

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

April 4, 2012

Council Chamber, 8th Floor

CONVENE: 9:07 a.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Joseph Pontanilla, Chair
Councilmember Gladys C. Baisa, Member
Councilmember Robert Carroll, Member
Councilmember Elle Cochran, Member
Councilmember Donald G. Couch, Jr., Member (In 9:13 a.m.)
Councilmember Michael P. Victorino, Member
Councilmember Mike White, Member

EXCUSED: Councilmember G. Riki Hokama, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Danny A. Mateo, Member

STAFF: Scott Kaneshina, Legislative Analyst
Michele Yoshimura, Legislative Analyst
Josiah Nishita, Legislative Analyst
Camille Sakamoto, Committee Secretary

ADMIN.: Sananda K. Baz, Budget Director, Office of the Mayor
Jo Anne Johnson-Winer, Director, Department of Transportation
Marc I. Takamori, Deputy Director, Department of Transportation
Scott K. Hanano, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation
Counsel

OTHERS: Lyn McNeff, Chief Executive Officer, Maui Economic Opportunity, Inc.
Three (3) additional attendees

PRESS: *Akaku: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

CHAIR PONTANILLA: ...*(gavel)*... Budget and Finance Committee meeting is now in session. Today's April the 4th, 2012. The time is like 9:07 a.m. Chair would like to introduce the members that are here. We do have Member Carroll, Member Baisa, Member Cochran --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Good morning.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: --Member Victorino, and Member White.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Good morning.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Excused at this time are Members Couch, Member Hokama, and Chairman Mateo. This morning we so privileged to have a former Council member that's now the Director of Transportation, Jo Anne Johnson-Winer --

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Yes.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: --as well as, Marc Takamori, who is the Deputy Director of Transportation. We do have Scott Hanano, Deputy Corporation Counsel as well as Sandy Baz, Budget Director. Again, supporting the Committee we do have our faithful staff, Scott Kaneshina, Michele Yoshimura, Josiah Nishita, as well as Camille Sakamoto. There's no one signed up for public testimony this morning. If any of the three people in the gallery would like to provide public testimony, you are welcome. Seeing none, if there's no objections, the Chair would like to close public testimony.

COUNCIL MEMBERS: No objections.

ITEM BF-1: PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR 2013 BUDGET FOR THE COUNTY OF MAUI (CC 12-59, 12-)

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Thank you. Members, today we have the Department of Transportation and this evening we go to Molokai, so the Chair's intent is to finish as quickly as possible so we do have time to pack our bags for our afternoon flight. So Members, I'm gonna limit the questions probably to two this morning. And if you do have additional questions to be asked of the Department, you know, if you could put it in writing and then we'll get information back from the Transportation Director to you folks. Okay. Today, we do have the Department of Transportation and we're gonna start on page 6-427. And at this time, the Chair would like to recognize Director Winer - opening comments.

DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Good morning, Budget Chair Pontanilla and Council Members. First of all, we'd like to begin by thanking you very much for your support of our Department. The funds that you provide have enabled us to continue to apply for and receive grant funding from the FTA. During the 2013 Fiscal Year, you will note that we've requested increases in funding so that we may respond to the public's transportation needs throughout Maui County. Taking the Council's advice from last year, we've also tried to become more sustainable by including a fare restructuring option for your consideration. You will also note that our programs span a total of six categories that reflect the various components within our Department's control. We've tried very hard to develop program goals, objectives, and measures that will help us to achieve greater efficiencies while allowing us to continuously evaluate our Department's performance. We welcome any suggestions from the Council that will help us become more effective as the Department and are happy to answer any questions the Members may have. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Thank you for that brief summary. Mr. Baz, you got any comments to make?

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair, no I think those were good opening comments. I just did want to say that I'm personally very happy with the Department of Transportation's goals, measures, and their proposal that they gave to my office. They're one of the better departments that provide that information.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Thank you. That's what you get when you hire a former Council member. Okay. Members, we'll turn to page 6-433. And we'll go through the A Account. Mr. White, if you have any questions for the Department? Salaries and wages on --

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Not on the A Accounts.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Mr. Victorino?

