind of pesticides that I was subject to, I learned that the...at Kaiser there is very limited ability to be able to test on pesticides through them. And that was eye-opening. I discovered that they do not have a toxicology lab on Maui and that's really critical when you have the level of toxic exposure that I had. It's just...it doesn't take much from a very powerful single dose to really do harm. I'm very lucky that I went to a naturopath who had the ability of a very specialized equipment to be able to tell what I needed to be treated with. It took about three weeks. But, you know, my system was like this. So now I'm okay. But I'm...I...it brings up the issue of testing. And --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. GROVES. --I did...there are 26 points that I did write. There is an article in here by...on the challenges and the overview on pesticides and GMOs and I'd really ask that you read the six pages. I know it's long but I did discern a lot. May I go over the one... to the one minute?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes.

MS. GROVES: May I? Okay, thank you. I did go to the State level to testify on pesticide bill, requesting notification. It was a bill...I think it was H.B. 673. I did request for notification. This was before I was even hit with pesticides since June. And I discovered that the very minimal amount in terms of being able to get public support for the notification wasn't there. I mean putting, you know, an annual report on a Department of Ag website isn't enough to protect us. We need the notification. I need to know. I mean I thank HC&S for notifying us on the cane burning. I could close up my windows, my doors, turn on the air purifier. But I can't do that when the pesticides come down on the ...(inaudible)...

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MS. GROVES: Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Ms. Groves, for your comments this morning.

#### January 31, 2014

MS. GROVES: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Members, any questions for the lady on her testimony she shared?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, and thank you, Ms. Groves for being here. You mentioned that you get notified for cane burning. And how do you get notified?

MS. GROVES: I signed up for alerts that's on their website. And I want you to know that there is, even though Monsanto has signed a voluntary disclosure, I looked at the website this morning. There is no notification alert up there. I think that's something that would be very useful, you know...

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay, sorry, wait. Sorry to interrupt but no, I wanted to go back to your...so you get just notified via HC&S . . . (inaudible). . .

MS. GROVES: Yes, and they're very good. I'm so grateful. They did it voluntarily and I'm so grateful that they do do it because I am able to get out of harm's way and that's the point of doing disclosure. It's to get out of harm's way and also have a method to be able to treat. You know, we don't have...we're very exposed. We don't know how exposed we are here. And, you know, for land use planning, you know --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you.

MS. GROVES: --before we put those subdivisions in --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

MS. GROVES: --we need to know what experimentals are being done.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Ms. Groves. Thank you, Chair.

MS. GROVES: Okay. Any other questions?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Any other questions for our lady? Having none, Ms. Groves, thank you for sharing your thoughts.

MS. GROVES: Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Courtney Bruch?

MS. BRUCH: Good morning, Chair.

#### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Good morning.

MS. BRUCH: Council. I submitted this morning, I hope you got a copy, there's a list of about 124 businesses, schools, organizations and farms that support the amended version of Elle Cochran's bill. So please take a look at that. I know it's a very small print. I'll send you a larger print by e-mail. But there are many, many organizations that support the amended version of this bill, as do I. Please also look at Gary Hooser's testimony again. It's on YouTube. It's very important that we all learn from what he has gone through and experienced. So I encourage you to please watch that and listen to that several times. I have. I am deeply concerned about the health of our environment and our people. Pesticides are poison. Restricted-use pesticides are poison. It is using our incredible intelligence and common sense to malama aina. We can do anything we set our minds to, anything we set our minds to with proper connection to the wisdom of the earth and working in community. We can co-create a fertile, organic and native Hawaiian plant environment that is healing and nourishing to the present and future generations. Placating to industrial ag industries may put pesticides, GMO-laden food in some mouths and money in some pockets in the moment. But it perpetuates poison. We need to turn our canoe in the right direction. We need good leadership. We need people to run for office that have fresh ideas that are innovative and connected to loving this land instead of exploiting it. There are people like Oprah Winfrey. There are people that have money. I'm not asking them to come in and make decisions for us but it's obvious that we need people all over the world that love this place that don't want it to be poisoned. This is a very precious place and so we have people that can come in and not just people who have money but people in our community are very intelligent. And to talk about how we can replace these jobs that people have that are poisoning our island. I realize that ties with HC&S, A&B, Monsanto, Maui Land and Pine run deep. Council members are public servants, not corporate servants. I have to continue to remind us of this. And I hope that more and more people come in our community to speak out because I know

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. BRUCH: --that people are afraid. They are some people that are on Molokai that I have been in contact with this week that are afraid to speak up because they have family members that work for Monsanto and Mycogen. I know people on this Council that have ties with those organizations. Using thousands of gallons of restricted-use pesticides on a small island is a serious problem. We have over 113,000 pounds of restricted-use pesticides that were used last year. This is unacceptable. I'll be...

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. BRUCH: May I have another minute, please? All we are asking for is disclosure and buffer zones. If you read the Pesticide Action Network's testimony by Paul Towers, it was e-mailed to you. There are many places in the United States that have buffer zones. That's all we're asking for. We're not asking to ban pesticides. And I really think it's a responsibility of people like

#### January 31, 2014

Warren Watanabe who, Executive Director of the Farm Bureau, not to put out fear mongering to farmers. This is not to put farmers out of business. These corporations use much higher levels of restricted-use pesticides than small farmers. And it's true that we might need to increase the threshold and I appreciate that Elle Cochran is more than willing and has been talking to farmers and is willing to amend this bill. And I have called Riki Hokama's office three times in the past week to ask why he did not schedule the amended version which is improved from the Kauai version and have received no answer. And I want an answer and so does other people.

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MS. BRUCH: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for the lady on her testimony provided? Okay, thank you very much for your testimony. The Chair will make one comment. Prior to posting this, I did have a discussion with Ms. Cochran. She knew exactly what...how they were gonna move forward on this item. She understood some of my concerns of multiple versions of a bill to receive testimony. And this was all done prior to my posting. And so for me this is something that I had cleared with the author of the original version, how we're gonna proceed. You have questions, you can ask Ms. Cochran whether this conversation occurred or not. But I can tell you it occurred in front of many other people who saw us have a discussion and that's the way it is. The Chairs have control over the agendas. They decide what goes on their agendas and that is the Rules of this Council, period. The next testifier is Amy Chang, C-H-A-N-G? Dr. Joe Ritter?

MR. RITTER: Aloha, Honorable Chair Hokama, esteemed Council members and Committee on Policy and Intergovernmental Affairs, and good citizens of Maui. My name is Dr. Joe Ritter. I'm a physicist and interdisciplinary scientist, long-term Maui resident and taxpayer. Thank you all for the opportunity to discuss objective science related to the intent of the most honorable Elle Cochran's bill, PIA-58. What are my qualifications to talk about this? I grew up on a farm. I learned to work on a farm. I'm in total support of local Maui County resident farmers and their rights. Although the Council members may know me from my NASA work as a Ph.D. physicist and expert in radiative transfer and light pollution for the County, I actually began my scientific career in laboratories as a teenager in the field of teratology which is the study of birth defects. Teratology is closely related to cancer research. They're both about cells which do not reproduce correctly. When I got a little older, I co-authored several peer-reviewed teratology publications. At the age of 19 was a keynote speaker at the 61<sup>st</sup> meeting of the Mid-Atlantic Reproduction and Teratology Society in Groton. Years ago I had a faculty appointment in Animal Science at the College of Agriculture, Farming and Natural Resource Management, the Ag College in Hilo. I flew a genetics payload, a genetic toxicology experiment on NASA Space Shuttle mission, STS-91. I'm a far better physicist than biochemist or geneticist but I have some small knowledge to share in this field that concerns us today, the field of toxicology. When I was younger, our group's peer-reviewed published research performed at the Institute for Developmental Research at the Cincinnati Children's Hospital with the medical school of the University of Cincinnati, used Wistar rats as test models for human reproductive systems.

#### January 31, 2014

We...we saw significantly increased damaging effect from administering multiple chemicals together to mothers. We often-those are mothers of rats--we often had results where giving a single safe chemical would cause no statistically, you know, zero to a few percent malformed embryos. But if multiple safe chemicals were given together, we might see upwards of eighty to ninety percent malformed young. This was tremendously helpful in understanding proximate biochemical pathology pathways and absolutely disastrous for the test subjects exposed to these chemical cocktails. Decades of science clearly shows that chemicals administered together --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. RITTER: --can have a multiplicatively bad effect on embryos and significantly increased negative health effects. The tests using single components cannot reveal this dangerous potentiated effect of chemical cocktail spraying is what concerns us. On Maui we see widespread application of cocktail herbicides and pesticides with as many as 50 components. Corporate shills say prove it as dangerous yet claims of safety--sir, may I please have 60 more seconds coming up? Thank you. Yet claims of safety are often based on research tests of a single ingredient, not the combination cocktail applied to crops and through runoff and drift applied to humans on Maui. Safety claims of cocktails based on tests of single components are not valid or convincing to those who understand the fundamental science. Short of the ideal which would be a Federal moratorium on these cocktails until adequately studied, at minimum I urge you to protect us on Maui. Why not protect our right to know what is sprayed and keep control of that on Maui? Do not relinquish these decisions to the State. The State Constitution is clear in directing our public officials to preserve our health and natural resources. Please do not let unsubstantiated fearful claims of job loss prevent County action. Please do not fear being open. Council, your health is at stake as well as mine and all of the residents of Maui. Thank you for your consideration of this view based on science and real concern for our community.

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much, Dr. Ritter, on your testimony. Members, any questions on Dr. Ritter's testimony?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair? Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Dr. Ritter, for being here and bringing that perspective, you know, the actual scientific end. You mentioned lack of, I guess, test or research on the cocktail mixture of chemicals. And you...so do you...you're in essence saying that is occurring here and thereby there's . . . (inaudible). . .

MR. RITTER: There's lack of research. Thank you for the question. I appreciate being able to elaborate on this. When we did research in birth defects and...which is the flip side of cancer research, those cells that don't grow correctly, we would often see a safe chemical, call it

#### January 31, 2014

Chemical A administered and see virtually no effects and same thing for Chemical B. Yet when given together we'd see disastrous effects. The point is that when...if you have 50 different things in something, you have 50 factorial different combinations. If you have four things in something, you have ten different possible combinations you could look at, okay. So the real issue, and actually there are \_\_\_\_\_ and they grow more than exponentially. The point is when tests are done, they're typically on a component and so people will say, gee, this is safe. It's been tested. We've looked at this ingredient. The point is the combinations are not safe. You can drink a beer, you can take a sleeping pill. You aren't supposed to take them together. This is what's called a potentiative effect. It's multiplicative. It's much more than just an additive effect. And this is the significant issue. This testing has not been done adequately at any level and I have some expertise in this field. I have refereed publications in this field from before I, when I became an astrophysicist. So I hope that answers your question. This is not adequately tested at all. I grew up on a farm. I am not against pesticides. I'm not against what we need to do for local agriculture. I'm a fan of local farmers and human residents that are But I'm very scared about what is happening here and I urge simply to have transparency. And I thank the Council for considering these views based on science.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Dr. Ritter. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, any other Member has a question for Dr. Ritter? Having none, Dr. Ritter, thank you very much for your presence.

MR. RITTER: Thank you all very much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We'll go back to Molokai. Ms. Alcon, your next Molokai testifier, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is William Casino.

MR. CASINO: Good morning, honorable Chairman, Council members. Thank you very much for giving me an opportunity to talk. My name is William Casino. I work at Monsanto for nine years and I am thankful that I get employed in Monsanto. And I'm happy that Monsanto is here in Molokai. Working in Monsanto is a privilege for me because I have learned about safety environment and all the safe employment. Ever since I get employed at Monsanto, I have gained a lot of experience and knowledge as the Crew Leader. I felt self-confidence of mine, of my job because we have rules and regulations to follow not only for us employees but for the sake of others of our environment. Monsanto is the biggest employment in Molokai and we depend on our jobs so we can support our family and provide their needs. Molokai has had economic problems situations with such high unemployment. If this bill passes, Monsanto as well as local farms will force to shut down. We will lose our jobs. It will affect all of us in the community and also businesses. This job means a lot to me and my family. I cannot afford to lose it. Please, honorable Chairman, I humbly ask you not to pass this bill. Thank you very much for your kind consideration.

#### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman? Having none, thank you for being there. Ms. Alcon, next Molokai testifier, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Alex Mangayayam.

MR. MANGAYAYAM: Good morning, Mr. Chairman and Members. My name is Alex Mangayayam. I'm here to testify on the GMO bill number 13-381. I work 23 years at the farm and I'm employed 15 years at Monsanto from now. I respect all ideas and opinions from any other organization when they give to us. But being a farm worker I support the farmers in the agriculture industries. So being a farmers worker, I vote no pass this bill. Again, my name is Alex Mangayayam and thank you very much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman? Having none, thank you for being there. Ms. Alcon, your next Molokai.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Melvin Spencer, Jr.

MR. SPENCER: Aloha, Maui County Council members. My name is Mel Spencer, Jr. I'm a Monsanto employee. Been working for this company 10 years. I support agriculture business, great opportunity for the next generation of our children future. Please don't take farming away from us employees. I'm against the bill. Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions, Members?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Sir...Mr...Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, Ms. Cochran.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And I guess, Mr. Spencer. Mahalo for being there in Molokai. Can you hear me, Mr. Spencer? This is Elle Cochran.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ella, can Mr. Spencer hear? Ella?

MS. ALCON: Yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Can...is Mr. Spencer there? Ms. Cochran --

MS. ALCON: Yes, he is.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --has a question. Okay, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Hi, Mr. Spencer, it's Elle Cochran. Can you hear me?

MR. SPENCER: Yeah.

#### January 31, 2014

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, thank you for being there. I've just been hearing over and over. I just have a question for you. Is your company or employer saying that this bill will put you out of work? Is that kind of the gist of what you're being told?-

MS. ALCON: Riki, please say the question over?

CHAIR HOKAMA: As I understand it, Ms. Cochran's question is, is the employer saying that the legislation would end their activities on Molokai island. Would that be an accurate --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --paraphrase?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Their job, activity, job.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, yeah. Did the employer say that if this bill passes, they would have no jobs on Molokai, is her question.

MS. ALCON: Asking you not going have one job. They telling you that?

MR. SPENCER: No, no, they're not telling me anything of that. I oppose the bill.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MR. SPENCER: Aloha.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Mr. Spencer.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, any other questions for the gentleman? Thank you, Mr. Spencer, for being there. Ms. Alcon, your next Molokaian.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Felipe Ragonton.

MR. RAGONTON: Hello, good morning, Chairman. I am Felipe Ragonton, working in Monsanto Molokai. I really don't like this bill. I support agriculture and I love my job. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman? Having none, thank you very much. Ms. Alcon, last one for this round, Ms. Alcon.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Jose Avila.

