

PLANNING COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

September 27, 2001

Department of Hawaiian Home Lands Conference Room
Kalana Oiwi Complex (across from the Kapuaiwa Coconut Grove
on Kamehameha V Highway), Molokai

CONVENE: 10:35 a.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Charmaine Tavares, Chair
Councilmember Michael J. Molina, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Alan M. Arakawa, Member
Councilmember G. Riki Hokama, Member
Councilmember Jo Anne Johnson, Member
Councilmember Dain P. Kane, Member
Councilmember Patrick S. Kawano, Member
Councilmember Wayne K. Nishiki, Member

EXCUSED: Councilmember Robert Carroll, Member

STAFF: Wayne A. Boteilho, Legislative Analyst
David M. Raatz, Legislative Attorney
Camille Sakamoto, Committee Secretary
Yvette Bantilan, Land Use Committee Secretary (10:30 a.m. meeting)
Ella Alcon, Council Aide, Molokai Council Office

ADMIN.: Clayton I. Yoshida, Deputy Director, Department of Planning
William Medeiros, GIS Coordinator, Office of Management (5:00 p.m.
meeting)
Edward S. Kushi, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the
Corporation Counsel (Substituting for Deputy Richard K. Minatoya)

OTHERS: 10:30 a.m.: Barbara Kalipi, Molokai Enterprise Community
Walter Ritte, Molokai Enterprise Community
Ed Misaki, Molokai Enterprise Community
Yola Meyer Forbes, Molokai Enterprise Community
Stacy Crivello, Molokai Enterprise Community
Kelii Mawae
Bettygene Dudoit, Molokai Enterprise Community
Claud Sutcliffe, Molokai Enterprise Community

Harold Edwards, Senior Vice President, Development
Division, Molokai Ranch, Ltd.
DeGray Vanderbilt

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Additional attendees (30+)

5:00 p.m.: Harold Edwards, Senior Vice President, Development Division, Molokai Ranch, Ltd.
Paul Mullin, Director, West Molokai Association and President, Papohaku Ranchlands Owners Association
Keoni Lindo
Gerry Anderson
Maria Holmes, Director, Molokai Visitors Association
Donna Haytko-Paoa
David Nanod
Michael Zarle, First Assembly of God and Calvary Chapel
Pastor Randy Manley
Yolanda Reyes
Donald Dudoit Jr.
Gladys Brown for Zachary Helm
Byron Espaniola
Patricia Pagay
Irene Kaahanui for Kauila Reyes
Wayne Fowler
Joseph Pentak
Kari Parks
Adam Briggs
James R. Berg
Lisa Davis
Art Parr
Carnation Nanod
Claud Sutcliffe
Alyne Kikukawa
Thomas Mashima
Bonnie Valdez
Edward Mersberg
Christina Kelly
Julia Makaena
Alice Codd
Willie James Laemoa
Jimmy Duvauchelle Sr.
Krisha Sahagun
Erwin Kudoba
Glenn Teves
Darryl Canady
George Pescaia
Paul Kaahanui
Tessa Reich
Audwin Calairo

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Lawrence Aki
Nahula Kapuni
David Patterson
Roy M. Horner, Molokai Mule Ride, Inc.
Stephanie Coble
Tom Juliano, Vice President, Mace Pacific Holding
Mapuana Kansana
Yola Meyer Forbes
Raymond K. and Roxanne Hiro
Sarah Sykes
Buddy Reed, Kukui (Molokai), Inc.; Kukui Resorts, Inc.;
Molokai Public Utilities, Inc.; and Mosco Inc.
Kathy Bennett
Deldrine Kauai Kapuni
Joanna Ramos
Ed Medeiros, President and CEO, Global Medical
Transcription and Pacific Island Teleservices
Lindsey Crivello
Clifford Dudoit, Molokai Junior Roping Club
Vandale Dudoit, Molokai Junior Roping Club
Julie Bicoy
Dartagnon Bicoy
Karen Holt
Laurie Bishaw
Gayla(?) Boswell
Justin Oho
Daniel R. Bennett
Mr. and Mrs. John Pele
Will Carlson
Wilma K. Grambusch
Felicidad Borden
Geri Mahiai Santiago
Phillip Stephens
DeGray Vanderbilt
Kenneth Ching
William F. Vogt
Halona Kaopuiki
Phil Merricks
Ron Kimball
Leilani Bicoy-Lalin
Joey Joao
Stacy Crivello for Steven Petro
Stacy Crivello
Zhantell Dudoit
Bettygene Dudoit

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Bettygene Dudoit for Pearl Friel Petro
Punahele Alcon for Sonya Yuen
Mahana Adolpho
Catherine Aki
Crystal Kanemitsu
Lehua "Fern" Hamai
Eugene Santiago
Judy L. Caparida
Tim Leong
Scott Adams
Barbara Kalipi
William Kalipi Jr.
Kanoho Helm
Kekama Helm
Sammi Kaai
Kyle Juario
Wayde Lee
Debra Mapel
Walter Ritte
John Kikukawa
Michael Weeks

Poncho Alcon
Clarence Adachi
Joseph Cariaga
Gandharua Ross
Uilani Ramos
Noelani Helm
Opuulani Albino
James K. Mawae
Lori Buchanan
Leonida Molina, Molokai Filipino Community Council
Jo-Ann Simms
Zessica Apiki
Buzzy Sproat, Molokai Mule Ride, Inc.
Que Martyn
Ronald Davis
Additional attendees (300+)

PRESS: ?
Catherine Aki with video camera

CHAIR TAVARES: . . .(*gavel*). . . Will the Planning Committee please come to order. It would be good the room was small enough, we could just talk, but for our

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

recording sake, we need to speak into the microphones. At this time, I'd like to recognize the members of the Committee that are here, and we have a 100 percent attendance. Starting from my left, we have mister--oh, except for Bob Carroll, that's right, who is excused--Mr. Nishiki, Mr. Kane, Mr. Arakawa, Mr. Hokama. On my right, the Vice-Chair of the Committee Mike Molina; then Jo Anne Johnson; and then Mr. Chair, Pat Kawano, from your lovely island. From our staff, with Legislative Analyst, Wayne Boteilho; and our Recording Secretary, Camille Sakamoto.

ITEM NO. 4: MOLOKA'I COMMUNITY PLAN (Misc.)

ITEM NO. 5: TECHNICAL STUDIES (C.C. 93-510)

CHAIR TAVARES: The purpose of today's meeting--and I think you know that we have a full day here on Molokai--the purpose of today's meeting is to receive information from the Enterprise Community and their plan. And I appreciate that Enterprise Community folks were. . . are going to share with us and with you all in this sort of setting. So we have a PowerPoint presentation that I think Karen Holt will be . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

?: . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: . . . oh, with finger only, okay. And then when you pick up the microphone, then introduce yourself for the record and we'll proceed with that.

We'll also have our Corporation Counsel, Mr. Ed Kushi Jr., who will be advising us, should we need any advice at this point in time.

Our purpose today is to receive that information after which we will recess the meeting until 5 p.m. And at 5 p.m. at Mitchell Pauole Center, we will be having a presentation by Molokai Ranch and then our actual meeting will start at 6 o'clock for the Molokai Community Plan review. So, that's kinda the format for today. In between there, we'll have Mr. Arakawa joining us and. . . and with his Land Use Committee and we will be meeting at 1:30 taking up some Land Use items that are pertinent to Molokai. So at this time, I'd like to turn the program over to Enterprise Community Board. You have to. . . you have to use the microphone.

MS. KALIPI: Before I . . . *(inaudible)*. . . I would like to . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, certainly.

NOTE: *Ms. Kalipi recited a prayer in Hawaiian without using the microphone, followed by her presentation.*

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MS. KALIPI: Aloha ka kou. My name is Barbara Kalipi and I'm really not a member of the Enterprise Community Board, however, I was one of two co-facilitators who co-facilitated the process that resulted in the designation once the community put its plan together. So I'm actually pinch-hitting for an Enterprise Community Board member who was my co-facilitator and his name is Alton Arakaki. He . . . works as an extension agent for the College of Tropical Ag and Human Resources and had to go to Oahu. . . I mean, I think, Maui for business. So, again, I'm pinch-hitting and if it kinda shows that I'm pinch-hitting . . . *(spoken in Hawaiian)*. . . forgive me, and I know that the Enterprise Community Board members will. . . will help to fill in.

Because they. . . they're asked. . . asked me to do the introduction and the. . . the general presentation, I also took advantage of that to. . . to reflect on some personal observations as I looked back on the process, and I wanted to share those personal obs. . . observations and be very clear that they are obvos. . . obviously my observations as a co-facilitator so my biases may seem to come in. And as much as possible I want to share the observations from the perspective of somebody who had the responsibility to be a co-facilitator, which means not to take positions, but to really help the process. At least I'd want to say that the communi. . . it was a community-based process that for me resulted in the most comprehensive island-wide grassroots and inclusive community plan for this island. And I think when we do the presentation it will become clear to you why I say that.

I think it was a process that strengthened and built new relationships in the community because it really called for us to reach out into the community and to get as much participation. And, again, I think some of the slides will show that. To be really truthful, it was also a process that was mostly favored with camaraderie, but sometimes was contentious and tested the strength of friendships, fairness and the ability as community members to look beyond our own biases for the interests of the greater good. And I. . . I want to stress that a lot because, again, it's not that. . . I think none of us can say that any of the plans that have been developed has full support of the community. I'm speaking Maui Countywide as well. But I believe the effort was a very sincere one to try to get inclusive participation, and I think Harold would be one of the folks to. . . to vouch for that because we had a very difficult time even as a community saying, well, should the Ranch participate, shouldn't the Ranch participate, they're not island residents--supposed to be island residents, but they do contribute to the community, they are here and we should include them. So the final outcome was we cannot not include everybody. And again, I want to stress that was not agreed upon by everybody, but it was ultimately the decision of the Coordinating Committee, the majority, and we moved forward with that. It was a process that attempted, in my opinion, to honor the island's. . . the island community's history,

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

its people, and their dreams. And finally, it was a process that looked for solutions and tried to build on our community's strengths.

I believe that. . .that at the end of the plan, the commitment to the plan that was developed was a commitment that moved forward and decided. . .the community decided they would do the implementation of the plan with or without designations. So even before the announcement that was made in January 1999 that the community got their designation, the. . .the people in fact had already begun organizing a board to actually implement some of the projects realizing that obviously without Federal funds and the kind of leveraging of their resources, we would not get as far as quickly, perhaps, but nevertheless I think that commitment to the plan became a greater incentive and of greater value than the funds promised by Federal designation. But, you know, I think the community was really blessed. They were able to get a designation and have. . .move forward to implement their ideas.

And also, I. . .I guess I'd finally like to say that the implementation of the plan is the responsibility of the governing board of directors who will, some of them will be presenting later on. And so now we go to the PowerPoint. Thank you for allowing me to share.

Okay. I'm trying to stay out of people's way, so . . .

A little bit more generally on the EC strategic plan and its goals. As you can see and, I guess, I. . .if I understand it correctly, each of the Council members were given some handouts which hopefully will aid you in. . .as we move into through the presentation. So again as you see under Environment, the environment will be clean, healthy, protected from damage, pollution, and over-exploitation.

For our Economy, very well known that we need a boost in our economy. We hope that it will be strong, diversified and production-based.

Self-governance: That Molokai's future will be in the hands of the people who live on the island.

And. . .and Healthy Community: Molokai's families will be healthy physically, mentally and spiritually.

The progress to date since it was awarded in January 1999, a summary from the EC staff, Jobs Created, 64 full time, a 150 trainee positions in the various projects as listed below.

Funding Leverage so far 18.9 million. And I think it should be pointed out that less than 3 percent of the funds that were gotten have been used for administrative, the rest has gone directly to Enterprise Community projects.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Partnerships Created: 37 partners. Those partners are listed here and they show that . . .the diversity of government partners including Federal, State, County agency and some private entities.

I guess the . . .the main gist of the presentation is really to . . .to state the EC's very strong support for the community plan as it was developed for the . . .the committee. What . . .ECC is a very strikingly similar process, development of goals and outcomes and it imple. . .and the implementation that there's very strong similarities between the community plan as it was developed in 1994 and the plan that was developed by the EC process in 1998. Even though there were two completely planning processes, one County and one Federal, in both plans the community spoke with one voice--their responses to the process were the same.

To summarize some of those similarities, if you look at that Process, both, you know, the effort was to be open to the whole community for input. . .input. One was initiated by the County government, the other was initiated, promoted and endorsed by the Federal government, again, with support from State and County on their review and approval of the plan. It was structured, both were structured to try to ensure maximum community participation. Planning steps were very similar. Community plan from the CAC looked at vision problems, opportunity, recommendations, goals, objectives, actions and standards. The planning steps for the EC Process looked at values, visions, problems, opportunities, resource, goals, strategies, project priorities. Again in the process, both were prepared by community volunteers. The CAC took 270 days, had district-wide meetings and got approval by the Molokai Planning Commission--needed, I'm sorry--approval by the Molokai Planning Commission and County Council. The process EC took was quite similar, volunteers took for the most part 90 days to actually do the . . .the planning, 61 committee meetings, with two town meetings, more than 300 unduplicated participants. Some folks participated in weekly meetings, some participated in subcommittee meetings, some came to the community meetings, some participated in survey responses. And we also had a survey done which resulted in 200 summer school students responding to . . .to some questions--all of that as an effort to try to get as much community input in a 90-day period as possible.

MR. RITTE, FROM THE AUDIENCE: Barbara, you want to pass the . . .the list of the people who . . .*(inaudible)*. . . out?

MS. KALIPI: Oh, I'm sorry, it wasn't passed out yet?

MR. RITTE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MS. KALIPI: Okay. Okay, thank you. Walter is just pulling out a . . .an excerpt from this. . .this is one of two volumes of the plan itself and in here there's a listing of all of the participants from each of the meetings that was done. And that was actually a requirement of the Federal government in terms of their set. . .the submittal of the plan to actually demonstrate how much effort you put into trying to do a community-wide process.

Okay. Similarities again, between both plans. The Community Vision Statement was developed by the EC and my understanding is that. . .that vision was adopted by the community, not in 1994, obviously, but . . .(*interruption*). . . I'm sorry, in. . .last year. So it was included. So there's the same vision statement for both. They identified very similar problems--again, high unemployment, not a surprise to any of us. It's articulated as lack of opportunities; high part-time jobs; no sustainable economy in the EC; lack of local control. And in EC it says, no. . .no local authority--and again, that is not a. . .a big surprise to anyone here. Identifying Problems, continuing, lack of recreation; public service; DOE turnover; high cost of living identified by CAC in 1994; 1998 community says facilities old; DOE turnover; no cultural park. . .park; and limited affordable housing.

Then we move into Identifying Opportunities--is always my favorite part of the. . .any plan, looking at the possibilities. Opportunities described by the CAC process: Hawaiian rural lifestyle; build on uniqueness, the open and uncrowded; subsistence resources; the values, helping each other; extended family and sharing and community. The Opportunities in 1998 as articulated by the community, perpetuate Hawaiian culture and traditions; the highest values, family, togetherness; rural lifestyle, everybody knows everybody; slow pace; and jobs. Continuing on Opportunities--CAC: Abundant cultural and archeological resources as an opportunity and its strength; culturally appropriate economic development as the opportunity desired; center of Hawaiian Renaissance; pristine environment, little pollution, farmlands, and an opportunity for subsistence. Opportunities, similar opportunities articulated in the EC plan: Cultural resources; undeveloped character; undisturbed historic sites; restoring of the environment; to protect resources, the native rainforests, water and coastal reefs.

So in summary, I guess, I'd like to say for the conclusion of my part that the similarities were so striking and so obvious to both the EC and the CAC committees that I think it made the presentation kinda like *happen* on its own almost. And I think this is the reason why there's such a strong sense from the EC Board that they really don't have a choice except to support the CAC from 1994 to 1998 seeing not too much difference in. . .in what the community shared in those two respective processes.

Now, I think we'll get into more. . . a little bit more detail on projects. And while that's important I think is because it will show the fit of the CAC

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Molokai. . . Molokai Community Plan goals/objectives and their implementing activities to the Enterprise Community's projects. And as you well know, the CAC Community Plan has yet to be approved, therefore, it cannot be implemented. However, the EC projects have begun so they have actually implemented their strategic plan. And so what members now will share further is some of the details of the projects and how they align to the goals and objectives of the CAC Plan.

So who's next? I think _____.

MR. MISAKI: Thank you, Barbara.

CHAIR TAVARES: State your name for the record.

MR. MISAKI: What?

CHAIR TAVARES: State your name for the record.

MR. MISAKI: Yeah. Just wanted to say aloha and welcome to Molokai. My name is Ed Misaki and I am. . . I work for The Nature Conservancy here on Molokai. I was born and raised on this island, and I am also a member of the EC Board, known as Ke Aupuni Lokahi and I just wanted to state that. . . what Barbara stated before, we are in favor of the 1994 CAC Plan without the amendments, uh, I guess, the 600 foot island-wide setback. Before I. . . before I go, you all have this. . . this handout that we gave you, but before I go into the individual projects I just wanted to give you. . . or reemphasize a little bit about the history and my view on it.

In 1998 I got involved in the, back then it was called the EZ Strategic Planning and Application Process, and I was asked to be part of the Environmental Subcommittee. This was one of seven subcommittees and, I must say, we met two, maybe three times a week for over a period of two to three months. And this was just one sub. . . subcommittee. So seven subcommittees were meeting twice, maybe three times a week trying to come up with projects and planned projects for this strategic plan to. . . to put together this economic package. The Environmental Subcommittee was made up of many people from many sectors of this island. We had conservation professionals, we had large land owners, we had local fishermen, local hunters, we had some farmers and just ab. . . bunch of different people on the subcommittee. In my opinion this is. . . this was sti. . . this is, this was and still is, the. . . the largest gathering of people for a community planning process that ever happened on Molokai that I've been involved with and it was very comprehensive, open, and very inclusive. And people from all walks of life, from economic status, from all lines of profession was involved in this process.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

If you know Molokai, you know Molokai is a community of extended families. And, um, all of us know that Molokai is still an island. . ."Island Paradise". Most of us realize that we still have a chance to be that Hawaiian paradise, unique and different from the con. . .contemporary Hawaii. If you look at the original '94 CAC Plan and the 1998 Easy Strategic Plan, you really hear the voice of Molokai. If you look at the Land Use Section. . .if you look in the Land Use loose. . .the Land Use and Environmental Section of this handout that we've given you, one thing that you will notice . . .*(inaudible)*. . . from this line . . .*(pause)*. . . one thing you will notice is that many of the ideas. . .

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: Excuse me, I just, if. . .hi, if you can point what you're looking at so we can refer to that particular. . .I'm sorry, Madam Chair.

CHAIR TAVARES: No, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: Thank you. If you can just point out what handout you have so that we reference that as you're speaking.

MR. MISAKI: It's called the Similarities between CAC, Molokai Community Plan. It's this chart. Yeah. And if you look at Page 4. . .

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: Thank you.

MR. MISAKI: . . .in the first two sections, the first one is Land Use and the second one is Environment. And if you look at it and you run down through the CAC side of it. . .of the column, you see the. . .many of the ideas and the things that were brought forward are very similar to what the Land Use and Environmental Subcommittees came up with projects. The one thing I must say that I'm. . .I'm very happy about the EC or the EZ Strategic Plan is that, not only have we come up with the same ideas, we're starting to implement a lot of these ideas. And this is a good example, we have a watershed project going on on Molokai where we've actually used Council money in, Board of Water Supply, we've used and we've been able to leverage a lot of monies for this project to help protect the upper rain forest from the large herds of goats that are affecting our East Molokai Mountains. You can see, the fence is already working--on one side of the fence it's green and the other side it's still being whacked by the goats. But this. . .this are some of the examples . . .*(pause)*. . .

We've also, Molokai is a. . .an island that a lot of us still depend a lot on our ocean resources and. . .and as some of you may not know, but Molokai, probably Molokai's greatest resource is it's fringing reef--it's the longest continuous fringing reef in the Hawaiian Islands. And if you look at the projects we. . .we're very, very, uh, you know, we look at trying to preserve and manage these. . .this resource which is a very, very important resource to our island.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Molokai is a very traditional, rural lifestyle, Hawaiian lifestyle and one of the important things is to preserve the past, the history of the Hawaiian people, and we have projects in there reflecting that. So again, I just wanted to reemphasize the point that many of the ideas, the objectives, the goals of both plans are similar, and like I say, the E. . .our EC Strategic Plan really gives us a chance to implement a lot of these objectives and goals. And I just ask that. . .that you accept the voice of the people, the 1994. . .the original 1994 CAC Plan that was done by Molokai people as the plan to accept. It is really the wish of Molokai. Thank you. Who's next?

NOTE: *Long pause.*

MS. MEYER FORBES: Hello, and welcome to Molokai. My name is Yola Meyer Forbes and I was born here on Molokai and I had a law office here for about 17 years, but I'm now retired from that and I run a tropical fruit farm. I wanted to speak about--I'm a member of the EC Board--and I wanted to talk about the cultural resources that we have and to show you the similarities. You can look at this, the comparison, on your similarities sheet. The. . .there are four main points that I wanted to. . .to stress. One is the Historic Site Inventory, that we will have comprehensive survey and interpretation of these wonderful historic sites here on the island. Some of them have been done and others are in the process of being done. The second, is Hawaiian Rights Education that there is, you know, a plan to educate and to share information about the legal rights of native Hawaiians to the people of Molokai so that they can have a good background, too, and understanding of the controversies that are going on and to know what their rights are. The third is the Malama Cultural Park down by the wharf, and we now have a park there and it's a place where we can have gatherings, have families together to share our knowledge of our. . .our growing up and. . .and the culture and traditions. And it's. . .it's a park that is used, but not right now, but should be used more often and. . .and I'm sure that will happen. And the fourth item I wanted to talk about is the Molokai Museum and Cultural Center and that is up at Kalae on the way to the Kalaupapa Lookout. And we now have a sm. . .just a small museum that has changing exhibits. It have [*sic*] a very nice exhibit on Kahoolawe which has now moved to the Smithsonian. And so it's located next to the, R. W. Meyer Sugar Mill. So we. . .we want to be able to expand the museum and the cultural center and have more activities there for our local people. And those are the main points I wanted to touch on, although there are many, many more. You can see. . .see them in the papers we've handed out. So, thank you very much for your consideration.

MS. S. CRIVELLO: Aloha. My name is Stacy Crivello and I also serve on the Ke Aupuni Lokahi Molokai Enterprise Community Board. Like Ed, many of us got involved for little motives that we thought, well, you know, there's this money. . .much money that the Feds is putting out there, maybe we can make a

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

difference. My personal reason was for the last ten years prior to we getting this designation, many of us and . . .and many people before were working very hard to get a dialysis center here on the island. And, um, that was my motive, looking at how can we make it happen and then things started roll and as Barbara stated earlier, as we expanded and inclusively got the full wind of the community involved, things just started to roll. And I . . .I chaired the Economic Committee. At the time, I was manager with the Verizon operations on . . .for Molokai and Lanai. I'm retired today. But with our economic activity that we know we have to vitalize on this island as well as all the other islands, especially what we're experiencing today, we took a good look at what we have. We look at our asset and we say, you know what, let's try and build on what we have. And I think all of us, even when we're looking within ourselves, we look at what do we have?

Let's move into production. We've got taro production, we talk about our native plant nursery, but most of all, you know, a plan that was created in 1994 and here we are 1998, completely independent from one another and yet, we're on the same page. We're . . .we're trying to work together to value the real landscape that we have and the cultural heritage that we value and the uniqueness of our island. Today, if you take a look at what happening up at Ho'olehua, there's a commercial kitchen, and that's going to involve work for our kupuna, for our Punanaleo and also it's going to give us an opportunity for the Auntie Myrtles to legally make her jellies so she can sell it out on the street and not have to hide and because it's a commercial kitchen. And you know what's unique about this, through the EC process, it's not only for the homesteaders, it's for all of Molokai. So it's called the Ho'olehua Commercial Kitchen, but the leveraging that was involved to get people to support this, as soon as we got our designation, money set aside for rural development from the USDA, got things rolling. And that's what our Enterprise Community bought.

Now, we all know Molokai Electric, we all know the dilapidated looks right there in Kaunakakai. We have an opportunity because our Enterprise Community designation, to redevelop this site into a technological center, a learning center, a business-development center, and even a mini-family center. And we already have monies waiting for us with the EDA, the Federal side, of \$500,000 and what we need to do is get support from State and County to be able to leverage to make this real.

Slaughterhouse--that's . . .that is truly community. I mean, the _____ our ranchers and farmers and everybody else has been working dead end to make this happen. And EC also was able to help leverage funding and it's becoming a reality. So this is all part of our economic implementation, part of a plan that started, really, since 1994, and continuing and starting on a new page in 1998. But, the same voice, the same authors--the community. So in . . .in all of this, we know that we have the similarities and this is what we ask. We ask that you support the original 1994 community plan.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Uncle Kelii would like to say something.

MR. K. MAWAE: I see everybody over here look serious today. My name is Kelii _____ Mawae. I'm the Honorary Mayor over here. I'm not the big mayor, you know, the small ones . . . *(chuckle)*. . . But my parents all come from Kaupo, Hana, Nahiku. So I really, uh, I'm officially, all my life, I was really an official over there . . . *(inaudible)*. . . *(laughter)*. . . Let me show you little bit, you know, because that's not the right way for throw the net, I just like show the people how I throw, but I throw more low 'eh . . . *(laughter)*. . . But . . . *(chuckle)*. . . but I . . . I like, my . . . my most concern is, uh, and then plus too, I work for Sam Kahinui and I also _____. Five years already . . . *(inaudible)*. . . He told me, Kelii, he give me this job as advisor for help the people. Not only Molokai, all over the State. You know, I still going yet.

So whatev. . . what. . . what I'm more concerned is the fishing right. I've been fishing all my life so I like our people to get a right-of-way to go fishing. I hate to see the kind sign like "kapu" and lot of this kind stuff like all over the State, you know . . . Us guys born and raised on Molokai, Hawaiian bug, you know. We like go catch the fish over here, pick up the limu over there. So, that's what I'm more concerned.

And, uh, the water. I see a lot of public without water and I . . . I look at _____ in Maui, uh, you know, Hana, Nahiku, that's where all of my family come from and they doing a lot of damage up there. So I went over there one day and I talk story with. . . I don't know who that like me over there, but that's where my family come from. Anyway, I first like to attend meeting, you might see me on TV some time. Give 'em Hawaiian slack key, all come from Kaupo for my tutu. But I . . . since I'm the Mayor now, I don't know how long I going last, but if I do my job for the people, that's what I concerned is the people, yeah. If . . . if . . . if Molokai Ranch like create some job, 'eh, go, you know. Like the hotels right over there now, they . . . the Sheraton, you know, the people no more job over here nowadays. You know, we just struggling. So I think you guys should help Molokai to help the people over here and I hope Molokai Ranch do their job and help the people. That's all I more concerned is the water, then the community and the people.

I come from the homestead, you know, 40 acres, and I was the first pilot in the State of Hawaii for Lanai. Now I can talk little bit, before I was like this 'eh, now I stay little bit like this, I can talk . . . *(chuckle)*. . . Yeah. Yeah. Okay. Anyway, I plan to mele. Maybe all you guys know about noni in Maui, but shipping made to _____ Libby's, where we get our juice over there now. Very far. We just shoot 15,000 pounds every two weeks, so we create job on Molokai. So all the homesteaders get land, they gave 'em noni, they gave 'em taro, they gave 'em everything. Look. . . I think we the bread. . . the breadbasket of Molokai, that's

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

what he is. _____. There's the breadbasket of Molokai. So we gotta do our job. And I think tonight I going do. I get somewhere, I no like say the words, but tonight I going say a little bit more. Thank you.

MS. B. DUDOIT: My name is Bettygene Ocampo Dudoit, and I sit of the EC Board. I wondered why I was part of the planning, why I came to the came to the table, but I finally figured it out early in the same when I was sitting there with that--you know what, I needed to be there because I'm a caretaker, we all are. We only take of the lands and take care of our resources because when we leave the earth, this is what we leave back, we take nothing with us. And that's the. . .how I figured it out. So I needed. . .I needed to be there to make sure that Molokai would be okay for the future of our families.

Design and Housing: The CAC, that. . .CAC, um, it's goal, you know, was harmony between the natural and man-made environments to ensure the natural beauty and character of Molokai is preserved. Well, Green Molokai, that's the project that we came out with and that was to make all of Molokai green. How beautiful it would be. But it's a project that is not, um, it's on hold now, it's. . .we're not working on that now. We got other priorities, other projects. The other was housing. Both plans, you know, and they echo itself. The people said for themselves that they need affordable housing. And basically that. . .this is what--we have a project called Self-Help Housing Loan Fund. This will provide opportunities for home ownership for low-income families. So, you know, if you really look at. . .look at it, the similarities are. . .are the same. Both plans echo each other. Thank you.

MR. RITTE: Aloha and good morning. My name is Walter Ritte and I'd like to say mahalo for this opportunity. Madam Chairman, thank you very much for this op. . .I think it's so important because a lot times you hear a lot of emotion and you don't quite understand all of the background coming to all these emotions and people are trying to say something in three minutes and sometimes you get and sometimes you don't. So, mahalo for this opportunity.

My section is on Infrastructure. And, I guess we could at this, um, palapala so that you could see we followed exactly what the CAC Plan--all of their policies, objectives, goals and those kinds of things. I mean we tried to fit ours in. . .into your format, and we found that it was really, really simple because it just meshed right in.

So, under Infrastructure we talked about Kaunakakai Harbor, we had some ideas from the CAC and we had some ideas from the EC side, but they're basically the same. And we also talked about, on both sides, Water Management--how we're going to figure out our water problems. And both sides were pretty much the same. And when we talk about Waste Management and Recycling and those kinds of things, both sides were basically the same. So, the message

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

with. .with all of this is that even though we had two different process, one County and one Federal, and two separate actions community based, they both ended up almost in the same place. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: Use the mic.

MR. SUTCLIFFE: Aloha and welcome . . .*(inaudible)*. . . with neighbors. Yeah. My name is Claud Sutcliffe. Aloha, welcome, and thanks for coming to listen to us, yeah. Basically, my job is to, Dain, on Page 7, look at seven, Social Infrastructure, Recreation, Health and Public Safety, and Education. In our community plan, this only one of the two volumes, yeah. We subsume that under Healthy community, Molokai No Ka Heke, yeah. And if you look on the left side, you got specific projects listed. I counted 12 and 9 out of the 12 have been directly implemented in our community plan. The only exceptions are at the bottom in education, where it says expand library hours in the library in east and west ends and funding for MCC. Well, we got the funding for MCC; you see the new building. And the State cut the library hours, but in general, if you look on the right hand side where we got things listed under Recreation, Health and Public Safety and Education, you can see that the EC Plan basically goes beyond . . .*(end of tape, start 1B)*. . . the CAC Plan, yeah. Goes beyond, flushes out.

Now, I'd like to point up to four things in particular on the right-hand side in terms of going beyond. The best example might be the learning centers, where it's a life-long learning opportunities, from our preschoolers to our adults. This is really an excellent thing that we have up and running and are consciously stewarding. In terms of flushing out that prior vision that we've tried to expand on, maybe the Dialysis Treatment Center which is up and running is the best example, yeah.

In terms of what we're trying to create in the future and haven't yet found the funding for, I think probably the Multi-Disciplinary Human Services Complex, yeah. And we need this because we have 17 off-island providers. Sometimes they come in and out, the kids don't get to see them. You know, we need local control on that one for sure. But I think the single thing that stands out to me in our health. . .Healthy Community Project is here in the Education section, something that really goes beyond the prior CAC vision, and that's our Youth Leadership thing. We've had young people actively involve from the get-go and they continue to be involved at the board level. And this has been the thing that I think has been. . .that and the Taro Production, you know, have been the most heartening things to me. I think you folks can be proud of what we're accomplishing here on Molokai, and I hope that you will help us continue our community plan.

MR. RITTE: One of our guys didn't show up so I have to pick. We're down to the last part, so the last issue under the CAC Plan is. . .is Government. And it's a big

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

issue for Molokai because we have. . .we used to have only two elected officials on this island. And now we have three with Ron Davis being elected as our representative. I'm blocking the show, huh? . . .(laughter). . . So, um, one of the things we always talk about on Molokai is it's very hard to be, you know, un. . .in Maui County, Maui County being the only tri-isle coun. . .county, where every island has its own county. So Molokai, we always talk big about being our own county, and we've never really gotten to that stage yet because I guess we're all afraid that we'll probably going to have to increase all of our taxes in order to keep that kind of lifestyle we're living right now because we don't have the base to work from. So those are the kinds of issues that we talked about in producing this. . .this whole idea of the EC Plan.

And some of the people explained why they got involved, and I'd like to explain why I got involved in the EC. It was because of this problem that we've been having since we were kids. And the problem was it's either the plantation people making decisions for us and telling us what we're going to grow and when we're going to get up or where we're going to pick up our "bongo" numbers, jump on the truck, hoe hana, come back, get your paycheck, go home--no need think, no need worry, just do what you're gonna do. And then on the other side you got Molokai Ranch all these years controlling, you know, more that a third of this island telling us what and what and what and how we can go into the land and when we can and cannot go there and all that kind of stuff. So we were basically, all grew up with no real government on our island with a plantation attitude telling us when to go work, when to go pick up you "bongo" number, so we become like everyday somebody's telling you what to do. And we all grew up that way. And then some people started talking about . . .thinking on their own and community empowerment and community-based development where we would develop things. And that's the kind of ideas that came up and grew up and really gave birth to this whole EC process.