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: None on the A Accounts.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Just looking at the services section...oh, wait that's operations?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No, no, nothing.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Member Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No thanks.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Mr. Carroll? Okay. We go to operations. Member White, if you have any questions?

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Yeah, just an explanation of what the...well, the explanation under services is a decrease in transportation services of \$445,000. Could you just give us an explanation or fill out the explanation on that? What is the increase?

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: What I'm gonna do because my Deputy Marc has the details, I'll let him respond to that.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Sure.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Marc?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

MR. TAKAMORI: If you look on Page 6-434, yeah, basically under services, number three, the decrease in the transportation services by 445, what we're doing there, that 445 used to be our bus procurement matching funds. What we're doing is moving it out of...from admin and removing that into...we're moving that under the Highway Fund which would then be on Page 6-435 and we're increasing that to 855.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Okay. So it's just a transfer and then an increase.

MR. TAKAMORI: And then a different funding source. Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. So you moved the 445 and then you add another 400,000 to that? Okay. Mr. Victorino?

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: That was my question, other than that, I see where the increases have occurred and what necessary and why those necessary increases are. I do have...under this operations, what is the estimated ridership this year? You know, I've been bragging about a number but let me see how close I've been.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Actually we...

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Best guess.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Well, so far we're on projection to make just under 2.8 million boardings.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Okay. So I told everybody we doing almost three million when we were up in NACo 'cause we're talking with transportation. And I said for an island of a 150,000 people, we have nearly 3 million ridership, which is not a bad ratio when you look at that, so job well done. I also...we'll talk about bus stops in a little bit, but I see, I see some signs, I see some signs the light is at the end of the tunnel, at least for the ones that we've been waiting for all this time. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Thank you. Chair recognizes the presence of Member Couch. Do you have any questions in regards to operations side? And then Staff had already passed out the details for that one area. So, Mr. Couch?

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Yes?

MR. BAZ: If I could just clarify that services reduction here \$445,000. The reason why we did that was to move it from a General Fund funded item to a Highway Fund item so that could...the Highway Fund had sufficient funds to pay for this and it's a qualified expense.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Fine, thank you. Mr. Couch, questions?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: No, thank you.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No, it was asked. Thank you.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Member Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Yeah, question was with the highway, moving the amount to the Highway Fund. Does the Highway Fund expect to have money to continue this? We talked about earlier, when we first started about the fear of decreasing money in taxes collected on things like gas, because everybody'd be using less because the price is going up. So I just want to be careful that, you know, maybe in the long run what that might do.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay.

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Mr. Baz.

MR. BAZ: Thank you. Yes. Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Member Baisa. The discussion with the Highway Fund, the fuel tax revenue...well, we expected a small bump this year in the long range. We do expect fuel tax to go down. And that, you know, looking at the weight tax increase, that has gone up and that has been sufficient. And also there is a, the fare restructuring. While we don't recognize the revenue, the public transit fares go into the Highway Fund. So those revenues, you know, with the fare structure we're...when we talk about fares and I apologize for even bringing that up until we talk about rates and fees on the 12th. But we did not recognize that additional revenue this year, because we're not sure exactly how much it's gonna be until we implement the fare change, if it's approved by Council. But it could be somewhere around \$300,000 and additional revenue.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Mr. Baz, with that three and four hundred not quite enough to offset moving that 400,000 there? I mean I'm just concerned, because, you know, we hear so many complaints from our constituents. We're paying so much money for gas. They don't understand that a tiny part of that is taxes. How come you cannot fix our road? Because you making all this money. So I think it's important to discuss this on television so people understand.

