

**CULTURAL RESOURCES COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
MARCH 1, 2012**

** All documents, including written testimony, that was submitted for or at this meeting are filed in the minutes file and are available for public viewing at the Maui County Department of Planning, 250 S. High St., Wailuku, Maui, Hawai'i. ***

A. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Cultural Resources Commission (Commission) was called to order by Commission Member, Erik Fredericksen, at approximately 10:08 a.m., Thursday, March 1, 2012, in the Planning Department Conference Room, first floor, Kalana Pakui Building, 250 South High Street, Wailuku, Island of Maui.

A quorum of the Commission was present (see Record of Attendance).

Chair Erik Fredericksen: I'd like to call the 1st of March, 2012, meeting of the Maui County Cultural Resources Commission to order. Stanley?

B. RESOLUTION FOR OUTGOING MEMBER ERIK FREDERICKSEN

Mr. Stanley Solamillo: Aloha, Commissioners. Our first item business is a Resolution for outgoing Member and Chair, Erik Fredericksen, a Resolution of the Cultural Resources Commission:

WHEREAS, Erik M. Fredericksen has served the County of Maui since July 2007 as a member of the Cultural Resources Commission; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Fredericksen has served as the Maui County Cultural Resources Commission's Vice-Chairperson from April 2008 to March 2009; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Fredericksen has served as the Maui County Cultural Resources Commission's Chairperson from April 2009 to March 2012; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Fredericksen has served with distinction and has performed his duties in the highest professional manner with the Cultural Resources Commission; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Fredericksen's term of office expires on March 31, 2012; now therefore

BE IT RESOLVED that the Maui County Cultural Resources Commission hereby commends Mr. Fredericksen for his dedication and untiring public service to the people of Maui County; and

FURTHERMORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Cultural Resources Commission expresses their sincere appreciation for Mr. Fredericksen's services and extends their best wishes in his future endeavors; and

FURTHERMORE, BE IT RESOLVED that copies of this Resolution be transmitted to the Honorable Alan M. Arakawa, Mayor of the County of Maui; and the Honorable Danny Mateo, Council Chair of the Maui County Council.

Chair Fredericksen: Well, thank you, Stanley. And now that it is -- that we are in the meeting, I'm just going to kind of reiterate what I said earlier. It's been a genuine pleasure to have been able to work with you folks and gotten to know you, and I am very proud of the Commission, and I'm very proud to have been able to have gotten to know you folks. And I -- everyone that's on the Commission is genuinely concerned about cultural resources, and I -- I've grown up here and it's been a focus of much of my life and it's very, I don't know if "gratifying" is the right term, but it's very rewarding, I guess, to be able to be on a commission and be with others from our community who also have a passion for our home. And I wish you folks the very, very best of luck as you continue on with all the important work. Sometimes it's frustrating. Sometimes we feel like our wheels are spinning. But that's part of government. But I just -- it's just been a blast, sometimes it's been a little hair-pulling, but never because of anyone on the Commission. It's just been -- you know how it is. Sometimes it's just frustrating. But that's okay. But I -- it's just been very good and I thank you all. And thank you for being volunteers. Thank you very much. And thank you to Stanley. Sorry, I'm not trying to slight. I just am a bit emotional right now. And to Suzie, and to the Planning Department, Corp. Counsel, all those involved on the paid side of the equation, because that's an important part of the whole picture. Thank you all.

Mr. Ray Hutaff: I'd like to kinda add to the Resolution that my time here on the Cultural Resources Commission has been enhanced by Erik being the Chair, and if I had to put it into an English word, "awesome" would not be big enough as far as a word as a job because I can only top it by a Hawaiian word, which is "maika'i."

Chair Fredericksen: Okay, Stanley?

Mr. Solamillo read the following item description into the record:

C. ADVISORY REVIEW

- 1. MR. KEPĀ MALY, on behalf of LĀNA'I CULTURE & HERITAGE CENTER, requesting comments on Repairs to Ka Lanakila o Ka Malamalama Church, located on the Old Maunalei Sugar Company Grounds, Lāna'i, TMK (2) 3-4-009:002, Lana'i. The CRC may provide comments and recommendations. Public testimony will be accepted. (S. Solamillo)**

Mr. Solamillo: I'm going to preface this, Kepa Maly is a former Commissioner, and he's been working on Lana`i history for a very long time, and it's unfortunate that he doesn't do this entire presentation because he knows so much more than I do. This particular building was built in 1903 and it stands in an area which is probably one of the most rich areas on the island of Lana`i, and there are very few places that I go today where I actually go wow, but this is actually one of those places. And the stewardship that his organization, LCHC, has undertaken for the last five years has been something that those of us who work with NGOs and preservation really want everybody to be and, unfortunately, it's real challenge to get organizations to get to this point and Executive Director, Kepa Maly, has achieved that with his board and with a group of very dedicated volunteers, including one of our Commissioners, Warren Osako. So I cannot tell you how important the work that this organization has been doing and, specifically, the work on this church is. This came about because in the rush to do the work, the organization went to SHPD and got SHPD's approval but forgot to file for the permit with Maui County, so that's why we're going through this process. It is an ATF, or after-the-fact, permit because work is in progress today.

These are some of our earliest maps of Lana`i, which were government maps prepared in 1878. Keomoku Village is located in the southwest quadrant, between two fishponds, and Kahalepalaoa Landing is located just below it. There was a Mormon settlement and, unfortunately, I forget the dates - I can't read them too well -- '53 -- 1853 through 1864, which was in the uplands, and William Gibson came to join that colony but ended up acquiring all the land. So the Mormon community dispersed and left the island, and he ended up acquiring most of it. He had a daughter named Talula, and she married a Frank Hayselden, and they ran a sheep ranch, some say to the deleterious effects on the island. And towards to the end of the century, they became hard-pressed to hold the note on the land that they had acquired.

In 1877, both the landing as well as Keomoku Village were shown but the total island population was at that time 175 residents.

Frank and Talula Hayselden organized the Maunalei Sugar Company Limited in 1898, and then they incorporated in 1899. It was one of four sugar companies formed in Maui County amid a frenzy of speculative ventures after annexation in 1898. So that includes American Sugar on Molokai and two sugar companies here on Maui that were eventually absorbed by HC&S. They were capitalized at one million dollars from Euro American and Chinese investors in Honolulu. They simply went to Honolulu; they got the best guys to do the deal who were in real estate; and that was Gear & Lansing, and they got an attorney named Payne, and another attorney to sell stock, and that's what they did. So they had lots of stock sales. The Palawai Valley and Upland Development Company, which is also known by the name of Palawai Development Company, was formed by the Honolulu firm of Gear & Lansing, who also acted as Maunalei Sugar Company sugar agents.

Labor contractors were brought in, and they brought in a total of 485 workers; they included Imperial Immigration Company, which brought in 75; Tokio Immigration Company, which brought in 100; another one -- another company named Japan Immigration Company, and several unidentified labor contractors, who brought in a total of 310 workers. They hired William Stoddard, who was the former chief engineer from HC&S, as the mill manager, and they built all the infrastructure that was necessary, including pumps for water, because water was thought to be an issue on the coast of Lana`i, and they built the railroad, which I believe is over two miles at length, it was a 24-inch narrow gauge line; they bought a Baldwin 04-2T locomotive named "Waiale" from HC&S and it was operated by an all Chinese crew and they brought them to Lana`i as well. Mill construction was supervised by J.D. McLeod. The mill machinery and pumps was supplied by Risdon Iron Works of San Francisco. And Risdon Iron Works, at some point, decided that it wanted payment and started a whole chain of events that ended closing this sugar operation.

Kahalepalaoa Landing was improved with a new addition and a wharf shed by J. Onderkirk. Keomoku Village was built in three months. It was expanded from a small group of dwellings, which we saw in the 1877 map by MSCo carpenters to number 50 buildings. There was a rush of activity and, unfortunately, bankruptcy loomed and occurred in 1901. In attempts to keep the company solvent, they let three-quarters of the workforce go, and they kept reducing the workforce until they barely had enough workers to keep the cane irrigated. They did get a cane crop. They tried to get Pioneer Mill to grind it for them. Pioneer Mill refused. And, finally, Olowalu Sugar Company ended up grinding their cane and commenting that it didn't have too much sugar content.

The red arrows: first one is the mill; second one is the railroad; third one is the landing. Structures that were built include the one that we're speaking of today, which was built in 1903. Charles Gay, who ended up getting the island out of the bankruptcy, who built his church in 1904, and an earlier church, which is the old missionary church, which dates to 1837.

Chair Fredericksen: Hey, Stanley, I've got a question. At its peak, what amount of acreage are we looking at?

Mr. Solamillo: The peak was 200 acres in cane.

Chair Fredericksen: Two-hundred?

Mr. Solamillo: Yeah. So it was small.

Chair Fredericksen: Yeah. Okay, thank you.

Mr. Solamillo: There are very few photographs of Keomoku Village, unfortunately, and we haven't been able to locate the bankruptcy records because if we could, we feel we would get, you know, a layout of the town --

Chair Fredericksen: Yeah.