#### January 31, 2014

- MR. AVILA: Hello, Council members. My name is Jose Avila. I'm a Field Crew Worker and Assistant Mechanic. I work for Monsanto for seven years. This is by far the safest job I've ever had. I work in the fields and on the machines, the spray. I can say with confidence that we comply with EPA standards. Everything that we do is within protocol of State, County and EPA. My name is Jose Avila and I oppose this bill. Mahalo.
- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman? Thank you very much for being there. We shall return to the Chambers. Benny Ramos, Jr.? And following Mr. Ramos is Jerry Edlao.
- MR. RAMOS: Good morning. My name is Benny Ramos, Jr. I...my mea kiekie birth title is Alii nui Kapu Chief. To the de facto County of Maui and the de facto State of Hawaii and to the foreign aliens of the Kingdom of Hawaii, GMO for me and Monsanto is totally illegal in the Kingdom of Hawaii. The bill that Elle Cochran is presenting, I'm for the bill. I'm for the people. I just came out because I watch Akaku a lot and I see people getting burned by this Administration. Burned being bad stewards, bad heads of the body that's supposed to be taking care of the people. I as Alii nui Kapu Chief, heir of Wailuku, heir of Maui nui o kama, I'm a good steward to my land in Piihana. And I do use some parts of pest control to control areas where I cannot control, but I do not urge to use chemicals around any kind of crop or any kind of seed because the threat of my kalo is being threatened by GMO, being threatened by Monsanto. I went back to my roots because I'm a--what you call--I was de facto'd by your County administrative Department of Human Services because I practice to do the things that I supposed to do as an heir of the kingdom, as an heir of royal line of many, many alii nuis. To my people on Molokai where Molokai supposed to be the most Hawaiian, I suggest you guys dig deeper into Hawaiian Homes, dig deeper into OHA. There's no excuse for Hawaiian Homes that they cannot help you guys with people with 40 acres that only has...not doing nothing with the land. Molokai should be a leader to all Hawaii Nei. That's why I'm a leader here in Wailuku.
- MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.
- MR. RAMOS: Anyway, I have a notice for all of you Council members that I wanted to hand out to you and I also have a genealogical chart for my aunty, Stacy Crivello. And a map that I could show you the lands of Wailuku, the lands that I pertain to. \_\_\_\_\_\_ Baldwin Beach --
- MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.
- MR. RAMOS: --Honokohau to the Pali point. This is Wailuku, this is me...I'm...you are seeing that is presenting myself as an heir to Wailuku, heir of \_\_\_\_\_\_, heir of Maui Nui o kama, yeah. I don't mess around with what I say. I don't think I'm messing around for what I do. I'm up against the biggest monkeys that you can think of, of development, yeah, illegally, fictitiously, knowingly, willingly, committing war crimes to all of us people, yeah. You guys need to hear the voices of the people and stand for the truth, stand on ke akua, God, not the \_\_\_\_\_\_. Thank you for me sharing and I wanted to ask if I could share this with my aunty. Aunty Stacy, I have this for you.

#### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, Staff will assist you, Mr. Ramos.

MR. RAMOS: And this is a notice, if you can make copies for Aunty. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much for your comments, Mr. Ramos. Any questions for the gentleman on what he shared with you this morning? Having none, Mr. Ramos, thank you for being here.

MR. RAMOS: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Jerry Edlao?

MR. EDLAO: Good morning, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Good morning.

MR. EDLAO: And Committee members. My name is Jerry Edlao. I initially signed up testifying by my own behalf as a resident but I'm also an owner of a pest control company and a concerned small businessman. I think there's two different things that being misunderstood. Number one, that all pesticides are bad. And some of 'em are bad. But the fact that this legislation's gonna put everybody out of business, I don't think so. It's gonna impact the small businesses and that is a real concern. Our industry has kinda gotten away from pesticides and right now the only restricted-use pesticide we have is used for tent fumigation. Other than that, a lot of baits and very safe products. I don't wanna get into the training part 'cause, you know, it's been said, all certified guys what they have to go through and et cetera, et cetera, et cetera. But I'm concerned mainly...I think the intent of this legislation is good. My concern is the buffer zones. That's gonna create a whole bunch of unnecessary things as far as notification. If I was to fumigate a house across the street, I would have to let everybody here in this County Building know what's going on. I mean that's gonna be hard on a small business. As far as notification, I mean we as an industry what we have developed is a sensitivity list and if there's...or we come across a client that is sensitive to chemicals and wants to be notified if any work is gonna be done in their neighborhood, we put them on the list. This is Statewide. I personally have put three people on this list on Maui. And I think on Maui we have probably about six people. But we are concerned. It's not that, you know, we go out and just spray and not care. I think even Monsanto, I mean they have some degree of awareness as to what they do but I do strongly believe in the disclosure. I think everybody has a right to know. And, you know, being a pest control operator I notify --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. EDLAO: --people on my list if I'm gonna be in their area. And if we go, do a job and there's people or kids playing in the yard, you know, my technicians will go next door and say, hey, we're gonna be doing this, you know, da de da de da. And if it's a problem then, you know, we

#### January 31, 2014

can reschedule or whatever the case may be. But I think the intent, Ms. Cochran, is good. I believe in disclosure and the right to know. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Edlao. Any questions for the gentleman on his testimony? Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair, and thank you, Mr. Edlao, for being here. So...as pest control...so my question to you is the amount of usage that your company...'cause you said you're a small company.

MR. EDLAO: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: You use pesticides.

MR. EDLAO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: So you read the bill and you saw the amount --

MR. EDLAO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --that triggers --

MR. EDLAO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: -- the whole thing.

MR. EDLAO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: So you fall into that category?

MR. EDLAO: No, because I don't use restricted-use chemicals.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, okay.

MR. EDLAO: The only restricted-use chemical in our industry now, Ms. Cochran, is chloropicrin and Vikane gas, sulfuryl fluoride, which is used for tent fumigation on residence. And my company, we do not do tent fumigation. And when we do pest control work on the interiors, I use a lot of baits and gels and on the exteriors, as much as possible, granules. I try not to use...my whole philosophy is if I don't have to use chemicals, I won't. I mean to me, you know, we've...my company, my technicians we've been certified, trained and I integrated pest management. Basically what it means is, you know, we look at the situation, if we can do modifications to the structures, cracks, crevices, chlorinate them up and things like that, then fine. If we have to use chemicals, I will use baits first and then pesticides, you know, liquid or whatever, aerosols, and things like that. But we try to be very, very safe.

## January 31, 2014

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Mr. Edlao. And one follow-up, Chair? Thank you. And so I thank you for, you know, and there's never been a question in regards to people being properly trained in the usage of any type of pesticide. But you mentioned that you will notify people who want to be notified. So how does a person...I mean if you don't know --

MR. EDLAO: Okay, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --if you have to be sprayed ahead or whatever --

MR. EDLAO: True.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --affected, so how do you let yourself know that you want to be notified?

MR. EDLAO: If we...if I get a call from a client and, you know, they say, well, you know, I really am sensitive to chemicals and, you know, but I have a problem. What are you gonna do? Then, you know, I'll discuss the options. And then, you know, if we move forward and then I'll ask her, you know, if she would like to be put on because, you know, I may not be there the next time. She may call another company. And the other company may just come out there and just start spraying all over the place. But if, you know, well, she's on our list, she asked to be on our list, then we put her on the list, and this is distributed to all pest control operators in the association in the State of Hawaii. And this is something our association did by ourselves. If there are people...I tell you right now, if there's anybody that wants to be on this list on Maui County, give me a call. Talk to me, I'll put you on the list. That's not a problem. All I need is a name, address and phone number and this will be distributed to all our members and every year we have this out and we post it right up in the office. And whenever we do a pest control, you know, we kinda look at this list, same address, then, you know, we know we need to notify that person that we're gonna be in the area, maybe not necessarily at her house or their house but in close proximity.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, okay. Thank you, Mr. Edlao. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, any other questions for Mr. Edlao? Having none, thank you very much for your thoughts . . .(*inaudible*). . .

MR. EDLAO: And kung hei fat choy.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Kung hei fat choy. Stephen West, please, next. Stephen West? Okay, we'll move to Olaf B-E-H-E-N-D-T?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Behrendt.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, it's your turn.

## January 31, 2014

MR. BEHRENDT: Aloha. I have a technical question. Did you get to read a little bit in this handouts from Tuesday 'cause my testimony will be based on some information?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Now is your time to share your testimony.

MR. BEHRENDT: Well, thank you. Well, the technical question was it's about education and we've got a little paradox of education. People from Molokai, they each have a lot of compassion, say that we who are proponents of this bill are not educated because we actually are called activists. And that they are educated but there's a big, like I said, paradox of education because it's fact versus promotion. And people from Molokai, they all state that they are so happy and well-educated and trained by Monsanto. But it's also well-documented that what Monsanto is spraying, the massive amounts of chemicals and toxins are actually unsafe. And they also have documented and tons of research and studies like this one that chemicals are harmful especially for...oops...children. Sorry. So we have a basic right to know what is sprayed because it is about our health. I grew up in a city but I spent half of my time as a kid on a farm too and I remember, that was in 1971, when the guys from the chemical companies came to the farm and distributed those chemicals and the farmers were readily open to increase their crops and all that. But that was in Switzerland. Now 40 years later we are facing a goal of...in 2018 Switzerland will be completely off of chemical fertilizers and chemicals and pesticides and by 2020 the goal is to be all organic. So they are ua mau ke ia o ka aina i ka pono because they took the lesson, they saw what's happening. The land is devastated and I've been to Molokai. It's...Molokai is devastated already. I've been there 20 years ago when I came to this island and it was so beautiful. Now it's all really sad looking. And this is --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. BEHRENDT: --because of this monocrop'ing and pesticides and all that. The runoffs into the...I'm a surfer. The runoffs in the water Hookipa is terrible. Even the runoffs on the street where the County and the State go with the truck and Roundup the sideways...the road side ways is devastating. You can see rainbow colors running down into the ocean. The leaves are covered with a layer of unknown substances. It smells. I go to surfing --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MR. BEHRENDT: --after the rain. May I have another minute, please? You can smell the chemical runoffs from these companies. So there is way more to say but what we're really dealing here with is transparency and education. You have to educate yourself and you have to read these studies because it's a proven fact that pesticides are harming the people and especially children and we are learning it now because 20 years of using it, these are the leftovers from the war. Free chemicals that they told farmers to throw on the fields. They brought chemical warfare into agriculture and now it's controlled and institutionalized by these corporations. There's also a letter from the guy who practically is the godfather of glyphosates. They told the EPA and the

## January 31, 2014

U.S. Department, the secretary, that they have to stop Roundup because they found pathogens that they don't even know what they are.

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MR. BEHRENDT: So the hell is loose. It's out there. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: We have a question for you on...

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Olaf?

CHAIR HOKAMA: If you can return --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: I have a question.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --Ms. Cochran has a question for you.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you. Thank you for being here. And so I just want to go back on your point in regards to Switzerland.

MR. BEHRENDT: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And so they have...or been in the process of banning pesticides and whatnot and thereby by 2020 they would like to be completely organic? Is that what's happening?

MR. BEHRENDT: Yes, that's their goal and ban pesticides. Most of the pesticides that we are debating here are banned in most European countries, Japan, Mexico, including GMO. So we are using stuff that is banned 20 years ago and all these cocktails that we are using here, there's...that's the problem. We heard it from a very well-educated professor. So...

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay, thank you. Thank you for sharing. Thank you.

MR. BEHRENDT: You're welcome. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: How do you spell your last name? What is...

MR. BEHRENDT: B-E-H-R-E-N-D-T.

## January 31, 2014

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Thank you. One question. I wanted...I didn't quite understand where you were going with...as you were trying to say about the Molokai population and education.

MR. BEHRENDT: Well, there was...on Tuesday there was some accusations of that activist, they're not educated, but the people from Monsanto which are only Monsanto people talking on the clock to testify paid by Monsanto that we are not educated.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: So...

MR. BEHRENDT: ...(Inaudible)...

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Do you know for a fact if they're getting paid by Monsanto?

MR. BEHRENDT: Well, they're saying they are employed and they are on the clock. I mean they don't take a day off to testify.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Oh, that's your assumption.

MR. BEHRENDT: That's my assumption, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay.

MR. BEHRENDT: I'm famous for assumptions.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay, I just needed to clarify that. Thank you.

MR. BEHRENDT: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, any other question for the gentleman on testimony he provided? Having none, Mr. Behrendt, thank you very much for your time.

MR. BEHRENDT: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Hana Office, is there anyone wishing to provide testimony?

MS. LONO: The Hana Office has no one waiting to testify, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Lanai, Ms. Fernandez, anyone wishing to provide testimony?

MS. FERNANDEZ: There's no one waiting to testify on Lanai.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Ms. Alcon, your next Molokai person, please?

## January 31, 2014

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Christopher Kaauwai.

- MR. KAAUWAI: Hi, good morning, Council Chair Hokama and board. My name is Christopher Kaauwai. I'm here to oppose this bill. 'Cause this is my...they're the only job that pays my bills and feeds my family unless you can find me a better job that pays the same or better than what I make now. I'll be more than happy to stand by your side and listen to your lies and disbeliefs. And that's all I have to say. Aloha.
- CHAIR HOKAMA: Aloha. Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman? Having none, thank you for being there. Ms. Alcon, next person, please?
- MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Jolenta Duvauchelle.
- MS. DUVAUCHELLE: Honorable Committee, Chair Hokama, Vice-Chair Couch and respected Council members. My name is Jolenta Duvauchelle. I'm 21 years old, born on Oahu and raised on Molokai. I'm currently employed at Monsanto Molokai as a seasonal Field Crew Worker and I'm a strong supporter of pesticides. First of all, I would like to state that we are not getting paid to be here today. We are on the clock but we all have a choice to come over here and speak or stay at work or just come and support. I think all the rumors about GMO and cancer --

CHAIR HOKAMA: There will remain order in this meeting.

- MS. DUVAUCHELLE: --is . . . (inaudible). . . First of all, I work in the field that is sprayed with all kinds of chemicals every single day. It is dangerous, however, the company trains their workers to make sure no one is contaminated. We put up \_\_\_\_\_ signs to show everyone that they cannot go into a field for a certain amount of time. These signs are posted on all four corners of each field. Pesticides are a big part of the agricultural industry. Without them all crops would fail. It protects our food we grow from insects, bugs and all kinds of diseases. So I believe it doesn't matter how much pesticides we use but how much...but how we use it is important. Besides pesticides I would like to address the issue of regulations and restrictions. I read a little bit of the bill and I don't understand it. Monsanto is already sending in reports and complying with all rules and regulations. Why should we have to send this information to someone else? We already do it. Why 500 feet of a boundary is set? Is there evidence supporting that 500 feet is necessary? If this bill gets passed, we could lose a lot of land and a lot of jobs. Monsanto takes care of their employees and their families and their community. This is not fair to the next generations like myself. I'm young, smart and a hard worker and we all have families to provide for. Didn't anyone stop to care and even think of how this bill would affect farmers? A lot of us could be unemployed and broke and I know if I wasn't...I didn't feel safe working for Monsanto, I would not be here. Please do not pass this bill. Thank you.
- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the lady? Having none, thank you very much for your testimony. Next person, please, Ms. Alcon?

#### January 31, 2014

MS. ALCON: The next testifier is Eric Lacar.

- MR. LACAR: Thank you, Maui Council members, for allowing me to voice my opinion on this proposed bill. I am here on my behalf and my choice, a taxpayer, a resident of Molokai. I believe Monsanto is doing all they possibly can do to keep employees safe from any pesticides or any hazardous material. This safety is not directly only for the employees but more importantly for the community of Molokai. Monsanto Molokai opens its doors and invites anyone who has any questions and concerns in regards to what Monsanto is doing. I knew that this is an invitation to those who has an open mind, not for those who are unbiased and whose intentions are to criticize. I feel safe at work and I firmly believe Monsanto has the same care for not only the employees, also those who make up the community of Molokai. With over roughly 7,000 people who occupy the island of Molokai, 11 percent stimulates our economy workforce, that is in regards to agriculture. If this bill is passed, it could jeopardize over 700 farmers. This would create a major loss of economic stimulation for the island of Molokai. I hope this will not happen. It will not only hurt my family of five but at an average ratio of one farmer, their partner with one to eight children, uncles, aunties, grandmas, and grandpas, this bill would hurt over 300...3,800 family members of our agriculture community which makes up more than 50 percent of the people of Molokai. In conclusion, I oppose this bill. Thank you for your time. My name is Eric Lacar, representative of Monsanto, who opposes this bill. Mahalo, peace, love and unity to all. Aloha.
- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman, Members? Having none, thank you very much. Ms. Alcon, next person, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Aristotle Oamil.

- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the testifier, Members? Thank you very much. One more person, please, Ms. Alcon?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Andrew Arce.

