

MAUI PLANNING COMMISSION

COUNTY OF MAUI

TUESDAY, MAY 19, 2009

MAUI ISLAND PLAN REVIEW

Held at the Planning Department Conference Room,
First Floor, Kalana Pakui Building, 250 South High Street,
Wailuku, Maui, Hawaii, commencing at 9:00 a.m., on Tuesday,
May 19, 2009.

REPORTED BY: CAMMIE GILLET, RPR, CSR #438

ATTENDANCE

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

- Wayne Hedani, Chair
- Bruce U'u, Vice-Chair
- John Guard, Commissioner
- Jonathan Starr, Commissioner
- Kent Hiranaga, Commissioner
- Ward Mardfin, Commissioner
- Lori Sablas, Commissioner
- Warren Shibuya, Commissioner

STAFF PRESENT:

- Jeffrey Hunt, Planning Director
- James Giroux, Deputy Corporation Counsel
- Joy Paredes, Secretary
- Simone Bosco, Staff Planner
- Julia Staley, Staff Planner
- John Summers, Staff Planner
- Dave Michaelson, Staff Planner

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

* * *

CHAIR HEDANI: The Planning Department meeting -- Planning Commission of meeting of May 19th will come to order.

We would like to open it up for public testimony at this time for anyone that would like to testify on any of the items on the agenda. Are there any members of the public that would like to offer testimony at this time? If so, step to the microphone and state your name for the record. Please speak slowly and clearly into the mic.

Gentlemen, where is the mic?

The comments are being transcribed, so you will have to speak slowly.

MS. PERREIRA: Good morning Mr. Hedani, Chair of the Planning Commission and Members of the Planning Commission. My name is Jocelyn Perreira. Hi. I'm the executive director and the trial Main Street program coordinator for the Wailuku Main Street Association, Inc., Tri-Aisle Main Street Resource Center. We have three minutes on this mic, and that's the reason why I am testifying again.

I talked to you folks all in Haiku and I made certain comments. But we only had three minutes, so I really didn't get a good chance to give you a lot of the

information that I circulated this morning in writing. So that's one of the reasons why I'm here this morning, so that you get a little bit more of the information that we were discussing relative to especially the population situation.

I am aware that there are some people from Waihee that came to testify that were concerned. They said they were representing Jan Yagi-Buen. I did talk to Jan. Jan is on the mainland. She will be talking to you later. She and I have been in contact quite a bit, and he did comment -- or listed my name with the Betsill Brothers and the other project.

But actually, Main Street was the proponent expressing concern for meetings to take place in the community with the community by developers. So it's just that gentlemen didn't get their information correct. And Jan Yagi-Buen will be letting you be aware of that. They didn't come on behalf of her. She will be speaking for herself. But I just want to clarify and make it clear to you all that one of the things Main Street strives for is that there are discussion that's do take place in the communities.

We've been assisting various communities throughout this planning process, the latest of which was the Waikapu people, the people of Waikapu. And we worked with the developer to talk about what is good sound, smart planning,

smart growth planning. But we also, one of our main things we told them was you needed to talk to the people of Waikapu and make sure they're aware of these projects as well. And as a result, they are having discussions.

I am meeting with some of the developers in Waihee this week, and I'm going to be stressing it to them once again. They have done a series of surveys to reach out to the community. But I think they need to get a regular meeting so that they can discuss things that are of concern and things they like and things they don't like.

We do know that there is on the list that we feel, the Main Street Association feels there was too much given to Waihee with 155 acres. That much we are on record. We participated and we were at the IRC meetings that was done by the GPAC. And it is too much for that town. It will overwhelm them. But we did put on our maps that Waihee should also have the opportunity for some small amount of development that will help the community to be self-sustainable. But, of course, it is something that the community should discuss amongst itself.

MS. PAREDES: Three minutes.

MS. PERREIRA: Thank you for the opportunity to present testimony this morning. The comments, I think if you take a look at them, they're good general comments as well as specifics.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you, Jocelyn. Are there any
 2 other members of the public that would like to offer
 3 testimony at this time? If so, please step to the
 4 microphone and state your name. We're in public testimony.
 5 Anyone interested in making public testimony, please step
 6 up. Seeing none, public testimony is closed. Thank you.
 7 The first item -- the next item on the agenda is a
 8 Staff presentation of a Draft Maui Island Plan Economic
 9 Development Element. John.
 10 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. We do have
 11 Simone Bosco from the Long Range Division --
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: John, state your name.
 13 MR. SUMMERS: John Summers. So Simone is going to
 14 give you a very short presentation on the Economic
 15 Development Element.
 16 (PowerPoint presentation shown.)
 17 MS. BOSCO: Can you hear me? Good morning,
 18 Commissioners. I have actually the long version and the
 19 short version. And depending on if you want to keep going,
 20 I will. But I'm going to give you kind of a brief overview
 21 of the Economic Development, the section of the chapter that
 22 deals with the goals, policies, objectives and implementing
 23 actions.
 24 And over the course of our work with the
 25 internal -- excuse me, the Review Committee of the GPAC, we

1 actually added two new sections to the original draft. And
 2 I'm going to just kind of briefly go over the structure of
 3 the elements, and then a little bit about the details. And
 4 I'm also going to give you just a couple examples of the
 5 objectives and policies and the kinds of actions that will
 6 reflect the overall themes, okay.
 7 The organization of this element basically falls
 8 into three over-arching themes. There are seven goals in
 9 the section. There are a total of 16 objectives that are
 10 couched underneath each of the sub elements. There are six
 11 sub elements, which I'll get to a little bit later in the
 12 presentation. And the three themes that we're going to be
 13 emphasizing during the -- over the -- in the entire element
 14 would be basically diversification as the central theme;
 15 secondly, sustainability; thirdly, improving the business
 16 climate. And so those are the three over-arching themes,
 17 okay.
 18 And then we have the six sub elements, which are
 19 tourism; agriculture, with a focus on diversified ag;
 20 emerging industries, which includes a number of identified
 21 industries that have been shown to be growth industries
 22 here. We also have a chapter on small business development
 23 to support the small business owners. We have a section on
 24 healthcare, which is one of the new added sub elements. And
 25 also, education and workforce development, which the GPAC

1 identified as a very important aspect of providing for
 2 economic stimulus and growth and job creation.
 3 This is the first theme, diversification. It
 4 should be obvious to everyone that we need to diversify away
 5 from tourism. It's our primary industry. It sets us up for
 6 a very vulnerable position. We rely on it very heavily. So
 7 whenever the tourism market takes a dive, as you all know,
 8 it becomes very difficult for a lot of people.
 9 Diversification here is defined as the spreading
 10 out of investments into a variety of sectors to minimize
 11 risk -- economic risk, in this case -- and to developing a
 12 wider range of industries to reduce that vulnerability. The
 13 objectives of diversification include basically, like I
 14 said, reducing a reliance on tourism and the consequent
 15 vulnerability to external courses and events.
 16 Number two, attracting more high-skilled,
 17 higher-paying jobs; thereby, increasing the proportion of
 18 jobs that pay a living wage. And three, moderating growth
 19 in basically the dynamics of our visitor industry.
 20 Moderating the growth of that industry and protecting its
 21 impact upon the community, the natural resources here, the
 22 people, the culture.
 23 This is the first theme. I'm just going to punch
 24 out a few issues here. About 70 percent of the economy
 25 depends on tourism. And some people even have said 80

1 percent. Thirty percent of all jobs are specifically tied
 2 to tourism. Okay. Primarily, we're looking at the
 3 accommodation jobs, restaurants, retail, including arts and
 4 entertainment.
 5 Over the next couple of years, there's projections
 6 of 15 percent drop in tourism approximately. We're already
 7 seeing the effects of that; a lot of businesses closing.
 8 And so we're looking at widespread budgetary cuts. Not only
 9 because of tourism, though. There are other reasons. But
 10 this has been a significant challenge, especially right now.
 11 This highlights where we're at in relation to the
 12 state. We're more dependent than anybody else in the state
 13 in tourism. And also, consequently, for that same reason,
 14 Maui has done economically very well over the last decade,
 15 10 to 15 years, because we've done so well in tourism. So
 16 as you can see, it can swing both ways.
 17 The chart up here is showing 29 percent of our job
 18 market is in accommodations and food services; whereas,
 19 across the rest of the state, it's about 20 percent in the
 20 same sector. And for retail trade, about 13 percent
 21 directly tied to tourism. And that isn't so true -- the
 22 rest of the state is in line with that, okay. I think. Let
 23 me double-check that.
 24 Retail trade -- yeah, that's right. Actually,
 25 no -- actually, that's -- yeah, that's right. Okay. So

1 I'll move on from that.

2 Here, this chart shows the number of jobs on Maui
3 in the retail -- the retail sectors, and also waiters and
4 waitresses. There's an example of what they make, their
5 annual range. Now, I'm not taking into consideration that
6 waiters and waitresses, they bring these tips and so forth.
7 And a lot of people rely on those tips. But the base wage
8 is very low.

9 Sustainability is the second theme. Sustainability
10 here we're defining as development that meets the needs of
11 the present without compromising the ability of future
12 generations to meet their own needs. This is a big theme
13 throughout. Actually, the entire plan. However, we're
14 really looking at providing for opportunities for this
15 island to look for ways to be less reliant on external
16 markets.

17 We're looking for ways to encourage
18 self-sufficiency here within the economic sectors and any
19 way we can actually support the idea of sustainability, the
20 ability for us to sustain ourselves during difficult
21 economic times. We're really showing that -- we're bringing
22 that forward to look through the policies. And you'll see
23 later on how we have done that.

24 This is one of the objectives, support principles
25 of sustainability. It's very broad. Just as an example of

1 table. And an example of a policy underneath that objective
2 would be support industries that are sustainable. Very
3 broad again. Same one. And the kinds of actions that we
4 can take -- and it's been couched under the general theme of
5 green planning, which is a big movement across the country
6 right now.

7 Energy saving programs and practices. We want to
8 try to support buying local, recycling programs, renewable
9 materials and energy sources, conserving valuable resources
10 and, of course, protecting the natural environment. It's
11 actually, in this case, good for the economy since, again,
12 we rely on tourism. And that's an all-around positive thing
13 in a lot of different ways. But protecting the environment.

14 One way to support sustainability is to reduce
15 energy demand. One example of that would be a policy
16 support telecommuting when possible. An action that would
17 be another example, retrofit all homes to be energy
18 self-sufficient or producers of energy. You'll find this in
19 our section. Another example, increase transportation
20 options. And we have a policy in our section -- support
21 public transportation, bikeways and walkable, affordable
22 communities close to workplaces.

23 Sustainability also means the ability to survive in
24 tough economic times. Maui's published living wage standard
25 is \$30,000. It's probably more like double that. So we

1 how we're not doing this and how we need to strive to do
2 this, seven percent of the state's energy is provided by
3 renewable sources. Okay. That means over 80 percent of our
4 electricity here in the state is created by fossil fuels.
5 And we import that from Indonesia and from other locations
6 in the world. But that's a huge dependency on fossil fuels.
7 And when prices go up, as you know what happened last year,
8 it can send people into -- well, that can become a
9 significant part of your budget, just getting to work.

10 Renewable energy sources, including wind, solar,
11 biofuels, geothermal, hydroelectric, and ocean energy. This
12 is a chart showing the movement of fossil fuels to Hawaii.
13 And most of it, like I said, is coming from Indonesia. And
14 you can see there's a breakdown to the right that shows what
15 the percentage is where we're getting our fuel from. And
16 we're also getting it from Alaska and Korea, and so forth.
17 And a little bit from -- it looks like Vietnam, China, so
18 forth.

19 Energy use compared to the United States. Again,
20 we're very reliant on fossil fuel, 78 percent. Whereas,
21 across the country, it looks like 52 percent coal and --
22 that's hard to believe there. But it says three percent
23 petroleum.

24 Objective. Increase activities which support
25 principles of sustainability. This is right out of our

1 really need to find ways to create new jobs that have a true
2 living wage, people can live here comfortably. An action
3 that would support the creation of new jobs would be to
4 regularly study market trends to attract new industries that
5 are environmentally and culturally appropriate for Maui.
6 And that's one of our actions.

7 This is the chart on the cost of living. Just to
8 illustrate that we're one of the most expensive places in
9 the U.S. to live. For some families, it's 60 percent over
10 the national average. And I think we're something like
11 right behind New York or something. We're the second or
12 third most expensive place in the country to live.

13 About 68,000 jobs on Maui; 17 percent are in the
14 hotels, 20 in retail, 30 percent of all jobs are sensitive
15 to swings in tourism. And four out of five new businesses
16 fail within the first five years of operation. So I'm
17 leading up to the third theme very shortly.

18 Improve the business climate. We've got to find
19 ways to bridge the tourism glitch. We've got to -- there's
20 an estimate of creating 10,000 jobs by 2030, or 4,000 new
21 businesses to basically hedge against the economic swings in
22 tourism, jobs that are not dependent on tourism. We've got
23 to create jobs that are not dependent on tourism. I've said
24 that twice, but important point. Because we just can't
25 survive. We can't keep depending on that industry only.

1 One of the snapshots here -- oh, I already said
2 that.

3 Okay. One of the policies we have in our section
4 is encourage, nurture and reward entrepreneurship and
5 innovation. Another policy that has been found to be
6 actually one of the most important themes too is to achieve
7 import substitution wherever possible, okay. And that ties
8 over into all the other sub elements.

9 As an example of that is the agriculture industry.
10 If we can try to grow local products and we can try to seek
11 to grow products to replace the ones we ship in, that would
12 increase our ability to feed ourselves. Food security. And
13 I'll get to that a little later, too. An example of an
14 action would be expand small business plans in microliving
15 communities.

16 Also another significant challenge is the cost of
17 doing business in Hawaii. And one of the policies we
18 drafted to address that would be to develop and expand
19 programs and support organizations which would assist local
20 entrepreneurs and small businesses. Another example of our
21 policy would be to support home businesses which do not
22 interfere with surrounding neighborhoods.

23 Improve employee/business relationships. We have a
24 policy in our section about supporting business practices.
25 For example, telecommuting, flexible schedules, offering

1 if we can, or at least increase diversified ag to the point
2 where we're becoming more diversified away from just this
3 monocrop industry. So that's a theme under agriculture.

4 Emerging industries. There's a number of
5 industries that have been shown to be growth industries.
6 Healthcare is actually one of them. Arts and entertainment
7 has been one for a long time. Renewable energy. There's
8 significant opportunities there. With the Hawaii Clean
9 Energy initiative, the memorandum of that agreement that the
10 Governor signed earlier this year. I think their goal -- or
11 the state's goal is to convert to renewable sources of
12 energy and renewable -- or sustainable practices, I think
13 it's something like a figure of 70 percent by 2030.

14 In other words, to convert over to renewable
15 energy, ways of living, using energy by 2030. It's a
16 significant goal. It's pretty -- and I think we're already
17 going in that direction. There's a company out there called
18 Better Places that has done a deal with the state where
19 they're looking at really bringing in a lot of electric car
20 uses, retrofitting the energy grid with -- I guess there's a
21 way to retrofit all of the facilities so that we can more
22 easily convert to electric car uses. And that's in the
23 works.

24 I think the goal for that is even more aggressive.
25 I think it's something like 2012 to convert, or at least

1 rebates for public transportation users. That's being done
2 across the country. Now we have a bus. Maybe we can start
3 supporting the public transportation system. Things like
4 that.

5 These are the sub elements that I can go further
6 into, or I can stop here we can just go straight into our
7 work. But just a little bit about them.

8 Tourism. There's a significant theme in the
9 tourism sub element. We're looking at actually constraining
10 the land supply. Not -- one of the policy discussions will
11 be do we want to add more resort land? Right at this point
12 in time, we have an objective demand, I think, of about
13 12,000 units. And we have a supply of resort units of about
14 5,000. And right now, we're looking at holding that supply
15 and looking at ways to diversify the economy into other
16 industries.

17 I can keep going if you want, but I'm going to just
18 briefly go over these.

19 Agricultural. The main thing there would be to
20 support diversified ag. We've got some really powerful
21 objectives under that section. One would be increasing the
22 proportion of the diversified agriculture markets in
23 relation to the rest of ag. In other words, we want to try
24 and just continue to grow that diversified ag sector and
25 hold the existing monocrop agriculture sector, maintain it,

1 encourage electric car usage across the state.

2 Moving on -- and there's other sub industries that
3 I won't go into now unless you want me to.

4 Small business. We identified that as a
5 significant player here in Hawaii. We've got a lot of small
6 businesses on Maui. They've been shown to create actually
7 more jobs for the local population. In some cases, they
8 keep the money local. In fact, I think the income
9 multiplier for local businesses is much higher than, say,
10 the corporate big box stores. Those kinds of small
11 businesses tend to keep money in the economy three times
12 more -- like the money cycles three times through the
13 economy as opposed to, say, sending your money to a
14 cooperate entity which takes it out of the state much more
15 rapidly. So small businesses, big thing. Buy local.

16 Healthcare. Our population is aging. In ten
17 years, the population will be -- I think the figure is -- I
18 can't remember the figure. But the population -- our job
19 market will actually decrease because the population is
20 aging. We need to find a way to take care of our people.

21 I think we're significantly short -- we have a
22 shortage in acute-care beds here. We need to try and do
23 something about that. There's a lot of programs locally to
24 train people in the medical industries. We've got a West
25 Maui hospital that is planned to be established in West

1 Maui. We might need to think about establishing one in
2 Kihei. It's underserved currently. So that's another
3 significant factor, actually. And it creates a lot of jobs
4 locally.

5 Education in workforce development. It kind of
6 speaks for itself. I know that Maui Community College is
7 doing a lot of work to expand their campus and their
8 programs and offer more course work, more degrees, offering
9 graduate degrees, undergraduate degrees, and so forth. And
10 that would help to create a skilled workforce that would
11 feed -- that it will directly tie into the industries here
12 that we're trying to grow.

13 So that's the quick overview, and I can stop there.
14 And that's it unless you would like me to keep going.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioners, do you have any
16 questions for the Staff at this point?

17 Mr. Starr.

18 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes. Thank you for the
19 presentation. I have two areas that I would like you to
20 enlist on a little bit deeper. The first one -- you know,
21 I'll take one at a time. This is regarding food. And
22 although you did glance over it a bit, I find that it's a
23 real critical issue that between 90 and 95 percent of what
24 we eat is imported. And both when it comes to the hazard
25 section and the economic section, I don't feel that issue

1 state, okay. Or actually grow food here, sell food in the
2 state. So that would be one taxation incentive for local
3 farmers.

4 Another way we are looking to try and do that is to
5 create value -- to allow farmers to create, to stimulate the
6 production of value-added products. Another possibility we
7 have would be to support direct marketing of their products
8 from their site. So like if a farmer is growing something,
9 we want and try and support them in their ability to sell
10 straight from their site, okay, which helps them because it
11 reduces their transport costs to the market.

12 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you, Simone.

13 Are there any other questions for Staff at this
14 time?

15 Mr. Starr.

16 COMMISSIONER STARR: Thank you, Mr. Chair. There
17 was no feeling that we need to address the fact that there's
18 no large land and water assets available for farmers at
19 affordable rates; that the land, a lot of which is ceded
20 land and owned by the state, it's controlled by the
21 plantation and the successes to the plantation, along with
22 the water; and that getting that into a place where farmers
23 could, you know, bid on dollar-a-year leases for land and
24 water would allow the growth of real food crops. You know,
25 the other items are really baby steps when there's not land

1 was very well covered. Especially, there seems to be no
2 path towards real large scale food production.

3 There is, you know, discussion where it says to
4 help in the export of food products. It says to help the
5 sugar cane and it says to help the seed crops. But nowhere
6 do I really see anything that will move us to production of
7 food. And I see that as a real problem and something we
8 need to address on a large scale if we're going to avoid
9 disaster at some point.

10 MS. BOSCO: I absolutely agree. If you take a look
11 at our table, we've actually got a section which is devoted
12 to increasing diversified ag. And under that section -- I'm
13 going to just turn to it real fast because I'm not going to
14 take a chance on who's quoting my policy here.

15 Okay, here we go. Under agriculture, the very
16 first goal -- or objective is to ensure that at least 85
17 percent of locally consumed fruits and vegetables and 30
18 percent of all other locally sustained foods are grown
19 on-island.

20 COMMISSIONER STARR: How do we achieve that,
21 though? How do we move to that?

22 MS. BOSCO: Right. There's policies under that
23 section which serve to support the local farmer. One of
24 them would be -- one of them that we have here is to waive
25 excise taxes for farmers which grow and sell food in the

1 and water available. Is there a mechanism to get to that
2 place?

3 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

4 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. That's
5 really one of the root causes of our food security issue
6 here on the island.

7 We do have some pretty specific policies in
8 relation to ag preservation, the preservation of the
9 resource space. And we also have some policies that call
10 for the development of additional ag parks in different
11 parts of the island. To address that issue, basically
12 long-term tenure to affordable land and a guaranteed source
13 of affordable water would go a long way towards helping us
14 achieve that objective.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you very much, John.

16 Are there any other questions for Staff regarding
17 economic development?

18 Commissioner Mardfin.

19 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I've got a number of
20 concerns, but I'll start with one.

21 CHAIR HEDANI: I think what we want to direct to
22 Staff is questions at this point.

23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: My question is you talked
24 about electrical cars as a way of saving on petroleum. Has
25 anybody done a study that compares the amount of petroleum

1 used in individual internal combustible engines with the
2 petroleum burned by Maui Electric to produce electricity to
3 power the cars and what the net effect is?

4 CHAIR HEDANI: Simone.

5 MS. BOSCO: I do know there's been a lot of studies
6 done at the state level. And I know also that there's
7 significant opportunities with wind energy right now, that
8 they're looking to build new wind farms. I cannot answer
9 your question specifically. But what I can say is yes,
10 there have been a number of studies done at the state level.

11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: But we don't know what the
12 conclusion is, whether Maui Electric consumes more petroleum
13 to produce the electricity than the petroleum that we'd be
14 using in gasoline, which is more?

15 MS. BOSCO: I can get that information for you and
16 bring it back to the commission.

17 CHAIR HEDANI: Any other questions for Staff?
18 Commissioner Starr.

19 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes. Another area mentioned
20 and I was happy to see is green planning and sustainability.
21 You also attended the national convention which was all
22 about sustainability and green planning. And almost every
23 session that I attended there, the top of the list was
24 compact communities, was discussions on creating communities
25 and lifestyles that are not automotive dependent.

1 wayside, we went towards tourism. And when that became
2 overwhelming, the move was toward a preferred future with
3 high tech.

4 MS. BOSCO: Yes, absolutely. That is under the
5 emerging industries section.

6 CHAIR HEDANI: Was education considered an
7 industry?

8 MS. BOSCO: Yes, it was.

9 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay, very good. Any other
10 questions from the Commission?

11 Commissioner Sablas.

12 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: I have a question. Was I
13 correct in understanding that we presently have a supply of
14 5,000 units in the visitor accommodations?

15 MS. BOSCO: That's correct. I'm going to have John
16 answer that.

17 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: And a projected 12,000? I
18 think -- my understanding is we were more like 18,000 units
19 on Maui.

20 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

21 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Those
22 statistics relate to the amount of vacant developable land
23 for the industry. So it wasn't the actual number of units
24 on the island today, it's demand for future units and
25 existing land supply that can be used to accommodate that

1 And it does definitely comes into economic
2 sustainability on several of the sessions. Figures were
3 quoted from between \$1,000 to \$1,200 a month savings for a
4 couple if they live in a compact environment where they can
5 walk to work and school, compared to living in a detached
6 housing. But this is not really something that I see in any
7 of the goals and objectives, yet it's a way of saving
8 emissions, saving greenhouse gases, then saving on the
9 economic aspect and cost.

10 MS. BOSCO: I'll just keep my answer very brief.
11 We cover that more in depth in the direct growth section.
12 However, we do have policies within this section to support
13 building affordable communities close to workplaces. And
14 without further ado, we're considering actually moving that
15 policy to a land use section because it's more of a land use
16 directive. But yes, as a short answer, we absolutely have
17 covered that. If not in depth, in more depth in direct
18 growth. So yes.

19 CHAIR HEDANI: I have one question. Is the
20 economic development sector, was it still a consideration or
21 a mention or emphasis given to the high-tech industry?

22 MS. BOSCO: Oh, yes, that's one of the emerging
23 industries. You'll see that under --

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Because I know historically,
25 we were sugar, pineapple. And when that was going by the

1 land.

2 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: I just wanted to understand
3 the 5,000 figure and one is 12,000 figure. I thought one
4 was present and the other one was projected, from what I
5 understand?

6 MS. BOSCO: Okay. We had an economic development
7 issue paper done. And in that paper it says -- there's a
8 forecast of 17,000 units needed over the next -- to 2030.
9 And we have 5,000 units not -- entitled now. We can build
10 5,000 units, okay. The land supply that we have can provide
11 for 5,000 units. So then you get the 12,000.

12 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: I understand. Thank you.

13 CHAIR HEDANI: Any other questions?

14 Commissioner U'u

15 COMMISSIONER U'U: When you say 5,000, that is when
16 you maximize the property?

17 MS. BOSCO: Probably so. There's formulas that we
18 use. If you take a look at what the land is, you can
19 extrapolate how many units you can get out of that land.

20 COMMISSIONER U'U: So at max, you would use that?

21 MS. BOSCO: Yes.

22 COMMISSIONER U'U: But what is norm? And that's a
23 question we need to know. Because if you're basing
24 everything in maximum and nothing is built to maximum, most
25 of the things are not even built for that fact. And we're

1 following something that is very misleading.
 2 MS. BOSCO: That's true.
 3 COMMISSIONER U'U: So how can we stick to factual
 4 or reality in the dream world of maximum? Because you know
 5 this, we'll never get maximum built here. It's either too
 6 high, it's either too much, it's either too close to the
 7 shoreline, which I agree. I agree to all of those. But we
 8 got to be real, and that's not real. Your 5,000 is flawed
 9 big time.
 10 MS. BOSCO: Right.
 11 COMMISSIONER U'U: And how do you forecast
 12 something in your forecast when you know it's not reality?
 13 It's like saying I'm going to have twelve kids, but I got
 14 three. I can max out at twelve, but three's enough already.
 15 But I got five. That's reality. So how can we make it
 16 really a forecast. If that was Guy Hagi, I'd be pissed at
 17 him.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Any response, John?
 19 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. If you go
 20 to your land use forecast and turn to Page 4-2, there's a
 21 pretty explicit description of methodology.
 22 COMMISSIONER U'U: I like the simple methodology.
 23 MR. SUMMERS: It's pretty simple. So read through
 24 that. I think it will answer a lot of your questions. And
 25 also, focus on Table 4-3.

1 to us at least 2500 miles from a distance source, and then
 2 we are worried about the price and cost of our energies and
 3 our way of life. Once we start doing renewable energy, that
 4 would be the incentive for us to piggyback and develop
 5 ourselves and pull ourselves up on our own boot straps.
 6 So I would encourage us to consider how do we use
 7 or finite land resources for growing crops. Not only
 8 agriculture on the land, but aquaculture type of crops that
 9 we can export some of the monies, as well as feed or people.
 10 These are some of the concepts I hope that you're mentioning
 11 or you have in mind.
 12 MS. BOSCO: Yes. Thank you, Commissioner Shibuya.
 13 I think we'll probably save that discussion for when we get
 14 to the section.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Director.
 16 DIRECTOR HUNT: The Commission doesn't need to
 17 address this today, but you should be aware of this policy
 18 that speaks to diversifying our economy. And if the demand
 19 shows that we need 12,000 units and we're only accommodating
 20 5,000, the only way our economy is not going to suffer is
 21 if we diversify our economy and enhance or other sectors,
 22 such as agriculture, or renewable energy, et cetera. So
 23 keep that in mind.
 24 It's a policy that's in the plan. And the GPAC did
 25 support it and the Department is supporting it. But I think

1 COMMISSIONER U'U: Can you give me an answer
 2 without reading, short answer? I will read it, though.
 3 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Will you hold up that
 4 document again. When did we receive that?
 5 MR. SUMMERS: You received it with your binders.
 6 It's on the CD ROM. It's also online.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Any other questions for Staff?
 8 Commissioner Shibuya.
 9 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Simone, I appreciate you
 10 making a suggestion about the business zones. I think
 11 that's very appropriate that we do that.
 12 If we're encouraging the development of some
 13 businesses, that would be a very good incentive. However,
 14 I'd like to expand that and to include renewable energy type
 15 businesses and sustainable type businesses to include
 16 aquaculture. I think you didn't mention that. But I
 17 believe you do intend to have aquaculture as part of this
 18 equation of sustaining ourselves and economically
 19 diversifying our businesses and jobs here on Maui
 20 specifically.
 21 But this is a chicken and an egg type of situation,
 22 how do you start. Well, I'm going to tell you that I think
 23 we should start with renewable energy, reduce our dependency
 24 for foreign and exporting our monies overseas and putting
 25 ourselves at vulnerability of having our energy transported

1 it's an important policy that you guys should be aware of
 2 and think it through. It kind of goes hand-in-hand with the
 3 policy we discussed at the last meeting that spoke to
 4 limiting the amount of nonresidents, that percentage, that
 5 proportion. Are we going to have someone out on the tarmac
 6 with a badge turning tourists away? No, you don't do it
 7 that way. The way you limit that ratio is through this
 8 policy. So keep that in mind as you discuss this in the
 9 future.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 11 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. For the
 12 record, I'd like to correct the total demand number. It's
 13 more like 8,000, just over eight, and total supply is just
 14 over four.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Four and eight versus five and
 16 twelve?
 17 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: I was kind of scratching my head
 19 trying to figure out where we're going to put 5,000 units.
 20 Commissioner U'u.
 21 COMMISSIONER U'U: No.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 23 COMMISSIONER STARR: I know I glanced through that.
 24 But could you elicit on the methodology used in the 8,000
 25 demand number. Is that what we would need to keep the

1 economy going or what?
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers,
 3 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Those
 4 numbers primarily flowed from the Department of Business
 5 Economic Development and Tourism. It's part of their 2030
 6 econometric model. Their methodology is very strong.
 7 Historically, they've been very accurate.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Any other questions for Staff?
 9 Seeing none --
 10 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: One more.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 12 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: This is sort of an overall
 13 view of economic development. And I guess I want to know if
 14 you folks have studied other areas and their success in
 15 picking industries and attracting industries. Because
 16 worldwide, it's been a horrible record on people being able
 17 to actually attract the industries they want to attract.
 18 They're usually unsuccessful. And I was just wondering if
 19 you've looked at other places? I mean, everybody in the
 20 world wants high tech. Not everybody gets high tech.
 21 I'm just wondering if you folks have looked at what
 22 is necessary to really attract industries and how you have
 23 assurance that industries you've picked are the right
 24 industries?
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Simone.

1 and discussions with the stake holders, the public school
 2 system and the lack of investment in that system has been a
 3 significant drag on our diversification efforts. We do
 4 have -- if you turn to your table -- a whole section on
 5 this. So I would just encourage the members to focus on
 6 that.
 7 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Where is that?
 8 MR. SUMMERS: That's on page 24.
 9 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Of what?
 10 MR. SUMMERS: Of this table.
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: That we got this morning?
 12 MR. SUMMERS: Yeah.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: One comment that I'd like to offer
 14 on the economic development section -- and this is just my
 15 impression. It seemed like we were almost being apologetic
 16 for the businesses being on Maui as opposed to being
 17 aggressive in terms of supporting industries. I think
 18 something like tourism has to be supported in order to be
 19 successful. And it just seemed like we were reducing --
 20 discounting the value of tourism as it contributed to the
 21 economy and not worthy of being supported, but being
 22 controlled and condemned.
 23 MS. BOSCO: No, I absolutely agree with that
 24 comment, absolutely. I think the concern is more about just
 25 creating more opportunities so that in tough times we may

1 MS. BOSCO: I'm not going to get into a lot of
 2 discussion right now about that. But the short answer is
 3 yes. And we're looking on the statistics on which
 4 industries have already been proven to grow here. There's
 5 trends. So the ones that I've identified in my presentation
 6 have been shown to be growth industries.
 7 The second part of that answer is because they're
 8 growth industries, we want to try to provide incentives to
 9 enhance their opportunities. Okay, I'll leave it a lot
 10 that.
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Follow-up to that.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: The one thing I didn't see
 14 under incentives, and particularly for high tech, is our
 15 school system. And maybe you didn't do it because it's a
 16 state kuleana rather than a county kuleana. But without
 17 good schools, people -- the people that can make high tech
 18 happen can go anywhere they want. And if we don't have good
 19 schools for their kids, they're not going to come here.
 20 MS. BOSCO: Under the education section, we have
 21 addressed that. But there is a whole entire other section
 22 just addressing schools under public facilities.
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Any other questions?
 24 Mr. Summers.
 25 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Our research

1 have tourism as a primary industry, but we also have other
 2 fact -- other dynamics going on economically that people can
 3 turn to and not feel such a huge dramatic swing when it's a
 4 tough time.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: Was the construction industry also
 6 considered?
 7 MS. BOSCO: That's a good question. It wasn't --
 8 we considered it, but it wasn't added as an element. We did
 9 not add that as a sub element, no. But we did consider it.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner U'u.
 11 COMMISSIONER U'U: Question. It was also brought
 12 up about controlling the number of visitors coming on this
 13 island. I know it was a topic. But to be realistic, how
 14 much of us in this room was a visitor at once? A lot of
 15 people. And it's appalling to me to hear that from you
 16 guys, the directors, the long range, to control visitors.
 17 And you guys were all visitors at one time. That's one sad
 18 fact.
 19 And construction should have been put in place or
 20 set on the table to have a share in this talk. Because I
 21 know those guys. They're just like me. They are the guys
 22 that build all the residences here, a lot of them. The bulk
 23 of the residence. And now we're saying limit the visitor
 24 growth. I find that contradictory or hypocritical of some
 25 sort coming from your planners.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Any other questions for Staff?
 2 Okay. Mr. Summers.
 3 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you. I just want to address
 4 those two points. The first, the construction industry was
 5 well-represented on the economic development IRC, which was
 6 extensively involved in the development of this. This was
 7 not just a Staff document, this was a GPAC document also.
 8 So they were well-represented. In fact, we had the head of
 9 contractors' association on this IRC.
 10 COMMISSIONER U'U: Where is he from? Where is the
 11 head of the contractors' association from? Was it a
 12 one-time visitor? Was it a permanent resident?
 13 MR. SUMMERS: I'm just illuminating the fact that
 14 there was plenty of representation on that committee.
 15 COMMISSIONER U'U: Not from us.
 16 MR. SUMMERS: With respect to the number of units,
 17 the contraction of the number of units, there are some
 18 policies that talk to essentially managing that growth.
 19 We're seeing that happen right now voluntarily. And if you
 20 look at the Makena Resort project, that development analyzed
 21 profitability under different scenarios and decided to
 22 reduce the number of units well below what they could have
 23 done with their entitlement. To some extent, this is
 24 happening. And it's happening at the direction of the
 25 owners and developers on the island.