Mr. Solamillo: Because the map that we just showed you was a memory map, which was done by one of the Hawaiian residents, who became a reverend at this particular church, and was there at 11 -- at the age of 11 when the whole operation shutdown. So the few images that we do have are taken in 1921, by Kenneth Emory, and the other thing that we should all remember is that I think the hotel was dismantled, and it was shipped to Lahaina, and that became the Pioneer Inn. And if you look very carefully at the right-hand of this photograph, you've got the two-room dwelling that I've talked to this Commission numerous times about, and that is the earliest production house in the Hawaiian Islands for workers; it's the two ...(inaudible)...

This was the manager's house, and it became Charles Gay's -- or Charlie Gay's beach house. And then by 1911, I believe, or 1912, excuse me, it becomes a school. And the photograph in the upper left-hand side of the slide shows the students that were attending school. In 1921, and I had always seen that photograph and really loved it, but I never knew where it was taken, and so it's on the front steps of the bottom floor plan. So that's pretty incredible that we would actually find a floor plan. These come from the Department of Public Instruction Records, which Kepa Maly located in 2011.

Today, several things have happened. If you drive down the road to get from Lana`i City to the coast, and you take the coastal road, you can't see the coast anymore because of the tree growth, and the other thing is that the coastline has actually extended because of siltation, so where the original coast was, it's almost 300 feet to the coastline today. So that's the amount of siltation which has occurred in a hundred-year's time. So it's very enclosed. There's no open feeling when you actually drive down this coastal road. And, yes, it's unpaved like the old days.

These are the remnants of the sugar mill - chimney; foundation walls; various kinds of building and construction techniques, whether its ...(inaudible)... concrete or stone with rubble and concrete fill, or just laid stone; walls, which were coarse, and you get these wonderful things that are just there, and this was a launch. This was a boat left there probably in 1912 or so. And that's where the original coast was, and as Kepa just said, it's 300 feet to the coast today, so they're sitting in the middle of a forest. And that's the boat engine. That's the boat in 1921. And it was the launch that would take you from the landing to Lahaina.

This is the Baldwin Locomotive. It was purchased from HC&S, Waiale. And it almost appears like the crew just walked away, and said the heck with this, and it laid there until

the ties that supported the railroad tracks collapsed and that's why the tender is in an oblique angle. But that thing was built in 1883 and it is still on Lana`i. It's actual picture of it on the lower left-hand side. The actual locomotive type is above it from a Baldwin Locomotive Works manual. We're trying to find the cut-sheet for it because every locomotive that came out of Baldwin Locomotive Works actually has a photograph taken of it when it leaves the production line, so we're still looking. One of the places of all places is back in Dallas at ...(inaudible)... museum, which is supposed to be looking for this for us as well.

Chair Fredericksen: Stanley, did you say the name was "Waiale" Engine?

Mr. Solamillo: Yep. Oh, "Waiahole." I'm sorry.

Chair Fredericksen: Thank you.

Mr. Solamillo: Seventy workers died in this frenzy construction to get this town built, the sugar mill built, the railroad built, and all the infrastructure. Seventy.

Mr. U`u: How big the period?

Mr. Solamillo: The period is like three years. It was 1899 to 1901. In 1900, they actually start shutting ...(inaudible)... calling workforce, laying off labor, so it's almost like a two-year period.

Mr. U`u: From what?

Mr. Solamillo: From 1899.

Chair Fredericksen: How did they die?

Mr. Solamillo: We don't know. This is where the rumors start coming out. Oh, they died of plague. Because that's one of the rumors. And, unfortunately, or fortunately, what happened after they burned Chinatown, the Health Department came to Maui and they burned Kahului, they dynamited the buildings first, then put everybody in quarantine before they did that, and then burned everything left from the dynamite. Then they went to Hilo. They placed all of Maui under quarantine, so that's everywhere from Hana to Lahaina, including Wailuku. Health officials or local officials wanted actually the Chinese section in Wailuku burned down and the health officials said no. And they went on to Hilo. If there had been plague on Lana`i, they would have gone there, and they would have done the same thing that they were doing, you know, in Honolulu and Kahului. So we don't -- we haven't been able to locate exactly what the causes for deaths are, but I think we'll continue looking at it. I mean it could be anything. You could get die from a fever, die from

dysentariae's a common one. In 1935, a monument dedicated to the Japanese workers who were perished was built here.

And this is the landing. I believe if you look directly across, it's Olowalu. And we you look to the left of the slide, Lahaina would be there. And this is one of two shots that we have of the landing; the other one's rather poor so I didn't show it. This was taken in 1902 after the foreclosure had taken place and they were auctioning off all of the assets of Maunalei Sugar Company. So they, literally, came in and stripped the place.

This is Kahalepalaoa, okay. This is really a very special place that was overgrown and was cleared as part of this whole process. In fact, everything that you've been looking at was totally overgrown. You couldn't really see it. And through a program that LCHC is doing, they've been clearing these monumental ruins and actually building trails to connect them to the road and to each other. This construction dates to 1837. It's a mixture of stacked rock and, at the corner, is cut coins in coral rock. And we have someone's name, which has been carved into a coral rock, and we can't quite make it out yet.

Chair Fredericksen: Stanley, is the in-fill, is it clay and mortar composite?

Mr. Solamillo: I don't know.

Mr. Kepa Maly: ...(inaudible)...

Chair Fredericksen: So more on the mortar side? We found -- there's some interesting like real early structures in terms of, you know, post-contact where you were transitioning, and some of them have -- looks like there's -- well, there is clay mixed in with the mortar. I just was curious. This one looks a little more formal than some of the ones I'm thinking about.

Mr. Solamillo: The next time you go to Lahaina, actually go, for anyone, just go look at all the missionary buildings and see how the construction varies because, quite interesting, Hawaiians built heiau and they built structures that had corners that Americans didn't trust the Hawaiians on corners so they go and do this whole bit about building the coin, which is a European building tradition, to make sure that the corners are solidly anchored, and that was, you know, of course, you know, bias on their part. The other thing, and this is a question for the Chair, these windows, they're little slits, they look like gun ports at the Alamo, and when you walk around, the formal windows have been eroded as well as the formal entry doors, but it starts asking questions because you can look in every wall and you could see these really small openings.

Chair Fredericksen: And then what also happened is that the timber -- the timber that was used for the window frames, that of course rotted, and then they collapsed, same as the Olowalu -- the old Olowalu Church, and elsewhere. It was early churches.

Mr. Solamillo: And as far as ruins go, it's quite stunning.

Chair Fredericksen: Yeah.

Mr. Solamillo: I mean it really is. Then we have things like this Portuguese bread oven, which is again out in the middle of a forest.

Chair Fredericksen: In terms of acreage of the village, the site itself, what qualitatively would it be?

Mr. Maly: ...(inaudible)...

Chair Fredericksen: Thanks, Kepa.

Ms. Michele McLean: Excuse me, Stanley. Can you repeat that into the microphone so Suzie can get that in the minutes, or if Kepa could do that?

Chair Fredericksen: Give us your name.

Mr. Maly: Hi. Aloha. My name is Kepa Maly. I'm from the Lana'i Culture and Heritage Center. And thank you very much for your time today. And to, if I may, just -- this gentleman behind me, who's been presenting to you, is an asset that I don't know that this county recognizes the true value of, but, you know, if we seek to keep our history in our community identity, and not just homogenize like everywhere else, we need this kind of work to continue. And I'm sorry, thank you. The answer to your question, basically, Keomoku Village and Kahalepalaoa are really separated by, you know, almost four-and-a-half, five miles, and there are many things in between, so the specifics of say the Ka Lanakila project in Keomoku Village is about five acres, including the many houses that were built, other features that supported the mill and the community operations, and then back in to the actual sugar mill, which sits just about a quarter of a mile almost directly behind the wooden church feature that we're looking at today. This site, at Kahalepalaoa, stone and mortar, it was built in 1837, it is a church, school, meeting house; multi-purposes was the case in outlying communities that didn't have the benefit of the watchful eye of the Lahaina mission station, and so this served multiple purposes. And I imagine that if we took a look at the whole sort of Kahalepalaoa complex, we would see that it's about two acres from the coastal area where the wharf, the original piers and then a remade wharf that exist today, the old warehouse, the burial grounds, the Japanese, a memorial, Kahalepalaoa, and then adjoining royal patent grant lands there, known land commission awards, you know, several acres.

Chair Fredericksen: Kepa, I've got a question while you're up. The church itself, has there ever been any work done? I'm just curious. Do we know what -- if that church was built on a Hawaiian ceremonial site ...(inaudible)...

Mr. Maly: So we're talking about the Kahalepalaoa, the stone and mortar one, correct?

Chair Fredericksen: Yeah.

Mr. Maly: Yes. To the best of our knowledge, it is not built on a, as is often the case, Kahalepalaoa, the stone and mortar school, church, meeting house facility, was not built on a traditional heiau or luakini, as they often might have been the case. In fact, that name -- the name that Stanley pointed out to you at the bottom course, at the back end of the church, I believe it's Koiku, who was actually the first teacher there, and it's written a little backwards, but a very classic block printing, but all the right letters are there; it's just not quite in the right spelling sequence. I believe that it's Koiku who was the primary teacher and actually the mission station manager from -- on Lana`i, and it just so happens that that's also his royal patent grant land that he was given, that he actually -- the church facility was taken out of his larger grant parcel. And so through the records, even through the surveys, we know where the Luakini Heiau was, just a short distance down at Kahe`a, not at this point here. We have records of the surveys at that time. So there's no indication that it was a ceremonial site prior.