A lot of us felt that it was this "carrot" that the Federal government put out there, they were going to give you half a million dollars or whatever if you do this plan and if you do it the way they tell you. And it found out it wasn't the money. The plan became so much more valuable than the money. In fact we only got 250,000. We didn't get what we thought what we was going to get. But the money, I mean, we've drawn down maybe 30,000 from that amount. But the plan and our ability to go leverage other monies was what I was so excited about. We became empowered as a community. We began to say where we gonna do, what we gonna do, how we gonna do it. And the plantation mentality started to disappear. And it wasn't that hard for Molokai because get plenty hard-headed people on this island. If you one fisherman, like Uncle Kelii, you hard-headed. Nobody going tell you when to go fish, what to fish, how to fish. He know when he going. He not going tell you when he going, but he going when he going. You one hunter, you the same way. And if you one farmer, you the same way. So in us, we have this innate ability to be hard-headed and to start thinking for

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

ourselves and not wait for the great State telling us this is how we going come over there and give you 300 jobs, miracles overnight and all that kind stuff. We went through all of that--none of that worked for us--from sugar companies that went broke, from Louisiana Land and Oil that couldn't make it. I mean, you have a whole list of failures that was brought in by the State. So this whole process we're talking about is our ability as people to empower ourselves, make our decisions, and move forward. So no matter who comes and goes, we all live here, we going die here, we going. . .we going carry ourselves forward. That's why it's exciting to see this, two processes--one County, one Federal--and the thing came together. It's like, even had three, it would probably come together. So, you know, that's. . .that's the message I think we're trying to get out to you guys.

And when Barbara talked about the fights we had, I was one of the fight. I did not want Molokai Ranch to be part of the EC process. I fought like hell. I even left the meeting, but we all had to give up something, so they became very involved in the whole thing. Went through the whole process, everybody said, yeah, we got a good plan, let's move forward, everybody all excited. The only one that said no to the plan was Molokai Ranch; they refused to sign off on the plan. And the same thing is happening with the CAC Plan; they're refusing to sign off. Thank you.

MS. S. CRIVELLO: I'd like to, on behalf of the Molokai Enterprise Community, summarize our presentation and come before you to ask that you support the original 1994 CAC Plan. Most of all, thank you for giving us this opportunity. And just to summarize, in 1994, the Citizens Advisory Committee participated in a community-wide planning process to help navigate our island towards its desired future--the Molokai Community Plan. Then in 1998, the Molokai community participated in a community-wide planning process to help navigate our island towards its desired future--the Molokai Enterprise Community Plan. These two plans are two independent created plans. These two plans are similar. Similarities are evidence that our community speaks with one voice in expressing the direction we want to go towards our future. Without the 600 foot buffer, the 2000 County Council Planning Committee's recommendation mirrors our CAC Plan. The Federal government gave its stamp of approval on our Molokai Enterprise Plan, somewhat like the CAC Plan. Do join us with that. Join us to remember that Molokai's community fabric is strong. EC, CAC, the process is community. We asked that the integrity of the process not be shredded. Our plan address economic vitality, education, self-government, environmental protection and social equity.

The themes of our island's plan are interwoven and con. . .connected like the Smart-Growth Plan that all of us are looking at today. We are directly dependent on the different levels of our plan. We value our sense of place, we value our distinctive of cultural heritage and we want to improve our economy. We choose

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

to live here, our children live here, our mo'opuna, they're here. We value the preservation of our environment for our mo'opuna, our natural resources. We recognize and understand our island's demographic, economic and physical features. We have a ten-year strategic plan and it's in its third year. It's been implemented. We've got 40 projects in this ten-year plan that was approved and put together by the community. And we're also ensuring ongoing community participation in the implementation of our strategic plan. It doesn't differ from our 1994 community plan--it does not differ.

The human-made landscape has a profound impact on people--as sense of place is based on the connection people have to their surroundings and their neighbors. We do not want this issue to be one of division for our community. The community process gives us choices and a sense of control over our own future. What we considerable. . .consider equitable is very much based on our values and ethics. As a community, we must think whether our use of resources is exploited and unfair. But, to come in full circle, there is a spiritual connection to our plan. That's what's unique about Molokai. We recognize that Molokai people, like all of Hawaii, are inherent. . .all of Hawaii have inherent spiritual significance. We have a plan. We have a vision. We have a road map.

If you look at your 2000 County Council Planning Committee recommendation, included in here is also the vision that we have and I'd like to share that vision with you: Molokai is the last Hawaiian island. We who live here choose not to be strangers in our own land. The values of aloha 'aina and malama 'aina (love and care for the land) guide our stewardship of Molokai's natural resources, which nourish our families both physically and spiritually. We live by our kupuna's (our elders') historic legacy of pule o'o (powerful prayer). We honor our island's Hawaiian cultural heritage, no matter what our ethnicity, and that culture is practiced in our everyday lives. Our true wealth is measured by the extent of our generosity.

We envision strong 'ohana (strong families) who steadfastly preserve, protect and perpetuate these core Hawaiian values.

We envision a wise and caring community that takes pride in its resourcefulness, self-sufficiency and resilience, and is firmly in charge of Molokai's resources and destiny.

We envision a Molokai that leaves for its children a visible legacy: an island momona (an island abundant) with natural and cultural resources, people who kokua (who help) and look after one another, and a community that strives to build an even better future on the pa'a (on the firm) foundation left to us by those whose iwi (whose bones) guard our land.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Approve our 1994 community plan.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay. Thank you. Is that the conclusion of your presentation? Thank you very much for that presentation. I think we all learned quite a bit from it. . . .at this time I would like to take a five-minute break. If there are any burning questions that the members have for this group, you can ask it now or I'm sure you'll be represented at tonight's meeting, and if you would care to ask the questions at tonight's meeting, we can do that later. So is there anyone who has a question that they want to ask 'cause we're going to get into many questions, and I'll take a recess. No? We'll wait, can wait? Okay. Thank you very much. So at this time, we'll recess our meeting until 5 p.m. at Mitchell Pauole Center. Thank you very much.

RECESS: 11:37 a.m.

RECONVENE: 5:03 p.m. at the Mitchell Pauole Center

CHAIR TAVARES: . . .(*gavel*). . . Will the Planning Committee please reconvene. Good afternoon, everyone. The Planning Committee is here to hear about the Molokai community plan. At this time, I'd like to introduce the members who are present, Jo Anne Johnson, Dain Kane; our Chair and our local-grown homeboy, Pat Kawano; we also have Alan Arakawa, me; Vice-Chair of this Committee, Mike Molina; Mr. Hokama from Lanai; and Mr. Nishiki from South Maui. Our Committee staff, our Legislative Analyst Wayne Boteilho; our Recording Secretary Camille Sakamoto. We have also with us from the Administration, the . . .the Deputy Director of the Department of Planning Clayton Yoshida, and from the Department of the Corporation Counsel, we have Deputy Counsel Ed Kushi Jr. We also have--Mr. Bob Carroll is excused, he could not make it to Molokai. He is not feeling well, so he's not able to be in attendance this evening. In today's meeting at 5 o'clock, what's scheduled is an informational presentation from Molokai Ranch to be presented to the Committee and to where. . .whoever is here. At 6 o'clock is when we will be starting the actual Planning Committee meeting, at that time is when we intend to take testimony. So, if you've signed up to testify, we ask you to wait until the 6 o'clock meeting. If there is someone for some outlandish reason cannot wait until 6 o'clock, you need to let us know now and we'll take the testimony now. Is there anyone who cannot be here at six? Okay. If not, thank you very much. And at this time, I'd like to turn the program over to Mr. Harold Edwards from Molokai Ranch. Harold?

MR. EDWARDS: Thank you, Madam Chairman, and, Members. This morning when your Committee met with the EC group, we started with a pule, which I thought was a . . .a great way to start the program. So, if we could at this time, I'd like to ask Jimmy Duvauchelle to come and . . .and lead us in a pule.

NOTE: Mr. Jimmy Duvauchelle Sr. recited a prayer in Hawaiian, followed by a prayer in English.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MR. DUVAUCHELLE SR.: Oh, gracious heavenly Father, thank you for this moment of grace. Thank you, Father, for allowing us to know that you are the King of Kings and Lord of all Lords. Father, we pray for thy spirit to be upon us so that we can go through this moot [*sic*] this meeting with loving kindness and the spirit of aloha as thou has taught us. Father, first of all, I pray that you be with our leaders. They are left with a hard decision that is set before them. Father, we pray for them. Give them wisdom, give them knowledge, give them love, give them understanding for the things that we go through as Molokai. And, Father, we pray for our people. Father, we pray for love and understanding. Father, we pray for one heart that we can get together, come together, and rise up Molokai again. Lord, you said that if we ask you to forgive us of our sins, Father, you would again increase our land. Forgive us, Father, for we know that we are sinners in thy holy sight . . .(*spoken in Hawaiian*). . .Amene. Amena. Amene.

MR. EDWARDS: Thank you again for this opportunity to make this presentation. Back on March 8th when we came before the Full Council, our testimony before you was that Molokai was in economic crisis. We commented that, Kaluakoi temporary layoffs were beginning to look permanent and we had mentioned that a Ranch transaction was pending, an investor in the Ranch was supposed to have closed in, in December. Well, the previous year it was still struggling to get done and basically I . . .today I can tell you that deal is now dead. We talked about investors being enthusiastic about Molokai. The natural beauty, the people, a lot of the things that Molokai has going for it that attracted people to want to come and invest in Molokai. But we talked about how enthusiasm eventually gave way to reality, the . . .the harsh difficulty of trying to make the numbers work; trying to be able to make a profit; and the difficulty of doing business here. And basically we . . .we indicated that developers were real optimistic and risk takers, and so we had confidence that investors could be found to get Kaluakoi going again to inject money in Molokai Ranch. And we basically asked that the Council adopt a community plan that would welcome developer's capital and would show a willingness in the part of government to work him to allow jobs to be created and the economy to be expanded. We didn't realize how good we had it back on March 8th. As we all know, the world has changed forever on September 11th and we still don't have, I think, a good understanding of where all that's going to take us.

NOTE: Very long pause.

MR. EDWARDS: I mean, even the news today on joblessness it's . . .it's getting worse. Molokai has had a job problem for . . .for years, ever since the pineapple shut down. The statistics basically show that there's half as many jobs per capita on Molokai as there are on Lanai or in Maui itself. So, the . . .the, the unemployment numbers don't even come close to representing the true issue with employment on the island. So, where does that leave us today? I mean, it's clear to us that

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

it's gonna get tougher before it gets better, but we believe that a community plan that encourages new economic investment is critical to minimizing this additional shock to our economy. We believe it will allow an eventual return to a stable economy that has been non-existent for so many years on this island. And as the islands largest private em. . . employer, we. . . we'll be able to determine whether on-island employment continues to decline or begins a recovery. And before we get into the. . . the community plan process, we believe there's a lot of information. . . misinformation out there that colors peoples' attitudes towards the Ranch and. . . and towards some of the things that we have proposed. So, we'd like to address some of that stuff right up front, if we could. The first one is the rumor we keep hearing, so what if the Ranch is losing money, they get a tax write-off. This last year we thought we did really good; we lost \$7½ million. I say really good because in the two years before that, our losses were in excess of 10 million. That's not paper losses, that's cash out-of-pocket that the Ranch had to inject into the. . . the operation to try to keep it going forward. The reality is. . . is that you don't get a write-off unless you make income. Brierly Investment has no subsidiaries on the mainland that are making profits that they can transfer that to, that's just out-of-pocket money that Brierly has injected into the economy. The next one is. . . relates to the community college expansion and the rumors we don't support the expansion. We believe the truth here is closer to the reality that we donated two acres for the University of Hawaii site; we set aside an additional three acres to the University with a ten-year option to purchase that property at fair market value. We have given them a ten year right of first refusal on top of that. So, the University has site control for 20 years of the adjacent three-acre parcel. After we agreed to make the donation to the University, they asked us if we'd be willing to do a design-built turnkey development for them of the whole campus. We agreed to do that. The first thing they asked us to do was to master plan the five-acre site to satisfy themselves that, what we did in the first two acres would complement their long-term plans. We did that. They were satisfied that their long-term needs could be met on the initial two-acre site plus the three acres of expansion. The next one out there is the island's population issue. At the March 8th Council hearing, somebody testified that the Ranch's master plan would increase Molokai's population to 30,000 people. The truth here is in the master plan presentation I made before the Enterprise zone folks a couple of years back, I commented that in ancient times I had understood that Molokai's population was reportedly 30 to 40,000 people. That comment was made in the context of talking about water and having a hard time believing we couldn't support more than our current 7,000 population when we could support that many people in ancient time. In reality, our master plan which is currently inactive, there is no. . . no plan to go forward at this point, would more likely double the current population of 7,000 to about 14,000 over a 50-year time horizon. That's less than 2 percent a year or about 140 people. The next one we want to spend some time on is the water shortage. We believe there is a lot of information. . . misinformation in that area. Before we get into that, I want to go through some definitions real quickly so we're all on the same page. Potable

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

water is basically just water that meets drinking water requirements; non-potable water is basically everything else; brackish water is a form of non-potable water that is 250 parts per million in chlorides or salt, that's the U.S. standard. In a lot of European countries and the world standard is 500 parts per million. We subscribe to the lower number in the United States basically because of health concerns. Salt is associated with heart disease risk. GPD is gallons per day. MGD is million gallons per day. MIS is an abbreviation for the Molokai Irrigation System and I won't try to go through that schematic over there it's pretty faded in this light. Aquifer is underground supply of water. Sustainable yield is the amount of water you can pump from an aquifer on a daily basis without damaging the resource. You can pump it today, you can pump it tomorrow, a hundred years from now, a thousand years from now and go back and pump the day after that and still be able to remove that amount of water from the . . .the resource. The sources of information for my presentation tonight are the, the *Water Budget for the Island of Molokai* prepared for by the USGS back in 1997 that was jointly funded by DHHL and the USGS, used in our contested case hearing. We also used the *Report of the Molokai Water Working Group*, which was originally done in 1993 then updated in 1996, that's was a group here on island, that was done for the Commission on Water Resource Management, and also, an *Island Water Use Permit Index* prepared by the Commission on Water Resource Management dated March 27, 2001. So, those are the sources for all of the numbers we'll be using further in our presentation. It's no surprise that Molokai is surrounded by the Pacific Ocean, for the salt relies on rain as its source of all its fresh water, but the question is how much rain is there? According to the USGS Water Budget study on Page 15, Molokai receives 200. . .I mean, 552 million gallons of rainfall a day on average. In January, which is typically the wettest months, the . . .the typical average day there is 899 million gallons per day. In June, which is typically the driest month, it's 215 million gallons per day. Those numbers were taken from about 70 years of rain data. Five hundred and fifty two million gallons of . . .of water per day would fill all of Molokai Ranch's reservoirs in less than two hours. It would fill the MIS Kualapuu reservoir in two and a half days, that's the big reservoir up there in the middle of the coffee field that all the farmers rely on, and it would supply all of Board of Water Supply's Molokai customers for 20 months; one day's rainfall. The next question is where does it all fall, and it's no surprise most of it's concentrated in the east end. This innermost circle here represents 157 inches of rainfall a year, that's 13 feet 1 inches of rain falling on every square foot of land in that area or 98 gallons of water per square foot. The next . . .the next number represents 118 inches of rain a year then it drops down to 7, and by the time you get out to the west end it's about 15 inches of rain in those areas. Our watershed up in this area, if we use a conservative number about 60 inches per year, collects or catches about 3.8 billion gallons of . . .of rainfall on it, of that we capture about 1 gallon out of every 20, about 185 million gallons of water a year. So, the next question where does it go. Fifty percent of it or 274 million gallons of water a day is lost by evaporation from the soil or from transpiration from plants growing on

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

the soil, basically plants perspire so half of that rainfall is lost by evaporation or transpiration. Eighty-nine million gallons a day or 16 percent is lost to direct-stream runoff and again, these are . . .these are annual averages, in big storms that number swells into the billions and some days it's probably close to zero. And then the remaining water 189 million gallons a day or 34 percent of that total fall becomes ground water recharge, and basically what's been happening now, for thousands of years that water has been flowing down into the, into the island and the underground basal(?) lands has become saturated. It can't hold any more water. So, what happens is that every gallon of water that comes down into the aquifer basically pushes a gallon of water out along the shoreline. It's no different than if you put a sponge on a table and started pouring water on it, at some point the sponge is full, the more water you pour on it the . . .the water all has to come out along the edge of that sponge on to the table. Same thing happens with the aquifer except if you remove water from wells. Right now, we remove about 6.6 million gallons a day. . .of water a day from wells, about 3.3 of that is potable water for drinking and about 3.3 of that is a combination of potable and brackish water used for agriculture. So, we got all this water, how come we have a problem? The first issue is inadequate infrastructure. We just don't have enough infrastructure and in the right places to do the job. The second problem is we have poorly planned infrastructure. Fifty-three percent of the island's potable water comes from four wells located within the 2,000-foot area in Kualapuu. There are seven major systems on this island that supply less than 7,000 people with their drinking water. Pipelines inefficiently crisscross each other. There's a lot of systems maintained and very few customers to pay for it. The permitting process is costly and time consuming. We're five years into trying to get a permit to build a well. We spent a million dollars on. . .on permit fees and costs to get through that process and we still don't have a clean water permit issued. I still don't get it. We've got lots more water than we're using, how come we keep hearing there's not enough water for future generations? So far, we've talked mostly about supply maybe what we need to do is take a look at demand. Back in 1993, Bill _____ of DLNR put together a group called the Water Working Group, and I apologize that this slides probably not that easy to see, but on the . . .the right-hand side there's a . . .left-hand side there's a list of participants in that meeting. The Ranch was res. . .represented in that meeting by Warren Haight, he was on our board of directors, and then in 1996 they convened that group again to try to update it and in that. . .one we were represented by Duncan Annandale. These are the findings from the Water Working Group, and since that's not legible at all, I'm going to just go ahead and go to some slides that show it a little larger. The first finding that came up was that agriculture would continue to be the economic and cultural "heart" of Molokai. The second finding they had was the sustainable yield of the Kualapuu aquifer appears to have been fully allocated in 1996. The areas of greatest present and future conflict have to do with agricultural and recreational uses of water. So far, so good, we have no issues with either of those comments. The next finding they came up with talks about the sustainable

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

yield to the island which was estimated by the Department of Land and Natural Resources to be 83 million gallons a day. In 1993, they dropped that number to 39 million gallons a day. And basically, what they did was they took the 44 million gallons of water that was the sustainable yield for the valleys from Halawa to Waikolu Valley and they said that environment's too pristine, that environment's too important to us, we do not want see water developed in that area. We don't have a problem with that. In '96, they came back and they acknowledged that there was water being used, already it was in Waikolu Valley, there were some other adjustments they made, and so at the end of the day the number they came up with was 33½ million gallons of developable sweet water. And we didn't have a qualm with that number at all. Where we . . . we start to differ is we started looking at the water use numbers. In 1993, the projected use by the year 2010 for potable water was 11.55 million gallons a day and then the big number in this whole thing is non-potable water, basically water for ag that something called "build out" was estimated at 42.9 million . . . 42.9 million gallons. Build out was basically described as when all the agricultural uses that would want to built on the island at some . . . day way out there in the future had a chance to be developed. They basically added the 42.9 and the 11.55, so we're going to need 54 million gallons of water someday, and they went back up to this 33½ million gallon number and said we're going to have a 20 million gallon shortfall someday. We're not going to have enough water. The big number, obviously, is the 42.9 and that's the number I think that needs closer scrutiny. DHHL said to build out all their land they would need 23½ million gallons of ag water a day. Frankly, we aren't any better, we said we needed 11.1 to supply all of our ag water needs. The other users of the MIS needed 2½ million gallons, Kaluakoi wanted 2.8, and Alpha USA wanted 3 million gallons. So, that's how we got to the, the 42.9 million gallons a day. And I had kind of likened this exercise to a bank screwing up in a vault and asking people how much do you want without any real consideration whether they could ever repay it or . . . or do anything with it. It was a very open-ended exercises, how much water do we want. I believe what we need to do is look realistically as to what our water sources are and how much water we can expect to have in the non-potable area. DHHL has a legal right to two-thirds of all the water that the MIS can develop, that's statutorily there. They're guaranteed that water. Molokai Ranch's system has about a 500,000 gallon a day average yield and the practical reality is we're not going to get permits to expand that. We've come to accept the fact that, the community's concerns about environment make it basically impossible for us to go forward and harvest more water for our own use. I think realistically, we could quadruple that number. I think we could easily triple that number but--with the infrastructure--but infrastructure is no good if you don't get permits. So, we believe we're pretty much stuck at the half a million gallons. The non-preference users in the MIS, they get the one-third that is not spoken for by DHHL, the other third that remains. The other users are probably in the same boat we're at. The concern about the environment for surface water is such that, there's not going to be a significant amount of additional permitting given for surface water uses.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Kaluakoi has no surface water resources. They have no access to surface water. They're not going to get any. Alpha USA same thing; no resources, no water. So, this represents 100 percent of the available affordable supply of water. So, if we look to MIS being able to provide 7½ million gallons a day, this is what the numbers would be but let's take a look at the 7½ million gallon number. Right now, the MIS would like to think it's a 4½ million gallon a day system. It's currently struggling to provide 3 million gallons a day. Last summer, we had a series of community meetings looking at being able to expand the, the supply of water to the MIS, and the number that circulated in that group was about 6 million gallons a day. So, in, in that I think was optimistic in some people. I'm being the wide-eyed optimist here in saying 7½ million gallons a day but let's look at what happens when we use those numbers. DHHL gets 5 million gallons a day of water, we're stuck at our half a million; the non-preference users get the one-third out of the 7½, so they get 2½ million gallons; the other users pretty much end up with what they've got now, the half a million; Kaluakoi gets zero; Alpha gets zero. The total supply of ag water is going to be 8½ million gallons. The reason I say that is that this represents the limit of affordable water for Ag. If you went beyond this, you'd have to go into places like Kualapuu, Kamiloloa, Kawela; go into high-level wells, pump water out of the ground. And basically when you pull water out of the ground you're dealing with energy costs, and to pull water a thousand foot out of the ground, you're starting to talk about a dollar a thousand to get that out of the ground. Our well, which is up in Kamiloloa is something like 1,600-foot elevation, we're looking at close to a dollar and a half a thousand gallons to get that water out of the ground. So, that water is not going to be available to farmers. Basically, right now, farmers pay 21½ cents a thousand gallons for their water and there was hearings a while back that scheduled those rates to go up to 32 cents a thousand, which got approved. The farmers came out of their woodwork testifying, they couldn't afford those higher costs for water because of all the other costs they had to pay to stay in business on this island. And so, to go from 21½ cents to 32 cents and then say all of sudden we're going up, look at a dollar or dollar and a half a thousand, that water is not going to be practical. If somebody came along and doubled your water bill, I think most people on Molokai right now pay somewhere between a buck and a half and two dollars a thousand for their water. If those rates got doubled, people would complain but they could still buy enough water to brush their teeth, flush their toilets, do their domestic use. They may water the, the lawn a little bit less but life would go on. For a farmer it's not that straightforward. A farmer won't pay \$2 for water to be able to produce 75 cents worth of crop. So, what we're saying unless attitudes change in the island, which I don't think they will about where we're going to go for water--to go beyond this would require going into Pelekunu Valley, Wailau Valley, those types of things--that's something that the community is not going to do. So, this represents the limit of water that's going to be available for ag. And I probably talked pass my slides a little bit. We have a slide, a supply of 8½ million gallons. The demand will come up and stop at the availability, the limit of the affordable supply. Supply will equal demand. Let's go

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

back to the potable side. The Water Working Group said there was 33½ million gallons a day of potable water available and the demand number they used was 11.55. I mentioned earlier, right now the island is using about 3.3 million gallons of potable water for domestic use, with that we support a population of about 7,000. Basically, water use on the potable side is linear to population, I mean that's what creates the demand. So, to get from 7,000 people and 3.3 million gallons, we may have to be looking at a four-fold increase to get to a number like that in population. Everything I've ever heard on this island about growth is that they want it to be slow; they want it to stay rural. So, that represents a huge number in terms of population growth that I don't think there's political support for. If we stay at that number, we've got a surplus of 21½ million gallons. Another way to look at it is we're using 10 percent of the water that's available today on this island for potable use as opposed to say Oahu, which is using 90 percent. So, if we take those numbers we've got 33½ million gallons of supply; 11.55 of demand; we've got a surplus of almost 22 million gallons a day. So, putting it all together, we've got 33½ million gallons of potable supply, 11.55 million gallons of demand; on the ag side we got 8.5 million gallons of supply, 8.5 million gallons of demand. This slide is really getting faded out now. I apologize for that. So, you end up with a total supply of 42 million gallons a day, a total demand of a little over 20 million gallons a day; we have a surplus of almost 22 million gallons of water. So, Molokai is in a much better shape than a lot of places in terms of water availability to water demand. The reason we spent so much time belaboring that is that water is always the issue and we wanted to share that perspective. And now, we get to the community plan. The 2001 Needs Matrix started from a group of folks that, businessmen and members, representatives from the Chamber of Commerce, who started meeting back in February I believe it was before the March 8th hearing. After a few of those meetings, I got invited to the party and we started talking about what can we do to help our economy. There was concern that a lot of items in the community plan had a negative impact to, to economic development and weren't going to work. So, what we came up with was to go through each one of the items in the plan, point by point, and look at whether that was the best decision for helping our economy on this island. And if it was, we supported it; if it wasn't, we came up with an alternate recommendation and then justification as to why we did it. Essentially, we were looking for a pro-business, pro-economic development plan. We wanted to keep it simple and straightforward and we constantly iter. . .reiterate that's it not just a Kaluakoi plan, it's not just a Molokai plan, because it affects so much employment, it's a, it's a plan that impacts the whole island. This is the transmittal letter that you received back on the March 8th hearing that transmitted the Matrix and there's a bunch of signatures on there. And as we sat around and looked at all the employment that those signatures represented, we came up with something like 900 jobs came from the folks that were signatory to that petition that was given to you back on March 8th. We believe that investment decisions are being delayed by community plan uncertainty and just to show a little bit of impact on the Ranch's involvement on

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

the island. For the last three years, our annual salary to Molokai based employees only has been a little over \$3 million. The annual amount we've paid to Molokai businesses, Molokai based vendors have been almost \$1.7 million. So, between the two, we've got \$4.7 million of activity on the island but it doesn't stop there. As you know there's something called a ripple effect or a multiplier effect that multiplies those anywhere from two to three times. Essentially, if we put \$100 in one of our employees pay envelopes, they take some of that money they go to Friendly Market, they go to Pizza Café, they go to Rawlins Chevron, wherever. . .they spend their money. Those folks in turn pay their employees who spend their money, on and on it goes, and before it's left the economy on Molokai that 4.7 that we inject turns into somewhere between 9 and \$14 million. We think it's important to get new dollars on the island, important to keep our dollars coming but bring more dollars to the island and expand the economy on island. Of the 55 items in the Matrix, we think 13 are just fine the way they are; there was six that we think are real critical to the islands future in terms of investment; we think four that are very important; and there's seven that, that are on there that we think representing good planning. There's five that we met, as that group I described, we couldn't quite sift through the issues, so we left those for, for you to sort out. The first three, I think are, are really crucial. They're redesignating to open space two hotel parcels and one multi-family parcel that's been on the community plan since 1984. We think, you know, very clearly that's a taking. We think it creates a liability to Maui County taxpayers. We know this is one of the things that's holding up a would-be investor purchasing in Kaluakoi. We think there's ample mechanisms in place right now to leave those zoning in place and make sure the archaeology is protected. Chapter 6E is very clear on that this is zoned an SMA, an SMA area, so it would need multiple public hearings to go through. If somebody can't propose a way to use that property without protecting the development or the archaeology, the archeology will stay there, the development won't happen. We believe in that. This to me is just basically saying we don't care what the facts are as regards to the property, we're going to take away your value, and I think that scares away a would-be investor. The next one is the 600-foot open space buffer. We were delighted back in October that it was expanded island-wide. I think it caused a lot of other people to focus on the issue of the taking and what it did to property values. We think clearly that's a problem. We think if it came back to just the west end, that would be a whole new legal issue. Clearly, it's aimed at, at one or two landowners. Definitely, a takings and it impacts our ability to bring new investment capital to the Ranch. It's, it's cousin probably if not sister, is the lateral shoreline access. We agree that there is no legal access created with this put on the map but I've sat through countless meetings now on this and overheard conversations about I can't wait for this to get on the map 'cause then I can take my bolt cutters and travel the west end at will. We see it as a taking. We think there's a good case that ought to support that and we think without improvements we've got a landowner liability problem; we think we've got trespassing issues; we think there, there's, there's a lot of negative that comes

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

out of this; not to mention it's, it's scary for somebody trying to make an investment decisions to not know you got control over your own property. I missed one. I want to go back up two. . .on the 600-foot open space buffer. We have a issue here I think is real important, is because Kaluakoi is in an SMA area and there's a requirement for consistency between community plan and zoning--right now as we know the County does not have open space zoning--I think what that means is that, somebody wouldn't be able to go in and get an SA [sic] SMA permit approved for rebuilding or refurbishing that building at Kaluakoi because there's no way the Planning Commission could find a consistency between the open space buffer and open space zoning 'cause that zoning is not yet on the books. Sorry about getting all out of sequence. This is the proposed golf course below the Lodge. We think this has a real opportunity to create new employment. We acknowledged that it wasn't something that was around back in 1993. I think we thought for years that we didn't need a golf course. We thought all the other things we were doing in the way of recreational activities would carry the day but the reality is there's a lot of people who go on vacation that want to play golf. We initially started this project up on top of Maunaloa, on the mountain where we had a nine-hole golf course or the, the plantation and nine-hole golf course in the past. There's two issues that came out of this project, one was water and the other one was archaeologic. . .archaeological issues. We went through did all the archaeological work; we got a clean bill of health from the State Historic Preservation Office. We realized that, notwithstanding that clean bill of health, we still have problems there. So, we brought it down below the lodge where it had been in pineapple production for probably 50 years and archaeology wouldn't be an issue. On the waterside, our proposal with both sites has been to reuse the brackish water coming out of the Palaaau prawn and shrimp farm. They have a permit for 864,000 gallons and they have brackish water. We would reuse that water; pump it up the hill and then gravity it back down to the golf course. We think that reuse which currently goes to waste would create 25 to 40 jobs. We also knew it would support new employment at the, the, at the Lodge. We've talked with current Kaluakoi owners and would-be investors in Kaluakoi and they agree that two golf courses would help their business. We know it would help ours and we'd ask you to consider this one to help us boost our economy. The light industrial area. There, there was a move to down zone five acres of that to Park for a rodeo facility. I'm, I'm pleased tonight to say that, we seen a copy of the letter sent to our Chairman Pat Kawano from the Junior Roping Club saying that they're asking that that down zoning not happen. We're happy we've been able to work that out. We've been pleased to be able to provide that site for the last 18 years. We saw that down zoning as about an \$800,000 hit on our pocketbook, which hopefully with the roping club support to leave it in industrial, that's no longer an issue. This is the items we asked for in the north side of Maunaloa town. In October, you supported the, roughly eight-tenths of an acre of single-family behind Managers Row to let us kind of clean up our property line there, our zoning area that wasn't working right. We'd ask you to again

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

reconsider designating 50 acres on the north side of town to rural, so we could develop some half-acre lots there. We think it's important to have an additional product to offer for folks that want something different. We'd also like you to recognize the, the further part of that the Future Growth Reserve, which basically says nothing would happen in the next 10 to 20 years in that area. But we've recognized limits around the town, we've, we've done that for the south side of town. We think it's, it's appropriate to, to put growth limits, designate growth limits around the entire island, entire Maunaloa community. Hale o Lono Harbor. Right now, the plan is to put 40 acres down there for park and recreational uses. We think any redevelopment of the park will in. . .development of the harbor will involve park uses but we think that there's some other things that could and should happen down there. Commercial uses like maybe a fuel dock, an icehouse, maybe a snack bar, or a small restaurant, all those things would need a commercial designation. There's been some talk about maybe building a little ferry terminal down there and create an easier opportunity for people to get to and from Oahu either for, for jobs or for doctor visits or even to bring tourist over here with their, their wallets full of dollars. That would need a Public/Quasi-Public designation. So, we're asking for here is a Project District designation so that if somebody were to come forward with a plan, there would be some flexibility in the community plan document to allow people through that public hearing process to decide what uses they wanted to put in that area and what they wanted to approve. Maunaloa Cemetery. This kind of pales in comparison to the rest of 'em but right now the proposal is to expand the three acre cemetery to ten acres and put it in Public/Quasi-Public. We believe the existing three acre cemetery has somewhere between 20 and 50 years of growth in it. We think it's inconsistent to try to go beyond the 50-year growth horizon in the cemetery when we're having trouble getting growth in the town itself. We think that the ten acres would probably have like a 200-year capacity. So, we would ask you to go ahead and, and support the Public/Quasi-Public for the three acres but to hold off on the expansion. Kaunakakai heavy industrial. This is the one across from Rawlins Chevron, was a redesignation to Park. I see in the staff memo that you're supporting retaining the business designation. In the October meeting, Kalani English brought up the fact that the down zoning here would represent a taking, would create a liability for the County. We're glad to see that recognized by the Council. Our concern that, we think a lot of the other things that we've looked at are takings as well and, and we think that that attitude towards shying away from taking should be applied uniformly without regard to the size of, of a landowner. The Kahananui parcel out at the east end, I think to be consistent with our group, we saw that as going backwards taking a Single-Family and going back to Rural. So, we support the maintaining it as Single-Family to avoid any taking issues. And again, we think 33 are just fine; those first six we've talked about we think are real critical to bringing in new money. We think the four after that are important and there's seven more that we didn't discuss here tonight that we think were on the Matrix for good planning consideration. Again, the six critical items are the 600-foot open space buffer;

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

the lateral shoreline access; the golf course at the Lodge; and the three sites on the west end that were proposed for open space designation. The four important items were the, the Junior Roping Club site, like I said we were pleased that--

CHAIR TAVARES: Excuse me, Harold, could you go back to the last slide, please?