1 not black or white. How much tourism do we want in our
 2 community, in our economy? That's all we're talking about.
 3 And if this committee believes these policies
 4 should be adjusted, so be it. And we'll help you adjust
 5 those policies.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you.
 7 Commissioner U'u.
 8 COMMISSIONER U'U: Just for the record, I'm for
 9 diversified. I don't want to be totally dependent on
 10 tourism. I'm not saying that, not 100 percent. And I want
 11 to be more diversified as a county.
 12 But at times maybe I feel like we're being
 13 premature by setting a cap when we're just talking about
 14 diversifying and not actually -- I know it takes baby steps
 15 to being more diversified. But by setting a cap and looking
 16 at other ways of diversifying when we're not there yet. And
 17 like Commissioner Hedani said tourism is a big impact here
 18 peoplewise, but also moneywise. So maybe my foresight is it
 19 might be a bit premature right now.
 20 But yes, I see the goal, I see the envision, I like
 21 the envision. But I'm not sure if we're doing it in an
 22 orderly fashion way. If it stops for now and halts for now
 23 and we diversified more in one sector instead of maybe
 24 putting a cap or setting a cap when it's closer to be more
 25 diversified. I see the envision, I see the end goal, and it

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Follow-up question?
 2 Commissioner U'u.
 3 COMMISSIONER U'U: So you're saying they're not
 4 building to maximum capacity?
 5 MR. SUMMERS: We're starting to see that trend.
 6 COMMISSIONER U'U: Which is your basis for the
 7 report?
 8 MR. SUMMERS: No.
 9 COMMISSIONER U'U: To some degree?
 10 MR. SUMMERS: To some degree. But you have to read
 11 the methodology. The methodology is pretty clear.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.
 13 DIRECTOR HUNT: The Maui Island Plan and the whole
 14 general plan update deals with some very, very critical
 15 issues for the island and our community. And we can have
 16 differences of opinions. And I think that's fine. But I
 17 would like to ask everyone to focus on the issues and not to
 18 be appalled at somebody who has a different opinion than
 19 you. And the alternatives need to be addressed at the same
 20 time.
 21 If the argument is, well, we shouldn't limit
 22 tourism, then what's going to happen as a result of that?
 23 And there's been a lot of testimony, citizen input, the GPAC
 24 that has expressed concern about having our economy too
 25 dependent on tourism. So it's not an easy solution. It's

1 is to be diversified, and I do support that concept.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you. With that, why don't we
 3 move on to the work in Item D on our agenda.
 4 Director.
 5 DIRECTOR HUNT: The next item is Item D. This is a
 6 planning commission discussion of and recommendations, if
 7 you choose, related to the Draft Island Plan's Heritage
 8 Resources. I believe we went through a portion of it at our
 9 last meeting.
 10 Correct me if I'm wrong, John, but we're going to
 11 take off where we left off on the Heritage Resources?
 12 MR. SUMMERS: That's correct.
 13 DIRECTOR HUNT: And if we have time, this agenda
 14 item also addresses natural hazards and economic development
 15 that was just presented to you.
 16 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 18 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, I'd like to make a
 19 suggestion that may help us get through this a little bit
 20 faster. And I believe Staff will possibly agree with this,
 21 which is that when we have our questions on goal and an
 22 objective, then perhaps we allow a motion for approval of
 23 the objective and all the policies, actions underneath that
 24 objective.
 25 Once that is on the floor with the second, then

1 any -- that any of the policies, actions, implementing
2 actions, and so on, that anyone wants to change or has an
3 issue with can be discussed and can have amendments to deal
4 with them. And that way, we handle each goal and objective
5 as a unit rather than as a single page.

6 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Any objections?

7 I think that was the Staff Recommendation in the
8 beginning, that we handle it that way, yeah.

9 Where did we leave off, John?

10 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Page 12,
11 which is Shoreline, Reefs and Nearshore Waters.

12 CHAIR HEDANI: I thought we were on the first page.

13 MR. SUMMERS: It's on your Shoreline, Reefs and
14 Nearshore Waters.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: Can we blow that up a little bit.
16 Commissioners, what's your pleasure?
17 Commissioner Starr.

18 COMMISSIONER STARR: I'll be making a motion
19 momentarily regarding this. But before I do, I would just
20 like to ask something of Staff in this area. Because my
21 understanding is that the -- this body is the final
22 authority on shoreline issues. And I have to say that's one
23 area that I feel proud to be a member of the Commission is
24 that we do have concerns and cares and look into the issues
25 of how runoff and how development in the SMA affects that.

1 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. This is
2 actually addressed in part under Objective 1, Action
3 Number -- let's see, Action Number 4. And it's addressed in
4 more detail under the Watershed section.

5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Is that the thing you just
6 gave us?

7 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.

8 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm sorry. Is the thing you
9 just gave us, the goal, Objective 1, Action 4, that's on
10 Page 14 of this document?

11 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.

12 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Page 14.

13 MR. SUMMERS: And there's a reference --

14 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I don't see the Maui
15 Planning Commission mentioned there. I see develop and
16 implement an integrated near shore water quality management
17 program to include the development --

18 CHAIR HEDANI: Slow downward, Ward.

19 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: To include the development
20 of Special Area Management plans for sensitive marine,
21 slash, watershed resources. I don't see Jonathan's concern
22 about the Maui Planning Commission mentioned there.

23 MR. SUMMERS: That's correct. But this policy --
24 actually, this action references and gets into the language
25 that Jonathan is talking about.

1 And I believe the original intent, a part of it,
2 was to leave that area of discussion under SMA. But on the
3 GPAC, there was some change to move some of that over to
4 sort of -- I guess on an advisory body, which would be
5 separate. And I'd like to ask for help in dealing with that
6 through the SMA -- through the SMA process and how that can
7 be accomplished. I'm not sure if exactly where that is, but
8 I know I read it.

9 Can I ask Mr. Summers or Mr. Michaelson for help
10 with that.

11 CHAIR HEDANI: What was the question again, John?

12 COMMISSIONER STARR: Regarding greater awareness of
13 what happened on the land above the shoreline ends up
14 creating the runoff that hazards it there -- what is a map
15 that defines those areas that are sensitive to runoff?

16 And I believe that the way it was left by GPAC was
17 that those areas would be under the jurisdiction of an
18 advisory body instead of being under the jurisdiction of
19 this body, which is where I feel they should be.

20 CHAIR HEDANI: So the question is was the
21 recommendation for support of an advisory body other than
22 the Commission to handle those things?

23 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. And how do we swap that
24 if we feel that we should?

25 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

1 There's a program that's discussed in this section,
2 as well as in the Watershed section that calls for the
3 creation of Special Area Management plans. And there are
4 maps in the heritage element that identify these areas,
5 areas where we have watersheds that are adjacent to very
6 sensitive to sensitive coral marine ecosystems.

7 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Is there a Special
8 Management Area for Hana, for East Maui?

9 MR. SUMMERS: Not at this time.

10 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: No.

11 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you. We're on Page 12. Goal:
12 Maui will have an intact and ecologically functioning system
13 of reef, shoreline coastal resources and nearshore waters
14 that are protected in perpetuity and in compliance with Act
15 212.

16 What's your pleasure? Commissioner Starr.

17 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair, I move to accept
18 for discussion purposes the Goal and Objective 1, on the
19 underlying policies and actions beginning on Page 12.

20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.

21 CHAIR HEDANI: Moved by Commissioner Starr,
22 seconded by Commissioner Mardfin to accept the goal under
23 Shoreline, Reefs and Nearshore Waters, Objective 1. All
24 subsequent policies and actions related to Objective 1.

25 Commissioner Starr.

1 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Discussion.
 3 Corp. Counsel would like to address the Act 212
 4 reference. James. This is James Giroux.
 5 MR. GIROUX: Thank you, Chair. James Giroux. The
 6 last time we met, the Commission asked me to go back and
 7 look at this Act 212. Basically, the Aha Moku concept.
 8 I had discussions with the planners about this.
 9 And my -- doing my research, looking at the act, the bills,
 10 the commentary and seeing the activity that this bill has
 11 generated, my concern is that it's a concept that integrates
 12 native practitioners as a body that would give
 13 recommendations to state agencies.
 14 My concern is that if you're referencing an act, a
 15 specific act within a long-range planning document, you're
 16 going to be left with an afoot arm. Meaning, you're going
 17 to be referencing something that may disappear within the
 18 next few years. And I'm not saying it will. I'm saying
 19 that it's a possibility. It's not a good idea to reference
 20 acts that are somewhat of a temporary nature. Statutes that
 21 are passed, you know, they may come and go.
 22 And as you saw in the last session, somebody
 23 actually introduced the deletion of 205(a). And it wasn't
 24 until the cross-over that somebody actually caught that and
 25 said what the hell are we doing.

1 And we already seeing that with SHPD. We're having
 2 trouble getting archeologists to review reports right now.
 3 They don't have staffing for a lot of their cultural and,
 4 you know, ag. You know, I mean all of those areas, you're
 5 having trouble getting the state to do their end. And we're
 6 now tacking on another state agency. So I just want you to
 7 be very cautious in just adopting this language without
 8 further verbalizing your intent.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you very much, most-esteemed
 10 counsel.
 11 Commissioner Mardfin, discussion.
 12 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: There's one way to handle
 13 that. And that's to put a period after perpetuity. Delete
 14 the words "and in compliance with Act 212."
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Is that a motion?
 16 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Not until I ask a question.
 17 Is there things in Act 212 that somehow modify the
 18 general concept of protected perpetuity?
 19 MR. GIROUX: No. The Act 212, it establishes a
 20 system of community-based advisors that would use native
 21 concepts of land use management in order to advise state
 22 agencies when they propose an action.
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: They'll advise state agencies?
 24 MR. GIROUX: Yes.
 25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: And county?

1 COMMISSIONER STARR: It was caught earlier.
 2 MR. GIROUX: So you have to understand that when
 3 you reference acts and statutes, you need to be very
 4 cautious. Because if the underlying policy and concept you
 5 want to go to perpetuity, or at least to 2030, you have to
 6 actually spell out what that concept is and not rely on a
 7 standing statute.
 8 So I think it's important for this body to look at
 9 the Aha Moku concept and Act 212 and actually verbalize what
 10 is that concept; what do you want to carry on if the state
 11 legislature decides that they're done with it. If they
 12 decide not to fund it, it could still be on the books and
 13 not funded. These people are going to be appointed or be
 14 put on boards that eventually, because it's a state agency,
 15 could lose all funding. So how does the county integrate
 16 its policies with that concept?
 17 And I think the underlying idea is -- if the idea
 18 was that you like the concept, you should verbalize the
 19 concept to have local practitioners have input and to advise
 20 county and state agencies. And if Act 212 stands with
 21 funding, you could encourage the county to utilize that
 22 body. But as far as integrating the two agencies, you know,
 23 that's going to be a logistical issue to come in the future
 24 when you're trying to get a state agency to give input into
 25 a county agency.

1 MR. GIROUX: Well, the way I read it, it was state.
 2 But, you know, the county is sometimes considered a
 3 subsidiary of state agencies.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Any additional discussion on the
 5 goal and Objective Number 1 and all subsequent policies?
 6 Commissioner Sablas.
 7 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: I have a question for
 8 counsel.
 9 So how long has Act 212 been in existence?
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: James.
 11 MR. GIROUX: I believe since 2007, was when it
 12 passed. So it's been about a year. And they are in the
 13 process of -- it's a two-tiered process to really get the
 14 system started. So I believe that they're in their primary
 15 steps where they have an appointed counsel that is then
 16 mandated to then pick, I guess, the permanent counsel that's
 17 going to be.
 18 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: And this is a statewide
 19 initiative? And you said there's island councils? I just
 20 want to understand this act a little better.
 21 MR. GIROUX: Yes. It's based on the moku system.
 22 So there's many moku on each island. So this council has to
 23 go around and establish the councils for each moku.
 24 So right now, they're at the point of actually
 25 getting their initial council that is then going to go off

1 and get members of the community that would most fit these
 2 mokus.
 3 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: So is there such council in
 4 existing for Maui County?
 5 MR. GIROUX: I believe they're in the process of
 6 developing it.
 7 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: I just want to speak to this
 8 as to how it was developed. My understanding again of the
 9 Hawaiian culture is because it was a culture that was not on
 10 paper, but more in oral traditions that are passed. You
 11 know, without really understanding how it was established, I
 12 just want to be sensitive to the fact that we need to
 13 always, always recognize the host people of the place.
 14 And generations before, Hawaiians descend seven
 15 generations back. We wouldn't get that on paper. You would
 16 get that from one generation telling stories to another
 17 generation. And if that's the value of this act to
 18 recognize this group of people, I think we need to be very
 19 sensitive about how we handle it, doing it the right way,
 20 but not just disregard it at this time.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you. Any additional
 22 discussion on the goal or Objective Number 1 and the
 23 actions?
 24 Commissioner Starr.
 25 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes. I'd like to offer an

1 we -- after it says "that are protected in perpetuity," to
 2 delete "and in compliance with Act 212," and substitute "and
 3 in support of the Aha Moku concept."
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 5 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Second.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Sablas.
 7 So the motion would be to adjust the goal to read,
 8 "Maui will have an intact and ecologically functional system
 9 of reef, shoreline, coastal resources and nearshore waters
 10 that are protected in perpetuity and in" --
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Support.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: "Support of the Aha Moku council."
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Concept.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: "Concept."
 15 Discussion? Commissioner Mardfin.
 16 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I want to speak in favor of
 17 this. I like it very much. One of the things I
 18 particularly like about it is it would be moku by moku,
 19 which is the way I think we ought to do lots of things in
 20 this county. The moku of Keanae, Nahiku, Hana, Kipahulu,
 21 Hana and Kaupo are very different creatures. What works in
 22 Kihei or Lahaina doesn't work in Hana or Kipahulu.
 23 So the moku concept will protect the perpetuity,
 24 but allow for regional input. And I think that's an
 25 excellent process in general.

1 amendment, which would be to add Policy 8 to Objective
 2 Number 2. Objective Number 2 being approve reef health,
 3 coastal water quality and fish stocks.
 4 And the wording of the new Policy 8 would be
 5 "Include Special Area Management plan areas within the SMA
 6 process."
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Hold on, Jonathan. Let's put it up
 8 on the screen.
 9 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Mr. Chair.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Hiranaga.
 11 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Are we going objective by
 12 objective, or are we going to be reviewing the entire
 13 goal --
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: The motion was for approval of the
 15 Goal and Objective Number 1 and all the policies and actions
 16 for Objective Number 1.
 17 COMMISSIONER STARR: I'm jumping the gun, I'm
 18 sorry. I apologize. I'll hold it until we get there.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. So the motion is withdrawn.
 20 Any additional discussion on Goal and Objective 1?
 21 Commissioner Mardfin.
 22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Now I'm ready to make my
 23 motion.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: "I move."
 25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the goal that

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioners, discussion?
 2 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 3 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I just wanted
 4 clarification. Is there such a thing as an Aha Moku concept
 5 that is universally accepted, or is this something that
 6 we're just going to figure out as we go along what that
 7 concept is?
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 9 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairperson. I think
 10 it would be wise in this case to italicize that concept and
 11 make sure it's defined in the glossary.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: What does italicizing it do?
 13 MR. SUMMERS: Well, that's a trigger for Staff that
 14 we need a definition.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: That's a trigger for Staff that you
 16 need a definition.
 17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm comfortable with that.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 19 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 20 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Just a procedural question.
 21 We're just talking about the current amendments that you're
 22 having discussion on?
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Right.
 24 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Thank you.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: The amendment is to read, "and in

1 support of the Aha Moku concept," and deleting "and in
 2 compliance with Act 212."
 3 Additional discussion? Ready for the question?
 4 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 5 (Round of ayes.)
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 7 (No response.)
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 9 Additional discussion, amendments to Goal or
 10 Objective Number 1 and policies and actions under 1?
 11 Commissioner Mardfin.
 12 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I would like to move to
 13 amend by adding -- actually, I'd like it to be Policy 2 and
 14 renumber the policies below it. But my Policy 2 would be --
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Read it slowly so Julia can put up
 16 it up on the board.
 17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'll try to. That the Maui
 18 Planning Commission be the primary body in support of
 19 achieving this objective.
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 21 COMMISSIONER STARR: I second it.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Second by Commissioner Starr.
 23 Commissioner Guard.
 24 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Isn't that what Objective 1,
 25 Action Item Number 4 kind of discusses, SMA plans for

1 sensitive water marine watershed sources and we would be the
 2 body that would look at that anyway?
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 4 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Actually,
 5 when we get into the more specific policy related to this,
 6 it would be a separate body that's being recommended. So
 7 this would clarify that it will be the Planning Commission.
 8 And we'll have to clean it up under the Watershed element to
 9 make sure we have consistency within the element.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I would like to speak more
 12 in support of this. Under Objective 1, it says, "a more
 13 comprehensive and integrated community-based management
 14 program." And I want to be clear that we're a key part of
 15 that for shorelines and reefs. And I want it as a policy as
 16 opposed to just an action.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 18 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 19 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I guess I want an opinion
 20 from Corporation Counsel if that's within the jurisdiction
 21 of the Maui Planning Commission?
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: James.
 23 MR. GIROUX: It would depend on how they establish
 24 these Special Area Management plans. If they're done by
 25 ordinance, the ordinance would basically appoint you to be

1 the body that would be the authority.
 2 Right now, the reason that you're the authority in
 3 the Special Management Area is because of the charter. In
 4 the charter, it clearly states that you're the final
 5 authority in the CZMA. In the charter, it also says that
 6 whatever laws give you authority, you'll have authority. So
 7 if they establish this through ordinance, if that ordinance
 8 is passed by Council and it states you are the authority,
 9 then you would be the authority. So in the policy document,
 10 it would have to be clear that's the direction that they
 11 want Council to go to in the future.
 12 John, am I on the right track with it?
 13 MR. SUMMERS: Yes, absolutely.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: My question, John, is are we adding
 15 another layer of approvals and authority to existing zoning
 16 and regulations? I mean, we just got through talking about
 17 economic development and making helpful business climate.
 18 Is this the same thing?
 19 MR. SUMMERS: Again, this is more specifically
 20 addressed under Watersheds. But it would entail the
 21 adoption of an overlay zoning category, an overlay district,
 22 with special standards and protections to more effectively
 23 manage our watersheds and sensitive coral ecosystems.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Discussion?
 25 Commissioner Guard.

1 COMMISSIONER GUARD: I was just wondering if that's
 2 going to come up in a bunch of the items, to have everything
 3 come through the Maui Planning Commission. And if this has
 4 to go to Council next, they'd be able to strike that fairly
 5 easily if they didn't want the Planning Commission to fill
 6 up our plate. I mean, I don't know if in the past, this has
 7 been the body that's saved all the reefs, just in seeing
 8 what's happened.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? Commissioner
 10 Shibuya.
 11 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I believe we're still
 12 talking about Policy Number 4?
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: We're talking about Policy Number 2,
 14 that's being created. And it states, "the Maui Planning
 15 Commission" -- can you blow that up a little bit more,
 16 Julia. My makule eyes cannot read it from this distance.
 17 "Maui Planning Commission be the primary body" --
 18 Julia.
 19 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Say, "decision-making body."
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: "Be the primary body in support
 21 of" -- I can't read the rest of it.
 22 MS. STALEY: Okay, I'll read it to you. And I
 23 wrote down exactly what Commissioner Mardfin requested. So
 24 it's verbatim. So it can be obviously massaged.
 25 It says, "the Maui Planning Commission be the

1 primary body in support of achieving this objective."
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 3 Commissioner Starr.
 4 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, I think we need to add a
 5 verb in there.
 6 MS. STALEY: I like verbs.
 7 COMMISSIONER STARR: I'll leave that to Staff.
 8 MS. STALEY: All right. Thank you.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: I'm sorry. What was the Staff
 10 response?
 11 MS. STALEY: I wrote underneath it that the
 12 language will be changed to reflect policy language, and it
 13 will be smoothed out to make sure the verbs are kosher.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. So do we know what we're
 15 voting on right now?
 16 Commissioner Shibuya.
 17 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I'd like to jump to the
 18 number one policy --
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Let's dispose of the amendment
 20 first. Any further discussion?
 21 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 22 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'm not sure if this is a
 23 policy. I've got this -- someone placed this little cheat
 24 sheet here on my desk here. I'm not sure if that's broadly
 25 drawn -- I'm not sure if that's a policy. I mean, that's

1 more of an action.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? Ready for
 3 the question? All those in favor of the amendment to add
 4 Policy Number 2 as displayed up on the board, please signify
 5 by saying "aye."
 6 (Round of ayes.)
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 8 (Round of nays.)
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor, signify by
 10 raising your right hand. Three in favor. Opposed, same
 11 sign. Four opposed. Motion dies.
 12 Additional discussion on Goal Number 1, Objective
 13 Number 1 and policies and actions?
 14 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 15 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Before we go too far,
 16 should we address whether we're going to amend the
 17 Objective 1 per the Director's Recommendation, or are we
 18 going to stick with the GPAC Recommendation? I guess I'll
 19 make a motion to adopt or accept the Director's
 20 Recommendation.
 21 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Second.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. The motion is to accept the
 23 Director's Recommendation on Objective Number 1, which
 24 reads, "a more comprehensive and integrated community-based
 25 Coastal Zone Management Program."

1 My only comment to that is it's an incomplete
 2 sentence. There's no -- it's like half a thought. I would
 3 prefer like, "develop the more comprehensive and development
 4 community-based Coastal Zone Management Program," or
 5 something that ties to together.
 6 Commissioner Mardfin.
 7 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move that we add the word
 8 at the beginning, "achieve."
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 10 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Starr.
 12 Motion is to add the word, "achieve a more comprehensive and
 13 community-based Coastal Zone Management Program."
 14 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 15 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Maybe a better word is
 16 "establish" versus "achieve."
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: "Establish a more comprehensive and
 18 integrated Coastal Zone Management Program." Maker of the
 19 motion agrees with the change to "established." Does the
 20 seconder concur?
 21 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: "Establish."
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Who seconded it, Jonathan?
 23 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, second.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion? All those in favor,
 25 signify by saying "aye."

1 (Round of ayes.)
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 3 (No response.)
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 5 Any other discussion on Goal and Objective Number 1
 6 on policies and actions underneath Objective Number 1?
 7 Commissioner Mardfin.
 8 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: This is a general concern.
 9 And I'm going to pick Policy 1, but it's throughout this
 10 whole document.
 11 The first word in Policy 1 is ensure. And whenever
 12 I see that word, my mind says and how are they going to do
 13 that? Some of the things that we are ensuring are beyond
 14 our power to do. Maybe this one isn't. But I wish we could
 15 find a word other than ensure and use it throughout.
 16 Because in most cases, we can't ensure things.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? The motion
 18 that we have on the floor is to accept Policies 1 through
 19 7 --
 20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: And action items --
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: -- under Objective Number 1.
 22 Is that the GPAC Recommendation, Jonathan, or is
 23 that the Director's Recommendation?
 24 COMMISSIONER STARR: It was a Director's
 25 Recommendation, because I believe it would end up that way

1 anyway.

2 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. So it would be the Director's
3 Recommendation. So on Items 1 and 7, we're looking at the
4 language that the Director -- in the second column as
5 opposed to the first.

6 Additional discussion?
7 Commissioner Mardfin.

8 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Would somebody answer my
9 question about how we ensure Policy 1.

10 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers, the fountain of all
11 answers.

12 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Ensure is
13 actually a very strong verb to use in this context and in
14 the context of a policy statement. The actual
15 implementation would be done through a number of measures in
16 the actions section, including the development of some of
17 these special programs, modification of ordinances,
18 increased funding in some instances. So it's really a range
19 of tools that the community will use to achieve --

20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'll accept it at this
21 point.

22 MR. SUMMERS: Thanks.

23 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?

24 Commissioner Hiranaga.

25 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: This is Policy Number 7,

1 and so goey that nobody is going to be able to do anything.

2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Mr. Chairman.

3 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.

4 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I think with a steward, that
5 might occur. With multiple stewards, I think they can be
6 responsive to the community and appropriate for the
7 community area, the moku area. So I think there's less
8 molasses with multiple stewards rather than a single
9 steward.

10 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
11 Commissioner Sablas.

12 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Could we somehow incorporate
13 the Aha Moku concept in the action here. Because we have
14 established they are in existence, all the mokus are there,
15 they know their particular area. So the idea is to consult
16 with the people of the place.

17 CHAIR HEDANI: Would this replace the Moku Council
18 or be veto power over the Moku Council? Or how does this
19 work? Mr. Summers.

20 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Action 5 in
21 that section gets right at this discussion.

22 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Sablas.

23 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: I guess, again, I would like
24 to ask the Director about the rationale for this recommended
25 change.

1 appoint a steward. Does that mean you're creating another
2 job, a payroll job? Or can a steward be voluntary, like the
3 Planning Commission? I'm not sure.

4 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

5 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. It could be
6 implemented either way.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.

8 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I want to also stay with
9 Policy 7. And my problem is the singular notion with the
10 word "steward." Because we had taken in our goal that we're
11 going to look at the Aha Moku concept. And I'm not sure any
12 given person is the appropriate person to steward all the
13 mokus. So I would prefer it be, "appoint stewards with
14 experience in traditional management practice who will
15 oversee preservation areas." And I'll make that as a
16 motion.

17 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Second.

18 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Guard.

19 The motion is to change the word "steward" to
20 "stewards"?

21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: "Appoint stewards" and take
22 out the word "a."

23 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?

24 My only comment on this is that it's like pouring
25 molasses on to the approving system so that it gets so thick

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.

2 DIRECTOR HUNT: I'll defer to Mr. Summers.

3 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

4 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. This
5 recommendation came from the GPAC during the -- towards the
6 end of its review. And it came from some of the Hawaiian
7 members of the GPAC who wanted to ensure that we have more
8 sensitivity to Hawaiian issues in decision-making. And so
9 Number 5 was intended to address that and, in part,
10 implement Policy Number 1 that talked about appointing a
11 steward, stewards, which has now been broadened.

12 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. The current discussion is on
13 Item Number 7, to change the word "steward" to "appoint
14 stewards."

15 Additional discussion? Ready for the question?
16 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."

17 (Round of ayes.)

18 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."

19 (No response.)

20 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.

21 One comment that I had on Action Item Number -- I
22 mean, Policy Number 5, my comment is don't recommend what
23 you did not read. So the assumption here is that everyone
24 here has read the Beach Management Plan for Maui, Coastal
25 Non-point Pollution Control Program Management Plan, et

1 cetera, until Item 5.
 2 Commissioner Mardfin.
 3 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I support your comment on
 4 that. And I wanted to ask in a parochial sense, the Beach
 5 Management Plan for Maui, does that deal with East Maui? Is
 6 there a section dealing with East Maui?
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 8 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. That covers
 9 the entire Maui, including East Maui.
 10 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Coastal Non-point Pollution
 11 Control Program Management Plan?
 12 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Implementation Plan for
 14 Polluted Runoff Control?
 15 MR. SUMMERS: That's correct.
 16 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Ocean Resource Management
 17 Plan?
 18 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.
 19 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: And Aha Moku Council?
 20 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: So you're saying that you're
 22 not dealing with any particular areas, it's for an
 23 island-wide plan? These are all island-wide plans?
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 25 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. These are

1 with the Maui Island Plan." And we actually do have, later
 2 on in this section, more specific policies about beach
 3 nourishment to address those concerns.
 4 But in general, often times when you're looking at
 5 a site, you do have to -- you know, this is best management
 6 practice at a general level. Which for a specific site, you
 7 need to take that to another level of review. So I think
 8 it's more of a tool kit than a mandate in most instances.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Any additional discussion?
 10 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 11 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Item Number 1, the word
 12 "retire from active use," are there areas on Maui that are
 13 currently retired from active use?
 14 When you say "active use," does that mean no one
 15 can enter the water in or near the area for perpetuity, or
 16 is there inactive use, I guess?
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 18 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I think a
 19 good example of this concept would be, say, Honolua Bay.
 20 And I think you bring up an excellent point that this
 21 particular term should be clarified.
 22 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: The word "retire" or
 23 "active use"?
 24 MR. SUMMERS: I think "retire from active use." I
 25 think Staff can work on making that a little more specific.

1 specific management strategies to address these issues at an
 2 island-wide level, but also at a project level to provide
 3 just best management practices, if you will.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Let me give you -- I'm sorry. Did
 5 he answer your question?
 6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Yeah. I'm uncomfortable
 7 with this, but go ahead.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Let me give you an example, John.
 9 Beach Management Plan for Maui. This says incorporate the
 10 following plan and subsequent updates were consistent, Beach
 11 Management Plan for Maui.
 12 If the Beach Management Plan says nourish the
 13 beaches, which I think it does, we opted not to nourish the
 14 beaches at Kaanapali because there is the chance that if we
 15 did something like that and there were 2 percent fines in
 16 the sand that we replenish the beach with, it would
 17 permanently discolor the water and make it milky forever.
 18 So we opted not to do that.
 19 So I think where the Beach Management Plan has been
 20 implemented in North Maui, it's exactly that that happened.
 21 So are we still embracing that?
 22 MR. SUMMERS: I think it's also important to note,
 23 because beach nourishment can have some -- it can be very
 24 good in some locations, it can be a real problem in other
 25 locations. So we have some language here, "were consistent

1 CHAIR HEDANI: I had the same concern. I had the
 2 word "retired" circled. Retired to me means prohibited from
 3 ever setting foot in that area forever more. And I don't
 4 think that was the intent.
 5 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: You could unretire. A lot
 6 of people who retire unretire.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Or only retirees can use that
 8 section. I could go for that.
 9 Commissioner Shibuya.
 10 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I just want to come back
 11 again to Item Number 1. It's talking about definition by
 12 monitoring and reducing point and non-point source
 13 pollution. Is there another way that we can use words that
 14 are more descriptive than some bureaucratic term such as
 15 point and non-point?
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: I'm sorry. Did we dispense with
 17 Item 1? Staff is going to handle that.
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Where are we, Mr. Chairman?
 19 I'm confused.
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: We were on Action Item Number 1,
 21 regarding the word "retired from active use." But Staff is
 22 going to handle that.
 23 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 24 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: From a procedural matter,
 25 if we're going to adopt a motion with these types of things

1 to be determined, how are you going to handle that if the
 2 words that are provided by Staff --
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: I'd rather stick them up on the wall
 4 and agree to them now rather than have to revisit the same
 5 thing over and over.
 6 John.
 7 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I actually
 8 think that the entire -- that language can be struck. I
 9 don't think it's necessary. Manage, protect and set aside.
 10 It's pretty clear. I think this would be operationalized
 11 more specifically in the plan that would be developed and in
 12 any implemented ordinances.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: So you're saying delete the words
 14 "and retire from active use"?
 15 MR. SUMMERS: That's correct.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there any discussion on that? Is
 17 there a consensus? Okay, so by consensus.
 18 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: What are we doing?
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Deleting the words "and retire from
 20 active use."
 21 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair, I don't agree with
 22 that.
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion? Is there a motion on
 24 the floor?
 25 Commissioner Hiranaga.