Chair Fredericksen: Thanks.

Mr. Maly: Well, I'm not sure if you want a little bit more story or if you want a little bit of information. Maybe just to start it off though, let me just mention that when you were talking about the actual acreage of sugar cane, we are looking at some 200-plus acres that were actually planted, but that map that Tutu Papa Daniel Kaopuiki drew, it's a sketch map, and it's also I think in the handout that you may have received from us, Tutu Papa, from memory, as Stanley said, drew this, it actually represents almost 2,000 acres of land that they cleared and that is why we see Keomoku and that whole region as we do today. They cleared, very ambitious, the whole water scheme. We actually had found a well, just an incredible resource that tells us more about the history of Ka Lanakila -- excuse me, of Keomoku and that region, and the Maunalei Sugar Company. Going back to what Stanley was saying, we see how it rose and quickly elevated. They sold stock, but you had to pay dividends on your stock to get full amounts. Chinatown burned down. And that's how the story about the plague on Lana`i. I know 70 seems like a lot of people in say a three-year period, but I actually believe that's fairly consistent with what was going on around there, as had Stanley mentioned, not only that, it wasn't only men laborers, there were women, there were birth issues. We know that the plague didn't hit Lana`i because we have records that say it was never on Lana`i from that period. But by the 1960s, the story was, and it was in the *Star-Advertiser* -- well, *The Advertiser* or *Star Bulletin* at that time, you know, what wonderful stories from Lana`i that the plague hit the people and that's why it -- why everyone died, why the plantation closed. In reality, there were several things going on. The heiau, the Luakini at Kahe`a, the Hawaiians say that it was the reason for the closure of the mill because they blasted through the base of the heiau to run the railroad line through there. The water went salty. They couldn't produce and everything collapsed.

In Chinatown, the fire occurred. They burned everything. Many of the stockholders were actually from Chinatown businesses. The money dried up. You guys are going to be amazed when you start seeing -- do visit our little community museum website 'cause we're starting to get all of this history up there. It's actually quite amazing. There was so much BS. I can see it repeating on Lana`i right now. Pardon me for the political pun. But there was just -- there was so much BS about what was going -- and later on, Vetleson, McLeod, Hayselden, they all said, you know what? This was one big scam.

Warren and I, your fellow Commissioner Warren, we've been out in the field. You can actually go mauka into lands that just you know would have never been good for sugar, and the auwai systems are put in, the sluice gates, the clearing that went on. It just -- it's an incredible story. When Stanley said he goes there and say, "wow," it touches my heart because, you know, it is wow. This place, if anyone ever comes up with a plan they think they're going to develop resort residences and stuff along the Keomoku region, from Maunalei through Kahalepalaoa like that, the burials, the traditional sites, the changes that have occurred there through the historic properties, it's going to be a nightmare. Yeah.

So, Ka Lanakila, Tutu Papa Daniel Kaopuiki was born in 1890. His wife, Hattie Kaenaokalani or Hattie Holohua Kaenaokalani Kaopuiki, they were my kahu hanai or my makua ho'okama. They were the parents that took care of me and instructed me as I was growing up on Lana`i. Tutu folks, that was their home. They were the last people to leave Keomoku. Tutu was the kahuna pule at the church there, and they were the last people in '51 to move from Keomoku Village up to Lana`i City thus abandoning what had been their home and their generational home, you know, for I don't know how many generations. The church was put to sleep. Ka Lanakila now is the name of our family's church up in town, which opened in 1955 and -- but the building is the last wooden structure of what was once the capital of Lana`i, the most important community on the island, and it is dear in the hearts of many of Lana`i's people, whether they're Hawaiian or not, doesn't matter. You know, in fact, even to this day, even as the church was leaning over ten inches on the verge of collapse, sort of demolition by neglect approach, what happened was is that people would stop there and, on one hand, and this is the thing that was painful, one hand, they would be leaving a little bit lulu, you know, cash donations at the church, which the families, certain people go down there and bring it up, they would always take it either the church at Kalokahi or Ka Lanakila just to give it back to the family. But on the other side of the coin, people were, you know, messing around with the wood of the church, they were defecating behind the church, you know, just, you know, messing stuff up.

And so, you know, for several years we spoke with the eldest kupuna, the oldest one was born in 1905, she died last year at 106. We just actually returned her ashes to Lana`i last week to her home, in the front of the house that Stanley showed you - the beach home that had the kahawai or the muliwai in front of it - we just took her ashes there last Thursday, a week ago today. The other oldest are 1913, Tutu Lei or Reverend Kuuleialoha Kaopuiki Kanipae, is now 96. We've just, last week, had the kupuna down there as well. We spoke

with them about this. Do we do this? Do we just let it go and say pau; it's done and over with? And everyone was of the heart, you know, if we can save this. And so we received a private family foundation grant so that we could actually engage young and not so young, but Lana`i residents, people involved in community stewardship, we engage them in our process. We thought we did the right thing, and I need to apologize for this, we thought we did the right thing. We went to SHPD. It's not in the SMA. It's a historic building that was on the verge of collapse. So we consulted with an architect from Honolulu and with an archaeologist from Honolulu, we went through SHPD and got authorization to take a phased approach that we had laid out for them to begin restoration so that we wouldn't lose this feature.

Tutu folks are down there now and we're actually planning, they're so excited, we're planning in late June a celebration, pule `ohana. Have the families of the old Keomoku Village, their descendants, gather with us. We're praying that Tutu Lei, who is 96, Tutu Irene, who's 95, we're praying that they're going to still be with us and be able to come down there. I don't know if some of you know Henry Aki, he lives down the road a little bit from here, but he's basically a Lana`i boy, you know, they attended the church there. They witnessed the last burials in the cemetery, which are a few hundred yards behind, not directly associated with the church project. We're hoping to have the `ohana down there and the larger Lana`i community come and celebrate and to reconnect people 'cause what we don't want is we don't want the malicious kind of, you know, hana `ino that can occur when people don't respect or don't feel attachments to a place. And so, you know, our goal is to create a place that is going to keep this community, this story alive, and from there, actually, be able to do special programs.

The trail to the sugar mill, the Maunalei Sugar Company Mill, is incredible. Do you know that most people on Lana`i didn't believe me when I said there was a sugar mill on the island? You know. It was incredible. Even though they've hunted throughout there all their lives, no one ever saw it, but Tutu folks told us about it. We found that. We knew that it was there, you know. And, as I said, it's just a quarter of a mile behind the church. And the whole millwork, Japanese stonemasons, incredible work that they did, and then, you know, the masonry or the brick and mortar like that. That old boat, we believe it's the Akamai, is immediately makai of the church, and Stanley was absolutely right. The boat was pulled out of the water. We were just talking with Aunty Lei about it again last week, when we were down there. The boat was pulled out of the water, on the edge, about 1921 or 22, and it sat there. Today, the ocean shoreline is almost 300 feet further makai. So now go back where I said 2,000 acres of land have been cleared, left barren and desolate. And then you add the impacts of goats, sheep, the period grazing cattle, then the deer were introduced in 1920. The church has been almost buried and we've had to dig out from underneath it and push dirt away just so we could get back and start redoing the floor joists and the post and pier, you know. Incredible. You see how close -- when I was a kid, when Warren was a kid - 'cause he's got a few years on me, there were four steps from the ground up to the church. This is -- that's 1970ish about, you know. You can sort of see the

steps behind the kiawe, small kiawe growth there. Beautiful coconut grove planted around it. The property is still owned by the major landowner on the island today.

Oh, sorry. Just looking at that photograph, one very important thing, and I tried to write it up briefly in our commentary. In the late '80s, there was an effort put into trying to stabilize and restore this church. Unfortunately, the windows were removed, the doors were removed, 70% of the wood in the building was taken off, a roof, ceiling, floors, you know, things were -- it was -- and so the church, and Stanley and I had to speak about this because, you know, he told me that, ultimately, it wouldn't qualify as a National Register site, I think, for nomination because so much of it had actually been redone, but still it holds a place. This is pre-the 1980s restoration. It's an important part of this community though and we felt that it was our responsibility to try and bring it back and care for it, you know. We're going to run programs, basically, with it but the kupuna want to go down and celebrate services once in a while down there, you know, and I think that that says a great deal. You wouldn't believe the wood, the floor, the people -- the company was the verge of probably having to make a decision about it because if you -- you see that floor, the top picture on the right corner there? You know, the flooring, it was dangerous to actually walk in. As I said, the church was leaning over, facing this way, so it was leaning towards Kahalepalaoa, which would be east, almost ten inches.

Mr. U'u: What's the square foot?

Mr. Maly: Forty long. Do you recall, Warren? Forty long and about twenty -- twenty-something, and I don't do math, I'm sorry.

Chair Fredericksen: At least 800 square feet, somewhere thereabouts.

Mr. Maly: I'm sorry. You've got to -- I don't do math very well. But it's -- oh, well actually, it's just about -- it's about as wide as this room and add another ten feet beyond here.

Ms. McLean: The sketch in the packets says 24 by 40.

Mr. Osako: ...(inaudible)... 24 by 40.

Mr. Maly: Okay. Yeah.

Mr. Osako: According to the plan that Charlie drew.