MR. EDWARDS: I should probably apologize now and tell you I've got--

CHAIR TAVARES: We know.

MR. EDWARDS: --a handout of this presentation, which I forgot to give to you before I started. So, I'll give it to you right after we're done and that slides in there and I do apologize for that. The four very important items, the Junior Roping Club site; Hale o Lono Harbor; the Maunaloa Future Growth Reserve item, which basically deals with, with three different uses including future growth; and the Maunaloa Cemetery. And the other thing that that's almost been lost in the shuffle because the Matrix items are so important is that, the text revisions within the document need to conform to whatever position ultimately gets taken on the community plan matrix. I think we don't know where this is going yet but I guess the, the one kind of closing comment I would make is that, as I sat through the EC presentation this morning, with the exception of the one item that got touched on rather obliquely which is buying up the ranch or buying up the whole west end. I mean, I don't see a conflict with virtually all the things that they're proposing to do. I think it's good to go after State, County, and Federal money in grants and multiply those, put those in your economy but I think it's important to have a private sector economy as well that creates a tax base, creates more employment. Like I said, we've got half as many jobs on this island as either Lanai or Maui, we need to do everything we can to stimulate the economy over here. So, our recommendation is preserve existing employment, encourage needed investment, support reasonable economic development, support reasonable opportunities for island residents, support the 2001 Needs Matrix. And I'd be happy to answer questions now or later as we go through things, whatever your pleasure would be.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, Members, do you have questions now or you want to wait 'til we go through item by item when we do the review later? Okay, we'll do it later. Thank you, Harold.

MR. EDWARDS: Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Yeah, if we could get the copies passed out to us we'd appreciate that. Okay, Members, we're going to take a 15-minute recess until 6 p.m. Recess . . . (gavel) . . .

RECESS: 5:47 p.m.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

RECONVENE: 6:04 p.m.

CHAIR TAVARES: . . .(gavel). . .It is really a pleasure to see so many people here this evening. If we could have your attention, please. And while we're up here and some of you in the audience are going to fight until the sun sets, I think we're going to be here after the sun sets anyway, so we're just going to struggle along for a little while. If it gets too bad for my eyes, I may put my dark glasses on but it merely means anything except that my eyes hurt. At this time, I want to kind of outline what, what the procedure is going to be this evening and we have quite a number of people who have signed up to testify. What happens on this is, and I'll call you up five at a time, and that's what those chairs are for, and if you will just take your seats up there I think we can move along more quickly than waiting for you to come from the back of the room to come up to testify. So, if you'll help us with that. The other thing that we'd like to ask you to help us with is if there's someone before you who has already said the same thing, you can say you agree with the previous testifier, briefly state it, and then go into what's different about your testimony. That will help us also. I just wanted to make a few comments about this meeting tonight and to have everybody kind of think especially about what the events were in recent weeks and days, and that people have given up their lives to protect what we in America hold very, very dear and that's freedom and democracy. And in that spirit of freedom and democracy, it means that each of us needs to practice democracy and ensure that our freedoms are preserved and that means for all of us, is whether you agree or disagree with someone who is testifying, they have the right and that's pertaining to. . .(end of tape, start 1B). . .rights. Everyone has a right to their own opinion whether you agree or not. This is not so in many countries. In some countries you disagree, you're history, under the ground six feet. So, let us put into practice what it is that we hold so dear in America and that's our freedom of expression and please offer everyone the courtesy and the protection of their rights to speak their mind. And I would certainly hope that we can all have a very civilized and freedom full meeting through this evening. We have a number of people to go through the testimonies. We'd like to do it in a, in an orderly way so that we hear everyone, that's what we're here for. If the meeting does get out of hand for some reason, I have no problem with recessing this meeting and scheduling it on Maui and we'll finish it on Maui. I have no problem with that. We are here because we want to hear what everyone has to say. So, please let's all cooperate and we can get through this and have some real good discussions and I thank you again for showing up and for participating. This is the biggest crowd I've ever seen I think and I think that's healthy for this community to get everyone's opinion shared and for us to make decisions based on good principles. And with that we'll begin--one other thing is we will be taking a break every hour for our staffs to have their breaks for five to ten minutes and at some point in time, we will decide when the Council and the staff will take a dinner break. And our dinner break will probably be short but we do need to get some

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

sustenance so we're not fainting away as we go through this meeting. I hope you'll all understand that and you'll probably need to take a little dinner break also. Okay, so with that we're going to start the testimony, you'll have three minutes--

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: Charmaine?

CHAIR TAVARES: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Oh, okay. Mr. Kawano?

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: Thank you. Actually, Charmaine, this is not the biggest crowd because you wait the next election you going to see a big crowd from Molokai. We always come out strong. But the reason I asked the chairman to say something is I think the EC company that presented the presentation to the Council this morning, I really want to thank you folks as far as giving us the presentation. I think it's well done. It's a lot of hard work and I really, I'm really proud of you guys, what you guys did. And also, the Molokai Ranch presentation that also will help us guys in the community plan and then to the people who are here tonight, thank you Molokai for coming out. And believe me, the chairman do crack a big whip when she start running her meeting, so listen to her. Thank you and God bless.

CHAIR TAVARES: Yeah and as a former resident of Molokai, even though I was only three or four years old when I was, when I lived here, you know, I do appreciate the fact that you have welcomed us here on Molokai. So, we're, we're all one big ohana. So, let's go on and with that spirit in mind and thank you in advance for your cooperation. Okay, if you'll work your way up to the room, we have Paul Mullin who will be the first to testify, and you'll have three minutes--by the way, everyone has three minutes. At the end of three minutes, you have to let me know if you're done or if you're coming back at the end of the testifiers, where you will get an additional three minutes. Okay, Keoni Lindo will be second, Gerry Anderson, Maria Holmes, and Donna Haytko-Paoa. If you five will come up and we will begin with you folks. . .and when you come up please state your name for the record. This is all recorded and minutes are taken verbatim and it will help us. Okay, first to testify, Paul Mullin.

. . .BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

MR. MULLIN: Members of the County Council, thank you for this opportunity to address this meeting. My name is Paul Mullin. My name is Paul Mullin and I represent the boards of directors of the West Molokai Association and the Papohaku Ranchlands Owners Associations. Collectively, that represents 818 property

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

parcels on the west end of Molokai. The West Molokai Association is the master association, which represents all of the developments in Kaluakoi including the hotel, condos, and single-family properties. Earlier this year, both boards unanimously endorsed the letter of which was sent by many of our members to you in opposition to parts of the Molokai community plan including the 600-foot setback and the various down zonings. I would like to read this letter into the record of this meeting. I wish to register my opposition to the recently proposed 600-foot setback as part of the Maui community plan purporting to prohibit all building construction without cumbersome variances for that distance from the ocean throughout all of West Molokai and, of course, that was ultimately extended to the entire island. We appreciate the support we have received from our Council Chair Pat Kawano who has supported us on this issue. We ask that the setback or buffer remain at the current SMA setback of 50 or 100 feet whichever it is now. The increase makes it too difficult for anyone trying to do any building or development out at the west end. The 600-foot proposal and other proposed down zonings just plays into the hands of that small but vocal minority who have continually attacked any attempted improvements on the west end including the Molokai Ranch and the successive owners of the Kaluakoi Hotel. The end result of all this imposition of planning obstacles by a few who oppose any economic progress for Molokai has now born fruit in the closure of the hotel and golf course with more jobs lost and more loss of what little tourism Molokai receives. I'd like to add parenthetically that, there's been a continuous drumbeat of additional closures that have occurred since then of, of family and local businesses on this island. Molokai has long been suffering economically due to poor tourism, lack of industry, and the consequent low numbers of jobs available. This lack of economic opportunities forces the best and brightest of the island's youth as well as some long time residents to have to leave the island for employment elsewhere. We already have more restrictive zoning than all the other islands and the 600-foot setback along with the down zoning only makes it worse. If the Kaluakoi Hotel and golf course remains permanently closed because of zoning obstacles, at least 112 jobs on Molokai will be lost permanently. We are not asking for Maui style zoning. We want only a reasonable amount for the west end which has been long been planned for hotel use and as the tourism anchor, if you will, on Molokai. This concludes the reading of the board's letter and I'd like to add for myself that, I was fortunate this morning to have the opportunity to, to attend the morning session and to listen and learn from the excellent presentation by the Molokali *[sic]*, Molokai Economic Community group. It is heartening to see all the fine--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. MULLIN: --I'm there already? I just have a few more comments here. It's heartening to see all the fine work which they are doing coming to the, coming to fruition on Molokai. It needs to be emphasized however that this group does not speak for all of Molokai citizens and like most human endeavors flaws exist in

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

that vision. These flaws endanger the economic health of this island. The 2001 Needs Matrix is a considered plan which seeks to make the CAC plan acceptable to a broader cross section of Molokai's residents and businesses and to encourage investment in our island economy. I'll--since I'm overtime here--I'll conclude my remarks now. Thank you very much for the opportunity to address you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Thank you. Any questions, Members?

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay. Keoni Lindo?

NOTE: Silence.

CHAIR TAVARES: You have to raise it up, I think.

MR. LINDO: Okay, Council Chair, Member Tavares, and the rest of the Council Members, my name is Keoni Lindo and I want to thank you for this opportunity to speak to you all this evening. I just want to make a note that, on the last March meeting, I was the guy who came up and gave those dominoes to you and those dominoes was there for a purpose. I kind of fumbled after that because I got nervous but the point I was trying to make is that, those dominoes there's an effect when they fall as you all know and we can see in recent months that those, some of those dominoes fell. You get the closing of Kaluakoi, you get the icehouse, you get all these local businesses that's just closing one after the other, and so you can see that effect going throughout, especially, with the current strategies *[sic]* tragedies that America faced, you know, with the, on September 11th. Its, its rippling effect is throughout the nation now and throughout the world in fact, so our economy is bad. With the current, the way the current Matrix is setup it's, we, how I see it, I see it personally as a way to distract investments to the island, income to the island, which creates an opportunity for me here. To come here and live here and to work here and to raise my family 'cause I was born and raised here on the homestead and I moved here a couple years ago and I want to stay here. As that famous quote by . . .I believe by Martin Luther King he said, he has a dream and I too have a dream. My, my dream is to live here and to retire here and in order for that to happen, you know, we need to put things into perspective and into place so that we can, not only me, but my children can continue to live here. And specifically on the, the Matrix, things that I'm talking about is I see some of those items as 1, 2, 3 on the Matrix as a taking issue. You down zoning private land, yeah. I wouldn't want my land to be changed and, you know, and downgraded, and the value for that land downgraded. I think that's unfair. So, I think we should, you know, allow it to keep this existing designation in zoning. Other issues as they had mentioned previous in the last meeting, they talk about water. I did my own

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

homework here. I studied and I looked at the, the government's numbers and as we saw in Harold's presentation earlier those numbers that he got from the USGS book that was sponsored by the DHHL also and the Federal government, it says that we have a lot of water. In fact, I went go inside there and double check the calculations. I took out my calc. . .my calculator and, and calculated those numbers and sure enough, you know, what he presented was the numbers that is, is stated there in the book.

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. LINDO: So, I just want to. . .close my testimony with another saying that you, you say here on Molokai; keep Molokai, Molokai. And as, as a famous Hawaiian cowboy once stated he said, in order to keep Molokai, Molokai you got to keep the people here and the spirit of the people and in order to do that you got to have jobs here. No jobs the people are going to leave. I know I will. I'll have too, you know. So, I want to thank you for your time and thank you for this opportunity. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Gerry. . .Gerry Anderson?

MR. ANDERSON: It always works this way, a tall guy followed by a short guy. Council Members, Chair. . .Chair Tavares, thank you for the opportunity to talk and welcome to Molokai. I attended the EC presentation today and I thought it was a very good presentation. I want it to go on record that, I support, you know, virtually everything that they presented but there was one little thing that was missing from their presentation and this is their goal to buy out the west end. Fundamentally, to force offshore people off. Now, I'm not sure what offshore people really means, is that me? I've lived here for 15 years and I live on the west end. They want to force me off. I don't know but I do support, you know, their general policies. The EC seems to work kind of hand in hand, you know, with the, with the CAC, you know, in terms of the taking of the land, the 600-foot setback, the down zoning. That seems to all be fit into the little puzzle of, you know, driving the whatever it means offshore people, you know, off island. Needless, to say I do not support that. I think back in the 70s when it was the, a good compromise was reached to allow development on the west end, you know, let, let some hotels be down there, bring, bring some money in, into the land that was a good compromise. Now, suddenly it's not a good compromise and people want to toss this out and, you know, you drive everyone else away. In terms of economic development, I would like you to see two things, one, encourage the EC projects. I'm, I'm a little skeptical how far they're going to get but I'd like to encourage them. And don't do any down zoning and taking on the west end, you know, let there be the tourist development that's so vitally needed, you know, for jobs. If you let the community plan go through the way it's currently written, you

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

know, with all the taking, I can guarantee what's going to happen and a lot of hard-working people in the audience they're going to leave. The brain drain will greatly accelerate, you know, on island. Finally, if you let that go through about the only thing that Molokai will be good for is a bombing range for the US military. So, I ask you to support the 2001 Needs Matrix and let's get the island on its feet again. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Maria Holmes?

MS. HOLMES: Aloha, Chair Tavares. My name is Maria Holmes. I'm the director of the Molokai Visitors Association. Thank you very much for coming, Council, I appreciate your time today. We are here--I represent my board of directors--we have eight board of directors and we're here to support the 2001 Needs Matrix for Molokai. We truly believe that this is the bless [*sic*] best place on earth to live and we don't want it to change very much either. We need to fix what's broken and we need to move on and work together as a whole. We need to attract new investment to this island to be able to fix what's broken because obviously we can't do it by ourselves. I just want to give you some statistics from a couple years ago. Last year, visitor spending to Molokai brought in over \$60 million adding the economic multiplier of 1.71, the total visitor economic impact to Molokai was \$102 million year ending 2000. Through July of this year, visitor spending has reached upwards of 40 million and if we add the economic multiplier to that, we've added about \$46 million to the economy so far through July of this year. We don't need a million visitors here. We don't need hundreds and hundreds of thousands of visitors but--and that's my goal or nor my boards goal to do that--but we do need about 100,000 people here a year to stay healthy and to have our accommodations healthy and fixed. In 1990, we had a 103 [*sic*] visitors come to Molokai and that information is available on DBET website. In 2000, we ended with 64,000 visitors. So, if 64,000 visitors can pump in \$102 million into the community, then imagine what 103 to 120 or even 150,000 visitors would do. I'd just like to close and thank you very much for your continued support with the visitor industry. You are the only Council that does that in the State and I appreciate that very much. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Okay, as, as Donna comes up, the next five are: David Nanod, Michael Zarle. . .Zarle. . .Zarle, Zarle; please correct my pronunciation, Yolanda Reyes, Donald Dudoit Jr., and Zachary Helm. I think someone is speaking for Zachary Helm.

MS. HAYTKO-PAOA: Thank you.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay. Go ahead, Donna.

MS. HAYTKO-PAOA: Okay, I have written testimony in front of you. Aloha, Chair Tavares, and Committee Members of the Maui County Council Planning Committee and the community. My name is Donna Haytko-Paoa and although I am currently Professor/Coordinator of the MCC Molokai Education Center, I am speaking tonight as a private citizen. Since 1984, when I was hired by Maui Community College as a part-time liaison, higher education on Molokai has been considered my kuleana. In the last 17 years since then, I have advocated for the construction of the permanent college facility which has over 227 students right now and have seen the expansion of upper level courses in bachelors and master's degree programs offered through the University of Hawaii right here on Molokai. In my role as coordinator, I have a unique understanding of the history of the University of Hawaii and Maui Community College planning process for the college on Molokai. In its planning history I would like to share with you tonight, in this planning history what I know about the planning process as regards to the college and as it relates to the 1994 Molokai community plan, the updated Molokai community plan 2000, and the 2001 Needs Matrix. As briefly as possible, in 1988-89 the University explored locating the college on Hawaiian Homes lands. The idea did not pan out. In 1992, the University released funds for a site evaluation study. Among the criteria was the directive from our chancellor to find a site with three to five acres to start with an equal amount of land for expansion. An independent contractor conducted the study and identified ten potential sites. In 1993, originally the most favored site was above the hospital but it was not chosen for several reasons, one of which was that the college could begin with the five acres but could only expand on two because there's a gulch. The cornfield site was chosen by the UH Board of Regents for a number of reasons, one of which was its ability to be expanded. In 1994, the CAC responded to the community and the UH Board of Regents choice by recommending that the cornfield site be designated as Public/Quasi-Public and that 15 acres be set aside for the campus. In 1995, the Planning Commission concurred with this recommendation. In 1999, the current college was built; 2000, the Council Planning Commission recommended that Public/Quasi-Public designation be given to the cornfield and that 15 acres be considered for the campus. And the 2001 Matrix, if approved would undo all previous planning, asking that the cornfield retain its Ag zoning and that the total Public/Quasi-Public designation would equal five acres; the existing two plus three for expansion. At--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. HAYTKO-PAOA: --okay, I'll finish up. Elementary schools are routinely built on six acres. A college campus even on a small island should not be limited to five with no ability to expand. Therefore, I believe good planning is planning for a 50 year or longer time frame and I support the 1994 community plan and the 2000

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Council recommendation regarding the college on Molokai. One last concluding comment. I don't think this is a taking. I think this is a giving of our best and brightest minds who right now are over at the college in class, more than a hundred of `em and that's why they're not here. Thank you very much.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Okay. David Nanod?

MR. D. NANOD: Aloha, Members of the Council. You know, I'm really thankful for each and everyone of you being here, you know, tonight and, you know, I, I'm the pastor for the Molokai Church of God and I'm also the County Plumbing Inspector and Building Plans Examiner. And I, you know, I, I represent neither one those when I come here because I come as a concerned citizen. I was born here. I was raised here on Molokai and my, my heart is here for this island and for the things that's happening. And I see how much Molokai is hurting right now and the needs have changed drastically from the time of the original writing of these proposals. And now, you know, there's so many, so much difference from then until now and so we need to address some of the, some of the issues and some of the things that are, are different during that time. And I see one of things in that, you know, I'm--oh, first of all, my hat goes off to those that, who participated so much in putting this together because it's a lot of work and it's a lot of years and a lot of people were involved in it and my hat goes off to them for doing such work. But there's certain things in there that I'm concerned about and one of `em is that 600-foot setback because I don't understand fully about all the, you know, ramifications of what that 600-feet when you talking about that island-wide situation and a lot of homeowners are also going to be impacted by that 600 feet. And so, there's, there's a lot of misunderstanding, a lot of things that's not being told us and we want to know, we want to have some more input as far as exactly what, what is this open space and how much, you know, or how much regulations more are we going to add to the system? You know being plumbing inspector and, and building plans examiner, we see a lot of people who come in, they save up their life income and they come in and they want to buy, they want to build their home and now, if there's 600-foot what can they do? What can they build? They're stuck with the property that they have, that they, they spent and so we cannot, we cannot issue them a building permit. And so, there's a lot of things and a lot of issues that we're concerned about and I, I, I feel concerned about Molokai, and I want to see growth, I want to see things change not uncontrolled growth. I've been on Maui when Kihei was, you know, dirt roads going to Makena and. . .(laughter). . .we helped put up a lot of the condos when I was working construction there and I don't want to see that happen here on Molokai. I want Molokai kept as Molokai but there needs to be jobs, that was said earlier and we need to keep Molokai as it is. So, you know, my, my recommendation is that, there's things in there that need to be fixed and I, you know, I just want to say that I hope we can do it.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, David. Michael Zarle?

MR. ZARLE: I guess, I'm one that gets to lift this up a little bit. I do have a couple letters here that I'd like to submit. And in my original form, I stated that I'll be reading this basically representing two churches. We also have Pastor Randy Manley here that's going to stand with me and instead of me reading the other pastor who could not be here, he's off island, he's going to read his letter as well that I submitted on my form. But, you know, and I want to say that, that I, I, I, I share the concern that a lot of people do share about turning Molokai into another Maui or Oahu but I know that that will never happen at least for many years unless our airport changes and turns into an international airport where the big jets fly in. So, the only way people are going to come in is by our smaller planes and also by boat and that's going to limit a lot of tourism on this island. And I'm also very concerned about the setback 'cause that would have a dramatic effect on our church facility as far as being able to expand our church or build on or change or to restructure in any way by changing that zoning but I'd like to read my letters. I am here today as one of the pastors of First Assembly of God, Maui County and a community citizen who has the best desire for our island of Molokai and its people. As the County Council, you have a very important decision to make concerning our island and their request of the approval of the Molokai 2001 Needs Matrix. I must admit that in the past Harold Edwards and I have disagreed on certain issues before you. But after three meetings and many hours of discussion concerning this 2001 Needs Matrix, I stand in agreement with a large number of people who feel that this Matrix needs to be passed today for the benefit of our island and for the people and the future of Molokai and keeping their families on Molokai. In the past, there were some issues presented to this Council that I feel have a very negative effect on our island, and the 2001 Needs Matrix proposal will make the corrections needed. To delay this vote or a vote no, I personally will be, be a vote that will impede the health and the future of this island. Therefore, I urge you to vote yes today for the Molokai Needs Matrix. Thank you very much for hearing me. And if Pastor Randy Manley could read and say his comment.

PASTOR RANDY: This letter is from Pastor David Tipton, Pastor of the Calvary Chapel. It says to the Council, as a pastor on this island, I am made aware of the devastating difficulties that people of Molokai are facing in living here and a major role in this is our present economy and the present restrictions that have not wisely been established. I would have to say that the majority of my conversations with people lately are on the fear of their job closing, having already closed, or no new opportunities to be found. I strongly encourage you to listen to the request made by the new needs matrix. Please help us help ourselves with a better and a brighter economy. If you have any further

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

questions please feel free to contact me. And I also support the 2001 Needs Matrix. Thank you for listening to us.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Next, we have Yolanda Reyes.

MS. Y. REYES: Good evening, Council Members, and staff. Thank you for being here this evening. Molokai has gone through some changes since the community plan has been put in place and we now need to take another look at the community plan to address a few recommendations. For the long-term economic benefit of the island, we need to keep Molokai attractive for investors and new, and new businesses. This cannot happen if we down zone designated areas to open space. It will surely turn investors away if they have to spend more money and time to get something built within this 600-foot buffer. This is a takings issue and any takings issue sends a negative message to investors. Molokai needs a golf course that will attract guests to the island. If you think we were economically depressed before the World Trade Center attack, the worst is yet to come if we don't do something for the, for Molokai economically. Yes, we want to keep Molokai, Molokai but what keeps Molokai, Molokai is its people. If there's nothing on Molokai to keep young families here together, to prosper and live a lifestyle they choose, and I emphasize the style that they choose, they will eventually have to move. I ask that the Council please consider the 2001 Needs recommendation. Thank you very much.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Donald Dudoit Jr.?

MR. D. DUDOIT JR.: Members of the Council, aloha. My name is Donald Dudoit Jr. I was born and raised on Molokai and a resident of 37 years. I stood before you in March 8th and I stand before you again this evening in the support of the 2001 Needs Matrix. Our, our economy is dying and a lot of it is already dead. Families are being forced to give up their homes, to move away to find help to support their needs and to a lot of our youth a future on Molokai doesn't look promising anymore. With everything going on in the world today, I hope that the decision you make tonight will enable our families and friends to return home to Molokai and be economically stable. So, I ask you, Members of the Council, to please support the 2001 Needs Matrix. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, thank you, Don. Okay, for Zachary Helm, someone is reading his testimony. At this time, I'd like to call up the next five, which would

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

be: Byron Espanioza *[sic]*, Patricia Pagay, Irene Kaahanui, Wayne Fowler, and Joseph Pentak.

MS. BROWN: Good evening, Council Members. Zachary Helm couldn't be here tonight for a very important reason and he asked me to read this his letter to you. Zachary is 50 years old and I've been on Molokai 45.

CHAIR TAVARES: Say your name.

MS. BROWN: Oh, my name is Gladys Brown. Sorry. And he and I share a lot of views about the future of Molokai and I agree with his letter today. Good evening, I am Zachary Helm, District Supervisor for the Department of Parks and Recreation here on Molokai. I was born and raised on Molokai. I am sorry that I can't be here in person tonight. I had to fly to Honolulu for personal business. I believe that it is very important to speak out and voice our concerns for the economic future of Molokai. I am a full time resident of the island. I received my education in recreation, leadership, and administration, from the state of Washington. I returned home to work for the County of Maui. My job is important to me and my family. My wife Henrietta is formerly from Hanapepe, Kauai. We have three children aging 21, 18, and 17. We live on our Hawaiian homestead in Kalamaula. Tonight, I would like to voice my thoughts about the economic development of Molokai. I want to ask you the County Council to do whatever you can to encourage the revitalization of Kaluakoi Hotel and golf club. We need to open this site. Over a hundred residents lost their jobs when the hotel closed. They are suffering financial loss. It is important that everything is done to encourage investors to reopen the hotel and make it the vacation resort it was. If restored these people can go off unemployment and return the hotel to its former existence, bringing tourist again to our island, building up the economy. They all want to work on Molokai. When you help in bringing back Kaluakoi Hotel and golf club, you will be assisting these residents to being financially stable and staying here on the island where they love to be. Secondly, we want to encourage Molokai Ranch to remain on Molokai. The company has done much in reaching out to the community. The company has touched the lives of hundreds of residents by giving them jobs and providing businesses that are building up the economy. The company is willing to work with everyone. If they decide to move out it will be devastating.

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. BROWN: The third thing he wanted to do is to look for, develop a balance in econo. . . economic development and he talks about families needing your help. And in conclusion, he says I thank you for the time you are spending on Molokai. I speak for all families here who are dependent on the economy. I wish I could have been here to speak one to one with all of you. I believe in the people of

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Molokai and want to be a part of their successes and welfare. Mahalo and God bless all of you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Gladys. Okay. Byron Espanioza [sic]?

MR. ESPANIOLA: My name is Byron Espaniola and I wanted to bring a little show and tell over here. And a lot of what I believe in is because of everybody over here. My belief system is because of the love of from Manae to Maunaloa. I was blessed with my Uncle Freddy he went put me on one Manae east end at 13. I played east end for long time. I'm from Maunaloa. So, I love all my brothers and sisters. The, the reason why I'm standing for this issues is because when I look into our children's eyes I see their needs. A lot of times we, we, we, we stand for our needs. Surfs up. What's happening? Everything we do affect our children. I love our activists. Our activists are wonderful. Matter of fact, our activist caused \$800 million on Kahoolawe that, which is pouring out a lot of the wonderful things--oh, wonderful things on Kahoolawe. I know--and, Council, I'd like to ask a favor to make a lot of these trainings on Molokai for our men to get onto Molo. . .Kahoolawe. The training is on, on, on Oahu and the, the schooling is on Maui. So, the boys have to fly here and there just, just to get on Kahoolawe. If, if the boys get on Kahoolawe, they can come back over here and spend the money at Auntie Shirley's Chevron and, and the rest, the rest of the businesses here. And a lot of times we talked about. . .no can divert water to west end. For thousands of years they was. . .diversing [sic] water going back over there Wailau, Halawa, Pelekunu, all these valleys was diverse [sic] water. For what? For taro for eat, for kau kau. We're asking simply to divert water. Come on along, help me on my taro. My water bill was big maybe Edward can help me with my water bill later on. I when talk to Shogo he ran Libby and ____ long time, make Libby ___ and Dole, Shogo Ogata. Maunaloa had 10,500 acres pineapple; Hoolehua had 3,000. I talked to Goro Uemura, he ran irrigation. CPC(?) had 6,000 pinea. . .acres of pineapple. So, we're talking close to 7,000 acres of pineapple and I asked him, oh, how much water you guys use? They said unlimited water and I said oh, jeez that's unlimited. That's 50 years they was using unlimited water for the pineapples. This golf course 500 acres along with the recycled water. I believe, I believe that we can support a golf course because if there's 40 jobs over there on the golf course--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. ESPANIOLA: --that would stimulate some income on Molokai. Life is a wonderful road. It is not a parking lot where we can just worry about not forgive our mistakes, our past, brothers. God bless you all. And we, as a team on Molokai, can work together. Amen.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Patricia Pagay?

MS. PAGAY: Good evening, Council Member. My name is Pat Pagay and I'm here tonight as a resident of Molokai and as an employee of Molokai Ranch. I would like to say that I support the Molokai Ranch 2001 Needs Matrix. I have been a resident of Molokai for over 55 years and an employee of Molokai Ranch for over 21 years. Through the years, I have seen Molokai go from 18 employees to 100 over 150 employees and that's 150 paychecks every two weeks to support 150 families on Molokai. We are proud to say that we are an employee of Molokai Ranch, it helps us to put food on our table, pay our mortgages, and our daily needs. As we watch the evening news we see more and more people being laid off from their jobs after the World Trade Center terrorists attack and wonder how this will affect our island of Molokai. I believe that if we stand together and support one another, we can determine the future for our children and grandchildren of our island of Molokai. Please support Molokai Ranch 2001 Needs Matrix. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Irene Kaahanui. . .Kaahanui for Kupuna Reyes?

MS. I. KAAHANUI: Yes. Okay, I'm here to read her letter. It says, due to a prior commitment, I will not be in attendance to give my testimony in person so I have asked Irene Kaahanui to read it for me. Aloha, Honorable Madam Chairman, and Council. My name is Kupuna Kauila Reyes and I would like to submit the following testimony to the Maui County Council on two issues tonight regarding the Molokai community plan land use redesignation. I am not representing the community as a whole; I am only speaking on my behalf. Number one, Maunaloa Lodge uses. I would like to support the redesignation of the land use so that a golf course can be constructed. Molokai currently has only one golf course, Ironwood, since the closing of Kaluakoi. Economically, this would give the island a needed boost as well as provide for job growth on an already depressed, already depressed area and island. According to the 2000 County Planning Committee recommendation no action on the golf course. Well, the County Planning needs to take action on the golf course matter. Secondly, regarding the 600-foot open space buffer. I do not support this proposal for a 600-foot open space buffer at all. I feel that, to have such a large area would infringe on people rights for potential investment and cultural practice. In closing, I would like to make a final comment. It seems that much of our island is definitely divided even in the community plan. It seems there are only two sides who feel the need to represent the community as a whole, maybe a kupuna should be called in to be a mediator so that there is no yelling between the two opposing groups. Thank you.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Wayne Fowler?

MR. FOWLER: Yes, I'd like to thank the Council and the Chairman. My name is Wayne Fowler and what can I say we've heard it all. After seeing Harold's presentation and hearing these good folks speak, I think we're all, from what it sounds like so far, we're all looking for the same things. I'd just like to go on record as saying that I support most of all of what the Ranch is looking for and, and these folks here. So, thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Joseph Pentak? And while he's coming up the next five: Kari Parks, James Berg, Adam Briggs, John Kikukawa, and Lisa Davis.

MR. PENTAK: I think I can speak over them. My voice seems to carry an awful lot. My name is Joe Pentak and I've heard almost everything--well, what I personally feel in my heart. I am a voting resident of Molokai and I think a lot of people here are also voters. So, we all have our various strengths and as I say, I'd like to just say that everything that has been said thus far I believe in my heart. I do not believe in the setback as proposed and I likened to bring this up a little bit further maybe and more pointedly, we're going to be taking a lunch or a dinner break here probably in a little while. Do you realize that we have more doctors on this island than we do have full service restaurants?

AUDIENCE: . . .(laughter) . . .

MR. PENTAK: Think about it. We'll be breaking shortly.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Kari Parks?

MS. PARKS: Good evening, my name is Kari Parks and I strongly support the 2001 Matrix. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. James Berg? Adam Briggs?

MR. BRIGGS: Hi. Good evening, Members of the Council, and all the residents of Molokai. I work for the Ranch currently as a mountain bike guide up there and I first came to Molokai four years ago actually, and two years ago worked for the

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Ranch. I want to say that, as a guide up there involved directly with the tourist industry, I've seen a huge decline in the amount of tourist coming up there and I think partially it could be affected by the closing down of Kaluakoi and just the overall outlook for our future here on Molokai. And I really want to say that, I fully support all the efforts that are being made currently to try and improve our economic situation here on the island to attract new dollars to come in. The one point that I want to make that hasn't been brought up tonight is the urgency for which this is all coming before us now. Not only with the national crisis and the uncertainty of our, of our tourist dollars coming in the future but also a large majority of residents of Molokai had been receiving also Federal assistance in living and, and that maybe taken away from them in the next coming years because of legislature that was passed during the Clinton Administration. But that is a scary thought when we think about our situation economically only getting worse at this point. I couldn't imagine. . .this, this situation getting worse than it is now. So, I would really like to say that we urgently need to support new, new, some new development. And I would encourage those that have put forth some of the agenda which is seemingly restrictive in the economic growth of Molokai to look for. . .(end of tape, start 2A). . . try and visualize what they would like to see Molokai like in the future as Byron said for, for our children not for us. Not for our needs right now but for, for the future generations to come through and to preserve it as it is now and as we love it. I just want to say really look at the urgency of the situation now and try and make the best decision to promote economic growth here on Molokai. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, thank you. John Kikukawa--oh, I'm sorry--Jim, you here?
Jim Berg?