1 managed or a marine protected area, such as Ahihi. So if
 2 you're concerned about this, maybe you can address that
 3 concern at the MMA level, and it should take care of it.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: I can go to Ahihi Canal and swim in
 5 the ocean right now. It's not retired from active use, from
 6 my perspective. It's a managed area. It's a protected
 7 area. You cannot harvest anything. You cannot destroy
 8 anything in the area. But it's still in active use, unless
 9 I misunderstood it.
 10 MS. STALEY: No, it is a managed area, a marine
 11 managed area. And not all marine managed areas -- we can
 12 get to this in a minute. But they're not all handled in the
 13 same planned program or implementation. There's going to be
 14 different uses across the board for every single one.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Commissioner Starr.
 16 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, there is an area that is
 17 kapu right now.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Yeah, that's part of the management
 19 plan. You can close it from time-to-time, then you can
 20 reopen it when it recovers.
 21 Discussion? Additional discussion?
 22 Commissioner Mardfin.
 23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Is there a motion on the
 24 floor? I mean, is there an amendment on the floor?
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Yeah, the amendment on the floor is

1 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'll make a motion to amend
 2 Action Item Number 1, insert the word "and" between
 3 protect -- protect set aside, and delete "and retire from
 4 active use," because I think that's redundant.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: Moved by Commissioner Hiranaga,
 6 seconded by Commissioner U'u.
 7 So it would read, "work with appropriate agencies
 8 and community organizations to manage, protect, set aside --
 9 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: "And set aside."
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: "And set aside those reef ecosystems
 11 identified on the cultural/scenic resource policy map."
 12 Discussion?
 13 Commissioner Starr.
 14 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, I would prefer to keep
 15 the wording as it is. An example is Ahihi-Kinau, where
 16 currently a large portion of it is retired from active use
 17 because it was getting destroyed. And it was considered the
 18 only way to save it was to take it out of use until it could
 19 recover, and then be brought back into use. So I don't
 20 agree with taking the wording out.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Julia.
 22 MS. STALEY: I understand the importance of this,
 23 and I think that we'll revisit this when we look at marine
 24 managed areas and marine protected areas. Because what this
 25 is doing is basically going to set you up for a marine

1 change Action Item 1 to -- delete the word "retire from
 2 active use" and to insert the word "and set aside."
 3 Additional discussion? All those in favor, signify
 4 by saying "aye."
 5 (Round of ayes.)
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 7 (Nay.)
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: One nay. Additional discussion --
 9 I'm sorry.
 10 Director Hunt.
 11 DIRECTOR HUNT: Could I ask for a hand vote on that
 12 last one.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor, signify by
 14 raising your hand. One, two, three, four. Opposed, same
 15 sign. Two. Four to two.
 16 I vote in favor. So five to two.
 17 DIRECTOR HUNT: So it passes.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: What happened to John?
 19 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Maybe we need a break.
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move to insert an Action
 22 Number 2. And I don't whether it has the wording that they
 23 had under the policy. If she doesn't, I'll try to
 24 reconstruct it. Okay. From her smile, it sounds like she
 25 doesn't have it.

1 That "The Maui Planning Commission be the lead
 2 decision-making body to protect the shoreline, reefs and
 3 nearshore waters."
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 5 COMMISSIONER STARR: Seconded.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Starr.
 7 Did you get that, Julia?
 8 MS. STALEY: Not all of it.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Could you repeat that again.
 10 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: That "The Maui Planning
 11 Commission be the lead" -- and I took Commissioner Sablas'
 12 suggestion, to "be the lead body to protect the shoreline,
 13 reefs and nearshore waters."
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: This is a new item?
 15 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Action 2. Because people
 16 didn't, obviously, like it as a policy, so we'll put it as
 17 an action.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 19 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 20 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'll be voting against the
 21 amendment. Again, I don't know if the Maui Planning
 22 Commission is the right entity to be overseeing this. And
 23 I'd rather just leave it for future determination.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 25 Commissioner Starr.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: According to Corp. Counsel, we're
 2 the final authority in the Coastal Zone Management Area.
 3 MR. GIROUX: Yeah. But as far as near shore
 4 waters, it's DLNR. Then when you get out further, you deal
 5 with federal jurisdiction.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: So we're going to compete with the
 7 DLNR and the U.S. Coast Guard.
 8 Discussion? Ready for the question? All those in
 9 favor, signify by raising your hand.
 10 Three in favor.
 11 Same sign, opposed. Four -- five opposed. Motion
 12 is lost.
 13 My comment on Action Item Number 2 is it's
 14 redundant because it basically repeats everything that's in
 15 Item -- or Policy 5.
 16 Okay, we've disposed of that particular motion.
 17 Let's take a ten-minute break for our stenographer. We'll
 18 be back at 11:00.
 19 (At which time, a recess was taken.)
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: The Planning Commission is back in
 21 session. I have no idea where we were. But the Director
 22 says we're moving really, really, really too slow, okay. So
 23 far, we've looked at one and a half pages.
 24 Commissioner Starr.
 25 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes. Policy 1 under

1 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, I'd like to call upon
 2 our Corp. Counsel to read our charter. I believe it says we
 3 are the final authority on the shoreline issue. But I'd
 4 like him to give us a real wording.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: Corp. Counsel.
 6 MR. GIROUX: I don't have the hard copy. I can get
 7 it on the computer. But I know that it's -- it states that
 8 you're the final authority in the CZMA, is what it says,
 9 CZMA. And that's basically the federal funded version of
 10 what we have, which allows the state to create 205(a). And
 11 then 205(a) is what this body has the final authority over.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Our stenographer has gone for
 13 one hour and 45 minutes so far. But let's dispose of this
 14 motion before we take a break.
 15 Any additional discussion? Question on the floor
 16 is to add -- Julia, can you read it, please.
 17 MS. STALEY: "The Maui Planning Commission be the
 18 lead decision-making body to protect the shoreline, reefs
 19 and nearshore waters." We're happy to fix verbs if need be.
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion? Ready for the question?
 21 Commissioner U'u.
 22 COMMISSIONER U'U: Are we the authority as we
 23 speak, or are there other agencies? I know we got
 24 recommendations for the agencies. But are we the final
 25 authority?

1 Objective 1, there's a note on the Director's Recommendation
 2 to move it to Objective 2. I believe the intent was to
 3 actually move it to Objective 3. I'm making an amendment
 4 that Policy 1 be moved to Objective -- under Objective 3.
 5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Didn't we cover that already?
 7 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. That was
 8 just a clarification. We have not covered it. The intent
 9 is to move it to Objective 3, not to as the paper states.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Our understanding is it will
 11 be moved to Objective 3?
 12 MR. SUMMERS: That's correct.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. We'll just do that by
 14 consensus, then.
 15 Additional discussion on -- are we still on Goal
 16 Number 1, Objective Number 1, policies and actions. Any
 17 additional amendments?
 18 Julia, you're adding an amendment.
 19 MS. STALEY: I wouldn't dream of it. But I would
 20 like to get a clarification from you guys.
 21 At the last meeting, you guys voted under the
 22 cultural section. And it's a language that I put on the
 23 board here, everywhere that it says Aha Moku Council. You
 24 guys asked for it to reflect consultation with the Aha Moku
 25 Council, or a similar advisory council. And I put that in

1 everywhere. And that's going to remain; correct?
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Right, universal change.
 3 MS. STALEY: Go get 'em, tiger.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm going to -- I hope it
 6 passes, but I'm going to vote no. We tried it as a policy
 7 and we tried as an action as the Maui Planning Commission to
 8 be cited as a lead agency. So I'm going to vote no. But I
 9 do hope it passes.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Guard.
 11 COMMISSIONER GUARD: I appreciate that. As I was
 12 going through this -- I think these are all great ideas that
 13 the Maui Planning Commission can take on and use it on their
 14 decisions, project by project. But Ward isn't going to be
 15 here forever and Commissioner Starr isn't going to be on the
 16 Planning Commission forever. So to give so much authority
 17 to one body may not be a very good long-term idea. So I
 18 think we should call for the question and move on.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. At the current time, I have
 20 no motions on the floor other than the main motion for Goal
 21 Number 1, Objective Number 1, policies and actions.
 22 Additional discussion? Ready for the question? As
 23 amended.
 24 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: We're voting on the
 25 original motion?

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Right.
 2 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Which is the Director's
 3 Recommendations as amended?
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Right.
 5 Discussion? All those in favor, signify by saying
 6 "aye."
 7 (Round of ayes.)
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 9 (Nay.)
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: One nay. Motion carries.
 11 Objective Number 2. Improve reef health, coastal
 12 water quality and fish stocks.
 13 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 15 COMMISSIONER STARR: Move to approve Objective 2
 16 and the underlying policies and actions.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second? Seconded by
 18 Commissioner U'u.
 19 Discussion.
 20 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Yeah, Mr. Starr.
 22 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, I move to amend, by
 23 including -- do you have the wording from before? Include
 24 the Special Area Management plan areas within SMA processes.
 25 This will be a new policy under Objective 2.

1 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Could you repeat that.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Julia, could you repeat that,
 3 please. Did you get that?
 4 Could you repeat that, Commissioner Starr.
 5 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. Include Special Area
 6 Management Plan areas within the SMA process.
 7 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Where does it go,
 8 Commissioner Starr?
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Question from Commissioner Mardfin
 10 as to where that would go.
 11 COMMISSIONER STARR: It would be an additional
 12 policy. I don't care what number policy it is.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 14 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Mardfin.
 16 Discussion?
 17 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 18 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I have to admit, I haven't
 19 read all the studies that was provided to us on the CD. So
 20 I just wanted to know if the example is an existing plan and
 21 if we can have a brief explanation of what that is.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 23 So we have Special Management Area Permits and we
 24 have Special Management Area Plans.
 25 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I think it

1 would be actually helpful if the members went to the
 2 specific policy on this, which is in the Watershed section.
 3 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: What page, please?
 4 MR. SUMMERS: That would be page 22. That's Action
 5 Number 3. And this is in the three-column matrix you
 6 received this morning.
 7 Essentially, what the Special Area Management Plan
 8 does is there would be specific areas identified on a map.
 9 We have developed maps for the members. These would be
 10 areas that are identified due to the importance of the
 11 watershed resources and the proximity of those resources to
 12 very sensitive coral marine ecosystems. These are to be
 13 identified on a map. And a plan would be developed and
 14 adopted to ensure more effective management of those
 15 watersheds and coastal resources.
 16 Along with that, an overlay zoning ordinance would
 17 be adopted. All this would be reviewed and approved by the
 18 Planning Commission, reviewed and recommendations provided
 19 by the Commission, a lot of public input, and then final
 20 approval by the Council. These standards would specifically
 21 provide direction for the protection of these areas. Now,
 22 it does call for the development of a Moku Council or
 23 similar advisory body to manage this system. So we've been
 24 having a conversation this morning about which vehicle would
 25 be more effective.

1 So again, in short, these would be plans, plans
2 that are developed for specific areas, plans that would then
3 be implemented through the adoption of an overlay ordinance,
4 and a body created to manage that framework.

5 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
6 Commissioner Hiranaga.

7 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: The SMA area is very basic
8 guidelines. It's all lands makai of state highways. Very
9 basic. So if we included this proposed amendment, how much
10 of an increase in land area would that entail? Would that
11 double the area under our jurisdiction, triple, quadruple
12 it?

13 MR. SUMMERS: In some areas, it would increase
14 those management areas significantly. And in other areas,
15 there would be no effect. And you can see that from the
16 maps. They're in the book. We're tried to narrow those
17 areas to areas particularly where we've had significant
18 coral reef habitat that is threatened.

19 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: So the largest areas might
20 be the Olowalu Stream area?

21 MR. SUMMERS: Olowalu would be one area. There are
22 also significant resources in Makena that would be protected
23 through this. Paia is another example.

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.

25 DIRECTOR HUNT: John, there's a map in the island

1 areas within the SMA process.

2 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
3 Commissioner Starr.

4 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes. This is intended, first
5 of all, to simplify the process so that the SAMP areas will
6 be dealt with under the SMA process rather than creating a
7 new process under the Aha Moku Council to have that
8 discussion.

9 And these are the areas that are -- have been
10 defined through the studies as those areas that need to
11 be -- need to be considered regarding the runoff from those
12 areas that is -- that are causing destruction to our reef
13 stock. And continuing to only consider a runoff issues in
14 those areas mauka -- I'm sorry, makai of the road does not
15 allow us to deal with the loads -- the loading from mauka
16 areas. These are the areas that would have been identified
17 as having the most impact.

18 So I think this is very much in line in the
19 direction of where we've been heading by protecting the
20 reefs with dealing with runoff.

21 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
22 Commissioner Hiranaga.

23 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: So just a question. Say
24 you want to build a house in Keokea, you would have to
25 submit an SMA Application determination from the Planning

1 plan, isn't there.

2 MR. MICHAELSON: Yes.

3 DIRECTOR HUNT: Could you help the Commissioners
4 find that. If it would be helpful.

5 MR. SUMMERS: If we can take a minute, we can
6 extract it.

7 If the members take their document and open it up
8 to the mapping section.

9 CHAIR HEDANI: Sorry, Mr. Summers.

10 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 If you go to the mapping section, which is the
12 second tab in your binder, you'll have a set of maps that
13 are called Marine Resource Special Management -- Special
14 Area Management and Zone Maps. These are at the end of that
15 mapping section. I think it's easiest to look at the
16 island-wide map. So go to the second tab under mapping.
17 And then go towards the end of that section, and you'll find
18 those maps.

19 MR. MICHAELSON: It looks like this.

20 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Right.

21 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Additional discussion on the
22 question on the floor, which is an amendment to add an
23 additional policy under Objective Number 2, which reads --
24 Julia.

25 MS. STALEY: Include Special Area Management Plan

1 Director, whether you're exempt or not from an SMA Permit
2 because you live in Keokea and the SAMP area? I'm just
3 wondering -- like we're going to create a lot of work for
4 the Planning Department.

5 CHAIR HEDANI: I'm just wondering whether we're
6 creating an unworkable system.

7 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Director --

8 CHAIR HEDANI: You guys are the ones that are going
9 to have to administer that.

10 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Could you answer this
11 question.

12 CHAIR HEDANI: Director.

13 DIRECTOR HUNT: I would defer to my Staff to give
14 the details of how the proposed scheme would work.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

16 MR. SUMMERS: I think the question was -- and
17 correct me if I'm wrong -- if a dwelling unit was to be
18 constructed in one of these brown areas, it would require a
19 Special Area Management Permit from the Planning Commission.
20 Is that your question?

21 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: No. Determination from the
22 Planning Director as to whether it's exempt or not.

23 MR. SUMMERS: Right. I think it depends on how the
24 program is implemented. If it's implemented to exactly
25 comport with the requirements as they exist today in the

1 Special Management Area, that may be the outcome. I think
2 during the development of the plans and the overlay
3 ordinance, those types of decisions would be made
4 specifically as to both the effectiveness of the overlay
5 category, but also whether or not it will be efficient and
6 can be administered.

7 So how I would see it playing out is larger
8 developments that may result in significant runoff to the --
9 due to the project and result in damage to the reefs, those
10 probably would require some additional management to prevent
11 that from recurring. Again, the system is going to have to
12 be set up so that it doesn't bog down the entire development
13 process. That would be part of the decision-making during
14 the adoption of the overlay ordinance.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.

16 DIRECTOR HUNT: And I think that John's last
17 comment is real important. Any ordinance involving the SMA
18 or land use has to go before the Planning Commission. And
19 you folks could, at least, make recommendations as to the
20 extent of that review and where do you draw that line, what
21 kind of exemptions are allowed or what kind of review is
22 required.

23 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

24 MR. SUMMERS: If I may add to that. This would
25 have to be adopted along with a coordinated strategy to

1 way to the shore. If we don't do that and we put houses in
2 there right now, we've got a major erosion problem.

3 So that's why I support this expansion of our
4 responsibilities. And since I'm going to be having at least
5 four and a half more years here, I'm willing to step up and
6 do it.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?

8 Commissioner Mardfin.

9 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I am in support of the
10 motion, which is why I seconded it. Earlier this morning,
11 Mr. Summers told me there is no SAMP for East Maui. If
12 we're going to require SAMPs, I think a SAMP should be
13 developed for East Maui. And I don't know if it's
14 appropriate to vote on this motion and then it can't be
15 done, and/or if the plan was to develop a SAMP for East
16 Maui.

17 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

18 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The
19 original intent with this was to identify using extensive
20 data developed from NOAA on coral reef coverage and coral
21 reef health, areas where we have watersheds, we have steep
22 topography, and we have the reefs. All three combinations
23 have to be met for us to include an area to be a SAMP.

24 We do have a provision that, as more research is
25 made available, additional areas could be added. And we

1 narrow the focus of the Special Management Area back to its
2 original intent.

3 We have an issue now where the system is requiring
4 a great deal of Staff time. It's very extensive in terms of
5 its review. And obviously, there's been a limited
6 effectiveness because we're seeing our coral marine
7 ecosystems are rapidly disappearing.

8 So I think the focus would have to shift back to
9 its original purpose. And I think that would be a good
10 thing. And it would not result in the increase in permit
11 volume that I think you're leading to if the system was
12 revised comprehensively.

13 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Shibuya.

14 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I'm in support of this SMA
15 expansion here on the review authority of the Maui Planning
16 Commission. The reason for it is that if we are going to
17 put in policies about water runoff, erosions, development
18 mitigations on dust and runoff, we need to be assured. And
19 these are some of the ways we actually are able to review
20 the development plans.

21 Also, the areas that it indicates there on the
22 mauka side, especially up at the 4,000, 5,000 foot
23 elevation, we're talking about restoring or possibly
24 restoring ancient forest; the forest that once before used
25 to provide water that used to trickle down streams all the

1 think all watersheds need to be protected more effectively
2 than they are being protected today. But we didn't have the
3 coral marine data to justify during the development of this
4 map, the creation of a SAMP for the Hana area.

5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Is it the intent to go ahead
6 and do that?

7 MR. SUMMERS: Our intent is if we have better data,
8 if better data is made available that would suggest that we
9 have these coral reef ecosystems that would necessitate a
10 SAMP, then we would want to do that. At this point, we
11 don't have that data. We're trying to be as precise as we
12 can to ensure the system.

13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: There is coral in Hana Bay.

14 CHAIR HEDANI: Any additional questions?

15 Discussion?

16 Commissioner Hiranaga.

17 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'm not opposed to the
18 concept of further review and protection of SAMP areas. I'm
19 not necessarily that fond of the proposed language. I might
20 suggest something like encourage and support greater review
21 and protection of SAMP areas, and not necessarily put it
22 within the SMA process. The entity who's going to be doing
23 that will be determined in the future.

24 CHAIR HEDANI: That was discussion. That wasn't a
25 formal amendment. Additional discussion?

1 Commissioner U'u.
 2 COMMISSIONER U'U: You know, I agree with
 3 Commissioner Hiranaga. We can be voting on something that's
 4 going to be created and looking to create something. And
 5 you know, like I said earlier, I went through the SMA
 6 process with my house. And it took me a year. And I'm all
 7 for protecting the near shore water quality, but also
 8 looking at not putting too much bumps on the road for human
 9 life. I think you can do it like what Commissioner Hiranaga
 10 said, in the permitting process. I think we're adding a
 11 lot. And that's what scares me here.

12 I want to know from the long-range planners if we
 13 implement everything that we have in the plan that's given
 14 to us, I want a breakdown of what it is and what it entails.
 15 That will be the new process for all these new processes
 16 that we added. And on top of that, what will be the cost?

17 Because we're piece-mealing this entire plan that's
 18 been given to us time-by-time, day-by-day, week-by-bike.
 19 And we're adding so much, I'm in shock. And we're already
 20 the slowest permitting process in the state, and we're
 21 adding new agencies. I want to know the cost effectiveness,
 22 one. Who will take the cost? State? County?

23 I don't want to know what we're adding to already
 24 an existing policy. Say the SMA. I want a breakdown, if
 25 possible, if you guys can do it. Which you guys should do

1 get during the environmental impact statement process or the
 2 development of construction plans. We do have order of
 3 magnitude costs.

4 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner U'u.

5 COMMISSIONER U'U: I know you brought up the word
 6 "projects." I'm not looking at projects. I'm looking at
 7 the implementing process that's very gray right now. We
 8 have the Aha Moku. We have the SAMP. And this is two days
 9 in, three days in. I have no idea what we're getting into.
 10 I want a broken down, step-by-step, play-by-play process for
 11 what we're about to get to the end of instead of going it
 12 one page at a time. This is what we got at the end of time.
 13 And then at the end, we add it up. Basically, that's what I
 14 feel we're going.

15 I mean, look at this. Look at this general plan
 16 that we got to go through. Who would ever do such a thing?

17 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. The question on the floor is
 18 to amend by adding a policy, it says -- Julia.

19 MS. STALEY: "Encourage and support greater
 20 review" --

21 CHAIR HEDANI: No, the second one.

22 MS. STALEY: Just kidding. Just testing you.
 23 "Include SAMP areas within the SMA process."

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 25 Commissioner Starr.

1 of the entire process. Not development, for everything.
 2 The planning process. Can we get that from you? Or is that
 3 taking it a page at a time and adding it as we go? And at
 4 the end, we look at what we got.

5 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 6 Hopefully, I'll get an answer from them.

7 Mr. Summers.

8 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. We do have
 9 an extensive section in the plan on implementation, as well
 10 as an additional section on monitoring and evaluation.

11 The actions in the plan are prioritized -- health
 12 safety, loss of an irretrievable resource, legal mandate.
 13 Those types of issues. So we clearly articulate what the
 14 implications would be for specific actions, both our best
 15 guess in terms of cost, as well as the rationale for the
 16 priority. We've gotten a lot of input from GPAC on this.
 17 We're looking forward to your input.

18 Ultimately, the Council is going to have to make
 19 some tough decisions about which projects go and which
 20 projects don't go and what the implications of those
 21 decisions will be. In this case, the natural environment.
 22 In other instance, it might be infrastructure or other areas
 23 that are important to our community.

24 So we've got it. We are at an island-planning
 25 level. So we don't have the kind of costing that you would

1 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes. I cannot stress the
 2 importance of this. Because we have seen what's happening
 3 to our reefs. Let's take, as a case study, Honolua Bay.

4 Until five years ago, Honolua Bay was the gem. It was the
 5 unspoiled pearl of Maui. It was incredibly diverse with
 6 corals and with fish. And the SMA is a very, very narrow
 7 area, bounded by the road at Honolua. No development has
 8 occurred in the SMA area at Honolua.

9 In the last five years, Honolua has been destroyed.
 10 If you go there now, over half of the coral is dead. Most
 11 of the rest of it is dying. The fish have declined to just
 12 tiny fractions of what there was in terms of quantity and
 13 diversity.

14 I remember last year before this body, I was really
 15 upset because I went diving there and every single wana was
 16 covered up with eucalyptus leafs and all the coral was
 17 covered with a half inch of mud. And that all occurred
 18 upstream. So there was no process regarding shoreline
 19 decisions when the permits were issued for those houses, and
 20 there was very little control. There was not best
 21 management practices utilized. The damage has been done.

22 There is still some areas that are worth saving.
 23 And this is an attempt to identify and try to save them by
 24 creating an awareness of the processes that occur upstream
 25 where the toxicity is being initiated. And I really would

1 appreciate what's been happening on the Commission in the
2 SMA area. We're all participating in this. And I think we
3 all realize the importance.

4 I think we really should take a lesson from that
5 and utilize what the scientists are telling us, that these
6 areas are just as sensitive, and create a process to try to
7 preserve the reefs which are one of our greatest and most
8 important resources. Thank you.

9 CHAIR HEDANI: Are we ready for the question?
10 Commissioner Hiranaga.

11 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I agree with Commissioner
12 Starr's concerns, but I will be voting against the proposed
13 amendment because I do not agree with the language that is
14 being proposed. If Mr. Starr were to take a look at what I
15 had proposed, he can modify it, he will obtain my support.
16 But at this time, with that specific proposed language, I
17 will be voting against the amendment.

18 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. I think we beat this to
19 death.

20 All those in favor of the motion, signify by saying
21 "aye."

22 (Round of ayes.)

23 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."

24 (Round of nays.)

25 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor. One, two,

1 district -- I think it's 12 in the Kihei/Makena Community
2 Plan. The Maalaea Triangle Project where the North Kihei
3 Road and Honoapiilani Highway meet, that would be the
4 terminus, as I understand it.

5 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: And they would go -- I'm
6 sorry?

7 MR. SUMMERS: It would go behind the power plant.

8 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Mauka of Kealia Pond?

9 MR. SUMMERS: That's correct.

10 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: How far is that from
11 Mokulele Highway? Are they going to be a couple hundred
12 yards apart?

13 MR. SUMMERS: Pretty close. There is a map in the
14 binder. When we get to that section, you can look more
15 specifically.

16 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
17 Commissioner Starr.

18 COMMISSIONER STARR: I'd like to offer another
19 amendment. That amendment shall be create mechanisms for
20 eliminating runoff and pollution originating in SAMP areas.

21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.

22 CHAIR HEDANI: Are we discussing the same motion in
23 a different form?

24 COMMISSIONER STARR: No.

25 CHAIR HEDANI: For the Commission's information,

1 three, four.

2 Opposed, same sign. One, two, three. Motion is
3 lost.

4 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Chairman voted against?

5 CHAIR HEDANI: Chairman voted against.

6 Additional discussion? We're only on Objective
7 Number 2, guys. Any additional discussion on Objective
8 Number 2.

9 Commissioner Hiranaga.

10 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I have only one comment for
11 Objective Number 2, Action Item Number 2. Just curious on
12 the GPAC Recommendation. They want a possible mauka
13 realignment of North Kihei Road. And I'm just wondering
14 where that road might go? Because Kealia Pond is mauka of
15 North Kihei Road. So if you're going to make it -- you
16 going to make a Mokulele Highway? I'm just curious where
17 they proposed that.

18 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

19 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. This
20 actually carries from the current recommendation in the
21 Kihei Community Plan. There's a recommendation to realign
22 that highway and move it behind the bird sanctuary.

23 The actual -- this would be subject to engineering
24 studies and the environmental approval process. But the
25 area where you have the triangle project where the project

1 you can amend the existing SMA maps to take it from the high
2 upper reach of the wash of the waves to the top of the
3 mountain. If you wanted to, the entire island would be the
4 SMA area. So that's already in the existing law. All you
5 have to do is amend the maps.

6 COMMISSIONER STARR: Should I repeat.

7 MS. STALEY: I have the language. I just need a
8 clarification where you want this to go. You want an
9 additional policy?

10 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes.

11 CHAIR HEDANI: Would you repeat the motion, Julia.

12 MS. STALEY: As it stands, I have from Mr. Starr,
13 "create mechanisms for eliminating runoff and pollution in
14 SAMP areas."

15 COMMISSIONER STARR: "Originating in."

16 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?

17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.

18 CHAIR HEDANI: It's already seconded by

19 Commissioner Mardfin. Discussion?

20 Commissioner Guard.

21 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Thank you. I don't know if
22 you want to add anything in there about Commissioner
23 Shibuya's mentioning more of the reef restoration in the
24 upper reaches of those areas as well. Instead of just
25 pointing out the runoff and pollution, but looking at the

1 potential improvements of the upper reaches of the SAMP
2 areas.
3 COMMISSIONER STARR: To me, that would be one way
4 of accomplishing -- that would be one of the mechanisms.
5 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
6 Commissioner Hiranaga.
7 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'm just wondering if the
8 word "contain and control" versus "eliminating." Because
9 I'm not sure how you eliminate runoff.
10 COMMISSIONER STARR: "Contain and control" would be
11 fine with me to substitute for "eliminate."
12 CHAIR HEDANI: That would be a friendly amendment
13 to remove "eliminate" and to insert "contain and control."
14 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, "to contain and
15 control." That works.
16 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
17 How do you stop Waikoa Stream from running?
18 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Is that a trick question?
19 CHAIR HEDANI: According to this, you would have to
20 stop it from running if it would affect the reef.
21 I'm sorry. Additional discussion?
22 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: It's not runoff. Stream
23 flow is not runoff.
24 CHAIR HEDANI: Ready for the question? All those
25 in favor, signify by saying "aye."

1 Objective 2?
2 CHAIR HEDANI: Right. We'll cover that in
3 Objective 3.
4 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Then I'll make a motion. I
5 move that we add on Page 17, Objective 3, Action 1,
6 "Implement a Reef Protection and Restoration Plan" be
7 inserted into Objective 2.
8 COMMISSIONER STARR: I'll second.
9 CHAIR HEDANI: Moved and seconded to insert
10 "Implement a Reef Protection and Restoration Plan" into
11 Objective Number 2 as an action item.
12 Discussion? All those in favor, signify by saying
13 "aye."
14 (Round of ayes.)
15 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
16 (No response.)
17 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
18 Any other discussion on Objective Number 2? I
19 don't care anymore. Let's go ahead and vote. Ready for the
20 question?
21 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes.
22 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor of Objective
23 Number 2 Policies and Actions as amendment, signify by
24 saying "aye."
25 (Round of ayes.)

1 (Round of ayes.)
2 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
3 (No response.)
4 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
5 I have a comment on Policy Number 4, "Advocate
6 managed retreat from shorelines that are subject to severe
7 coastal hazards." My comment was "balanced with economic
8 considerations." That's so you don't have to move a hotel.
9 That's just for discussion.
10 Any other proposed changes to Objective Number 2,
11 policies and actions for the good of the order?
12 Commissioner Mardfin.
13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I don't an addition. But I
14 wanted to confirm that under Objective 3 on page 17.
15 COMMISSIONER STARR: We're on 2.
16 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: No, we're not. Objective 3
17 on Page 17, Action 1 says, "Implement a Reef Protection and
18 Restoration Plan." It says, "Move under Objective 2." Is
19 that part of our motion to include that?
20 CHAIR HEDANI: No.
21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: So we're going to vote on
22 Objective 2?
23 CHAIR HEDANI: Right.
24 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Then when we get to
25 Objective 3, we're going to get to something that modifies

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
2 (No response.)
3 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
4 Gentlemen and ladies, what's your pleasure?
5 Commissioner Mardfin.
6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move that we adopt
7 Objective 3, Policies 1 through 9, with the addition of
8 Policy 1 from Objective 1, and Actions 1 through 4 -- I'm
9 sorry. Two through four. We've already moved Action 1 up
10 already.
11 CHAIR HEDANI: Basically, you're moving to approve
12 Objective Number 3 and all policies and actions below it?
13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Correct.
14 CHAIR HEDANI: All remaining objectives and
15 policies. Is there a second?
16 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.
17 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Starr.
18 Discussion?
19 Commissioner Starr.
20 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. Do we need to mention
21 the objective that we moved to here or is that already done
22 or was that included in the motion?
23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: That was included in my
24 motion, Page 12.
25 CHAIR HEDANI: Item Number 1 has already been

1 moved.
 2 Commissioner Shibuya.
 3 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: On Item Number 3 A.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Is that Objective Item 3?
 5 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Objective 3 is okay with me,
 6 but I'm going to Policy Number 3 A and B. It says,
 7 "Subdivisions" -- well, I'll start from the beginning.
 8 "Require the approval of an Erosion and
 9 Sedimentation Control Plan (ESCP) for the following: A,
 10 subdivisions of four or more lots," semicolon, "and B,
 11 development that requires grading of more than a quarter of
 12 an acre."
 13 I've got an issue with the word "and." It is
 14 conditional that you have subdivisions of four or more lots.
 15 But if you have grading of more than a quarter of an acre,
 16 that is significant whether it has four or more lots. Why
 17 can't you just have subdivisions of four or more lots,
 18 semicolon, and then B, if you grade more than a quarter of
 19 an acre, then it's subject to this review?
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Staff. Mr. Summers.
 21 MR. SUMMERS: We agree with the recommendation.
 22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: That it be changed to "or"?
 23 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: I'm sorry. What is the change,
 25 John?