Mr. Maly: It's beautiful. The pews are actually up in our church in town. The bell is up at our church in town also. And --

Chair Fredericksen: When was the bell cast? Is there a date on it?

Mr. Maly: Well, the church was dedicated in 1903 - the bell was there, and so I would have to go look at the bell up in town to see if I could figure that out.

Chair Fredericksen: I've got just a little nuts and bolts questions for you, Kepa. How long does it take to get from Lana'i City down to the church - qualitatively about?

Mr. Maly: Yeah. If you take a reasonable drive, you've got 40-45 minutes. You know, that's driving respectfully.

Chair Fredericksen: For the kidneys?

Mr. Maly: That too. Yes. As Stanley mentioned, I guess, and I apologize, but this is an after-the-fact request, we have begun and, actually, the entire -- we were very fortunate with group of volunteers and of a skilled contractor who specializes in historic restoration, the bell tower is completely rebuilt. It looks just like it did. The louvered windows that were in the bell tower back, they've been taken out and thrown into the wayside in the 1980s. The entire roof has been refinished. We have wood for the ceiling. The pulpit area was pulled out of the wall and it's being stabilized to put back exactly where it was. The old sign that is "Ka Lanakila o Ka Malamalama Hoolaaia Iehova Okakopa 3" -- no. "Okakopa 4, 1903." The sign, which was in the wall was being consumed by bugs, and was just about falling apart, but we've actually pulled it off of the replacement wall that went in in the '80s and are stabilizing it and put it back up also. So the original printing will still be there.

Chair Fredericksen: Was it possible to re-utilize some of the lumber?

Mr. Maly: Yes, some of it was --

Chair Fredericksen: And the ceiling?

Mr. Maly: The ceiling was ripped out in the '80s.

Chair Fredericksen: Okay. I missed that.

Mr. Maly: Yeah. Some of the side paneling, all the, as I said, windows, it's really sad that the beautiful glass double-hung windows, you know, the doors, everything are gone.

Chair Fredericksen: And so those were just lost?

Mr. Maly: Yes. And in fact, at this time, just because of financial conditions, we're not going to be able to do anything about the windows or the doors, but what our thought was is that if we could at least stabilize this and keep it, you know, intact, that as time goes along, we may be able to actually recover some of this, you know, and go further.

Mr. U`u: So the windows are gone?

Mr. Maly: Yes.

Mr. U`u: Isn't there another structure in Lana`i, potentially, might be demolished where you guys could utilize some of that material for the church? Wasn't it brought to our attention? No?

Chair Fredericksen: That would be a question for Stanley. There was --

Mr. U`u: There was some type of building with the bank; if you guys could utilize that material. I mean we'll try save the bank too and ...(inaudible)...

Chair Fredericksen: Pau.

Mr. U`u: But no sense. Poho. Done.

Mr. Maly: No, pau. Gone already. That 1923 house. Adaptive reuse is a great idea --

Chair Federicksen: Yeah.

Mr. Maly: But not one that isn't -- not one that is implemented easily in some areas so -- One of the really -- I think one of the great things about this project, and about this incredible family that's offered us a funding base to do this, they're not from Lana`i. They have a home there now. And they fell in love with Lana`i, not the modern dream of it, but with the people, the land, the history of place, and they said, "We'll give you the money. Do this stewardship project idea - creating trails, stabilizing areas, saving places. Go ahead and restore that church building. Bring it back to a safe and serviceable part of the community. We'll give you the money for it." And what we did is we've engaged -- you know, at one point time, any of us growing up in Hawai`i remember that, particularly Lana`i, you hit summer, you go pick pineapple, right? Every one of our kids on Lana`i grew up with the opportunity to work and learn what it meant to, like my time, I don't know what Warren's time was, my time was a dollar-forty an hour for picking pineapples, so by the time summer was pau, we saved up maybe what - a couple hundred dollars, you know. And you know, hard to believe, yeah? So we -- our kids don't have opportunities to learn that if you can survive some hard work, picking pineapple, or in this case, clearing kiawe and stabilizing some areas, that you actually can accomplish anything, so what we've done is this foundation gave us the opportunity to engage 16, 17 high school students, not all at one time, but over a couple of years, to bring them back to an opportunity, sort of like an HYCC program opportunity, where they actually, for four or five weeks, work and earned more money than we did ever picking pineapple for a full summer, you know, and we've re-engaged young local people. I have crew leaders, people that are out there doing amazing work that are reconnecting with their history and their heritage, and so we've been able to

draw in -- and again, it's mixed, we have Hawaiians that are generationally descended from families of Lana`i, and we have children whose parents or grandparents or great-grandparents came to Lana`i to pick pineapple. I mean it's this great mix, you know, of people that just help us connect people and keep our community engaged in its history and a sense of responsibility that we have to it. So, you know, we've got the high school students, college, and adults, and then an incredible kupuna component with oral history and stuff going on. I think it's -- it's a model program for our community just keeping them engaged. So, mahalo nui, and I would be happy to answer any questions.

Chair Fredericksen: Oh yes. Bruce?

Mr. U`u: Three-thirty. That was my pay at Maui Pine.

Mr. Maly: Oh, wow. You lucky boy.

Mr. U`u: I had one big increase in pay also. But was that a trail to the Portuguese stove?

Mr. Maly: Yes. And if I could, I'm going to just do a little sidebar on this. It's actually, forgive me, it's not a Portuguese stove. The Portuguese component -- no, no, no. This is what everybody says. In reality, when we take a look at the actual records that we have now of who was employed from Maunalei Sugar Company, we know what the notes were, and go take a close look at the stone. It's Japanese stone mason's cut stone. And also, you'll notice, it's conical, not -- it's not the typic forno type, or even the Russian type of bread oven, it's like this, but it was still being used. Aunty Venus Gay Holt, who was born at Keomoku, 1905, died last year at 106 years old, she remembered it still being used when she was a child. By the time -- so she was born ten years before say the oldest other living Lana`i kupuna, Aunty Lei, was born in 1915. Aunty Lei has a little bit memory, but it was a community bread oven. Where that bread oven is, all of the community's houses in the plantation were spread out from there. It was the heart. And more recently, several family members, up to maybe about six or seven years ago, went back and actually fired it up again and cooked Thanksgiving dinners in it, you know, and, you know, so it still works, but I must tell you also, just in case if you hear from someone, what we did is I made a conscience decision about this, I wanted us to create some boundaries so that people would know that when you go to visit Save the Old Boat, when you go to visit the bread oven, unless you have a reason to go and touch it, I'd like you to stand back from it, appreciate it, and value it for the work of those who came before us, but it's not appropriate to take your kids and set them up, okay, stand on top the bread oven and let's take your picture, 'cause next thing you know, collapse or someone --

Chair Fredericksen: Or take pieces for souvenir or whatever it may be.

Mr. Maly: Yes. Yes. Exactly. And so what we did though is, being respectful of the families who still may want to go and get closer and intimate with it, we just put a simple

barrier, and then in front of the bread oven, if this is the ground, the barrier is about 24 - not even 24 inches, you know, but it just sets a little bit of a buffer. It's not saying kapu, keep out, but it's -- I think it's saying, you know, respect, yeah, aloha.

Mr. Hutaff: Very good.

Chair Fredericksen: Any other questions?

Ms. Chandler: Chair?

Chair Fredericksen: Rhiannon.

Ms. Chandler: Aloha, Kepa. So nice to see you. I was wondering, I know that you were moving on to Oahu, and then I see you very active in this restoration, I wanted to find out if you're the lead, you know, restoration person for this and about how long you'd say the timeline is for this project.

Mr. Maly: I, humbly, do remain sort of the lead of the program for right now. We are trying to build youth capacity on Lana`i. We need our `opio to step forward that, you know, this -- I don't have -- oh, I do have my phone on my -- this kine stuff and everything isn't all the world, right? What we need is we need people to remain connected to the `aina, to the wai, to the kai, you know. I mean sorry. One of the other things that makes that whole region so rich is that there are at least five fishponds along there. For Lana`i, that's a big deal. Moloka`i - choke fishponds, yeah, aunty? Everywhere. But on Lana`i, the nature of the land is very different, but also the importance of that community is tied from makai up to mauka, and so what we're going is we're working to re-engage young people, connect them with their history. Our time frame, my goals, of course, is I'll be long-gone, is that this is an ongoing program of stewardship. We are hoping that by the end of this year, we're actually going to have interpretive signage back in. You went on Kapiha`a Trail, Commissioner Chandler. So you went on Kapiha`a Trail with us. The kind of signage we did, it's similar to that Lahaina anodize aluminium-type, you know, but that \$1500 a pop, you know, it's expensive, but we're trying to develop so that it will actually be an interpretive asset, and I promoted it to the landowner as added value to the experience of anyone who travels on Lana`i, but the idea being is that let's keep our community engaged in their history, so this should be an ongoing program. June 23, we're expecting to have our celebration of Ka Lanakila to where we can get it. And by the end of the year, this year, we hope to have the signage up so that you can see the locomotive and get to it, you know, get to Kahalepaloa Church, the bread oven, and the loop trail that takes you past Akamai, the old boat, through there and up behind Ka Lanakila out to the old sugar mill. To me, it's all exciting stuff. It's going to just add value to everyone's experience on Lana`i.