MR. BERG: Good evening, Chairperson Tavares, Council Members. Thank you for coming to Molokai to meet with us. My name is James Berg. I have four members of the Molokai community to stand behind me tonight. Mr. Clayton English, manager of our landscaping department, currently our Manager of the Quarter at the Ranch; Apolonio Reyes, long time Filipino that worked in our pineapple fields, he works in landscaping; Honorato Reyes, his brother who is our Employee of the Quarter. . .Quarter. This landscaping group takes care of our lodge and our facilities. I'm sure you know how beautiful that is. Richard Ka. . .Kahana, standing with us today; Chad Marques(?), I don't know where he went but anyway I only thought I was going to have three of `em. These men are standing with me tonight because they are just like the majority of Molokai citizens, they have great difficulty speaking before a crowd. They've asked me to speak for them. You will see others tonight who feel the same as these gentlemen. They are a portion of Molokai's silent majority whose inability to speak out has allowed others with louder voices to say that they speak for all of Molokai. These men are as proud of their work for Molokai Ranch as I am.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

They work hard for their income and are saddened at how many of their friends have had to leave Molokai since the pineapple industry shutdown. How many more have left since the watermelon closed and now, how many are leaving because Kaluakoi is closed down and the unemployment has run out. Now, they are worrying for their jobs because the investor who would have purchased a big portion of Molokai Ranch has left and the deal is dead. It's over. It's gone. If this were not enough, faced with the recent events of September 11th and all the news stories of layoffs in the airline and tourist industries, they have to be wondering if when Molokai Ranch will have to begin layoffs as well. They own homes on Molokai. They have house payments to make. Sure, they raise a good deal of their own food like most people here but the bank will not take pigs and vegetables as payments on mortgages. What are they to do as the Molokai economy continues to decline? The airlines have cut off all direct flights to Maui from Molokai. They've also cut half the flights from Molokai to Honolulu. The car rental agencies are beginning to ship out cars and, of course, what this all means is that jobs, which bring dollars into Molokai will be lost. Now, the domino effect comes into play and more people in related businesses lose jobs. What happens to the folks at the Mule Ride, Hotel Molokai, the Pizza Café, Maunaloa Town cinnamons [*sic*] cinemas, Big Daddy's, The Kite Shop--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. BERG: --Rawlins station--I'll be done in a minute. As this flow of tourists dollars diminish, they will have to layoff people too. So, I ask you is this the time to institute a community plan that is detrimental to the islands economic future? A plan that takes land value away from island, the islands largest employers? A plan that discourages investment? A plan that was designated to stop any and all economic growth on the west end? This is a plan that is out of date and I would like to quote one of our Council people, this plan is the death now for Molokai's economy. Throw out the 600-foot buffer. Throw out the lateral shoreline access. Eliminate the down zoning of Kaluakoi properties to open space. Put the golf course into the plan as an incentive to economic investment. Follow the recommendations of the 2001 Needs Matrix and let Molokai grow into the 21st century. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(*applause*). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Jim, and for your fellow members there. John Kikukawa. Okay. Lisa Davis. While she's coming up, the next five will be: Art Parr, Carnation Nanod, Claud Sutcliffe, Alyne Kikukawa, and Thomas Mashima.

MS. DAVIS: Okay. Good evening, Madam Chairman, and, Members of the Council. My name is Lisa Davis and I've lived here for two years. I would like to share with you my decision for moving to Molokai. I first visited the island of Molokai in

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

December of 1998. When I boarded the plane to go back home tears came to my eyes, there was something about this island that got under my skin and into my heart. For some reason I felt like I was home here. I went back to the mainland and started saving my money as I made a pledge to myself to find a way to make Molokai my home. My dream came true in September of '99. I boarded a plan in Seattle and headed to Molokai, not having a job or knowing a soul. It did not matter, as I believe faith brought me here letting the spiritual world make choices for me. I landed a job after about six weeks on the island. I felt so totally blessed to have the opportunities opening up for me. Thank you Molokai Ranch for that opportunity to fill, fulfill my dream of being able to live on my favorite island. Now, I'm thinking all this could change in myself and everyone here, and everyone not here this evening could be affected. The island of Molokai may deteriorate right before our very eyes if bad choices are made. So, I'm begging you, Council, to please keep score this evening because I believe those supporting the Needs Matrix 2001 would win the majority vote. Are we not a democratic society following majority rule? So, please, Council, take heart with your decisions as they affect so many generations on this wonderful island of Molokai and thank you for giving me the opportunity to speak this evening.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, thank you. Okay, Art.

MR. PARR: Planning Committee Members, we listened to a very persuasive presentation this morning and--we listened to a very persuasive presentation this morning--

CHAIR TAVARES: We need your name.

MR. PARR: My name is Art Parr. And my name is Art Parr, my wife and I live on the west end. And we listened to a very persuasive presentation this morning and it was suggested by one of the presenters there that, they wanted to see a lifestyle that was more reminiscent of past times and, and they wanted to see the people go back to hunting, fishing, and farming. And if I had to depend on my ability to hunt, fish, or farm to subsist I wouldn't last very long. Now, that that was a joke . . .(laughter) . . . Anyway, please do not do anything tonight that will diminish the ability of the Molokai Ranch or the Kaluakoi Hotel to get back in business and develop their properties as they are currently zoned. Please do not do or recommend any down zoning or anything that will diminish their ability to be healthy, viable companies. This whole thing is about the economy and about jobs and I think a lot of people on the island want to do more than hunt, fish, and farm, and these two businesses would give them that opportunity. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Art. Carnation Nanod?

MS. C. NANOD: My name is Carnation Nanod and I'm here to represent the elderly, and the unemployed, and those people that are scared to talk. There are so many people here that are losing their homes and what happens is that they are going to live with their elderly parents who cannot stand the loud noise and everything else.

AUDIENCE: . . .(laughter) . . .

MS. C. NANOD: And so, these are good children who have lost their jobs and so I am with the exception of the Maui Community College, I, I am thoroughly in favor of the Matrix 2001. I would also like to say that, I agree with Molokai Ranch of having a ferry over at Hale o Lono because then airlines are so bad that we can go to Honolulu and come back on the ferry. But the park, kind of hold off the park. My family and I go camping down at Hale o Lono and I know what a mess the park on, on Maui's are and we don't it to be like this. And so, leave Hale o Lono alone or make it a park but years from now. And also, we don't know why Molokai Ranch is still, they're losing money all the time and so we hope that they will continue to do it and that you hasten all the whatever they need to get their projects going fast. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Claud Sutcliffe?

MR. SUTCLIFFE: Aloha. Welcome. Thank you for coming to listen to us. My name is Claud Sutcliffe. I come tonight to plead with you, please let us keep our community based Molokai community plan that, articulated by the CAC in 1994, the Enterprise Community in 1998. This is work by hundreds of people over a number of years. I listened to the Molokai Ranch presentation and Harold said, yeah, Molokai is in crisis and it's gotten worse. You know he's right and I couldn't help but think oh, poor Harold trying to sell Molokai Ranch in these times. Hard to sell, yeah? You guys couldn't even fly over here directly; you had to go to Honolulu so you probably read the Honolulu Advertiser editorial, yeah. It says, crisis but opportunity. . .and it warned us against "cargo cult mentality", you know, when someone comes from above with a solution to your problems. Sounds a little familiar and it said we have to take risks. So, I said shoots. Well, what kind of a partner would Molokai Ranch be for Molokai and I'm a newcomer I've only been here 15 years. But unless I count wrong there have been five different owners of Molokai Ranch in that period and there have been five different managers, each of whom was let go either in ownership transition or else because they got to friendly with the natives, yeah. So, I kind of wonder how stable that is. It feels pretty risky to me. So, I say well, let's look at the two

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

visions. The Ranch vision and the community vision. The one of `em, the Matrix 2001 pro-business, pro-development; the other, the CAC/EC sustainable growth. I say, oh, in these times which one makes more sense, huh? And I'd like you to look at the two plans and look at the two track records. Harold said that Molokai Ranch's plan currently is inactive. The community plan has just been endorsed by the Federal government, yeah, as one of the best community plans in the country. Why? Because a whole of people put a whole lot of work into it, that's why, yeah. And about the track record on money. Money counts, yeah. Harold said the Ranch only lost 7-plus million this year on top of 10 million the year before that, 10 million the year before that. So, the Ranch has lost 17 million over the last two years at a time when the Enterprise Community through leveraging this Federal designation has brought in I think it's 18.9 million to the community, yeah, and I forget how many jobs. And so, my, my simple-minded point is please, these are horrible times. Please don't make us change horses in the middle of the stream it's a flood.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Alyne Kikukawa?

MS. A. KIKUKAWA: Alyne Kikukawa. Thank you for coming tonight to hear us. My husband John had to leave earlier for a prior commitment, so I guess I have to share his views also. Basically, we were both in support of the Needs Matrix. Part of the reason is just recently he and I both had conversations about whether or not we could stay on this island because of the poor employment opportunities here. We have a daughter off in college and our other two will soon be leaving, and the reality is if something doesn't happen here on this island they are not coming back and as close as my husband and I are to our kids, we don't want to see that day come. If the easiest thing is to allow Kaluakoi to open then so be it. But to hamper them or any other investor that would come to this island who is willing to put their money into the economy to build this resort back up or to take Molokai Ranch from where they are and, and put them into the future, and to handcuff them at the same time by not allowing them to develop, I think is just wrong. And I can't blame them for walking away from deals if they're not being supported by the community. So, basically that's it. I, I support the Needs Matrix. I don't think it's out of, out of line. I don't think it's outrageously asking for a whole lot. I think if you take a good at it, it's a pretty reasonable request and that's where we stand. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Thomas Mashima? And Thomas will be the last one to testify, at this point we'll take a ten-minute break after he testifies.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MR. MASHIMA: Good evening, Madam Chair, and other Members of the Council. My name is Thomas Mashima. I was here in March in the last hearing and as we all know things have gotten much worse but we have an opportunity now to situate ourselves for potential enhancements for the island. Maybe it was all meant to be that our community plan is, has been delayed so long as things have changed. What we are now facing no one would have ever predicted seven years ago. We have all, we have a great need to ensure that this plan in no way deters any opportunity from occurring on or for this island. The down zoning of parcels at Kaluakoi area and 600-foot buffer needs to be looked at as an obstacle and hindrance to potential investors. We need to be able to entice, encourage, and support the resurrection of Kaluakoi; welcome back jobs and opportunities for the people of Molokai, especially those who have lost their jobs and careers. The golf course in Maunaloa although not on the original plan should be added on as the opportunity is here before us. When you look at Lanai and the success of their two properties, the golf courses are their major attraction. One golf course will attract visitors should Kaluakoi reopen theirs, this would be a plus and potential for overnight guests to our islands. Overnight guests, which we know spend more money and impact our economy much better than a day guest. I support the recommendation of the Matrix as it does encourage the return of what Molokai had to offer its people and the possibilities of choices for them in the future. I'm going to end with a kind of personal note. My mother would love for me to be back with her right now but she does not need me right now. Should she need me then I would go back and take care of her and know that I could find a job. I ask many of the respected elders here. You may not, you may not need all your children back here right now, in the future should you need them and want them back with you, will they be able to have the choices and opportunities to support themselves and you? Or will there be more hardship with economic or there will--sorry. . .or will there be more hardship without economic development? Right now, all the children of Molokai could not come home and thrive. This decision being made now is not only for now but for the future and the future of the children from Molokai. Thank you very much for this opportunity, for coming and visiting with us and for giving me the time to say my peace. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, thank you. After the break, the following people are scheduled: Bonnierae Valdez, Edward Mersberg, Christina Kelly, Julia Makaena, and Alice Codd. Recess . . .(gavel) . . .

RECESS: 7:14 p.m.

RECONVENE: 7:26 p.m.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

CHAIR TAVARES: . . .(gavel). . . We'd like the meeting to reconvene. Thank you very much for your cooperation. Just would like to let the people know that we're moving at a rate of 25 miles per hour.

AUDIENCE: . . .(laughter). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Twenty-five people per hour. So, if there's any way that you can shorten your presentation please do so. We have over a hundred people signed up. By my math, we will not be done with testimony until after midnight. So, if you'd like us to get to some decision-making try to get your, your speeches shortened up a little bit. We will be taking a dinner break at 8:30 and reconvene at 9:15, that's a 45-minute dinner break and then we'll be ready to go, hopefully. Okay, at this time, and thank you for being so prompt at, at being at the chairs. You know, I used to be a past, former teacher so I'm afraid I got some of that teacher stuff still going in me yet. At this time, we'd like to start again with Bonnierae Valdez.

MS. VALDEZ: Good evening, Council Members. Thank you for coming to Molokai. My name is Bonnierae Valdez. I'm originally from Oahu. I moved to Molokai in 1979 with my dad. His name is Donald Mahiai. We lived on the east side of Molokai across Kilohana School. When we moved here in '79 we became residents of Maunaloa. I moved back due to my father's illness to Oahu in '82. I graduated from Nanakuli High in '83. I made Molokai my home. I married a Molokai boy from Maunaloa and ever since then, I've been living here. I have three children; one girl and two boys. I'm very proud to be part of Molokai Ranch. I am Camp Assistant Manager for Kaupoa Beach. I've got family and friends that work for Kaluakoi and it saddened my heart to know that many of them have lost their jobs but I'm here because Molokai Ranch has given me the opportunity to spread my wings, to develop new skills so that I'm able to provide for my family. No one in this room have ever given me a check to pay for my shelter, my children's clothing, and all the necessities of life that I need to provide for them. So, I beg, Council Members, to please consider, really consider the 2001 Matrix Needs because if this do not pass many families, sad to say, will have to leave this beautiful island of Molokai. My mom had told me, if you can't live here because you don't have a job, you are welcome to move back home to Waianae. I don't want to move. I told my mom that's not my home anymore, this is my home. Molokai Ranch has done so many good things. They provided me a beautiful four-bedroom home. The plumbing are excellent and in good condition. We have streetlights. We have paved roads. When I moved here before the roads was all puka; when it rained my roof would leak, and even my car would be filled with water. I don't want to live that lifestyle anymore. I appreciate my heritage, fishing, taro, farming, but that's not my lifestyle now. We need to remember that our future is different from back then and I respect that but please help us as Molokai residents to continue pushing forward and to continue helping us support Molokai Ranch for I have seen many good things from them. I would like to

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

thank all of you for listening to me this evening, Council Members, and please consider the 2001 Matrix Needs. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Edward Mersberg?

MR. MERSBERG: Aloha, and welcome over here to Molokai. Without sounding redundant, I would just agree with everything that Bonnie had just stated. And just to leave everybody with the same thought that, that we as Hawaiian people we're always looking for that self-determination and for me that only comes through gainful employment. So, I, I feel the need for more development, more job opportunities. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Christina Kelly?

MS. KELLY: Aloha, and good evening, Council Members. My name is Christina Kelly and I'm an employee of, a happy employee of Molokai Ranch and have been for the past three years. With me, I have employees as well as families members. Henry Paleka and his daughter Artis(?), Dori, ____, Mele, and Katrine, and all of us but Artis(?) are happy, proud, employees of Molokai Ranch. But we're here tonight to let you know that we're in support of the 2001 Needs Matrix and we're here today and tonight as a family, not just friends but family. And first of all--well, only, the only issue we wanted to address was the 600-foot buffer. It seems to us that the 600-foot buffer was put on plan to hinder Molokai Ranch and Kaluakoi from further development. The guise of using it for cultural and historical preservation was used and presented to the community. Yes, Molokai Ranch has made some mistakes, a lot of mistakes. Huge, hubongo [*sic*], grand mistakes but they're still here losing millions of dollars and they employ the people who live here; the people who spend their money here; the people who raise their families here, and that's important to us. They also offer payment for non-profit organizations to do fundraising and cleaning up the highway that we've adopted. They allow the parks that they own in Kaunakakai to be used by our children for tee ball, senior league, major league, minor league. They, they offer funds for scholarships for our high school students when they go off to college. They allow our students in high school, elementary, as well as our summer programs to enjoy the lodging facilities that we have built in Maunaloa. And I don't want anyone to be confused--oh, also, also they allow the arena in town to be used by the Junior Roping Club. And I don't want anyone to be confused about who we are going to hurt when we attempt to hinder business for Molokai Ranch. You don't hurt the owners in Singapore or the upper management nor Harold who is getting gas tonight but the majority of the people who work there and that's us. That's people who are raised here; who are born here; who are

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

raising our families here; who even are taking care of our elders here. If the purpose is to hinder Molokai Ranch from developing then you hurt your own neighbors. How can you justify hurting a company that employs and takes care of the people of this island? If you want to be fair, put the buffer around the whole island, if not don't put it at all. Don't just single out the west end because that's where Molokai Ranch is. And you know what everyone is so worried about the water. The 600-foot buffer pass, no need worry about the water because not going have anybody to use the water 'cause everybody going move away.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

MS. KELLY: Think before you act because that's a whole lot of people out of jobs with nowhere else to go but off the island.

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. KELLY: Just in closing, I hope that we would want a plan that would revitalize our economy over here and just to reiterate that farming and fishing and hunting and all that good stuff, we learned from our elders and we enjoy it. I enjoy it as a recreational activity but I was raised with a choice to choose on how to sustain my family and I've not chosen that as sustenance for my family. I've chosen other things and if we don't have choices here on this island then a lot of us will go and not going be nothing over here but old folks and nobody, just old folks homes. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Julie Makaena?

MS. MAKAENA: Good evening, Council. I thank you for coming and listening to our concerns. Tonight, I'm in here in behalf of my housekeeping department, Lorna; two Lorna's, Ida, and Emma. We all here tonight stand as a resident of Molokai. We feel that we are, as part of Molokai, we should be able to share our thoughts on how we want Molokai to be now and the future. We are proud to say that we work for Molokai Ranch because they help us pay our bills. They put food on our table. We are here tonight not for Molokai Ranch but for ourselves and our family. Future plays a big role in all our lives. We have children of our own, they're Hawaiian, they're young they're innocent and they're loving. We all, we all that's here tonight have all different beliefs. I don't want people changing our beliefs. My family lifestyle is being able to work and to support all our families, not for others to come into our life and tell us what we can do and what we cannot do. By observing the last meeting on March 8th, I took it for granted that somehow they wanted us to join them. So, I'm supporting the 2001 Matrix. We need more educational jobs. I have a 16-year-old daughter who's just starting to work at Subway. She comes home tell me, mom I don't want to work, I say,

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

babe you have too. She go to work and she waits for Friday to pick up her paycheck, and if you don't agree with the 2001 Matrix, how that can happen to my other kids and all the other families that have kids. So, we should support the Matrix. So, Council, least but not least as for Molokai residents please seriously consider the concern of our Molokai community. So, remember, Council, whatever you decide tonight is our future for Molokai. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: Julie. Julie, I have a question. You, you shared that you work for Molokai Ranch and all, all the other people.

MS. MAKAENA: Yes, I do.

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: How many years?

MS. MAKAENA: Okay, I've been working for Molokai Ranch for six years and majority of my employees was working there for five and four years.

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Next to speak will be Alice Codd. The next five will, is: Willie Laemoa; Jimmy Duvauchelle the. . .Senior; Krisha Sahagun; Kudoba, Erwin Kudoba; and Glenn Teves.

MS. CODD: Aloha, Madam Chairman, Members of the Council. My name is Alice Codd. My husband Pat and I have been full time residents of Paniolo Hale for last five and half years and we support the recommendations of the 2001 Needs Matrix. I have a letter here that was sent to Madam Chairman an e-mail but another of our owners Eric White, and he asked me if I would read this into the record. I quote, as a part time resident for the past 21 years and a concerned citizen on the west end of Molokai, I am writing to express objections to recent proposals which would impose a 600-foot setback for Papohaku Ranchland lots as well as restrict other potential improvement/renovations in the Kaluakoi resort area. Please recall that in the 1970s there was considerable public discussion regarding the future development on Molokai, which was driven largely by concern for local residents and fear of developmental blight that had appeared on Maui. As a result, future resort scale development was restricted to the uninhabited areas of the west end, removed from the more popular and settled areas of Molokai. Furthermore, the development zoning approved for the west end provided many large parcels, limited hotel/condo lots and included open space, numerous beach access points, as well as a large public park. Although, not ideal from a developer's standpoint, the owners of the resort at that time

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

agreed to these concessions in the public interest, provided public amenities and proceeded with a relatively small scale development. As you are probably aware, the development has struggled for the past two decades with only a small percentage of Kaluakoi's potential sites utilized and the only hotel and golf course now closed. The setback rules would effectively be a taking of property from existing owners and block any means of the resorts single hotel to renovate and reopen. It is unimaginable to me how the Planning Commission could approve such measures considering the will of the majority of Molokai residents and the dismal economic conditions on the island, not to mention the rights of property owners. The now existing zoning was discussed at great length in the 1970s with voluminous input from local residents and final agreement by all parties by appropriate government channels including the predecessor of your committee. In good faith, many west enders subsequently bought property and invested capital on Molokai based on those regulations as law, and as it turned out virtually none of the doomsday predictions of original opponents of Kaluakoi have materialized. I urge you in the strongest possible turns to vote down this misguided proposal and further urge you not to postpone or delay its consideration which would have the effect of hindering legitimate efforts by west end property owners to the entitlements of their land. End quote. This is signed by Eric White, owner of G-1 Paniolo Hale. Mahalo.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Willie James Laemoa?

MR. LAEMOA: Council, my name is Willie James Laemoa. I want to thank our activists for keeping Molokai, Molokai and also our elders but also I want them to understand, to look at my side as well. I thank God for my wife giving me three sons. I'm the second generation. A friend of mine that told me sometime ago he said, of course, he was a lot younger at that time, his son came up to him and said, dad, I need a job. At that particular moment, a frog kind of got to his throat, went very speechless, didn't know what to say and yet, his life has changed in a dramatic impact and I like this person a lot because he tells me from his level as well as mine. Five years from today my son will be joining me in the workforce but I don't want him there. The education is too great and it cost money. Everyday my kids ask me, am I going to work, am I going to work? And I get tired of hearing that, I ignore them and yet, yes, and yet I love them but then I'm very hard. You know a person said anyone that writes straight up and down he's a person with no heart and sometimes I feel that way. I want to thank you all and I don't want to keep this here night too long. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Jimmy Duvauchelle Sr.?

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MR. DUVAUCHELLE SR.: Madam Chairman, Council Members, Aloha ahi ahi.

AUDIENCE: . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

MR. DUVAUCHELLE SR.: Aloha. Madam Chairman, I have a letter in my hand from a resident of Maunaloa could I read this letter? And one more question would that be included in my three minutes?

CHAIR TAVARES: It's whoever has signed up. So, if you, you have a letter--

MR. DUVAUCHELLE SR.: Yes, yes.

CHAIR TAVARES: --that you want to read, that's part of your testimony.

MR. DUVAUCHELLE SR.: Oh, okay.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay.

MR. DUVAUCHELLE SR.: Okay, thank you. And it reads, Dear. . . Dear Chair. . . Chair Tavares, and Committee Members, my name is Kehau Pule of Maunaloa, Molokai. I have been a resident from Maunaloa for ten years. I'm also born and raised on this island. This written testimony is in regards to the 2001 Needs Matrix plan. It is with much consideration and discussion with those who are in favor of the 2001 Needs Matrix and those who oppose it that I suppose *[sic]* that I support this proposed committee plan and recommend that your committee pass the 2001 Needs Matrix. Madam Chairman, can I give this to you and you can keep it on record, and there's more but I going take up my time. I need my time.

?: Right here.

MR. DUVAUCHELLE SR.: Oh, I'm sorry. Madam Chairman, this is a--Council Members, these, these are people that work with me and this is Darlene, she work with us for seven years now; and this is my cousin Charles Uahinui, cowboy all his life, 35 years with Molokai Ranch; my daughter over there six years Molokai Ranch; and now my grandson here about three months or so; Phil there is five, five years for Molokai Ranch; Chinky three years for Molokai Ranch. We had, most of these people you see here, this girl have a new home, brought a new home paying her mortgage. My daughter going through some struggle paying mortgage, working hard trying to keep this thing going. So, in all that just to make things going, we don't want to waste your time, we are in favor of the 2001 Matrix. And Molokai we love you, that's how it is. I understand where you're coming from and I hope you understand me. I want to live here Molokai the rest of my life. I want to make--this is my sixth generation on Molokai; keiki o ka aina, born Molokai. I want to make seven generation, eight generation, nine

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

generation here on Molokai. So, if I have to do what I have to do to keep our family line going. So, thank you very much and God bless you, love you all.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Krisha Sahagun?

MS. SAHAGUN: Aloha, my name is Krisha Sahagun. Come. This is, this is my family. I just want everybody to see. I am 23 years old. I work for Molokai Ranch for two and a half years. I've just recently been promoted to Front Desk Assistant Manager. My main concern here is this. This is my family. This is what I live for. I just want my children to be able to stay on this island, have the choice to stay on this island and not be forced to move anywhere. I work for Molokai Ranch, my husband works for West Molokai condominiums, so both of us directly or indirectly will be affected by this. I have four generations of my family in this room tonight and I'd like to keep it that way. I'm speaking also for my grandmother that's here but she's not well right now, so I'm speaking for her also. I just think it's important for us to look at our families and what everything, all this is going to do us. I do support the Matrix and I just wish that more people on this island would think more about the children than other things. I know everybody has their own opinion but this is mine right here. This is my life and this is how I want to keep it. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Erwin Kudoba?

MR. KUDOBA: Good evening, Madam Chair. . .Chairman, Members of the Council, ladies and gentlemen, my name is Erwin Kudoba. I'm speaking on behalf of my family, many of my friends on Molokai, and myself. I have been a Molokai resident since 1977 working for Shore of Molokai as the executive chef. At that time, we had 240 employees. I trained many local residents in the food service industry and they continued their employment 'til the closing of Kaluakoi. For the past four years, I have been working for Molokai Ranch as the executive chef and ironically, I am training the kids of my former workers in the food service industry. I support the Matrix 2001 Needs for Molokai and the residents. At, at this troubled economic times, I cannot see how a handful of individuals want to cast us into the Stone Age. I would like to quote my friend, one of my friends, this world is made to be enjoyed. Thank you very much and aloha.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Glenn Teves. The next five will be: Darryl Canady, George Pescaia, Paul Kaahanui, Tessa Reich, Audwin Calar. . .Calain [sic].

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

?: Calario.

CHAIR TAVARES: Calarin *[sic]*. It's not my pronunciation, it's the handwriting.

AUDIENCE: . . . *(laughter)* . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: So, excuse please.

MR. TEVES: Aloha, Council Members. My name is Glenn Teves. I'm a Hoolehua homestead farmer. I'm also a member of the Molokai Water Working group and I support the Molokai community plan in its present form. However, I have no views on the 600-foot buffer. This plan went through rigorous bottom-up community input with over 22 community meetings. This plan is also congruent with the Molokai Empowerment Zone plan that received community input from over 1,000 residents who almost through, almost 100 meetings. By comparison, the Molokai Ranch 2000 *[sic]* Needs Matrix had meetings by invitation only and is not a bottom-up community document. It's a corporate strategy and it does not guarantee jobs. This meeting tonight is to discuss a community process stamped by the community. This is the Molokai community plan not the Molokai Ranch plan. The next review of the Molokai Ranch, the Molokai community plan is 2004, which gives Molokai Ranch ample time to make their planning intentions known to the community and sufficient time for the community to digest, debate, and decide upon additions to the plan. This is very important because Molokai Ranch has yet to make their long-range plans known to this community. This is about process; you cannot just come in through the back door. It makes no sense to maintain resort zoning for Kaiaka and Kawakiu if we can't even fill up what we already have. Why should we give away this zoning just to be sold to the highest bidder, when the community can use it as a bargaining chip with the new owners? It would be more prudent to work on getting the Kaluakoi resort back on line and even allowing this resort to expand on its present lot. It would also be more prudent for Molokai Ranch to negotiate with the community in good faith to sell Pau Hana Inn to a community-based group. Once the County approves zoning for a resort, they are obligated to supply the water for these groups, for these resorts. Where you going to get the water from? Mr. Edwards talks about all this water we're drowning in, yet, Molokai Ranch representatives were at the Legislature last year to coerce our decision-makers into putting Hawaiian Homes water into the irrigation system to benefit Molokai Ranch lessees, Coffees of Hawaii and the corn companies. Homesteaders, including myself had to go down, on two occasions, to undo what the Ranch did. The Ranch just built two water tanks in Kalae to service their lands in the area and where is that water coming from? Hawaiian Homes. They had become very dependent on other people's water in an attempt to increase the value of their lands and sell it. At the same time, they have prevented Hawaiian Homes from getting water to their 125-lot development in Kalamaula for the last three years. In these examples, we really need corporations that work with the community

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

and willing to grow old with us and I don't see this happening right now. By allowing the Molokai Ranch to build that golf course with brackish water is setting a dangerous precedence. In essence, developers can take water from a failing aquaculture operation and re. . .call it reused water and bypass water commissions and community purview and input. I want, I want to summarize little bit more. The Molokai--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. TEVES: --Irrigation System is out of water. We've been in a drought situation for six years. The pumps in the mountain are sucking dry. In the meantime, the west end users, the utility companies consuming water like there's no tomorrow. They owe the farmers as of today \$200,000 and 27 million gallons of water. And Kaluakoi better start paying up. We want the money. We need to run our system. I also talk about right-of-ways if you can read my stuff. In summary, my recommendation is go with the draft plan because this is the community's plan. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Glenn. Okay, Darryl Canady?

MR. CANADY: Madam Chairman, Council Members, my name is Darryl Canady. I would like to read very quickly a statement that you have from the president of the board of directors of Ke Nani Kai, that's a 120 members that are paying taxes in, in this community in Maui County. I would like to reiterate my e-mails addressed to each of you earlier this week. My name is David Brooks and I am the president of Ke Nani Kai Owners Association. I also serve on the board of directors of West Molokai Association. Ke Nani Kai is composed of 120 condominiums, staffed and served by local Molokai people on the west end. The West Molokai Association represents more than. . .(end of tape, start 2B). . . home and landowners. I strongly urge you to defeat any motion, which is intended to change the zoning for property on the west end of Molokai. Additionally, I ask for a similar vote regarding the 600-foot setback issue. The west end of Molokai has been designated for development. It has, it has clear and well-defined rules to insure that some of the mistakes that may have been made elsewhere are not made here. Our island needs limited development to provide tax monies for the people as well as to provide jobs for the local population and their families. The closure of the hotel and golf course by Kaluakoi Molokai has had a devastating effect on the island as a whole and the families that have depended on that facility for employment. We urge you in the strongest terms to help these families feed [sic], pardon me, find jobs. A negative vote on the west end down zoning and the 600-foot setback will send a clear message to potential buyers that Molokai is friendly to business and will go a long way to restoring jobs, the resulting tax base. . .tax base needed to support

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

the families on Molokai. Thank you for this opportunity to present this testimony. We need your help and thoughtful guidance. As far as my comment in the time remaining, I think one thing we ought to consider because of the tough times that we're going through now. Maui County is supporting Molokai to the tune of \$13 million a year out of their budget just to keep us alive. Maybe we could consider in Maui County getting some support to new businesses coming in here, economic development support or foregoing of some taxes for a brief time to get business and jobs back, going here on Molokai. Thank you.

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Perfect timing. George, you're next.

MR. PESCAIA: Members of Council, aloha. My name is George Pescaia and I must speak humbly to you this evening. I don't have any figures or papers so that I can read off things but I gonna speak from the heart. I like to ask my family to stand with me. This is my joy. This is my life, my family. Okay, this is my island like everybody else here. You all my people, you all my cousins, you all my, my, my blood and I think it's healthy to see both sides what they have to offer. But my concern is for the future of my family, my future. I'm fortunate to have a full time job unlike many of the people here who on welfare or unemployment and it's, it's sad. But, you know, I think with, with the, the information that is going on tonight, we can make the right decisions for the future of, of my children and everyone else's children and, and their families here on Molokai. I just like to say that my wife is not here but she's been struggling to get a job for the past five months, my daughter and it's rough not only for me but for everyone. And I'd just like to say too, that I support the 2001 Needs Matrix and I ask you folks to consider and to make your vote positive for that. And if you do then that I feel that, this is the best way that we can utilize the full potential of these marked lands for zoning. Mahalo.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Paul Kaahanui?

MR. P. KAAHANUI: Good evening, Council Members. My name is Paul Kaahanui. I work for Molokai Ranch and Dream Builders self help program. You guys heard about the economy, you seen all the figures, I no need go into that. We need jobs on Molokai so we can provide for our families. I work all my life. I worked from when I was 15 and that's all I know how for do is work, provide for my family. I don't work for Molokai Ranch for Molokai Ranch, I work for Molokai Ranch for my kids, my wife, my home, my family. So, I support the 2001 Needs Matrix. Thank you.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Tessa Reich. . .or Reich?

MS. REICH: Hello, Council. Thank you for letting me speak tonight. I've lived on Molokai for 32 years.