1 MR. SUMMERS: Under 3 A, substitute "and" for "or."
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: The other way around.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Substitute "or" for "and."
 4 MR. SUMMERS: "And" for "or."
 5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: You're putting "or" in.
 6 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: You're putting the "or" in.
 7 MR. SUMMERS: That's correct.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Hold on. Only one person at a time.
 9 John, state what the correction is.
 10 MR. SUMMERS: The correction is to strike the term
 11 "and" and replace it with "or."
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Any objections?
 13 (No response.)
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: No objections.
 15 I had a comment that says you're a quarter of an
 16 acre and you're 43,560 square feet --
 17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: That's an acre.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: -- does not match. So Item B says a
 19 quarter of an acre. And 43,560 foot squared is not a
 20 quarter of an acre. A quarter of an acre 10,890 square
 21 feet.
 22 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. This 43,560 --
 23 43,560 square feet would require an on-site monitoring
 24 program. Okay, so there's a difference there.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: So it's not an acre squared? It's

1 an on-site monitoring program for anything that's an acre?
 2 MR. SUMMERS: If you have grading in excess of an
 3 acre, you would have to have an on-site monitoring program.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Can we just change the language to
 5 say anything in excess of an acre?
 6 MR. SUMMERS: That would be good.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Any objections?
 8 (No response.)
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you. Any additional comments?
 10 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 11 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Just for my information,
 12 what is Ala Nui and Ala Hele? This is Number 4, Action
 13 item, Page 18.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: The question is what is Ala Nui, Ala
 15 Hele?
 16 MS. STALEY: This language was suggested through
 17 the GPAC process by Kaipō, similar to all the other ones
 18 with language like this. And Ala Nui and Ala Hele, he's
 19 referring to the trail system, that there is a trail system
 20 that was created by, I believe, by a nonprofit organization
 21 in combination with the state. And it has to do with
 22 traditional access points.
 23 I don't know that much more about it than that.
 24 All I know is that it's a big path.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: I know there's Ala Hele Trail and

1 Access System. But I don't know what Ala Nui is or Ala Hele
 2 is.
 3 MS. STALEY: I believe -- and I've been wrong
 4 before. But I believe Ala Nui is within the system. And I
 5 would have to refer to Kaipō, whom I can't call or e-mail.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. So at this point, we really
 7 don't know.
 8 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 9 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Yeah. I would just like
 10 clarity as to what we're voting on.
 11 MS. STALEY: Oh, I just received a note -- I'm
 12 sorry, Mr. Chairman.
 13 Leslie Bruce just wrote me a note that says it's
 14 the Piilani Trail. "Julia, Kaipō is referring to the trail
 15 system."
 16 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: So Ala Nui is a place?
 17 MS. STALEY: No, it's a trail.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Where's the Piilani Trail System?
 19 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: If I may, Chair.
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Sablas.
 21 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: My understanding is it's the
 22 coastal trail that traditionally surrounds the island. And
 23 basically, it just protects access to the ocean resources.
 24 But the trail is an ancient trail that surrounds all of Maui
 25 Nui. That's my understanding.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: That's Ala Nui?
 2 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: It encompasses the entire
 3 island. It's not just a place. It's a trail that
 4 circumvents Maui.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Additional discussion?
 6 Commissioner Starr.
 7 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. I believe that what Ala
 8 Hele is, is along the south shore and extends all the way
 9 out to Hana. And then Ala Nui is on the north side.
 10 They're both called the Piilani Trail. But they've been --
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Hiranaga.
 12 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: So maybe we should put
 13 "such as Ala Nui and Ala Hele Trails."
 14 COMMISSIONER STARR: Included.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Is that an amendment?
 16 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I don't know if that's an
 17 amendment. That could be just a clerical clarification.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Clarification?
 19 John's confused. He's giving me that quizzical
 20 look. Do you have -- okay, do you folks have any problem
 21 with the Director's Recommendation or the GPAC final
 22 recommendation relative to that question? Director's
 23 Recommendation.
 24 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: My motion was for -- I think
 25 it was my motion, to approve with the Director's

1 Recommendation throughout.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Right. Maker of the motion would be
 3 the Director's Recommendation included in the Objective 3.
 4 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Ala Nui and Ala Hele
 5 Trails?
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Hiranaga.
 7 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Once again, just for
 8 clarity. What is the Public Trust Doctrine? I should have
 9 done my background reading maybe. I do have to work for a
 10 living.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: What section are you referring to?
 12 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Policy Number 5, Page 19.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: That's Objective 4.
 14 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Sorry.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Any additional discussion on
 16 Objective 3?
 17 Commissioner Mardfin.
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: John, under Policy 6, you
 19 say, "Support the development of regulations to prevent the
 20 excessive taking of fish stocks." And I totally agree with
 21 the intent here. But should each local region moku develop
 22 their own to fit the local conditions, or is this a
 23 countywide policy?
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Which one are you referencing,
 25 Commissioner Mardfin?

1 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: On page 17, Policy Number 6.
 2 It says, "support the development of regulations." And I'm
 3 wondering whether we're talking about an island-wide
 4 regulations, or whether we're going to have local
 5 regulations for each moku? I would prefer the latter.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 7 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
 8 This would be implemented by the State DLNR. I
 9 would guess they would implement it by not just looking at
 10 the island in its totality, but looking at specific
 11 resources individually. They're already doing that, making
 12 strides in this area.
 13 I would add that Policy 6 and 8, I think would
 14 better -- fit better under Objective 2.
 15 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: We've already passed
 16 Objective 2.
 17 MR. SUMMERS: Yeah, this is really about the Clean
 18 Water Act. And the previous objective was about fish
 19 stocks. Just in that -- we'll probably clean that up.
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Don't confuse us, John.
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I would suggest if you're
 22 cleaning it up that you work with moku regional plans rather
 23 than the island-wide plans because the ocean is different in
 24 different places. And fish -- most fish stocks are
 25 different in different places.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Hiranaga.
 2 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Just from a procedural
 3 perspective. Once we approve a certain objective and
 4 there's something like this, where it should be placed
 5 elsewhere, when they present it to the Council, the Director
 6 can make that recommendation.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Staff can handle that.
 8 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Put that where it belongs.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Right.
 10 One comment that I had on Objective 3, Policy
 11 Number 8 was that it's redundant with Policy Number 2.4.
 12 2.4 is on the top of Page 16. But you already have general
 13 instructions to review the entire document for redundancies.
 14 So it's just a comment.
 15 Commissioner Shibuya.
 16 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: On Item Number Policy 5, I
 17 would like to discuss whether the need for a time limit in
 18 terms of phasing out cesspools and to use the septic
 19 systems. And if so, what kind of remedies or remedial type
 20 of alternatives would be available to the people when they
 21 transition?
 22 Also, the reference -- any references are absent
 23 right now on using gray water. I would like to insert
 24 something to the effect that allows for gray water using,
 25 which would be consistent with our water reuse.

1 I'll go on to the next items here --

2 CHAIR HEDANI: Did you want any action taken on

3 that item?

4 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Yes, I would like to include

5 that we have some time limit, by 2015 or 2020, you know,

6 whichever the Commission would like. It is a suggestion

7 that we would have 2020, conversion of all cesspools to

8 using septic.

9 CHAIR HEDANI: Staff, do you folks have any comment

10 on that?

11 We're talking about Policy Number 5, phase out

12 cesspools and restricted use of septic systems and inserting

13 a time frame for implementation of that.

14 Commissioner Mardfin.

15 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I just want to say that

16 again, this is an area specific sort of thing. In Hana, we

17 have lots of cesspools, but a very spread out, small

18 population. And it would put an undue burden on a lot of

19 people to do it there where it's not doing any particular

20 harm. So this is the sort of thing that ought to be a

21 moku-by-moku kind of concern.

22 I have no problem with cesspools in the Hana area.

23 They don't seem to be doing much problems, creating much

24 problems.

25 CHAIR HEDANI: My only comment on Item Number 5 was

1 be prohibitively expensive.

2 I can live with Policy 5 because it says, "Phase

3 out cesspools and restrict the use of septic systems in

4 ecologically sensitive coastal areas." Because the impacted

5 area is not affecting an ecologically sensitive coastal area

6 in the East Maui region. So I can live with the way -- and

7 phase out, I do agree, is sort of amorphous. But it can

8 allow for like Makena and Lahaina coming in fast and Hana

9 coming in very, very slowly, over a century or two.

10 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Is that -- do you want to put

11 that in? Do we have that in the form of a motion?

12 Commissioner Shibuya.

13 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: No, I have not put the time

14 limit on it. And I'm considering what Commissioner Mardfin

15 said.

16 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Any other discussion on

17 Objective 3, Policies 1 through 9, or Action Items 1 through

18 4 as amended?

19 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I would like -- sir.

20 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Shibuya.

21 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I would like to allow for

22 the use of gray water uses, households or communities may

23 use gray water.

24 CHAIR HEDANI: As an action item or policy?

25 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I would like to create it as

1 I underlined the words "environmentally friendly alternative

2 sewage treatment systems." And my question was identify,

3 because I don't know of any. So you're going to convert

4 people to something which doesn't exist.

5 Commissioner Shibuya.

6 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: On this septic systems, it

7 doesn't have to be one septic tank per household. You can

8 have a community having their own septic system and a leach

9 field which it's treated and distributed that way.

10 CHAIR HEDANI: This would restrict the use of

11 septic systems.

12 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: No, it would be using septic

13 systems.

14 CHAIR HEDANI: This policy would restrict the use

15 of septic systems.

16 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: No, it would not.

17 CHAIR HEDANI: That's what it infers.

18 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Well, it would phase out

19 cesspools.

20 CHAIR HEDANI: And restrict the use of septic

21 systems.

22 Commissioner Mardfin.

23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Again, in a place like Hana,

24 East Maui, where houses are rather far apart often, the

25 burden of even bringing them together to join systems could

1 a policy.

2 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?

3 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.

4 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Mardfin.

5 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: We'd like to see the

6 motion, please.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: The motion is to add the use of gray

8 water -- you want to restate that again.

9 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: To allow gray water uses.

10 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I presume this is for

11 irrigation?

12 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: That's correct, for

13 households and/or communities.

14 CHAIR HEDANI: Gray water uses for irrigation?

15 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Yes.

16 CHAIR HEDANI: For households and communities.

17 Discussion?

18 Commissioner Hiranaga.

19 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'm just wondering if this

20 is the proper policy for this to be in? Are we talking

21 about --

22 CHAIR HEDANI: Shoreline reefs and near shore

23 waters.

24 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Right.

25 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?

1 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Comment by Staff.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 3 MR. SUMMERS: I think, Mr. Chairman, we support the
 4 concept. I think it should go in the Infrastructure section
 5 under Waste Water.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. So we'll stick it into the
 7 Infrastructure section under Waste Water if it's approved.
 8 You want to withdraw the motion, or do you want to
 9 vote on it now?
 10 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Let's go ahead and vote on
 11 it.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Ready for the question? All those
 13 in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 14 (Round of ayes.)
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 16 (Round of nays.)
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor, signify by
 18 raising your hand. One, two, three.
 19 Opposed, same sign. One, two, three, four.
 20 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Question. You're voting on
 21 whether to include this in the Heritage Resource section?
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: No. It will be stuck into the
 23 Infrastructure Waste Water section by Staff.
 24 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Why don't we just bring it
 25 up when that section comes up?

1 CHAIR HEDANI: We can do it anyway you want,
 2 gentlemen.
 3 All those in favor, signify by raising your right
 4 hand.
 5 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: We're voting to include
 6 this in the Heritage --
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Into the Infrastructure section,
 8 Waste Water.
 9 One, two, three.
 10 Opposed, same sign. Opposed same sign. One, two
 11 three, four.
 12 COMMISSIONER GUARD: If we're just voting to move
 13 it into the Infrastructure, I'll vote for it. I didn't
 14 think it was necessary to be in Heritage Resources.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Why don't we take this up in
 16 the Infrastructure section and not vote at this time since
 17 we don't have the votes to have it approved at the current
 18 time anyway. So Staff will tab it --
 19 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair, we just had five
 20 votes affirmative.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Show me five votes affirmative.
 22 One, two, three, four, five. Okay, it's approved.
 23 Moved to the Infrastructure section.
 24 Additional discussion on Policy Number -- Objective
 25 Number 3.

1 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Mr. Chair.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Hiranaga.
 3 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'd like to discourage the
 4 practice that we just did because we did not read that
 5 section and we voted to put it in that section. So when we
 6 come to that section, we cannot pull it out if it's already
 7 in there.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Staff will highlight that so
 9 when we get to the Infrastructure section, it can be shown.
 10 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Can we vote against it and
 11 modify it, or has it already been approved?
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: When we come to the Infrastructure
 13 section, we can look at it again.
 14 Additional discussion on the question on the floor,
 15 Section Number 3, policies and actions as amended.
 16 Gosh, you guys are really getting into the minutiae
 17 of this thing.
 18 Commissioner Shibuya.
 19 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Okay. Action Number 2 A, 1
 20 and 2, would be the same changes, subdivision of four or
 21 more lots, substitute "or" for "and."
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: The same comment for B as well.
 23 Staff will make those changes.
 24 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Okay.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? I had a

1 comment on Objective Number 3, Action Item Number 2 C,
 2 "Minimize impervious surface areas, thereby reducing storm
 3 runoff and non-point source pollution."
 4 My comment was it does not logically follow
 5 percolate petroleum problems. In other words, if you have
 6 an impervious surface, you would have petroleum products
 7 going directly into the ground.
 8 Commissioner Starr.
 9 COMMISSIONER STARR: The state-of-the-art pervious
 10 surfaces allow mechanisms for cleaning out petroleum
 11 products. When you put in pervious pavement, you have to
 12 annually clean it, which is basically like a
 13 pressure-washing type of thing. They have a machine that
 14 pressure washes and then sweeps it and sucks it up so that
 15 it takes that out and it's sent to the right place. So
 16 there are mechanisms for doing that.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: So if it rains every day, it would
 18 go down every day, but you would clean it once a year?
 19 COMMISSIONER STARR: It kind of sticks in the
 20 pervious concrete or they create traps for it. There are
 21 several mechanisms being used that address that, which is a
 22 good concern.
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Additional discussion? Our
 24 lunch is already here, gang. Any additional discussion on
 25 Objective Number 3 as amended?

1 Commissioner Shibuya.
 2 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: On Number 4, rather than be
 3 a negative, I'd like to change the negative to a positive.
 4 "Do not restrict" -- I would say "recognize and encourage."
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: Any objections? Why don't we change
 6 that by consensus. Okay. Additional discussion?
 7 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 8 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I would suggest the word
 9 "preserve."
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: "Preserve traditional access." Any
 11 objections?
 12 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: "Accesses."
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay, we'll adopt that by consensus
 14 if there's no objection.
 15 Any other changes for Objective Number 3? All
 16 those in favor of Objective Number 3, policies and actions
 17 as amended, signify by saying "aye."
 18 (Round of ayes.)
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 20 (No response.)
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 22 Let's take a break for lunch. We'll come back at
 23 1:00. Thank you.
 24 (At which time, a lunch recess was taken
 25 from 12:05 p.m. to 1:00 p.m.)

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Planning Commission meeting of May
 2 19th, is back in session. We are still on Heritage
 3 Resources. Shoreline, Reefs and Nearshore Waters, Objective
 4 Number 4, Page 18. Ladies and gentlemen -- oh, Director.
 5 DIRECTOR HUNT: I just wanted to remind you what
 6 your schedule was. Today's May 19th. According in your
 7 schedule, you should be through your Heritage, Natural
 8 Hazards and halfway through Economic Development in order to
 9 keep to your schedule. The intent from the body, as I
 10 understand it, was to go through these earlier elements
 11 quickly in order to allow time to go into the directed
 12 growth elements with a little bit more detail. So with all
 13 respect, you are behind.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you, Director.
 15 COMMISSIONER STARR: Excuse me, did the Director
 16 just call us behinds?
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: I think that's what he said.
 18 Objective Number 4, what is your pleasure?
 19 Commissioner Mardfin.
 20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move we approve the
 21 objectives for Number 4 and the policies and actions.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Any seconds?
 23 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Starr.
 25 Discussion?

1 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 2 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I asked this earlier. What
 3 is Public Trust Doctrine?
 4 MS. STALEY: You like this one Giroux? I like it
 5 better.
 6 MR. GIROUX: The Public Trust Doctrine is a
 7 doctrine that comes out of the Hawaii Constitution because
 8 we have certain resources that seem to be in the property of
 9 the public. And the state and the county agencies have an
 10 affirmative duty to protect those resources.
 11 And one of the resources is the quality of your
 12 nearshore waters and also your fresh water sources that are
 13 coming from your groundwater and your stream water, surface
 14 water. So those are based upon the Public Trust Doctrine.
 15 And in future litigation, the courts may expound on some
 16 more of the resources, which we haven't fully litigated and
 17 used the same doctrine to affirm the duty of the state and
 18 county agencies.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you, counselor.
 20 Commissioner Mardfin.
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Time for questions?
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion on Objective Number 4.
 23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I have a question about the
 24 Shoreline Access Inventory Update Final Report. And it's
 25 mentioned a couple places. Was East Maui included in that,

1 or was that an islandwide? I looked for it on the CD, and
 2 couldn't find it.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 4 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. That document
 5 is islandwide.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: I have a question on Objective 4,
 7 Item 2. I assume we're going with the Director's
 8 Recommendation in the motion?
 9 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: That's what my motion was.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: The word "require." It says,
 11 "Require the dedication of public beach and rocky shoreline
 12 access to and along the shoreline as a condition of
 13 development or subdivision approval." It does not give you
 14 the option of not requiring, just so you know.
 15 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Mr. Chair.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Under Action 4, it says,
 18 "Acquire development rights for the lands adjoining Hookipa
 19 Park to enhance Coastal Zone Management."
 20 Are we going to go around enumerating all the
 21 places we want protected, or does someone have a squeaky
 22 wheel that got oiled on this one?
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 24 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. This came
 25 from the North Shore Greenway Master Plan. And we're

1 looking at specific areas that islandwide -- are of
2 islandwide importance cropped from multiple
3 community-planned regions.

4 So I think if there's an area that would meet that
5 criteria, that certainly could be added to this. If it's a
6 very specific smaller site, it's more localized, then we
7 would encourage those type of sites to be identified through
8 the Community Plan process.

9 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Okay. Follow-up. I would
10 just -- I'm willing to vote in favor of this. I think it
11 would keep the parks wonderful. But I would just urge that
12 the interpretation not be that since we enumerated this,
13 that it is the highest priority and other things are not. I
14 have no problem enumerating this one. But consistent with
15 what you said, I think there are many other places, too.

16 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? Ready for
17 the question?

18 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
19 (Round of ayes.)

20 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
21 (No response.)

22 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.

23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Chairman.

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.

25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Did it pass?

1 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Chair.
2 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
3 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Quick question. Are you
4 using stream-bed-to-stream-bed or ridgeline-to-ridgeline?

5 MR. SUMMERS: True watersheds.

6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: So basically,
7 ridgeline-to-ridgeline, not stream-bed-to-stream-bed?

8 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.

9 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Shibuya.

10 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: As a point of clarification.
11 They're talking about streams here. But in the East Maui
12 watershed area, there are tunnels and distribution streams,
13 or rivers or distribution flow ditches, if will. So it does
14 not make any reference to tunnels. Do we want to include
15 that?

16 The question is ahupua'a, when it was enacted, did
17 not include tunnels. So now do we add tunnels in to clarify
18 our clear interpretation of the ahupua'a model?

19 CHAIR HEDANI: Anybody?

20 MS. STALEY: For the Infrastructure.

21 CHAIR HEDANI: There is no answer.
22 Director Hunt.

23 DIRECTOR HUNT: I think we need to be careful on
24 how strict we interpret the ahupua'a model. As I understand
25 it, the ahupua'a model water was self-contained within that

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Approved.

2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
3 the goal under Watershed Streams and Wetlands and
4 Objective 1 and the policies and actions related to that.

5 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?

6 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Starr.
8 Discussion?

9 Commissioner Mardfin.

10 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I love Policy 1. I really
11 do. "All watershed management plans should incorporate the
12 ahupua'a model." That would be that EMI would cease taking
13 water from the mokus of East Maui to Central Maui, is the
14 way I read it.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: My question is what is this and is
16 there a model to follow? Mr. Summers, tell me what the
17 ahupua'a model is.

18 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Essentially in
19 this context, we're talking about looking at resources from
20 the top of the mountain to the shoreline, and actually a
21 little bit beyond the shoreline and taking nearshore waters.
22 So we're looking at it geographically in this light. The
23 ahupua'a concept also incorporates social and other features
24 as well. I just want to be clear that this is a narrower
25 application of it.

1 one valley or area, watershed, whatever you have. Clearly,
2 our existing island with water going from West Maui to
3 Central Maui and East Maui to Central Maui would not violate
4 a pure interpretation of the ahupua'a.

5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Would not or would?

6 CHAIR HEDANI: Would not.

7 DIRECTOR HUNT: Would not be consistent with.
8 Thank you.

9 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Thank you.

10 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.

11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: The other one I wanted to
12 talk about -- two, actually. Action Number 1 on Page 22,
13 says this duplicates Policy 5 -- Director's Recommendation
14 says this duplicates policy above. Does that mean we're
15 deleting it? Action Number 1.

16 CHAIR HEDANI: My comment is redundant, exclamation
17 point.

18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: So we're deleting it?

19 CHAIR HEDANI: That's up to you.

20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Well, I thought that's what
21 the intent of the Director's comment was.

22 MR. SUMMERS: That was essentially our
23 recommendation.

24 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: That it be deleted.

25 MR. SUMMERS: Yeah.

1 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: My motion was for the
 2 Director's Recommendation. So I just wanted to clarify.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Shibuya.
 4 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Excuse me. I was going to
 5 rephrase it on the actions. "Ensure all Watershed
 6 Management Plans, balance uses of watershed resources,
 7 incorporating principles of the ahupua'a model.
 8 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Moved and seconded to amend -- is
 10 that Action Item 1?
 11 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Yes.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Can you repeat that for Julia to put
 13 up on the board.
 14 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Okay. Action 1 would be,
 15 "Ensure all Watershed Management Plans, balance uses of
 16 watershed resources, incorporating principles of the
 17 ahupua'a model.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: I like that. Discussion?
 19 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 20 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Why is the goal in
 21 Objective 1 identical?
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Good point. Back to the item on the
 23 floor is Action Item 1. Julia.
 24 MS. STALEY: I believe that is a typo. I know it
 25 would be hard to type all of that accidentally. I believe

1 that there is an objective that goes in there that is does
 2 not read that way. I'm going to have to look that up.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Staff will check on that. Any
 4 additional discussion on Objective Number 1, policies --
 5 Action Item Number 1, as displayed up on the -- where did it
 6 go -- on the board.
 7 Can you just put up the PC Recommendation in
 8 bold -- I mean, bigger.
 9 MS. STALEY: Bigger.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: On Action Item Number 1, as
 11 recommended by Commissioner Shibuya, "Ensure all Watershed
 12 Management Plans, balance uses of watershed resources,
 13 incorporating principles of the ahupua'a model."
 14 Additional discussion?
 15 Commissioner Shibuya.
 16 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Just for clarification.
 17 Julia is correct as to Objective Number 1 as put in our
 18 document was a typo. Objective 1 should be reading,
 19 "Greater protection and enhancement of native ecosystems and
 20 species" --
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Warren, hold that thought. Let's
 22 vote on the item on the floor first.
 23 Any further discussion on the item on the floor?
 24 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 25 (Round of ayes.)

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 2 (No response.)
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 4 Commissioner Shibuya.
 5 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: It should be reading,
 6 "Greater protection and enhancement of native ecosystems and
 7 species through integrated watershed management and the
 8 ahupua'a model." I have the GPAC version.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Can everybody see that? Is there a
 10 way to make it bigger?
 11 How about take out the GPAC Final Recommendation
 12 and make it bigger? Can't get it on there. That's as big
 13 as it goes.
 14 "Greater protection and enhancement of native
 15 ecosystems and species through integrated watershed
 16 management and the ahupua'a model."
 17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Mr. Chairman, that should be
 18 a vote. This is, in effect, a typo.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Right. But it's being restated
 20 because it's not something you have right now. If nobody
 21 has any problems with that right now, that's what we're
 22 voting on in terms of this objective and goal.
 23 Any further discussion?
 24 Commissioner Mardfin.
 25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: This is for the long-range

1 planning. I love Action Item Number 2. It is absolutely
 2 wonderful.
 3 "Develop and regularly update Watershed Management
 4 Plans for regions of the island not covered by existing
 5 plans." And I wish you would liberally use that throughout
 6 the entire plan where East Maui was ignored. And I don't
 7 know if that means a vote. But that needs to be done for
 8 everything.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 10 Okay. The only comment that I have that hasn't
 11 been brought up was for Policies Numbers 3, 4, 5, 6; Action
 12 Item 1, 2, 3 and 4. I had a redundant exclamation point.
 13 That's for Staff's consideration whenever you feel like it.
 14 Additional discussion?
 15 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 16 (Round of ayes.)
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 18 (No response.)
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 20 Objective Number 5.
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Objective 2, I think.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Objective Number 2. Commissioner
 23 Mardfin.
 24 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 25 Objective Number 2 and its related policies and actions.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 2 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Starr.
 4 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Director's recommendation, I
 5 should specify.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Right, Director's Recommendation.
 7 Comments?
 8 Okay. The one comment I have is on Objective
 9 Number 2, "Decrease non-point source and point source
 10 pollution," in my mind didn't make sense. It was talking
 11 about decreasing pollution. Because it's either point or
 12 non-point pollution.
 13 Commissioner Starr.
 14 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, the regulatory
 15 mechanisms for them are very, very different.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: This includes both point and
 17 non-point pollution.
 18 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, I think it's good to
 19 state them both because they're technically specific. Where
 20 if we just said pollution, it's not really a regulatory term
 21 where point source and non-point source are.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 23 Director's Recommendation is to remove Objective
 24 Number 3 -- Policy Number 2. And to remove Action Item
 25 Number 2, for your information.

1 Additional discussion?
 2 Mr. Shibuya.
 3 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: On Policies Number 3, I'd
 4 like to restate it. I'll just restate it and let's see what
 5 happens here. Number 3 on policies, it says, "Restrict
 6 grading land within watersheds unless to increase watershed
 7 efficiencies and to maintain watersheds and distribution
 8 systems."
 9 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm sorry --
 10 COMMISSIONER STARR: I'm lost.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: This will be an amendment to Policy
 12 Number 3 to revise the language to read.
 13 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: "Restrict grading land
 14 within watersheds unless to increase watershed efficiencies
 15 and to maintain watersheds and distribution systems."
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second? No second.
 17 Additional discussion?
 18 On Policy Number 4, I had a question mark over
 19 "5,000 square feet and for Low-impact Development
 20 Practitioners Guide, June 2006," explain. Does anybody know
 21 what that is? I assume Staff knows what that is, and it's
 22 tied to 5,000 square feet somehow, which does not tie to a
 23 quarter of an acre or an acre or anything else.
 24 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

1 MR. SUMMERS: This low-impact development book is
 2 basically a set of best management practices. This was
 3 prepared in '96 by the State Office of Planning, Coastal
 4 Zone Management Program.
 5 The 5,000 square feet is actually a recommendation
 6 is the State Pollution Prevention Control Plan. We have
 7 specific policy language for grading above 5,000 square
 8 feet. This entire book provides a set of best management
 9 practices to limit the impact of grading on the environment.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you.
 11 Additional discussion?
 12 Commissioner Starr.
 13 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, I didn't second
 14 Commissioner Shibuya's motion because I didn't want to get
 15 rid of the best management practices wording. However, I
 16 did agree with the intent. So I'd like to move an amendment
 17 to Policy 3, under Objective 2, that it shall now read,
 18 "Minimize grading of lands within a watershed" and then the
 19 rest of it -- the r will be lower case, and the rest of it
 20 will stand.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: I'm sorry. Your amendment is to?
 22 COMMISSIONER STARR: Preface the wording --
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: "Minimize grading of lands within
 24 the watershed" --
 25 COMMISSIONER STARR: "And require." Yeah, leave

1 that all, don't take it away. Just add the word "and" and a
 2 lower case r.
 3 MS. STALEY: Excuse me.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: What is the first word after
 5 watershed? Julia.
 6 MS. STALEY: Okay. The bottom language is
 7 Mr. Shibuya's --
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: No, no. We're discussing -- the
 9 bottom language has died for lack of a second. We're
 10 considering Commissioner Starr's recommendation.
 11 MS. STALEY: Okay. So we're taking out this one?
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Right.
 13 MS. STALEY: Very good.
 14 COMMISSIONER STARR: And then add "and" before
 15 "require."
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: "Minimize grading of lands within a
 17 watershed and require the use of best management practices."
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Mardfin.
 20 Discussion?
 21 Director Hunt.
 22 DIRECTOR HUNT: Perhaps my Staff can help me. But
 23 isn't all land within some kind of watershed?
 24 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.
 25 DIRECTOR HUNT: So do you need to say within the

1 watershed, or are we simply minimizing or requiring best
 2 management practices for any grading?
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Good point. Discussion.
 4 Commissioner Mardfin.
 5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Well, the Director is
 6 certainly correct, everything is within a watershed. Since
 7 the heritage resource we're talking about is watershed, it
 8 doesn't seem inappropriate to leave it in. But it's a bit
 9 redundant.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 11 COMMISSIONER STARR: I think it will continue to
 12 allow the grading within Haleakala Crater.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Why don't we just say don't grade,
 14 period. Discussion? Ready for the question?
 15 The amendment reads, "Minimize grading of lands
 16 within a watershed and require the use of best management
 17 practices when grading land within a watershed.
 18 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 19 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: If the Director says all
 20 lands are within a watershed, isn't this covered somewhere
 21 else? It seems --
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: I'm sure it's covered 12 times
 23 somewhere else.
 24 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: When you say a watershed,
 25 are you typically speaking of a source of water that has

1 trees that collect the water from the clouds and goes into
 2 the soil and percolates. So you're saying the isthmus of
 3 Central Maui is a watershed?
 4 DIRECTOR HUNT: I would argue that all land is
 5 within a watershed in one way or another. Now, we may be
 6 able to find some extreme example that defies that. But
 7 yeah, what land would not be within a watershed?
 8 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Could we come up with a
 9 word that sort of narrows the scope so it sort of means
 10 something?
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 12 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I would
 13 recommend that 3 and 4 be consolidated. They both deal with
 14 watersheds. They both deal with grading. I think 4 is more
 15 specific. I think 4 is probably also more practical. So we
 16 can easily drop BMPs in Item Number 4 and cover them both
 17 and get rid of a policy.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. You can handle that in the
 19 consolidation effort.
 20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Mr. Chairman, you should
 21 check with the maker of the motion to find out whether
 22 that's acceptable to them.
 23 COMMISSIONER STARR: No, it's not.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 25 Commissioner Starr.

1 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes. As the maker of the
 2 motion, it's not. I do want to maintain the BMP language,
 3 and I want to send a message to minimize grading.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Any other discussion? Ready for the
 5 question?
 6 All those in favor, signify by raising your hand.
 7 Three in favor.
 8 All opposed, same sign. Four opposed. Motion
 9 dies.
 10 Any additional discussion? Ready for the main
 11 motion? Main motion is for Objective Number 2 in policies
 12 and actions beneath Objective Number 2.
 13 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 14 (Round of ayes.)
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 16 (No response.)
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 18 Commissioner Mardfin.
 19 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 20 Objective Number 3 and the policies and actions.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second? Is there a
 22 second?
 23 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Second.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Sablas.
 25 Any discussion? This is the Director's Recommendation.