Ms. Chandler: One more question. I was looking at your right-of-entries from Castle & Cooke and it looks like they're just giving it one year at a time. Do you feel like that

jeopardizes the project at all or, ultimately, do you know that you will be able to continue this restoration?

Mr. Maly: I live by faith. And we were successful. The company graciously gave us a renewed right-of-entry agreement to continue the work. I know that it would be very bad publicity for everybody if we weren't able to come to some sort of good agreement that would allow them, and ultimately as I said, the bottom line of this is rather than driving through a dust road overladen with kiawe that, you know, why go to Lana`i? Now we're adding some extra value. Come visit, experience a little bit of our history. People like Warren, my board president, Albert Morita, some of our younger people that are getting engaged, they're going to actually be able to be out there. I'm looking to trying to create actually opportunities to have kama`aina interpreter, naturalists, whatever you wanna call them, out there telling the story of their kupuna and, you know, on the land. So live by faith, yeah? Got to.

Ms. Chandler: `Ae. My question is, you know, would it be helpful if we had a letter that came from the Commission to Castle & Cooke to just support your project and ask that they continue or would that -- I know that the company can be extremely ...(inaudible)... however, it would be one extra thing to add pressure to, you know, continue support --

Mr. Maly: To add encouragement.

Ms. Chandler: Encouragement. Yeah.

Mr. Maly: Yes. Mahalo. It's a beautiful idea. And I believe that it's an opportunity for us to do in all of our communities. Every community has its treasures and assets and these resources, and what we've done I think on Lana`i, and I know I'm sad that I haven't seen -- been able to see most of you on Lana`i, you've been to our newer -- you came to our dedication. I mean how -- wasn't it exciting to see the community engaged. It's a professional, you know, program, but it's still, you step in, it's like you're stepping in home. Sorry, I'm picking on Warren, but Warren's family has donated such incredible things. His mother had this beautiful armoire Japanese carpenters made, you know. It was a part of the family's home and his aunty them's home at Kaumalapa`u before that, you know, you step in. And so every community has the capacity or has the resources, they need to build the capacity so they can start telling their own stories. Much of -- a lot of our collection is actually from Bishop Museum. Kenneth Emory's collections from the Munro's, the Gay's, Keliihanani, the Kaopuiki's, and other ohana. Imagine if we had collections like these in moku, in our communities where now it's not sitting someone's basement, but it's back for our community, our children are touching and being a part of and inspired by their legacy whether you Hawaiian, Filipino, Japanese, Haole, whatever, you know, it doesn't matter. It's who we are today, you know, so mahalo. A letter would probably be very nice, at least a letter of support and encouragement, but again, mahalo. I know that's up to you folks.

Mr. Hutaff: Maybe more along the lines of thank you.

Mr. Maly: Yeah.

Chair Fredericksen: Good.

Mr. Maly: See, that's why he's our kupuna in here, yeah?

Chair Fredericksen: Kepa, I've got just a backup question about the sugar company. Was that mill ever actually used to produce sugar? I don't recall ever hearing anything. When you talked about it first, my ears just went plink. But I never heard -- seen anything to indicate it was.

Mr. Maly: To the best of our knowledge, it was not used. The boilers, the last of the boilers from Risdon Iron Works that Stanley mentioned in his write-up, were actually landed at Kahalepalaoa, that wharf that was out at the end of the water there, landed there, and sat there, and then were retrieved back again. But we know that there were boilers there; some of them, the water -- they were so delusional. The water works system is just like -- they must have just been on another planet, you know. But there was incredible work done. And the reason that we don't believe that it was even ever fired up is because the remains of the smokestack now are only about 12 feet. The rest of it is gone. But there's no black. Nothing charred.

Chair Fredericksen: No anything; no stain or nothing.

Mr. Maly: No. But, interestingly, we did find some of that, it almost looks like obsidian, we figured it must have been from a locomotive.

Chair Fredericksen: Oh, the slag?

Mr. Maly: A flag.

Chair Fredericksen: A flag. Yeah.

Mr. Maly: It must have been from the locomotive 'cause the locomotive ran from there to Kahalepalaoa.

Chair Fredericksen: Yeah, they'd get a sledgehammer, break it out of the furnace area. We found it all over the place, especially HC&S land.

Mr. Maly: Sure.

Chair Fredericksen: And it does -- well, it is glass, ultimately.

Mr. Maly: Yeah. Yeah.

Chair Fredericksen: But it's very similar to obsidian.

Mr. Maly: Yeah. We were thinking - wow.

Chair Fredericksen: Yeah, wow.

Mr. Maly: One incredible magic source for --

Chair Fredericksen: The biggest in Hawai'i.

Mr. Maly: Yeah.

Chair Fredericksen: Very, very interesting. Any other questions for Kepa? Thank you for all the knowledge sharing. Bruce has got one.

Mr. U`u: Question. I understand about repairing the church, but how do you take care of that silt that's coming down?

Mr. Maly: Very good question. It's -- and it's also very difficult, and we didn't really quite finish the story about the siltation, 2,000 acres cleared in-between the 50 to 200-foot elevation for the plantation. Plantation collapses. Ungulates destroy the landscape. Kiawe is coming back in and very little scatter of anything native, sadly, anymore. But you know above the Halepalaoa section, there is - I don't know if still exists out there - but there was found in the 1990-ish period an Abutilon that was known nowhere else on earth, and beautiful 'ilima like, sort of like the ko'olua `ula, you know, the same kind heart-shape leaf, but this one unique to Lana'i and they called it "hidden petal Abutilon," "'ilima kuahiwi." Just an incredible, incredible plant. So we know that there are a few things that have survived. How are we going to deal with the siltation? Well, there really should be, and I know these words -- so many of our words in the language, in fact, Commission Hutaff and I were talking about this today, is that how many words are sometimes just over used, just sitting on the tip of our tongue, but an ahupua`a based approach of looking, how do we stabilize the mauka because no sense in taking care of the fishponds down here and the kahakai if everything's hemahema up there, right? 'Cause it's just going to continue running down. So what we had to do for the interim is, as we were pulling dirt out from underneath to try and see, 'cause the post and piers were just rotting and buried in soil, they were rotting, they were buried up to the floor boards, yeah, so pulling dirt out, we created a berm behind the church to at least divert that sheeting that occurs coming down to us, and there's one little break in the berm that allows you to get onto the trail that then takes you to the mill. That's the best that we could for right now. One, I didn't want to incur a major permitting and just, you know, we don't have the funding for it. You know, it's a

major, major job. But if we didn't do it, the church would be buried. In fact, the rains we had from December 2010, yeah, I think that the floor would have been in mud by now.

Chair Fredericksen: In terms of the restoration work, and I know you've already shared with us that the windows and the doors are not part of the equation at this point, what do you anticipate or when do you anticipate or target trying to get that part of it done anyway so it's stabilized, the structure itself, minus the doors and windows?

Mr. Maly: As far as that part of the process, how this structure's stabilized? We're almost there. The next step is going to be putting the floor back in, and the ceiling, and we're really -- we're almost there. If you have the opportunity, if the Commission has the opportunity to go to Lana'i again, I hope that you will let me know because I would love, if you could, I would love to accompany you. One, I'd love you to see our little heritage museum program, but we should go makai. Warren is an incredible guide. He knows Lana'i, and Albert Morita. These gentlemen know Lana'i like almost nobody else. Together, you folks would walk away with that wow that Stanley had, you know. It's incredible. So I believe by June, I put our guys on notice, June. I can't wait too long because our kupuna, you know, are --

Chair Fredericksen: Any other questions or comments? Well, let's go ahead and take the opportunity to see if there's any public comment. So there being no public comment, we will close that part of it, and then, Stanley?

Mr. Solamillo: I just wanted to make one comment. I've got two newspapers up. One is *Nupepa Kuokoa* and the other one is the *Evening Bulletin*. The unique thing, I had an opportunity to look at the history and do some research on the Maunalei Sugar ...(inaudible)... the unique thing is that these two newspapers cover Maunalei Sugar's development, and so you have Hawaiian language sources that you can compare with English language sources, and it's quite spectacular to be able to actually piece this history together from two sides, and that was just another layer of uniqueness about this place and, you know, the advantage of having --

Chair Fredericksen: Is the interpretation pretty similar?

Mr. Solamillo: No. They're different. I mean one is -- one is quick to, you know, this is America and we're doing it, you know. And the other one is thoughtful in saying, you know, change is coming. 'Cause in the year 1899, Kapiolani has just died; that newspaper. So -- and then we have to remember that Hayselden is royalist. A lot of people are royalist. Newman, who represents them as an attorney, is also the attorney for Queen Lili'uokalani, you know. So there was, I think, from the American side, there was probably a wish that they would fail, you know, but there's always a concern about what's happening over there, you know. There's all this fear they're going to come back and have another rebellion. Wilcox's rebellion was just, you know, recently around, you know, has just taken place.

Just a very unique time in history and having, you know, being able to use the two newspapers is pretty incredible.

Chair Fredericksen: Kepa, you wanna add something?