#### January 31, 2014

MR. ARCE: Aloha, County Council members. I thank you for this opportunity to be able to come before you to voice my concern. My name is Andrew Kaleola Arce, a resident of Molokai for 52 years. I've been involved in agriculture for more than 30 years, involved in the seed industry for more than 15 years and an owner and operator of Arce's Farms since 2007, a farm that my father started in the early 1960s. I currently farm part-time on my Hawaiian Homes land in Hoolehua. Crops in production on my farm currently are asparagus, broccoli, won bok cabbage, grape tomatoes, Chinese peas and Molokai's best sweet corn. My family farm was voted Family Farm of the Year in 2012 by the Hawaii Farm Bureau Federation. I stand before you today to oppose the proposed GMO/pesticide bill. One of the reasons my farm is successful is being able to control pests that populate my crops. I use all types of products, organic, biological, general-use and restricted-use products when needed. By passing this bill it would make it difficult for me to operate my farm with the required buffer zones. I would need to open up new farm land. This would cost me thousands of dollars for land, clearing, irrigation lines, new windbreaks, soil conditioning, et cetera. I also need to pay for the acreage fee for the MIS irrigation system for land that I cannot use due to the buffer zone requirements. I also lose out on thousands of dollars that I already invested on infrastructure on my current farm. Pesticide regulation should remain with the Federal and State agencies. For those of you that don't farm, it takes about seven years 'til you start making a profit. I'm just starting my seventh year this year so if this proposal passes, you will send me and other small farmers, family farms, throughout Molokai and Maui County back to year one or out of business. Another reason why my farm is successful is because of the technology that farming has taken. New varieties of vegetables and fruits that were bred being more nutritious, grow faster, resists diseases and insects better than their ancestors of the past. New technology in ways that we irrigate, fertilize crops, new and safer chemistries that we use out in our fields --

MS. NAKATA: Two and half minutes.

MR. ARCE: --computer software that helps us do better planning and recordkeeping. I know that GMO is a technology that works. I have seen this firsthand. We need to continue to improve our crops for the future. As a farmer I support all types of farming whether it's organic, conventional, genetically modified. Again, I ask you humbly to oppose this bill. Aloha.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman? I'll go with Ms. Crivello first, followed by Ms. Cochran.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Aloha, Andrew. This is --

MR. ARCE: Aloha, Aunty.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: --this is Councilmember Crivello. I...thank you for your farming, the Arce Farms and I understand you also work for Mycogen and...

MR. ARCE: That's true, Aunty. I'm the Farm Manager for Mycogen Seeds here in Molokai.

## **January 31, 2014**

- COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Right. So do you feel that you're receiving the education as far as, you know, you being a farmer and a worker with agribusiness, do you find that the use of pesticides is balanced for you on your...on a personal side as well as...the agribusiness that you are employed at?
- MR. ARCE: Yes, Aunty. As far as on my farm and even at Mycogen Seed, it's all about a balance. So we rely heavily on our field scouts that go out and take the data out in the field as far as what kind of, type of pests we have whether it's insect disease or weed pressure. And we make our judgment calls on what we will apply according to what we find out in the fields. It's not that like we just go out and spray everything. If we have issues in certain areas, we look at our game plan and see what type of products that might fit the menu for that day. We normally come in with something that's not restricted. There's a lot of chemistries now that are safe that have short REI times, you know, as little as four hours. So we try and use the products that are lesser of the compounds that we use. In the last resort we use restricted-use pesticides. For corn a lot of problems with insects and it's all about this maize chlorotic mosaic virus that we had and it's prevalent throughout the State in all of our industries and even at my own farm. If you can't, if you're not able to control leafhoppers or corn thrips, the virus usually sets in and you can totally lose your whole crop. So even on my own farm that's the basic physiology that I use.
- COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: I have one more comment or question. So, Andrew, so I am fully knowledgeable that your home farm involves your children, your grandchildren, your wife and all of your ohana. So am I to believe that you feel that whatever restricted pesticides or whatever applications you would use, you feel confident that your family is in harm's or no harm's?
- MR. ARCE: I feel very confident in what I do. I have seven mo`opuna that help me in various projects on my farm. They help me all the way from transplanting seedlings to ho`ohana out in the field, all the way to harvest and it is a family effort. All of my children moved back to Molokai as of last year so it's a family activity. So we are out there all the time when we can and, you know, and that's what I learned from my dad. My dad taught us how to farm and it was a family effort. Without our family we would not be able to be as successful as we are now. And hopefully one day I can pass this on to my children and hopefully the cycle continues.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Mahalo, mahalo, mahalo, Andrew, for all that you do.

MR. ARCE: Mahalo, Aunty, Council members.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much, Ms. Crivello. Mr. Arce, Ms. Cochran has a question for you. Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Hi, Mr. Arce. It's Elle Cochran. Can you hear me?

MR. ARCE: Aloha.

#### January 31, 2014

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Aloha. Thank you for being there. And so, yeah, I was trying to distinguish your testimony in regards to your personal farming, you know, versus I guess you're with Mycogen also?

MR. ARCE: Yes, I am.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

MR. ARCE: But I'm here to voice my opinions and in support of my family farm.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. So in regards to your family farm then I believe one of your concerns is the buffer zone?

MR. ARCE: Yeah.

- COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And I would like to know what you feel would be a good amendment to this current legislation where it wouldn't harm your, you know, your family farming in regards to the buffer zone.
- MR. ARCE: I'm, actually I don't have any recommendations right now. I know that, you know, if that, that buffer zone would affect me, 'cause the area that I'm farming right now is within the buffer zone requirement. I'm not sure what amendments might be made. I feel that there shouldn't be any buffer zones required. But like I said if that comes into effect, all the land that I have and all the money and infrastructure that I already invested in is kinda down the drain. So and I need...if I want to continue to farm I would have to move to, you know, move into more area where it is not developed and that would cost me thousands of dollars. I already have...I kind of exhausted my USDA loans with the government and in order for me to get another loan I'm not sure what that would take. But that would really put me in a bind.
- COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you. Yeah, I'd like to discuss more in regards to that with you. As I've mentioned to others it's a, you know, working document. So thanks for sharing that. But...a follow-up, Chair? So my next question is in regards to restricted-use pesticides. I believe you mentioned that, you know, your last resort is to utilize those. So do you personally fall into the category that this...the, you know, the gallonage and tonnage that it's mentioning in the bill?
- MR. ARCE: No, no, I don't. I don't fall into that criteria. But I'm just afraid that if this goes through, who knows what might happen later down the road as far as requirements for small-quantity users like me.
- COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay, thank you very much. And I hope to avoid that. Thank you for being there.

MR. ARCE: Aloha.

## January 31, 2014

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Aloha.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Any other questions for Mr. Arce? Having none, thank you very much for being on Molokai this morning. Members, it's the Chair's intent to take a one hour break at this time so we can get back. I would like to try and reconvene at 1:00. We have quorum 'til 2:30 so at which time if we're not concluded, we shall recess and try and get another date where quorum is not an issue so that we can continue and try and finish this phase of the process. So the Chair will keep you informed and I will just say that this Committee will not be starting discussion of any revision, any other proposal until we complete testimony. So as long as there's testimony, the Committee will not start its Committee work as we go through experience of all the other Committees. So we'll try and do the best we can, Members. And once we finish testimony is when we'll get to working on legislation. Okay, we'll stand in recess 'til 1:00 p.m. . . . . (gavel). . .

**RECESS:** 12:00 p.m.

RECONVENE: 1:05 p.m.

CHAIR HOKAMA: ...(gavel)... The Policy Committee shall return to session. This is a continued recessed meeting of January 28<sup>th</sup>. We are here to take testimony on Policy Item 58 under the heading of Pesticides and Genetically Modified Organisms. It is the intent...and thank you, Members, for doing your best to adjust your schedules. The Chair is hoping that we can conclude the testimony portion of the meeting process this afternoon. That is the goal. If we cannot then we need to find other adjustments in our calendars. But that's the goal and I think...the Chair thinks it's a doable thing, so let us all strive to allow the people to have their say but be able to us to move to the next phase of the process. So we'll start with the Chamber at this time and then go to our District Offices. I will ask if there is Stephanie Constantino? If you'll please come forward and after Ms. Constantino, the next person is Michelle Kwik, K-W-I-K.

MS. CONSTANTINO: Hello, County Council members. I support the intent of this disclosure bill for the following reasons. In the mid-1990s high technology corporations were encouraged to come to Hawaii to stimulate economic growth. Legislation was passed to financially assist and protect these corporations as incentives. Benefits of undisclosed amounts have been routinely given making it a well-known fact that Hawaii taxpayers are helping to subsidize these high-technology corporations. And yet the activities of these corporations pertaining to their open air seed testing and the spraying of over 20-plus restricted-use pesticides on their testing fields goes completely undisclosed to the very taxpayers that help subsidize them. This is not simply farming here. For what farmer dressed from head to toe in a HAZMAT suit, saturates his soil with biohazard in an effort to sterilize it? I wonder how Princess Liliuokalani would feel about the aina being sterilized. We have been forced to rely on those corporations to assure us that they are doing everything safely while they have a complete conflict of interest in this matter. This is a travesty in light of the fact that there's a body of evidence that has established that GE crops

#### January 31, 2014

are inherently dangerous. Please see exhibit A. For instance in Dr. Arpad Pusztai's studies in 1999, nearly every system of his laboratory rats' bodies were adversely affected by the GE potato. Furthermore, the rats were sterile after the third generation. Pusztai was a major proponent of genetic engineering until his clinical studies showed such alarming results. There is also a body of litigation, please see exhibit B, that provides precedent as it establishes that transgenic contamination of seeds and plants is harmful and irreparably injures farmers' rights as well as consumers' rights. Please note on the exhibit the case concerning Hawaii biopharm where Monsanto and other biotechs negligently crossed corn with AIDS proteins, Hepatitis B proteins, Trypsin and others and then planted them all over west Maui acreage and on the other islands without no...without so much as one environmental impact study. We need a disclosure bill. We cannot rely on the Federal government to regulate as you will note in exhibit B. The USDA has repeatedly issued permits without the proper NEPA requirements.

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. CONSTANTINO: Thank you. Neither can we rely on our State government as evidenced by the upcoming GMO preemption bill. Both of these government levels obviously have members that have conflicting interests. Our right to know is a basic fundamental right. Please protect our rights. Give us a disclosure bill. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Members, any questions to the lady on her testimony provided? Thank you very much for our presence this afternoon.

MS. CONSTANTINO: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Michelle Kwik, K-W-I-K. And after Ms. Kwik, Kelley Janes.

MS. KWIK: Thank you, Chair and Council members, for being here today. I support the intent of the disclosure bill. I have been a pediatric nurse specialist for close to 30 years. I have spent many years as a neonatal intensive care unit nurse. I ran a public health program for children 0 to 5 years of age and I spent the last half of my career working as a school nurse in a district with 6,000 children. Our children are our future. And they are the most vulnerable population because their bodies and brains are still developing. What we see in our children's health is a direct result of what is going on in our environment. Fifteen years ago at the district I worked in there were approximately 20 children with EpiPens. I don't know if you all know what EpiPens are. They're used for anaphylactic allergies typically to food. Today there's more than 150 children with EpiPens. Fifteen years ago we only have one Type 1 diabetic. Today there are 18 Type 1 diabetics. Children with leaky gut syndrome are on the rise and this results in multiple chemical sensitivities and allergies to gluten, corn, soy, eggs and dairy to name a few. Inhalers for asthma have gone up at least 20 percent. We all know autism was almost unheard of 20 years ago. In the last year we had probably 250 children on the spectrum in the district I worked in, with every year we had at least 20 new cases of children three years old 'cause that's when we first tested them. All of these disorders are immune disorders or exacerbated by a sensitive immune system. The number of immune disorders in our most vulnerable population is off the

## January 31, 2014

charts. And as an advocate for children, I say we need to make every effort to put a stop to this. We all know stories of tobacco, asbestos and DDT. Originally declared safe, they cause widespread death and disease. Food is something we all consume daily. Everyone eats. So 100 percent of the population is affected by pesticides and herbicides, especially the children. One of the main differences with our food consumption today compared to 15 to 20 years ago is the massive production of herbicide-tolerant soy, corn, cotton, canola plants engineered with bacterial genes that allow them to survive otherwise deadly doses of herbicide. These herbicide-tolerant plants are engineered to tolerate Roundup whose active ingredient is glyphosphate. Glyphosphate and Bt toxin that is engineered into GM corn ends up in every GMO corn chip, corn tortilla and all GM corn syrup. Did you know that Bt toxin produced by GMO corn kills insects by punching holes in their digestive tracts? Bt toxin glyphosphate --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. KWIK: --thank you, components of GMOs, are linked to intestinal permeability, imbalanced \_\_\_\_\_\_ bacteria, immune activation allergies, impaired digestion. One of the world's leading experts of GM food safety, Arpad Pusztai, she believes that the digestive tract which is the first and largest point of contact with foods can rebuild various reactions to toxins and should be the first target of GM food risk assessment. And we all know that the increase in Roundup in soybeans was up by 227 percent between 1996 and--

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. KWIK: --2011. Can I have a couple of seconds left?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Sure.

MS. KWIK: And in regular GMO soy...non-GMO soy acreage decreased by 20 percent in that same time. And I just have one more important thing I would like to say that I'm really proud of all of you for looking ahead and creating measures coming up that will help to create open doors for our future. For example, you know, helping farmers farm more, in more of a healthy way, you know, more of a sustainable way. I know there's a lot of measures up right now. And I think as we produce more of these measures and bills to help society in that way, it's gonna support the farmers on Molokai. It's gonna support everybody to do more farming in more of a natural way. So as we open the doors, everybody's going to be taken care and I know it's going to take time. But we need to consider the well-being of our young --

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MS. KWIK: --children. Thank you so much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Members, any questions to the lady on testimony she presented?

## **January 31, 2014**

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you. And thank you, Ms. Kwik, for being here. The statements you're making as the growing immune disorders and diabetes and what have you, the laundry list you mentioned, that is from firsthand experience from what you --

MS. KWIK: That's from --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --you've seen?

MS. KWIK: --firsthand experience. And I even have...I did all the health assessments of all the kids at school, all the Special Eds. needs...Special Ed. children. I did 200 health assessments a year. I did every child in the district's health cards with their health concerns issues. And it's astronomical. It really is. And our school district has put aside 15 acres of land that they are starting to farm organically so that they can feed the children from the school from organic fields. That's how important it was to this school district.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Sorry, a follow-up. And this is here?

MS. KWIK: It's in Encinitas, California. So they have started all of that.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay, thank you --

MS. KWIK: You're welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, any other questions to the lady? Having none, thank you for your thoughts. Kelley Janes? And following Ms. Janes is Bill Greenleaf.