1 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: It's the same
 2 recommendation.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: There's no discussion.
 4 All those in favor -- sorry. Commissioner
 5 Hiranaga.
 6 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: We're going over Objective
 7 Number 3, or are you going over the main --
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Policies and actions.
 9 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 10 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Actions 1 and 2 in
 11 Objective 3 are identical in Actions 1 and 2 on Objective 4.
 12 I'm wondering why?
 13 COMMISSIONER STARR: I think we're in the wrong
 14 place here.
 15 MR. MICHAELSON: He's right.
 16 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Sorry, I read ahead.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: We're on Page 25.
 18 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Right. So Actions 1 and 2
 19 of Objective 3 are identical to Actions 1 and 2 on Objective
 20 4.
 21 MS. STALEY: Excuse me, Mr. Chair. I know it
 22 doesn't -- it's an accident. It's not supposed to be that
 23 way.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay.
 25 MS. STALEY: Mr. Hiranaga, your attention to detail

1 is commended. I'll have to find out what policies were
 2 intended to be there, and we'll have to revisit that because
 3 I don't have that information.
 4 COMMISSIONER STARR: Warren has it.
 5 MS. STALEY: But Warren has it.
 6 COMMISSIONER STARR: Warren to the rescue.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Was it approved by the GPAC, is the
 8 question? This is the GPAC, according to Mr. Shibuya.
 9 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: No, I'm just trying to find
 10 mine. It's not numbered the same.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: I have different items for Policies
 12 1 and 2 for Objective Number 4.
 13 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: No, it's action.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: Action, oh, okay. Redundant,
 15 redundant, redundant, exclamation point.
 16 MS. STALEY: There very well maybe actions that are
 17 to go there in place of those, and they'll have to be
 18 brought to your attention.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Whenever you feel like it.
 20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Mr. Chairman.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I just checked in the full
 23 graph where I found. And it's vertical instead of
 24 horizontal and the duplication is there, too. So I don't
 25 think we can recover it at this point.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: The duplication is universal.
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'll retract my motion to
 3 approve Objective 3, since we don't know what it is.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. The motion has been
 5 withdrawn. What's your pleasure on Objective Number 3?
 6 Commissioner Starr.
 7 COMMISSIONER STARR: Can we wait and see if they
 8 have it in Warren's GPAC book.
 9 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: There's a little confusion
 10 here. So I don't want to be to presumptuous.
 11 COMMISSIONER STARR: Can we lend that to the Staff.
 12 Maybe they can figure that out.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.
 14 DIRECTOR HUNT: Kind of following up on
 15 Commissioner Hiranaga, but with a little more seriousness.
 16 The document that we're reviewing over there is a draft, and
 17 we don't know if it was the final approved GPAC. You guys
 18 can adopt any policy you want. But you base it on something
 19 that you perceive to be the GPAC and it's not, it can be a
 20 problem.
 21 I would suggest that we take a little more
 22 conservative approach and let Staff come back to you on what
 23 we believe was the GPAC adopted version.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I mover we defer Objection 3

1 and the policies -- because the actions are consent with the
 2 Objective. We defer Objective 3 to a later date.
 3 COMMISSIONER U'U: Second.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. If there's no objection --
 5 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 6 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Or until the end of the
 7 meeting, maybe they can get the answer. And Objective 3 and
 8 4 until the end of the meeting.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. The motion is to defer
 10 Objective 3 until the end of the meeting. Okay, we'll do
 11 that by consensus, then, and move to Objective 4.
 12 Commissioner Mardfin.
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 14 Objective 4 and its policies and actions.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 16 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Second.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Shibuya.
 18 Commissioner Mardfin.
 19 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Will somebody specify what
 20 the strategic plan for ungulates is about.
 21 COMMISSIONER U'U: That's my neighbors.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: What line are you on?
 23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm on Action Number 2 on
 24 Page 26.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

1 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. This would
 2 essentially be a plan that would help deal with pigs and
 3 other types of predators that feed on native species.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: That's not a spelling error, it's a
 5 real word, ungulates.
 6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Pigs and goats, mostly.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Pigs, goats and deer, et cetera.
 8 MR. MICHAELSON: Nonhoofed.
 9 MS. STALEY: No, they're like this.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 11 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 12 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Are we assuming Action
 13 Items 1 and 2 are correct under Objective 4? So Action
 14 Items 1 and 2 in Objective 3 is incorrect; is that the
 15 assumption? I hate to use the word assume.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: My main problem with
 18 Objective 4 -- I have no problem with Objective 4. My
 19 problem is the policies I don't think go far enough to
 20 protect native species. And I don't know what to put in.
 21 But it seems to me we can do -- just controlling the
 22 ungulates is not and mandate invasive species is not
 23 sufficient to protect native species. But I don't know how
 24 to form a motion that would take care of that issue.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. My only comment on this is

1 the comments -- or the proposal as stated does not advocate
 2 the elimination of ungulates. It says manage it. So
 3 basically, you have to make sure there's pigs, goats and
 4 deer in the watershed.
 5 Commissioner Shibuya.
 6 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I would like to suggest an
 7 editing here on Policy Number 1 to read, "Coordinate with
 8 the state agencies and private groups to manage and
 9 eliminate feral ungulate populations and invasive species."
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 11 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 13 COMMISSIONER STARR: As someone who lives in
 14 ahupua'a with for adults and several thousand ungulates, I
 15 second the motion.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Do ungulates taste good? They do.
 17 Yes, very good.
 18 Julia, did the get the suggested language?
 19 Commissioner Shibuya, could you repeat your motion.
 20 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Number 1 again, "Coordinate
 21 with the state agencies and private groups to manage and
 22 eliminate feral ungulate populations and invasive species."
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Can we say and eat them.
 24 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Consume them.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?

1 "Coordinate with the state agencies and private
 2 groups to manage feral ungulate populations and invasive
 3 species." Discussion?
 4 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 5 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I have to agree with the
 6 original language, "eliminate feral." If you want
 7 ungulates, you can raise them. But to let them run wild
 8 through the indigenous flora and fauna as a sport, that's
 9 what video games are for.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Shibuya.
 11 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Yeah. My biggest concern is
 12 here I was trying to accommodate Commissioner Mardfin. But
 13 after a second thought, I don't want to minimize invasive
 14 species, I really want to eliminate them. So I'll stand
 15 with my original --
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: So the motion was to eliminate feral
 17 ungulate populations.
 18 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: And invasive species.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 20 Commissioner Mardfin.
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Would you consider managing
 22 pigs and eliminate goats, deer and invasive species?
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 24 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: No.
 25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: You wouldn't?

1 Commissioner Mardfin.
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm going to vote against
 3 this motion because there are a lot of people on Hana who
 4 depend on pigs and -- less on goats. But pig especially for
 5 providing food for their families. And eliminating them
 6 would do great hardship to them and also be in conflict with
 7 discussing economic things where we're proposing local food.
 8 So I'm going to vote against this motion.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 10 COMMISSIONER STARR: That's why the word feral is
 11 relevant here. Because feral means ones that are in the
 12 wild and destructive as opposed to ungulates that might be
 13 in a place where they're suitable.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: Further discussion?
 15 Commissioner Shibuya.
 16 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Would replacement of the
 17 word "eliminate" with "minimize" be helpful for you?
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: "Manage" to me is better.
 19 Because the Hana people depend on pig hunting, particularly
 20 for a lot of food. And sports and recreation. They take
 21 their kids out at high school graduations, they proudly show
 22 slides of when their parents took them up into the hills to
 23 hunt pig. And it's a cultural thing. I would not like to
 24 see it destroyed.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Julia did you get all that?

1 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: No.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Ready for the question?
 3 All those in favor of the motion as printed on the
 4 board, signify by saying "aye."
 5 (Round of ayes.)
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 7 (Round of nays.)
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor, signify by
 9 raising your hand. One, two, three, four.
 10 Opposed, same sign. One, two three. I vote with
 11 the majority of four, so that would be five. That would be
 12 passed.
 13 You ready for Objective Number 4 as amended?
 14 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 15 (Round of ayes.)
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 17 (No response.)
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 19 Commissioner Mardfin.
 20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 21 Objective 5 and its related policies and actions.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: As proposed by the Director?
 23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: As proposed by the Director.
 24 COMMISSIONER U'U: Seconded.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner U'u.

1 Discussion?
 2 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 3 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: On Action Number 4, I'm
 4 just wondering if the word "identify" versus "map" is a
 5 better word, Page 27.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Action Item Number 4. And the
 7 suggestion is what? I'm sorry.
 8 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Replace the word "map" with
 9 "identify."
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Identify areas susceptible to high
 11 erosion and sediment loss.
 12 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I guess that's a motion.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 14 COMMISSIONER U'U: I'll second that.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner U'u.
 16 Discussion?
 17 Commissioner Shibuya.
 18 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I just wanted to get a
 19 clarification. How would you just identify it? Would it be
 20 through mapping?
 21 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Point a finger. However,
 22 they want to identify, I don't care. You can make a map, if
 23 you want.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 25 Director Hunt.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Nobody wants to second it?
 2 COMMISSIONER U'U: Second.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner U'u.
 4 Discussion? I have no comments on this section.
 5 Commissioner Sablas.
 6 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: On actions, I would like to
 7 replace the word "minimum" stream flow with "adequate"
 8 stream flow, especially as it relates to healthy kalo crops.
 9 Minimum could be a trickle, and it's not going to help the
 10 kalo.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Is this for Action Item Number 1.
 12 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Yes.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: So it would read, "Work to establish
 14 adequate stream flow levels and promote actions to support
 15 riparian habitat," et cetera.
 16 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Mardfin.
 18 Discussion?
 19 Commissioner Starr.
 20 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes. I would like to know if
 21 the maker of that motion would be willing to accept
 22 minimum -- well, I'd like to keep minimum in there because
 23 that's a regulatory term under the Water Code. And
 24 basically, by doing this we're specifically supporting the
 25 Water Code and attempting to create enforcement. Where

1 DIRECTOR HUNT: I think Staff actually agrees with
 2 that recommendation. It's broader. Mapping is very narrow.
 3 we can still map, but we can do it other ways also.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Additional discussion?
 5 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 6 (Round of ayes.)
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 8 (No response.)
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Any other discussion?
 10 Commissioner Mardfin.
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I thought we were finished
 12 with that one.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: No.
 14 Additional discussion on Objective Number 5? No
 15 discussion.
 16 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 17 (Round of ayes.)
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 19 (No response.)
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 21 Commissioner Mardfin.
 22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 23 Objective Number 6, with its related policies and actions
 24 and Director's recommendation.
 25 There is no second for Director's recommendation.

1 adequate is good, but I'd like to have both -- if we want to
 2 put adequate, I'd like to figure out how to put both in
 3 there.
 4 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: I have a suggestion. "To
 5 establish minimum stream flow levels and to promote" -- wait
 6 I did have a thought.
 7 "To adequately promote actions to help support" --
 8 COMMISSIONER STARR: Or how about --
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Slow down. One at a time.
 10 The motion on the floor is to replace the word
 11 "minimum" with "adequate."
 12 Commissioner Mardfin.
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Even though I seconded it,
 14 I'm going to vote against it because I'm going where
 15 Jonathan is going. But I think we're going to end up with
 16 something like minimum stream levels and somehow work a
 17 sustainability word in there. But we have to vote down the
 18 motion or change it.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 20 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes. My suggestion is it
 21 would go friendly to change it to "work" --
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Slow down.
 23 COMMISSIONER STARR: I'm keeping the original
 24 wording so far I'm sorry.
 25 Okay. We'll maintain the wording up to the word

1 "available lo'i and maintain adequate flows for the
 2 production of healthy kalo crops."
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Lori.
 4 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: I'm fine with that.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: Julia, do you have all that? That's
 6 a mouth full.
 7 Discussion?
 8 COMMISSIONER U'U: Can we have it read back to us
 9 again.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Julia.
 11 MS. STALEY: "Work with appropriate agencies and
 12 stakeholders to establish minimum stream flow levels and
 13 promote actions to support riparian habitat and the use of
 14 available lo'i and maintain adequate flows for the
 15 production of healthy kalo crops."
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 17 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 18 (Round of ayes.)
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 20 (No response.)
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you. Any further
 22 discussion on Objective 6?
 23 Commissioner Shibuya.
 24 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I'm going to make a
 25 suggestion on rewording Objective 6, but I'm open to

1 discussion on it. "Enhance the vitality and function of
 2 underground aquifers, tunnels and streams while balancing
 3 the multiple needs of our community."
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Is that an amendment?
 5 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: That's an amendment.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second? Any other
 7 discussion.
 8 Julia, that dies for lack of a second.
 9 Commissioner Shibuya.
 10 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: The reason why I put in the
 11 underground aquifers and tunnels. It's just not streams
 12 alone that provide the communities with water. It's the
 13 aquifers, underground aquifers and our tunnels that actually
 14 capture the moisture and distribute it into ditches.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 16 I think the intent of Objective 6 is to ensure the
 17 streams are flowing. Because a lot of them are not flowing,
 18 I think. I don't know.
 19 Additional discussion on Objective Number 6?
 20 Commissioner Starr.
 21 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, I'll support what
 22 Commissioner Shibuya is trying to do, but in another place.
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Additional discussion? Any
 24 other amendments to Objective 6? Are you ready for the
 25 question?

1 All those in favor of Objective 6, policies and
 2 actions, signify by saying "aye."
 3 (Round of ayes.)
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 5 (No response.)
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 7 Commissioner Mardfin.
 8 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 9 the goal under Wildlife and Natural Areas, Goal 1, Objection
 10 1, and the attached policies and actions.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: It's getting late. There's no
 12 number on the goal. And it's not an objection, it's an
 13 objective.
 14 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Correct.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 16 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Second.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Guard for
 18 the approval of Wildlife and Natural Areas in Objective
 19 Number 1, it's policies and actions as recommended by the
 20 Director.
 21 Commissioner Mardfin. As recommended by the
 22 Director.
 23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Yes, as recommended by the
 24 Director.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.

1 COMMISSIONER STARR: I'm wondering whether this
 2 objective is our desire to reduce feral ungulates. I know
 3 on Lanai, there was some spirited discussions over the years
 4 as to whether the deer are a wildlife resource or a feral
 5 ungulate. So I look to the Department here for a little
 6 wisdom on that.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.
 8 DIRECTOR HUNT: The goal speaks to indigenous flora
 9 and fauna. I think feral ungulates would not be considered
 10 indigenous. If you folks want to accommodate both, we can
 11 go back and massage it. But at this point, it's speaking to
 12 reducing or minimizing feral ungulates while protecting our
 13 indigenous flora and fauna.
 14 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 16 COMMISSIONER STARR: I'd like to amend the
 17 Objective 1 to insert the word "indigenous."
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: The amendment is to insert the word
 19 "indigenous" before wildlife in Objective Number 1.
 20 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Second.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Guard.
 22 Indigenous as opposed to endemic.
 23 COMMISSIONER STARR: Does that mean infected?
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Sprouted from the land with no help
 25 from others.

1 COMMISSIONER STARR: My pigs are that way.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 3 All those in favor of the amendment to insert the
 4 word "indigenous" in front of wildlife, signify by saying
 5 "aye."
 6 (Round of ayes.)
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 8 (Nay.)
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: One nay. Motion passes.
 10 Additional discussions on the goal in Objective 1
 11 and policies and actions?
 12 Commissioner Mardfin.
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: John, Policy Number 3 refers
 14 to Hawaii Comprehensive Wildlife Conservation Strategy. You
 15 want to give us some information on that.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Staff.
 17 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. This is a plan
 18 that was prepared by state DLNR in 2005. It's an excellent
 19 document. Here's the title page. It has very specific
 20 recommendations for dealing with invasive species, feral
 21 ungulates, wildlife and the endangered species throughout
 22 the island.
 23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Did it call for eliminating
 24 feral ungulates or just managing them?
 25 MR. SUMMERS: I would have to look into the exact

1 whether he supports this since it would likely be under his
 2 department.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.
 4 DIRECTOR HUNT: The Planning Department is
 5 currently, as of today under-staffed, given the volume of
 6 projects that are we are charged to review and given the
 7 volume of policies we are charged to review them again. By
 8 my estimation, the Maui Island Plan will have 900 policies
 9 that we will have to review for projects being in
 10 compliance, in addition to the added 600 policies that
 11 countywide policy plan is recommending.
 12 If we don't have additional Staff, there's a
 13 comment earlier that it will halt all development on the
 14 island. Without additional staffing, that may be true.
 15 COMMISSIONER STARR: Is that a negative?
 16 DIRECTOR HUNT: In answer to your question, I
 17 support more staffing, including this particular division.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Hiranaga.
 19 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I don't oppose more
 20 staffing or funding of the Planning Department. I don't see
 21 how creating another division with a division head -- that's
 22 a pretty high-paying job -- a division secretary. I mean,
 23 if you want to fund the Planning Department to implement
 24 this, that's fine. But why do we have to create a new
 25 division?

1 language.
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I probably won't vote, then.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 4 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 5 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Action Item Number 5.
 6 Again, you know, I like creating jobs, but I think that's
 7 Obama's job. So I'm going to propose deleting Number 5.
 8 COMMISSIONER U'U: Second.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Motion to delete Action Item
 10 Number 5, "Establish and fund an Environmental Resource
 11 Planning Division." Discussion?
 12 Commissioner Starr.
 13 COMMISSIONER STARR: Was this supposed to be a
 14 county-level thing?
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: It's an entirely new department in
 16 the County of Maui.
 17 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Yes, this
 18 would be at the county level. It does not specifically call
 19 for the creation of a new department, it calls for a
 20 division.
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Within the Department of
 22 Planning?
 23 MR. SUMMERS: It could be within the Department of
 24 Planning. It could be within a number of departments.
 25 COMMISSIONER STARR: Could we ask the Director

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm going to support the
 3 motion mostly because I think it can be taken up under
 4 implementation, which we haven't yet gotten to. And it
 5 strikes me as something that belongs there when we're
 6 weighing all other kinds of implementation costs. So I'm
 7 going to support taking it out here. I'm not in general
 8 opposed to it appearing at some other point.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Guard.
 10 COMMISSIONER GUARD: In that other document that
 11 you brought the cover page, the statement from '05. A lot
 12 of these things are in place in a statewide level; right? I
 13 don't think we need to elimination all invasive species
 14 throughout everything.
 15 There's a lot of entities in place in action that
 16 go out and fence out critical habitats, and they're trying
 17 to save indigenous habitats one-by-one. Where, at least,
 18 it's manageable to protect and keep the bad species out.
 19 Right?
 20 I mean I've hiked into the crater the last one was
 21 November. But there's actually new fences along there and
 22 they've been fairly successful in getting rid of the pigs
 23 get on the outside out of the critical habitats. So these
 24 already these items are being addressed out there. So to
 25 create another county level job. It's not easy work. I

1 mean these guys bust their tails they go camping for five,
 2 six days at a time I don't know if Director Hunt will be
 3 able to manage that crew when he has to be here with every
 4 other week with 1500 policies.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: The question on the floor is to
 6 eliminate Action Item 5. If there's no additional
 7 discussion, ready for the question.
 8 All those in favor, signify saying "aye."
 9 (Round of ayes.)
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 11 (No response.)
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 13 Additional discussion on Objective 1, policies and
 14 actions as amended?
 15 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 16 (Round of ayes.)
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 18 (Round of nays.)
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried.
 20 Commissioner Mardfin.
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 22 Objective 2 and its policies and actions.
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 24 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Second.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Sablas.

1 Commissioner Sablas.
 2 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Under action 2, "Work with
 3 federal and state agencies to develop, implement, and
 4 enforce procedures." I would like to add the word "and
 5 enforce."
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 7 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Seconded.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Mardfin.
 9 On Action Item 2, "Work with federal and state
 10 agencies to develop and implement procedures" -- "to
 11 develop, implement and enforce procedures for inspections of
 12 incoming cargo," et cetera. Discussion?
 13 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 14 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'm not sure if that's the
 15 right word. You want to enforce inspections? So if they're
 16 not inspecting, you have a penalty. So if TSA is not
 17 inspecting, they will be penalized. Is that what you're
 18 saying?
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 20 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I would assume the TSA is
 21 going to do their job.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: So the county would get into the
 23 enforcement action as well. Is that the intent?
 24 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Well, again, if you have that
 25 and there's no way of enforcing it, then why have it?

1 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Director's Recommendation.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: No discussion.
 3 Oh, Commissioner Starr.
 4 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, there's a typo in policy
 5 2. It should be "at."
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Staff will note that. Additional
 7 discussion?
 8 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 9 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Action Number 3, is that
 10 intervention or you're inventing invasive species?
 11 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Intervention.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Interception or intervention, is
 13 that the question?
 14 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Well, they have "invention"
 15 there.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Are you on Policy Number 3 -- oh,
 17 invention.
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: What word was intended?
 19 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: We're doing biological
 20 experiments at the harbors.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Two demerits for the Planning Staff.
 22 Action Item 3 shall read, "Increase dedicated
 23 federal funding for the invasive species interception at
 24 harbors and airports." Staff will note that correction.
 25 Additional discussion?

1 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: There is, TSA --
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 3 Commissioner Starr.
 4 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, right now, most
 5 containers are not inspected. I'd say most of the goods
 6 that enter Maui are not inspected. So we're enforcing the
 7 procedures.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion.
 9 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 10 (Round of ayes.)
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 12 (No response.)
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 14 Additional actions on Objective 2?
 15 Seeing none. All those in favor of Objective 2
 16 policies and actions as amended, signify by saying "aye."
 17 (Round of ayes.)
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 19 (No response.)
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 21 Commissioner Mardfin.
 22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 23 Objective 3 and its policies and actions.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second? Is there a
 25 second?

1 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Second.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Sablas.
 3 You guys are on your own, gang. I stopped reviewing all of
 4 these policies after my pen ran out of ink writing the word
 5 redundant.
 6 Commissioner Mardfin.
 7 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'd like to speak to Policy
 8 6, support the expansion of Haleakala National Park in the
 9 creation of where national parks is appropriate.
 10 If this is referring to the summit, I don't have a
 11 particular problem with it. But I've spoken with a lot of
 12 people who live in Kipahulu. And they would not like to see
 13 Haleakala National Park expanded any more. It's already
 14 very intrusive. They enforce rules from keeping people from
 15 swimming in the pools. They have very heavy-handed tactics
 16 on the local people. And the local people lived there
 17 before the park was there. And people are resenting it out
 18 there.
 19 So I guess I'd move that support the expansion of
 20 Haleakala National Park at the summit. So I'd add the words
 21 "at the summit."
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second? Additional
 23 discussion?
 24 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Would Mr. --
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Motion dies for lack of a second.

1 expansion of Haleakala National Park, even though my brother
 2 is employed there. Up in the summit area, it is a sacred
 3 area. And I would like to keep it preserved for the Native
 4 Hawaiians and their right to worship and to do their
 5 native -- continue their native practices.
 6 However, I also would like to have them coexist
 7 with the scientific community. So there's got to be not
 8 only Haleakala National Park being controlled, there needs
 9 to be some balance here.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 11 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. One
 12 approach would be at the end the sentence, would be to add
 13 "where appropriate and supported by local communities."
 14 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: So moved.
 15 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Motion by Mr. Summers -- motion by
 17 Commissioner Mardfin, seconded by Commissioner Starr to
 18 insert after the words "where appropriate and supported by
 19 local communities." Discussion?
 20 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 21 (Round of ayes.)
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 23 (No response.)
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 25 Any additional discussion on Objective Number 3?

1 Additional discussion?
 2 We're looking at Policy Number 3 -- I mean, we're
 3 looking at Objective Number 3, policies and actions which
 4 goes all the way to the top of page 34.
 5 Commissioner Mardfin.
 6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: If we don't do something
 7 about 6, it implies the expansion of the Kipahulu area. I'm
 8 going to have to vote no on this policy objective.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 10 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. I lived in Kipahulu. I
 11 believe for a large majority of the people there are really
 12 thankful for the park. And, you know, it beats having
 13 really sensitive coastal areas be developed, and it provides
 14 resources. So I think that those folks who have a problem
 15 with it in the Kipahulu area, it's just two or three are a
 16 little bit loud, but not numerous.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: In response to that comment,
 19 it's not the people resent having it there at all. It's I
 20 don't think they would support the expansion of it. So my
 21 motion was to preclude the Kipahulu portion of Haleakala
 22 National Park from being expanded. And if that language
 23 isn't in there, I can't support it.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Shibuya.
 25 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I would not like to see the

1 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 2 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: This is Action Number 5 on
 3 the top of page 34. I propose deleting D -- no. B, as in
 4 boy; D, as in dog; E, as is -- not everything. Ever.
 5 You know, we talk about affordable housing, and now
 6 we want to put these taxes on real estate transfers. Real
 7 property taxes -- I don't know if you notice, but real
 8 property taxes are pretty high even with your homeowner's
 9 exemption.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second? Motion to was
 11 delete items B, as baker; D, as in dog; and E, as a easy.
 12 COMMISSIONER U'U: I'll second that.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner U'u. Any
 14 discussion.
 15 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 16 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: We're talking about
 17 affordable housing, we're talking about TAT. I don't think
 18 we should be that specific.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 20 Commissioner Starr.
 21 COMMISSIONER STARR: There are mechanisms in place
 22 that come under these and are responsible for a lot of the
 23 preservation of these areas that's taken place. When we
 24 feel we want to preserve beaches and shorelines for the
 25 public, there really is no other way a lot of times other

1 than the acquisition. And these are the sources that
2 traditionally allow for that.

3 And as we grow, we're going to need to have parks
4 along the shoreline. And we need to increase them if we're
5 going to be able to utilize them. I really feel that what's
6 here is appropriate.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
8 Commissioner Hiranaga.

9 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'm not opposing the
10 funding. I'm opposing where they're focusing they should
11 obtain the funding. If you want to support all the people,
12 then all the people should pay for it. And one way to do
13 that is adding an increase to the GET Tax. So everyone who
14 lives here, whether they rent or own property will be
15 contributing to this fund.

16 You're trying to tax the people that own a home
17 here. And these are the residents that live here. You're
18 not impacting the visitors, the people that come --
19 long-term visitors, short-term visitors, people that stay
20 here a couple years and rent and move on because they
21 couldn't find a job because they're against everything.

22 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? Ready for
23 the -- Commissioner Shibuya.

24 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I'm going to be voting
25 against that proposal unless Commissioner Hiranaga adds in

1 for Action Item Number 2 on Page 33, Item C, "provide
2 conservation easement for perpetual protection." And he
3 recommended removal and I'd be kind of curious as to why.

4 CHAIR HEDANI: Director.

5 DIRECTOR HUNT: John, can you shed some light on
6 that.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

8 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. We didn't
9 feel that was appropriate as it relates to achieving it
10 through an amendment through the zoning ordinance.

11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: So it's a procedural thing?

12 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.

13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: So it's a procedural thing?

14 MR. SUMMERS: That's correct.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?

16 Commissioner Hiranaga.

17 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Is there a motion to adopt
18 Objective 4?

19 CHAIR HEDANI: No, there's a motion to adopt
20 Objective 3, policies and actions. Any additional
21 discussion?

22 All those in favor as amended, signify by saying
23 "aye."

24 (Round of ayes.)

25 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."

1 another provision for the GET.

2 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?

3 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: All those in favor of the
4 motion to delete B, D, E, signify by saying "aye."

5 (Round of ayes.)

6 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."

7 (Round of nays.)

8 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor, signify by
9 raising your right hand.

10 Opposed, same sign. Motion passes -- I'm sorry.
11 Motion is lost. Nice try. Discussion?

12 Commissioner Mardfin.

13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'd like to commend the
14 long-range planning for Action Item Number 4 on Page 33. It
15 says, "Develop and adopt overlay district standards for
16 Heritage Areas identified through a community planning
17 process."

18 Again, I would urge you put this every place you
19 can find where it's appropriate throughout the entire
20 document. That is the way to process community input into
21 the development maps all parts of Maui for all the maps. I
22 love it.

23 COMMISSIONER STARR: There goes Jeff's budget.

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.

25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'd like to ask the Director

1 (No response.)

2 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.

3 Commissioner Mardfin.

4 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
5 Objective 4 and its intended policies and actions.

6 CHAIR HEDANI: As recommended by the Director?

7 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: As recommended by the
8 Director.

9 COMMISSIONER U'U: Second.

10 CHAIR HEDANI: Second by Commissioner U'u.
11 Discussion?

12 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."

13 (Round of ayes.)

14 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."

15 (No response.)

16 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you. Commissioner
17 Mardfin.

18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption
19 under Scenic Resources of Heritage Resources for the
20 adoption of the goal in Objective 1 and the related policies
21 and actions.

22 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?

23 COMMISSIONER U'U: Second.

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner U'u.
25 Discussion?

1 Commissioner Mardfin.
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Policy 4 on page 36 refers
 3 to protect ridgelines from development. And I'm very
 4 concerned that might preclude us working heavily with
 5 windmills. So it conflicts with some later policies on
 6 energy. Would somebody --
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Windmills are not considered a
 8 development.
 9 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Oh, they're not?
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: No, I'm just kidding.
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm sorry. You had me.
 12 Director Hunt, enlighten us.
 13 DIRECTOR HUNT: The policy is more of a broad
 14 general guideline or aspiration. It wouldn't necessarily
 15 state windmills. It wouldn't even necessarily state that
 16 you can't develop on a ridgeline. It gives us direction
 17 that we should adopt an ordinance or a ridgeline protective
 18 ordinance, or something along that line.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 20 Commissioner Mardfin.
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: A ridgeline development
 22 policy that might specifically include windmills? Because
 23 that's probably the most logical place to put windmills, I
 24 would think.
 25 DIRECTOR HUNT: Chair.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: That was Commissioner Sablas.
 2 Director Hunt.
 3 DIRECTOR HUNT: I think the policy as proposed is a
 4 good idea. I agree with the question, what is a high-rise
 5 and perhaps even a -- we should protect the shoreline views
 6 from obstruction development along the shoreline.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 8 Mr. Summers Summers.
 9 MR. SUMMERS: We have a number of policies under
 10 Objective Number 2 that relate to this.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: So your suggestion is to take it up
 12 under Objective Number 2?
 13 MR. SUMMERS: That's correct.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: Maker of the motion withdraws under
 15 reconsideration under Objective Number 2.
 16 Any further discussion on Objective Number 1?
 17 Ready for the question?
 18 All those in favor of objective -- or of the goal
 19 and Objective Number 1, signify by saying "aye."
 20 (Round of ayes.)
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, same sign. Carried.
 22 Commissioner Mardfin.
 23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Mr. Chairman, I move for the
 24 adoption of Objective 2 and its related policies and
 25 actions.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.
 2 DIRECTOR HUNT: That would all be worked out in the
 3 adoption of the ordinance and the public hearings, et
 4 cetera, reviewed by this very Planning Commission, I would
 5 imagine.
 6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I can accept that.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Windmills trumps scenic resources.
 8 Additional discussion?
 9 Commissioner Starr.
 10 COMMISSIONER STARR: I'd like to make a -- add an
 11 Action 4, which would be, "Protect shoreline views from
 12 obstruction caused by new high-rise development along the
 13 shoreline."
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: Julia, can you read that back,
 15 please.
 16 MS. STALEY: "Protect shoreline views from
 17 obstruction caused by new high-rise development along the
 18 shoreline."
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Seconded.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Mardfin.
 22 Discussion? Commissioner U'u.
 23 COMMISSIONER U'U: What is considered a high-rise?
 24 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Hung within the coconut
 25 street.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 2 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Second.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Sablas. Is
 4 there discussion?
 5 Commissioner Mardfin.
 6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: On Page 38, Action -- I'm
 7 sorry, Policy Number 5, it talks about "utilities should be
 8 placed underground, where feasible, to avoid such
 9 degradation." And again, this is one of the things where
 10 there should be community input on this. Some areas it
 11 might be okay, other areas it might not be okay. And it can
 12 be very expensive in certain areas to do that.
 13 I have a friend that did it, but he laid a half a
 14 mile underground on his own.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: I'm sorry. Did you have an
 16 amendment?
 17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: My amendment is utilities
 18 should be placed underground, where feasible, and
 19 recommended by the community plan. In other words, "and
 20 recommended by the community plan."
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 22 Motion dies for lack of a second. Additional
 23 discussion?
 24 Commissioner Starr.
 25 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair, I'd like to bring

1 back my previous item regarding high-rises on the shoreline.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: The amendment was to add "protect
 3 shoreline views from obstruction caused by new high-rise
 4 development along the shoreline."
 5 That was moved and seconded by Commissioner
 6 Mardfin. Discussion?
 7 Commissioner Mardfin.
 8 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'd like some clarification.
 9 Are we talking about the view from mauka to makai, the view
 10 from makai to mauka, or both.
 11 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Both.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Any high-rise should be invisible,
 13 in other words.
 14 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I like that.
 15 COMMISSIONER STARR: Any high-rise should not be on
 16 the shoreline.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Any high-rise should not be on the
 18 shoreline. That's the intent. Any discussion?
 19 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 20 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Shouldn't there be a finite
 21 or definite definition on high-rises to three stories?
 22 Coconut trees go up to 80 feet, which is eight stories. So
 23 eight stories is okay? I'd like to know.
 24 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: No.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?

1 terms can be defined.
 2 They also have Policy Number 4, which would address
 3 it through the development of visual impact assessment.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 5 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, Mr. Chair.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 7 COMMISSIONER STARR: Can we switch that from an
 8 action to a policy.
 9 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: The seconder does not have
 10 any objection.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? Move that
 12 from an action to a policy. Additional discussion?
 13 Ready for the question?
 14 Commissioner Mardfin.
 15 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'd just like to say my
 16 definition of high-rise is two stories. Hana Kai is about
 17 that, and that's about the limit we want to go in Hana.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: This is our program for economic
 19 development for the visitor industry.
 20 Additional discussion?
 21 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 22 (Round of ayes.)
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 24 (Round of nays.)
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor, signify by

1 Commissioner Starr.
 2 COMMISSIONER STARR: I believe that high-rise
 3 development is a term commonly used in planning and land
 4 use. Can we --
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: High-rise in Honolulu is different
 6 from high-rise on Maui.
 7 COMMISSIONER STARR: I mean, I'd be happy to say
 8 over six stories if people are happier with that.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? Is that a
 10 friendly amendment?
 11 COMMISSIONER STARR: To think out loud. I mean,
 12 there are some cases where three stories will block a view
 13 and there are some cases where 12 stories will block a view.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: There's some areas where one story
 15 will block a view.
 16 COMMISSIONER STARR: I think by using the term
 17 high-rise, there's -- I think it creates a situation where
 18 it's relative. If it's down in a hole somewhere, maybe
 19 that's not a problem with a taller building. If it's
 20 another spot -- I'd like to stick with the current wording.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 22 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. My only
 23 comment is this really reads more like a policy than an
 24 action. If it is written as a policy, then the action
 25 during the development of the ordinance, those types of

1 raising your hand. Four in favor.
 2 Opposed, same sign. Four. Chair votes opposed.
 3 Motion dies.
 4 Additional discussion? Ready for the question?
 5 All those in favor of Objective Number -- I can't
 6 even remember what objective we're on -- Number 2, signify
 7 by saying "aye."
 8 (Round of ayes.)
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 10 (Nay.)
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Motion carries.
 12 Why don't we take a break, come back at 2:30. Ten
 13 minutes.
 14 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Mr. Chair.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 16 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: If she want's a break, fine.
 17 We just have one objective to go, then we're finished with
 18 Heritage Resources.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Go ahead. Commissioner
 20 Mardfin.
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I apologize. I move for the
 22 adoption of Objective 3 and it's two policies and one
 23 action.
 24 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Second.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Cammie, you can spell Commissioner

1 Mardfin's name wrong on the next paragraph.
 2 MR. GIROUX: Well, no. He doesn't get a break.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 4 Director Hunt.
 5 DIRECTOR HUNT: I believe on Page 40, there's
 6 Actions 2, 3 and 4.
 7 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I apologize.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 9 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 10 (Round of ayes.)
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 12 (No response.)
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you. We're on
 14 break.
 15 (At which time, a recess was taken.)
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: The Planning Commission is back in
 17 session. Okay. We approved Natural Hazards and approved
 18 Diversification. Any additional discussion? Just kidding.
 19 Okay. We're on Natural Hazards. Did we get the
 20 Staff presentations at the last meeting on Natural Hazards?
 21 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 24 Objective 1 and its intended policies and actions.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?