Mr. Maly: Stan, thank you. Again, that's why he's such a good historian and researcher. It's incredible. People have no idea. In 1899, Hayselden and a group of people were pulled into court, the information was that Lana`i was being used to store arms and ammunition, it was being brought in the Pacific Northwest to fund a rebellion, and in the courts, it was that these people had even approached Queen Lili`uokalani and said we'll help reinstall you to the throne if you give us Lana`i. Hayselden was trying to figure out what -- how they were going to keep from bankruptcy even by 1899. And it's incredible the stories about the opium runners and how they dragged people into court and Hayselden had to go and defend himself, and it even goes up to by 1906, and Hayselden then are out of the picture, basically, except for their graveyards in Palawai, and Gay is being dragged into court because -- of course he's purchased the ceded lands on Lana`i, so there are none by this time, and the big stink was is that Charles Gay was talking with Japanese investors and, of course, the white business community was just up in freakin' arms because they thought foreigners were going to buy an island; it was bad enough that Sinclair, Robinson, Gay owned Kaua`i and part of -- excuse me, Ni`ihau and part of Kaua`i, and that they were controlling Lana`i, but now they're going to sell it to Japanese. I mean the people have no idea how deep and involved, how, you know, hihia, and the intrigue of Lana`i in Hawai`i's history. You guys are going to be so excited, you know, when you see some of this. And Stanley's right, there are untapped resources that are just very incredible.

Chair Fredericksen: Thank you, Kepa.

Mr. Solamillo: Okay. So, recommendations. Recommendation is to approve the after-the-fact permit.

Chair Fredericksen: Any questions for Stanley? Any discussion on it? I just would like to say that, you know, they did the best they could with the situation that was -- you know, the termites, if they sneezed or whatever, the building would have fallen down, and doing the right thing, and just a little glitch, and get it realigned, and it's all good.

Mr. Hutaff: Yeah, I kind of agree. We probably wouldn't be having this conversation had they not taken the action that was necessary, common sense action, at the time, and within the fact that they did get permission and ...(inaudible)...

Chair Fredericksen: Well, and consulted with SHPD.

Mr. Hutaff: I think approval is automatic.

Mr. U`u: Then make it.

Chair Fredericksen: Yeah, let's go ahead and let's do a resolution on this. Make a motion?

Mr. Solamillo: Ask Corporation Counsel.

Chair Fredericksen: Yeah. Does anyone want to make a motion regarding this?

Mr. Osako: Well, I make a motion that we recommend the permit.

Chair Fredericksen: After-the-fact permit.

Mr. Osako: After-the-fact permit be approved.

Chair Fredericksen: Do we have a second?

Mr. Hutaff: Second.

There being no further discussion, the motion was put to a vote.

It has been moved by Mr. Osako, seconded by Mr. Hutaff, then unanimously

VOTED: to recommend the after-the-fact permit be approved.

Chair Fredericksen: Alright. Now, Rhiannon, do you want to make a motion about the kinda the bigger picture as it were?

Ms. Chandler: Thank you, Chair. I would like to make a motion that the Commission send a letter to Castle & Cooke, and CC Kepa Maly and the Lana`i Culture and Historical Society --

Chair Fredericksen: Heritage --

Ms. Chandler: If we could please thank both the company and the heritage center for their work to restore or taking action -- allowing action to be taken to restore this structure and the cultural history that it carries with it for that community --

Chair Fredericksen: Working together, collaborating --

Ms. Chandler: Yeah. I mean any other Commissioners, you know, have thoughts on what should go in the letter, I just think it's --

Mr. Hutaff: How about understanding the value. Thanking them for understanding the value.

Chair Fredericksen: Okay. Do we have a second?

Ms. Kanuha: I second.

There being no further discussion, the motion was put to a vote.

It has been moved by Ms. Chandler, seconded by Ms. Kanuha, then unanimously

VOTED: that the Commission send a letter to Castle & Cooke, and cc Kepa Maly, thanking both the company and the heritage center for working together, collaborating, and allowing action to be taken to restore this structure and the cultural history that it carries with it for that community, and for also understanding the value of this structure.

Chair Fredericksen: Okay, motion carried. Yeah, and I just would like to thank Kepa for coming over and talking story with us, and as always, distributing lots of very, very interesting information. And it was really nice seeing you. And best of luck on the project. Okay, Stanley, what have we got, Item D?

Mr. Solamillo: I was actually asking how much for each window and every five panel door, but anyway --

Chair Fredericksen: Bruce? Bruce has got ...(inaudible)...

Mr. U`u: The Ma`alaea Store, they have a carpenter redoing their windows there so on the way back to Lana`i, I would stop by, you know, and they was working on them last week. I passed by and talked to one of the guys. So if you can stop by and -- if you can give them dimensions, they can make them here and send them there, you know. Can't go to Honsador for that one, or Home Depot.

Chair Fredericksen: No.

D. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

1. Update on the status and initiating Section 106 Consultation for the Mokuhinia/Moku'ula Ecosystem Restoration Project

Mr. Solamillo: Okay, the item is Director's Report. The first item is an update on the status and to notify you that the USACE, or U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, has initiated Section

106 consultation for the Mokuhinia/Moku`ula ecosystem restoration project. This Commission had asked, at a previous meeting, that after arsenic sampling had taken place, that some report be made back to this Commission. The results are in. A formal report has not been completed yet. You will get a copy of the formal report. According to Athline Clark, who emailed these comments late last night, like at 11, the analytical results of the soil sampling indicated that none of the samples contained concentrations of arsenic that exceeded the Hawai`i Department of Health, or DOH, Tier 1 Environmental Action Limit, or EAL, for arsenic in soil. The highest concentration of soil arsenic at the site was found to be 14.8 milligrams for surface soil, and 16.0 milligrams for subsurface soil. The highest concentration of arsenic in the sediment samples taken from `auwai was 3.63 milligrams. These reported concentrations are within the published range of background concentrations for soil arsenic in Hawai`i. She also wanted to let the Commission know that an archaeological monitor from Cultural Surveys Hawai`i was present at all times during subsurface sampling. The archaeological monitoring report concluded that although isolated faunal material and manuports were found in the fill soil, no culturally significant resources were disturbed. The culturally significant intact soils of Moku`ula were not encountered during the soil sampling. A copy of the final arsenic site investigation report and the associated archaeological monitoring report are being finalized and will be sent to the CRC as soon as they are completed.

Under Section 106, there will be some public meetings which will take place; we don't have a final schedule yet. When we do that, the CRC will be informed. Are there any questions?

Ms. Chandler: Mahalo, Stanley. Did you say that we were going to get a report?

Mr. Solamillo: Yes.

Ms. Chandler: And will that be at the next meeting?

Mr. Solamillo: I have no idea when the USACE will produce it.

Ms. Chandler: And will they be coming back to talk to us?

Mr. Solamillo: Yes.

Ms. Chandler: Oh, thank you.

Mr. Hutaff: Before we go to that, can I ask two questions?

Mr. Solamillo: Yeah.

Mr. Hutaff: How are we doing on the permit on Moloka`i for the park ...(inaudible)... last?

Mr. Solamillo: Okay.

Mr. Hutaff: Do we know the status of that?

Mr. Solamillo: Yeah. A letter came in two days ago from DAGS, and it was directed to the NGO who had asked for permission or ask for the say in the demolition, and it is offering to give them 90 days to finalize, you know, where things are going to be. But as far as the issues of land or where the final site is going to be, there has been no information that's come my way.

Mr. Hutaff: Okay. Good. That was my second question about the buildings. But the first question is is how is the hui canoe club there had asked for permission and permits to do their -- build on the site and stuff like that. Was that ever approved? The canoe club?

Mr. Solamillo: I don't know. I'm sorry.

Mr. Hutaff: Can we find out by the next meeting?

Mr. Solamillo: I can find out.

Mr. Hutaff: Thank you.

Mr. Solamillo: Okay. I'm going to jump over to the next slide, then I'm going to go back to this slide. Okay. If any of you go by Ma`alaea, this got featured in the news this week, we've made some progress, and this Commission, you know, deserves, you know, a lot of praise for, you know, assisting it and assisting the project in getting along the way, so we've got a building that was originally built in 1910 and we have lots of additions that were made to it, and we were -- this was a challenging project for many reasons because it involved the demolition of a house, a dwelling, which the family had occupied to make room for parking so that this could actually have a new use and get approved by other departments in the county, so we're now at a point where visible change is happening, a parapet was reconstructed based upon a photograph that was finally located in the corner of a shot of a boat, there was this store, and that -- from that photograph, this reconstruction of the parapet is actually taking place. So they're hoping to be open like end of April, first of May, so, you know, that's quite a feat. It's been a lot more expensive than the applicant, you know, thought it would ever be and it's been really frustrating from a lot of standpoints, but he's nearing completion so -- this is tax credit project number two for Maui County.

Chair Fredericksen: I just would like to make a comment on this project. I know the owners personally and I -- I went to -- we used to call it "Jimmy Uno's Store" in the past, but I spend a lot of time there as a kid when Ma`alaea didn't have any slips on the side that used to face the cane fields and what is now the Maui Ocean Center, that was kiawe trees, and I remember as a kid, when we'd take the boat over to haul it out at the ramp, going

around in the harbor and putting the dingy up into the kiawe trees, climbing back in there, and then eventually getting over to the store and buying hot dogs.

Mr. Hutaff: We gotta help them out. We gotta buy some hot dogs.

Mr. Solamillo: Yeah.