MR. BAZ: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chair. When we discuss the Department of Public Works, who's the other recipient of Highway Funds, we can discuss in detail that, and they basically got whatever they asked for out of the Highway Fund in their requests. So we feel there was sufficient revenue for cover both of these items.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Okay. Thank you, Chair. One more quick one and the second one is, you mentioned the ridership and I'm concerned about what is going on, even this morning on the news with the school bus situation, and is your department ready for a deluge of kids?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Member ...Member Johnson.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Yeah. That's perfectly all right. We did meet with the Department of Education, both myself and Deputy Takamori. So one of the challenges that the DOE has is they talked about discontinuing services first on Oahu. The prospect of trying to pick up the slack even on their part is very troublesome to Oahu transit. It would also be troublesome to us. They did approach us with some potential solutions, but we put the caveat in that we would be open to such partnerships or solutions, only if a guaranteed stream of revenue came with it. So we are not prepared at all to take on that kind of a task nor is Oahu or any of the neighbor islands.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Thank you very much. It's just a situation that I think could be catastrophic so we need to keep it on the radar screen. Thank you.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: You're welcome.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Thank you. Thank you, Member Baisa, for those questions. Ms. Winer, in regards to your conversation with Marcus Oshiro, I think, House Finance Committee Chair in regards to, you know, the possibility of partnering in providing transportation for school kids. I'm glad, you know, the thing is not shut out, but, you know, you continue to talk about it. Just to let you know, I've had conversation with Marcus Oshiro, several times in regards to...because we almost provide the same type of services for the kids. We have a school...a fare for school kids that we implemented. And my conversation with him was that, you know, both of us we provide the same type transportation and the possibility of partnering in trying to provide transportation for the kids. And I am happy that, you know, you are following up on some of these things, and, you know, it's something that we need to work with the State, you know, if you're providing the type of transportation for the kids and hopefully, you know, somehow we can get some subsidies from the State of Hawaii.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: And just to let you know, we did not visit specifically with Mr. Oshiro. It was, I think, Mr. Kauhi and also the local representative.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: So we dealt with them with that.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Just to let you know, I had that conversation with the State of Hawaii.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: I appreciate that as well.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Thank you. Member Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Just an update, Chair. This morning, when I was listening to the radio they said that they were talking to the DOE and the latest was that they were talking about if they would cut, they would cut based on need. Where it was most needed, they would continue and where there was alternatives, they probably would do it later. That was as of this morning so that's kind of scary.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Thank you. Mr. Carroll, questions? Okay. Member Victorino?

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Yeah, thank you. And I'm glad Ms. Baisa brought the subject up, because I was gonna wait 'til little bit later when you go to goals and objectives to talk about this. But I too have met with Mr. Kauhi and Mr. Josephs, that's the other gentleman from Maui, because the two areas that are initially to be affected is our two areas, Kahului and Wailuku. The other areas are not on the map yet, that's to say yet. But our two would be the first to be hit, because of the fact that they just said the same thing. We have a alternative bus system in the area for our kids to ride. And I'm like, no, we do not. I mean, you know, so I mean and I know these two gentlemen a long time. They've been good family friends, so it's really hard when you have relationships and understand the powers to be, which is the Board of Education. So I have put in a call to some of the friends I have on the Board and Mr. Amemiya and some of the other ones have assured me that they will really look closely before they touch the neighbor islands, but I said no matter where you hurt, you hurt the kids and that's the big thing, Mr. Chair. They hurt the kids. This is not adults we're talking about. These are kids who need transportation and you don't have bus ride, bus system up in Wailuku Heights. And I know the bus every morning picks up about thirty kids up in the Wailuku Heights area. I see 'em. My neighbor has two twins that go on the bus. So this is really profound if it happens in its...what they're talking by the Fiscal Year 2012, '13, you know, the Fiscal Year '13. So Mr. Chair, I hope we will monitor this and whatever we can do to intervene, please let us know. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Thank you. And, you know, my recommendation to the Transportation Department is to have that conversation with the DOE and which they will, as well as the House and Ways and Means Committees in regards to the funding of school buses for our children here in Maui County. Of course, we don't wanna, you know, completely stop the transportation which, you know, would be devastating for school kids. So, any more questions regarding the operations?