1 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: At Director's
 2 recommendation?
 3 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Director's Recommendation.
 4 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Second.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Shibuya.
 6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Mr. Chairman.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 8 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm going to be slow,
 9 because we only got this horizontal version when we came in
 10 today. And so all my notes are on the vertical version in
 11 my book. So that means we got to look up, look back, look
 12 forward. I would actually prefer -- I don't know if it can
 13 be done -- but refer to the numbering in our Maui Island
 14 Plan book?
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? No
 16 discussion. Ready for the question?
 17 The question is for the adoption of goal under
 18 Natural Hazards Objective 1, policies and actions. All
 19 those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 20 (Round of ayes.)
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 22 (No response.)
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 24 Commissioner Mardfin.
 25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Mr. Chairman, I move for the

1 adoption of Objective 2 and its intended policies and
 2 actions on page 29 and 30 in our -- and 31.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: As recommended --
 4 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: In our guide.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: Director's Recommendation?
 6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm going to say no because
 7 I didn't get the Director's Recommendation until today. So
 8 whatever the GPAC recommends.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second? Seconded by
 10 Commissioner Shibuya. Discussion?
 11 Director.
 12 DIRECTOR HUNT: I appreciate the concern that you
 13 just got this today. But I was wondering if you could take
 14 a minute since you cruised through the last one so quickly
 15 now and at least consider the Director's Recommendation
 16 rather than merely saying that you got it late so we're not
 17 going to consider it.
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: No, I'd be happy to deal
 19 with them, but as amendments to GPAC's recommendation so we
 20 have time to look at them.
 21 DIRECTOR HUNT: That's fine.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 23 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The table
 24 that was distributed today, what Staff did in light of the
 25 comments from the last meeting for the Staff to look at

1 consolidating wherever we could. We couldn't do that for
 2 Heritage. But for Hazards, we were able to do that. So
 3 this table reflects that effort at consolidation as
 4 requested by this body.
 5 I'd like to note that for the Natural Hazards
 6 section, the GPAC did not formally, as a body, review and
 7 approve this section. It did go the IRC. This was
 8 originally in the Heritage element, that Heritage IRC took a
 9 look at it to provide some comments and asked that it be
 10 wrapped into its own separate element. So this is a
 11 combination of some IRC suggestions and the Department.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: So the Director's Recommendation in
 13 this case is the response to the Commission's request for
 14 consolidation at the last meeting?
 15 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 17 Commissioner Starr.
 18 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes. I'd like to make a
 19 motion to add a policy under Objective 2. And that policy
 20 shall be --
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: We're on Objective 1.
 22 COMMISSIONER STARR: Bare with me. "Increase food
 23 and energy security through local production and storage."
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Under Natural Hazards?
 25 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, under greater protection

1 of life and property.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 3 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Mr. Chairman.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I wish you'd rule that out
 6 of order since the motion dealt with Objective 1.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: We already approved Objective 1.
 8 This is for Objective 2; right?
 9 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. Did we have a motion
 10 for 2?
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: We had a motion for 2; right?
 12 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: On the IRC Recommendation as opposed
 14 to the Director's Recommendation. So it's in order.
 15 Your motion is to move it into this section; right?
 16 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, it would be under 2. A
 17 new policy under Objective 2. We already approved
 18 Objective 1.
 19 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: With the GPAC
 20 Recommendation.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: With the Director's Recommendation.
 22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Okay, I'm sorry. My
 23 mistake. I'm wrong.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Additional discussion?
 25 Didn't we cover this once before?

1 it was. I just need to know if Policies 1 and 2 are going
 2 to be combined as the Director recommended? If that's
 3 what --
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Not at this point.
 5 MS. STALEY: Okay.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Ready for the question? The
 7 question on the floor is to amend by adding a policy that
 8 reads as displayed on the board, "Increase food and energy
 9 security through local production in storage."
 10 All those in favor, raise your hand.
 11 Opposed, same sign. Motion carries.
 12 Commissioner Starr.
 13 COMMISSIONER STARR: I was going to make a motion
 14 to utilize the Director's Recommendation.
 15 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Second.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Guard.
 17 Discussion?
 18 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 19 (Round of ayes.)
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 21 (No response.)
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 23 Commissioner Mardfin.
 24 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: He got his motion in first.
 25 I wanted to ask a question about whether coastal hazards

1 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Can you state that again.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Julia.
 3 COMMISSIONER STARR: Okay. The wording is,
 4 "Increase food and energy security through local production
 5 and storage."
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Staff comment. Mr. Summers.
 7 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Staff
 8 supports the purpose of this. I do know that we've
 9 addressed this in a significant way in the agriculture
 10 sections of the paper. So if the body wants to address it
 11 here as well, it's up to the body.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 13 Commissioner Starr.
 14 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, I feel some mention of
 15 it does belong here. This is certainly a hazard that could
 16 cause severe loss of life if our shipping were to be put on
 17 hold for even several days. We would likely have starvation
 18 and people without water.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 20 Ready for the question? Question is as displayed
 21 on the screen.
 22 Julia.
 23 MS. STALEY: I just need clarification because I
 24 have that as Objective 2 policies and actions. And we had a
 25 little confusion about whether it was -- what recommendation

1 includes sea-level rise?
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: What item are you on?
 3 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: We combined 1 and 2 and we
 4 just approved it, but I still have the question. "Identify
 5 critical infrastructure, lifelines, roads and populations
 6 that are vulnerable to coastal hazards and encourage
 7 strategic retreat." And I'm asking if coastal hazards
 8 include sea-level rise?
 9 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.
 10 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: The answer is yes?
 11 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you, Mr. Summers.
 13 Additional discussion? Ready for the question?
 14 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 15 (Round of ayes.)
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 17 (No response.)
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 19 Commissioner Mardfin.
 20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Mr. Chairman, I move for the
 21 adoption of Objective 3, policy and actions as recorded
 22 under GPAC, but evidently by the IRC. It's on Page 31 of
 23 our book.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Not the Director's Recommendation on
 25 Page 5?

1 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: No. I'm moving the one that
 2 I had a chance to read.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Is there a second?
 4 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Second.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner U'u --
 6 Guard. Sorry. You guys all look alike.
 7 COMMISSIONER STARR: Those paddle guys.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 9 Commissioner Mardfin.
 10 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Under Action 1, it says,
 11 "Develop an island-wide evacuation routes plan." And Action
 12 2 says "Identify and develop required shelter capacity."
 13 And I want to ask if they say an "island-wide
 14 evacuation routes plan," I want to know if that is going to
 15 be very community and even neighborhood specific, or if
 16 that's going to say everybody head for Haleakala. Because
 17 as I mentioned the last time around, the various hazards in
 18 East Maui can affect various microcommunities. And plans
 19 have to be written so no matter where you live, you know
 20 where you're supposed to go and where you're thing is
 21 supposed to be. And different communities may have a
 22 different evacuation route.
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 24 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Whenever we
 25 develop a plan or an ordinance, that ordinance typically

1 evacuation.
 2 MR. SUMMERS: Exactly.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Or when all else fails, climb the
 4 nearest coconut treat.
 5 Commissioner Mardfin.
 6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Let me state what I would
 7 not like to see. I would not like to see a book this thick,
 8 like the Maui Island Plan, go to every community where
 9 there's one page or two pages that are relevant to the
 10 people who live Kuiki, and they have to wade through all
 11 this to get to it.
 12 In terms of education, public outreach, public
 13 education, each community needs to know what they're going
 14 to do in their community. And I care -- excuse me, I could
 15 care less what happens to Kihei in Lahaina in terms of the
 16 overall --
 17 (Round of woes.)
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: We need to know what is what
 19 for a current situation. And I've seen the hazard book that
 20 comes out, and it's not terribly helpful.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you, Commissioner Mardfin.
 22 Additional discussion? Are you ready for the
 23 question? Okay. We're not going by the Director's
 24 Recommendation as it stands. Director's Recommendation was
 25 to combine 2 and 3, which was a request from the Commission

1 involves extensive community outreach. And ultimately, it
 2 also includes review by Planning Commission or similar
 3 bodies, and often times Council approval.
 4 So the answer is yes, as part of the review
 5 process, there's extensive local grass routes consultation.
 6 And that's done to ensure that it's actually adopted and
 7 approved. Whenever there's a failure in that regard, what
 8 happens is the Council or the other body says huh-uh, we're
 9 not going to move forward, and they send us back out in the
 10 field for that.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 12 Commissioner Mardfin.
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: So let me understand.
 14 You're going to write for adoption by the Council, an
 15 island-wide evacuation route plan. And within that, there
 16 are going to be 1,000 mini-evacuation routes, depending on
 17 the community; is that correct?
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 19 MR. SUMMERS: I think it really depends on the type
 20 of hazard that we're modeling. And so it's situation
 21 specific. In some instances, it might get down to that
 22 level. In other instances, depending on the situation we're
 23 trying to mitigate, it may not. So I think a comprehensive
 24 plan like that would include both.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: An evacuating in place, vertical in

1 from consolidation.
 2 COMMISSIONER STARR: We're pau on that.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay, I'm sorry. We're on
 4 Objective 3. Policy and action items under Objective 3.
 5 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 6 (Round of ayes.)
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 8 (No response.)
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 10 Commissioner Mardfin.
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 12 Objective 4 as recommended by the IRC.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by?
 14 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr. Discussion?
 16 Director. Come on, Jeff. Fight for your
 17 recommendation here.
 18 DIRECTOR HUNT: Well, we're just implementing the
 19 direction from this body, this streamline.
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: I'd like to thank the Staff for
 21 doing some consolidation work before the end of this entire
 22 process, actually. Thank you.
 23 Commissioner Shibuya.
 24 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I'd like to endorse the
 25 Director's Recommendation to combine Number 2 and 3 actions.

1 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Second.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Moved and seconded to amend the
 3 Director's Recommendation on Actions 2 and 3. Discussion?
 4 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 5 (Round of ayes.)
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 7 (No response.)
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried thank you. Additional
 9 discussion on Objective 4 policies and actions?
 10 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 11 (Round of ayes.)
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 13 (No response.)
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 15 Economical Development. Commissioner Mardfin.
 16 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Okay. I move -- under
 17 Economic Development, I move for adoption of the goal GPAC
 18 recommendation, Objective 1, and it's related policies and
 19 actions.
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 21 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Second.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Shibuya.
 23 Discussion?
 24 Commissioner Mardfin.
 25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'd just like to -- I was

1 see it stop after approvals?
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm sorry?
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: A period after approvals?
 4 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Yeah, I'd like to see a
 5 period after approvals.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 7 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I agree.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Moved by Commissioner Mardfin,
 9 seconded by Commissioner Shibuya to delete "support targeted
 10 industries."
 11 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 12 (Round of ayes.)
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 14 (No response.)
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried, thank you. Additional
 16 discussion?
 17 COMMISSIONER STARR: Can we have a clarification on
 18 what that was just changed to?
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Policy number 3?
 20 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. Because the Chair said
 21 it was support targeted industries.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Policy number 3 would be restated to
 23 read, "Facilitate and expedite permits and approvals,"
 24 period.
 25 COMMISSIONER STARR: Then I'd like to vote against

1 looking particularly at Policy Number 3. And I would --
 2 it's just my experience as an economist that targeting
 3 industries has a horrible history both by developing
 4 nations; by Japan, by the U.S., by the Soviet Union. And
 5 while I think, you know, we want to try to do it, I don't
 6 think we should give our hopes up that we will be totally
 7 effective.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 9 Director Hunt.
 10 DIRECTOR HUNT: I just want to thank you for out of
 11 your 900 policies in this document, you have one that speaks
 12 to expediting for me. So thank you.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Guard, additional
 14 discussion?
 15 Commissioner Mardfin.
 16 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: With relationship to
 17 expediting permitting and streamlining, I have no problem as
 18 putting that as a general guidance for things. There were a
 19 couple things later in this document where it was specifying
 20 a particular industry. And I don't think it should be
 21 industry specific. I think in general, we should be
 22 streamlining, not saying oh, the film industry gets
 23 streamlined and everything else doesn't. So I like it here
 24 under a generalized.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: What you're saying is you'd like to

1 that.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. One nay noted. Still
 3 approved. Discussion? Ready for the question?
 4 All those in favor of Objective Number 1, policies
 5 and actions, signify by saying "aye."
 6 (Round of ayes.)
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 8 (No response.)
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried.
 10 Commissioner Mardfin.
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 12 Objective 2 and it's policies and actions.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Do we have a second?
 14 COMMISSIONER U'U: Second.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner U'u.
 16 Discussion?
 17 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 18 (Round of ayes.)
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed "nay."
 20 (No response.)
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 22 Commissioner Mardfin.
 23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 24 Objective 3 and its policies and actions as recommended by
 25 GPAC.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 2 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Second.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Shibuya.
 4 Commissioner Mardfin.
 5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I would appreciate if the
 6 Director would speak to his recommendation, that Policy 2 be
 7 moved to Hazards and Policy 3 be moved to Land Use.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Director.
 9 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Objective 3.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Sorry, that's Objective 3. That's
 11 what we're on.
 12 COMMISSIONER U'U: We're still on 3.
 13 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I thought we were on 2.
 14 COMMISSIONER STARR: Two is pau.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Director.
 16 DIRECTOR HUNT: Well, a lot of policies touch on
 17 several elements. And you could logically put them in
 18 various elements within the plan. I don't think it matters
 19 if you have a strong feeling about it, but that's our
 20 recommendation.
 21 COMMISSIONER STARR: Chair.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 23 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. I'd like to keep a
 24 statement here because I think it's important. And I'm sure
 25 there's stuff in housing that will cover it as well. But I

1 think it's important to have Economic Development, to have
 2 people know where they're going to live and work.
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 4 Director Hunt.
 5 DIRECTOR HUNT: Not to argue, but I didn't explain.
 6 An issues of housing will come up. So then they'll go to
 7 the housing element to address that. The fear is it's not
 8 in the housing area and then it gets overlooked. That's
 9 just the logic.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: On Policy Number 4, I'd like
 12 to ask the Director -- well, it isn't the Director,
 13 actually. It's GPAC. They put, "encourage, nurture and
 14 reward entrepreneurship." And I'd like to understand what
 15 they meant by "reward entrepreneurship."
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: They would be exempt from all
 17 permits.
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I know what it means in my
 19 line of work. It means you make profits and you survive.
 20 But I don't know what it means in terms of government
 21 policy.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: John, fill this room with your
 23 intelligence.
 24 MR. SUMMERS: I think this is a very broad policy.
 25 I think it just calls for sensitivity within the different

1 agencies of the county to respect and understand the
 2 challenges that entrepreneurs in small businesses face, and
 3 to try to create a conducive business climate to encourage
 4 their survival.
 5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I can accept that.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 7 Director Hunt.
 8 DIRECTOR HUNT: Several policies in the document
 9 are aspirational, and they just kind of speak to a feel good
 10 policy or something. I doubt there would be an
 11 implementation specific to rewarding entrepreneurship. But
 12 people felt they wanted to make that statement.
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I understand that, too.
 14 That's fine.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 16 Commissioner Starr.
 17 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. Move to amend the
 18 following in the Director's Recommendation on 2 and 3, which
 19 are Action Items 2 and 3. I think they're Action Items 2
 20 and 3 -- no. They're Action Items 2 and 3 on the next page.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 22 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Second.
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Sablas.
 24 Discussion?
 25 Motion to accept Director's recommendation under

1 Action Items 2 and 3 on Page 4. Discussion?
 2 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 3 (Round of ayes.)
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 5 (No response.)
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you. Additional
 7 discussion on Objective 3.
 8 Mr. Summers.
 9 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Can we take
 10 a short recess. I've got to make sure that Julia has got
 11 the most recent table projected.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. We'll go ahead and take a
 13 five-minute recess.
 14 (At which time, a recess was taken.)
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: The Planning Commission is back in
 16 session. We haven't voted on Objective Number 3 at this
 17 point.
 18 Commissioner Shibuya.
 19 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I just want to clarify, get
 20 a clarification that the telecommunications infrastructure
 21 does include broadband, does it not? This is for Staff.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: It's under Objective 3, Policy 1?
 23 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: That's correct.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 25 MR. SUMMERS: Thanks for clarifying that.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Yes, it does include broadband in
2 telecommunications infrastructure.
3 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.
4 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? Ready for
5 the question. Mr. Shibuya. Ready for the question?
6 All those in favor of Objective Number 3 as
7 amended -- did we amend this?
8 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, we took Director's.
9 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: We took the Director's.
10 CHAIR HEDANI: Right. Significant by saying "aye."
11 (Round of ayes.)
12 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
13 (No response.)
14 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
15 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair.
16 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Starr.
17 COMMISSIONER STARR: Move to approve Objective 4
18 and it's associated policies and actions with the Director's
19 Recommendation.
20 CHAIR HEDANI: Start with the goal.
21 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes, of course. I'll start
22 with the goal.
23 CHAIR HEDANI: So seconded by Commissioner Shibuya.
24 Discussion?
25 Mr. Mardfin.

1 to keep offering \$400 a night rooms, you're going to include
2 a lot of those people, they'll end up buying motor homes and
3 going to national parks on the mainland.
4 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'd like to support what
6 Commissioner Hiranaga is saying, but I want to elaborate on
7 it a little bit. If you're talking about high-end
8 visitors -- this is going to take me a little bit to get out
9 because I want to do it carefully. Because I've done some
10 time studying the visitor industry.
11 People used to complain about Japanese owning the
12 hotels; and therefore, we were losing out on that. That
13 argument, by and large, doesn't hold much water because they
14 were hiring local people to provide the services, they were
15 paying the local property taxes, they were buying generally
16 local goods -- or as locally as we normally get. So most of
17 the impact benefited the local economy. The exception are
18 the profits, which are relatively small. And whether it
19 went to Japan or California made no difference to me. So
20 outside ownership means that the profits do get repatriated
21 back.
22 With a high-end visitor, they're paying higher
23 prices, but you're not paying the workers particularly more,
24 you're not spending more on local goods. So the high-end
25 basically results in a higher percentage of the revenues

1 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I need a little bit of time
2 to read this because I just received this.
3 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Well, other commissioners
4 have comments.
5 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Hiranaga.
6 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: What does increase the
7 financial economic contribution of visitor industry mean?
8 Does it mean they pay more for what they're getting?
9 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.
10 DIRECTOR HUNT: I believe there was a plan from the
11 hotel industry that spoke to getting more money per visitor
12 arrival rather than increasing the number of arrivals;
13 therefore, our economy would receive a bigger jolt from the
14 same number of visitors.
15 CHAIR HEDANI: Bigger bang for their buck.
16 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I guess my concern is, from
17 my perspective, the high-end visitor segment is the most
18 fickle. They have the money to go anywhere. If they don't
19 like it here, they can go to South American, Asia,
20 Australia. And for us to put all our eggs in this basket to
21 go to the high-end visitor, I'm not sure if that's the right
22 thing do do.
23 For me, it's the people that like to come to Maui
24 from the west coast for a fairly affordable vacation. I
25 don't think we should be shutting that out. If you're going

1 going to either California or Japan. So high-end visitor,
2 per se, to me, doesn't speak to necessarily benefit. On the
3 other hand, I think Policy 2 and Policy 4 somewhat conflict
4 with each other. And just focusing on the higher end, I
5 think would be a mistake.
6 There are communities that can benefit by the
7 diversification by having lower-end kinds of alternatives.
8 I'm thinking about bed and breakfast and TVRs outside of the
9 hotel areas. So I think we need to be careful at least
10 about focusing on the high-end visitor. So I support my
11 fellow Commissioner.
12 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Guard.
13 COMMISSIONER GUARD: I'm not seeing where it says
14 high-end visitor. So that seems to be someone who wants to
15 go rent a kayak, go on a canoe ride, not necessarily staying
16 at the Four Seasons. So I think we got a little off track.
17 I'm not seeing increase hotel rates. Having more activities
18 or different options for people than just the a spa day at
19 the Grand Wailea or anywhere else.
20 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
21 Commissioner U'u.
22 COMMISSIONER U'U: Yeah. I think we're rated the
23 highest hotel rates in the state. I agree with the comments
24 on some of the Commissioners, even JB Guard's.
25 But I know we're losing tourists to Mexico. And

1 they're saying it's due to the permitting process and the
2 cost of doing business here. And it's a lot cheaper to do
3 it in Mexico. And right now, we're winning that battle on
4 tourism that would come here. But thank God, they got the
5 swine flu. But I am saying that we're losing some of our
6 visitors to Mexico. And I would not want to see the
7 increase in an already expensive area.

8 But I would agree with what Commissioner Guard
9 said, increase activities would be something good.

10 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?

11 Commissioner Starr, was your motion to include the
12 Director's Recommendation?

13 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes.

14 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? Ready for
15 the question?

16 Commissioner Hiranaga.

17 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I guess I'm looking for a
18 better word for Policy Number 2, through increase visitor
19 spending. Something like through enhanced visitor
20 experience. I mean, you have to -- people now are looking
21 for value. And I don't think we need and try to squeeze the
22 last drop out of the fruit. I think we need to make Maui
23 attractive for that valued visitor. I just don't like
24 trying to control the number of visitors and squeeze as much
25 money out of them as possible. I think if that's our

1 development? And that would be a very interesting
2 discussion.

3 COMMISSIONER U'U: Hana.

4 DIRECTOR HUNT: So again, these policies, you can't
5 just look at one side of the equation. You have to look at
6 both sides, and then weigh the pros and cons on both sides.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: Plus, you can't build any more hotel
8 rooms unless you have more children.

9 Commissioner Sablas.

10 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: You know, I've been part of
11 the visitor industry for over 40 years. And it doesn't
12 really set right with me to see an industry targeted. I
13 guess I look at the development of Amfac. And because of
14 that, a lot of family members are here on Maui. And instead
15 of rewarding, we're now assessing more taxation on the very
16 thing that has kept this island going economically. And it
17 concerns me.

18 Because being in the visitor industry, you know,
19 it's not an easy task to take care of our employees. I know
20 we put more money back in our community over the years that
21 we've been in our hotel than we've ever given back to our
22 owners. By a ration have maybe nine to one, 90 percent of
23 our resources has gone to the community and not to our
24 owners.

25 So to continue -- I mean, I understand maybe the

1 strategy, we're going to end up losing them to a lot of
2 other places.

3 So my amendment is through a focused economic
4 growth in the visitor industry through an enhanced visitor
5 experience rather than increase visitor arrival.

6 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.

7 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Third.

8 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Policy Number 2.

9 CHAIR HEDANI: That's an amendment to the
10 Director's Recommendation on Policy Number 2.

11 Julia, can you read that back to us, please.

12 MS. STALEY: "Focus economic growth in the visitor
13 industry through an enhanced visitor experience rather than
14 increased visitor arrivals."

15 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?

16 Director Hunt.

17 DIRECTOR HUNT: This is probably one of your more
18 important policies and it's worthy of some good discussion.
19 It's important to look at the big picture. And you can make
20 a good argument that we shouldn't just focus on getting more
21 money out of the existing visitor count. But if we don't
22 pursue this policy, it could result in having a need to
23 expand our resorts.

24 So then the question that I would pose is where on
25 the Maui Island Map do you want to propose more resort

1 rationale. But I think this should be really looked at.
2 Because I'm surprised we don't have visitor industry people
3 here to speak toward this. But it's really -- I cannot vote
4 in support of this objective.

5 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?

6 Mr. Shibuya.

7 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I will support this because
8 many of the visitors do this have opportunity to
9 participate, personally participate in reality type of
10 activities, such as going down slides, as well as going
11 through streams and doing artistic items and participating
12 in triathlons, sports, various recreational activities. And
13 I hope they would stay on the boats to take a look at the
14 whales and perhaps not try to catch the beautiful fish that
15 we have on our nice shorelines.

16 But these are some of the things that we can
17 probably encourage them to do. And it enhances their
18 experiences of the Hawaii aloha that we have here. And I
19 think that is the essence. Thank you.

20 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?

21 Commissioner Mardfin.

22 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Are we talking about the
23 amendment?

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Yeah, we're talking about the
25 amendment to Policy Number 2, under the Director's

1 Recommendation to read as displayed on the board.
 2 Commissioner Starr.
 3 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. You know, I like the
 4 idea of trying to enhance the experience. I think that's
 5 right on. Because more and more, tourism is moving into a
 6 lot of niche and interest markets. You know, when you have
 7 people coming for health-type things, wellness-type things,
 8 wildness experiences, and sports and activities like that,
 9 it does create more of a bond to the place than someone who
 10 just comes because it's cheap.
 11 We're not going to be able to compete with Mexico
 12 that pays three bucks a day down there. And I don't think
 13 we want to go there. I think we want to continue to be the
 14 best. Maui's mark has been the best island in the world,
 15 and we have to strive to keep that and to make it a really
 16 special place, you know.
 17 You know, I think the next visitor horizon is going
 18 to be China in mass. And I'm hoping that as that happens,
 19 we become a place where people come for a special experience
 20 and to learn something new that maybe educational, tourism
 21 becomes the type of thing that people are doing, rather than
 22 just being a numbers game. And I think that's the statement
 23 that's being made here, and I like what we're doing.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 25 Commissioner Shibuya.

1 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: I mean, is it increase from
 2 the businesses or is it increase from the individual
 3 visitors that we're after?
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Director, you want to clarify your
 5 original intent.
 6 DIRECTOR HUNT: Well, first of all -- and correct
 7 me if I'm wrong, John. But the planners didn't just kind of
 8 sit in the room and smoke some stuff and come up with this
 9 policy.
 10 COMMISSIONER GUARD: You're wrong.
 11 COMMISSIONER STARR: Busted.
 12 DIRECTOR HUNT: It's based on a strategic plan that
 13 came out of the tourism industry. So the tourist industry
 14 themselves came forward and said here's what we're
 15 proposing.
 16 Again, you have to look at the whole picture. And
 17 you guys are back on schedule. So you should have a lot of
 18 time in the next coming months to focus on directed growth
 19 and the amount of growth that we want on our island. And
 20 one of the questions the planners are going to ask you is
 21 how much resort development are you going to want? And are
 22 you going to propose another Makena and go through that all
 23 again?
 24 And those kind of questions, the issues that you're
 25 grappling with, I mean these are really tough issues for our

1 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I just want to embellish it
 2 a little bit more with a personal experience. A couple
 3 Saturdays ago, we took up about 50 people to the awahi to
 4 plant and restore a native forest. And out of that 50,
 5 there were seven people, seven visitors who came over for a
 6 vacation and saw our newspaper article and volunteered to
 7 help us plant and spent the whole day planting native plants
 8 and trees. So there were two from Connecticut and five from
 9 California.
 10 So I just want to relate to you that they came
 11 specifically to be part of the experience. And they
 12 learned -- we took them around the various areas and
 13 actually showed them. It was free from us. But for them,
 14 it was a top-of-the-line experience. They've never seen
 15 anything like this.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Additional discussion? We're
 17 talking about Policy Number 2.
 18 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Yes.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: As amended.
 20 Commissioner Sablas.
 21 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: I guess before I can even
 22 vote on that, I need to more clearly understand the
 23 objective of this goal.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Well, we kind of warped the
 25 objective from --

1 community. There's a lot of citizen input that says we
 2 don't want to keep expanding our resorts. So how do you
 3 accommodate visitors and how do you not have a negative
 4 impact on our economy? Because tourism is such a large part
 5 of our economy. And this shouldn't be viewed as punitive by
 6 the planners or we're disrespectful of the resort
 7 communities.
 8 We're trying to craft a policy that reflects the
 9 public concerns that we've heard out in the community. And
 10 this again is a GPAC Recommendation as well.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Hiranaga.
 12 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Well, I think my proposed
 13 amendment language says the same thing. It just says it in
 14 a kinder, gentler way.
 15 I mean, just because they're going to have an
 16 enhanced experience, doesn't mean we need to create more
 17 resorts like the Ritz Carlton. Because there's -- a lot of
 18 my friends who are from the mainland or from foreign
 19 countries, they prefer to stay in the B&Bs. They'll go to
 20 Mama's, they'll do kite surfing lessons, they'll spend.
 21 They just don't want to spend \$400 for the Ritz Carlton.
 22 They'd rather spend it going to the mountain.
 23 Back to this. I'm not saying don't increase
 24 visitor spending. I'm just saying it's kind of a gentler,
 25 kinder way of getting the money out of their pocket.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Okay. Another couple of
 3 observations. Commissioner Shibuya mentioned when out
 4 planting with his group, they probably didn't spend much
 5 money because they were away from the stores that day. But
 6 they will go home with stories to tell and people will come
 7 because of the experience. That's why I like Commissioner
 8 Hiranaga's comment on the enhanced visitor experience, the
 9 focus on your market.

10 And if we keep Maui as a beautiful, wonderful place
 11 and it helps the residents and it helps the visitors, and
 12 that's where we should be going. That's why I didn't like
 13 the talk about number limitations per se. It's what you
 14 make with the industry. Hotel Hana Maui is the single
 15 biggest private employer. Nothing above one story, by the
 16 way. And I really like this. So I support this idea of
 17 enhanced visitor experience.

18 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. I think we beat this one to
 19 death.

20 Commissioner Guard.

21 COMMISSIONER GUARD: I was going to comment on
 22 Commissioner Sablas. This one seems to go for the visitor
 23 and their experience.

24 Well, going with Commissioner Mardfin, I was a
 25 tourist in Hana this weekend and went to the hotel to listen

1 Page 36 of our large book, it says "Establish oversight of
 2 cultural and ecosystem by the Office of Cultural and
 3 Heritage Resources." And I was wondering what that
 4 establish oversight meant?

5 You might note that I'm the treasurer for the Hana
 6 Cultural Center. So I a personal interest in this.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

8 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. There's
 9 been pretty extensive growth in the eco-tourism subsector in
 10 recent years. And the University of Hawaii and others have
 11 department-management strategies for that sector.

12 So this would be establishing an agency to work
 13 with participants in this subsector to ensure sustainable
 14 practices in this area. Eco-tourism can be extremely
 15 beneficial or it can be extremely harmful, depending on how
 16 it's implemented. So that's what we're trying to get at.

17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: So the intent is to work
 18 cooperatively with the various cultural and ecotourism
 19 operators.

20 MR. SUMMERS: Right, to lay out a basic framework
 21 to ensure that the operations are sustainable.

22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Thank you.

23 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.

24 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. Along this vein,
 25 perhaps we can put some words in there that will tar and

1 to free Hawaiian music and ended up having a few drinks at
 2 the bar. They hugged me to death and took all my money. So
 3 they got it from me. And I think that's what we're talking
 4 about. That provides them the experience that allows them
 5 to do what they want to do and stick with being in a
 6 Hawaiian fashion so they're not going to Mexico. But not to
 7 say we need more from hotel owners to raise the taxes.

8 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: I needed that clarification,
 9 so thank you.

10 CHAIR HEDANI: From my perspective, the only
 11 comment I had on this item was that in the Economic
 12 Development section, the only concern I would have over this
 13 amended recommendation is that it says "rather than increase
 14 visitor arrivals." Assuming we have enough visitors now,
 15 where the Ritz Carlton is running at 30 percent occupancy
 16 and it takes 66 percent for them to break even. So that was
 17 my only concern.

18 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 19 (Round of ayes.)

20 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."

21 (No response.)

22 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. On to Objective 4,
 23 policies and actions.

24 Commissioner Mardfin.

25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: It's Action Item Number 4 on

1 feather the Maui Revealed guys.

2 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Aye.

3 CHAIR HEDANI: Further discussion?

4 Commissioner Hiranaga.

5 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Yeah. Objective 4, I'd
 6 like to amend by inserting the word or "sustain." "Increase
 7 or sustain."

8 CHAIR HEDANI: So the Director's Recommendation
 9 would read, "Increase or sustain the financial economic
 10 contribution of the visitor industry to the island and its
 11 residence."

12 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: And I'd like to -- well,
 13 I'd like to keep them while keeping the percent of the
 14 number of visitors existing at lower levels.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?

16 COMMISSIONER U'U: Second.

17 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner U'u. The
 18 motion is to amend the Director's Recommendation on
 19 Objective 4 to, "Increase and sustain" --

20 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: "Or."

21 CHAIR HEDANI: "Or sustain the financial economic
 22 contribution of the visitor industry to the island and its
 23 residence," period. Discussion?

