

SALARY COMMISSION  
MINUTES  
KALANA O MAUI, 9<sup>th</sup> FLOOR MAYOR'S LOUNGE  
FRIDAY, APRIL 8, 2005

Present:

Douglas Levin, Vice-Chair

Janet Tomita

Jason Williams

Curtis Franks

Frederick Rohlfing

Staff: Traci Fujita Villarosa, First Deputy  
Corporation Counsel

Lynn Krieg, Director, Department of Personnel  
Services

David DeLeon, Executive Assistant

Momi DeMello, Secretary to the Boards  
And Commissions

Absent:

Andrew Herrera

Scott Matsuura, Chair

Anthony Lemmo

Mike Westfall

Others:

Civil Service Commission Members:

Gene Moore

Dave Hunkins

Carol Summers

J.D. Kim, Corporation Counsel

## **I. Call to Order**

Vice Chair Levin was not feeling well and had very little voice and therefore the Commission voted Commissioner Williams as acting Chair.

Chair Williams called the meeting to order at 8:40 a.m. and welcomed new Commission Member Frederick Rohlfing.

## **II. Public Testimony**

### **a) Carol Summers, Civil Service Commission**

Ms. Summers reviewed the Civil Service Commission's report of 2/2/2005 and reiterated on a few points as follows:

The Civil Service Commission recommended that the salary level of the Director and Deputy Director of Personnel Services be moved from Level I to Level III based on the following:

1. To be commensurate with the breath and scope and duty of the responsibilities of their positions
2. That the Salary Commission review the current pay structure of the executive compensation plan
3. To look at adopting Administrative Rules to provide for a systematic review of the executive management compensation plan

Ms. Summer distributed a report that outlined specific criteria for establishing a compensation system

(copy attached) and advised the Commission that she will be open to working with an ad hoc Committee.

**b) Gene Moore, Deputy Chair of the Civil Service Commission**

Mr. Moore handed out copies of an organizational chart (copy attached) and suggested that when the Commission is looking at salary reviews it should be about the position and not the individual in the position. Mr. Moore went on to explain that they are trying to look at establishing a compensation system as laying the foundation so it's easy to establish compensations every year. Mr. Moore suggested that the Commission take a look at what's going on with the position, measure the positions and make sure the responsibilities are still significant for that position to be in that salary range.

Chair Williams clarified that there are no job descriptions to base the salary ranges on. The Salary Commission then informed the Civil Service Commission that the Salary Commission does set the salaries of the Directors, Deputy Directors and Council members based on the Commission's set criteria.

Ms. Summer asked how the Commission set the levels that they are using now. Commissioner Tomita informed the members of the Civil Service Commission that those levels were set with the past Commission and not with this current Commission. Ms. Summer asked if these levels could be changed and she was told that it was the intent of the Commission to move away from the levels but have not done so yet.

Commissioner Levin explained to the Civil Service Commission that this Commission used the salary level structure because it was already in place and they needed to do a quick fix of salary inversion. The goal of the Commission is to now create a structure that the members all believe in and use it to support future pay increases. Meanwhile the Commission is thinking about staying with the historical structure of salary levels until it can work out all the details for the new structure.

**c) Dave Hunkins, Civil Service Commission**

Mr. Hunkins expressed his concerns about the changes in the responsibilities of the Personnel Department and because of that the Personnel Director is misplaced and he was hoping to bring that inequity to the attention of the Commission to correct it.

Commissioner Levin thanked the members of the Civil Service Commission for sharing their knowledge and encouraged the Civil Service Commission to come back.

Chair Williams thank the members of the Civil Service Commission for coming and providing the Commission with some really good information.

### **III Approval of Minutes**

First Deputy Villarosa stated that the Commission did not have quorum and so they cannot approve the minutes, there were only four Commission members present that were at the meeting of the minutes.

Chair Williams deferred the March 11, 2005 Minutes to the next meeting.

### **IV. Unfinished Business**

1. Introduce new Commission Members and provide Orientation Session (conducted by Corporation Counsel)

First Deputy Villarosa conducted a brief orientation and covered the following topics; Maui County Charter, Commission Duties, Sunshine Law, Administrative Procedures and Rules, Robert's Rules of Order and Code of Ethics.

2. Received input on Executive Management Compensation Plan form Civil Service Commission Members.

Chair Williams explained that this issue was addressed in the Public Testimony portion of the meeting.

3. Discuss Salary Inversion issue (receive report from Personnel Director)

Ms. Krieg informed the Commission that she had submitted a report at the March 10, 2005 meeting. Within this report, the Commission was provided with an updated inversion report and Ms. Krieg proceeded to read the report and reiterated on certain points for clarity.