CHAIR TAVARES: Tell us your name.

MS. REICH: Tessa Reich, is my name. I've lived on Molokai for 32 years. I have four children all born here on Molokai. I want to tell you a little story about my son. When he was a senior in high school he said I can't wait to get off this rock and he went and he, he, he went to the Charter Institute of the Pacific, graduated. American Airlines hired him, sent him to Texas for training, came back to Oahu, and was a ticket agent for American Airlines in Honolulu. He didn't, he couldn't hack it. When a lot of our kids get out there and they see what it's like out there. Molokai is a special place. Pat, you know that it's just the people here are one of a kind. Very family oriented. Everybody knows everybody, you know, everybody waves to everybody and for our children to not be able to live here and have jobs it's very hurtful for us. It stresses us out. It worries us when they're out there in the world especially with what's going on in the world today. A lot of kids, the people that I know the kids are calling home, I want to come home I don't feel safe over here. They cannot come home no more jobs. So, I support the 2001 Needs Matrix and I hope that you will help us with it. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Audwin, you're next and. . .the next five will be: Lawrence Aki, Nahula Kapuni, David Patterson, Roy Horner, and Stephanie Coble.

MR. CALAIRO: Good evening, Council, Council Chair Tavares. My name is Audwin Calairo. I live here all my life for 40 years and I in support of the Matrix 2001. It's not only for me, it's for my--I get, I get three kids, my girlfriend get three kids. My oldest is 14 years old and it's scary for me for think where my, my kids going now with everything in this world. We gotta think now what we going do with our island. Improve our island and keep the ohana over here. This is all my fellow workers and this is my girlfriend Sammi(?). This is Pat, one of my workers too and this is my, my main boss right over here, and Moke he work up the Ranch, too. I here for everybody over here and all my fellow workers. We need the jobs here on Molokai and. . .

NOTE: *(speaking to someone in the audience)*

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MR. CALAIRO: You get anything for say?

?: Go ahead.

MR. CALAIRO: Okay. Yeah.

?: We gotta support our family, babe.

MR. CALAIRO: Yeah, we gotta, gotta support our families over here. I stay nervous, man. I scared.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(laughter)*. . .

MR. CALAIRO: This the, this the first time I ever when talk on one mic.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

MR. CALAIRO: But yeah.

?: We all support. . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MR. CALAIRO: Yeah, we all in support of the 2001 Matrix. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Lawrence Aki?

MR. L. AKI: Aloha, Council Planning Committee Chair Charmaine Tavares, Committee Members, and a special aloha to our long time Council Mr. Pat Kawano. Everybody we need to give this man a big hand.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

MR. L. AKI: Ms. Chair, I'd like to point out first of all, I would like to come back at the end as well because as you, most of you know me, I have a lot to say and I know three minutes is not going to do it. So, I'd like to ask to come back at the end. I'd like to point out a few things. First and foremost, I appreciate all of the individuals coming up here and sharing their manao as to how they feel, as to where the direction of the future of Molokai should be. As we understand it and as we see it this evening, many people are very concerned about their family members and how they will prepare the future for that of their children and grandchildren. Sonny Laemoa when he spoke of the person of where the son had approached the father and asked the father, dad, I need a job after he graduated from high school, was myself. I have three children. They're all grown up. One that is 29 years old; one that is 27; and unfortunate for me my youngest

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

son who is 22 years old lives and works on Maui. In case you did not know, I come from Halawa Valley, born and raised in this valley over on the northeast side of this island of Molokai. My great grandfather was born there, my mother's father. My great grandmother was born in the valley of Pelekunu. My family go to the time of beginning of populating this island of Molokai. My ancestors are buried into this ground and I have such love for this island and for its people. I do what I do because of the people of Molokai but I have to make sure that it's clearly understood. I do what I do not for Molokai Ranch because with or without Molokai Ranch, the community plan that we are facing today is not a good community plan.

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. L. AKI: Yes, the 2001 Needs Matrix that has been prepared by many of the businesses needs consideration.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay.

MR. L. AKI: And I'll be coming back.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay. Return--

MR. L. AKI: I'd like to close if I could?

CHAIR TAVARES: --no, you're, you're done.

MR. L. AKI: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Close when you come back. Thank you.

MR. L. AKI: Okay.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, Nahula Kapuni?

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

MS. N. KAPUNI: Aloha, Council Members, and everyone here tonight. My name is Nahula Duvauchelle Kapuni and this is Sheri(?), one of my workers. I am employed by Molokai Ranch. I am a Hawaiian homesteader but moreover I'm a born and raised resident of Molokai. Tonight, I stand before you as a parent in support of the 2001 Needs Matrix. I say a parent because I am concerned about the livelihood of the future for my children and all of your children. Today, as we all know old time residents, young adults, families raising their children, are moving away. Why, we all ask, well, look around what do we have here? We have filled State and County jobs. No offense, my mom works for the State. We

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

also have live off the land situations but for me I cannot live my life in just picking limu or raising fish. I have cousins and friends that do this for a living and do well at it but this is not for me. Overall, what I'm trying to say is what may be good for some is not always good for others. So, to our Council Members, the ball lies in your hands. I'm asking you to do what is right for the future of our children. Let them all have a choice. Mahalo.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. David Patterson?

MR. PATTERSON: Good evening, I'm Dave Patterson for the record. I don't think that this whole meeting tonight is about Molokai Ranch versus the community or per se community. There's more than Molokai Ranch at stake here. There's also probably 75 or 80 other small businesses including myself. Two years ago, my payroll to my employees, which I had like 20 at that time was around \$750,000 all local stuff. Today was the end or two months ago was my year-end, my payroll was down to \$250,000, which means I laid a lot of people off that I didn't need to, all because of the economic situation. So, in a way to maybe speed this meeting up to 55 miles an hour, I'm definitely in support of the 2001 Needs Matrix. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Roy Horner?

MR. HORNER: Thank you very much, Madam Chairman. And I would like the County Council for coming to Molokai to make it more convenient for all of us. We appreciate you being tonight. I've been a business, business owner now for nearly 22 years. I'm in the insurance business; I do funeral planning. And about eight years ago, I formed a partnership with Buzzy Sproat and purchased--we started the Molokai Mule Ride. And looking at a perspective of a business owner, of a family man, of a grandfather of eight grandchildren, and what I'd like to say is I'm here to--I, I moved back to Molokai in 1983. I went off to Kamehameha in 1963, 20 years moved back, and I've been observing Molokai the last 17 years and it seems like we're moving backwards. When we were kids, you know, we used to have theatres in Kualapuu, in Maunaloa, Kaunakakai; two theatres, and pool halls all over the place and everything seems to be, you know, doing so well thriving, you know, with people working. Pineapple fields is not big money but people working and what I feel for us today on Molokai is we really need the jobs. One thing that occurred that is real devastating was the closing of Kaluakoi golf course and the hotel. That was an emergency situation that, you know, should have been, you know, heads should have gotten together and we should have done something to try to keep it going. And right now, that is one area that I feel, 'cause it's really hurt our business the golf course closing,

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

the hotel. You know, we need to make it more accessible to somebody who wanted to invest in that property and at this present moment with the 600 setback, 600-feet. . .the shoreline, you know what's happening, it would be difficult for anybody to come in to make an investment on that property. You know, this guy got married to this lady and every time she cook fish she cut the tail, and he said, why you cut the tail? She said my mom cut the tail and so, he said go ask your mom why, why she cut the tail. So, she went to ask her mom, I don't know grandma cut the tail. So, she went to see her grandmother and then she said, grandma why do you always cut the tail when you cook the fish? The grandma told her because I had a small frying pan. And, you know, what we need to do is we need all kind of take a look. You know as a business you gotta put your goals in concrete but your plans have to be in the sand. You cannot keep on the same plan if you headed for devastation and we are at that point right now on Molokai, where we're headed for devastation. September 11th 'til now, I've never seen worse in our business then in the last three weeks. It's very, very scary.

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. HORNER: So, I'd like to close and thank you again very much for coming. I know Wayne long time from Kihei days. Back in those days one policeman down Kihei, that was me. One guy; one shift. Thank you very much. Aloha.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Stephanie Coble? The next five: Tom Juliano, Mapuana Kansana, Yola Meyer Forbes, Raymond Hiro and Roxanne, and Sarah Sykes.

MS. COBLE: My name is Stephanie Coble and I want to thank the Council for allowing the concerned citizens to convey our wishes. I am somewhat paled by the people before me that, and cases brought tears to my eyes, with their wishes that they would like to see the Matrix 2001 Needs be supported. I am a resident of 25 years of Hawaii. I've owned property on Molokai for some 20 years and I most importantly have lived on Molokai for the past five years. I feel it's important to speak out at this time. . .I feel it's important to speak out at this time because I think all of the residents young and old on Molokai are feeling the hurt from the closures of many businesses that we've seen just recently closed down such as the hotel, Kaluakoi Hotel, the golf course, the Icehouse, Brew Pub, shrimp farms, the list probably is longer than I even know. I, the same as many others do not want to see another Waikiki but we do not, but we do need jobs for the parents of the young children, our elders and activities for all. Young children get into trouble when they don't have activities and when they don't have jobs. I think the only thing in conclusion that anybody can say is that, Molokai Ranch has supported many, many families on this island as has Kaluakoi Hotel resort

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

and golf course. And we need to support them with the 2000 *[sic]* Needs Matrix in order to support the people that have lived here for many years, generations before all of us and I want to show my support for the Matrix. Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Tom Juliano?

MR. JULIANO: Aloha, my name is Tom Juliano. I am the Vice-President and Partner in the Mace Pacific Holding Company. For the past six months, we have been negotiating with Kukui Molokai for the acquisition of the Kaluakoi resort. We are in the final stages of those negotiations and expect to have closed on those negotiations shortly. This is a very complex acquisition. The Kaluakoi resort has four problems that we are dealing with currently: number one, the events of September 11th have left many unanswered questions and many investors unclear of the future; number two, as you know for some time the hotel and golf course have been closed and it is now in a state of disrepair; number three, there are issues with the Department of Health on the transmission of potable water; and number four, the suggested revisions to the community plan call for 75 acres of hotel zoned property to be reclassified. Anyone of these four would give great pause to many buyers. Once we acquire the resort, we plan to begin work immediately to reopen the hotel and golf course. Our plans are to spend \$10 million on the renovation of the hotel and 3 to \$4 million on the golf course. Additionally, it is estimated to cost \$6 million to bring the water system into compliance. We will be giving preference to all contractors who employ Molokai residents on these projects.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

MR. JULIANO: Once the hotel reopens, we expect to have 100 jobs available and hope all former employees consider applying for these positions. Our commitment will require us to spend \$20 million before the hotel is open and the first guest arrives. Much of what you're being asked to consider today will affect the west end of Molokai and the Kaluakoi resorts future. Please, listen to the Molokai residents. Thank you very much.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Mapuana Kansana?

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

?: Stand up. Stand up for that man.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MS. KANSANA: There's a lot that was said from individual and it was all in my paper. See how small the paper but look how much was brought up. Good evening, Madam Chairman, Committee Board Members, my name is Mapuana Kansana. I'm from Molokai, born and raised here. Like I said, mentioned a lot has been mentioned and I'm for the 2000 *[sic]* Needs Matrix 'cause if I was a buyer that wanted to come in and help the people, I don't, I don't want to jump in with, I cannot do this, I cannot do that, especially, the, the buffering the 600 like that. I cannot. So, I can see why the investors going be scared to come in. And I was once, one of the Sheraton or Kaluakoi workers that got laid off or let's say an emergency shut down. Okay. Now, I'm working for Molokai Ranch and I only got, been there for six months. Okay. With this thing going on, I might not have a job. So, what was brought up is for everybody. As James, James Grant Benton, what happens if we don't have this? What happen if we don't have that? Now, I know you guys must have seen `em on the TV last night. What happen if we don't have this? What happen if we don't have that? What happen if we don't have the aloha spirit? Everything going be dead. So, please, Committee Chairman, Board Members, please look in to our hearts that I'm for it. I'm for the 2000 *[sic]* Needs Matrix. Mahalo.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Yola Meyer Forbes?

MS. MEYER FORBES: Thank you. Hello, Madam Chairman, and the, Members of the Committee of the Council. Thank you for coming and for giving us this chance to share our opinions with you. My name is Yola Meyer Forbes and I'm speaking as an individual tonight. I was born on Molokai and I went away for school then I came home and was fortunate enough to start up my own business. And so, I can appreciate the kids who have to leave and then come back but, but not have jobs and I have children I'd like to have come home also. There are a few points I'd like to meet *[sic]* make tonight and one is that, I strongly believe that a landowner should have the right to do whatever he or she wants to do with their land, provided--

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

MS. MEYER FORBES: --provided they consider the impact that their decision is going to have on community resources, on community interest because we live on an island and so we're limited. It's not as if we're on the mainland where we have all these miles to go and so, we have to be very knowledgeable about what our resources are and how we're going to use them. Now, I, I want--I'm for business on Molokai and I can appreciate everybody's wanting jobs. I want jobs, too, not for myself but for my children, for my neighbors, for my friends and their children and grandchildren. So, I strongly support getting jobs but I think you have to be

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

really careful when you start looking at where the jobs are going to come from. And, and I wanted to say I hope you will carefully weigh all of the--what you've heard so far from this morning until now--weigh all of those issues, you know, jobs versus resources versus lifestyle. I'm very unhappy about having off shore owners of businesses and, and I think. . .Gerry Anderson said he doesn't know what an off shore owner is. Well, an off shore owner is like Tokyo ___ from Japan, from Brierly, Hong Kong, from Alpha USA from Japan, you know, those are off shore owners. They don't live on Molokai, so they don't know what we're up against and I don't think they, many of them don't care because they have other worries. They have to satisfy their stockholders. So, they have other priorities.

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. MEYER FORBES: And so, I, I want, I don't support a blanket on 2000 *[sic]* Needs Matrix and I think that we've gone through a process of community planning. Look at that very carefully and look at the 2000 *[sic]* Needs Matrix to see what, what is best for our community. And, and I have confidence that you folks have done this so much that, you know, you know what happened to Maui. We don't want to be like Maui. We don't want that development. You folks have it. And we want to be just Molokai and be rural and so we can enjoy one another. Thank you very much.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Raymond Hiro. . .and Roxanne?

MR. HIRO: Good evening, Chairman, and the Council. Oh, I wasn't really going to say anything, when I came here I said oh, I just going stay, kick back, you know. But anyway, my name is Raymond Hiro and this is my wife Roxanne and yes, we do support the 2001 Matrix along with my family. I have a lot of family on the Ranch and in the community. Anyway, as I was signing up for the testimony paper I see on the bottom two squares where it says, myself or my organization. For me I wish they had put something like my family. I have a son in college that I hope he can come back to the island of Molokai. Both my wife and I miss him very much and when I ask, when I ask him, son, you want to come back to Molokai? He said you crazy, there's nothing in Molokai and I told him, you know what that's your decision. But if we can support this 2001 Matrix, we can invite our children back from wherever they get their education and we can have them here at home 'cause with how the world is going now, I like my kids close to me. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

MS. HIRO: I just like to say that I support this 2001 Matrix. We live up in Maunaloa and I work for Molokai Ranch but I'm here to support myself and my family. I'm an

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

accountant, and I've been there for four years and the bottom line is that, I need my job to support my family and there's no place else on this island that I going find that go pay me what Molokai Ranch is paying me now. And how I know 'cause I tried, I tried all over on this island. I ain't going work for minimum 'cause I worked, I tried to hard to get where I'm at and nobody else wants to pay me what I'm getting at Molokai Ranch and I need this job at Molokai Ranch. So, I support the 2001 Matrix. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Sarah Sykes? And while she's coming up the next five: Buddy Reed, Kathy Bennett, Kauai Kapuni, Joanna Ramos, and Ed Medeiros.

MS. SYKES: Thank you for coming back. Thank you for patiently listening to everyone tonight. I can make this really short. To please incorporate by reference all of my previous testimony from the original community meetings through the Planning Commission process about the Molokai community plan. Please ignore the silly scam that the Ranch calls the 2001 Matrix and I don't have to say much 'cause I'd like to second everything that Yola had to say. Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, and whatever you submitted before is part of the record, Sarah. Okay, Buddy Reed?

MR. REED: Hi, good evening and, and I thank the Council for coming to Molokai to listen to all of our. . .(interruption). . .good evening, my name is Buddy Reed. I'm the president of Kukui Molokai, Kukui Resorts, Molokai Public Utilities, and a sewage company called Mosco Incorporated. On, on behalf of, of--everyone should have the testimony in front of them so I'll just, I'll go through it--on behalf of our, our companies, we support very much a business friendly Needs Matrix and that's the 2001 Matrix. As, as some of the items specifically relate to our, our property, we formally request that the Planning Committee not change the current zoning and use designations on Matrix Nos. 1, 2, and 3 from the current H-M zoning to the Council Planning Committee's recommended designation as Open Space. As to, as to Matrix Items 8 and 9, as opposed to just drawing an arbitrary [*sic*] arbitrary circle around the island or allowing some sort of access, we believe and we believe this very much that the currently undeveloped shoreline of the west end from Moomomi to Palaau is an important open, open space resource. And the County should work very closely with DLNR to establish a restoration/management plan for the existing conservation districts and shoreline areas that are already in place. We believe that the zoning and use designations as proposed in the current Molokai community plan represents a taking and will ultimately require the County to adequately compensate us for our loss of economic value and benefit. As everyone here knows, we're actively pursuing and have been actively pursuing the sale of all our holdings on the west

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

end and, and the mere, just the mere mention of the County redesignating our parcels just sends shudders to an investor. I mean it, it sends the total wrong message to the investment community. As a compromise because we realized this zoning has been in place for many, many years out there and it's not been acted upon, but as a compromise to the Council Planning Committee's recommendation, we as the landowner request--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. REED: --request the Committee adopt the language I provided on the attached sheet under the column, Recommendation. This, this language will allow us to utilize the SMA permit process and it also sends the correct message to the investment community. If you would like when we come back at the end, I'll read that language into the record or, or it's on there, you folks can read it.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, we could probably call you back when we get those Matrix items.

MR. REED: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Buddy.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Kathy Bennett?

MS. K. BENNETT: Good evening, Council Members. My name is Kathy Bennett. I just like to testify in favor of the community plan and the community plan process. I think it's really important. I think if the community plan process doesn't work, there must be a process to change that and I just really don't want to see it separated. Other than that, I'd like to second every single thing that Yola Forbes said. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Kauai Kapuni?

MR. D. KAPUNI: Madam person Tavares, my name is Deldrine Kauai Nohea Kapuni. Madam Chairperson Tavares, Molokai, Councilman Kawano, Council Members, and people who love Molokai, aloha. I come from Ualapue Molokai. I was raised like my three children on our family's kuleana lands. I, I now have one moopuna who has a birthright to this tradition. I was literally raised off the land. The livestock and food we raised, we ate and when momma said go catch dinner she literally meant go catch the dinner. Crabbing, fishing, and picking limu was the way of life and cleaning the loi and making poi was the pits but swimming in

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

ocean afterwards made up for the hard work. We were taught to be eleu and there were no other choices. That was that, and that was a lifetime ago. Today, I enjoy the comforts of a new home. God has truly blessed us. If I choose to eat out, something we never did as kids due to financial constraints, well now I can. If I decided to take up golfing, I should be able too. If I wanted to spend a night at a resort on Molokai, I should be able too. The phrase, well go live someplace else then, does not compute 'cause this is my home. I should be able to enjoy balance Molokai, open to options and choices. We should still enjoy fishing, opihi picking, limu gathering, or working the loi, if that's our choice. I will never denounce my cultural heritage as a native Hawaiian but my lifestyle has changed dramatically because I choose to because I can. I no longer work in the loi. I buy my poi from Hanalei, Haleiwa, or Chong's poi shop. I no longer crab like I used to but I tell you I cannot pass the nice patch eleele when the limu is growing down the beach. No one in this room wants to overdevelop Molokai. No one wants to see her lands and ocean destroyed by poor and irresponsible planning. I support development that is culturally and environmentally sound and can be managed and controlled properly. I support Molokai Ranch's efforts in developing the west end with eco-tourism in mind. Down sounding *[sic]* down zoning properties causing devaluation is not the answer. I got to hurry up, three minutes. The 600-foot open space buffer should be deleted altogether, please. It would drastically impact the entire island from Kalamaula to Halawa. Enough. We who are, are employed on Molokai should be grateful. To private business owners, God bless you, because I think you working one of Hawaii's harshest environments. To people with family trusts you lucky. To people who live on Hawaiian homelands, how fortunate, and to people with kuleana lands, never, never sell.

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. D. KAPUNI: To those who write grants, spend our money wisely please and include all of Molokai. Molokai people have carried a heavy burden in our hearts for many, many years. This is not new to us and people who are talking about the crisis at the World Trade Center, eh, I, I totally sympathize with the, the, the nations and the world's economy but we have been facing crisis on Molokai for years. This is really not new to us. Please, the, the, the burden is heavy in our hearts, it is now on your shoulders. I trust and pray that you make the right decision for Molokai. Mahalo.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Joanna Ramos?

MS. J. RAMOS: Aloha ahi ahi, all the Members of the County Council, and Members of the Planning Department. Thank you for being here with us this evening. My name is Joanna Ramos and I reside on Maunaloa, the west side of Molokai. My

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

purpose for being here tonight is to support the Matrix. . .Matrix 2001 that was presented tonight in the beginning by our Harold Edwards, and it is for the betterment of Molokai that we support that Matrix 2001. I have my family living here. All of my children are residing here on Molokai and by having that Matrix 2001 brought in to Molokai, it will have jobs for our people here, and the ohana will stay on this island and make Molokai our home. And for my manao, I would like to add something and it is for all you young ones and maybe some of the older ones too, and that is to keep our island drug free. If you have drugs in the island it, it deters your employment wherever you work. So, if you want your families to stay together, keep drugs out of your homes that is all I asking. Mahalo.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Ed Medeiros?

MR. E. MEDEIROS: First of all, I don't know if you've every wondered when an empire cleans the, the plate his okole faces the pitcher's mound. There's two reasons. If the pitcher doesn't notice he's there and he throws the ball, he hits the empire on the end. The second reason, it's rude for the empire to put his okole towards the audience. So, if you'll excuse me a minute, I'm going to make a few adjustments. Okay.

CHAIR TAVARES: Excuse me, Ed--

MR. E. MEDEIROS: I'm not being anti. . .it's this--

CHAIR TAVARES: --you, you need to say your, your name for the record, please.

MR. E. MEDEIROS: Okay, my name, my name is Ed Medeiros.

CHAIR TAVARES: And you are speaking to the Council.

MR. E. MEDEIROS: I represent Global Medical Transcription, Pacific Island Teleservice. . .services, and Mobetta.net. We employ 11 people on the island of Molokai. Our company is struggling to survive since the terrorist attack on America and we simply can't endure many more hardships, much less any hardships that may be created by our own community, ourselves, or even our own local government. There have been individuals or groups that have been very successful in limiting the economic development on Molokai. They have been effective in limiting tourism. They have also been effective in limiting land usage and water usage. By not allowing third party leases on homestead lands, they have been successful in limiting our growth in agriculture. They have done an excellent job of utilizing the media and have taken the political process to newer levels. They are articulate, intelligent, and passionate in their beliefs.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

They have accomplished their goals. They can give themselves a pat on the back. They can also pat themselves for helping to close down Kaluakoi, Pau Hana Inn, cause the corn companies to relo. . .relocate many of their fields off island and now, they can take credit for possibly jeopardizing the potential sale of Kaluakoi. They can take credit for the 150-plus jobs that left when the hotel closed. They can take credit for 40, 50-plus foreclosures on homes of local residents. Some of these, these individuals have even been dedicated to the total destruction of Molokai Ranch and they can also take credit for the 120-plus jobs when Molokai Ranch leaves and the next foreclosures that occur. They have attained their goals of stopping tourism and development on Molokai. What they haven't done is replaced those jobs. Now, they can look around and share the burden and the blame for all this unemployment. They can help those families that have lost their homes. They could become mediators and counselors to the many marriages that are in deep stress because of the financial problems that that these situations have created. They can talk to those people . . .(end of tape, start 3A)--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. E. MEDEIROS: --continue life struggles. They can talk to even people that are turning to drugs as a mean of escape. They can help in the programs that have been started to build self-esteem in our teenagers because they have no home life, cannot see a future for themselves. They can counsel the youth that want, that want to return to a lifestyle of hunting and fishing, when all you know that our resources are in deep jeopardy, and no-hunting and Federal regulations are in order and are necessary to protect our dwindling resource. Their passions and actions have helped to breed depressed socio-economic conditions now present on Molokai. Everyone knows this is the truth but we dare not speak of it. Well, you did it, now you can take the credit for it. We should no longer let passion overrule intellect. The results of anti-terrorism and anti-development have had a most horrible economic effect on our island. The reason I am speaking tonight is because I want my fellow Molokians to know that these few people can no longer represent me and because of my--

MR. BOTEILHO: Four minutes.

MR. E. MEDEIROS: --silence these people actually became my voice on Molokai. They should no longer represent the wishes and aspirations of the people of Molokai.

CHAIR TAVARES: Ed. Ed, you're past four minutes already.

MR. E. MEDEIROS: Okay, I'm sorry.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

MR. E. MEDEIROS: Thank you anyway.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Folks, we're going to taking our dinner break now. We're going to be recessing until about 9:20. If you have a written testimony and it is more than one page long, during this time please figure out a way to shorten it so I don't have to rudely cut you off because I don't like to do that. So, you should shorten your testimony to one page and that will probably be about three minutes. Okay, this meeting is in recess . . .(gavel) . . .

RECESS: 8:38 p.m.

RECONVENE: 9:30 p.m.

CHAIR TAVARES: . . .(gavel) . . . Planning Committee please reconvene. Thank you very much. I'll call the names of five people: Lindsey, Clarence, Clifford, Vandale, and Julie Bicoy. Please come up, that way I'll know you're still here. I know some people have gone, gone home and if there are any of you who wish to submit written testimony, we still have first and second reading of the Council, your testimony will still be considered. Our, our intention tonight is to take all of the testimony of the people who have signed up to testify here tonight, at which point we will close testimony and we will be recessing the meeting 'til 9 a.m. on Monday morning but it will be in Maui. We will try very much, very hard to get Akaku to televise it live but the uncertainty of when we could reschedule here on Molokai, we wouldn't be able to recess to a meeting on Molokai. So, I think we are here to hear your input and please be assured that every person's feelings and opinions will be taken in consideration as we do our deliberation on the plan. So, with that we'll start. Are you . . .

MR. L. CRIVELLO: Lindsey.

CHAIR TAVARES: . . . Lindsey?

MR. L. CRIVELLO: Yeah. Aloha, my name is Lindsay Crivello. I'm a resident of Molokai all my life, and I'm in support of the original 1994 community plan and I just like to say Mahalo. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Lindsey. Clarence Adachi, are you here?
Clifford Dudoit?

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MR. C. DUDOIT: Clifford, right here. Yeah.

CHAIR TAVARES: Clifford. I'm sorry not Clarence, Clifford. Oh, go ahead.

MR. C. DUDOIT: Hi, I'm Clifford Dudoit and I just want to thank the, the County Council for all the support they've given us in the, in the past and to let them know that our decision that we made is, is pretty much a win-win situation with the Ranch and we, we can work things out. We should all consider doing that for the economy of the island too, I think. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Clifford, try wait, we have a question from the Chairman.

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: So, Mr. Dudoit, can you tell me what is your position in the Roping Club?

MR. C. DUDOIT: I'm one of the advisors to the Junior Roping Club and we're one of the guys that started it from scratch.

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: So, the last time when the Council was here, we changed you folks designation to Park. So, you're saying put it back to Park to Light Industrial, the way it was, and you guys worked it out with the Ranch as far the arena go?

MR. C. DUDOIT: Yes, we did. Yeah, and that's, that's why we requesting.

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: Thank you.

MR. C. DUDOIT: Yeah.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you for that clarification.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Vandale Dudoit?

MS. V. DUDOIT: Aloha, Madam Council, Council Chair, I mean, Council Members. I'd just like to say that, I'm not going to repeat any of the testimony you already had, already listened, I mean you already heard. So, just to say that I am in support of it and thank you for coming and allowing us to speak.

CHAIR TAVARES: Support of what?

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MR. V. DUDOIT: The Matrix, I'm sorry, the Matrix.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, which Matrix?

MR. V. DUDOIT: The, the one that's before you right now.

CHAIR TAVARES: There's, there's two of them.

MR. V. DUDOIT: Okay.

CHAIR TAVARES: So, the, the 2001 Needs Matrix--

MR. V. DUDOIT: The 2001 Needs Matrix. Yes.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay. Thank you for the clarification.

MR. V. DUDOIT: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Julie Bicoy? And next, after that is going to be: Dartagnon Bicoy, Karen Holt, Doris Miller, Laurie Bishaw, and Justin Oho.

MS. J. BICOY: Good evening, Charmaine Tavares, Members of the County Council. My name is Julie Bicoy. Standing behind me is all my family members. I have nine children, three of which are in college currently; three in high school and, excuse me, four in high school; and two in elementary. I've been a fulltime mother for 20 years; a resident of Molokai for 25 years. I am currently employed in the tourist industry with Molokai Ranch. I've worked with Molokai Ranch for the last three years and I've seen people come down and see the smiles that come on their face. I'm in support of the 2001 Needs. I'm also in, in support of the island people as a community to come together in harmony that we all as communities of Molokai can work together. We all have good points of views. We all have dreams and visions. I would like to see the island of Molokai work together and that's my dream to see that everyone here whether you're for the Matrix of '94 or 2001, I'd like to see everyone here work as a team. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Dartagnon?

MR. D. BICOY: I'm Dartagnon, I'm her husband. I support Molokai Ranch. I think they're ahead of their time in promoting eco-tourism. I think eco-tourism is the way to go. I don't think, I mean, that's, that's Molokai. I support Items 1, 2, 3,

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

and 4, and I think that they need immediate attention. If this gentleman over there wants to spend \$20 million, I say let's take his money.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

MR. D. BICOY: I mean, let's see what he wants, you know, what he needs and we can work together. We have things in place presently, SMA permits, we have policies and procedures that he has to already go through to get what he wants done. If we, if we put anything impeding him trying to invest this money before he even have a--before we as a community have a chance to see what he wants, I think we do all of us a great disservice. I agree with my cousin Ed Medeiros who came up before here. My cousin, my son Zavier he go to, he goes to MCC, I agree with Donna, Donna Paoa as keeping Molokai, the 15 acres for Molokai Community College. Both my sons are pounding nails with me part time. I'm a, I'm a fireman. Isaiah works at Rawlins fulltime, fulltime student at Molokai High School. We need jobs, you know, and we willing to do anything, pound nails, crawl in the dirt. I also support my cousin Byron for the golf course at west end. Oh, just in a new thing, yeah, I was talking with Mr. Davis our State Representative and I know this is a State issue. A deep draft harbor on Molokai where you can have one cruise line come in, 2000 people walk off the boat--I see this in Lahaina--they come off the boat; they walk into the town; they drop thousands of dollars and the best part is they leave.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

MR. D. BICOY: They go back to the boat, they get on the boat, they go to the next stop. They come drop the money. There's not a better business in the world. I mean, then and you can it will benefit our farmers because they can get their products straight off this island. It will benefit the construction. I order materials cheaper from Container Home Supply in Washington delivered to Molokai then I can get it delivered through Young Brothers--nothing wrong with Young Brothers, we need Young Brothers--from Honolulu to Molokai. A deep draft harbor would be an immediate solution to some of our deepest problems over here. And now also, with the, with the 9/11 incident here on New York City, I think more and more people are going to feel more comfortable traveling by boat. So, there's a, there's a, there's a big chunk of money that we can bring into our community that way. We need tax relief for businesses. I know Ed Medeiros, he's my cousin, he's in business. He's trying to start a new business and taxes just kills, just kills people. I mean as far as trying to getting businesses up and running and as a, as a County we should find ways--I don't know how about doing this technically--but we should find ways to help these people to walk them through the permit processes. Permits are--and I know you guys revamping that already--that was discussed in the last meeting, we really appreciate that. And I'd just like to say--

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. D. BICOY: --thank you for coming over here and my family appreciates all of your help. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Karen Holt?