MS. JANES: Hi, I'm Kelley Janes. I live in Haiku. I've lived here on Maui for seven years. I have been a farmer for over 30 years. I have been a migrant laborer for five years. I've worked breeding seed for organic seed companies for seven years. And I come because I was diagnosed with inflammatory breast cancer and I'm one of the lucky ones because it was a misdiagnosis but they gave me a six-month lifespan to live. And, you know, when you have two young children, a six-and a nine-year-old, your life flies right in front of you and you don't know what's going to happen next. And so it's kind of...I'm here to speak from my heart and part of my heart is a heart of a farmer and a person who loves the land. I definitely am in support of the intent of the bill of 58. Thank you for bringing that for conversation. We're all learning. I certainly am. I'm not very articulate and there is...so I decided to read something to you from a book called *Breasts: A Natural and Unnatural History of Breasts* by Florence Williams. She did her Ph.D. I believe and as a result she wrote this book. And so I will do my best to read here because I was

#### January 31, 2014

stunned and so I'm just gonna read a few quick *Cliff Notes*. In the United States 700 new chemicals come to market each year joining the 82,000 already in use. Of these 82,000 only a few hundred have ever been tested for health effects despite the 35-year existence of government regulatory agencies and their guiding laws in the United States including the Toxic Substance Control Act, only five chemicals have ever been banned. Unlike in Europe, American companies are not required to perform safety studies on chemicals before they introduce them into the marketplace. In fact, they have a strong incentive not to perform them. In the United States every chemical is assumed safe until proven guilty. The burden to do that falls on government and university scientists who don't have the institutional muscle or resources to keep up. It takes years of work to prove that a chemical causes harm, and a shield of proprietary industrial secrets

has kept manufacturers from revealing which chemicals they are even using. These recipes may be private but they swim in our bloodstreams. Of the 650 top \_\_\_\_\_ chemicals in use, four billion pounds get released into the American water and air each year. Forty two billion pounds

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

are made here or imported each day --

MS. JANES: --for \_\_\_\_\_\_ products. I'm gonna skip ahead because there's one thing that really struck me that I think we all need to hear. Several studies have compared that pesticides levels in women with breast cancer to those in women without breast cancer. Nothing remarkable showed up but then in 2007 researchers looked at blood samples collected from mothers in the 1960s. The younger women, the ones exposed to more pesticides as girls, had levels still measurable to their blood because of pesticides half-life, have a five-fold increase in breast cancer incidents later in life. The girls who were older than 14 were...who were exposed to pesticides, which is everyone, was introduced had no increase in the incidents of cancer. Sorry . . .(inaudible). . .

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MS. JANES: For those girls who --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Can you conclude, please, Ms. Janes?

MS. JANES: --received . . . (inaudible). . . early use. In other words, they're now showing that there...there are sensitive keyholds where children are sensitive to receiving cancer up to the age of 12 and it shows up later in life.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MS. JANES: And that's a topic that we can't see with what's going on with pesticides and that's my greatest concern today. So thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, thank you for your testimony. Members, any questions to the lady on testimony she presented? Thank you, Ms. Janes. Bill Greenleaf, please? And after Mr. Greenleaf, we shall return to the Districts.

#### January 31, 2014

MR. GREENLEAF: Chair Hokama, thank you. Council members, good day. So my name is Bill Greenleaf and I'm representing Maui Farmers Union as their president. Maui Farmers Union is a bridge-building farming organization. And looking at this as for concerns, I felt it was important to go to speak to a conventional farmer and understand just what their concerns are. It turns out we don't have any conventional farmers in the union. We're certainly open to it. I met a man that grows on 50 acres. He grows cabbage, tomato, he grows zucchini and he grows...what else does he grow? Well, anyway he grows four crops. He's been growing, he's a third generation Japanese farmer and I asked him what his concerns were. He said, well, I'm really threatened. My livelihood is threatened and I'm also vilified. I've been feeding people. This guy, he was so emotional, he was almost crying. He said I used to give my extra food to the goats and the pigs and now I feed it to the homeless people through the Food Bank. And, oh my gosh, and so I said, what's your threat? He said, well, my threat is that if this restricted-use pesticide...I said, do you use restricted-use pesticide? He said a little, I try not to. I said, well, I don't think Ms. Cochran's bill and I know on Kauai, Gary Hooser's bill did not impact any farmers that grow food for the local economy...and because of the thresholds. And I think that...so I asked him to explain how his life had happened. He's third generation farmer. And he said his grandfather didn't use chemicals. They didn't even exist. Then in his father's lifetime the chemicals were advocated by the U.S. government. The farmers tried them and they had success with them. It seemed to make their life a little bit easier and they got good yields and every year they kinda got pulled into the system more and more and more as more chemistry came on until it became a way of life by the time this fellow, and he asked me not to use his name, by the time he was a grower. And he says he's tried growing other ways but it just doesn't work for him. He doesn't know how. So that really got into my mind and I realized that if Farmers Union is gonna build a bridge, we gotta have a way to connect agricultural practices from the past, and that means the third generation, and back into Hawaiian times with the present generations and the future generations.

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. GREENLEAF: Farmers...young children are not following their family into farms because...we don't know why but when we talk to young kids, they aren't interested in spraying chemicals on fields. They are very interested in the regenerative agricultural practices where we bring life back in the soil. So anyway, what Farmers-I don't wanna go over my time--what Farmers Union would like to offer is we believe we can take a homeland area of substantial size and we can bring it back to life as a demonstration and we can --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MR. GREENLEAF: --also show some of these farmers that are afraid of being displaced from their livelihood that there is a big difference between now and the '50s. The markets are in Hawaii. We've got the chefs, we've got the restaurants, we've got the hotels. We could sell so much food and the 700 or 1,000 displaced workers could have future jobs. And so I'm...Farmers Union is seeking funding for this. We're looking for grants and will probably ask the County for some

#### January 31, 2014

help with this too. We believe we can be a bridge builder for this problem so that people won't lose their livelihoods and we can have future farmers as well. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Greenleaf, for your comments. Members, any questions for the gentleman on testimony he shared this afternoon?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you. And thank you, Mr. Greenleaf, for being here and I appreciate. I like your comment about bridge building. And so you mentioned...and I guess to summarize past, present and future practices and sort of somehow connect those, is that sort of one of your intentions in bridge building?

MR. GREENLEAF: Right, yes. The past was so vibrant and we know the Hawaiian past was thriving. Now there's been an interruption and there's been an interruption for six, seven decades. So the people that had that knowledge are gone. We need to regain that knowledge. We need to...and we have regained it. There are many farms, and I'll send you some names, but there are many farms that have regenerated land that had a lot of this toxic poisons put on it and killed all the life and those lands are thriving again. And then the future bridge is to the kids, the ones that are gonna come now and they are interested. And this is a...there's a passion in bringing life to the soil just as there's a passion for people that are already established conventionally and are bringing life to the people that are starving.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Right.

MR. GREENLEAF: It...is that helpful?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yes, thank you.

MR. GREENLEAF: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you very much for your efforts. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Any other questions for the gentleman? Mr. Greenleaf, thank you for being here.

MR. GREENLEAF: Thank you. Thank you, Council.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Molokai, would you ask your next testifier forward, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Phyllis Starkey.

## January 31, 2014

- MS. STARKEY: Hi, my name is Phyllis Starkey. I'm a resident of Molokai and I work for Mycogen Seed and I opposing for this bill. Thank you.
- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your comments. Any questions for the lady? Having none, thank you. Next Molokai person, please, Ms. Alcon?
- MS. ALCON: Next person is Tyra Reyes.
- MS. REYES: Aloha, Council members. My name is Tyra Reyes. I'm a resident of Molokai, born and raised. I work for Mycogen Seeds. I love my job and I oppose this bill. Mahalo.
- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your comments. Any questions, Members? Thank you for sharing your thoughts. Next person, please?
- MS. ALCON: Next testifier is Jae Won Perez.
- MS. PEREZ: Hello, everyone. I will like to thank Chairman Hokama, Vice-Chair Couch, and Committee members in taking the time to listen to my testimony. My name is Jae Won Perez, a resident of Molokai and I work for Mycogen Seeds. I strongly oppose the proposed bill, PIA-58, because I truly believe that we have the experts at the State and Federal level enforcing strict regulations on pesticide usage and overseeing GMOs. There are no scientific data indicating proper usage of pesticides and GMO products cause health issues. I believe that my company as well as any seed company and farmers follow strict regulations on proper usage of pesticides. And if there were any health concerns and concerns about pesticides, there is a State advisory council. Members include expert at the University of Hawaii, Department of Health, Department of Agriculture and other representatives, all who are appointed by the Governor to address those concerns and to seek for an investigation. PIA-58 is an anti-agricultural bill intended to target local farmers and feed companies. It does not address other users of pesticides. This is discrimination. The proposed bill will heavily burden any local farmer as well as seed companies. It will only waste their time, money and resources to hand out notifications and make buffer zones when there are no scientific data proving that proper usage of pesticide causes harm. It will also be harder for farmers and seed companies to produce crops which may lead to fewer jobs, less food to provide for the people. Our island has...as...our island has the highest unemployment rate according to the State Department of Labor and Industrial Relations. If this bill were to pass, it will take away so many jobs and opportunities for our Molokai residents. At our company we do not see each other as just coworkers. We see each other as family and friends. And I clearly do not wish to see myself, my family and my friends lose their jobs. In conclusion I strongly oppose this bill because we do not need to...
- MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.
- MS. PEREZ: We do not need the County to regulate something that has already been regulated at the Federal and State levels with experts overseeing everything, especially not with the hardworking

#### January 31, 2014

taxpayers' money. Also the County does not have the right to take away jobs that are run under safe and strict regulations. Thank you for your time. Aloha.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the lady on testimony presented? Having none, thank you for your thoughts this afternoon. Next person, please, Ms. Alcon?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Iponohea Nahoopii-Kaauawai.

MS. NAHOOPII-KAAUAWAI: Aloha, everyone.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Aloha.

MS. NAHOOPII-KAAUAWAI: My name is Iponohea Nahoopii-Kaauawai, born and raised on this island of Molokai for 28 years. I work for Monsanto Molokai as an ESH...ES&H assistant. I feel that our company's main focus is the safety of our coworkers, their families and our community. We have trainings on everything that we do at Monsanto including worker protection standards. We also have our 30-day log available and always up to date. We have earned a VPP-OSHA star for our company that has had a lot of requirements to receive. With that being said, I feel that it's even safer to work for this company. I would never put myself or my family in any dangerous situations. This job has provided a lot for my family and I. They also help out our community in ways that they...in any way that they can. They give monetary donations, labor and give \_\_\_\_\_\_ to help others fundraise. I just want to be clear on this situation that we are not being paid to testify on this bad bill. I am here voluntarily. We still have to go back to work to make up for the time being testified. We are here to defend our jobs. So that with that being said, those are the reasons why I oppose this bill.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for the lady, Members? Having none, thank you very much for being there this afternoon. Okay, Ms. Alcon, one more and then we're gonna return to Chambers.

MS. ALCON: The next testifier is Lionel Adachi.

MR. ADACHI: Aloha, my name is Lionel Adachi. I am a keiki o ka aina of Molokai. I am also a native Hawaiian, born and raised here on this island. I come from a line of generation of farmers. My first job at 14 years old, I used to work for Dole Plantation in Hoolehua, Molokai and later on I ended up working for Del Monte over in Kualapuu. In 2004 to 2010 I worked as a contractor in Baghdad, Iraq and in support of the operation Iraqi Freedom. What we are doing here right now not only in research and development is we're trying to produce our food for our families here as well as in the mainland and as well as our military out in the field doing security work for our country. I have seen a lot of places on my travels that do not have what we have here, the opportunity to produce the product as...to support our country. In short, I'd like to say that I oppose the bill that is being put forth here in our country. The majority of Molokai residents also oppose this bill. Mahalo, thank you.

## January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman? Having none, thank you for your testimony this afternoon. Hana Office, anyone wishing to testify?

MS. LONO: The Hana Office has no one waiting to testify, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thanks, Ms. Lono. Lanai, Ms. Fernandez, anyone would like to testify?

MS. FERNANDEZ: There is no one waiting to testify on Lanai.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Ms. Fernandez. Mark Strathmann, S-T-R-A-T-H-M-A-N-N. Mark Strathmann? David Fisher? And following Mr. Fisher, we have a Claire Florio, F-L-O-R-I-O.

MR. FISHER: Aloha, good afternoon, Chairman Hokama, Council members, fellow participants here and over Akaku. My name is David Fisher and some of you may remember me as the person who had the honor of launching and operating the Small Business Development Center at the Tech Park here for 19 years. I left four years ago to start my consulting practice, Maui Venture Consulting. Thank you for the opportunity to speak today. Just as moving away from the dependency on imported fossil fuel is good for the economy, environment and citizens of Maui so does reducing our dependency on imported food. The UH CTAHR estimated that in 2009 substituting locally grown food for import is a \$7 billion opportunity. Now not many people realize that this is about the same amount of money that we spend on energy. And just to get some perspective both numbers combined are actually larger than the 10 billion that visitors spend here in Hawaii. So it's a significant opportunity. My work these days is to help companies bring back to Hawaii some of this money that we're currently spending in importing energy and food. At another time I would gladly go into detail on how I'm doing this but wanted to focus in for today on some good news and that we on Maui are making great progress even if it seems slow both in terms of energy and food. We hear much about energy...much more about the energy than about food. But in the area of food you should know that Maui's Whole Foods store leads all of the other Whole Foods stores in the nation in buying over 40 percent of its vegetables and fruits locally. Most of this is from farmers and value-added processors who practice ecological growing techniques without the use of petroleum-based fertilizers, pesticides and herbicides. Last year Whole Foods announced that it'll require GMO labeling. And I mentioned Whole Foods primarily because they're such a highly visible example of a major trend responding to consumers who are perceiving that there is a connection between fresh local food that has not traveled for thousands of miles and our health. So if we were to really analyze this, what we spend on food we should factor in what we spend and save on healthcare. And again to give some perspective on these numbers we spend 8.8 billion on --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. FISHER: --healthcare. So what does this all have to do with disclosure of pesticides and the location of GMO operations? Without disclosure, especially now in the context of what's going

## January 31, 2014

on here and Statewide, we risk creating the perception that locally grown food is tainted and as a result reverse the trend to buy local. The story of the pesticide disclosure bill is already, all the bills, is already a national story as well as a local story. And this story will only grow with the State considering laws to preempt the County, I just have a minute more, and --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MR. FISHER: --multi-national chemical companies filing lawsuits against Kauai County. All of this hurts our economy and democracy and, if we can't buy local, perhaps our health. I also think this has a potential to threaten the visitor industry. The antidote to these fears is transparency and scientific study of the facts. But you can't have the second without the first. We also need to be able to trust our government and with the role of corporate money in government this is already a problem. One fact is that the proposed law here is only going to affect a small handful of large operations. Small farms will not be covered under this bill and would likely actually benefit from the consumer confidence and safety and quality of locally grown food. On the other hand if the bill is not passed, small businesses selling to Whole Foods and other places may actually be harmed. I finally believe that disclosure requirement is going to ...not going to cost because --

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MR. FISHER: --it's very large companies and they should be able to afford this and given all the thoroughness and training and documentation that we've been hearing about today, that shouldn't be that much of an extra cost. Transparency should serve these companies...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Fisher. You're gonna need to end it.

MR. FISHER: Okay, thank you. The transparency should serve these companies as well as the whole community. Mahalo.

- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman, Members, on testimony provided? Mr. Fisher, we appreciate your comments this afternoon. Thank you. Claire Florio? F-L-O-R-I-O. Let's see, Courtney Swanson? And following Ms. Swanson is Paul Garrett Hugel, H-U-G-E-L.
- MS. SWANSON: Thank you for this opportunity. My name is Courtney Swanson. And I have a chronic illness that's directly affected by pesticide exposure. It's called interstitial cystitis. And for those who don't know what that is, it causes severe irritation to my bladder linings which keeps me from eating a lot of foods that other people can enjoy. And there's been direct links that the pesticide exposure not only caused me to feel this way but that it may play a role in the development of the disease to begin with. This has been a long, hard road for me. I went...I suffered greatly for many years before I even knew how to help myself and thankfully through avoiding pesticide contamination and eating the right foods which involves no GMO foods at all, I'm able to enjoy my life again and not have my joy completely robbed like I used to. But I don't want other people to suffer like I had. It's...it was a long, hard road. Monsanto claims that

#### January 31, 2014

there's no studies or anything that indicate that there's anything wrong with pesticide use and they don't wanna affect our health but, honestly, can Monsanto actually be trusted? There's a very good website called gmwatch.org. This is not a blog. This is a very well-documented website that outlines a long history of lies and deceit of the part of Monsanto. France...France's highest court found them guilty of advertising claims of leaving the soil clean. The EPA scientist found doctor studies...doctored studies that covered up...that they covered up dioxin contamination in products. They were...Monsanto is fined 1.2 million for trying to conceal the discharge of contaminated wastewater in a river in Connecticut. They've already had to pay \$1.5 million to the Justice Department for bribing. They were fined \$50,000 by the New York Attorney General. And six government officials in the Canadian state, their Senate Committee were bribed between one and 2 million dollars to approve growth hormone without further study. So if there's nothing wrong with what they're doing, why are they paying people off? There's also a very good documentary on YouTube about a group of reporters that were hired by *Fox News* to --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. SWANSON: --uncover the truth about what Monsanto is doing. And when they came to their conclusions that they did, they were actually threatened by Monsanto with big lawsuits if they disclosed what they found. And they were also, because they wouldn't shut up, they were then bribed and they wouldn't take the money. So these are reporters in their own words so I urge you to please go on to YouTube and put in this search Monsanto Cancer Milk Fox Fires Reporters. Just one more moment, please.