24 Commissioner Starr.

25 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. I'll be voting against

1 this. I think I like the intent of the Director's
 2 Recommendation. And I think even the Maui Hotel Association
 3 and most other industry bodies have come out in favor of
 4 maintaining the current base and trying to enhance the --
 5 enhance the value rather than building up the numbers. And
 6 this is going along with the Maui Hotel Association.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 8 Commissioner Guard.
 9 COMMISSIONER GUARD: I guess, what time line or
 10 week are we looking at for keeping the percent or the number
 11 of visitors at existing or lower levels? That might be
 12 something we want to clarify.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: This week, the Ritz is at 95
 14 percent. Next week, they go to 37.
 15 COMMISSIONER GUARD: So we want to wait and vote
 16 next week?
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 18 Commissioner Sablas.
 19 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Yeah. I do have a problem
 20 about that, too. Because I think -- while I understand the
 21 intent, I mean we're in survival mode. To put any more
 22 restrictions on what we're doing, even an indication of
 23 keeping the percent. I mean, lucky -- we need to put
 24 increasing percent at this moment. And you don't know how
 25 long it's going to last.

1 above 25 percent, it changes the community character of our
 2 island. I think one of the Commissioners mentioned we don't
 3 want to become Disneyland, we are a resort island. So
 4 that's the intent. If you want to change the wording, we
 5 can help you with that.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: So the intent of the recommendation
 7 was to keep -- the percent relates to the visitor-resident
 8 percentage, not the occupancy percentage as it exists right
 9 now?
 10 DIRECTOR HUNT: Yeah.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 12 COMMISSIONER STARR: Would it be helpful if we
 13 added the word "accommodation" and remove the s from
 14 visitors. So "percentage of the number of visitor
 15 accommodations at existing or lower levels."
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Maker of the motion?
 17 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Actually, I'd like to
 18 withdraw my motion.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Motion is withdrawn.
 20 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: With the consent of the second.
 22 Commissioner Starr.
 23 COMMISSIONER STARR: I have a new motion, which is
 24 to change the wording to "visitor accommodations."
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: So it will read, "while keeping the

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: The Director last time
 3 around told us the way they would implement this would be to
 4 limit the development of new rooms. If it's reducing the
 5 growth of inventory, that should help all the existing
 6 businesses by giving them a higher occupancy rate. So I
 7 don't think this endangers existing hotel rooms. It just
 8 endangers people who plan to build new ones.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: I don't think that's what this says.
 10 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: It doesn't say that.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.
 12 DIRECTOR HUNT: Commissioner Mardfin said it
 13 exactly. It's not intended to reduce the occupancy number.
 14 I think there's actually policies in here that would speak
 15 to increasing. Warm beds generate economic development for
 16 our community. What it's about is how much additional
 17 entitlement of hotels do we want to allow, which then allows
 18 the accommodation numbers for visitors. It's important to
 19 say keeping the percent of visitors at the existing level.
 20 So it's not to say no growth of our hotel industry. It's
 21 just to say it would grow at the same percentage that we
 22 have now.
 23 If you remember one of the slides Dave Michaelson
 24 showed of our percentage of visitors is, I think, 25 percent
 25 on our island. And we received a lot of concern if you go

1 percent of the number of visitor accommodations at existing
 2 or lower levels." Is that what you mean?
 3 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second? No second.
 5 COMMISSIONER STARR: I may need to fine tune it.
 6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'll second it for the
 7 purposes of discussion.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Mardfin.
 9 COMMISSIONER STARR: Could I have some help in fine
 10 tuning it so it works.
 11 MR. MICHAELSON: Yeah. Because right now, it
 12 doesn't.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Hold on, guys.
 14 Commissioner Mardfin.
 15 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: May I ask. A percent is
 16 based on something. And it is implied in here, I think,
 17 that the base was the resident population. So it was
 18 visitor-to-resident population was the percentages. If
 19 you're changing it to accommodations, what is it, houses on
 20 Maui compared to visitor accommodations? I mean, it's a
 21 strange way to deal with it.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 23 MR. SUMMERS: Yeah. We can turn it into ratio if
 24 you want to let Staff work on that a little bit, where we
 25 can tie it to the average annual visitor census. I mean,

1 you can do it either way. You can use a ratio that allows
2 the growth over time, or you can actually tie it to a number
3 that's tracked on an annual basis, which is the average
4 annual visitor census.

5 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Commissioner Guard.

6 COMMISSIONER GUARD: We kind of stumbled over this
7 issue two weeks ago, correct, in Haiku?

8 So it seems by just removing the underlying section
9 of the Director's Recommendation and going to the main

10 objective, I think we've reached that we're just trying to
11 get more contribution, or how Commissioner Hiranaga stated

12 it, our visitor enhancement is what we're looking for, that
13 maybe we don't need to discuss the number of rooms or people

14 available, right, for a person? We're just looking for them
15 to have an enhanced Maui experience dollarwise.

16 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Can somebody repeat back to
17 me what the motion on the floor is right now.

18 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Take it out. We discussed it
19 two weeks ago.

20 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.

21 COMMISSIONER STARR: I want to try to --

22 CHAIR HEDANI: Just explain the intent of your
23 motion.

24 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. The intent was to try
25 to make it clear. We're talking about the entitlements.

1 My eyes can't handle reading it from this point.

2 But discussion?

3 Mr. Guard.

4 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Thank you. Objective 5

5 discusses the visitor unit expansion. And by adding this
6 unit count, if we start to stumble and if you look at all of

7 the policies and the actions for Objective 4, it discusses
8 more of a visitor experience and different programs in the

9 industry, and it doesn't talk to anything about the number
10 of units.

11 And I'll voting against it if that's what the new
12 objective is going to discuss if we don't talk about it.

13 And I'd rather it just die and we go back to the GPAC Final
14 Recommendation and bring it up again in Objective 5.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?

16 Commissioner Mardfin.

17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I seconded it for purposes
18 of discussion. But I think I also will be voting against

19 this.

20 I understand the principle of -- by the way, they

21 easily duck the question of whether it's 33 and a third or

22 some other number. Because I still think we're above 33 and

23 a third right now. But that being the case, I understand

24 the concept of not wanting the average daily visitor count

25 to be growing indefinitely as a percent of the resident

1 And so my feeling is while we could do it by keeping --
2 getting rid of the percentage. And we would have, "while
3 keeping the number of visitor accommodations at existing
4 levels of entitlements." "Existing number of facilities and
5 entitlements."

6 CHAIR HEDANI: Got that, Julia?

7 MS. STALEY: The last part of it, please.

8 COMMISSIONER STARR: It would be "while keeping the
9 number of visitor accommodations at existing
10 accommodation" -- "at the level of existing accommodations
11 and entitlements."

12 Because we know there's an additional 5,000
13 entitlements already out there.

14 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion? Consent of the second?

15 You're the second, Ward.

16 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I was the seconder? I won't
17 approve that adjustment.

18 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Guard.

19 COMMISSIONER GUARD: What Commissioner Starr seems
20 to be aiming at, it seems to be our next Objective Number 5,
21 and there's no second.

22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I take it back. I will
23 second it for the purposes of discussion.

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Motion by Commissioner Starr,
25 seconded as displayed on the board.

1 population. While the numbers are debatable, the general
2 goal seems to be applaudable.

3 When you switch to accommodations, I think you're
4 on a different thing. And I thank Commissioner Guard for
5 pointing out Objective 5, because I think that's the way of
6 dealing with the accommodation thing.

7 I also think we need to work the accommodation so
8 we get a little higher occupancy rates. And that can be
9 done by eliminating the accommodations. With a fixed number
10 of people -- growing, but fixed number of people -- and
11 limited accommodations, you can drive occupancy rates a
12 little bit higher, which is both beneficial to the existing
13 operators and people that work in industry. It will not,
14 unfortunately, help people that want to build new
15 accommodations.

16 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?

17 Commissioner Hiranaga -- Commissioner Starr.

18 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. I'm reluctant to go
19 along with the objective in its original wording because
20 that then become the basis for entitlement of lots more
21 accommodations, which would lead to less occupancy in hard
22 times. So, you know, I think one mechanism or another
23 should be used.

24 I'd like to make a motion that, going back to the
25 GPAC Final Recommendation, "Increase financial economic

1 contribution of the visitor industry to the island and its
 2 resident by increasing occupancy" --
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: We already have an amendment on the
 4 floor that we need to dispose of first.
 5 COMMISSIONER STARR: No, I thought -- oh, okay.
 6 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: It's your amendment to the
 7 accommodations.
 8 COMMISSIONER STARR: Okay. Vote on it.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Current amendment on the floor is,
 10 "Increase or sustain financial economic contribution of the
 11 visitor industry to the island and its residents while
 12 keeping the number of visitor accommodations at the level of
 13 existing accommodations and entitlements."
 14 Discussion? Ready for the question?
 15 Director.
 16 DIRECTOR HUNT: I think this actually goes too far
 17 the other direction in the sense that it could be
 18 interpreted that we would be keeping the accommodations at
 19 the existing level that we have today. And I don't think
 20 that was the intent of the GPAC and the Planning Department.
 21 COMMISSIONER GUARD: And I don't think it's going
 22 to go.
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Ready for the question?
 24 All those if favor of the amendment, signify by
 25 saying "aye."

1 we're going to create another mega resort destination in
 2 Hana. I mean, right now, how many B&B permits are out there
 3 that are legal?
 4 So when we get this process through, we're going to
 5 create 100 more or whatever accommodations that are not in a
 6 mega resort. So I don't think we should focus on hotel
 7 rooms. It's visitors. We don't care where they stay. So I
 8 think that the GPAC's Recommendation is concise enough. So
 9 that's why I'm making that motion.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 11 Commissioner Mardfin.
 12 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm going to vote against
 13 this motion amendment. Because while, as I say, I can
 14 quiver about what the percent should be, I think that the
 15 Director's Recommendation that you give some acknowledgment
 16 to ultimately limiting the growth of tourists -- I don't
 17 like existing or lower. I'd have slightly higher. But the
 18 general idea of not letting visitors grow expediently
 19 forever strikes me as a good idea.
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 21 All those in favor of the motion to accept the
 22 GPAC's Recommendation under Objective Number 4, signify by
 23 saying "aye."
 24 (Round of ayes.)
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, nay.

1 (Aye.)
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, same sign.
 3 (Round of nays.)
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Motion is lost. Discussion?
 5 Commissioner Starr.
 6 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, I move that the wording,
 7 "increase financial and economic contribution of the visitor
 8 industry to the island and its residents through
 9 optimization of occupancy and a value-added visitor
 10 approach."
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second? Additional
 12 discussion?
 13 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 14 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I make a motion to amend
 15 Objective 4 to the GPAC Recommendation.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 17 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Second.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Guard.
 19 Discussion?
 20 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Question.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Hiranaga.
 22 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Yeah. I think when we're
 23 talking about visitor accommodations, there seems to be an
 24 inference that these are more hotel rooms. But actually, it
 25 could be B&B rooms, it could be inn rooms. It's not like

1 (Round of nays.)
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor of the motion,
 3 signify by raising your hand. One, two, three, four, five.
 4 Motion passes.
 5 Any additional discussion?
 6 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 7 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Action Number 4.
 8 "Establish oversight of cultural and eco-tourism by the
 9 office of cultural and Heritage Resources."
 10 Is this an existing office, or we want to create
 11 more jobs again?
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: It's another county agency.
 13 Mr. Summers.
 14 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: The father of new county agencies.
 16 MR. SUMMERS: Absolutely. This was the office that
 17 was proposed in the cultural resource subelement of the
 18 Heritage element.
 19 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: No. My question was is
 20 this an existing office or --
 21 MR. SUMMERS: Well, this was a proposed office, a
 22 new office.
 23 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: A new office.
 24 MR. SUMMERS: That was recommended by the
 25 Department and not supported by this body.

1 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Director's Recommendation
 2 should have said delete. It's blank.
 3 MR. SUMMERS: Right. The Director supports the
 4 GPAC's Recommendation.
 5 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Oh, but Staff does not?
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Do so at your own peril.
 7 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'm trying to understand
 8 what you just said.
 9 MR. SUMMERS: Well, it was in the original -- this
 10 particular office was proposed in the cultural subelement of
 11 the Heritage chapter. And that was the recommendation of
 12 the GPAC and the Department. As I recall, this body in its
 13 deliberations in Haiku voted not to create this office.
 14 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Okay. So I make a motion
 15 to delete Number 4.
 16 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Moved and seconded to delete Number
 18 4. Discussion. All those in favor, signify by saying
 19 "aye."
 20 (Round of ayes.)
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 22 (Nay.)
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: One nay. Discussion? Any other
 24 items under Objective 4?
 25 All those in favor of the main motion for Objective

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 2 Director Hunt.
 3 DIRECTOR HUNT: Correct me if I'm wrong, John. But
 4 I think we raised it as a potential. But we used the word
 5 possibly. I guess it's an adverb. I don't think it's a
 6 strong recommendation. We're just bringing it to your
 7 attention.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 9 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 10 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Policy Number 1, you say
 11 limit resort destination complexes. And just going back to
 12 the Population section, you use the word resort destination
 13 areas. So I'm just wondering if there's a difference
 14 between resort destination complexes and resort destination
 15 areas.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: I'm sorry. What item are you on,
 17 Kent?
 18 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Policy Number 1.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you. Sorry, I was one
 20 objective back.
 21 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Did we approve Objective 4?
 22 We're on Objective 5.
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Yes, we're on Objective 5. I'm
 24 sorry.
 25 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Yeah, policy. So I'm just

1 Number 4 for the goal in Objective Number 4 as amended,
 2 signify by saying "aye."
 3 (Round of ayes.)
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed "nay."
 5 (Nay.)
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: One nay. Carried.
 7 Objective 5. Commissioner Mardfin.
 8 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move we adopt Objective 5
 9 and the policies and actions as recommended by the GPAC.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 11 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Second.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Guard.
 13 I'll note the Director's Recommendation was to move, one,
 14 two, three, four five, six, seven -- seven items and amend
 15 one item to the Land Use section.
 16 Commissioner Mardfin.
 17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Here, I really do like the
 18 GPAC Final Recommendation. While it might be appropriate to
 19 be in other sections, I kind of like it here where we're
 20 talking about tourism. Demonstrated community desires in
 21 here. Small locally owned retreat centers are compatible
 22 with the character of the surrounding community. I like
 23 these things. And while it might not do any harm to move
 24 them, I think it's appropriate to be under the visitor
 25 industry.

1 asking for some consistency unless there's a difference
 2 between resort destination complexes and resort destination
 3 areas.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers -- I'm sorry Director
 5 Hunt.
 6 DIRECTOR HUNT: John, again, pipe in. But I think
 7 areas would be the better term.
 8 COMMISSIONER GUARD: Correct.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Any discussion? That is a semantic
 10 item, so that will be corrected unless there is any
 11 objection; right? So the change is from complex to area.
 12 Commissioner U'u.
 13 COMMISSIONER U'U: Yes. Limit resort destination
 14 in Kapalua, Kaanapali, Wailea and Makena. So what is Kihei?
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Kihei is like Napili.
 16 COMMISSIONER U'U: So is Kihei a resort
 17 destination? Not really. Maui Lu --
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Actually, it's like a
 19 residential/visitor community, but not a destination area.
 20 COMMISSIONER U'U: So what is the destination area,
 21 is it zoning?
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Generally -- and the Staff can
 23 correct me if I'm wrong. A resort destination area was
 24 originally conceived as an area where the visitor could go
 25 to that area and have all of his visitor needs and

1 requirements fulfilled within the area.
 2 COMMISSIONER U'U: So the question again, is it due
 3 to zoning? So if you zone H1 or hotel -- if you zoned hotel
 4 and say you're in Kihei, you're not allowed to be a resort?
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: Director.
 6 DIRECTOR HUNT: I think there's several factors.
 7 If you're zoned hotel, you can build a hotel. The resorts
 8 that the policy speaks to -- actually, the four proposals,
 9 those four areas actually have a proposal for that resort
 10 and they mapped them out saying this is where want our
 11 resort to be.
 12 Some of Kihei was built by people converting
 13 apartments, et cetera, into short-term rentals. So they act
 14 as de facto resorts. Resorts are usually more -- and we had
 15 the word complex there. They're larger rather than just a
 16 single hotel isn't necessarily considered a resort area.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Also, generally, the resort
 18 destination areas would have a master plan and integrate
 19 everything: open space, shopping, recreation,
 20 transportation, and all the other stuff.
 21 COMMISSIONER U'U: Local.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Right, local.
 23 Commissioner Starr.
 24 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. In the day-to-day work
 25 by current division planners, is the fact that this -- you

1 When we got into that debate in Haiku, there was a
 2 suggestion that we include the term "new" so that we would
 3 not inadvertently impact a private like Hana resort. So
 4 that might be something for the Committee to consider.
 5 I think the concept here, the reason resort
 6 destination complexes is important and it does need to be
 7 defined, as we spoke in Haiku, was the intent of this policy
 8 was to essentially not allow a new, large megaresort-type
 9 facility outside of the existing four resort areas that are
 10 mapped on your Economic Policy Map.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 12 Commissioner Mardfin.
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Is there an amendment on the
 14 floor.
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: I don't think there's an amendment
 16 on the floor. We're open for discussion on Objective 5.
 17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: If there isn't, I would like
 18 to amend Policy 1, what we're talking about, to limit -- add
 19 the word "new resort destination complexes." We had agreed
 20 to areas, but go back to the complexes, to the four existing
 21 resort destinations, blah, blah, blah.
 22 So put "new" after limit, and change "areas" back
 23 to -- the first destination -- "areas" back to "complexes."
 24 Is that clear?
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: New resort destinations wouldn't be

1 know, this kind of land use related items were economic
 2 development. Would that make them less likely to be called
 3 into play, or does it not matter?
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Director.
 5 DIRECTOR HUNT: I didn't understand. I'm sorry.
 6 COMMISSIONER STARR: I know there was a suggestion
 7 to move all these items to land use. I'm wondering if the
 8 reasoning is that the current division planners, when the
 9 time comes, would find them there more readily, or does that
 10 not -- would they find them just as well in economic
 11 development?
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Nobody pays attention to economic
 13 development, right?
 14 MR. SUMMERS: Yeah. I think the reason we
 15 suggested that was that all of these items are related to
 16 land use or development standards. And we felt that might
 17 be more applicable in the Land Use element. And I think it
 18 can go in either location. It's not a big problem if you
 19 have similar policies with similar intent in both locations.
 20 But if we wanted to reduce the number of policies, we
 21 wouldn't do that. We would just put them in one section or
 22 the other. And we thought that the Land Use section would
 23 be more appropriate.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 25 MR. SUMMERS: And I do have a comment on Policy 1.

1 included in the four.
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm sorry. We're limiting
 3 new complexes to be in the four areas.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Is there a second?
 5 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Starr.
 7 Your amendment would read, "Limit new resort
 8 destination complexes." Everything else stays the same.
 9 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Yes.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 11 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 12 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'd like to offer replacing
 13 the word "complexes" with "developments." I'm not sure what
 14 a complex is.
 15 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I can live with that, that's
 16 fine.
 17 COMMISSIONER STARR: Mr. Chair.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 19 COMMISSIONER STARR: I think the resort destination
 20 complex is what you get when you've been working too long in
 21 the resort destination area.
 22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'll accept development as a
 23 friendly amendment.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: So the restated amendment would
 25 read, "limit new resort destination developments to the four

1 existing resort destination areas of Kapalua, Kaanapali,
 2 Wailea and Makena."
 3 Discussion? Ready for the question?
 4 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 5 (Round of ayes.)
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed?
 7 (Nay.)
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: One nay. Carried. I'm not sure
 9 what that means, but we passed it.
 10 Commissioner Mardfin.
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Policy Number 6, current on
 12 Page 36 is, "Minimize negative impacts from transient
 13 vacation rentals, timeshares and resort condominiums on
 14 residential communities, public infrastructure and community
 15 facilities."
 16 I would like to eliminate -- delete the last "and,"
 17 so it would be "public infrastructure, community
 18 facilities," comma, "long-term rental housing," comma,
 19 "price of housing," comma, "and rental housing."
 20 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: And delete community facilities?
 22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: No, leave it in. The comma
 23 was after the period. So after community facilities, you
 24 put a comma, and then you add the other three items.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: You got that, Julia? Woe, I'm

1 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I believe the proposed
 2 language in the amendment is a subcategory of negative
 3 impacts to residential communities. I think it's -- I don't
 4 think it's necessary to go into that detail.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.
 6 DIRECTOR HUNT: I kind of agree with Mr. Hiranaga.
 7 If you look at Policy 7, it speaks to impacts of the housing
 8 stock and the number of the added impacts kind of speak to
 9 housing, while in my mind, Policy 6 speaks to more of
 10 impacts to the physical structure of the neighborhood
 11 itself, or whatever. Perhaps some of those items could be
 12 added to policy Number 7.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion? Commissioner Mardfin.
 14 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I still like it where it is
 15 because it says minimize negative impacts on these things
 16 rather than directly discourage the conversion of. And
 17 there may be a way to do that, I'm not sure. But I'm happy
 18 with the way I proposed it.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: I have a question. What's the
 20 negative impact of resort condominiums?
 21 The reason I raised that is because in general in a
 22 resort destination area, you would have a combination of
 23 hotels, condominiums, single-family, recreational, and all
 24 that stuff. And I didn't know that condominiums were
 25 necessarily bad.

1 impressed.
 2 So the amendment to 6 would read, "Minimize
 3 negative impacts from transient vacation rentals,
 4 timeshares, and resort condominiums on residential
 5 communities, public infrastructure, community facilities,
 6 long-term rental housing, price of housing, and rental
 7 housing."
 8 Long-term rental housing and short-term rental
 9 housing is what you're talking about?
 10 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Well, I meant price of
 11 housing.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm sorry, excuse me. It
 14 should have been price of land. I can't read my own
 15 writing. The last one should be -- no. Rental housing,
 16 price of housing and price of land. I got it wrong. I'm
 17 sorry. Take out the rental before land. Price of --
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Price of housing and the price of
 19 land.
 20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Right.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion? Is there a second?
 22 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Starr.
 24 Discussion?
 25 Commissioner Hiranaga.

1 Mr. Summers.
 2 MR. SUMMERS: Yeah, I think it gets back to the
 3 impact on the housing stock and it would be location
 4 specific. If it's in a resort area, the impact would be
 5 less. It would be recognized as a potential use in the
 6 district.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: So this is intended to address
 8 condominiums that might occur and might be for resort use in
 9 residential areas. That was the intent, I see.
 10 Additional discussion? The amendment on the floor
 11 is up on the board. And it's too long and too late in the
 12 afternoon for me to read it. But you can read it.
 13 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 14 (Round of ayes.)
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 16 (Round of nays.)
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor, raise your right
 18 hand. One, two.
 19 Opposed, same sign. One, two, three, four, five,
 20 six. Motion is lost.
 21 Additional discussion on -- what the heck is it --
 22 Objective 5?
 23 Commissioner Mardfin.
 24 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move the amendment of
 25 Policy Number 7, "Discourage the conversion of the island's

1 housing stock to transient vacation rental to minimize the
 2 impact on the long-term rental housing, on the price of
 3 housing, and on the price of land."
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Got that, Julia? "Discourage the
 5 conversion of the islands housing stock to transient
 6 vacation rental use."
 7 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: "To minimize the negative
 8 impact on long-term rental housing, on price of housing and
 9 on the price of land."
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 11 COMMISSIONER U'U: Second.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner U'u.
 13 Discussion?
 14 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 15 (Round of ayes.)
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 17 (Nay.)
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor, signify by
 19 raising your hand. One, two, three, four, five.
 20 Opposed, same sign. One, two. Motion is carried.
 21 Any additional discussion on Objective 5?
 22 Commissioner Mardfin.
 23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: On Action Item Number 3, I
 24 like -- well, the motion on the floor is for the GPAC Final
 25 Recommendation. I'd like the Director's Recommendation for

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Into the microphone, Jonathan.
 2 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. Allow bed and breakfast
 3 establishments managed through the permitting process.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Maker of the motion?
 5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: If that's intended as a
 6 friendly amendment, I'd accept it. But my colleague is
 7 saying that we don't have a second on it yet.
 8 COMMISSIONER STARR: Oh, I seconded the original.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Moved by Commissioner
 10 Mardfin, seconded by Commissioner Starr. The amendment as
 11 proposed is to allow B&Bs --
 12 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: With the --
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: "Allow B&B establishments managed
 14 through the permitting process with appropriate standards
 15 and criteria consistent with community input and desires
 16 through the community plan."
 17 Discussion?
 18 Commissioner Mardfin.
 19 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I would like to -- again,
 20 with the seconds permission. Go back to actually the full
 21 wording on F, which was, "allow bed and breakfast
 22 establishments that do not interfere with surrounding
 23 neighborhoods" --
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Slow down. Go ahead.
 25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: "Allow bed and breakfast

1 Item 3F, but with a slight change of wording.
 2 The Director's version of 3F is, "Manage B&Bs
 3 through the permitting process with the appropriate
 4 standards of criteria consistent with community input and
 5 desires through the community plans."
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Julia, do you have that written in
 7 Chinese? Twice. Okay, thank you.
 8 "Manage B&Bs through the permitting process with
 9 the appropriate standards and criteria consistent with
 10 community input through the desires of community plans."
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: "And desires through
 12 community plans."
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: I'm sorry. Commissioner Mardfin.
 14 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: "Community input and desires
 15 through the community plans."
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I can delete "and desires"
 18 if that bothers somebody.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 20 Commissioner Starr.
 21 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, I feel that by having
 22 changed the wording from "allowed" to "manage," it kind of
 23 turns it into a negative. And I would prefer to utilize the
 24 same wording except preface it to allow bed and breakfast
 25 establishments --

1 establish that do not interfere with surrounding
 2 neighborhoods and managed through the permitting process
 3 with appropriate standards and criteria consistent with
 4 community input through the community plans."
 5 And if my seconder will consent to that --
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. The amendment has been
 7 restated with the consent of the second, to read -- Julia.
 8 "Allow bed and breakfast establishments that do not
 9 interfere with surrounding neighborhoods and managed through
 10 the permitting process with appropriate standards and
 11 criteria consistent with community input and desires through
 12 community plans."
 13 Discussion?
 14 All those in favor of the amendment, signify by
 15 saying "aye."
 16 (Round of ayes.)
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 18 (Nay.)
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: One nay. Motion is carried.
 20 Discussion on any other items on Objective 5?
 21 We're going to take a break after this because
 22 we're cramping our stenographer. And all of your names are
 23 going to be spelled wrong.
 24 All those in favor of Objective 5 and its policies
 25 and actions as amended, signify by saying "aye."

1 (Round of ayes.)
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 3 (No response.)
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 5 We'll take a ten-minute break.
 6 (At which time, a recess was taken.)
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Planning Commission is back
 8 in session. We're on Economic Development, Goal and
 9 Objective Number 6. We're going to have -- one commissioner
 10 has left. We're going to have another commissioner leave at
 11 4:30, and we're going to go until 5:00.
 12 Commissioner Starr.
 13 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah, move to approve Goal
 14 and -- first goal under Agricultural and Objective -- does
 15 this start with Objective 6? Yeah, Objective 6, and the
 16 underlying policies and actions.
 17 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Second.
 18 COMMISSIONER STARR: Per the Director.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 20 Moved by Commissioner Starr, seconded by
 21 Commissioner Sablas for approval of the goal under
 22 Agricultural and Objective 6, with the underlying policies
 23 and actions under the Director's Recommendation.
 24 Discussion?
 25 Commissioner Hiranaga.

1 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I guess Objective 6,
 2 ensure -- I'm not sure if that's the right word.
 3 COMMISSIONER STARR: Can we ask Staff what a good
 4 objective word would be to substitute there.
 5 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: What do you do if we don't?
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: You need to dump all of the imported
 7 fruits and vegetables before we consume this.
 8 Mr. Summers.
 9 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. As an
 10 objective, I think the term ensure is okay. Because really,
 11 this is intended to just set a benchmark. There's nothing
 12 really prescriptive in the way it would be used.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 14 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: This is a question. Does
 15 anybody know what the current percent of locally consumed
 16 fruits and vegetable is? I mean, it would be nice to know
 17 where we are before we set a goal of where we want to be.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 19 MR. SUMMERS: Jeff, did you want to take a stab at
 20 that?
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.
 22 DIRECTOR HUNT: As I understand it, it's 20 percent
 23 of what our food supply is now.
 24 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Twenty percent of what's
 25 locally grown?

1 DIRECTOR HUNT: I believe so.
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm amazed it's that high.
 3 DIRECTOR HUNT: Well, I guess the statistic I've
 4 heard is 80 percent is imported. So I'm not sure it
 5 necessarily follows. But intuitively, it would follow that
 6 20 percent is local. I would suggest you also look at
 7 perhaps just saying that 85 percent of locally consumed --
 8 dot, dot, dot. I'm not sure you need to ensure -- an
 9 objective is an aspiration. This is what you want to aim
 10 for.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 12 Commissioner Mardfin.
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I just have a problem with
 14 the number that high. I mean, I don't think we grow apples
 15 on Maui. I don't think we grow pears on Maui. We don't --
 16 we do grow grapes, but only for wine on Maui. You know,
 17 there's a whole lot of stuff just is there, and I don't know
 18 how you get anywhere near 85 percent.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 20 Mr. Summers.
 21 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. This objective
 22 actually comes forth from the Hawaii Sustainability Plan.
 23 And there was extensive research that went into that with
 24 the local farm bureaus around the state. So this is
 25 essentially is taken directly from that.

1 And we've run it through the ag people on the GPAC,
 2 Warren Watanabe from the farm bureau who was on the
 3 committee. And he was comfortable with that and supported
 4 it.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: This is going to end up with a lot
 6 of people eating meet and fish instead of fruits and
 7 vegetables.
 8 MS. STALEY: Feral ungulates.
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 10 COMMISSIONER STARR: We started out with 100
 11 percent not all that many years ago.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: As a goal? As an objective, you
 13 mean?
 14 COMMISSIONER STARR: No, as a reality.
 15 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: As a reality.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 17 Commissioner Mardfin.
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I would feel more
 19 comfortable if it were like 85 percent of locally consumed
 20 tropical fruits and vegetables, or something like that,
 21 where -- I mean, there's just some things we're not going to
 22 compete in. And it seems I'd rather it be targeted to the
 23 stuff that we do produce.
 24 I wouldn't see us importing a lot of pineapple from
 25 somewhere else because we can grow that here, or mangoes or

1 papayas or avocados. But even that, if it's off-season,
2 you're going to import them. So it just seems to me, it's
3 just kind of silly to talk about things we either can't or
4 don't produce here.

5 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

6 MR. SUMMERS: I would just note that the latest
7 statistics are that 40 percent of all fresh vegetables are
8 grown in the state.

9 CHAIR HEDANI: This talks about growing on-island
10 as opposed to the state. So it would prevent imports from
11 Honolulu.

12 Commissioner Shibuya.

13 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I just want to respond to my
14 colleague from Hana. Coming from Kula, much of our
15 cherimoya, our pears, our apples are actually grown in Kula.
16 We don't put them on the market because it's too tasty.
17 Lychee, loquats. These are available, but we trade amongst
18 ourselves. So if I give my loquats to the guy with onions,
19 when he gets his harvest, I get onions.

20 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.

21 COMMISSIONER STARR: About a year ago, I traveled
22 to a place called Rurutu in the Austral Islands of French
23 Polynesia, in a climate not that different from ours. And
24 they get -- almost 100 percent of what's eaten there is
25 grown locally. And the people strive for it, take pride in

1 Mr. Mardfin.

2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: This isn't an amendment, but
3 it's a question about Action 8. What is review Chapter
4 19.30 (a), Agricultural District, Maui County Code? This
5 goes along with the Chairman's concern that we not approve
6 things that we don't know about.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: What item are you on, Commissioner?

8 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Action item 8. It's on Page
9 39 of my big thing, but it's a different page --

10 CHAIR HEDANI: Director.

11 DIRECTOR HUNT: That's your Agricultural Zoning
12 District in the Maui County Code. It's the one that you
13 folks use to review any agriculture proposals that come
14 before you amongst any other regulations.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: So the recommendation is to review
16 that particular chapter to see if it remains supportive of
17 the other chapter. Is that the intent?

18 DIRECTOR HUNT: That's correct.

19 CHAIR HEDANI: Thank you. Additional discussion?

20 Commissioner Hiranaga.

21 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: This is Action Item 2, as
22 proposed by the Director. I'm just wondering how practical
23 it is to designate open space within residential
24 developments.

25 CHAIR HEDANI: Why is that under agriculture?

1 it, and frankly, live very well with a lot of diversity.
2 And it includes grains. It includes, you know, all kinds of
3 animal husbandry. And I really think that's the area where
4 we want to strive.

5 And I think we know it's going to take a long time
6 to go from 10 percent to 85, if we can ever get there. But
7 I don't think we should set our sites low in this area.
8 Because a day will come when the shipping will get cut off
9 and we're going to have to make due. And the further we are
10 in this direction, the better off we'll be.

11 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?

12 Commissioner Mardfin.

13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: First, I'd like to thank
14 Commissioner Sablas about educating me about things that I
15 knew little about. And I tend to agree with Commissioner
16 Starr on that we ought to be moving in this direction. And
17 maybe what needs to be done is some sort of having people in
18 Kula scale-up their production and find some mechanism for
19 getting it around the island. Because it sounds like it's
20 access that's the problem. Then we could go a long way with
21 better marketing systems and cater the local market.