MS. HOLT: Aloha ka kou, I want to first if I may briefly summarize some testimony from someone who's not here and she is next on the list, Doris Miller. She was a member of the Molokai CAC that created the original plan and also was a member of the Mau. . .or the Molokai Planning Commission that approved the plan several years later. Very briefly, I think you have her testimony somewhere in the pile in front of you and what, what she's concerned about is that the process that she participated in is being preempted, that's her word. She asks that you folks endorse the plan that she and others worked so hard to create and notes that the plan that they put together is not one that cannot be amended and the particular instance that she talks about is Kawakiu. You may remember there was a Supreme Court case many years ago that, actually stopped development at Kawakiu because it was found to be one of the richest archaeological areas in the entire state. And the plans to build a hotel and a condominium there actually fell in front of the Supreme Court and Doris says and I'll quote this she says, the earlier designation of hotel was too intensive in view of the archeological resources discovered after the Hawaii State Supreme Court mandated a study of the Kawakiu area. The amended process can be used should a reasoned request come forth. So, I think her point is that, this is not necessarily a, a carved in stone plan, it can of course be amended if it appears that minimal damage will be done by some later development proposal. I would like to speak on behalf of the original plan that was put together by community volunteers who spent literally hundreds of hours talking to their neighbors and their friends; going home and agonizing with their families about what compromises needed to be made so that the economy of this island would be strong. But so that we could keep a legacy that all of us can be proud of for the generations that come after us. I want to say something very briefly about the Enterprise Community because I'm, I'm, I'm so glad that you folks were patient enough to sit through that presentation this morning, and I think judging from the comments that I've heard tonight from others who sat through it that, that they were impressed with the reasonableness of most of it. The Molokai Ranch folks participated, Harold did through the entire process actually, his name is on the sheet that we gave you. He made it clear from the very beginning that the only issue he really wanted to talk about was water and that was the committee that he participated on because the Ranch needs water. When we finally asked for his vote of approval on the plan that we put together, which is very, very similar to that original CAC plan, the Ranch would not go along with it. And I was disappointed

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

by that because we had certainly invested a lot at that point in a dialogue I thought. But I will, I will tell you that the point which I think that many of the people in the EC or--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. HOLT: --the EZ process became concerned was the meeting at which Harold actually laid out all of the plans that the Ranch at that point had for the island. And they involved putting a new marina town at Hale o Lono; I think another one at the old Holomua junction; gentleman's estates and subdivisions all up and down the southern coast of the island. In addition, to it at that point, I think there was suppose to be a golf course at Puunana, which is not now planned. We asked him what the implications of all of that would be for this community in terms of people, numbers of people. Our last census just said we have 7,400 people living on this island and his best estimate and it was an estimate at that time was that, it would add 20 to 30,000 people to this island. If that were ever to happen then all of you who love this place would be living in a very different environment. And it was at that point that, I think we realized that it was going to be very hard to do business with this particular business.

MR. BOTEILHO: Four minutes.

MS. HOLT: I, I don't want to take too much more of your time 'cause I'm sure you're tired but I, I hope that that as a community, 'cause this is a small little vessel here we're all riding around on, that we can talk about this stuff openly. Because I don't think any of us wants anything differently than security for families and to keep Molokai, Molokai and it's going to be hard to do that, if, if our, our, our destiny is shaped by off island multi-national investors. Mahalo.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Oh, wait, Karen, we have a question.

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: Karen, being so active in the EC group and I, I think you guys did a fabulous job today again, but you know the golf course was set for the old golf course where--the plantation added that Puunana--but now that they're changing and they looking at putting it in front of the lodge. Can you just share your thoughts on that?

MS. HOLT: You know, I, I, I, I was a history major in college and so I like to read old newspapers. And if you go back and you read the newspapers about the Kaluakoi Hotel development, you'll see they promised 200 fulltime jobs when that hotel was built. You fly over that golf course now and, you know, you ask Uncle Kelii what it did to the, the fishing resources there, it's gonna be hard to get them back. I, I'm not the judge here. I, I think I wouldn't want to speak in anyway

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

that would imply that, that you should do what I say. What I will say is that, the Ranch made virtually all the proposals that they're making to you folks in this Matrix 2001 to the CAC seven years ago and it was hard for them. You talk to any of them. I don't think any of them testified yet. They scared testify because this is a hell of a organizing job but if you talk to them, I think they'll tell you that they did not want to see another golf course. And I remember when the, the Lodge was coming up and, you know, you guys were there, that was a heck of a hearing. There were signs all over the place. Molokai Ranch employees were saying, you know, we'll lose our jobs if you don't put that lodge together. And I can remember testimony at that time, from the very few who spoke out, asking if you build this new hotel what's it going to do to Kaluakoi? And I think we know what it did to Kaluakoi. So, I, I, I find it hard to answer your question because I think that I, I would very much want to look at why the CAC rejected the golf course proposals that Molokai Ranch made to them in 1994. They must have had some good reasons. I'm assuming a lot of those reasons had to do with water.

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Laurie Bishaw? Will the next five people come up please? Justin Oho, Daniel Bennett, John Pele and his wife, Will Carlson, and Wilma Grambusch.

MS. BISHAW: Aloha, Maui Council, friends, neighbors and family. My name is Laurie Bishaw and I work at Molokai Ranch for three years. I support the 2001 Matrix. The reason why is because with this plan, it will give my kids a reason to come home to Molokai to start their own family. It's hard now after the 9/11 day in New York. That day hit us all hard. Our prayers and hearts go out to the families, the people that have lost their loved ones but I can feel the hit here as it is hard over there. On the islands, there is no jobs put out there for any of us at this moment. Hours have been cut; people have been laid off. What will happen to us if things don't change? I'll tell you. No jobs mean no money. Means everyone here will have will be or will have unemployment in a lifetime if we stay like this. So, please do what is necessary for this plan to go through so we can all stay and live here on Molokai. I know for one thing, I'm speaking from my heart, for my family and yes I love my job and somehow my bosses love me. I'm a very outspoken person. Doesn't sound like it now, I sound like a nice angel but I am not. But please, they're not threatening me for stand over here, they asked me nicely. It's not easy for me to stand in front of people especially with a mic but I can do it. Off on the side, speaking to my friends or workers, I don't need a mic when I do that, but please think about it and do what is necessary for all of us.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MS. BOSWELL: Hi, my name is Gayla Boswell and--oh, I more nervous than anything else. Oh, okay, I support the 2001 Needs Matrix as well as Boswell Trucking supports it, too. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Justin? Are you Justin?

MR. OHO: Yeah.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, thank you.

MR. OHO: Good evening, Council Members. My name is Justin Oho and I work for Molokai Ranch. It's with a lot of people that I work with, you know, I don't have family that's born and raised here. I'm not born and raised here but I come from Oahu, I've been here for two years now and I've grown to love this island and the people. If we don't--this Matrix the 2001 Matrix doesn't go through, we're going to be in a lot of trouble. See, after the September 11th tragedies in New York a lot has already changed, thousands of people in Hawaii have lost their jobs are filing for unemployment. I don't want to see the same thing happen here. Please think about these things as you come to your decision, don't make it harder on all of us, you know, I don't want to see friends and family have to leave. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Daniel Bennett?

MR. D. BENNETT: Good evening. Thank you for letting me speak this evening. I was a member of the CAC and I guess I'm one of those evil people who perpetrated all this bad things on Molokai and I have to talk to Wayne after, after the meeting and try and figure out why he appointed me at this point. So, I just want to speak for the integrity of the process that we went through. We spent hours and hours listening to community members from State, people from the State; people from all of the large corporations; individuals, neighbors, friends. It took along time but I don't mind, you know, I, I, I figured the impor. . .the future of Molokai is important. Things change and things have changed drastically. Forces outside of Molokai have affected the economy and there's nothing we can do about that right now. We just have to learn to live with it for a while. I think that if we continue to follow the process, I think this plan is, is a living document that shouldn't be changed. It should be changed every ten years at least. I hope the next time that the community plan goes through it doesn't take ten years for it to reach this point because you need to change things faster, because times change faster. So, I hope that like, like Julie suggested that we do, do make changes in, in due process and careful consideration and we do it in harmony and everywhere, everyone will benefit if we do it that way I think. Thank you.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Mr. and Mrs. John Pele?

MR. PELE: Aloha, Council Members, my name is John Pele. This is my wife Kahalanani(?) Kama Pele. Still kept the last name, so you know who get the, who wear the pants, huh.

AUDIENCE: . . .(laughter) . . .

MR. PELE: I wanted to actually start off by sharing a moment that happened couple hours ago when the meeting started. I play music so I lent, I lent the boy a drum set last weekend, and he caught me over here today, he had to return my, my, my set. So, he actually asked me oh, well what's going on over here? I told him huh, this is the community plan hearing for the future of Molokai. He's a senior. So, I told him you should go check it out, pretty cool. He told me nah, when I graduate I'm out of here. And I told him how come? He told me 'cause no more nothing over here, but you guys heard all that already but I just wanted to share that story. Kind of break the ice, easier for me. Actually, the reason that I wanna, you know, there's always good testimony over here. One of the reasons I want to share with, with you my feelings is--got a little bit off tangent here--I haven't heard anybody talk about small business. I have the opportunity right now in Maunaloa. I was fortunate enough that my father started a small business and I have that opportunity right now before me to take over that small business, and the numbers right now to take over that small business don't look to good. And whether I like it or not development--oh, see I don't want to use that word development--I think Zachary, Zachary Helms testimony that Ms. Gladys Brown, well, I, I found a better word revitalization. Revitalization of the island is I think what I need to, to see in order to make this business prosper. So, my vision for the community plan, I know there's a lot of, lot of hard work put into it but. . .what I see and, and sometimes--oh, now I got an opportunity to surf a little bit today--so I was thinking if we could take all the personal issues out of it and do what is right with Molokai. It's obvious that Molokai Ranch has a, has had a bad past and I'm not going to deny it. I've worked for the Ranch by the way for eight years and one thing that I'd like to say is that, the aloha that I feel from everybody here I've never been looked down upon for that 'cause I know we all, all got to make a living. Jobs is not the issue. I think the issue is the history and looking at the history but I think if we can put all that aside and look at the community plan without personalizing it. Take the Ranch out. Take the Kaluakoi out. What's, okay, what are we going to do now for the community? What, what's our plan for the community? If these entities don't exist, what are we going to do? So, something like that I think, I think we should all look towards. I think the EC is

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

doing a great job. I have a nephew, my sister's boy, who is really involved in building fishponds and he loves it. I love it. I think it's wonderful. I have a daughter, Hawaiian heritage, she's nine years old who's starting to ask questions about fishponds, starting to ask questions about her heritage. I think it's about time that, they get the money that they need to do what they need to do but I also want to say--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. PELE: --it's Federal grant money, people got to understand that that's tax money now. You need private, you need private entity putting dollars into that tax money so they can get Federal grants. So, I just say live and let live. Aloha.

AUDIENCE: . . . *(applause)* . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Will Carlson?

MR. CARLSON: Hello, Council Members, residents, friends of Molokai. My name is Will Carlson. It's tough for me to speak here tonight, I feel like an outsider looking in, but what's going on affects my future and my job here on Molokai. I moved here from the mainland about two years ago. In that time, a seed was planted and I feel like I've grown roots here on this island. The roots being my friends, co-workers, and the people that have taken me in as ohana. I may not be Hawaiian but I love my Hawaiian girlfriend and my Hawaiian food. When I look to the future with my girlfriend, we don't like what we see. Jobs are super hard to find. If you're lucky to have a job it doesn't, it doesn't seem to pay enough and then when we look at the children, there's not much for them here but yet they are roots of our future generations. The plan you have proposed does not allow for the children to have a sense of responsibility and almost makes our future out to be hopeless. How can they graduate from high school and not have had a job or what if they want to come home from college for the summer, there's no jobs here. There's no jobs on Maui anymore. The papers prove that, they haven't had anything good to say for a while. We need to send a message to our future generations that we care about them and our island economics. Hawaii and myself. I make my living from tourists. If the tourists go, I go. I don't want to leave. Most, most of us are raised, I was raised, but I went hunting in the grocery store in the meat department. You know I pulled cans from shelves that's what I know how to do. If you ask me to go back to a subsistence living, living off of the land, hunting, fishing, that's an insult to me, my future, and the children, and the future generations here. The world changed forever a couple weeks ago. We gotta do what's right for us now at this moment. Planning for investors to come and promote economic development or as John said a renewal of island is promising, looks good for our island and it looks good for us the community. We all wants be. . . we all want what is best for the aina but we have to allow for growth, so that our children's children can call this island

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Molokai home. Jobs, we all need `em. There's a commercial that says, job good; life good. You Council Members are our voice, please speak using our words when we say we need to support the 2001 Needs Matrix for the future of Molokai and the roots that are in our keiki. Thanks for your time.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Wilma Grambusch? And the next five: Phillip Stephens, Felicidad Borden, Geri--I can't read your last name--Mahiai something, Desmond Manaba or Maneba, and DeGray Vanderbilt. Manaba? Okay. Thank you.

MS. GRAMBUSCH: Ready? Okay, my name is Wilma Grambusch and I live in Kawela. I'm a taxpayer and I'm a landowner, for the man that was talking. Being very torturing to come up in front of neighbors, and friends, and family because this is a very unbalanced room.

CHAIR TAVARES: Wilma, you're speaking to us, please.

MS. GRAMBUSCH: Yes, I do want to speak to them, too. This is a very unbalanced proposal. We have two corporations here on the west end. They need to be good neighbors. We are caught tonight in a financial disaster that they created. We did not and they are, they are torturing themselves by trying to get good air and good water. There is no balance in their Matrix plan. I'll tell you how I feel about their Matrix plan. Number one, it isn't our plan. This is our community. It's coming from Thailand, wherever, New Zealand, Saipan, wherever, wherever their investors are. I think that's unfair. The Molokai plan is from the people and this is what has made our great country, communities. This is our community. We we're going to live here; we're going to die here; we're going to bury ourselves here. There are many people here who have vested interest, who have come in on the airplane and are leaving. They're, they're going out. But they are going to determine our destination by the mere stroke of a pen that is unfair. It's like the big rule of swallowing up small fishes. And I support the Molokai general plan because I was on the first, very first Molokai general plan in 1974. And I'm sitting back there and I'm listening and I'm saying to myself, this plan is it really coming down to another golf course in front of a hotel? I don't think so. I don't think we can take resources and get what we want, corporations get what they want and say goodbye later on, while their hustling to find another buyer. Let's not be blackmailed. This is not our responsibility for the hole that everyone is in. I'm in the hole, too, but the problem is if we do not have corporations that are honest on the table telling it like it is then by gosh, I hope you have the money. If you don't you're not going to get the water either. So, what it comes down to is water. So, I hope that this Council--in fact I heard a rumor that--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MS. GRAMBUSCH: --one of the Council Members wanted the whole island 600-foot setback. Excuse me, we have. . .*(inaudible)*. . .on all ends. Hawaiians that live in the east end, no I'm talking about the west end, I think that's unfair. So, you know, if, if you do that, go back and do that to your own island please. You need, you need to take us into consideration. Don't go back to Maui, close the doors and make a decision that's not right. Face the people. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Felicidad Borden?

MS. BORDEN: Madam Chairman, Council, and, Mr. Kawano. I am here in behalf of myself, speaking for myself, representing myself. . .for the people of Molokai. I, I am two months shy of 24 years of working at the Kaluakoi Hotel.

CHAIR TAVARES: Say your name.

MS. BORDEN: Oh, my name is Felicidad Borden. Sorry. Shucks, I forgot what I was going say already. . .*(laughter)*. . .

AUDIENCE: . . .*(laughter)*. . .

MS. BORDEN: I was going to read my speech but. . .oh, my I got lost already. But anyway, I'm only here speaking for in behalf of the people of Molokai. I, the way the economy is on Molokai, I'm, I'm more concerned about, you know, I pray and I plead that you Council people will take it in heart and do what is right for the, for the people of Molokai, the majority. People going get hurt but we have to think of the majority of the people here and we're concerned with--and I'm, I'm very grateful that we did, we did, you know, we did have so much turmoil but I pray that you folks will make the right decision. That's all I have to say.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Felicidad.

MS. BORDEN: Yes, yes.

CHAIR TAVARES: Could you, could you introduce the people that are standing there with you.

MS. BORDEN: We're all former employees. This is Geri Santiago, she's supposed to talk after me, then we have Jean Han, Moses Reyes, and Paul Mamuad behind there. He didn't want to come join us 'cause he shame.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

AUDIENCE: . . . *(laughter)* . . .

MS. BORDEN: But he like us. Back us up, yeah? Okay. That's it.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

MS. BORDEN: But I'm from Kaluakoi.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Geri, you want to go ahead now and, I had skipped over Phillip Stephens.

MS. MAHIAI SANTIAGO: I'm Geri.

MR. STEPHENS: Right here.

MS. MAHIAI SANTIAGO: Okay.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, Phillip, you're, go after Geri, please.

MS. MAHIAI SANTIAGO: Okay, I'm Geri Mahiai Santiago. I live on the island all my life. . . all my life and I work at Kaluakoi for 23 years. Okay. I'm sorry that we had, you know, that things turned out bad but when Mr. Juliano spoke up and said that he had money to invest in our, in Kaluakoi, I, I feel that you the Committee has all the power and I feel that I need a job. Unemployed. My friends already have part time jobs but then we need a job and since this gentleman is here to invest in our, in our, on our island and Kaluakoi Hotel, I ask that you look into your hearts and move on for us. Imua. Mahalo.

AUDIENCE: . . . *(applause)* . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Phillip Stephens. . . and thank you for waiting, I'm sorry I missed you.

MR. STEPHENS: No problem. Evening, Committee Chair. My name is Phillip Stephens, I work at Molokai Ranch. I've been on Molokai now six, a little over six years. I moved from Maui. I'm another one that didn't write something out, only because what I have to say is, is again is from my heart. Majority of the people here I think we have a lot to say from our heart. I left Oahu in '77 to move to Maui 'cause at that age, you know, I was saying there's too much people, place is blowing up so I moved to Maui. I watched Kahana. I know some of my friends here, we watched that island explode. The reason I moved from Maui is the last five years I was there, I lived in Kihei, and that place just laid a bomb into it. I listened to a lot of people mention they don't want Molokai come like Maui and Oahu. You don't have to take my word for it but I, I feel in the bottom of my heart that will never happen. Maui and Honolulu doesn't have people from

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

Molokai, that's the difference. This island will never become like those islands. Lot of talk tonight about money. It's a bummer world when you gotta, when we all have to deal with money. I plan to have my own Hawaiian homestead when DHHL ever finds my name on that list again.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(laughter)*. . .

MR. STEPHENS: I've been trying. I plan to live off of the land. I have the crops already planned out. I've talked to many people. Some people inside here I'm helping them on their properties already. I'm proving myself that I'm going to live off of this land but not everyone of us can do that and there are other things such as electricity bills, gasoline for our cars, bullets for the guns that's gonna help this thing, you know, to subsidize off the lands. There's money has to be made, it's, it's the time, the time and place of this world. If we--I, I would, I'd like to say that I'd like to backup the 2001 Matrix, not just because I work for Molokai Ranch. God is my source. He's, he's using the Ranch to help me supply my family right now. There's other supplies. There's the aina; there's the ocean. I would ask all of you to look into your hearts, too. You guys all have families. Couple of you. . .majority of you don't live on Molokai are not to ma'a to what's happening on the land here, you guys live in Maui and stuff like that. It's different. I know I lived there for 20 years. It's kind of hard to understand what Molokai is all about until you've lived here for sometime. I've only been here for six years and I'm still learning but this is a different land for everybody. I want to thank you for your time. Mahalo. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Desmond Manaba? DeGray Vanderbilt? The next bunch of five will be: Kenneth Ching, Joseph Cariaga, Gandha. . .Gandharva Ross or Ross Gandharva, William Vogt, and Halona Kaopuiki.

MR. VANDERBILT: Aloha, Chair. . .Chairperson Tavares, and, Members of the Committee. My name is DeGray Vanderbilt, a 23 resi. . .year resident of Molokai and I was a member of the CAC along with several other people who I just like to let this audience know who they were. There was Dan Bennett, who's a teacher at the high school; Judy Egusa, who runs Friendly Market; Pearly Hodgins, who was working for Molokai Ranch and who was a realtor; Tim Leong a contractor; John Urauchi retired Maui Electric; Kip Dunbar, Manager of Bank of Hawaii; Patrick Kansana, Kaluakoi employee; Ron Kimball, Head of Kamehameha Schools here; Danny Mateo, aid to Councilman Pat Kawano; Doris Miller, a Kaluakoi resident; Beverly Pauole Moore, Head of the Department of Labor; and Irenio Vergara, who is an insurance broker here on the island. So, this wasn't, this was a pretty wide range of people and there were 17 meetings there. The plan was reviewed by the County Planning Department then there was another 21 meetings before the Molokai Planning Commission. The volumes of

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

testimony is this ma. . .technical reports and everything else and a lot of work went into it and it is a living document and there is a process to amend it. I was over in Maui County on Tuesday, and I ran into about 16 Ranch employees on the eighth floor of the County building and they asked me how Pau Hana was going. So, I passed them out some recent letters and we're trying to open Pau Hana as a community based development, and we put in a check to the Ranch for an extension, 60-day extension. The community has put in \$155,000 so far to bring it to this point and get the zoning, so it can be reopened as a community based hotel but they sent the check back and said they weren't going to make a decision after this, until after this meeting. So, I don't know if my testimony has anything to do with the extension or not but I hope not because Kaunakakai needs Pau Hana, it needs the 15 acres at the college and it needs the Junior Roping Club arena. Now, I didn't see a lot of enthusiasm from Clifford. I know some of the roping club members don't know about this lease, but this, the Planning Commission approval was to preserve the Junior Roping Club for the future, not only for the Junior Roping Club, the. . .but also for the 4-H and other youth activities, and whether it was going to be down zoned or whatever. So, I would recommend that even if there is a lease that, you keep the language in there that it be preserved for the future use of the Junior Roping Club. Because our community plan talks about really doing something nice between the town of Kaunakakai and the ocean, to link the town to the ocean. And you--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. VANDERBILT: --you have the cultural part, you have Pau Hana, you have the roping club, you have the canoe clubs and the yacht club, and it could be one of the nicest towns in this State before it gets too developed. And I know when those kids were given the CA. . .the Planning Commission approval that they would have their own roping arena for. . .for. . .forever along with the, the 4-H people, that was a good thing. So, maybe the lease is a good lease and they have the same protections, I don't know. But I just hope that everybody can work together and we can move forward from here because there's, there's over 5,000 lots that can subdivided right now that haven't been built on. And just one last point is that, the lady from the Visitors Bureau said that there *[sic]* need about 100,000 visitors--

MR. BOTEILHO: Four minutes.

MR. VANDERBILT: --to be comfortable and if you take the three hotel sites at the resort plus all the other facilities, Pau Hana, it adds up to about 475, 000 room nights if there's 50 percent occupancy. And so--

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, DeGray.

MR. VANDERBILT: Okay, thank you very much.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, Kenneth Ching?

MR. CHING: Hi, Madam Chair, Members of the Council. Thank you very much for coming to Molokai. Thank you for giving us the opportunity. I just wanted to thank everybody that came and supported the 2001 Needs Matrix. Members of the community and other fellow people that I work with, I so appreciate them so much. I needed just to come and tell you a couple stories. We recently closed the restaurant that we were operating in Maunaloa called the Village Grill. We closed, closed it in early July and then in hindsight, as we went back to figure out why we needed to close it, and it came as a result of the Kaluakoi closing, Kaluakoi employees losing their job, snowbirds leaving from Paniolo Hale and Ke Nani Kai. We're losing approximately 10 to 20 dinners a night, \$20 per person. Couldn't keep up with that 12 to 14,000 a month to keep it open. So, the employees came up and they said Kenny, why? Why isn't the sales people doing more? We don't, why aren't we getting more people on this island? We operated that restaurant just like a local business and so I couldn't really come up with an answer. I guess, like somebody just took your heart out and then we started to meet with other people, talk to them. So, then we started to realize that it wasn't just the Village Grill in Maunaloa, it could be other businesses in Kaunakakai. John Pele had recently said that his father was asking him to take over the business. He was wondering why and how could he survive at that business. I believe what's happening at Kaunakakai is that a lot of people are depleting their savings to keep their business open. We just need some support. A business friendly plan to keep us going. I need to do one more thing, commend the people that we work with. The employees they get. . .(end of tape, start 3B). . .in 1999, we hired people who had no experience in the industry, no experience whatsoever and we brought a lady in to help us her name is Pat Graham a professor at the University of Hawaii and a training director at the Kahala Mandarin. And today, I've got to tell you we are probably as good as any hotel maybe in Hawaii but anywhere. We do a wonderful job and the people are so friendly. Everything I hear is all the guests comment cards tell me, oh, you know your employees they are most friendly people in the world, wonderful people. So, I'm telling you the people of Molokai, they just need your support. We ask for your support on the 2001 Needs Matrix. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Kenneth? Kenneth?

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: Mr. Ching?

CHAIR TAVARES: Mr. Ching, could you come back we have question for you?

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: Hi, Mr. Ching.

CHAIR TAVARES: Mr. Kane.

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: Thank you.

MR. CHING: Dain?

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: This may seem to be a sensitive question but--

MR. CHING: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: --I'm going to ask it because I can't think of doing it any other way.

MR. CHING: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: How many of the employees that are here tonight testifying in favor of the 2001 Needs Matrix participated in the formulation of that Needs Matrix?

MR. CHING: I don't know.

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: How many?

MR. CHING: The business, the business community came up with the--Molokai Chamber Business Association came up with the Matrix and we explained it and showed it to the employees at one of our meetings. They. . .go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: So, let, let me ask you then. The result of the understanding that, that the employees have from Molokai Ranch of the Needs Matrix, the 2001 Needs Matrix is a result of one meeting they had with you folks telling them what, what the Needs Matrix was.

MR. CHING: We, we explained the Needs Matrix to them over the course of--yeah, one or two meetings but not a whole lot.

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: Thank you.

MR. CHING: Okay.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Joseph Cariaga? Oh, I'm sorry. Ross. Do we have Joseph Cariaga here? Ross Gandharva. . .or Gandharva Ross.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

?: Gandharva.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, Gandharva Ross is he here? No. William Vogt.

MR. VOGT: Vogt.

CHAIR TAVARES: Vogt. Okay, thank you.

MR. VOGT: Good evening, Chairman Tavares, and, Council Members. My name is Bill Vogt. Good political name. You know I, I speak just for myself, I don't represent any organizations and I've learned a lot listening to this. I've been a 40-year resident of Hawaii and a nine-year fulltime resident of Molokai and I can look at all sides and be somewhat of a devil's advocate. But what no one seems to have mentioned tonight is that, this doesn't have to be either Maui style development or all rural. There can be a compromise within sustained economic growth. Molokai is a, is a wonderful island and it's unique in that it's not going to turn and many people have testified that it is not going to turn into a mad house of development because all the people that have spoken here tonight both for and against this issue won't let that happen. They're too smart to let that happen. But the bottom line is really that, you have to either go forward or backwards economically and unless the 2001 Needs Matrix or something similar to that is enacted, Molokai is going to continue to go backwards. I've been coming to Molokai for 40 years and it was a vital place and it's losing that vitality but it doesn't have to be an all or nothing situation. So, what I would like to stress is that if the 2001 Needs Matrix is put in place there can be limited development. Many, many people have used that word limited, controlled, revitalization, that does not mean hotels and people overrunning this island and nor does it mean that there can't be hunting and fishing and more traditional lifestyles. All of these are compatible with each other and they can all be done simultaneously on this very unique island, which is one reason I love this place. It's different. And I think that, if the development isn't encouraged to some extent, Molokai will lose its uniqueness because it, it will be a nothing island, it just will turn into nothing and I, I would just be crushed personally if that were to happen. And I'm not a big fan of development. I've been 40 years in Hawaii. I've been sort of anti-development but I have to put my selfish needs aside when I look at the big picture and I think that's what a lot of people are losing sight of. We, we can't be selfish. We have to look at our grandchildren. I have eight grandchildren. I have children who would like to live on Molokai. I have grandchildren who I know would like to live on Molokai but none of us can do it without some controlled growth. But there's enough intelligence in the Council and the Planning Committee and the residents of Molokai that, all of this can happen nicely and together and it was spoken earlier about working together. I think we can do that. Thank you very much.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Halona Kaopuiki? Okay. If not, the next set is: Uilani Ramos, Noelani Helm, Opuulani Albino, James--I can't make out the--Mawae. . .James Mawae Sr., and Phil Merricks. Just come up to the microphone.

MR. KAOPUIKI: Hello, Council. My name is Halona Kaopuiki. I was born and raised on Molokai. My great grandparents name was Helen and Joe Kaiakapokaha(?). My grandparents name was James Naonela(?) and Helen Kaopuiki. I get so much ohana over here, born and bred over here. I get so much ohana over here who working for the Ranch. My ohana was one of the people who built this ranch. My great grandparents was one of the first opposers of dredging in Kamiloloa and Keawa Nui--today we have nothing--was her and Kupuna Minerva Keawe. They are not here today. They all in heaven today but I speaking for them. And what I saw tonight is a lot of lies, lot of scam, and everything. Brother Nishiki should know, ring around the roses, is going back again in circles. Everybody are screaming for jobs but the eyes is a different color they see. They don't see the desecration, that's what my kupunas are screaming when I look down at this ground. Desecration. I live the old style. This is what I found in the pu'us in the mountains this ulumaika. I'm an archeologist. I'm not a certified archeologist, my tutus gave me this knowledge, and they pass it down to me. When I was up there in the pu'us, pu'unui, I was there. Uncle Jimmy Duvauchelle should know my family 'cause we again I said, blood, sweat, and tears. We plug the waterline and the whole nine yards, before never have nothing was only pastures. The lifestyle of my culture, what going happen to me? Everybody talking about their children, everybody talking about jobs but again, Council Members, the color they see, the ho'ailona they see is not what I see. Me, my kupunas are here I must take care of them. You guys are in a different island, you guys not going be here with the problems that we face. I got to face my, my ohana. They all screaming for jobs. What about us? Right now, they have food on their table. My wife was working for Kaluakoi for 22 years. The other side of the story of this hotels because there's no pono. What I mean there's no pono is there's hakaka between two sides of the party. So, nothing going work, as one Hawaiian nothing going work. The other side of picture of this ho'ailona, you ask people who was working at the hotels what they saw? Why they had to shut down the rooms?

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. KAOPUIKI: Amen, brah. Why they had to shut down the rooms? Why? 'Cause tourists go in their room the bed over here, when they go eat dinner they come back the bed history, different kind corners. That is for real. That is the other side of the story and then when they building hotels it's like Peyton Place. Husband over there with one another wahine; wahine over there with another brother like that. They bring bad habits and poison to my island. This is my

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

island. I taking care of my kupunas. I taking care of the iwi right here today, everyday. I pray to the holy man up here. I want to live like how my kupunas when teach me how to live. I want Molokai to be Molokai. I don't know why everybody else over here screaming *blah, blah, blah, blah* stop, Molokai is so beautiful let's leave Molokai, Molokai, then let's leave Molokai, Molokai. Let's forget about this 2001 Matrix. They went put the tape over there they when make the _____ small.

MR. BOTEILHO: Four minutes.

MR. KAOPUIKI: God bless you. They when put the tape over there and they when go put `em over here.

AUDIENCE: . . . *(laughter)* . . .

MR. KAOPUIKI: What about all the people who when struggle to make the plan. They never put the tape they had manao. We never had manao brah and then God bless you guys.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

MR. KAOPUIKI: Now, I can go home, go eat, and go sleep.

AUDIENCE: . . . *(applause)* . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Is anyone here from the group that I called up before? Uilani, Noelani, Opuulani. . . sounds like a lot of Hawaiians, huh?

AUDIENCE: . . . *(laughter)* . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: James Mawae or Phil Merricks?

MR. MERRICKS: That's me.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, thank you.

MR. MERRICKS: Thank you all for being here tonight. I've been living on Molokai for 11 years and this is probably going to be the place I spend my last breath, so I hope everything works out. The, it's sounds like, you know, it's like one or the other plan. I hope you are all wise enough and intelligent enough to know that hopefully it doesn't legally have to be one or the other. Now, I've heard a really bad idea tonight that came out of the 2001 plan, which was to decrease the amount of land for the college. Okay, so that's a bad idea in that plan. But I also hear that there's this 600-foot setback on this other plan, that's a bad idea in that plan. Okay. So, go through the two plans, find the good ideas put `em together,

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

and come up with a great plan. Okay, now a friend of mine told me that when, and he's an employee of Molokai Ranch, he told me that when Kaluakoi was full tilt boogie it was 150,000 people a year coming to Molokai. They laid--and I, I talked to some other born and raised Hawaiians and I asked them I said, well, when Kaluakoi was busy full on, back when it was the Sheraton, was Molokai a bad place? Was it crowded? Did you guys not like it? And he went nah, nah it was fine. You know we had 300 employees; we played music up there; we had parties up there. I heard that on a Wednesday night you had to make a reservation for dinner in Kaluakoi 25 years ago, you know, and it didn't destroy the island. So, the lady from the Visitors Association said we had 64,000 last year. So, if we, if we get 150,000 tourists a year supposedly, it's not going to destroy Molokai. There's four existing hotels on the island; Pau Hana, which you know is not open; Hotel Molokai, which has just been restored; Kaluakoi, which hopefully is going to get restored; and their Lodge, which is in good shape. Okay. I'd say give those four properties whatever zoning they need to not only open but to improve and expand if necessary and not only just let `em do it encourage `em to do it. You know on Oahu they, they were, they were giving `em property tax breaks if they do improvements. The State's giving `em no excise tax on all this construction projects on these. So, they're encouraging `em to make improvements. Pau Hana could use another building. We could have a trade school over there and rebuild Pau Hana and then create a lot of skilled people on this island. We could even do a trade school and do part of the, the repairs up at Kaluakoi and get some--and keep down their costs to rebuild the thing and to create a lot of goodwill and create some skilled people. This is a ten-year plan. We've got people right now on this island that's nine years old, in ten years they're going to be 19. They're going to be entering the job market. They're going to need a job. We've got about a hundred graduates a year from the high school. Some of `em is going to leave; some of `em is going to come back later; some is going to stay, they're all going to need a job, you know.