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. SWANSON: And please I just urge you to research for yourself. There's so much information about this company out there. So I feel bad for all these farmers who are scared of losing their means of work but if we don't have our health which is our most basic need in life, we really have nothing. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Ms. Swanson. Any questions for the lady, Members? Thank you very much. Paul Garrett Hugel, H-U-G-E-L.

MR. HUGEL: Aloha, Council members, Elle Cochran, those viewers watching on line and around the world and those in Maui. I would like to share something that I think is relevant to this case that may not have been brought forward. We have a challenge and it's going to require a whole new way of looking at an opportunity from this challenge. And I'd like to share with you a minute and 17 seconds from part of a broadcast that I broadcast worldwide from his Holiness the Dalai Lama in Maui. (Audio presentation) Effort with vision and patience, determination, a more holistic view that, huh, certainly we can reduce many crisis. That is my fundamental belief. And then most important, as I mentioned earlier, clear vision. Here you have to know the reality and in order to do that holistic view and then in order to do that development of determination or willpower motivation now here compassion. Compassion gives you inner strength. Also

## January 31, 2014

compassion gives you self-confidence. That is the basis of willpower or determination. So wisdom side, and the determination, these two combine, I think many problems can be reduced. That's my fundamental belief. (*End of audio presentation*) So in referencing how I think this is valid, we have a crisis of differences. We have people working that don't want to lose their jobs and we also have a multinational corporation whose effect goes far beyond the local community. The decision that may come to a close here could affect potentially billions of consumers and farmers around the world. So I would like to personally help everyone --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. HUGEL: --that says no to this bill to contact me in person through encrypted...at NKO.org. I have an encrypted contact form and we can discuss this. If you need to learn more, if you want to know, k-n-o-w more, I'd like to put action into process and see if I can help more people understand what's going on here. Thank you and aloha to everyone.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your comments, Mr. Hugel. Any questions for the gentleman? Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Just a basic question. Thank you, Chair. Sorry, what was your last name?

MR. HUGEL: My name is Paul Garrett Hugel.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: H-U-G-E --

MR. HUGEL: H-U-G-E-L.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you.

MR. HUGEL: I've had the privilege of recording a few of your presentations.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, thank you.

MR. HUGEL: Thank you so much.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, any other questions for the gentleman? Mr. Hugel, thank you very much for your presence. Malia Cahill?

MS. CAHILL: Aloha, Council members. Thank you for sitting through all of this testimony and for giving me the opportunity to speak today. My name is Malia Cahill. I grew on Maui in Hana, Kula and Ulupalakua. I have been surrounded by agriculture of all kinds for my entire life. I lived part of my life on Ulupalakua Ranch. I know people involved in all different kinds of

#### January 31, 2014

agriculture from small local organic farmers to large corporations to, you know, people that work for HC&S. So this is not...this is not an easy issue and I sympathize with the people testifying on Molokai even if I don't agree with you. But I just wanted to say, first of all, I support this bill because I believe it increases transparency in...for the issues that affect all of us because we all participate in agriculture in some way. I also... I now teach afterschool programs to Maui youth ages 12 through 18. We do an environmental filmmaking program. We have done many programs where we interview people on all different sides of the issue. The good thing about teenagers...one of the few good things about teenagers sometimes is that they haven't made up their minds yet. So I see a lot of minds very made up in this room so I hope we can continue to listen to each other 'cause that's how we really learn from each other and come up with things that work for everybody. But one thing I wanted to say, there's a lot of interest among young people in agriculture. And there's also a lot of farmers who are showing us that the way we've done agriculture in the State of Hawaii is not the only way. I just don't believe that it's true that the only way to do agriculture is with large amounts of pesticides. If you go and see...go visit some of these organic farms that I have had the opportunity to visit with my students 'cause it's very inspiring. So just remember there's different schools of thought in how we go about agriculture. My students did a project last year called the Eat Local Project where they attempted to eat only food grown on Maui for four days. They also went around to different farms to figure out where their food comes from. It's one of...honestly, one of the best projects I think I've ever been a part of. It was very, very inspiring not only to see the farmers but to see how excited the kids got. And to me what this world is about is...I'm sorry I'm getting emotional...is about giving our future generation the choice of what agriculture means to them. Sorry.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Take your time. Take your time.

MS. CAHILL: It's about...it's basically about giving them the opportunities --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. CAHILL: --to...that agriculture doesn't have to take on just this certain one form and giving them the opportunity to decide. And most of my students, they're not excited about growing up to become pesticide applicators. They're excited to grow up and grow food and feed it to people and eat it themselves and know where it comes from. So, let's see. So, yeah, that's basically what this bill means to me. It's about deciding what will the future of agriculture look like and that...and questioning like --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. CAHILL: --is this the only way to agriculture? I don't believe that this bill is anti-agriculture. It's just increasing transparency and maybe the bill isn't perfect and maybe there's things that need to be amended about the bill, but I just hope that it won't be kind of thrown out completely because of the testimony of people who are afraid for their jobs that haven't...and I guess my question to the people on Molokai would be, don't you want your kids to have the option of not...of what

## January 31, 2014

kind of farmer that they wanna be? So I think we just need to do a lot of things in the County of Maui to support more local organic farming and give people options, diversify...I mean food security is a huge issue here. So, thank you. That's all.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony this afternoon. Any questions for Ms. Cahill, Members? Having none, thank you very much for sharing your thoughts.

MS. CAHILL: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, Molokai. It's your turn. Who's next, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Timothy O. Crawford.

MR. CRAWFORD: Good afternoon, honorable Committee Chair Hokama, Vice-Chair Couch, and respected Council members. First and foremost, I would like to express my gratitude to respected Council members this opportunity to express my concern over this issue. My name is Tim Crawford and I'm an employee of Monsanto Molokai. I have been involved with agriculture my entire life. I'm the a fourth generation of a family farm and I'm a supporter of all farmers, large and small, conventional and organic. I am also the husband of a wife of 24 years and a father of three children. In response to the proposed legislation I would like to manifest my adamant opposition. Local agriculture both large and small, conventional and organic comply with Federal and State laws and regulations. These laws and regulations are intended to protect the interest and health and safety of the general public. To date these laws and regulations fulfill their objectives. Additional laws and regulations will generate little, if any, benefit but incur exponential cost for local farmers and result in the increase of food...increase of cost for the local food supply for the general public. To the honorable Committee Chairman Hokama, Vice-Chair Couch and respected Council members, I ask the following. How does the current Administration propose to finance the additional cost incurred to enforce proposed regulations? Increase taxes on locally grown food? Impose new fees for local farmers? An increase in operating cost from additional taxes and fees for local farmers will create additional financial challenges for all farmers, large and small. In response to these additional costs, many local growers will face financial ruin.

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. CRAWFORD: The locally grown food supply will diminish and prices of the local produce will increase. How will the honorable Committee respond to their constituency with increased other cost of living? Local agriculture generates income for local growers, good jobs for the people of Maui and tax revenues for the local community. The new legislation sends a very strong message to the farming community --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

#### January 31, 2014

MR. CRAWFORD: --large and small, that Maui is not a safe place for agriculture. The role, the duty of our elected public officials is to represent the interests of the majority, not the vocal minority. The large majority of voters in Maui support agriculture as a source of jobs, tax revenues and

social development. How will the current Administration respond to the voting public this election year when local farms begin to close and local agriculture begins to disappear? I would like to propose that the local political authorities consider alternative, positive ...(inaudible)... --

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MR. CRAWFORD: --designed to support local agriculture including financial incentives --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Crawford, you're gonna need to end your testimony.

MR. CRAWFORD: --... (inaudible)... thereby helping local farmers, creating additional jobs, lowering

the costs --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Crawford.

MR. CRAWFORD: --...(inaudible)... benefitting the entire general public.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Crawford.

MR. CRAWFORD: ...(inaudible)...

CHAIR HOKAMA: We appreciate your testimony.

MR. CRAWFORD: Sincerely, Timothy Otis Crawford, Ag Economist.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Any questions for the gentleman?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Mr. Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, Ma'am?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: I need a break.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, we're gonna take a short break. Five minutes, okay, Ms. --

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Hopefully.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. We'll take a recess subject to call of the Chair. . . . (gavel). . .

#### January 31, 2014

**RECESS:** 1:54 p.m.

RECONVENE: 2:07 p.m.

CHAIR HOKAMA: ...(gavel)... We shall bring this meeting back to order. Thank you, Members, as well as residents that wanna share testimony. Let's see, we had to take a break and we're on Molokai. So, Ms. Alcon, your next Molokaian.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Gene Albino.

MR. ALBINO: Aloha, Council members. My name is Gene Albino. I'm a resident of Molokai, born and raised here and I'm a direct descendant of the very first farmers in Hoolehua who are taro farmers. Our breeds have been bred and made by our family and we keep those breeds 'til this day. These breeds have dwindled because of pestilence, blight and a few other things, weather. And without any kind of pesticides to even help us control this pestilence, we would not have our breeds that we have had over 100 years. And I'm also a worker for Mycogen. I'm a mechanic at Mycogen Seeds but I speak as a subsistence farmer that...I've just moved back to the island in the past two years and have seen my insect problem get worse than it was when I left. So I oppose any legislation that takes my tax money and uses it to regulate pesticides that are already regulated on a State and Federal level when my taxes could be used for our schools, our roads, our parks and other things that it'll be put to good use for. And I oppose this bill. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the gentleman, Members? Having none, thank you for your comments. Next person, please.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Jay Duquette.

MR. DUQUETTE: Aloha, everyone, Council members. I'd like to start by thanking you guys for hearing everybody's testimony today. It's a pretty divisive issue and we really appreciate you guys bringing it to our attention and hearing what we have to say today. So first let me start by saying that I support this bill in its entirety and look forward to seeing its passage. It's about time government starts monitoring this industry which up until now has enjoyed little to no oversight while using some of the world's most toxic compounds in unknown quantities right next to our homes and schools. This practice which has gone on for years threatens the health and safety of our island's most vulnerable population, children, the elderly and the infirm. It also threatens our land and very scarce fresh water resources. And to what extent? The truth is we just don't know because appropriate measures and studies have never been done by an unbiased third party. These companies all claim that the State and Federal regulations are enough yet massive amounts of dust still blow from every field on a daily basis and during rains runoff can be seen pouring into streams and out towards the ocean. This bill is not anti-GMO. It is prochildren and pro-health. All we're asking for is responsible management and recordkeeping by Biotech so that we can all feel safe in our home and schools. When looking at the response from Biotech that this bill has received, any reasonable person would ask themselves, what are they trying to hide? I have heard the slogan going around by Biotech and its employees to educate

## January 31, 2014

before you regulate. This is exactly what this bill seeks to accomplish. Educating the public about the types of pesticides and in what quantities and mixtures are being used on a daily basis. I would love to be educated in this manner. But for now it's a mystery guarded by attorneys who claim proprietary knowledge and intellectual property rights for the basis of their secrecy. We need and have a right to know about what happens in our community. In closing I would like to pose the question, is this bill --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. DUQUETTE: --good for the County? Is this a well-intentioned and meaningful legislation? The answer is yes. Pass the bill. Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony this afternoon. Any questions for the gentleman on the testimony? Mr. Couch?

VICE-CHAIR COUCH: I just wanted to get his name.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Our understanding, his name is Mr. Duquette.

MR. DUQUETTE: Yes, sir.

CHAIR HOKAMA: That's his last name. Your first name, please, Mr. Duquette?

MR. DUQUETTE: It's Jay, J-A-Y.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

MR. DUQUETTE: You're welcome.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Any other questions for Mr. Duquette? Thank you very much for your testimony this afternoon.

MR. DUQUETTE: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Next person, Ms. Alcon.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Keola mau loa o Hawaiiloa Mowat.

MR. MOWAT: Aloha, everybody. My name is Hawaiiloa Mowat and I approve this bill for many reasons. First of all I would like to state that everyone here on Molokai testifying to oppose this bill is making profit by spraying these hazardous chemicals. Regardless of what we hear out of the mouths of workers and read on blogs and newspapers saying how safe this poisons are if handled correctly, the fact still remains pesticides were created for one purpose and that is to kill. I'm sure both sides of the issue can agree that we have witnessed a rise in cancer and other health

#### January 31, 2014

problems in the last 20 years. Something is wrong and all we are asking is to pass a bill to ensure the safety of our children and community. I recently lost a nine-year-old nephew to cancer, right there on Maui. I'm not 100 percent sure of it and can't prove it. But the fact is where he lived at Spencer Homes Waikapu was a pineapple field right before they built houses right over it. What kind of toxic chemicals were sprayed there in the last 50 years? We don't know because they're in a law and effect saying that we have the right to know what they sprayed in the past and what they'll spray in the future. I have lost two grandparents, my father, and a nine-year-old nephew to cancer. That's half of my family that has passed on, being passed on to cancer. That's not normal. Well, nowadays in Hawaii that is normal. But it shouldn't be. I hear workers on Monsanto and Mycogen telling me they're against spraying by schools but say they oppose this bill and it confuses me. It sounds to me that their bosses are saying their jobs rely on spraying to schools. I don't know that for sure. This is a very, very important issue that needs to be weighed out. If weighed out honestly, we are talking about a few hundred jobs versus the well-being of all of Hawaii. Will you make a decision to save jobs or save lives? I ask everybody to do your research. Look at the track records of the big corporations that we are dealing with. The pineapple and sugarcane companies gave jobs for a little while but where are they now and who is left to deal with their leftovers? I really pray that politics will not impact this decision 'cause we are talking about the future lives of generations. I hear people saying that people smoke cigarettes and eat unhealthy and do many things hazardous to our health. But these things are choices people make. Children don't have the choice to what air they breathe or what dirt they'll play in. If we continue to let these guys spray what we know in fact is toxic --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. MOWAT: --...(inaudible)... all I hear is jobs, jobs, jobs, money, money, money. What about the families that go into debt because of hospital bills of a sick loved one? Can we ever trust the decision when it is...when money is involved? Here on Molokai all of these workers are on the clock in uniform testifying as individuals against the bill. That's what this is all about, money. I hear many saying Monsanto is feeding the world. I've been all around the world and still see poverty in most countries. But they are feeding the world by stocking every shelf with --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MR. MOWAT: --. . . (inaudible). . . supermarket with their GMO products. They're making a revenue of \$11 billion a year by feeding the world. I made one video last year of Manila Camp corn field of when it was raining just like the days that we witnessing this past couple weeks. It was pouring rain and all of the water coming out from the corn fields was all going across the road and went right into Kaunakakai Stream. And I'm glad to say that they vacated that field from Manila Camp. And I'm happy with that but it goes on every day. Even though that field is shut down they're still doing it other places and when the rain comes even though they say it's safe and, you know, they know how to apply it, but what happens when the rain comes and all that water gets washed out to other places. They cannot control that. What happens when the winds come and pick up that dirt --

#### January 31, 2014

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MR. MOWAT: -- and blow it across the street into residential. They say that--

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Mowat, you're gonna need to conclude your testimony, please.