22 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. I don't think we have any
23 motions on the floor at this point, except for the Goal and
24 Objective 6 and policies and actions. Do we have any other
25 proposed amendments?

1 Director.

2 DIRECTOR HUNT: Community farm or community
3 gardens. How practical? I don't think you should look at
4 it as huge open space. Even some jurisdiction require open
5 space in commercial developments where essentially you don't
6 have pavement-to-pavement. So this is a policy -- or is it
7 an action? But nonetheless, it would be worked out in the
8 development of that actual ordinance.

9 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'm just wondering when you
10 say residential development, five-lot subdivisions, 6,000
11 square feet, you got 30,000 square feet that you're
12 developing, you're going to require an open space in that
13 development. I think there needs to be -- you might want to
14 encourage to require that the designation of open space.
15 Sometimes it may not be practical, and you're just going to
16 create a little dumping ground for people.

17 CHAIR HEDANI: Director.

18 DIRECTOR HUNT: And perhaps you would have a
19 threshold on it, or whatever. Again, the details aren't to
20 be specified in this policy. It's just saying that we need
21 to -- or we should go forward to amend our plans to require
22 it, and we would set up a criteria in the details.

23 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I guess I propose an
24 amendment to amend the Director's Recommendation to delete,
25 "Amend the Maui County Code to require," and just put in

1 there, "encourage the designation of open space within
 2 residential developments."
 3 CHAIR HEDANI: So the amendment would read, "Amend
 4 the Maui County Code to encourage the designation of open
 5 space within residential development."
 6 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: No eliminate "amend the
 7 count code." Just start with "encourage."
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Oh, I see. "Encourage the
 9 designation of open space within residential developments."
 10 Discussion? Is there a second? Any other
 11 discussion?
 12 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Was there a second?
 13 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I'll second it.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Shibuya.
 15 Discussion?
 16 Director.
 17 DIRECTOR HUNT: Encourage would be more of a policy
 18 word. And I'd suggest you look at your existing policy or
 19 draft policy to see perhaps if you've already got it
 20 addressed. I think the idea of having an action would be to
 21 implement that policy, perhaps 5 or Policy 4.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. So specifically the
 23 Director's Recommendation was address that community gardens
 24 primarily.
 25 Mr. Summers.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Ready for the question? All those
 2 in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 3 (Round of ayes.)
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 5 (No response.)
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 7 Commissioner Mardfin.
 8 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 9 Objective Number 7 and the accompanying policies and
 10 actions.
 11 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Second.
 12 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: The GPAC's Recommendation.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Sablas.
 14 Discussion?
 15 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 16 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Action Number 1, "Work with
 17 the state to waive excise taxes for commercial ag products,"
 18 I would say "reduce" and not "waive." We're already working
 19 with a state deficit.
 20 Question. Commercial agricultural products,
 21 they're not paying the wholesale excise tax, they're paying
 22 the retail excise tax? Because wholesale is only a half a
 23 percent.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Staff. Mr. Summers.
 25 MR. SUMMERS: Yeah, I think it would depend on

1 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. There is a
 2 specific action that would implement that policy, Action
 3 Number 6. I'm not sure if Action Number 2 is actually
 4 necessary in this section on agricultural. My
 5 recommendation would be that we delete --
 6 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I'll withdraw my motion.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay, motion it withdrawn.
 8 And is the Director going to concur, or are you
 9 going to fire your subordinate again?
 10 DIRECTOR HUNT: I don't fire my staff. I need more
 11 staff.
 12 CHAIR HEDANI: Keep what you got.
 13 DIRECTOR HUNT: John knows the draft document
 14 better than I do. So if he's suggesting to delete that, I
 15 can concur.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: So the Director's Recommendation at
 17 this point would be to delete Item 2.
 18 Further discussion? Ready for the main motion?
 19 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: For my information --
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.
 21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: For my information, can you
 22 tell me, is the main motion on the Director's Recommendation
 23 or GPAC's Recommendation?
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Director's recommendation.
 25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Thank you.

1 whether it's wholesale or retail. And often times, these
 2 producers are doing both.
 3 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Okay. So my amendment
 4 would be replace the word "waive" with "reduce."
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: So Action Item Number 1 as proposed
 6 would read, "Work with the state to reduce excise taxes for
 7 commercial agricultural products produced within the State
 8 of Hawaii." Do we care what happens on Oahu and Kauai?
 9 Commissioner Mardfin.
 10 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I have a question on this.
 11 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Second.
 12 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'll second it.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Mardfin.
 14 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: When you say reduce, if it's
 15 four percent, reduce to a half a percent? Or if it's four
 16 percent, reduce it to a quarter percent?
 17 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: No, I said reduce.
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: But you're not talking about
 19 either one.
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: No, it's just open. So the goal
 21 would be to eliminate taxes on agricultural products.
 22 Basically, General Excise Taxes on agricultural products.
 23 Discussion? Ready for the question?
 24 All those in favor of the amendment, signify by
 25 saying "aye."

1 (Round of ayes.)
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, nay.
 3 (No response.)
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 5 Mr. Starr.
 6 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. I would like to move to
 7 delete Policy 1. I really believe that growing crops for
 8 export and exporting them is what got us into trouble. And
 9 I don't think we should facilitate the export of the
 10 island's agricultural products, but rather we should grow
 11 crops that will be eaten here. So my motion is to delete
 12 Policy 1.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Motion to delete Policy Number 1.
 14 Is there a second?
 15 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'll second it for the
 16 purposes of discussion.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Mardfin.
 18 Discussion?
 19 Commissioner Mardfin.
 20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: This comes from my overall
 21 world view. But I think trade is good. I think trade
 22 benefits both parties. I believe in specialization. And
 23 what got us into trouble in The Great Depression was bigger
 24 than neighboring policies. In trying to protect jobs in the
 25 U.S., we put on tariffs to prevent international trade. But

1 Discussion? Commissioner Starr.
 2 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. On Policy 3, I move an
 3 amendment that will reduce the words, "sugar cane production
 4 or other." So that it would read, "Encourage the continued
 5 viability of agricultural crops in Central Maui."
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 7 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Mardfin.
 9 Discussion?
 10 Commissioner Starr.
 11 COMMISSIONER STARR: I really think that the days
 12 of sugar cane are waning. It's a crop that cannot be eaten
 13 here. It is sustained only by subsidies that are on the
 14 wane. And the sooner that we can move beyond it to food
 15 crop production and that the land and water be utilized for
 16 growing stuff that can be eaten here or other higher valued
 17 crops will be a great day.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 19 Commissioner Mardfin.
 20 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I have a question for
 21 Commissioner Starr, because it's now, "encourage the
 22 continue viability of agricultural crops." Is that --
 23 CHAIR HEDANI: That's all agreed it's on the
 24 amendment.
 25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: That isn't necessarily --

1 the other countries responded. If we put in things like
 2 we're going to restrict stuff from other places, they may
 3 put restrictions on our's. I think it's a horribly bad
 4 idea.
 5 CHAIR HEDANI: My comment is that if we eliminate
 6 one under Economic Development -- what we're talking about
 7 is not exporting sugar and pineapple.
 8 Commissioner Starr.
 9 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. I really think we need
 10 to move toward in an era where we're producing crops that
 11 are consumed here. And I think that right now, our
 12 incentive is to produce crops that do not have food value
 13 and are not exported. And I cannot say that we need to
 14 further facilitate the export of crops, but rather we need
 15 to grow food that can be eaten here.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. Ready for the question?
 17 Question on the floor is to eliminate Policy Number 1.
 18 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."
 19 (Round of ayes.)
 20 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, same sign.
 21 (Round of nays.)
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor, signify by
 23 raising your hand. One in favor.
 24 Same, opposed. One, two, three, four, five.
 25 Motion dies.

1 the way it now reads wouldn't necessarily be for food
 2 consumption. For instance, this would support bamboo for
 3 construction issues and other kinds of agricultural
 4 products, whether used for human consumption or whether it's
 5 used for some other manner. Is that correct?
 6 COMMISSIONER STARR: I don't want to say anything
 7 negative about sugar cane production. I would just like to
 8 make this a general statement that we want to continue
 9 growing agricultural crops in Central Maui rather than
 10 stating that it has to be sugar and cannot be anything else.
 11 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 12 Commissioner Shibuya.
 13 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I'm a little confused.
 14 Because I think we're talking about land-based agriculture,
 15 soil based. In my mind, agricultural means aquaculture,
 16 too. And it's not limited to just growing vegetables and
 17 fruits. It's including high-valued products, ocean
 18 products, like uni, seaweed, tako, squid, not only for our
 19 own consumption, but to bring in money so that we can have
 20 the jobs and provide for this type of industry. So that's
 21 the way I view it.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: My only concern with not supporting
 23 sugar cane production, frankly -- or pineapple for that
 24 matter -- is that all those fields that I look down and see
 25 waving fields of sugar cane would be sprouting homes instead

1 of crops.
 2 Commissioner Mardfin.
 3 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Is there some reason this
 4 was -- I think it is for long-range planning. Is there some
 5 reason this item, Policy Number 3, specified Central Maui as
 6 opposed to growing agricultural in other areas, including
 7 the ocean?

8 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

9 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I think
 10 sugar cane production, the lands in Central Maui are
 11 currently under severe threat in terms of their agricultural
 12 production, their active agricultural production. So we
 13 felt it was important to have a specific policy to that
 14 region of the island, which is in a state of threat. And
 15 whenever we can be more specific, I think that's helpful in
 16 terms of the policy language.

17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: So we could approve this --

18 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.

19 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: So we could approve this
 20 policy and then have an amendment by Commissioner Shibuya to
 21 the extent that we support bamboo production and
 22 agricultural, that sort of thing?

23 MR. SUMMERS: Absolutely.

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion.

25 Personally -- my personal perspective on this is

1 Mr. Summers, father of all county agencies.
 2 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. You know,
 3 with the creation of these divisions, I think it was clear
 4 in the GPAC's opinion and in the Staff's opinion that these
 5 areas are under-funded. And as a result, we've experienced
 6 whether it's environmental resources, degradation in those
 7 areas, agriculture, the need for diversification. If you
 8 really want to see this stuff, we're going to have to pay
 9 for it. And that's going to require an investment in
 10 personnel. Whether it's a new division or staffing in an
 11 existing division, there's going to have to be investment.

12 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?

13 Commissioner Hiranaga.

14 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I do not oppose funding for
 15 additional staffing. But I just don't see the merit in
 16 creating additional layers of bureaucracy. You've got to
 17 create new stationery, new titles. I mean, I don't see
 18 creating divisions or departments as a solution. I see
 19 funding, staffing. But just because you create a division
 20 doesn't mean you're going to help the problem. So that's my
 21 pet peeve.

22 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Mardfin.

23 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm going to support the
 24 amendment to delete. But again, first I share Commissioner
 25 Hiranaga's concern about the function is the important

1 that I think sugar cane is a viable crop that is valuable,
 2 both for scenic resources as well as for agricultural
 3 production as an export crop. And it's worthy of support.

4 Additional discussion? Ready for the question?

5 The question on the floor is to amend Policy
 6 Number 3 to say, "encourage the continued viability of
 7 agricultural crops in Central Maui."

8 All those in favor, signify by saying "aye."

9 (Round of ayes.)

10 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."

11 (Round of nays.)

12 CHAIR HEDANI: All those in favor, raise your right
 13 hand. Three.

14 Opposed, same sign. Three. Motion dies.

15 Additional discussion on Agricultural Objective
 16 Number 7.

17 Commissioner Hiranaga.

18 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Propose to delete Action
 19 Item 4.

20 CHAIR HEDANI: "Create an agricultural division
 21 within the office of Economic Development," et cetera.

22 Discussion? Is there a second?

23 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Starr.
 25 Discussion?

1 thing, not the division is the important thing. Secondly,
 2 as I did for an earlier item, I think this belongs under
 3 implementation. It doesn't belong at this stage under
 4 Economic Development. But that's my feeling.

5 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? Ready for
 6 the question?

7 All those in favor of deleting Action Item 4 under
 8 Objective 8, signify by saying "aye."

9 (Round of ayes.)

10 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."

11 (No response.)

12 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.

13 Additional amendments or discussion on Objective 7.

14 Ready for the question?

15 Commissioner Mardfin.

16 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: On Policy Number 2, it says,
 17 "Support infrastructure investments and special projects at
 18 harbors, airports and other facilities that facilitate the
 19 rapid and cost effective export island grown products." Are
 20 we talking about irradiation facilities on Maui?

21 CHAIR HEDANI: Superferry.

22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm just wondering if
 23 irradiation is necessary to get us into California?

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers, what was the intent
 25 behind Policy Number 2?

1 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you. I don't recall
2 discussions about irradiation. I think it could potentially
3 fall under that umbrella. But Warren, I don't know if you
4 remember any discussion in that area.

5 So no, it was not intended to facilitate
6 irradiation. It would prevent it.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Shibuya.

8 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: There was no irradiation
9 discussion. But there was, in terms of getting your
10 products to the market in a very economical way or, of
11 course, cost-benefit way. So these infrastructures were
12 essential to getting the products across, not only to feed
13 our folks, but to gain income.

14 CHAIR HEDANI: Is that for a fast inter-island
15 submarine service?

16 Commissioner Mardfin.

17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I would just like to ask
18 Commissioner Shibuya if he proposes to add a policy on
19 aquaculture and agriculture -- other kinds of diversified
20 agricultural.

21 CHAIR HEDANI: Go ahead, Commissioner Shibuya.

22 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: What item are you talking
23 about?

24 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Policy Number 4.

25 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: "To encourage the production

1 wherever you want it to go, and the receiver would receive
2 the container. And it's the most efficient, cost beneficial
3 way of doing it. And that mass transit would not only carry
4 these small light load cargos, but would carry people.

5 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion on Objective
6 Number 7?

7 All those in favor of Objective Number 7 and its
8 policies and actions as amended, signify by saying "aye."
9 (Round of ayes.)

10 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
11 (Nay.)

12 CHAIR HEDANI: Motion is carried.
13 Commissioner Hiranaga.

14 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: If we're going to be ending
15 at 5:00, should we be addressing other items on the agenda
16 because it obvious we're not going to finish this section.

17 CHAIR HEDANI: There's two more pages on
18 Agriculture before we go to Emerging Industries. So there's
19 one more page for Agriculture. Shall we tackle Objective
20 Number 8, then move on?

21 Commissioner Mardfin.

22 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
23 Objective 8, with the policies and actions as recommended by
24 GPAC.

25 CHAIR HEDANI: Second?

1 of aquaculture products." I just would keep it very simple.

2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Second.

3 CHAIR HEDANI: Moved and seconded to create a
4 Policy Number 4, "to encourage the production of aquaculture
5 products."

6 Mr. Summers.

7 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. My only
8 comment would be that I think it would be perhaps more
9 appropriate under Objective 8.

10 CHAIR HEDANI: Why don't we hold that thought --

11 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I'll just withdraw it.

12 CHAIR HEDANI: Any other additional discussion on
13 Objective 7?

14 Commissioner Shibuya.

15 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I was just trying to respond
16 to Commissioner Mardfin as to how you get your products to
17 market from the Kula area to Lahaina, and from Lahaina to
18 perhaps even to Haiku. One of the proposals that I had
19 was -- and a group of us had was to generate renewable
20 energy. Once you have that power, then you could have a
21 mass transit system running on this renewable power, and
22 that would be containerized. And now you don't have to have
23 manpower moving the product to the market.

24 You would move your item from your field to the
25 mass transit terminal. And from there it would go to

1 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Seconded.

2 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Sablas.
3 Discussion?

4 Commissioner Shibuya.

5 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I'd like to make a proposal
6 to add in support or encouraging of aquaculture products.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: As a policy?

8 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: As a Policy Number 3. Is
9 there a second?

10 COMMISSIONER SABLAS: Seconded.

11 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Sablas.
12 Commissioner Starr.

13 COMMISSIONER STARR: I'm looking for support for
14 bamboo in other forests. I'm wondering if that should go in
15 the same --

16 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Acceptable, too.

17 COMMISSIONER STARR: So it would be aquaculture and
18 bamboo and other forests.

19 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Acceptable.

20 COMMISSIONER STARR: What's the term for that
21 product?

22 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Forest products.

23 COMMISSIONER STARR: Forest products, okay.

24 CHAIR HEDANI: Friendly amendment to the motion
25 would read, "Encourage the development of aquaculture and

1 bamboo and other forest products," as a Policy Number 3.
 2 Discussion?
 3 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 4 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: As the amendment is
 5 written, I'd be voting against it. But I would support it
 6 if you took the word "bamboo" out.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 8 Commissioner Mardfin.
 9 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'd like to ask how you
 10 picked up that 4 percent annual rate of increase in
 11 Objective --
 12 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Wrong section.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: We have an amendment on the floor
 14 right now.
 15 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I'm sorry.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Any additional discussion on the
 17 amendment?
 18 Commissioner Starr.
 19 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yes. There are at present,
 20 two bamboo farms operating on a commercial level on Maui and
 21 doing pretty well. They're producing a number of products.
 22 Mostly construction materials, but also edible bamboo and
 23 bamboo for musical instruments and exporting some of that.
 24 It's actually generating some numbers and quite a few jobs
 25 in East Maui.

1 the previous amendment.
 2 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 3 COMMISSIONER STARR: With the maker of the motion,
 4 accept forest products as additional --
 5 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: No, he wouldn't. He intends
 6 to make a second policy after this.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Okay. We have five minutes to wrap
 8 this up, guys. Ready for the motion?
 9 All those in favor of the motion to create Policy
 10 Number 3, "to encourage the production of aquaculture
 11 products," signify by saying "aye."
 12 (Round of ayes.)
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 14 (No response.)
 15 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried.
 16 Commissioner Mardfin.
 17 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move Policy Number 4, "to
 18 encourage the production of forest products of all types."
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 20 COMMISSIONER STARR: Second.
 21 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Starr.
 22 Discussion?
 23 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 24 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I have a problem with the
 25 word "all types." It's like whatever you -- as a forest

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion? Ready for
 2 the question.
 3 All those in favor of the amendment to "encourage
 4 the production of aquaculture, bamboo and other forest
 5 products," signify by saying "aye."
 6 (Round of ayes.)
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 8 (Round of nays.)
 9 CHAIR HEDANI: Three votes nay. Motion dies.
 10 Additional discussion? Commissioner Mardfin.
 11 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I move for the adoption of
 12 the Policy 3 to "encourage production of aquacultural
 13 products," period.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: Is there a second?
 15 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: Second.
 16 CHAIR HEDANI: Seconded by Commissioner Shibuya.
 17 Discussion?
 18 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 19 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I said I would have
 20 supported the previous amendment if the word "bamboo" had
 21 been taken out, and bamboo is a forest product. My question
 22 is not all bamboo is desirable. So I don't -- when you say
 23 "bamboo," it's like all types of bamboo.
 24 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 25 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: That was my objection to

1 product, you can grow it whether it's invasive or not.
 2 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: I concur. I will take out
 3 all types. "Support the production of forest products."
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Acceptor of the second, the motion
 5 to agree, "encourage the production of forest products."
 6 All in favor, signify saying "aye."
 7 (Round of ayes.)
 8 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 9 (No response.)
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Motion carried. Item Number 8,
 11 Objective Number 8.
 12 Commissioner Mardfin.
 13 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Back to my question. Where
 14 did you get the four percent -- production growth at four
 15 percent? Is that arbitrary?
 16 MR. SUMMERS: No, it was based on a trend
 17 extrapolation.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.
 19 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. We looked
 20 at historical growth rates and then used that to come with
 21 up the four percent.
 22 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion?
 23 Commissioner Mardfin.
 24 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Under Action Number 2,
 25 "Acquire and develop land and water for public agricultural

1 parks to provide farmers with affordable land and water to
2 grow crops."

3 Where will this come from? In particular, the
4 water?

5 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers.

6 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. We have
7 significant amounts of water that are currently going to
8 agricultural crops to all the areas of the island. As we
9 all know, the surface water is currently being deliberated
10 in the courts. So we'll get more specific guidelines in
11 terms of the amount of water that would go to agricultural.

12 I think that everybody is expecting that some
13 amount of water will go to agriculture. And the idea here
14 is to ensure that these ag parks which will probably
15 predominantly supply a local supply food for the local
16 market. That water for those will be particularly
17 important.

18 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers, so the intent of this
19 particular section or action item is for the County to
20 acquire land for agricultural parks?

21 MR. SUMMERS: It could be through a cash
22 acquisition or the acquisition of development entitlements,
23 or it could be through other means.

24 CHAIR HEDANI: But for the County to do the
25 acquisition?

1 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. It might
2 include that. The state has a pretty big role in this area.
3 So I think a lot of it would be state and county
4 collaboration. But we do have an Office of Economic
5 Development. We do have an ag coordinator in that office
6 that does some of this work.

7 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion on Objective
8 Number 8? Ready for the question?

9 All those in favor of Objective Number 8 as
10 amended, signify by saying "aye."
11 (Round of ayes.)

12 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
13 (No response.)

14 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.

15 We're going to stop at this point on Emerging
16 Industries and go back to our agenda. Item 8 on the
17 Planning Director's Report. You have five seconds.

18 DIRECTOR HUNT: What do you guys think of number
19 one?

20 CHAIR HEDANI: Discussion on different options for
21 taking testimony on development proposals.

22 DIRECTOR HUNT: So we gave you a hand-out. There's
23 three options on how we could deal with development
24 proposals. Hopefully, you read it. There's pros and cons,
25 and there's reasons behind it.

1 MR. SUMMERS: Yes.

2 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.

3 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. An example of how it
4 could be implemented would be in West Maui, where there was
5 quite a bit of land, some of it state land, ceded land that
6 was in agricultural production, is not longer in
7 agricultural, is now fallow. And there was approximately 12
8 million gallons a day of ditch water that was in
9 agricultural production, but it not any longer being
10 utilized. And most of it is either being dumped or being
11 converted for development. So that would certainly be a way
12 to do it.

13 CHAIR HEDANI: Any other discussion on Item 7?

14 Commissioner Mardfin. I'm sorry. Objective 8.

15 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Action 5 says, "Work with
16 educational institutions and appropriate agencies to provide
17 education and training for farm owners and entrepreneurs."
18 Doesn't the UH Agricultural Extension service already do
19 this?

20 CHAIR HEDANI: It exists.

21 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Is there -- is it
22 insufficient? Or I'm wondering where this one -- came from.

23 CHAIR HEDANI: This could mean County funding or
24 support for those kinds of efforts, I guess.

25 Mr. Summers.

1 The GPAC last time actually went with kind of an
2 option b, where they had a special meeting or several
3 special meetings, they gave developers extra time. And in
4 exchange for that, they asked the developers not to come
5 forward and pepper them every meeting with a development
6 proposal. For the most part, the developers abided by that.
7 Several did not. A handful did not. And so there was some,
8 "Well, is it fair? These few developers didn't abide by
9 it." On the other hand, it did seem to save a lot of time.
10 So that's option 2.

11 Option one is what we're doing right now. Anyone
12 has three minutes, and they can go to the microphone.

13 Option three would just be more of a shred or
14 affair, and it would be kind of a more intensive day.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: What's the Director's
16 Recommendation?

17 DIRECTOR HUNT: We've got -- we don't really have
18 one. If you manage your testimony well, you could get away
19 with option one. You could also make it clear to the
20 developers that you don't want to hear from them every
21 meeting. If they want to come forward and give their three
22 minutes -- legally, they can come forward any meeting. But
23 you can make it clear you're not happy. Don't ask one
24 question. You can ignore them. Read the paper, whatever.
25 So you can kind of enforce it that way. That's the most

1 efficient.

2 CHAIR HEDANI: What section is this, Jeff?

3 DIRECTOR HUNT: This would be public testimony.

4 CHAIR HEDANI: Public testimony for what section?

5 DIRECTOR HUNT: Any section. The concern is that
6 the developers could come forward. And especially, once you
7 start getting into the land use sections, or when you go out
8 to the regional areas.

9 This is what happened with GPAC. Once they went to
10 the regional meetings, the developers in those regions used
11 it as an opportunity to petition and pitch their project.
12 And they lined up supporters and had their supporters'
13 written testimony, that they then read that into the record.
14 And it caused a lot of concern.

15 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioners.
16 Commissioner Starr.

17 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. I'd like to ask the
18 feasibility of option three. It sounds like a good idea. I
19 don't know if the resources are readily available to do it.
20 But I do think that might be a good forum to do those
21 presentations. So could we have a comment from perhaps
22 Mr. Summers or from the Director.

23 DIRECTOR HUNT: Well, I'll give a couple brief
24 comments. Then, John, go ahead. The biggest concern with
25 that is the first bullet item under disadvantages. It would

1 you think that under the advantages or -- the fifth one,
2 "should cut down on developer testimony at regular
3 meetings."

4 CHAIR HEDANI: Director Hunt.

5 DIRECTOR HUNT: I think there would have to be some
6 sort of agreement. And it's just a gentlemen's agreement,
7 that in exchange for this Saturday, you won't come forward
8 to the mic. And again, we had that agreement last time.
9 And some developers chose to ignore it. I mean, there's
10 nothing you can do about it. The First Amendment gives them
11 that right.

12 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion.

13 COMMISSIONER STARR: I think my preference is
14 towards option two, which does create a specific territory
15 where there is a good opportunity to present each project
16 and showcase it, and it's less humbug for the long-rangers.

17 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Shibuya.

18 COMMISSIONER SHIBUYA: I'm with Commissioner Starr
19 in this respect in option two. The special meeting would
20 have special conditions and you have rules. And you can
21 state it so that you have each developer presenting it for
22 ten minutes or so, not to be repeated by another individual
23 or continued by another individual. You just have
24 exclusively, ten minutes or 15 minutes, whichever it is,
25 handouts, and that you are not taking -- or you may take

1 require a significant amount of Staff time. Staff really
2 expended a lot of time and effort during the GPAC. And I
3 think some of us are still kind of recovering from.
4 Perhaps, if it's one day, that's fine. We don't want to
5 start getting the camels nose under the tents, and you guys
6 go, "well, another Saturday" and "why not another Saturday."

7 John, you want to --

8 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you. That is our major concern
9 with option three. There's a big upside, but it's a lot of
10 Staff time required to set it up.

11 I don't know that we have to have a decision at
12 this meeting. The members can chew on this, and we could
13 discuss it more at the meeting in Hana. But if we do move
14 forward with option two and option three, we would want
15 guidance by the Hana meeting. We can start setting that up
16 logistically.

17 If we were extremely efficient with the testimony,
18 option one would be the path of least resistance. But it would
19 just require a significant amount of discipline on all of
20 our parts. And there is some uncertainty that we could just
21 get inundated and start to lose meetings due to public
22 testimony.

23 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional comments?
24 Commissioner Mardfin.

25 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: On number three, what makes

1 public testimony after this or you may limit your public
2 testimony to only three minutes, and that sort of thing.
3 With this special meeting, these special rules must be
4 adhered to.

5 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
6 Commissioner Hiranaga.

7 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: When you say a developer,
8 that means a developer for a specific project. So you're
9 not saying that A&B, you've got ten minutes to talk about
10 your ten projects?

11 DIRECTOR HUNT: They were allotted ten minutes
12 each, as a understand it.

13 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Per project?

14 DIRECTOR HUNT: Yeah, per project.

15 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Also, I'd like, if we
16 could, if we're going over certain districts, that the
17 developers talk about that district. Say we won't hear all
18 of them all on one day. You know, talking about Lahaina
19 Kihei, Upcountry. If we can organize it so we're reviewing
20 the boundary growth map for Haiku area only. The Haiku
21 developers talk about it versus covering the whole island.

22 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers. You're squinting at
23 me.

24 MR. SUMMERS: I just wonder whether -- I think the
25 idea is wonderful. I'm just wondering if we have a legal


1 basis for requiring it. We can encourage it. And like Jeff
 2 said, we found that most of the developers are pretty
 3 cooperative.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Hiranaga.
 5 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I would encourage them to
 6 cooperate.
 7 CHAIR HEDANI: Personally, my preference would be
 8 for option number two. I mean, if you want the items in the
 9 plan to become a reality, the best way to work on it is to
 10 work with the people that can make it happen, in certain
 11 respects. And giving them 10 or 15 minutes for each project
 12 is not unreasonable, from my perspective.
 13 Commissioner Starr.
 14 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. I move that we
 15 undertake option two, and that the Department come back to
 16 us with more details on how they recommend organizing it at
 17 a later date.
 18 CHAIR HEDANI: Mr. Summers, do you second?
 19 Seconded by Commissioner Sablas.
 20 Mr. Summers, comments.
 21 MR. SUMMERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair. We would like
 22 to do a little more research on option two. If we're not
 23 going to meet it in one meeting, if we're going to require
 24 or need two to three meetings to take in all the testimony,
 25 then option three might be easier under that scenario.

1 All those in favor of the motion, signify by saying
 2 "aye."
 3 (Round of ayes.)
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: Opposed, "nay."
 5 (No response.)
 6 CHAIR HEDANI: Carried. Thank you.
 7 Director.
 8 DIRECTOR HUNT: Next item is the Maui Island Plan
 9 schedule. And a couple things. Nice job today in getting
 10 caught up. A little slow in the starting blocks. But
 11 nonetheless, according to my schedule, you're almost caught
 12 up here. Almost halfway through Economic Development.
 13 So a little reminder about the next meeting. It is
 14 on June 2nd. That's a site visit. It's out in Hana.
 15 You'll be getting an agenda, I believe. I'm getting an
 16 affirmative head nod. So we do need to coordinate that and
 17 be cognizant of the Sunshine Laws, even though it's a site
 18 visit.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Question on the general public on
 20 where the location is on the site visit. I assume it's
 21 going to be at Helene Hall?
 22 DIRECTOR HUNT: Site visit? No, the site visit is
 23 going to be in a van driving.
 24 MR. SUMMERS: That's correct. But we'll be meeting
 25 at Helene Hall.

1 So I think it would be helpful for my staff to do a
 2 little more research on this after getting your input and to
 3 have a decision made on Hana.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: My preference would be one meeting,
 5 when, pau.
 6 Director.
 7 DIRECTOR HUNT: And some of the input we'd like is
 8 what day that meeting would be. Would you be available mid
 9 week, or would it have to be on a Saturday?
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Saturdays are my fishing day.
 11 DIRECTOR HUNT: Saturdays are hard on Staff. Just
 12 to let you know, that's our least preference.
 13 CHAIR HEDANI: Commissioner Starr.
 14 COMMISSIONER STARR: Yeah. Why don't we have the
 15 Department come back to us with what they prefer, and we can
 16 discuss it.
 17 CHAIR HEDANI: To be determined.
 18 COMMISSIONER MARDFIN: Anything but a Tuesday.
 19 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 20 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 21 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: Looking at your schedule
 22 here, you've got four meetings for Directed Growth Mapping.
 23 So couldn't you incorporate their presentations in those
 24 four meetings? Try to. You don't need to commit to it.
 25 CHAIR HEDANI: Think about it, John.

1 CHAIR HEDANI: Right. But it's open to the public
 2 as far as the site visit also.
 3 MR. SUMMERS: 10:00.
 4 CHAIR HEDANI: 10:00. Any other items of
 5 discussion?
 6 Commissioner Hiranaga.
 7 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: I would like to get these
 8 bullet points before the presentation versus after the
 9 presentation.
 10 CHAIR HEDANI: Staff will note that.
 11 COMMISSIONER HIRANAGA: And also, the revised
 12 matrix. If we could receive that before the meeting versus
 13 at the meeting. Because I do read ahead, believe it or not.
 14 CHAIR HEDANI: Additional discussion?
 15 Okay. The only other comment that I would have is
 16 I'm getting inundated by stuff out of sequence, so that my
 17 packet that I receive for the next meeting doesn't
 18 necessarily contain everything. And people are handing me
 19 things. And I frequently take everything and toss it into
 20 the recycle bin. So if we can somehow control how we
 21 receive information so it's there when we actually have the
 22 meeting, I'd appreciate that.
 23 And with that, our next meeting for the General
 24 Plan is June 2nd, with a site visit at 10:00 to 12 noon, and
 25 meeting from 1:30 to 8:00 p.m., at Helene Hall in Hana,

1 Maui.
 2 And if there are no other comments, with the good
 3 of the order, we are adjourned. Thank you.
 4 (Meeting concluded at 5:11 p.m.)
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
 10
 11
 12
 13
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

1 CERTIFICATE
 2
 3 County of Maui)
 4) ss.
 5 State of Hawaii)
 6
 7
 8
 9 I, CAMMIE GILLETT, a Certified Shorthand Reporter
 10 in and for the State of Hawaii, do hereby certify that the
 11 foregoing pages comprise a full, true and correct transcript
 12 of the proceedings had in connection with the above-entitled
 13 meeting.
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19 Dated this 22nd day of June 2009.
 20
 21
 22
 23 
 24 CAMMIE GILLETT, RPR, CSR No. 438
 25