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Chair?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Mr. White?

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: On Page 6-435, the 855,000...the explanation is using these Highway Funds in order to compete for Federal funds and you're using 755,000 for that and then also to provide the ability to apply for grants, 100,000. So those amounts being...are those matching

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

amounts or how...these are Federal or Highway Funds, County Highway Funds being used to match with Federal funds?

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Go ahead.

MR. BAZ: Thank you. Most of the FTA grants require at least a 20% match on those. And so if we're gonna apply for competitive grants for livability, there's a bunch of different categories that we're eligible for, to apply for buses and different things. And so we need to have the money appropriated and available when we make the application. And so that's why this money is being requested here. They're applying for... they have identified a number of grants they're applying for, during, you know, this current period within the next couple of months. You know, they've already started doing negotiations with and things. And then the other one, the \$100,000 is for future grants that they may apply for during this fiscal year.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Okay. So basically, what this...this is for bus procurement?

MR. BAZ: The 755,000 is for bus procurement. The \$100,000 is for the...it could be for operational grants or it would be related to mass transit.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Okay. So the amount is a little less than double what we had last year.

MR. BAZ: That's correct. We hope to receive a significant amount of Federal monies for bus procurement.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Okay. So then later on, on Page 6-442, we've got a million dollars of additional funds that is for--let me get there--million dollars for matching funds for anticipated Federal funds. So is that for operations or is that...okay. So that's just for operations?

MR. BAZ: Yeah, when we get down to that, we'll discuss that, but that's specifically for operations.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Yeah, I'll wait on that one. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Fast question for Mr. Baz.

MR. BAZ: Yes?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: What is the gas tax for Maui County, Maui County, our take?

MR. BAZ: I'd have to verify it but I think we have 16 cents.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Thank you. Members, any more questions regarding the B Account? If not, we go to equipment, lease, and purchases. Any questions on the equipment side? Ms. Winer, do you have any vacant positions?

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: No, there's no vacant positions.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: No vacants. Okay. Members, any questions on the goals and objectives for the Administration Program?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Actually, Chair, sorry, can I jump back to salaries and wages. The 5,900, that's an increase in the salary?

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: It was a reclassification from an SR-22 to an SR-24, because of the breath of the task that had to be taken on by one of our employees.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Says, I mean it's basically a raise, right?

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: If well, it's gonna result in an increase for this employee. Yes, but he was doing actually...and he still is doing the work of two people.

MR. BAZ: Yeah, Mr. Chair?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Mr. Baz?

MR. BAZ: From our discussion last night, you may remember the position that was requested to be reallocated by the Department of Environmental Management that was denied.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: The one that was rejected?

MR. BAZ: Right. They're justification for reclassification wasn't sufficient. When the Personnel Services reviewed this one and the change in the job duties and classification, it was justified, so they approved this reclassification.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Mr. White?

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Thank you. I'm glad Ms. Cochran brought this up. The question in my mind is whether or not any of these tasks could've been taken over by one of the two of you instead of left in this, with the person in this position? I only say that, because this is a significant raise and I don't have a problem with paying them if that's the only way we can get the job done. But in this environment, when we're asking for a whole lot more money in this Department, I'd like to think even though this is small this is still \$6,000. And so I'm just wondering, if any of these responsibilities could be handled by either one of you?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

MR. BAZ: Before they answer that, I just want to say that this Department is a very small Department. There's only five staff members and they have...they work very, very hard at managing what they have and what they do and with what they are processing. And this one...

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: I hope all our Departments do that, Mr. Baz. Are you suggesting that others don't?