MR. MOWAT: Okay, I'm done. Thank you very much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for Mr. Mowat, Members?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, it's Mowat, last name?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, M-O-W-A-T. Okay, any questions for the gentleman, Members? Having none, thank you very much for your testimony this afternoon. Last one, please, Ms. Alcon.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Hoala Davis.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

MS. DAVIS: Aloha, Council members, and mahalo for the opportunity to speak today. My name is Hoala Davis. I'm born and raised on the island of Molokai. My father's family is from this aina. My children are growing up here and one day I will die here. I'm testifying in support of this bill in order to secure a legacy that my children deserve to have. Sadly, people no longer seem to realize the importance of living like our ancestors and thinking multiple generations forward. My testimony has changed several times over the last few days sitting outside with our...various members of the community. But I believe that ultimately our islands and this Council needs to make a decision on where our priorities lay. After reading this bill I realized that there's much focus being drawn away from the bill itself. And talking with community members outside, the intent is to protect the keiki and the kupuna but also the land itself. I could go on and on about corporate giants breeding on impoverished communities, the bad environmental damage on health impacts. I won't. I do believe, however, that there is no economic threat unless there is truly something of concern being sprayed on our island. For a product that is deemed safe by the opposers of this bill, then where is the harm in disclosing that information? Why would protecting children be a threat? If regulations and transparency leave an opening to expose anything, good or bad, then to oppose that seems like a ploy to hide only the bad. In fact by Monsanto's own admission, they deem that their product, being their GMO seed, can be stolen by small organic farms within a five-mile radius of their corn fields. Although this is not necessarily based on pesticide spray, I think perhaps that as a distance it says a lot. This is their standard that they have set in the courts of laws throughout the U.S. By my standards as a mother, 500 feet is not enough to keep my children safe. It may be a start but that number should be more than doubled. I feel strongly for a community that is driven by fear to the extent that they would sacrifice their piece of paradise and their children's futures for a paycheck today. I envision raising my children barefoot and carefree as I grew up. Now I worry that my home has

## January 31, 2014

become a Petri dish and my children are the test subjects. I refuse to passively let them become victims. I fully support this bill. I know that in the attempts to be political and bureaucratic there may be compromises. I ask that this Committee remember who you are protecting and who you advocate for. These corporations pay millions to create a voice. We vote for you to be our voice. Mahalo, again, for your time today.

- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for Ms. Davis? Having none, thank you very much for your testimony. We're gonna come back to the Chambers. And we'll ask Mr. Lorrin Pang for his comments this afternoon and following Dr. Pang, Gerry Dameron.
- MR. PANG: Ready? Good afternoon. My name is Lorrin Pang. I speak as a private citizen. I am the Maui County Health Officer for the last 15 years, but I speak as private citizen. Besides that, I am retired Army Medical Corps. I'm consultant for the World Health Organization for 25 years. In the last year I've become a consultant to the U.S. Congress to review research proposals. I'm a professor of medicine, Federal University of Brasilia. And also I am a consultant in the last year for an international organization developing drugs for neglected diseases. I forgot to focus on...I have a chemistry graduate with honors from Princeton. I wish to address the pesticide issue of this bill. I am for the bill. This is a first step, the disclosure, in the correct regulation of GMO farming practices. My issue is not with the farmers. My father...grandfather was a duck farmer. I'm a backyard farmer. My issue is with the regulators who we refer to as the all-encompassing guys who set the rules. Specifically, specifically the pesticide issue I would like to address is the combinations, the combinations. I'm not addressing yet the amount but the combinations. Give you an example, 25 years ago as a drug developer for treatment. We combined two very safe drugs and we saw stuff qualitatively we never saw before. Next, bring it up to four years ago, published Scientific American, Glyphosate, Roundup. That's pretty safe. When combined with a surfactant used to deliver it, which is alone is pretty safe, the combination has very stupendous amazing effects especially in the reproductive area. It's no wonder that people are in Argentina looking at perinatal problems. So I am worried about the combinations. As a previous speaker, Dr. Ritter said these things have not been looked at. Seven years ago I went to West Kauai because the children were sick from a school. I asked about the combinations. Apparently they were using about 40 or so. These are GMO companies. The EPA, your regulator, was there representing them. And I asked him, has anyone tested a combination, two of these 40 compounds being used? No answer. I asked him, do you believe that combinations should be tested in addition to the single pound compounds? All he said was some of these single thresholds are 1/1000<sup>th</sup> --
- MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.
- MR. PANG: --the health effect of the single. Well, then I showed him publications that sometimes two can potentiate the toxicity above a thousand, 7,000. So I rest my case. There was no further answers from your regulator, the EPA. So how bad are these things? Let's put it in reference here. Sugar cane, pineapple, let's say 15 pesticides were used. How many combinations are there? Double, triple that. There's about 30,000.

## January 31, 2014

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

- MR. PANG: Forty-five compounds, I think that's what you used here, that's 30,000 times a billion. A billion, that's a billion times more likely to have these effects. Finally I'd like to say, what is a combination? Sometimes you use them together. Sometimes you use them separately but they persist in the environment. Sometimes they persist in the body. And the killer argument is sometimes they clear the body but the effect they left, the damage, persists. That's a combination. Until these things are better studied, until the EPA can respond, I support the start of better regulation starts with disclosure. I think you'll find once they disclose you will be asking for a moratorium. Thank you.
- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Dr. Pang. Any questions for Mr. Pang on testimony he shared with us this afternoon? Ms. Cochran?
- COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair? Thank you. And thank you, Dr. Pang, for being here. So I've been hearing a lot of reference that there are no...I guess your answer about the EPA not having tested and having answers to your questions I guess points to the fact that there are no, I guess, baseline studies and what have you. So is there a way to get them to start this or is that what you're saying this is a good step in that direction in this disclosure?
- MR. PANG: Okay, I gave testimony on a very similar bill in Kauai. And the question was how should we start with one billion times 30,000? That's a trillion combinations to test. The EPA says that's prohibitively expensive. It is. There are ways to do this. You can test the combination that you use once disclosed, the 45 compounds together. If nothing happens, like beef stew that's a combination of chemicals, beef stew, nothing happens, I'll give it clearance. But until you accept that combinations...not you but...but until one accepts that combinations are just as scary as single compounds, we're not even talking the same language. There's no question that they have not systematically tested even the double combinations let alone triple, quadruple. By the way, Kauai, when it came to presentation, they were claiming not 40 compounds but 70 or 80 including not just RUP, those pesticides of restricted, but *all* the chemicals like the surfactants. You have any idea how many combinations 80 compounds give you compared to 15? Not six times. It's 10 to the 23<sup>rd</sup>. More than the grains of sand in the beach, in the ocean and in the deserts. You think this is rare when I tell you numbers big. This is not winning the lottery. It's the opposite. It's quite rare to be not impacted by severe toxic effects multiple times. There's no wonder that we're in this situation today.
- COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you. And one quick follow-up, Chair? Sir, you mentioned glyphosate plus...is exacerbated or whatever with surfactants or something? What is that word? Sorry, can you elaborate on that?
- MR. PANG: The word is surfactant. The acronym is POEA. It's a chemical which itself is not a pesticide but it allows the penetration. Of course, there's synergistic toxicological effects.

## **January 31, 2014**

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Thank you, Dr. Pang --

MR. PANG: You're welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --for being here.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Any other questions for Dr. Pang, Members? Having none, Dr. Pang, thank you for your testimony this afternoon. Gerry Dameron, D-A-M-E-R-O-N, please?

MR. DAMERON: Aloha. Thank you very much for the opportunity to speak today. It's an honor to follow Dr. Pang. It allows me to speak on other matters. We've seen a great deal of compelling testimony today. This bill, I am 100 percent for this bill. Two of our sister islands, Kauai and Hawaii, their County Council members have passed a similar bill and it's not a big surprise. They understand that their responsibility to the citizens, disclosure, is obviously the pono thing to do. I would like to speak as a business person today. I've been in the renewable energy business for 35 years. I'm the Vice-President of Business Development for a company called Bright Energy that is bringing a new technology to Maui, Kauai, Lanai, Honolulu, and Big Island that will be combined as energy storage with any renewables, photovoltaics, geothermal or wind which will make renewable energy firm and dispatchable and less expensive than fossil fuels. We're putting our first prototype installation into Pearl Harbor. The Navy is our investment and testing partner and that is happening in March and you're gonna hear quite a bit of press after that installation goes in. It bodes very well for the future of renewable energy in the islands. I would like to speak for a few moments about, after all this excellent testimony about the detrimental and worrisome challenges for our keiki, our citizens and the environment, I'd like to talk about jobs. And we're talking about...many people are talking about let's protect our citizens, 190,000 citizens on Maui. I'd like to say let's protect our workers. I have a great deal of compassion today for the Monsanto and HC&S workers who have come and talked about their concern for losing their jobs. What about these people who are toiling in the fields? They're wearing HAZMAT suits. They're spraying proven carcinogenic and toxic materials 250 to 260 times a year. What about their health?

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. DAMERON: They're scared to lose their jobs but they can't speak up. If they have concerns, jobs are scarce. The other thing that's not being discussed is the long-term health of Monsanto and HC&S employees. The average life expectancy in the United States is now 82 years for a male. We hear about many Monsanto workers dropping dead at 62, 64, 65. A young lady --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MR. DAMERON: --may I have another moment...another minute, please? We hear...a young professional woman from Molokai told me she's sick of going to funerals. This is something we need to look into because it's not being discussed, the early deaths of these dedicated workers. We need to protect these people. Now there's 190,000 citizens. We've calculated there are

## January 31, 2014

approximately 800 and 500 jobs for Monsanto and for HC&S. We recently did a gathering of about 60 people and we talked about what could green collar jobs be on Maui and we came up with 60 new job titles for jobs that helped the environment and helped the community. I would like to offer to the Council to share this information. Let's do economic development that's safe for our workers and safe for our entire community. This is what we need to do.

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MR. DAMERON: I've had very good talks with Councilwoman Baisa about new ways to expand organics. Oprah has organics. How about Monsanto organics?

CHAIR HOKAMA: You need to conclude your testimony.

MR. DAMERON: Thank you very much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Members, any questions for Mr....can you pronounce your name for us, please?

MR. DAMERON: Dameron.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Dameron, thank you. Any questions for Mr. Dameron? Okay, thank you very much for your testimony this afternoon. Glenda Frederick? Glenda, if you're here?

MS. FREDERICK: Good afternoon.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Hi.

MS. FREDERICK: My name is Glenda Frederick and I'm --

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Can you use your mic, honey?

MS. FREDERICK: Oh, sorry. My name is Glenda Frederick. I'm a retired nurse's aide and a concerned citizen. I'm in complete support of this bill. Cesar Chavez who started the National Farmers Union back in the 1960s had documented evidence of cancer related to the use of pesticides by the farm workers. Also in the local communities there was evidence of birth defects and cancer related to pesticides. Cesar Chavez referred to pesticides as an evil we must do away with. It is my understanding that these chemicals and pesticides come from the military industrial complex. Many of the pesticides used in America has been banned in Europe. GMOs and Monsanto are banned in many countries. So why are we using dangerous pesticides? I'd say it's big business. Have we become the land of the corporations instead of the land of the free? Has government sold out to corporations? For thousands of years, humans have been able to grow food without pesticides. Now in a short span of time we're being told that pesticides are a necessity...are necessary. We are also being told that GMOs will help feed the world. But think about this. The poor farmers in India were convinced by Monsanto to use the GMO seeds. Since their crop...since then their crops are failing. About 150,000 Indian farmers have

## January 31, 2014

committed suicide over the years. This is proof that it's not helping to feed the world. In America thousands of people are yearly experiencing pesticide poisoning. One of the results of pesticide poisoning is nerve damage. I myself...

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. FREDERICK: I myself was poisoned and I experienced the very uncomfortable tingling in my legs for years. But I know that there are many people who are severely poisoned and disabled for life. Here in Maui we are...we frequently see workers spraying pesticides in business areas where pedestrians are walking. There's no safeguard for the public.

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. FREDERICK: May I have more time?

CHAIR HOKAMA: You have one minute.

MS. FREDERICK: There are other means of controlling pests. There are organizations that can help with this. One such organization is Beyond Pesticides. So there's no need to rely on these dangerous chemicals. The greed of commercialism is strangling our planet and its people. We must now be a voice for the earth. Our job now is to educate the public. When we stop purchasing from companies like Monsanto they will either change or go out of business. This is what I'd like to say to the workers of Monsanto, you don't have to compromise yourselves for money. Poor farmers all over the world are becoming conscious and aware of the dangers of pesticides and GMOs, Mexico, South America and India. You don't have to continue to be exploited and live in the Dark Ages. I suggest that you educate --

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MS. FREDERICK: --yourselves on the dangers of pesticides and be independent. When the world wins over Monsanto, where will you be?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony --

MS. FREDERICK: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --Ms. Frederick. Any questions for the lady on her testimony provided this afternoon? Having none, Ms. Frederick, thank you very much for your testimony. Now this could be Joseph Kohn or Joseph Kohu. Not too sure. K-O-H.

MR. KOHN: Aloha and thank you for the opportunity to comment. I am Dr. Joseph Kohn, M.D., a board-certified internist licensed in Hawaii with an office here in Wailuku. I am also the Medical Director of <a href="www.weareone.cc">www.weareone.cc</a>. I apologize in advance for the limitations of my language and culture. I am speaking as an individual. I am grateful for all the wonderful accomplishments

#### **January 31, 2014**

and abundance we as humans, governments, businesses and farmers have created to date. I recognize the humanity of all of us, our susceptibility to toxic environments and our need for clean economic growth as well as clean water, clean food, clean land, clean housing, clean clothing and clean energy. We are in possession of powerful scientific tools to transform our environment. I think the concerns of clean water, clean food, clean land, clean housing, clean clothing and clean energy are the future for responsible, sustainable growth and development on this planet. And on Maui I respectfully submit there is no rational reason to pollute our own environment or destroy ecosystems. I respectfully submit there is no rational reason to pollute our own environment or destroy ecosystems. Corporations definitionally have economic profit as their primary goal above the good of the public. Just because we have a technology it does not mean it benefits us to use the technology without concern for the effects on our collective environment. We humans are not guinea pigs. Our actions have consequences. It is our responsibility individually and collectively to do no harm while we increase the health and prosperity of all humanity as well as all our systems public and private.

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. KOHN: I am honored to speak. Thank you for your very kind attention.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Dr. Kohn. Any questions for the gentleman on testimony he presented, Members? Having none, thank you very much for your testimony this afternoon. We'll go back to Molokai. Ms. Alcon, your next testifier, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Moses Phillips, Jr.

MR. PHILLIPS: Yeah, hello, my name is...ready?

MS. ALCON: Go ahead.

MR. PHILLIPS: My name is Moses Phillips. I was on Maui working for a while. I work...started with Mycogen seven months ago and I ain't going back Maui work. I rather stay home and, you know, I'm against the bill.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MR. PHILLIPS: ...(Inaudible)...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions? Having none, next testifier, please, Ms. Alcon.

MS. ALCON: The next testifier is Keith Suafoa.

MR. SUAFOA: Hello, my name is Keith Suafoa. I working out at Mycogen and I oppose the bill. Aloha.

### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much for your testimony. Next person, please, Ms. Alcon.

MS. ALCON: The next testifier is Roshani Nash.