Chair Fredericksen: But they've done a really neat job and, you know, just to be able to go by and look at it. When it does open, I think it'll be really neat. What a great reuse, and it's still a store and everything, but what a -- I'm so happy that it has been able to come about. I'm very proud of the owners of the property 'cause it's been a labor of love, it has been real dear, but they've done the right thing in my opinion.

Ms. Chandler: Absolutely. Also, I'd like to thank you, Stanley, because I don't think that people would know about tax credit projects if it weren't -- you're one of the only proponents of such a thing that could save some of these buildings and owners wouldn't even go this far, I think, unless they knew they were going to get something like this, so I really appreciate you perpetuating that education.

Chair Fredericksen: And I will -- I'd like to share with the Commission that the owners have shared that with me; that without Stanley's involvement, it would not -- they would have gone, oh, too much to contend with, but I mean it's been, like you said, it's been way more expensive than was anticipated but that, you know, that's how it goes, but they definitely are bringing life back. I mean it's a landmark, a community landmark. It's very neat. And, Stanley, your efforts have been critical in them being able to get so they're getting close to being done.

Mr. Solamillo: And if you think it's solid wood --

Chair Fredericksen: You can put your finger through it.

Mr. Solamillo: Yeah, it's not.

Chair Fredericksen: Or the roof, or whatever.

Mr. Solamillo: This was what was amazing, everything that we thought was, okay, we can save that, we can save that -- no, you just push your finger through it. The termites eat the core of the wood so the top surface has some solidity to it, so that's everything from wall board to windows and doors, so that the whole core is eaten out, so, literally, if you apply any kind of pressure, it'll go right through, and you realize, ah, replacement. That's -- damn the termites.

Chair Fredericksen: Oh, sorry, Bruce.

Mr. U`u: No. Don't be sorry. It's your last day. I'm sorry. Couple things. You know, if ever we were to go to Lana`i and visit the church. That's one. Two, thank you for your work, and I do appreciate your work, and I wouldn't mind, I know we got invited, the Commission, to go up to the Fred Baldwin Memorial Home.

Mr. Solamillo: Yeah, we gotta go.

Mr. U`u: I would love to see the end result --

Chair Fredericksen: What it comes out to be, yeah.

Mr. U`u: To how we started. And the Ma`alaea General Store, we can go on our own, and go niele, 'cause we can go buy the hot dog. We going judge more so the hot dog than the building. Kidding. But that will be incredible for us to see the finish product. I ran into the guy Xorbin in Costco. He said come up anytime. But, you know, I think we, as a Commission, it would be incredible to see the end result - kinda inspire us to save some of the buildings. It would be incredible for us as a group.

Chair Fredericksen: And the more this information gets out into the community, the more the folks that are able to do these sorts of project will go, hey, you know, it can be done, and there are a lot of positives that come out of it. Yeah, it is more expensive in the big picture, and it takes longer, but the end result is something that's -- it has meaning.

Mr. Solamillo: One of my inspirations, then I'll shut-up, was, when I came back and I wanted to see Pu`ukoli`i Camp, or Pu`ukoli`i, is gone, right? That's where my father grew up and where I went as a child. It's gone. When I went back to Honolulu, where is the Kabuki Theater? That was the first thing I wanted to see, right? Gone. The whole block. And it was like -- when you deal with those landmarks that really mean something to you as a child, and you carry them into adulthood, it's like, whoa, wait a minute. And that's probably why I become so vocal. It's like I've lived in places where the whole landscape changes in 20 years and it's like nothing is -- you know, you can't remember the landscape. It doesn't look familiar anymore. And this place, because of its important to cultural history, you know, and, you know, our temples - I mean can you imagine in Hawai`i without Japanese temples? But that's literally, as all the congregations get old and you got one 90 year old and no backup, right? No preservation plan. That's the danger is that this whole, you know, our tradition, our culture, local culture will just be forgotten, and that no can so -- anyway, now back to the other slide.

2. April 5, 2012 CRC Meeting Agenda

April 5, 2012 agenda. Deputy Director McLean? Shall I mention our anticipated design guidelines?

Ms. McLean: Oh. Sure.

Mr. Solamillo: We should anticipate the Lana`i City BCT Design Guidelines 2011 coming to us for review, and that's by council resolution, so it is time sensitive so we gotta get to it in one meeting. So it's a lot of reading. There's backup material because the history section comes from the original historic context that was prepared for a proposed district that never happened, so you'll get that, and you'll get, for comparison, another design guidelines, which was done by Chris Hart & Partners.

Mr. Hutaff: Are we going to be able to get some of that information now?

Mr. Solamillo: So we're going to attempt to get it out really fast to you.

Mr. Hutaff: Even if it's given to us in pieces.

Mr. Solamillo: Yeah. Okay. So it's a lot of reading but you guys can to it, and we'll be sensitive to the fact that you need sufficient time.

Chair Fredericksen: That would be very helpful ...(inaudible)...

Mr. Solamillo: Yes. Okay.

Mr. U`u: ...(inaudible)...

Ms. McLean: The process, just so you know in case, you know, you hear about things or any of this is in the paper, the Planning Department also needs to conduct a public hearing on Lana`i, which we're starting to organize for early this month, we're in March already, in addition to the Lana`i Planning Commission reviewing them, so there's just a general public hearing that the department conducts, plus the Lana`i Planning Commission, which is a public meeting, and then also you folks, which will also be a public meeting. So just in case you hear about those other ones, I don't want you thinking, oh, who's reviewing what? It's everybody needs to take a look at it, and then all of those comments are put together and we send them back to council.

Mr. U`u: So we'll be making recommendations to the Planning Commission of Lana`i?

Ms. McLean: Your recommendations will go to the council as will the Lana`i Planning Commission's recommendations.

Mr. U`u: And the BCT, it's a business country --

Ms. McLean: Business Country Town.

Mr. U`u: Town. Is it similar to Lahaina, similar to every one little unique ...(inaudible)...

Mr. Solamillo: It's unique because most of our business country towns were built, you know, kind of like frontier towns, it's frontier architecture, and they're adjacent to each other, right? The difference in Lana`i is that they used kind of a residential model where there's a central quad and then there's separate between every building, so you don't get a, you know, a strong commercial, you know, group of edifices that line a main street; it has a very suburban feel. So it is an example of garden city planning that occurred for a community.

Ms. McLean: And also, as Stanley mentioned, the department had contracted with Chris Hart & Partners to revise the existing design guidelines, and those were never put forward to this Commission or to the community or the Lana`i Planning Commission. What's formally being sent and circulated now was generated by council, from Council Member Hokama from Lana`i, so there are these two versions, if you will, just so you know where those came from.

Mr. Hutaff: Cool.

Mr. Solamillo: Are there any other questions about this?

Chair Fredericksen: I have a question about Lana`i City itself. Is that boat just kind of dead in the water, going forward as a historic district, at this juncture?

Mr. Solamillo: It was sent back without prejudice by the Hawai`i Historic Review Board. The condition for its return to the Hawai`i Historic Places Review Board, excuse me, would be that two public meetings would be held and that because of the turnout at the hearing on Lana`i where large numbers of community residents wanted the baseyard recognized and included in any proposed district that that would be part a new nomination. No work has occurred on that. So as far as from the department's standpoint, we're not moving any further on it.

Chair Fredericksen: And that would have to be ultimately done with the cooperation of the landowner, basically?

Mr. Solamillo: To be nominated to the National Register, to be nominated to the Hawai`i Register, I don't know.

Mr. Hutaff: How does one reinstitute that process?

Mr. Solamillo: Any community organization, private citizen could resurrect the process.

Mr. Hutaff: By?

Mr. Solamillo: I don't know if I'm allowed to instruct you on that ...(inaudible)... you get a copy of it, you fix whatever the Hawai'i Historic Places Review Board wanted fixed, and then you resubmit.

Mr. Hutaff: You're not going to give me the phone number then?

Mr. Solamillo: It's public information.

Mr. Hutaff: I'm only joking.

Mr. Solamillo: You can call me or email me. I'll provide you with the contact person of any particular agency as well as if you want a copy of the nomination, you can get a copy.

Mr. Hutaff: Well I have, unfortunately, I have no plans for that but maybe someone on Lana`i might have not know that this process can be redone so maybe I might take it upon myself to just say, hey, is anybody interested? And leave it at that. If that's okay ...(inaudible)...

Chair Fredericksen: Not yet, Ray.

Mr. Hutaff: Next week.

Mr. Solamillo: Okay, are there any other items that any Commission Members would like to specifically have on the next agenda seeing that it will be jammed?

Mr. Osako: I have one comment. From what I understand, the plan that Councilman Hokama has forwarded to the council is actually Castle & Cooke's plan, so I think that at least, you know, the Commissioners should recognize that.

Chair Fredericksen: Thank you, Warren.

Mr. U`u: I thought it was from Chris Hart?

Mr. Osako: The plan that Councilman Hokama ...(inaudible)... it's sort of a misnomer because if all the people on Lana`i voted for him or didn't vote for him, he'd still get elected.

Ms. Chandler: How -- sorry, Chair. Will we be getting both copies of the plan or just one at this time?

Mr. Solamillo: Of the design guidelines, you'll be getting both copies.

Ms. Chandler: Oh, thank you.