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. MERRICKS: So, you know, when you have a bad economy it, you know, it creates economic problems, of course, and then that creates social problems, you know. So, we, we have both right now. So, just use your head. Let your heart tell you what to do and let your head tell you when to do it. Okay and let's come up with a great plan. Now, the Ranch has put a lot of energy into this 2001 plan and we know those guys every project they have done has failed. They have proven they do not know how to plan. They came to this island with a great resource and they have not pulled out one successful project yet. The man that they sued to get out of the Village Grill was making a living at it. It was successful when he ran it but he wouldn't kowtow to them and they sued him and got him out of his lease because he was one day late on painting his building. And the deadline was the week that Iniki hit and the tourists started coming to Molokai on the tour groups instead of, of Kauai and he had to struggle--

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. MERRICKS: --and get his business up and running for all these new people. He was one day late, the Ranch sued him, and he had a successful business they kicked out of town because he wouldn't go along with them. There's horror stories on what this company has done. Brierly are the bad guys--

CHAIR TAVARES: You, you need to close.

MR. MERRICKS: Okay. They've had a lot of people that have one goal to make money. They said that, they told me last week, Edwards told me what we want to do is get some zoning so we can sell this place. Brierly said in 1992, we are an international land holding company; we buy land; we split it up; we sell it, we leave town. They wanted to sell \$100 million worth of real estate on this island and it didn't work. But a better plan and better--

CHAIR TAVARES: You need to stop. Thank you.

MR. MERRICKS: Thank you so much. Just put 'em together and make one good plan.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Thank you very much.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: The next group: Joey, Ron, Leilani, Steven Petro, and Stacy Crivello. Any of you are here, just walk up to the mic and identify yourself.

MR. KIMBALL: Hi, Ron Kimball, one of the bad guys on the CAC. I spent one year working on it and five years on the Planning Commission working on it. I pretty much know this, this community plan. My testimony is to support what we did, the CAC in '93-'94 and I hope you guys do that 'cause the, the thing here is the process, it's just the process, you know. We, we really worked hard and you guys cannot ignore that fact. It's a process that you guys help set up and we tried to implement, and you guys cannot deviate from that. The other thing too, is a lot of people didn't hear. The, the sad part about it is nobody know. These guys don't understand what the community plan is about. They all talking about the Matrix but nobody realize that there's a whole set of wording that goes with the Matrix. Okay, it talks about our environment; it talks about education; it talks about a whole bunch of things, and one of the things inside there that was stuck in there is to make this whole island an SMA. You guys worried about the 600-foot buffer. They making this whole island SMA then you guys got some real problems that this island will have. So, if you guys have a chance to get your hands on the language, the language is the most important thing not so much the matrix. The matrix serves as a guide but the language is the teeth. I wanted, I

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

really wanted to get to this matrix but I cannot 'cause, 'cause I scared of this guy right here. The watch. So, what I'll do is I'm gonna. . .my testimony is to support what we did, the CAC, and to support the language that's attached to the Matrix. And everybody in here go find the language read, 'cause basically what was said in '84 is what we tried to do again in '90. . .'94. My recommendation to the Council is. . .you guys got to make this community plan more accountable. You guys got to put some teeth into this thing 'cause when reviewing the '84 plan that was really well done by a whole bunch of great Molokai people, we found that little or nothing was done in ten years, nothing. The only thing that we can give credit to the community plan for was the, the setup of the Molokai Planning Commission, that's about the only thing that was done that we found. So, we, we got to put some meat into it and I kept asking who's responsible? Like I see Clayton there at our Planning Commission meeting, I kept asking Clayton, yeah but who's responsible for putting in all of this nice plans that we had in the, in the wording of the community plan? They don't know. Nobody knows. So, that's one thing, we got to get some meat into that. I would suggest that--it's not my idea somebody else gave this, gave this idea--that the CAC, the next one that's created, they serve it on an advisory capacity to the Planning Commission and to the Council. Where people can come to the CAC bounce their ideas off with regards to the community plan and then this CAC can stay intact and, and follow it and they can be the birddogs for this community plan to make sure that it gets implemented. They can meet quarterly. They can be a committee where recommendations are, are bounced off. They can oversee the implementation of the community plan. They can try to find partners within the business community or within the, you know, wherever--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. KIMBALL: --wherever in our community they can find partners to try to implement the plans. The next recommendation I have is to table this whole thing. Table it. Put it on the side from now until the end of this year. Look at this room, full of people; choke people in here. Go get all their names, put another CAC together right now, between now and December put another CAC together. In the year 2002, have that CAC work on a plan, another plan. The year 2003, we bounce it up like we have all of these great community meetings; we run it through the, the Molokai Planning Commission; we run it through the Council and then, you know, we, we knock it out like what we doing right now, and then next thing you know the year 2004 is going to come right around and we can implement the plan. Right now, if you guys going to haphazardly approve something, in one year we gotta work on another plan. Just table what we have and we get all the parties, they'd be back on the tables and we hash this thing out. Okay, I going real fast. The Council needs to stagger the implementation of community plans. You guys putting, trying to--

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

CHAIR TAVARES: Ron, you're talking about PC-8. I'm coming back to Molokai to talk about the planning process.

MR. KIMBALL: Okay, good. Great.

CHAIR TAVARES: And you at four minutes already.

MR. KIMBALL: Oh, shoot. Okay, well then before I go let me introduce the most important guy in the room tonight, that guy right there Kaluakoi. We gotta support the guy, find a way for them to buy Kaluakoi make that happen. Kaluakoi comes back on line, our jobs come back. Okay. The other thing we need to do is have the Council, the Council you guys are the key. Councilman Kawano, Kawano or, or, or, or the Mayor, you guys got to go meet with this guy and then meet with the Ranch and find a buyer for the Ranch. Help them find a buyer. That's the bottom line. Help them find a buyer and it help. . . *(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Ron.

MR. KIMBALL: Mahalo. I like come back I get plenty ideas.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . . *(applause)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Question. Excuse me, Ron? Ron, Mr. Nishiki has a question for you.

MR. KIMBALL: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER NISHIKI: Ron, these guys want to put in another golf course. If Kaluakoi comes back--

MR. KIMBALL: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER NISHIKI: --they gonna put in that golf course back again?

MR. KIMBALL: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER NISHIKI: Did you discuss why they--

MR. KIMBALL: It was already there so let `em bring that back.

COUNCILMEMBER NISHIKI: We don't need another golf course either.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MR. KIMBALL: Well, on the CAC, Kaluakoi approached us and they wanted to put in three nine-holes, they wanted to add 27 more down there and we, we turned that down but that 18 was already there. Let `em come back I got no problems with that one. Let `em come back.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: _____ please. Go ahead.

MS. BICOY-LALIN: Chairperson, Council Members, I am a concerned resident of Molokai, a working mother and I'm trying my best to support my family to the best of my ability. Employment being a very valuable source now--

?: . . .(inaudible) . . .

MS. BICOY-LALIN: --oh, I'm sorry, my name is Leilani Bicoy-Lalin. Employment being a very valuable source nowadays just to survive but not enough to live, living on a mediocre income trying to give my children a brighter future on Molokai is very slim to none. The minimum wage does not exceed the cost of living on Molokai. So, what kind of future is there for our children when our present holds no promising economic value. I am a taxpayer and I want to see some changes to our island. We Molokai are hurting in all aspects of future growth on this island but to everything, there is a solution only if we can come to a compromise. I've heard a lot about this matrix in the community, if I'm for it if I'm against it. I've read the Matrix, and I'm for some and I'm against others. To put the Matrix in one whole package and say are you for it or against it to me is immature. We need to take one thing at a time. Give us some details. What exactly are you going to do, then let's take a vote on that. I would like to voice my written concern to you on an important issue that would be very devastating to this community. The West Molokai Matrix 9, 600-foot open space; the West Molokai Matrix 1 through 3, the down zoning of existing properties. Why are we trying to discourage development or improvement to our island? Why not make it 100 to 150-foot open space? Why so much big open space? What is the intention of it all? Why only one side of the island is affected and not the other? Or is it? Why don't we worry about the height of our future infrastructures? Why down zone something when it has been already approved? If all of this seems to pass what type of business opportunities or ladder will I be climbing when little or none will be offered? Why encourage our children to get a higher education when little or none is required or offered as an opportunity? Will we the taxpayers suffer from the consequence of, consequences of your decision if this passes? Who will refund the property owners for this unused land--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MS. BICOY-LALIN: --that they have bought and can no longer use? If this affects one side, I think it should affect all. We are one island, one community. United we stand divided we fall. To conclude, I would like to see development to this island to the extent of Molokai being able to support the population and to become a self-sufficient island able to stand on our two feet. We do not need five-star hotels or another Waikiki but we do need enough job opportunities to offer our residents. We don't need skyscrapers but moderate to the island's demands and pleasing to the visitors sights. We need to change for the time, are more evident now than ever. I ask that you please reconsider your decision on the 600-foot open space and the down zoning properties. Let's not discourage, discourage investors and visitors but most important the residents of Molokai from what I see to be a very promising place to live and to raise our children--

MR. BOTEILHO: Four minutes.

MS. BICOY-LALIN: -- and our children's children. I would like to thank you for taking this time to hear my concerns as well as it is written. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Okay, do we have Joey? Is Joey here. . .Joao? Steven Petro. Oh, is this Joey? Okay. Thank you.

MR. JOAO: Howzit, thanks for listening to us. I'm Joey Joao and this is my buddy Sam Thompson. The reason he's here with me is he like talk but he little bit more shame than me, so he's standing right here. He's been gone from Molokai for ten years. He went to Lanai. He was--he had to move out, no jobs on Molokai so he moved with a construction company. Finally, he came back to Molokai, bummed around for about a year I think, came see us at the Ranch and the Ranch gave him a job. He's a very good worker, you know, he's intelligent, he's an intelligent man. Works for me in fact, he was one of my workers but anyway I'm not here for the Ranch and talking about Molokai Ranch, I'm here, we both are here for the reason for Molokai. We're residents of Molokai. One reason is, you know, you guys, the Council people you guys have a hard task in front of you. I understand that. All the people giving their testimony, a lot more people is going to give more testimonies, whether you see it good or bad is your decision, and it's our thoughts, it's our ideas that we give you folks but it boils down to you folks decision. And remember the date 2001 where things happen really bad on, in, in the United States where things changed, you folks going to make a difference too. You folks going to make a difference to see whether people stay on Molokai. Our kids, my kids I love my kids, I no like see `em move off the island, you know, kind of protective yeah but 'cause I, I like them stay here to raise their kids. I like see my kids. I like see their grandchildren. I want to be here on the island of Molokai where they can go catch fish, go hunting, go pick

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

opihī, and we still can do that today, yeah, go catch some hihiwai and stuff. But we need jobs on Molokai, you know. My family started the Ranch, too. My granddad lived at Kaluakoi and some of you guys probably seen him when you guys was changing the beds 'cause he the guy that wear the lauhala hat. Okay, he the guy that used to pinch guys on the butt, that's what my grandfather used to do, brah. Okay, my grandmother used to live at Puunana inside the bushes inside there. I still see the mango tree. Some nights, I go down there talk story with her. My great granddad lived at Moomomi. You guys can see the date tree that he used to live underneath. So, my family is from that area and I, I love that area very much. Lot of guys concerned about that area because all the, the artifacts and stuff. True there is a lot. So, but the, the people who developing if the do develop small little stuffs, they're the people that ones gotta take care that for our, for our people, yeah. Nobody know where they at. When they open `em up, we take care of `em for people no desecrate `em. But all I'm trying to say is, you know, we need the jobs on Molokai. And the Matrix 2. . .the, the 2001 is something they when present to us, Mr. Kane asked Mr. Ching about did we tell the people, the ranch workers about it? Yes, they did. Okay, they, they taught us about it. A lot of us didn't know about it. A lot of us wasn't educated about it. When they presented it to us in couple meetings--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. JOAO: --a lot of the questions and answers was answered by the workers themselves who understood it. So, it wasn't like we was brainwashed or nothing we just understood it. A lot of intelligent people in the, in the community. Okay, there's a lot of intelligent ideas. Why don't you guys put your ideas together instead of fighting with each other. The world came together after that, that that plane went into that, that building. United States came together, why can't the island of Molokai come together? Thank you. Mahalo.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Steven Petro? You, you reading for Steven?

MR. S. CRIVELLO: Right.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, thank you.

MS. S. CRIVELLO: Okay. This letter is to the Honorable Charmaine Tavares, Chair Maui County Council Planning Committee, and Members of the County Council. Dear Chair Tavares, and Council Members, welcome to Molokai. I am sorry that I am unable to attend your meeting, however, I would like to provide testimony concerning the Molokai community plan draft on behalf of the Molokai Enterprise Community Board. The Molokai Enterprise Community Board strongly supports the Molokai community plan draft that was adopted by the Planning Committee

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

that you chair. We have only one major concern about the Planning Committee's draft and that relates to a proposed island-wide 600-foot open space buffer. We do not support that proposal. We do not want existing and future residential landowners to be prevented from building or to lose their homes if they are within this 600-foot buffer zone. Aside from this one reservation, we solidly endorse the proposed Molokai community plan as approved by your Committee. Ke Aupuni Lokahi is the volunteer governing board for the Molokai Enterprise Community. We are working to implement the ten-year strategic plan that won Molokai our Federal designation as EC. As stewards of a plan that was developed by literally hundreds of grass-roots community residents, we have a tremendous amount of respect for the work that was done to create the proposed Molokai community plan. Seven years ago, dozens of our friends and neighbors gave generously of their time and attended numerous meetings to map out a land use plan for our island. In 1994, after carefully balancing the needs of the public and the private sector against the island's carrying capacity and environment, these community servants finalized their draft of our plan. A year later in 1995, the Molokai Planning Commission ratified virtually all of the Citizens Advisory Committee's recommendations. Your Committee in the year 2000 convened a series of comprehensive meetings to review the draft plan and the Committee concurred with almost every one of the community's decisions. In a recent County Council hearing on your Committee's recommended draft, a number of major changes were proposed. The entire plan was then referred back to your Committee for further deliberations. As you consider whether to adopt the proposals, we urge your Committee to stand by the integrity of the process that produced the first draft of our Molokai plan and to stand by the Molokai community residents who worked so hard to create it. In closing, the Molokai Enterprise Community Board strongly supports the community plan that our Citizens Advisory Committee crafted and our Molokai Planning Commission endorsed. We ask you and the rest of the Council to support these hard-working community volunteers whose decisions were motivated by their love for our island home and their desire to ensure that it will nurture our families for many generations to come. Thank you very much for considering our testimony, with sincere aloha Steven Petro, President Molokai Enterprise Community Board.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Are you going to testify for yourself now?

MS. S. CRIVELLO: Yeah, I will.

CHAIR TAVARES: You're number 89.

MS. S. CRIVELLO: Okay. I'm Stacy Crivello and a resident of Molokai. I too support the 1994 CAC plan. I support the plan because of the integrity of the process needs to be preserved. That process comes from our County, comes

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

from our government and what we're saying is to allow it to become real. On a side, side line, I too personally would like to see the opportunity for Kaluakoi to come back and employ our people. I hope and pray that whatever becomes of Molokai Ranch that Molokai Ranch will take care of their employees. If Matrix 2001 will open the doors and give Molokai Ranch to buyers to buy them out; corporate you buy out, you lay off. Whatever may turn out, Molokai Ranch, I sincerely hope you will take care of the people you are employing. You have done a good job in redeveloping Maunaloa town. I am trying to understand why, why can't you take care of the employees today without they feeling threatened if they will lose their jobs or lose employment if our community plan is put in place. If we look at this community plan, there's only about three items that we differ. Why, why will their jobs be threatened? Molokai Ranch, take care of our people. Sincerely, take care of our people.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Stacy. Stacy, when the EC plan was submitted to the Federal government was Kaluakoi still open at that time?

MS. S. CRIVELLO: Yeah.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, thank you. Mr. Kane?

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: Just one, Stacy.

CHAIR TAVARES: Stacy, one more question. You so popular tonight.

MS. S. CRIVELLO: I'm not used to staying up late. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: Nice voice.

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: This morning. . .strategic plan goals that you folks presented to us. One of the things that I found absent and I wanted to get some comment from you was in the third slide that you folks showed, Molokai's economy will be strong diversified and production based. What stuck out to me that was, was glaring, and absent was service-oriented type of economics. It talks about production based. Where's the service base? Knowing that we have what we have on the west end is primarily a service-oriented type of economy.

MS. S. CRIVELLO: It's a balance. It's not an imbalanced where it would be fully service based. Today is a good example. Our State economy nestles everything in service base. We're struggling. I mean everybody is running crazy to see what we're going to do to, to make things okay. It is production based. This is where our plan is like any other business it's not going to happen overnight but we are implementing projects that leads up to production based. We want to go

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

this way instead of depending always this way. You've heard testimony that we don't want to depend and that's where production based comes in.

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: Thank you. Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Stacy. At this time, we are going to take a break and we'll reconvene at 11 p.m. At the--after the break it will be: Zhantell Dudoit, Bettygene Dudoit, Pearl Petro, Sonya Yuen, and Catherine Aki. Recess . . .(gavel). . .

RECESS: 10:55 p.m.

RECONVENE: 11:02 p.m.

CHAIR TAVARES: . . .(gavel). . . Thank you very much. Zhantell Dudoit, you're up.

MS. Z. DUDOIT: Am I gonna break this if I. . .(adjusting microphone). . . I like make sure everybody hear me that's why. I said am I going to break this is if I'm fussing with it?

?: I get `em. I get `em.

MS. Z. DUDOIT: Okay, aloha, my name is Zhantell Dudoit and I am, I was born and raised here on Molokai. But because I also am the vice-chair of the Molokai Planning Commission, I'll refrain from giving you my opinion or my recommendation on any specific matter concerning the Matrix. However, as a community member and as a member of the planning process for Molokai, the planning process, I'd just like to take, to take few things into consideration as you work through this Matrix. Number one, I think it was important that Mr. Kimball pointed out that, language because I know how difficult this is to come up with the language when we create any kind of a process is very important and I think that that's what the people also don't understand 'cause they're not here through that process. But to not only look at the areas that we have on our Matrix but to really read what it says. I also have to agree with Mr. Kimball in the fact that, and I not specifically talking about any which Matrix I'm talking about but that, we have this tendency to keep recreating the wheel. We have something in place, instead of trying to work out, you know, work it out and find the bugs and try to. . .we tend to just say oh, you know what let's try this again. And we keep going over and over it again and then ten years down the line we still don't have a community plan that works for everybody. I think and I going address it to you 'cause I know that's how this process goes but I'm going to hope that the people in the back of me hear what I'm trying to say. I sit in the front of people and I listen to them and I try to be fair and I listen to both sides of this party, and you know the funny thing is they all are here for the same reason. They--not where they live, they want Molokai to stay the same way. Eh, they fight with each other.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

They get the same ideas they just--you know what we gotta do is like put aside all our personal stuff, yeah. Molokai Ranch is this big evil entity. Eh, I not saying that they're not but I am saying that what makes up Molokai Ranch is a lot of people that love this island, too. I not saying that the people that oppose the Ranch are bad but I am saying that it doesn't make you less Hawaiian because you choose to work in the service industry. We talked about vital resources and resources and working on our economic hardships. You know what is our most important resource that won't cost us a thing but will profit us the most, us. We the best bunch of service industry people in the world. You know why, 'cause we love where we live. The tourism industry may not be what all of us want but you know what, it's, it's here, it's something that is immediate, and it's something that can sustain us right now. I mean we looking at this plan and we thinking that, oh, down the road this gonna happen, this is gonna happen, and I tell you what, for those of you who don't know by December of 2002, 200 families will be off of welfare. Will we be producing enough taro or farm to support these families? Yeah, you sit back and you say, that's not our problem that people have hardships, everybody gotta take care of themselves. You like know what and it's 200 families we talking about, that is our problem. So, yeah we gotta look at the future. Yeah, we gotta preserve the past but we also gotta think about what's happening right now in the front of us. The past is good we need to learn from it. The future is a whole wonderful area of goodness. It, it can be but we never gonna get there--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. Z. DUDOIT: --if we don't--gee, was fast hah my three minutes?

AUDIENCE: . . . *(laughter)* . . .

MR. BOTEILHO: Actually was long.

MS. Z. DUDOIT: But we never going to get there if we don't work together. And then in closing, I'd just like to make a comment to DeGray's statement because I felt that he was kind of minimizing the agreement between Molokai Ranch and the Junior Roping Club. I had the opportunity to sit there while the both parties talked about this and it wasn't pretty in the beginning. Let me tell you. But if two opposing parties like Molokai Ranch and the Junior Roping Club can come together to work out their differences for the betterment of the community and everybody involved, we all can do this. All of us. We all want the same thing. I love where I live. I love all of you. Thank you for your time.

AUDIENCE: . . . *(applause)* . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Zhantell. Bettygene Dudoit?

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MS. B. DUDOIT: Aloha, again, Chairman Tavares, and Council. My name is Bettygene Ocampo Dudoit and I was born and raised here. So, I'm talking as a keiki o ka aina. I'm here tonight to ask your support for the Molokai community plan that was developed by the CAC in 1994, in its entirety. The County Charter set up the process. The CAC completed their responsibility in their course of action as well as the Molokai Planning Commission. Now, that it's in its final stage it is in your hands tonight and so, I ask that you adopt the Molokai community plan. Also, in closing, I'd like to say thank you for coming to Molokai and thank you for allowing me to be involved in the final stage. Thank you. And now, . . . Pearl Friel. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Yeah, you're going to read for Pearl Petro?

MS. B. DUDOIT: Yeah. Yeah, Pearl Petro.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay.

MS. B. DUDOIT: She couldn't be here she went to the mainland yesterday. The Honorable Chairman Tavares, Chair, Maui County Council Planning Committee, and Members of the County Council, regarding Molokai plan September 27, 2001 public hearing. Dear Chair Tavares and Council Members, aloha. Thank you for coming to our island to hear testimony concerning our Molokai community plan, community plan. As a long time resident and large landowner of our rural island community, I would like to register my complete support for the Molokai community plan. I have lived on the island of Molokai for over 75 years. I have also had the pleasure of being the manager of Bank of Hawaii for 40 years. With this history, I believe I testify with full understanding, compassion, and love of our island. I do not support the island-wide 600-foot open space buffer zone that your Planning Committee recommends for our island. I strongly oppose this recommendation. This recommendation will definitely be a land use nightmare for our kamaaina residents. I support the Molokai community plan that was developed by our Citizens Advisory Committee in 1994. Our CAC members spent many months, days, and hours, to develop a land use plan for our island. They conducted numerous meetings to receive community input to develop this plan. In 1995, the Molokai commun. . . the Molokai Planning Commission endorsed all of the CAC recommendations. In fact, . . . (end of tape, start 4A). . . your Planning Committee concurred with almost every one of the CAC recommendations. Finally, I respectfully request that your Planning Committee support the integrity of the CAC process and trust the land use decisions of our Citizens Advisory Committee. With much aloha and love, Pearl Friel Petro. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . . (applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Is Sonya Yuen here? Ok

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

ay.

MISS ALCON: I'm reading a letter for her.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay.

MISS ALCON: This letter is addressed to the Honorable Charmaine Tavares, Maui County Council Planning Committee, and Members of the County Council. Dear Chair Tavares and Council Members, thank you for coming to Molokai to hear our testimony regarding our Molokai community plan. I consider myself a long time resident of Molokai, living here for over half of my life, a business owner and also a board member of Ke Aupuni Lokahi; the Molokai Enterprise Community Board. I am giving my full support for the Molokai community plan. This written testimony is in support for the Molokai community plan that was developed by our Citiz. . Citizens Advisory Committee in 1994, which was accepted by the Molokai Planning Commission in 1995. I believe in the integrity of the process that the CAC went thru to develop our community plan. They held many community meetings to listen to the community needs and concerns to develop this community plan. I would also like to state at this time that, I do not support the island-wide 600-foot open space buffer that the Planning Committee recommended. Thank you for your time and consideration, Sonya Yuen. On behalf of myself, my name is Punahale Alcon, I am also in support of the Molokai community plan. And this is Mahana Adolpho and she has a little something to say also.

MISS ADOLPHO: Within Sonya's time she wanted to myself--

MISS ALCON: My three minutes.

MISS ADOLPHO: --myself and Sonya and Punahale wanted to share that, the EC community who supports the plan works side by side. And some of the projects that they do talking about employment and the, the youth, and giving them jobs and, you know, all that bit(?) that people was talking about, is the Molokai Visitors Coordinator Project that we have to bring tourism to the island. Another is the, the Youth Opportunity Grant that we worked so hard to bring to the island to help the youth who are out of school, in school, you know, who dropped out of school to, to get them, get them ready for jobs in the community. And a lot of community people took in these kids, you know, and trained them and helped them and by doing that, they, they unknowingly supported the plan, the, the Molokai community plan. The other things that we have environmental-wise; we have a watershed project that will help to, you know, to replenish the, the, the water nat. . naturally. Okay, there's no chemicals or anything. It's growing trees so that it will rain and, you know, the whole process. There's so much things that the Enterprise Community, a lot of projects that we're trying to implement and get the community to jump in--

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MISS ADOLPHO: --and give us their, their manao. And, you know, if they knew about this. . .I tell you we'd be successful. We'd be out there and our problems would be solved, and we can work together. I really and strongly support the Molokai community plan and the hard work that it, it went through and all the people that volunteered their time. Mahalo.

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay. What is your name?

MISS ADOLPHO: Oh, my name is Mahana Adolpho.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Catherine Aki?

MS. C. AKI: Good evening, everyone. My name is Catherine Aki. I'm not from Molokai, I've been here for a while. I always try to remember where I'm from 'cause sometimes people forget where they're from and I'd like to say that, I participated in the process in this community plan and I believe in process. I always tell people that I believe in process but I also believe that there should be an end to the process. There should be a conclusion and we should get to where we need to go. I participated in the present. . .process back in '94 even in the 1984 one to a certain extent. I was here long enough on Molokai to have been a part of that one. What I don't understand is, is this meeting a part of the process?

CHAIR TAVARES: Yes.

MS. C. AKI: Thank you. Because sometimes I don't get that impression that we're still participating in the process. Okay, and the reason why is the October 2001 meeting when the 600-foot buffer was introduced, I remember that Beverly Pauole Moore was there, I remember that Ron Kimball was there and I remember that DeGray Vanderbilt was there. And when the idea of putting a 600-foot buffer around the entire island was brought forth then none of those people that were on the CAC agreed with that idea and they came out and said that at that time. Okay, but it was voted in. So, was that part of the process?

NOTE: Silence.

MS. C. AKI: Okay. So, we're, we're still in the process. We're still participating. We're still--but if it was changed in October of 2000, do you folks still have the capability

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

to, to change it today? And that's part of the process? Okay. Now, I understand the process. We're still in the process. Okay. Thank you. Having said all of that I am still participating in the process. Okay. I'd like to say that when I participated in the process in the previous time when it was being developed, I was kind of like on a different side than I am now. Okay, and at that time, there was a lot of things going on in the community. We were all going around yelling, hooray for Robin Hood and his merry men, because there was a lot of things going on the side. You know a lot of oh, I think there was fence cutting and there was fires here and fires there and that kind of stuff, and those were kind of things that--and there was a meeting in which, you know, they bought out the spears and they danced the dance and a lot of people were intimidated. I remember the people going home from that meeting being intimidated.

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. C. AKI: So, I think that, you know, I don't feel intimidated tonight. You know whether I felt intimidated then I don't feel intimidated tonight. I feel tonight that we've all had a chance to say what we feel, mean what we say and, and feel good about how we feel and I thank you folks very much for that. You know we don't have, you know, people yelling, we don't have people screaming, we don't have angry voices, we have people saying they love Molokai. We just don't necessarily have a balance and I'd like to see a balance between production and service industries. When I was younger, I've been there done that, did red dirt. I worked hard, people thought I had red hair but that was just Hoolehua red dirt. You know, I've done my time in the hard work, the lepo. You know, I've been there I've done that. I want to move into something that's a little bit comfortable--

MR. BOTEILHO: Four minutes.

MS. C. AKI: --and so, we need the balance between production and service. Thank you very much, 2001.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . . *(applause)* . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, the next group is: Lehua Hamai, Eugene Santiago, Judy Capari. . . Caparida, Tim Leong, and Leo. . . Leonida Molina. You walked fast, thank you.

MS. HAMAI: . . . *(laughter)* . . . We wanted 95 times. My name is Lehua Fern Hamai. This is Crystal Kanemitsu and my boyfriend Ty Kanemitsu. So, to make her job easier she's going to go first.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MISS KANEMITSU: Aloha, my name is Crystal Kanemitsu. I'm 14 years old. I'm a sophomore at Molokai High School. Being a teenager at first, I wanted the big city style for Molokai, cruising the malls but then with the help of ohana, extended ohana, I realized how special Molokai is. But the thing is when you in Hawaii we need the tourism. People depend on the tourism but we don't need Molokai to turn into a big city and I also heard a lot of things mentioned about Molokai Ranch. This is not being for Molokai Ranch, not being against Molokai Ranch. This is about people's jobs and their lives and that's why I have to say I support the 2001 Matrix.

MS. HAMAI: I'm so proud of here. I didn't have to tell her what to say. She actually didn't want to come. It is important for all of us to inform not just the people of Molokai but for next, the next generation and it makes me proud and I'm sure it makes her dad proud that she can come before you--the people that she hasn't voted yet for--but she can come before you and speak from her heart. So, she's right on but I have some things to say and that's why I made her go first. Okay. I'm not from Molokai. I'm actually born and raised in Kailua but I've been here for almost six years and I stood before you, all of you on March 8th. This is my second time. Now, the question this gentleman--I'm sorry I don't know your name. Dan?

COUNCILMEMBER KANE: Dain.

MS. HAMAI: Dain. Sorry. You asked Kenny Ching a question. We were given and who are we?--is Molokai Ranch people--were given the Matrix and I still possess one in my hands. We weren't part of this Matrix but you know what they informed us. They talked to us. They gave us. We took it home; we looked it over. We only pointed out the ones that we were concerned about. The 600-foot buffer, the effects that it will have on the island of Molokai. See, the people here on Molokai we're very strong. This is one thing I've learned living here. The people of Molokai is strong in voice. We make the difference. Molokai is based on the people. The companies just provide jobs for us. We are Molokai. I am for the Matrix 2000 [*sic*] because we all need our jobs, that's what it's based on. The livelihood; the economy; the jobs; the small businesses; as well as the big businesses; and it comes--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. HAMAI: --down to family. Whoa, that was fast. You know and that's what it comes down too. You know, I love where I live. I don't want to go back to Honolulu. I've got my family here. I want to stay here. I want to have a job here and we have to compromise, that's what it comes down to. It's compromising. Everybody has their opinions. Everyone has their right. I want choice. I don't want somebody else making the choice of me moving back and I surely want her

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

to have a choice to move here, I mean, to stay here or to go on but she will have a home here and that's going to be her choice, nobody else's. Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. And--

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: --thank you, Crystal, for staying up so late to share with us. She really should be in bed she has school tomorrow I think. Eugene Santiago?

MR. E. SANTIAGO: Waited long time. Members of the Council, people of the Molokai, aloha.

?: (spoke from the audience) Aloha.

MR. E. SANTIAGO: My name is Eugene Santiago, a native resident of Molokai, and I wish not to offend anyone with my testimony nor do I have any intentions of insulting myself. And since we have heard many testimonies I wish not to repeat what anyone else has already said rather I would just like to humbly offer some alternatives that I trust we can all benefit from. And, and really I'm not, I'm, I haven't resolved with either the Matrix or the community plan 'cause I not really fully familiar with all of its contents. And so, I trust that those who have come before me already have provided good input and I trust that you folks will make the right decisions for the people of Molokai. My testimony is not about what I want--and this going be kind of little bit different testimony really but just kind of bear with me--or what we want or what they want, rather it's what about God wants. I'd like to quote scriptures from II Chronicle Chapter 7 verse 14, *if my people, who are called by my name, will humble themselves and pray and seek my face and turn from their wicked ways then I will hear from heaven and I will forgive their sins and heal their land.* And I believe this is what we all need at this very moment, healing. Another scripture I'd like to quote is Matthew 6:33, *seek ye first the kingdom of God and all his righteousness and all these things shall be added unto you.* We really need to trust in God to provide all our needs. All this trying to be dependent on either Molokai Ranch, government, or whoever but only we get one provider. But more than trust, we need to pray and believe that, that he will bless us abundantly. Let us thank him and praise him for all that he's already blessed us with and will continue to bless us with if we put him first. And I'm not sure if we opened this meeting with prayer 'cause I came late but I'd like to close my testimony in prayer and would like to ask all of you kind of just pray with me. *Heavenly Father, you are the creator and savior has blessed us so much and we thank you and praise you for all your good gifts. We thank you, Lord, for all the people on Molokai and all the love that they have for one another. We thank you for all that you've provided us with each day. We thank you, Lord, for the opihi, the he'e, the lobster, the a'ama, the moi, the awholehole, the manini, the palani, the kala, the papio, the olua, the menpachi, the o'ama, the weke, the*

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

halalu, the akule, the limu, the hihiwai, the o'opu, the banana, the papaya, the sweet potato, the kalo, the olu, the mangoes, the avocados, the pariya, the kalamurungay, the eggplant, the okra, the pigs, the deer, the cattle, and so much, much more that our cup spill over. And we pray especially for healing in our lives and in our land in Jesus name. Amen.

AUDIENCE: Amen . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Poor, Judy, you have to follow that.

MS. CAPARIDA: That's fine.

CHAIR TAVARES: But I, I am going to give you the prize for the most beautiful penmanship in your sign up sheet.

MS. CAPARIDA: Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: I could read this name very, very easily. Thank you.