MS. NASH: My name is Roshani Nash and I totally support this bill. I feel that Monsanto workers are proud of what they're growing. They really believe that pesticides and herbicides and Roundup do not...does not...do not hurt children and adults. Then I believe that they should stand up and disclose exactly what they're spraying with, when, where, why. Only thieves work in the dark and don't want to say what they're doing. That's not how we want the world to be working. We want openness, disclosure, disclosure, disclosure. If genetically-engineered food is good for everyone, then shed the light of day on it. Disclose, label the food. We deserve to know what we're putting in our bodies. We deserve to know what we're eating. We deserve to know that the air is not polluted. We deserve to know that we're not polluting the ocean. We need to know that we're taking care of the earth and we are not doing it by polluting. I have great sympathy for Monsanto and Mycogen workers. I understand people need jobs to feed their children and their families but this is not the way to do it by polluting and destroying the earth. Again, I really recommend that you make sure that there's disclosure, that we know when things are being sprayed, that there are large areas that are buffer zones, even though I think the air gets polluted. Things fly out in the air and people are breathing the dust from these fields. When we have high winds in Molokai, we see the dust blowing everywhere and it's not safe. And they pollute crops that we're trying to grow on our own lands. And we need to know that what we're eating is safe, what we're drinking is safe, that the water is safe and the air is safe and our food is safe. Thank you very much for letting me speak.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for Ms. Nash and her testimony? Thank you very much for being there. Next person, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Kanoe Davis.

MS. DAVIS: Aloha. My name is Kanoelani Davis and I'm from a long line in genealogy from the island of Molokai. I'm a mother, a sister, a student, a kumu hula and most importantly a child of this beautiful island. I'm here to share my thoughts in regards to the pesticide disclosure bill that is being proposed. As a mother my concern is having my children exposed to pesticides, that mass distribution in the air near their schools. To slowly see large corporations obtain more and more land to provide jobs, to provide more food resources on such a small island leaves our people less and less choices to live. There are but a small group of people against large corporations who have made sure that the dependency of what they provide for families to live due to economic monetary issues leave even employees little to less choice. As a kumu hula, a person who continues to not only practice in the art of hula but also fosters the aspects and practices of cultural art form and healing, the land is a part of who we are. As original descendants of Haloanakalaukapalili we need to be...find balance in how we utilize our natural resources. The vast effects of what happens today reflect the chaotic distribution of how we're going to survive or even heal in the future. I also wanna point out a key word that I mentioned

#### January 31, 2014

earlier, that word is dependency. Through history and time as it reflects in education, as we see a significant pattern which has caused many plants and many animals and many resources to become extinct and no longer exist. If we reflect back to the Neolithic time where humans started the agricultural revolution by becoming dependent upon planting for food and domesticating animals, you will see in history the cause of death amongst not only our...their resources but communities and people became extinct as well. The natural hunting process slowly lost its potency and practice. The gatherers no...had no reason to leave and go out to find what they need and slowly people stopped caring...taking care of the place that they went to. The idea to survive was lost because of the convenience of just living became apparent. In essence the domesticated animals and the food plants from agricultural...agriculture became dependent on humans. We have continued this process for years and generations across the world, none being recognized. But the evidence is in our history. It is a part of our past and now today we continue to constantly be dependent on large corporations to provide us jobs, to provide us food, to provide us a means to survive. As a human, we now become dependent on corporations to live. The balance of living has overstepped its boundaries. So when do we stop taking? Why do we need more? Land already is being utilized on this island to create GMO crops. Why are they obtaining more land? Why are we moving to where people dwell to where young children spend majority of their active --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. DAVIS: --...(inaudible)... They say no one can prove any type of evidence to show that these chemicals have diseased our people. They say no one can prove that GMO products lead to many of our health disparities in combination of or merely solely. But I can tell you. The wind blows. It moves the dirt, the dirt that is contaminated. I can tell you that the rain pours. It moves the soil into the water, the resources, with traces and evidence of contamination from the poor use and mass distribution of these pesticides. I am for small farmers, especially on Molokai, to advocate for some type of resolution --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. DAVIS: --if the bill passes because they are not the issue. Their use is small \_\_\_\_\_ and cut no comparison to the mass distribution of chemicals in one large given area. There needs to be a stop to moving into highly-populated areas. There needs to be accountability for the use and distribution in these large areas and that at the end of the day we need to stop being so dependent on these corporations to have a livelihood because Molokai knows all too well how large corporations can come in, provide jobs, have us turn against each other and then abandon us and all their facilities in an instant. So, you know, for me I appreciate your time and the time to share my testimony. And I am for the pesticide disclosure bill. Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for Ms. Davis? Having none, thank you very much. One more person, Ella, please.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Cherie Dudoit-Galam.

#### January 31, 2014

MS. DUDOIT-GALAM: Aloha. My name is Cherie Dudoit-Galam and I wear many hats. I am a wife, a daughter, a mother of six and I'm also an employee of Monsanto Molokai. I was born and raised here on Molokai and my families are ranchers as well as farmers by inheritance. I am also a homesteader. I moved home from Las Vegas three years ago and agriculture was not my field of choice. However, having to learn and be trained in the different aspects of this field, I learned that things are not as cut and dry as they seem to be. Our applicators go through vigorous training. Not only do they learn different applications but they also learn safety regulations as well as conditions in which to spray. Our company is regulated by government agencies such as the USDA, the FDA, the EPA, as well as the DOA. We go through annual inspections and certifications. We go through compliance trainings as well as safety trainings. And we are also OSHA-certified. As a mother, I keep myself alert and aware to issues concerning our community especially if it directly affects my children. My children are enrolled in schools which are across of the fields to which these applications are being applied, the same fields to which I as well as my oldest daughter work in on a daily basis. If I at any time thought that this was detrimental to the health of my children, I would be the first to support this bill. However, I have faith in the agencies and the people who enforce our compliance regulations that the practices that are performed are totally in compliance. These agencies like the USDA and the FDA were created for reasons such as these. Our County has so much other issues that need addressing and I really feel that our State and Federal agencies have it well under control. As a homesteader enforcing a buffer zone puts a limit on what I can farm. It puts a damper on the thought of expansion because if we at any time had a notion to expand our farming, we would have to take into consideration not only the cost of leasing but how much unusable land would be involved. It limits the crop size that we can grow because of the pesticide use. So it's either let the insects invade our field or lose a good portion of the land so that we can apply the necessary pesticides. Although this is not intended to affect the small farmer, it will still have its effects because that is all we will ever be --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. DUDOIT-GALAM: --...(inaudible)... Lastly, I am a kama`aina of this land. My family has made this island the base of our roots and I oppose this bill. Today is a work day for me. And I find myself very fortunate to have an employer who is willing to put a hold on production so that we the employees have a chance to voice our opinions. I have in no way been threatened, pressured or persuaded to give testimony opposing this bill. This I do of my own free will.

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. DUDOIT-GALAM: Regardless of whether it had been on a work day or not, my views on this matter remain the same. I have full faith in the agencies that already govern our regulations and I would never oppose something that would affect the health and well-being of my family. I am a worker. I am a farmer. And I am a mother. This is my opinion. Thank you for your time.

### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the lady on her testimony? Having none, thank you very much. We shall return to Molokai after the Chambers. Lanai, anyone wishing to give testimony?

MS. FERNANDEZ: There is no one waiting to testify on Lanai.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Hana Office, Ms. Lono, anyone...

MS. LONO: The Hana Office has no one waiting to testify, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much. Next, Glenn Larson?

MR. LARSON: Aloha. My name is Glenn Larson. I'm here representing the MBA, Maui Beekeepers Association. And today there is a lot of research and debate in dealing with honeybees and pesticides. We as beekeepers have the right to know where these poisons are being applied to prevent potential negative impacts on the health of bee colonies. The honeybee colonies here on Maui are unique because we don't have to use miticides which is a pesticide used in bee colonies to treat Varroa mites, aka the Varroa destructor. To the USDA this treatment is considered safe. In fact the regulating agency considers it safe enough even though it is known to make male bees infertile. The Varroa mite, a known killer of honeybee colonies, exists in most places of the world but not in Maui County. When the mite infested the Big Island and Oahu, almost all feral bee colonies died. Maybe we should think about the farmers, both big and small, and how much crop they stand to lose if the mite arrives here, not to mention the overall health of bee colonies. We have the right to know where these insect-killing poisons are being applied. These are our pollinators and need to be prioritized. We hope that any legislation that supports agriculture supports healthy practices regarding the bees and related importation of products that produce...products and produce from elsewhere. I'm sorry, excuse me. We are initiating a dialogue with outer counties to better understand how best they can help not export the deadly mite into Maui. This dialogue could be useful to the Council members as to understanding the issues as they relate to protecting the honeybees and the use of pesticides and any comprehensive ag policy must take into account if we are serious about food security. Maui County is grappling with the same issues regarding pesticides as are being debated on Kauai and the Big Island. There are many missing facts and not known, and this legislation provides a good opportunity for all concerned to direct energies towards studying the issues and facts. The Big Island's policy was announced in December and the County Council and Mayor are taking one year to study all the issues regarding pesticides and the growing of a healthy and robust small farm agriculture. We propose that instead of killing this bill 58, we keep it in Committee and take time to study all the issues --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MR. LARSON: --or rewriting the bill. Something off the back of the...one of these miticides for the beehives. Environmental hazards, this pesticide is highly toxic to birds, fish, aquatic invertebrates. Do not apply directly to any body of water. Do not contaminate water when

### January 31, 2014

disposing of the used strips. You know, commercial keepers use this stuff and I feel that people have the right to know what they're getting in --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MR. LARSON: --their food and in the air. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Larson. Questions for Mr. Larson on testimony he shared, Members? Having none, Mr. Larson, thank you very much for being here. Carol Reimann?

MS. REIMANN: Aloha, Chair, Members of the Policy Committee. My name is Carol Reimann and I'm the Community & Government Affairs Manager for Monsanto. I have submitted written testimony so I won't go over my entire written testimony. But many of my key points are the same as points that have been raised by other testifiers. Why is Maui County getting involved in an area that is already regulated by the State and Federal government? Does Maui County have the funds to implement this bill? I know that I don't want my taxpayer dollars going towards to duplicative regulations. Why is Maui County discriminating against agriculture in regards to pesticide use? The U.S. and Hawaii Constitution both guarantee equal treatment and protection. Why is Maui County attempting to regulate GMO when the Federal government already has rigorous regulations and laws in place? Biotech is the highliest...is the...most highly regulated crop. Is this bill about health and safety in our community or about singling out agriculture? The Center for Disease Control and Prevention reports in 2011 that there were over 47 million food-borne illnesses in the United States with 120,000 hospitalizations and over 3,000 deaths. By comparison the National Pesticide Information Center's latest report says that there were 3,000 human pesticides exposure incidents in the United States, three-quarters of that happened in the home or yard and only 5 percent were agriculturally related. 46.8 percent reported no symptoms with zero deaths. If this bill is truly about health and safety, statistics provide that there are more incidents of food-borne illness versus pesticides issues. I am from Maui. My descendants came to Maui in the 1800s, just like Leona Rocha Wilson's. They came here to work in the plantations. They lived in homes adjacent to plantation fields, right next to the fields. And they all lived to ripe old ages with very few health issues. I recall as a child growing up here playing in the schoolyard with black ash falling upon us. We called it black snow at the time. I don't recall any of my friends having respiratory issues. We all played outdoors with the ash falling all around us and then we'd go home to sweep out our garages. This shouldn't be about Monsanto or HC&S as we are all farmers.

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. REIMANN: And we have history in our community. Like myself, Leona and the vast majority of testifiers in opposition of this bill, we have deep roots here and decades of family from Maui. We stand united in opposition of this anti-agriculture bill. We urge you to listen to the facts, not innuendo or anecdotal fear-mongering and we look forward to future Policy and Intergovernment [sic] Affairs Committee meetings where the facts will be revealed --

#### January 31, 2014

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. REIMANN: --the \_\_\_\_ and lies fleshed out and where the truth will prevail. Mahalo for the opportunity to testify.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Members, any questions on testimony presented this afternoon? Having none, thank you very much for your comments.

MS. REIMANN: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We'll go back to Molokai. Ms. Alcon, next person, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Mercy Ritte.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you.

MS. RITTE: Aloha, my name is Mercy Ritte. I'm here as a concerned mother and Molokai community member. I'm in support of bill 18581 [sic] primarily because disclosure of information and transparency surrounding unknown pesticides and experimenting of genetically modified organisms in the County of Maui is non-existent. My concern is that our basic human right to live, work, learn and play in an environment that is non-threatening to the well-being of present and future generations is in jeopardy. The expanding of GMO fields edging closer and closer to our schools and residential areas, the heavy spraying of unknown pesticides used to grow these crops are seeping into the air, soil and waterways and the open air field testing of GMOs I feel significantly challenges this basic human right. As a mother, it is deeply distressing to know that protecting your children from the health harms of pesticides and the unforeseen consequences of GMOs is out of our control. Even more worrisome is to know that U.S. government agencies established to improve the health, safety and well-being of the public are just as limited in this ability. Over a year ago when Molokai experienced a series of devastating fugitive dust storms stretching miles across the landscape and finally settling on our fragile coral reef system, the Department of Health, Clean Air Branch on Maui was immediately contacted. To my surprise, considering the length of time that Monsanto has been established in Hawaii, the DOH at the time was not even aware of Monsanto's best management practices. They also asserted that there are no regulations on chemicals in the dust. In closing, I support this measure and hope that questions, unknowns and uncertainties surrounding pesticides and the experimenting of GMOs will come to light. Thank you to Councilwoman Elle Cochran for introducing a bill that places high values on human life and environmental health. And also thank you for the opportunity to submit a testimony.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much Ms. Ritte. Any questions for Ms. Ritte on her testimony, Members? Having none, thank you very much.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Jirch Torres-Umi.

### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Excuse me, before we start the testimony, we're gonna take a short recess. Short recess subject to the call of the Chair. . . . (gavel). . .

**RECESS: 3:02 p.m.** 

RECONVENE: 3:07 p.m.

CHAIR HOKAMA: ...(gavel)... The Policy Committee shall return to order. When we took that short recess, we were on the Molokai District receiving comment from Molokaians. So, Ms. Alcon, if you would...we apologize for the short break. If you'd ask the next Molokai testifier to please come forward.

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Jirch Torres-Umi.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you.

MR. TORRES-UMI: Hi, my name is Jireh Umi. I work at Mycogen and I oppose the bill. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Next person, please, Molokai?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Charlton Wallace, Jr.

MR. WALLACE: Hi, my name is Charlton Wallace. I work for Mycogen and I oppose the bill. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your comments. Next testifier, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Walter Ritte.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

MR. RITTE: Aloha, my name is Walter Ritte. I am pro-agriculture. I have a three-acre farm on homestead land on Molokai. And we are here today because we are being threatened. People are saying that the corporations are overregulated and they already have too much regulations. My homestead is next to these fields and I'm saying they are not regulated. There is problems going on, not only Maui County. I've been to all of the islands. I've been involved in this issue throughout the State and I'm saying that I'm in strong, strong support of this bill. If we don't get this bill and the people's fields are not tended to, this issue is gonna boil over. We are afraid for our children. We have to drive twice a day through all of this dust and pesticides. These pesticides are now next to our high school, the only high school on Molokai. These fields are now in Kualapu'u town next to Kualapu'u Elementary School. These fields surround the MIS, the Molokai Irrigation System. It surrounds the whole system. This system not only puts water on our fields. This system is drinkable water that feeds Maunaloa town and the west side of

### January 31, 2014

Molokai. We need regulations. Thank you, Elle, for listening to the people and taking on these corporations. We need to regulate these corporations and I support this bill 100 percent.

CHAIR HOKAMA: You done, Mr. Ritte?