MR. BAZ: I just have personal experience that they...that all of the staff in there work incredibly hard, even, you know, the private secretary's doing way more than just secretarial duty. She's their accountant and their personnel person and everything. And the Director and Deputy, you know, work very hard. I'll let her describe specifically that position and maybe why, you know, that person needed to be reclassified, but just to let you know that they work incredibly hard.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Thank you.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Yes, and the skill set that this particular individual has is unique in that it required years of training, which, sadly, you know, I mean, I don't know how to repair cameras. I do not know how to repair hard drives. Marc does some of the task, but in terms of Paratransit qualifications, all of the site inspections that are done, the photography, all of the processing of the applications, every complaint that comes in for civil rights, this particular individual and, I think MEO can attest to the fact, because we have also tried where we can to help MEO. With this individual...has a unique skill set that would require training that probably is gonna outlive my tenure in the job that I'm in. We do other tasks though and we multitask. We cross train continuously and we expand the opportunities that we have, but in this particular situation, the individual had not even had a raise for years and years. And so this is . . .

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: I mean it's like a lot of people in the private sector.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: This is not justifying that this was our way of achieving a raise, but when we reviewed the job description, we made our case to Administration and also to Personnel Services, as was stated by Sandy. The justification was there, otherwise, we would not have been granted that. I can assure you that we really had to justify it.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: I understand that. I'm just concerned, because having not achieved much in the way of attrition, we're not seeing a reduction in our overall costs, and these increases, even though they're relatively small in the overall scope of things, are things that indicate that we may not be looking at this as though this is our own money. And I think that's important for all of us to do and I'm...and you may have exhausted all possibilities. So we'll move on. I'll accept your description, but just a reminder, Chair, that, you know, we got to look at this as money that we may not have in the end. And we... 'cause all of our costs are going up and it's a little concerning. Thank you, Chair.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Thank you, Mr. White. In fact, I had conversations in regards to redescribing positions and what I saw in previous Budget sessions is that we describe a lot of positions. And what does it do? It will add cost to the County Government. So when we did a mass removal of all vacancies, you know, all those things disappeared. So I'm glad that the Administration now is working more closely with Personnel to insure that it matches the--because it's Civil Service--it matches, you know, other job descriptions that do the same type of work. So at least we have, you know, a review process, not like before, we didn't have. Thank you. Members, any more questions regarding this area?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Chair?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Member Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Chair, you're on the goals and objectives for admin, right?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Okay. On Page 431, 6-431 on the bottom, Goal 2 has that hot topic that I'm sure everybody wants to get an update on. And that is to continue to implement bus shelter and transit amenities through the County CIP. Maybe if Director or her assistant could update us on the status of the bus shelters.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Department?

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: I'll defer this to our Deputy, who has been working closely with our engineer on this.

MR. TAKAMORI: So as of right now, there are eight bus stop improvements. There are three in Central Maui, one on Waiale and two right on Papa, in front of Luana Gardens. Those first three, the shelters you're probably gonna notice that the shelters are coming up. So we actually received the shelters from our, I guess, our vendor in Michigan, and so within the next few weeks those shelters should be completed. The next five out of the eight are...I think there's four on South Kihei Road and one by Makawao Ranch Acres. So those...pretty much the infrastructure has been completed. We are waiting for the next set of shelters to be shipped out from our vendor in Michigan. So that should be coming in. That should be shipping out within the next few weeks from what we're told by our vendor.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: So more or less when...I mean how long does this shipping take?

MR. TAKAMORI: I would say about three weeks to maybe a month.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Okay. So hopefully we'll see these before the end of the fiscal year? That would be nice.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

MR. TAKAMORI: Oh, definitely, definitely that would be nice.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Okay. Thank you very much. I know they're much awaited. Thank you.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Thank you. What is the average cost for a shelter?

MR. TAKAMORI: The average bus stop shelter cost...if you don't include the getting the site infrastructure meeting...like if you're building it on a slope or if, you know, you have to build a retaining wall in that area. The shelter based on the lowest bid we got for the contract is approximately, just for the shelter above the ground for just the shelter, that's 25, around 25,000.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Twenty five thousand and the added cost is a preparation of the ground.