Chair Fredericksen: And just on a - I don't know if on procedural basis is quite the right way of putting it - but so the council will have two plans?

Mr. Solamillo: No. The council only gets one plan but -- 'cause that's the resolution and that's the document, which has been transmitted by resolution, from Council Member Hokama to the Planning Department to act on. The reason why the other design guidelines is coming in is because there are other aspects of when you produce a design guideline, specific to place like Lana`i City, there are other things that may need to be touched on, so we're trying to give you all the things we'd like to have plus what the things, you know, what has been prepared by the applicant and transmitted to the department, and then it's up to you, as Commission Members, to make your call.

Ms. Thomson: May I ask a question?

Chair Fredericksen: Sure.

Ms. Thomson: So, Stanley, when the Commissioners are reviewing both of those documents, they could pull things from the Chris Hart document that they would prefer to see and then make their recommendations that way as well?

Mr. Solamillo: Yes they can. Something -- we're providing you with the history because there is a history component to the transmitted design guidelines, which if you read the history that was prepared for the nomination, there's some discrepancy there, so it is up to you to make that call.

Chair Fredericksen: Yeah. And I wanna thank Warren for adding or clarifying that because -- about the other plan, as it were, that has been submitted by Councilman or forwarded, whatever, put forth. Bruce, did you have --

Mr. U`u: Just a question on the procedure. So we look at the BCT, make recommendations, the recommendations go to the Lana`i Planning Commission?

Ms. McLean: No. There are three separate meetings and the results of those meetings go to the council. So we will send a packet back up to council with some kind of table or chart that says this is what the Lana`i Planning Commission recommends, this is what we heard at the public hearing, and this is what the Cultural Resources Commission recommends.

Mr. U`u: And they decipher -- when is the council the date they looking at to look over the BCT plans as recommended by -- what's the time frame, if you don't mind me asking?

Ms. McLean: When they pass the resolutions, sending it to these different agencies for input, they want it back in 120 days.

Mr. Hutaff: That was -- how long ago did they send it down? How long ago did they send -- made that resolution?

Ms. McLean: Just two weeks.

Mr. Hutaff: Okay.

Ms. McLean: About two weeks.

Mr. Solamillo: I don't remember.

Ms. McLean: It was pretty recent.

Mr. Hutaff: But we're already in 40 days of it then, by the time we had the meeting.

Chair Fredericksen: Yeah, I would just like to encourage the Commission to really look at things like carefully because it's -- it's just -- but it is kind of concerning to me. Yeah, Bruce?

Mr. U'u: And the reason I bring it up about the time line is, when I was on the planning commission, and we were going over the general plan, and they went try, seriously, they tried to ram it down our throats, and so I'm afraid when they say we got a time line. Okay, you know, we just got done with one agenda, we went right into the next, and they wanted us to go through it, and I don't think it was proper, and I understand the time line, but, you know, and by the time you know it, you're done with this document and it's passed to the council and, really, we had some say but what we would say as a planning commission could change -- be changed by the director, and then we'll hand it off to the council, you know, we didn't have much say. I thought the plan was already the plan. We was part of the process, but not a part of developing the plan.

Mr. Hutaff: And you also said too that there was going to be a couple of public meetings on Lana'i. Are we going to have access to that minutes and stuff of the -- as part of our duties?

Ms. McLean: I don't know if the minutes will be completed by the time you folks meet in April, but we'd certainly have -- we'd have our notes and so forth.

Mr. Hutaff: If we lived in a perfect world, I would like to see where our government, the council, push forward their ideas, then we have an alternate idea, okay, not put together by the council and then we have the people of Lana'i's input as part of our recommendations. Is that something that is going to be possible?

Ms. McLean: Like I said, we won't have the -- I don't think the minutes will be completed, but we can, you know, put together some bullet points of their comments.

Mr. Hutaff: Yeah. I think it's nice if, you know, as a Commission, we have Lana`i in our thing but the majority of us are not from Lana`i, grew up, and know all of that, and if anything I've learned in my life is the people who should make the decisions are the people who walk the walk, not the outsider who goes, oh, that's a good idea. So I would really like to have that kind of information.

Ms. McLean: But again, those comments go to council.

Mr. Hutaff: Also.

Ms. McLean: Just as your comments will go to council as will the department's notes from the meeting that the department will hold.

Mr. Hutaff: Okay. I got it.

Ms. McLean: So that doesn't mean that they can't be shared with you, but it's -- their comments are to inform the council, who has final say, not to inform you folks, but they can be --

Mr. Hutaff: Shucks. I thought we were more important.

Ms. McLean: They can still be -- we can still share them.

Mr. Hutaff: Cool. That's perfect.

Chair Fredericksen: Rhiannon, go ahead.

Ms. Chandler: Are we going to be going to Lana`i this year?

Ms. McLean: Yeah, when there are, like with Moloka`i, when there are items to go to -- that we need to go for, yeah, of course.

Mr. Hutaff: You know that there's always a plan B too, right?

Ms. McLean: It's the department's responsibility.

Chair Fredericksen: I've got -- I need some clarification or some -- because of what, I know I'm not going to be here, but just -- I just want some good -- I'd like to have some clarification. How long has the process been for the BCT?

Mr. Solamillo: Which process?

Chair Fredericksen: The -- okay, this resolution --

Mr. Solamillo: Right.

Chair Fredericksen: Why was that brought forth - to try to get some movement in things or -- or maybe that's not quite the right way to frame it.

Mr. Solamillo: If it's okay, I'll direct that question to Deputy McLean, Deputy Director McLean.

Ms. McLean: The department recognized a while ago that the design guidelines needed to be updated and that's why we had the contract for the consultant to update them. You need to ask Council Member Hokama why he jumped ahead with this particular version.

Chair Fredericksen: Okay. Thank you. Now, so here's my next question: Okay, so there is a planning process that has been initiated that is utilizing Chris Hart & Partners to develop a plan for Lana`i City.

Ms. McLean: They're design guidelines. It's not a plan.

Chair Fredericksen: The design -- yeah, yeah, the design guidelines, okay, for Lana`i City, and so -- and that would be similar to what goes on in Lahaina and elsewhere, Makawao, etcetera, Paia, so there's that process that's in place, so the councilman from Lana`i has put forth a resolution that seems, and just from my very, very limited understanding of this situation, is basically from the landowner.

Ms. McLean: That -- we've heard that too and I can't comment on that. Council Member Hokama would have to answer that.

Chair Fredericksen: Was Councilman Hokama aware of the planning process that's going on for the design guidelines with Chris Hart & Partners?

Ms. McLean: Yes.

Chair Fredericksen: Too bad I won't be here. That --

Mr. Hutaff: There's going to be a ...(inaudible)...

Chair Fredericksen: That just is an odd --

Ms. McLean: Come and testify.

Mr. U`u: Question. You know, I think business country town design guidelines, I'm looking forward to look at it. Just a question. How does it mesh with the community plan, eventually Lana`i going be having their community plan during the general plan, so I guess it's an underlay or an overlay of the community plan so it's more specific for the design guidelines and not actually a community plan, correct?

Ms. McLean: The design guidelines support the zoning, so community plan is a more general designation than the specifics of zoning. So if a parcel is zoned business country town, then it would have to comply with the design guidelines.

Chair Fredericksen: I have one more question/comment because my understanding of the governmental process is certainly imperfect. If there's a planning process that is underway for design guidelines for a particular area, it just seems kind of odd to me that a resolution would be put forth that has - I mean I don't know how similar the two documents are - but it doesn't seem very appropriate. Just kind of odd.

Mr. Solamillo: I'm going to --

Chair Fredericksen: And I don't expect -- that was just my comment.

Mr. Solamillo: An old director in Dallas told me that the "P" in "Planning" stood for "Politics," and the older I get, the more he's right. I also would like to compliment Deputy Director McLean, who's defended the right of this Commission to review the document.

Mr. U`u: Thank you for sending us to Moloka`i, by the way.

E. COMMISSIONER'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

Mr. Solamillo: Now we have Commissioner's Announcements. And notice that the slide has changed, and it's like God is behind the clouds. What, nothing? Okay.

F. NEXT MEETING DATE: APRIL 5, 2012

G. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Fredericksen: Okay. Well, before I adjourn, I would again would like to just say a big, big, big thank you, and it's been a genuine pleasure to have been on the Commission with everyone, and I will miss you all, and I wish you the best. Keep the faith and hang in there. Thank you all very, very much. Now, if anyone would like to make a motion for us to adjourn, please put that forth.

Mr. Osako: I move that the meeting be adjourned.

Chair Fredericksen: Any second?

Ms. Kanuha: I will second.

Chair Fredericksen: Alright. Assuming there's no objections, then we don't even need to get the ayes on that. Thank you all.

There being no further business brought before the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 11:52 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by,

SUZETTE L. ESMERALDA
Secretary to Boards & Commissions

RECORD OF ATTENDANCE

Present

Erik Fredericksen, Chairperson
Raymond Hutaff, Vice-Chairperson
Rhiannon Chandler
Irene Ka`ahanui
Makalapua Kanuha
Kahului Maluo
Warren Osako
Bruce U`u

Excused

Brandis Sarich

Others

Michele McLean, Deputy Planning Director
Stanley Solamillo, Cultural Resources Planner
Richelle Thomson, Deputy Corporation Counsel