MR. RITTE: Yeah, I just wanted to say one last thing that no matter what happens, we're gonna protect our lands from these corporations and we're gonna protect our children from these corporations. And we need you guys to help us to protect ourselves. That's why you guys are serving there and we're telling you that we need protection. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Ritte, for your testimony. Members, any questions for Mr. Ritte on testimony he has provided this afternoon? Having none, thank you very much for your testimony. Next testifier please, Ms. Alcon?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Loretta Ritte.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

MS. RITTE: Aloha, my name is Loretta Ritte. I live on Molokai. I'm here to support this bill. Our children cannot make choices about their environment. It is up to us adults to make the right decisions to ensure that they are protected. My concerns are my grandchildren, my children and the water that is in the MIS system. The corn fields surrounds the MIS reservoir. The MIS water comes to my home. We...our animals drink the water. We water our plants. This water also goes to Maunaloa for their drinking water. And so I'm concerned about that. The corn fields are across Kualapuu School and Molokai High School. I have grandchildren in that school and I'm concerned. I think that the corporations have gone too long without being regulated. I want to know as a parent, grandparent what kind of sprays they're using, where they're spraying and when they're spraying. I think that's something that we have a right to know. So I support this bill 100 percent. Thank you, Elle, for hearing the voice of the people. Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mrs. Ritte. Any questions for the lady? Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. And thank you, the Ritte ohana, over there for being involved and sharing your voice. I'm just...I didn't realize that it's near...your fields are near the water system. And the buffer zone that's in the legislation, would that be helpful I guess? Or if not, did you have, you know, an amendment at all?

MS. ALCON: The question is if the buffer zone gonna help? You know, in regards where you guys live? Can you please repeat the question, Riki? It's hard to hear.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah, it was in regards to the buffer zones. I didn't realize the fields on Molokai were in close proximity to the water system. Is that correct?

MS. RITTE: Yes.

### January 31, 2014

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yes, okay. And so what would be an amendment, I guess...would the buffer zones be helpful?

MS. RITTE: What was the question?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: The buffer zones. Buffer...to have fields, you know, further away from the water system itself.

MS. RITTE: To have a buffer zone around the water system?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah.

MS. RITTE: Gotta be a really wide, wide, wide one.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Anything else, Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No, that's fine. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, any other questions for Ms. Ritte? Okay, thank you very much for your testimony this afternoon. Okay, Ms. Alcon, next Molokaian. Ella, next Molokai person, please?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Did they get cut off?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, try check the Molokai Office.

MS. ALCON: Okay, this is Ella. We got disconnected.

CHAIR HOKAMA: All right. Next person please, Ms. Alcon?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Maria Balangatan.

MS. BALANGATAN: Hello, good afternoon, Councilman Hokama, Councilman Couch. Thank you for this opportunity. My name is Maria \_\_\_\_\_\_ Balangatan. I work Monsanto for 10 years. I work Mycogen Seed too for one season. And this job help me to provide my family and pay my mortgage and other expenses. I love my job. I support this bill because I feel safe and this job is a great place to work. Thank you. This Maria Balangatan.

### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for Ms. Balangatan? Having none, thank you very much for your testimony. Next person please, Ms. Alcon?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Juliet Tangonan.

- MS. TANGONAN: Good afternoon. My name is Juliet Tangonan. I am a current resident of Kaunakakai, Molokai. I live here for 34 years and I have been working at corn field for 27 years, 13 years at Hawaiian Research and 15 years at Monsanto. I will be very disappointed if the Monsanto Company will shut down on Molokai. I worried about this economically and financially...if I lost my job but not only for myself, but for the employee who work here. We have family of your...of their own too. I'm concerned that the loss of this many jobs in such a small community like Molokai will be very hard for us and finding work on this island is almost next to impossible with high gas and food prices we deal with now. It's hard to keep a job when you're...when you have to provide your...for your family and keep a roof over your head. I want to see a sustainable future for this island while the people of Molokai are able to stay here. But if family have to move away because of the financial struggle of less job opportunities that this island isn't able to offer, then there will be very difficult days for the people of Molokai. I understand that there is a struggle to find the appropriate balance on this island. But I would not want to leave my home here if I lost my job. Most importantly, I care more about the future of my children and grandchildren and I want to see more grown here on Molokai. I would love to raise my grandchildren here, but I just wish there was more for them...
- MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.
- MS. TANGONAN: ...for them, not just a growing up to as children, but I advance in their \_\_\_\_\_. I would hate to see their ability to grown restricted because of lack of no resources. And I just cannot watch all of our children leave --
- MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.
- MS. TANGONAN: --leave this island if there is nothing to left...if there is nothing to let them to stay, the money I earn from this job will be the money I will provide for my grandchildren. Then they go to college and have a better education and life for themselves. I'm sure I'm not the only parent that want to see more opportunities for my children, grandchildren and Molokai children in the future. But I can only hope that we are able to --
- MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.
- MS. TANGONAN: --set up for our future generation and also may better future for them. Thank you.
- CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the lady on the testimony provided? Thank you very much for being there. Next person, please?
- MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Leandra Duvauchelle-Rawlins. Oh, sorry, Leanda.

### January 31, 2014

MS. DUVAUCHELLE-RAWLINS: Good afternoon. My name is Leanda Duvauchelle-Rawlins. I have been an employee of Monsanto for five years. I am also testifying at my own free will. Monsanto is a high safety factor. If for any reason they think it's unsafe, trust, we are not allowed there. We get safety briefings every morning. We are constantly reminded how important safety is. So to say that it is unsafe, couldn't be more far from the truth. I have bad asthma and it is finally being controlled. But with being in the heart of all this, I am a field crew member. I don't work in the office. I can honestly say I have never had an episode because of the pesticides here at work. I saw a sign reading once pesticides is worse. That is so far from the truth if I have ever seen it. There's a lot of bad things come out of ice. People have taken their...other people's lives and not to mention some of them have taken their own. We should all put our energy into the fight against drug abuse instead. There is nothing illegal in Monsanto's practices. I stand strongly in what I believe and this is what I believe in. I oppose the bill.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for the lady on testimony provided? Having none, thank you very much. Ms. Alcon, next person?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Delfin Rabara, Sr.

MR. RABARA: Hi, my name is Delfin Rabara. I work for Monsanto Molokai. I love my job and oppose this bill. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much. Next person, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Sid Bicov.

MR. BICOY: Aloha and good afternoon, Maui County Council members. Thank you for giving me the opportunity to voice my opinion. My name is Sid Bicoy and I oppose this bill. The use of restricted-use pesticides is already regulated at the Federal and State government levels by the EPA, USDA and HDOA. I do not see the significance of adding another level of regulations. I can assure you that Monsanto operates within compliance of the current guidelines set forth. All of Monsanto's pesticide applicators have gone through the State's training and certification process in order to obtain their pesticide applicator's license. In addition to the strict procedures, extra precautions are taken such as limiting field operations in windy conditions in order to reduce pesticide drift and dirt erosion. These additional measures are not mandatory but are implemented as an act of being a good neighbor and steward. If this bill is passed, it'll create extra financial obligations to farmers as well as taxpayers. Some people see the use of pesticides in agriculture as a problem. But I do not see this bill as a solution. Passing this bill will not solve the proposed issue at hand. Please do not pass this bill. Thank you for your time and aloha.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for Mr. Bicoy? Having none, thank you. Next, Ms. Alcon?

### January 31, 2014

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Wanette Lee.

MS. LEE: Aloha, my name is Wanette Lee, born and raised on Molokai. History just is... just repeating itself. Pineapple companies came to Molokai promising work and yes, they provided, used our vulnerability and needs of our parents for their profits. When they found cheaper labor, they left our families flat and left behind their pilau. Remnants of this greed continues to show themselves on our aina that we were forced to live with every day. The pesticides that was sprayed over and over again as we played in the yard not even 500 feet away. I never knew how dangerous they were. They were no signs telling us not to play there. There was no signs telling us it's poison. Cancer is high on Molokai and I cannot pinpoint where it comes from but it doesn't take a genius to realize what's going on. I support this bill. I don't think applying buffer zones around schools, homes and hospitals is too much to ask to keep our community safe. I support the need to report what kinds of pesticides they use on their farms to keep our community safe. I support reporting any genetically modified organisms because I have the right to know. This bill would not affect the small farmers. It states 15 gallons of use or purchase of five pounds of restricted pesticide before this law will affect you as a commercial farmer. My ohana, friends and neighbors will not lose their jobs because of the buffer zones near hospitals, homes and schools, compared to the hundreds of acres they already possess. This bill will not take away any jobs from anyone which many has testified before me. But I believe it will create more because the big commercial farmers will have the responsibility to our community to keep Molokai safe and healthy for generations to come. Again, this bill will only affect only those farmers that use 15 gallons or purchase 5 pounds of restricted pesticides. If anybody using that much, you're killing me. I have heard firsthand stories from employees that they would find dead birds around water puddles in the fields. I hope no children are playing in fields. It takes 25-plus years for surface water to reach our aquifer. My grandchildren will suffer the long-term effects ten times worse as we are for the pineapple fields today. My experience of pesticides drift that swept through my home in Manila Camp in recent years that was once farmed by Monsanto.

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. LEE: Respiratory problems were apparent in my household and neighbors problems breathing every so often and allergy reactions, itching eyes and throats. And we used to say they must be spraying, especially during Kona winds. My brother who never experienced asthma all of a sudden was in ER gasping for air. I cannot prove that pesticide use was reason for this but I do know after they stopped farming in that area, symptoms have not flared up again. This is not too much to ask of you. Yes, I agree it's --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. LEE: --more work, more headaches for you big companies. But if you are for the future of Molokai, then it's a small price to pay. In closing, to my ohana, friends and neighbors, this matter hits home for all of us, at times divides us. It is not intended to hurt any of you. It is not

### January 31, 2014

against you. It is my responsibility to my children and my mo`opuna to keep them safe and healthy and because they are the future of Molokai. I love you and God bless, Molokai.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions to Ms. Lee on her testimony, Members? Having none, thank you very much. Next person, please?

MS. ALCON: Our next testifier is Cheryl Pritchard.

MS. PRITCHARD: I can't remember what I ate for breakfast this morning. I...my hand's off to you to remember everything you heard today or even parts of it. I'd like to start out by saying I have respect for every worker who gets up every morning to work for a meager wage. And I understand that jobs are needed for health. And I also am concerned for everybody's health on this island and the health of the land from which we eat. And for that is what I'm speaking to today. The lasting legacy of heptachlor and DDT today on this island is deplorable and to continue poisoning the land is irresponsible. Birth defects continue generations down the line from Agent Orange, chemical warfare and Vietnam. I'm concerned about the externalized costs of operations by mega corporations. Monsanto owns five Superfund sites. That's externalized costs. They're externalizing their health costs and the cleanup cost. In Annistan, Alabama there was a court case against Monsanto in the '90s and the Supreme Court said that Monsanto was a corporation that should not be allowed to operate in civilized society. I am wholly distrustful of the profit motive of the top decision-makers. We have a right to know what chemicals and what quantity are assaulting us and I support this bill. Thank you for listening.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your testimony. Any questions for Ms. Pritchard on her testimony? Thank you very much for being here. Next person, please?

MS. ALCON: Our last testifier for today is Judy Caparida.

MS. CAPARIDA: Aloha, everybody.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Aloha.

MS. CAPARIDA: Love you guys. I'm here to say, you know, I didn't know nothing about GMO. I never got involved with it. But then one day I sat down and I said, Lord, I'd like to know what is GMO. And then, you know, when I opened up the Word, it says the cross breeding of the seeds. That is very displeasing to him. He made humans for humans, animals for animals, plants for plants, fishes for the sea and the fowls of the air. And because they are cross breeding it and this is why you take the parts of the bodies and they put it together to make the seed, okay. We were invited about two weeks later by Ray to come there. He wanted to talk story. So we went to his office and had talk story, me and my sister, Ruth Manu. And as we sat there, if he...we was gonna get coffee then he took us into his room. I asked him where his room because we're standing up inside the hallway. And then we met some of the workers there, the girls, and then we got to the room. He put up his presentation and he showed us about the corn. From the time the corn was from hardly any seeds in the cob and to now it was fully full with the what-you-

### January 31, 2014

call-it, the seeds. And we said, oh, it's beautiful. You know, it was full. Then when he finished presentating it, then I said, braddah, what is da kine, you, what is this thing all about? He said, well, Judy, we're trying to feed the whole world. I said, oh. I said, you finish with your presentation? And he say, yes. I said, braddah, God no need your help. He's been taking care of the whole world. He created heavens and earth. He made you and I and you telling me you like feed the whole world? We wasn't even in existence when he already was taking control of the world. And he just looked at me. As much as he wanted to hold his tears, his tears was running on the side of his face. He's powerful. And then if we have all these things happening, I told him, braddah, if you never heard it before I'm letting you know that we're accountable for everything --

MS. NAKATA: Two and a half minutes.

MS. CAPARIDA: --we put on this earth while we are living here. Everyone is put into position to do what is right in God's eyes. We're all accountable one day. And this what I told him, braddah. And I'm telling you folks now that I know what it's all about. I saw the wind blow and it picked up all the dust. And it made its own clouds on Molokai, so red I thought we were --

MS. NAKATA: Three minutes.

MS. CAPARIDA: --burning, the island was burning down. I saw the tourists run out of da kine, their cars trying to take pictures of this big red, red cloud. And we had a rainbow up at that time. And even the rainbow changed color. That's how bad it is. And I saw them put on this suits. I thought they was astronauts in the fields trying to whatever they're doing out there, making the chemicals and all that. I said, braddah, we ask for them to label. They don't wanna label. What is hidden that we cannot know about? All the foods are being labeled so we can know what we wanna eat and what we don't want to eat. That is so simple. That's why my sister and I, we work together and we talk to them. And this is what we told them. We said, you know what, braddah, you are accountable because you're the head on this island. And I letting all my people know on Molokai, I get involved --

MS. NAKATA: Four minutes.

MS. CAPARIDA: --with everything that comes to Molokai because my dad used to stay on the corner and cry for the Hawaiian people to be thankful for what Molokai has. We are blessed people here. We no need all the junk stuff from outside.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Aunty Judy, Aunty Judy.

MS. CAPARIDA: ...(Inaudible)... We are so, so blessed. If you know that that thing is no good, then you know what? One day you're gonna have it because all my family that work for the corn field now they are getting...they are sick, sick. They cannot find a cure for it.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Aunty Judy.

#### January 31, 2014

MS. CAPARIDA: ... (Inaudible). .. for 30 years.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Aunty Judy, you gotta stop. You have to stop your testimony.

MS. CAPARIDA: That's why I said...

CHAIR HOKAMA: So we thank you for your testimony.

MS. CAPARIDA: Okay, braddahs. That's why I wanted to share. That it is a thing that we need to look into and we support this bill.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you.

MS. CAPARIDA: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Aunty Judy, for your testimony. Any questions for Ms. Caparida, or better known as Aunty Judy? Okay, having none, thank you very much for your testimony. Is there anyone else on Molokai, Ms. Alcon?

MS. ALCON: There's no one here on Molokai waiting to testify.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Lanai, anyone else?

MS. FERNANDEZ: There's no one waiting to testify on Lanai.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Ms. Fernandez. Hana, is there anyone wishing to share testimony?

MS. LONO: The Hana Office has no one waiting to testify, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Ms. Lono. Members, we have taken all testimony that was requested to be presented before the County...this Committee. Any questions for your Chair? The Chair will post for a future meeting where we can hopefully get to the work part and start the discussion of...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: ...(Inaudible)...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes? Yeah, yeah, we'll get there yet. So again, yeah, the next meeting hopefully is to get to that point of doing Committee work. So with no objection, Members, the Chair will be closing testimony on Item 58 that is before the Policy Committee. Any objections?

COUNCIL MEMBERS: No objections.

#### ...END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY...

### January 31, 2014

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much. The Chair will notify of posting of a future date to continue the discussion on this subject matter.

ACTION: DEFER pending further discussion.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Therefore, with no further business before this Committee at this time, this meeting is adjourned. Thank you very much for your presence. . . . (gavel). . .

**ADJOURN:** 3:37 p.m.

APPROVED:

Policy and Intergovernmental Affairs Committee

pia:min:140131:rk Transcribed by: Reinette Kutz

January 31, 2014

### **CERTIFICATE**

I, Reinette Kutz, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED this 24<sup>th</sup> day of February 2014, in Wailuku, Hawaii.

Reinette I Kutz