MR. TAKAMORI: Yes, so that doesn't include installation and, you know, site improvements or anything like that.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. What is the estimated average for...let's take Kahului for instance, the three average to prepare the site?

MR. TAKAMORI: Based on the lowest bid --

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Yeah.

MR. TAKAMORI: --for the one of the Kahului stops it came out to be around 45,000.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Forty five, so you add the 25, about 70? Yep.

MR. TAKAMORI: That goes...that's including the 25,000.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Yeah.

MR. TAKAMORI: Yes.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: There were talk like \$200,000 so this kind of dispels this thing, so thank you for that information. Mr. Victorino?

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Yeah, thank you. And you asked a couple of my questions so thank you very much. For this coming fiscal year, how many bus stops are you looking to implement? I'm not gonna talk about the ones that are on their way, that should be done before the end of the year which, you know, is good news, but how many will you be looking for next fiscal budget because looking in here, I see...

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair, do you want to discuss that in the CIP section?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Maybe, CIP--

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Yeah.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: --which we can get to the detailed costs.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Okay.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay.

MR. BAZ: According to their goals, yeah, they're doing it, trying to do it as fast as possible, but the actual number will be in the CIP section.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: And there is...the other question I have, would these costs that you have been giving us, there is no possibility of any, well I would say, lessening of the cost in any way? This is about the best we can do overall, cost to...and I know everyone is a little different but...

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Just to answer, we do always . . . we're bound by the lowest bid--

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Right.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: --but what's been happening is the construction costs and the actual site improvements are where we run into problems, and much of that is due...if there in a Special Management Area, if they're in a historic district. Those costs, we are trying to cut down on a little bit by doing our own in-house processing of the requirements that you would find under SMA. So actually, Planning Department has been helping us. So that was one area where we thought we could try to cut down, because some of these...Mr. Chair, the cost are as much as a third of the whole shelter preparation and sometimes they've been more than that.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Well, that's good because the public has to understand why we spend so much for these shelters, you know, and it's not just something we wanna do. Sometimes we bound by the different laws and ordinances that exist throughout the County. And so they have to understand that. What is the next priority as far as next year's group? Where would most of those go? Are they spread out all over?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Mr. Victorino, can we take that in CIP --

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Well...

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

CHAIR PONTANILLA: --and looking at the overall plan for the Department when we come to that CIP portion? And maybe, you know, require from the Department themselves, their future locations as far as, you know, the next several years in regards to bus shelters.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Okay.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. One fast question, Ms. Winer. Nonprofits, do they have an ability...can they do bus shelters for the County of Maui?

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Because of the ADA requirements and the site preparation and the specifics that we really have to go through in order to satisfy those requirements, we wouldn't find it advisable, because, you know, I guess, we wanna be fully compliant. And if there is an injury or there's any kind of an accident that would occur on any kind of a shelter that was not constructed, 'cause in some cases you'll see bollards that are up. If you saw that unfortunate mishap the other day, where a youngster was killed as a result of a vehicle was coming into a bus shelter area. There are certain things that we have to do to protect the public. We do, on the other hand, have support from some of our nonprofits in actually...well I won't call it a formal adopt a shelter program, but they are emptying the trash for us. We have a couple locations, even Parks Department is doing some of the work for us. So we are trying to achieve efficiencies and partnerships in that way.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Chair?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Member Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Chair, quick comment. I can verify what Director Winer is saying. When MEO wanted to do shelters and we had Don Medeiros at that time. And Don looked into it. And it was just a morass of regulations, requirements, having land acquisition, ADA requirements, and so we never were able to do it even though we wanted to because of all the requirements. It really is complicated, you know, the public has no idea. I get it at home, once in a while my husband will say, why don't you guys just put up a bench and a roof, that's all people need is a place to sit and be out of the sun. So I have to explain to him, it's not that easy, remember we have requirements and government regulations and we just cannot do that like we used to before. I know that you come from the nonprofit sector, where I think...was it Lions or Rotary or everybody was putting up shelters, but those were the old days. Now with the requirements of ADA, cannot.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. And this may or may not be the right location... time to discuss this, but Ms. Winer, why not...you know, you're trying to get ten more buses or actually five this year but... I'm sorry, ten, yeah, ten this year. Why not cut back