MS. CAPARIDA: Thank you. Aloha, my name is Judy, kupuna Judy Caparida and this is my sister Ruth Manu and oh, and. . .(laughter). . .and our oldest, older kupuna Aunty Napua Kaupu.

?: Aloha mai.

MS. CAPARIDA: Aloha. We're in support of Glenn Teves and Aunty Yola Forbes testimony. And the thing for me is that, like Dain asked the brother how long did they take to make that plans 2001, and he said they had two meetings. Now, I hope that you all would consider that these took many years to make which was from 1994 'til now. Now, in this short time they don't expect you to make miracles. You folks should consider because there's a lot of loopholes in this plan. The plan here is not all guaranteed. They had a chance to give our people jobs you know that. They did have a chance. They screwed up. Now, that Kaluakoi said they want to open up, you buy that you better not BS. You better make sure you do it because the people will hold you to it. That is what we want. If they want to come out see us, you know what's wrong. Not pono. When you not pono on Molokai, you will never make it. That's what my dad told me. He said my girl if you do anything do it righteously, even if you have to hurt your friend by standing for the truth. Tell `em, and that's why I'm saying to all of you. I tell you because you have to make research, which took a lot of time to make this plan come out. To take his advice which are messed up. Hey, poor management no blame us. We not the one that when go make the mess for them. We trying to clean it up. We trying to get everything that we need for our children but if we sit down hooponopono and make it right, I know we can work it out but until then we will never do it. I don't care what help they get, God is the

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

only one. He's our weakness; he's our provider; he's the blesser [*sic*] of everything that we have on Molokai. And it's not come from man, it comes from him, he's the boss. So, that's what I needed to say. We love God, you cannot do nothing. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(*applause*). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Tim Leong?

MR. LEONG: My . . .my name is Tim Leong and believe it or not, I was a member of the 1994 Community Advisory Committee that worked on this original draft. So, I'm one of those members here and I'm sure DeGray gave a little cross section of the other people that were involved. And as you heard him say, it was quite a, you know, interesting cross section of the community I mean it wasn't like it was heavily weighted one side or another and we went through a process. We met, we discussed, and, you know, we went over a lot of different things and what you have in front of you was one the items that came out of it. And I agree that, no plan is ever going to satisfy everybody but given the time we had and what we had worked with, that was the best that we could do. Now, that was in 1994, okay, and this community plan actually goes through a ten-year review process. So, come 2004 do we go through this process all over again? And I'm saying if we do, something is wrong. I mean, you know, we even haven't adopted the plan that we worked on in '94 and it's 2001 now. So, my recommendation is this, okay, I would say adopt the majority of the CAC's plan. Okay. Some items you might not agree with and fine, I mean this is the process but to come in and wholesaling(?) change this process at the eleventh hour, undermines this whole community and what they went through over the past years. So, if somebody were to come and, and say to me, hey I've been appointed to work on the CAC for the 2004 plan, you know, what's your manao on that? And I would say, well, you know, I don't know. I've got mixed feelings about it because, you know, it's taken so long that by the time it has become adopted, you know, things have changed drastically. And I can tell you this in the eight years or seven years since 1994 'til now, we have not had a community plan that has been adopted. We're still working with the 1984 community plan. Now, this hasn't hampered, you know, the job situation and our economy of the island. I mean, not having a plan hasn't, you know, said hey, I mean we don't have a plan, you know, our economy is going down the tubes, we need a plan now. That, that--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. LEONG: --that that didn't happen and I'm saying, you know, our economy went down for a different reason. I don't, I can't really put my finger on the, on the pulse of what that reason was but, you know, it went downhill and irregardless of what plan we had in place, you know, it went through a decline. So, I'm saying it's, what I'm saying is this is, you know, don't throw out everything and, you

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

know, throw in something else. I, I, I feel that's not the right approach to take at this point in time, you know. Approve the plan that we worked on, make some minor modifications if you will but, you know--

MR. BOTEILHO: Four minutes.

MR. LEONG: --you know, you got a big job ahead of you. Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Leonida Molina, are you here? Okay. Scott Adams, Barbara Kalipi, William Kalipi, Zessica Apiki, and KanoHo Helm. If any of you are here, please come now.

MR. ADAMS: Aloha mai, my name is Scott Kaohanehonokowainani(?) Adams. I'm a third generation Hawaiian homesteader . . .(spoken in Hawaiian). . . You know before I get started, for the people of Molokai I just like to say e kala mai ia'u, forgive me if I offend anybody, that's not why I came here for. I came here for share my mana'o and try give you one, the other side of the coin. I went away college everything. I born and raised on Molokai. I never choose the nine to five. I when choose the sunup to sundown life of one farmer. This has been my goal since I was this high for be one farmer. I too, am a small, small business owner and up until about two years ago, I had one farm that I ran for nine years. We employed about two other people, small kind. But as Hawaiians yeah we give, we give, we give 'til no more nothing. Our water. I used to raise fish up in Hoolehua now a'ole. No more fish up there anymore. We gave plenty of our water for water golf courses which Kaluakoi still owe, owe us water and money for that we still yet no more. Also, too this. . .I don't know where this thing came out island-wide. When first came out was only undeveloped areas and I think Mr. Hokama might have got that mistaken or something mixed up but it's not island-wide, what was just for the undeveloped areas. 'Cause I would be against one island-wide buffer zone around the whole island. But. . .right now, I get plenty heavy in my heart because it's like it's pitting our way of life or my way of life with my brothers and sisters way of life, yeah. Like some people came up and they said oh, we promoting drugs and unemployment, that's not true I not the devil. I just like everybody else we struggling trying for work. This is what I know. I only know how for work the, work the land. I don't how for bed bedsheets or scrub toilets. This is all I know. In this day and age, we gotta diverse the farm, diversify our economic base. I know Mr. Kane was talking about the service-orientated side. How many years the State been going through this ups and downs with the tourist industry. It's time we diversify our economic base and if you read the whole book, not just look at the front cover of what the EC is doing, it provides for all of these different integral components. People talk

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

about lifestyle. I remember sitting in meetings four or five years ago and Harold Edwards telling us--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. ADAMS: --35,000 people going be living here. Now, where does that leave me? Everybody going have their nine to five. What about the bruddahs who like, like the sunup to sundown. Where that going leave us? I derive 40 percent of my food from the aina, you know, we all no more big money over here so we go holoholo, we collect food from the aina like that. Forty percent. Thirty-five thousand people here; no way we going be able to do that. We going lose one whole way of life. . .lifestyle. Molokai is unique. We should be marketing that uniqueness, not trying for homogenize everything and make, you know--they saying oh, we no like one Waikiki but again look at the whole picture, read the whole book. Harold Edwards had stated to us many times that 35,000 people is the goal for the island of Molokai. Gentlemen estates are the goal for the west side of the island. Do we want our children to be servants? Not me.

MR. BOTEILHO: Four minutes.

MR. ADAMS: I like see my children be productive, I mean, not well, produce products and not just folding bedspreads and wash. . .washing toilets. Anyway, again e kala mai ia'u, forgive me. I love everybody. A hui ho.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Barbara Kalipi?

MS. B. KALIPI: Aloha, Council Members. I just want to make two, two comments really about the community plan. One, really is an observation and, you know, in my field, I'm a social worker by training, observation and listening is really important skills. So, I want to share some observations from tonight's hearing so far. Actually, I really heard a community that is not as divided as, as it seems. I did hear on both sides how much people love this island. I did hear from both sides how much people love their families. I did hear from both sides how much people care for each other and want us all to work together and not to be divisive. I heard from both sides that everybody is concerned about jobs and the sustainable employment for this community. So, in my mind and in my observations and in my heart, I don't believe that this community is that divided and I, and I again I, I stress that from my observation, I believe we have the capacity to, to pull together because I heard that again from both sides. They don't want to be divisive. For me it is important that community be involved. If we take responsibility, then we have to be involved and I give credit to all the

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

people who spoke today. But from my heart, I have to say that if we want as a community to build that vision that we all said we wanted in our testimony tonight, then we all gotta take responsibility to, to participate throughout the process. I give again credit for everybody who came out tonight and spoke their testimony but I gotta say honestly too, that it is at the tail end of the process. The meat of the, of the plan was developed way back a number of years ago. It sat for whatever reasons and then it's brought out, and then now we are faced with having to make a decision on one night's testimony. That's how I feel in my guts because it's been so long I don't know how much everybody remembers from the process. And so, I, I speak to that and, and with that in mind, I, you know, have to say that I do support the community action, community plan as it was developed by that, by those folks and I, but I, I do say also that, I think there is still opportunity for us to work together as a community. And I, I, I truly invite, you know, all of us to try to work together as we've, we've all said because I think that we are a community that desires that and we do truly have pretty much the same vision. And--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. B. KALIPI: --the last thing, the second thing I'd like to say is that, the second concern I would have is. . .that we not just look at one part of the plan. It is a comprehensive community plan that address recreational needs, health needs, the environment, as well as employment, and so did that second process in 1998 with the EC. And I believe that we again as a community cannot only look at one, we gotta look at the whole and we gotta participate and I take some responsibility as a member of this community that I did not discuss enough with people, you know, that work for the Ranch. And I aloha them because they're my family and their friends but I have to speak for my family, too. So, it is a struggle but I believe this community can pull it together. So, I thank you for giving us that opportunity.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: William Kalipi, Jr.?

MR. W. KALIPI, JR.: Aloha, my name is William Kalipi, Jr. I just like, I just like explain `em like, like one farmer or, you know, for the--so to speak. When a farmer grows something he grows `em from one seed and then he makes the tree pop out and the roots grow deep. That's how I look at the '94 Matrix, you know, it was, it was started from one seed that the thing growing up right now. The thing going be strong when the wind comes and if get hurricane but we have another matrix it's, it's called the 2001 Matrix which was graft which can fruit so faster but the roots is not tied down to the soil. So, it's not really tied to the, to the people

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

I'm saying. So the, the maybe the fruit going be, going be faster but when the first Iniki hits it's gone. It's dead. So, I like you really think about how this whole process went and I, I like bag up that '94 Matrix that the thing came down from deep from the roots from, from this community and, you know, not from one graft tree or from someplace else. The '94 Matrix I, I hope you guys support that. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Zessica Apiki? KanoHo Helm?

MR. KANOHO HELM: Hello, my name is KanoHo Wailuku(?) Helm. I came here because I concerned about my community, my island, my family. I oppose the Ranch 2001 Matrix. I think it's going to be a destruction to our aina, to our water, to our lifestyle. I going be here, unemployed, employed, sick, lame. I going die on this island no matter what, nothing going make me move away from here. I going find one way for survive and I going find one way for my family for survive over here. Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, next we have: Kekama Helm, Sammi Kaai, Kyle Juaris [sic], Wayde Lee. If any of you are here please come forward. I noticed we stopped using the chairs up here, so it's very difficult for me to tell who's here and who's not here. So, If you want to come forward and at least hang out near the microphone it would help. Okay, Kekama, go ahead.

MR. KEKAMA HELM: Aloha, Kekama Helm. I just like to say I'm in support of the existing community plan and not in support of the 2001 Matrix. Mahalo.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Sammi Kaai?

MS. KAAI: Aloha. Thank you for being here so late. My name is Sammi Kaai. Please forgive me if I shed some tears but it's, it's a sketchy position we're in. I shed tears for my, my kids and my, my kids' futures. I understand where my fellow brothers and sisters who want to keep Molokai, Molokai but how? I'm, I'm not a farmer, I, I'm--you not going catch me in the taro patch, you not going--I don't want to deprive my children and send them into the taro patch or send them out to the ocean to feed themselves. I want them to live the life that I live. I want, I want them to prosper on this island. In ten years, my son going make the decision if he wants to be here or not and I hope he tell me, ma, I stay with you; I

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

take care you; I going live here on Molokai because get jobs. And this Matrix going give them hope, going give them future. We gotta malama each other. We gotta work together. I'm a taxpayer, you know, please I don't want to insult anybody but grant money come off of taxpaying money and if I don't have a job, they don't have tax, they won't get grants. We need each other. We can, we can preserve our culture. I do mine when I go up into the mountain and I exercise my gathering rights to participate in Aloha Week festivities. I preserve my culture when I dance my awana and my kahiko and I teach my kids to do the same. We can work together but I don't want to deprive my children. I don't want to deprive any of my fellow workers. Yes, I work for the Ranch but I'm not here for the Ranch. I'm here for myself, for my family, for the next generations to come. I'm a homesteader but if I don't have a job, I won't be able to build my house for my children. I won't have a place to call home anymore. We're in so much hardship and if we work together, you know, in preserving our land and yet moving forward for growth, we can control our growth. We can, we can control what happens here. We just need that hope and that matrix going give us hope to proceed into the future for my kids, for my boyfriend's kids, for all these people who have kids. I want them to stay here. I want them to learn what all my fellow brothers and sisters in the back there know and what I know but I like that hope for the future. I want to be able to call this place home for the rest of my life and for my kids and their kids to call home, Molokai home. I support the Matrix because I don't want to deprive my children. I don't, I don't want them to have to suffer. I want them to live--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. KAAI: --lives. And in closing, we can work together, we can preserve our heritage. We can do all that if we just malama each other, come together, make an agreement. I want you guys to teach my kids how to build fishponds. I want them to learn everything they have to learn about the Hawaiian culture but I want them to have a future here. I don't want to send my kids off. Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . . (applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Kyle Juaris [sic]?

MR. JUARIO: Whew, it's been a long night. Aloha, Members of the Board, Council Members, people of Molokai. I hope I don't offend anybody out here but I'm an employee of the Ranch but I came here to speak from my heart.

CHAIR TAVARES: _____ your name.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

MR. JUARIO: My name is Kyle Ikaika Juario, oh, excuse me, Bishaw Juario. I was just married couple months ago . . . *(laughter)* . . .

AUDIENCE: . . . *(laughter)* . . .

MR. JUARIO: Currently, there is a law in place which allows the residents of Molokai to access the west side of Molokai. I for one, take advantage of this privilege. So, every so often I throw on my tabis, backpack my throw net and I take an hour, hour and half walk down to La'au Point. You guys can pop up the screen? No can.

MR. BOTEILHO: No can, I . . . *(inaudible)* . . . already.

MR. JUARIO: Oh, well. Okay. Well, La'au Point, down at La'au Point there's this concrete piling, it's an old concrete piling. I think it's a lighthouse that was once, that once stood there and I sit there and I look into the ocean and to my left I see a holehole; one school a holehole. I look out on the point and I see some enenu and I look to my right and get some moi. So, basically I'm thinking, you know, what I like eat for dinner. And so, then I stop and think about Hale o Lono and remember the times when Hale o Lono was just like that, and I remember the stories that my dad and my uncles used to tell me about Papohaku beach. How the moi and the o'io used to cover the shoreline like a blanket and today it's a different story. Today there is nothing. Then I wonder, will it be like this tomorrow or the next time I come back here. Then I hear this 125 foot lateral shoreline access and this 600-foot buffer, I don't really know what it means. All I know is I hear lateral shoreline access and I mean how much land you need for access. You know, all I do is walk in with my throw net, all I need is a path that by, for get into these areas. And when I think of this 125-foot lateral shoreline access, I think of cars going inside filling their trucks with fish, with lobster, everything, just the raping the resources we have out there and they leave. It's a sad, you know, it's just grim reality. You know it's not the people the landowners, it's not the tourist that come here, it's us the local people who lives on this island that do that. We are the majority. If I was to give bruddah man, right here, one throw net--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. JUARIO: --and tell him go catch one fish. You think he can go out there and can get `em? No, we the people, we know how to fish. We know how to hunt this fish and we know how to gather this fish. I hear a lot of people say malama o ke kai, take care of the ocean. Do we truly understand what that means? I ask you this question. If we go out there and we catch one lobster everyday or we go out there and catch a thousand pounds of lobster in one season, who is breaking the law? Okay, who's breaking the law? So, I'd say delete this 125 buffer zone and

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

600-foot buffer. The kupunas teach me malama o ke kai, to love the sea. They also teach me to practice what you preach.

MR. BOTEILHO: Four minutes.

MR. JUARIO: I believe I haven't mastered the idea of malama o ke kai, so I do not preach that. Okay, for you landowners, in you I place my faith. I believe in you guys that you guys will do the right thing and utilize your land wisely. Okay, God has blessed you with this great gift, he can take it away. Mahalo.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Wayde Lee? Thank you, Wayde.

MR. LEE: Good evening, Madam Chair. Aloha, Council, my name is Wayde Lee and I'm here to testify. You know why it takes a long time to look to plant because you got to step back and look the forest. Bruddah said the tree get strong roots but then you gotta step back, how much more trees going grow out of that tree and you gotta know what are the environmental impacts upon that tree to make it grow to come to a forest. And I going say this right now, I'm a homesteader Lot 65, me and my wife. Hawaiian homestead is illegally pumping water to me. Any new homesteader going get. . .no more water. No more water, that's the truth. Hawaiian Homes know that. Everybody over pumping over here so we got to step back and what is the impact? Yeah, the job; the fruit. That's true but right now I no more water, and I cannot support any other progress until my house legally get water. And if you think that's a lie, call Hawaiian Homes find out. They tell you they is over pumping. They--any infrastructure on this island from now on is over pumping. We at the limit. Kaluakoi was over pumping. I get one thing for the bruddah from Kaluakoi who's buying. Aloha, my name is Wayde. If you figure `em out, everybody who never work with the community, and I mean the community that opposes, never went through. The first guy who going sit down with them and work out one plan, going be the winner, going take all the eggs. I promise you that. Many good ideas came out. Do one dialysis [*sic*]. We cannot, we cannot compete with the Hyatt. There's no way. Thirty percent occupancy right now. You do one dialysis [*sic*] give this community half of the--get even the tourists during the day, get the tourists during the night--now, we specifying what kind tourists we going service. We good in help. You see how we take care of our family. They good service people who work for the Ranch, I know that, but we gotta see where we want to go. You know I told the Governor that he laugh. Look who laughing now. So, I say all the things that going down, we no more water. We need to step back and really--cannot just add on and say oh, it's a great idea, here's the candy eat it now. That's what we did to our kids. Here's the microwave. We like instant. Our generation nowadays so instant they

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

want it now, but all you old timers down here you know when you get instant what happen? You guys know, I don't have to say nothing. Last year, when I was here it was about. . .(end of tape, start 4B). . . to make the decision. Go back, make one committee, go get all the brothers over here and all the brothers over here, and let them make the decision. Let them figure out. Yeah, I one taxpayer but you know what's more important to you guys, I'm a voter. That's what's important and I trust all of you. Yeah, give Molokai back so they have the ownership, and you know what, sit in so you can hear who telling the truth. Who really wants to compromise? A lot of guys say we want to compromise.

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. LEE: I sat in the meetings with a lot of them. No more compromise. Here's my plan, you know--oh, you no like work with us. You no work with us so what you going do? They charge me with abusing somebody. That's not my life. They go to court and say I abuse one archeologist in court. That I, that I when assault, excuse me, assault. That's the kind low action get over here. All I like is the truth. You like compromise. I think a lot of people are ready for the truth but make one committee. No be akua. Have the--Molokai own up to what they have to say 'cause then when the decision come out you say, we never made it you made it Molokai. You guys all in the clear voting time. Check `em off. I just wanted to mahalo for my time and thank all of you for paying attention but I like water for my kids right now. I like be legal and all the homesteaders no more water and any other infrastructure on this island no more water. Go do your homework before you come over here and do things. No more water. Mahalo.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Wayde.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, we have: Debra Mapel, Buzzy Sproat, and Walter Ritte.

MS. MAPEL: Hello, and welcome back. I know it's late and I'll try, try to condense this some more. Tonight, we're talking about the community plan and we know that the impact this will have on our island's future. There is an, also an impact by not moving this process on. It has been good, very good to see the community getting informed, learning of the choices, and hearing each other and as hard as it is for you to make these decisions, it's just as difficult for us to come here and speak in favor of one issue over another. Planning is what this is all about and I have to borrow this article from the newspaper 'cause it says right here, planning is the design of an environment to accommodate people. It's an impossible ideal. There really is no accounting for people, there are to many of them. Planning can take into account materials, terrain, gallons of water, numbers of vehicles. It is hard, it is a hard time taking into account what a diverse population of people thinks, and, you know, that's very clear here tonight. When we talk

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

about the process, I remember last October when we sat here for three nights. Three nights we went through this line-by-line and we went through the text and so, I'm, I'm wondering what happened to the process, you know. We, we already spent three nights on this and actually, we have to thank Mr. Hokama for that one inclusion because that's what kind of really woke this community up. So, now we've spent two more very long evenings and, you know, I do serve on the Molokai Planning Commission and we need to move this on. It, you know, the decision is not easy. As you know we, we're going to have to go to a review, people can come and ask for a plan amendment, but if we don't move this thing on and get it done, we can never move on to the next step of improving the whole process. Right now, we're just stuck and you're stuck, the Planning Commission is stuck, this island is stuck and as difficult as this is going to be we've just go to do it and, you know, deal with it as it goes. There's one other thing that I wanted to mention, and we talk about people who provide services and I think a lot of us are thinking in terms of services to the visitor industry. Well, I'm in the health care profession and we service the people who work in the service industry. Okay. Health care on this island in the '70s was dismal, and to get professionals in the healthcare field or actually in a lot of fields to move to an area where the economy is just not happening. I mean, first and foremost, we are a business, we do provide healthcare but if our business is failing it doesn't matter how good you are you're out of business. On this island right now--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MS. MAPEL: --oh, I'm sorry. On this island right now, people have lost their jobs, lost their benefits. Healthcare goes back on the shelf and healthcare is going downhill. And those of us who moved here in the 70s to address the medical need we're all going to be retiring, I don't know how, you know, we're going to get new people to come to this island unless there's a future here. A spouse needs a job. They might not be in the healthcare but they need jobs and, you know, I hate to just keep stressing jobs, jobs, jobs but that's the only way you get money, you know. So, you know, this, this is affecting everybody not just the tourist industry. So, my message to you tonight is bite the bullet, move forward. You have got to make a decision. Thank you.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Debra. Buzzy Sproat? Okay. Walter Ritte?

MR. RITTE: Aloha, Madam Chairman, Councilmen, Councilwoman. Thank you so much for coming. When I walked in I ran into Joey at the door and I said, Joey this look familiar? And he said, yeah over and over and over and over. For some of you new Councilmen and Councilwoman, this is nothing new and we've done this many times before where there's a wedge driven into this community and then you get family talking against family, and people calling each other,

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

blaming each other, and going through this whole process of laying their, their guts out on, on the microphone trying to convince you one way or the other. And it's interesting 'cause we have one major landowner here and another major landowner. . .owner over there and the style that this landowner has chosen has really put a lot of pressure on this community. I mean the style is to divide us and always confrontational and all that kind of stuff and I don't know how that's good for business. I don't know how you can do business by dividing up your community. I just as a businessperson cannot understand and I'd like to see--

CHAIR TAVARES: Walter, you're going run out of time, so could you get to your, just of your presentation tonight.

MR. RITTE: Oh, yeah, yeah. Okay.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you.

MR. RITTE: So, I'm trying to figure out why, why we were mad at each other and doing all this kind of stuff and it's because at the last minute, after we tried to work together through a process of six years, at the last minute there's this wedge that's driven in. Why? Why are we doing all of this? So, I look at the Matrix that we talking about. The CAC Matrix and that's what I handed out to you. The CAC Matrix has 57 items. Out of those 57 items, 32 items more than half of the CAC Matrix is things that the Ranch wanted. They lobbied all those years to get these 32 items in there. More than half of the plan belongs to Molokai Ranch whether it's west end or central or Kalae or wherever. So, then I asked myself then what's the beef? They got 32 items, more than half, and they lost one. They can't get their golf course. . .that's, that's the beef. They didn't like the things that the public want, they don't want--the public wants to walk around west end. They don't like that idea. No lateral access. The 600-foot but they don't want that, that's something that the public wants. So, they don't want two things that's beneficial to the public but for the, for the business--this plan is supposed to be anti-business, it's supposed to be putting people out of work--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. RITTE: --and yet they got everything they wanted to do their business. Look at this list, 32 of the items they got `em. They should be able to do their business. The only thing they didn't get is their golf course and they said the same thing about the hotel. Without the hotel, we're not going to be able to do it, and they went around the process and they got their hotel and now, they're doing the same thing again. After the other one we met, everybody holding signs yelling at each other for the hotel. Now, we're doing that for the golf course. So, I'm saying enough. Like everybody saying enough. Let's go with the process that we set up and finish this process where we all work together, so we can all learn to work together. So, if this gentleman is going to come and spend some money--

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

-he can't do it with a divided community--and your process is the process that keeps our community together. So, let's honor that process.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you, Walter.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(applause)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Okay, returning to conclude his testimony, Lawrence Aki. And you have three minutes only.

AUDIENCE: . . .*(laughter)*. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: I know you were trying to cut your wife off over there. I don't know if she knows that you were making all these signs.

MR. L. AKI: I thought when I come at the end I get ten. But anyhow, first and foremost, wanting to complete what I was trying to emphasize at the beginning. The community plan as is, I disagree with Walter as to what Walter is saying first and foremost, 'cause the way that the community plan is written it is very much not business friendly especially when you're down zoning properties. 'Cause if that was my property and it was zoned for hotel like that of in the Kaluakoi area and you were taking that away from me, I would definitely not be happy about that. So, I disagree with the fact that the community plan as is should be passed. I'm glad to hear--well, that's one part I was happy about my wife clarifying--that this is still part of the process and for that reason we have the opportunity to be part of this process. I don't care how late in the game we are because in truth of the matter I was part of the process at the beginning. And so--and I'm still here, I always have been--and so, for this reason I keep saying the same thing. I did it when it first started back in 1994. We gotta create a situation here whereby business have a chance. Now, let me be very honest, everybody tip toe around everybody but in truth of the matter you could pick up outside magazines, you go read the article about what Walter said that's why our industry, the visitors industry is dying. But come on let's be honest, let's be truthful, let's say where the blame is. Yes, the other side is very good and that's why as far as Eddie is concerned he hit it on the nose but that's not what I'm here for tonight. Alright. What I want to say is the golf course will basically entice an investor when looking at purchasing Molokai Ranch. I've been in the industry for 25 years. In the 25 years I've worked at the Kaluakoi Hotel, I felt very bad when many of those people lost their jobs because many of them were hired by me. And yet, when I was there and in the different other areas that I've been in the visitors industry, I've always heard people or visitors that come here tell me, would be great if you had a second golf course then instead of spending one day they would spend two or three days here on the island of Molokai because of having a second option. Now, we know all the plus and minuses as far as golf course, so I don't have to tell you that. We know those that have failed and those that have

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

done well. It has been shared with you as to how the water was going to be used for that golf course. One thing, I will say that I do agree with this Councilmember Kane that golf course better not be taking any potable water. I agree with that 100 percent. We have not a lack--

MR. BOTEILHO: Three minutes.

MR. L. AKI: --of water, not a shortage of water. We have water. Don't get fooled with the fact we don't have water. We do.

CHAIR TAVARES: Lawrence, you're at your three minutes. You're done. Thank you.

MR. L. AKI: And I thank you. Alright.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you very much.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause). . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Is there anyone here who signed up to testify but did not have a chance to testify yet? John, I see you're here. I know you had to leave for a meeting, so at this time, I'll call you up. Is there anyone else who signed up to testify that has not yet testified? Please come, come forward. Thank you. Go ahead, John.

MR. KIKUKAWA: John Kikukawa, fulltime resident, born on Molokai. I was part of the Planning Commission when we reviewed the community plan. I don't really want to talk about the issues. What I wanted to talk about was Lei Kalipi talked about the things that we have in common, we all spoke about--and her husband Tubs(?)--what we have in common is that we care to keep our people on the island. We care about having a diverse economy. And when I was going through the plan with the other commissioners, I disagreed with some of things in it. Our strengths lie in the, in the people that we have here and you said to make it short and agree with things and that people had put well and I don't want to reinvent the wheel. We do have tourism and it did work. We had plantations and it did work, and we had good in-between the economy for a while and it did work. In the plan, Mister, I guess, Hokama put in making everything that 600-foot buffer of the whole island, you know, only I kind of agreed with him because no matter a big landowner or a small landowner, what's good for one is good for all. And that's what our nation is based on. I'd rather not see that buffer and I am, I'm not going into business. I'm talking about myself. I'm not going into business 'cause my business did not bring any money onto the island. I used the money that went around and my father's suggestion or counsel was don't go into business. When Big Daddy's opened up, the Icehouse closed down. The same dollar. So, I support the fishpond people; I support the farmers; I support Molokai Ranch; I support the small businessmen here. I have three daughters, I want one to come

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

back. I don't expect all three to come back. Give everybody a chance. I don't fully support the old plan 'cause I didn't when it was going through and I don't fully support the Matrix 2001. A combination is good. What. . .whatever you do for a small landowner, whatever you do for the, the fishermen or the farmer or the businessmen or the hotel person, do it for everybody. Make it equal. Give everybody a chance and I thank you for staying late and I don't envy you guys position. Good luck and thank you for your time.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. State your name.

MR. WEEKS: Hi, my name Michael Weeks.

CHAIR TAVARES: Wait a minute, Michael Weeks?

MR. WEEKS: Michael Weeks.

CHAIR TAVARES: Did you sign up? I don't have your name on this list.

MR. WEEKS: Yeah, I turned my paper in. I don't know what happened.

CHAIR TAVARES: Well, go ahead and do your testimony and sign up afterwards.

MR. WEEKS: Okay, my name Michael Weeks, 25 years old. I live in Kawela and yeah, I'm pretty young yet I only 25 years old but in my time, I seen our mountain get drier and drier and drier. And just not to long ago, me and my brother over there we went go up the mountain, take a ride in the Suzuki. Was dry to the end of the road. Never in my life I see `em dry and went all the time, all the time before, three times a day if I had too. Just go up the mountain go holoholo, enjoy life. And it's dry, you can see `em from down here. All dry. So, plenty people saying get plenty water, make some more golf course, make some more golf course but I don't think that's the truth. With our own plain eyes we can see `em up there. No more water. No more even forest anymore. The forest stay way down east end side. So, I support the original community plan, not Molokai Ranch's new whatever they get, but no more water for make golf course and that's, that's just plain and simple you can see `em with your own eyes. Thank you.

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you. Michael, can you sign up, please.

AUDIENCE: . . .(applause) . . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Thank you very much. Okay, at this time, Members, we are going to close testimony formally.

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

. . .END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

CHAIR TAVARES: Do any members have any comments they'd like to make at this time? Okay, I just have two comments. I want to thank you first of all, all of you and even the ones who had to leave for coming out to participate and to share with us. It's really heartening to see so many people care so deeply about their island. I think that was quite obvious tonight. Secondly, I repeat again that this meeting is going to be recessed 'til 9 o'clock on Maui in the County building 8th floor on Monday, this coming Monday. I heard two things that I, I would like to address a little bit. First, the first thing is that, the process looks like it doesn't work as well as it was designed to work and the fact that here we are in 2001 dealing with a plan that was formed in 1994 is evidence of that if nothing else. The reason that it's taking the plan so long to be adopted is because there has been so much time that lapsed between when the CAC first met and today. The other thing about the process is that, there seems to be a misunderstanding--or it's not a misunderstanding--we are not clear. We don't make it clear the difference between a community plan designation and zoning. None of what we are doing here is zoning. It's community planning. There is another process totally separate from this one that covers zoning and that follows after a community plan is adopted. As far as the process, this is--I'm glad Catherine asked that question--this is part of the process. It's another layer of review. If we only had one layer of review and the plan was adopted, we'd have more problems than we have today. I know that might be hard to believe but it would be. So, this is part of that process. This is a long process. Remember we had the meetings here. We had a public hearing from the Council, it got referred back to my committee--this is what we're doing tonight--from here, this committee will decide at some point in time maybe Monday maybe not to finalize it some more, tweak it some more and send it back to the Full Council. At that time, there will be a first reading and follow two weeks later or so with a second reading. So, there are two more opportunities for people to participate either in person or in writing and that would be at first reading and second reading. So, it's not quite done yet but there is reasons why we take this long as far as the process. CAC, Planning Commission, Planning Department, and the Council, are all part of the process. So, don't exclude us. Okay. We will try our very best. We have our challenges ahead of us. Most of the challenge comes because of the time, 1994 'til today. It's very difficult but I assure you that each of will give very serious consideration to all of the input and try to make decisions that we think and I know it's going to be in our hearts that we think is right for this community. And I want to thank you very much for coming and we'll see you over the air if we don't see you in person, you know, on TV. We'll try to get that on TV for you. So, any other words, Mr. Kawano, you want to say goodnight or anything or good morning.

COUNCILMEMBER KAWANO: Thank you, Madam Chairman. Again, Molokai thank you for staying so late. This is our job and I think the presentation with Harold

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 27, 2001 - Molokai

tonight is great and we do have a lot of corresponding. And I think what the Chairman is doing is right that, we go back to our office and read the correspondence and make a proper decision, and I'm glad that the Chairman would put it on Akaku so Molokai people can see the process. Again, thank you. Good night and God bless.

CHAIR TAVARES: Members, if there is no objection, can we receive the written testimonies that were submitted into the record?

COUNCIL MEMBERS: No objection.

CHAIR TAVARES: No objection. Okay, thank you, Members. This meeting is in recess until 9 o'clock Monday morning, 8th floor, County building . . .(gavel). . .

RECESS: 12:21 a.m.

APPROVED:

CHARMAINE TAVARES, Chair
Planning Committee

pc:min:092701:cls

Transcribed by: Cathy L. Simmons