In the course of the conversation on inversion, First Deputy Villarosa informed the Commission that there is inversion, that is, line staff being paid more than their supervisor in her department (Corporation Counsel) as well and that the department of the Prosecuting Attorney is probably having the same inversion.

Commissioner Levin asked the Commission if they would entertain a motion to discuss another patch today to fix these inversion problems.

Ms. Krieg interjected to explain that the Department of Personnel is currently looking at another pay increase for the Excluded Managerial Compensation Plan effective July. The amount of the increase is unknown at this time because it depends on what the outcome of the interest arbitration decision is for HGEA.

Commissioner Levin suggested that being that the Commission now knows that EMCP raises come traditionally in January and July perhaps the commission can use the meetings prior to the scheduled raises to do a catch up to resolve the inversion issue.

Commissioner Tomita asked, what will happen to the departments that doesn't have salary inversion and should the Commission increase their pay as well. Commissioner Tomita stated that's the reason why catch up is not a good thing.

Commissioner Levin clarified that he is not looking to fix the problem now, but he would like the Commission to have discussions to consider fixing the problem in May and June. Chair Williams expressed that he thought this was a good idea, but also that Commissioner Franks made a good point in saying that salary inversion will never end and that it will always be there. Chair Williams stated that even if the Commission fixes salary inversion based upon the June first meeting someone's hire date could come along and put them above that rate. Commissioner Levin's response was to make the pay increases so much higher than where it's at right now that it would be irrelevant.

Commissioner Levin stated that he would like to make a motion to raise the Personnel Director and Deputy to Level III or even entertain a move to raise them to Level II with a salary that could be made commensurate at a time when we consider the other raises. Commissioner Levin made a motion to propose a raise for the Department of Personnel Director and Deputy Director from Level I to Level III. Commissioner Levin would like to not considering a salary raise at this time but to make the move in Levels so that when the Commission considers the salary raises for the future the Commission will treat the Department of Personnel Director and Deputy Director as a Level III. There was no second from the Commission.

Commissioner Levin then proposed a raise from Level I to Level II and Chair Williams asked if he could second the motion. Commissioner Rohlfing asked what does this mean in money. Ms. Krieg distributed copies of a chart that showed the different levels of pay. Ms Krieg explained that the written figures on the right are the current figures. First Deputy Villarosa stated that Commissioner Williams could second because he isn't technically the Chair but it will still require all five votes to pass.

Chair Williams asked for a vote on the floor but Commissioner Franks asked for discussion. His suggestion was to look at everything at one time, make the changes and move forward. Commissioner Levin stated that he had mentioned to the Civil Service Commission that every now and then the Commission reserves the right as a Board to provide a patch when there is a clear inequity. Commissioner Levin went on to say that he thought the Commission should make the move for the Department of Personnel Services from Level 1 to Level 2 now so that when the issue of raises are addressed again they will already be on Level 2. Commissioner Franks expressed that the Commission should wait and address all of departments at one time. Commissioner Levin explained that it's not going to give them a raise; it's just going to move them to the next level.

First Deputy Villarosa stated that it will give them a raise because as soon as the Commission vote to move the Director and Deputy Director to the next level it also moves them to the next salary range because the salaries are attached to these levels. Commissioner Levin stated that he was not asking for a raise today, just a change in levels. First Deputy Villarosa suggested that if the Commission is not looking at doing a salary increase until a later time then they should wait and do it all at once. Based on the facts stated above and that the votes didn't carry, Commissioner Levin agreed to let the motion drop.

Chair Williams asked if the Commission had any further discussion and there was none.

#### **V. Set Agenda for Next Meeting**

- Revised schedule of salaries from the Director of Personnel Services for discussion by the Commission

- Orientation for Mr. Herrera
- Discuss time line report by subcommittee – discuss a plan of action
- Draft of a Welcoming Packet for new members by Commissioner Levin

The next meeting is scheduled for May 13<sup>th</sup>, 8:30 a.m. in the Mayor's Lounge.

**VI. Announcements**

Ms. Krieg asked if the Commission would like to take up the offer of the Civil Service Commission to come back and help the Commission with some of the details of establishing pay increases. Chair Williams suggested that the Commission be better prepared for the next visit of the Civil Service Commission and possibly prepared some specific questions prior to inviting them back. The Commission will have the Civil Service Commission come back at a later date.

**VII. Adjournment: 10:00 a.m.**

Respectfully submitted,

---

C. Momi DeMello  
Boards and Commissions Secretary