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

on two buses and make more shelters, because as always we're trying to catch up, you know, we're trying to always catch up to what we really need, infrastructure wise, we're always lagging behind. So slow down on the buses and let's get the shelters up for the people who do use the bus. I don't know if that's right but...

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Yeah, you looking at public transportation and you looking at bus shelter. You know, maybe we should like take your question in the CIP regarding --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: --construction of bus shelters, because the Department has...I guess, because we're so successful that we need to take care of ridership and if we did that, then what happens, yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Right.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Any more questions on the goals and objectives? Okay. Next area is the Human Services Transportation Program.

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair, this is a grant holding to Maui Economic Opportunity. I wasn't sure if you wanted to take this up now or during the grant session.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: We'll take it at grants then. Similar with air ambulance?

MR. BAZ: Yes, Mr. Chair.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Paratransit Service.

MR. BAZ: Paratransit is contracted. This Paratransit and the Public Transit are a part of the program, so it might be relevant discussion today.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. So that concludes the operations side then.

MR. BAZ: Oh, Mr. Chair? I'm sorry if I miscommunicated that Paratransit and Public Transit are contracted services.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Yeah, I'm gonna go turn right there, right now.

MR. BAZ: Okay. I'm sorry.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: We'll go to Paratransit Service Program first and then the Public Transit Program. Ms. Winer? Oh, Members, Page 6-440.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Yeah, if the Members have any questions? I think Member White had question about the one million dollars.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Mr. White?

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: I believe that was under the transit, not the...

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Oh, public transit he's talking about.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Yeah, it's under Public Transit, not the Paratransit.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay.

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Yes?

MR. BAZ: If I may make a comment? The Paratransit services, you'll notice that there was...we left the program intact, but the funding was moved to the Public Transit services Program because it's ...currently a single contract, and this will be the last year of that single contract. And so for accounting purposes it was easier to just leave it as one program. That's why that's combined there in that, but the goals and objectives, success measures in the program description are still relevant for that specific program.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Okay. Fine. Member White?

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Thank you, Chair. The question I have is if we're going to be combining them, will the amounts for each service still be identified or identifiable, or are you gonna combine them all in one contract and we won't see what we're spending on Paratransit again?

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Go ahead.

MR. BAZ: That for the last four years it has been combined in a single contract and this ...

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: I know, but we're getting a specific amount for it.

MR. BAZ: Yeah, last year's one was...or two years ago, I think it was that it was discussed as a separate amount but that was not an accurate amount. And actually what the services are for the Paratransit Program were discussed and because it's a single contract it wasn't necessarily relevant. But we decided to split it out last year so that we could start to identify how much those costs were. Paratransit services are on demand type of service. So the dollar amount is

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

based on the requests from ridership, where the public transit...the fixed route system is the costs are more fixed because it's certain stops that run on a single day. And so long answer...quick answer is that it's one contract, they're not identified separately in that contract other than the cost, but the allocation is not separated out in that contract.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: But is the service still going to be provided on a cost per pickup basis?

MR. BAZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Are we gonna be able to see in future budgets or can I see anywhere in this budget what that cost is?

MR. BAZ: It's a part of the contract and maybe the Budget and Finance Committee can pull that contract up if they'd like to review that contract specifically and the...look at those costs. The...this will be the last year of the current...

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: We won't, I'm sorry for interrupting, but we won't know what that cost is. I mean we can see what the cost that's contracted per rider. We can see what that cost is but we're not gonna know what that ridership is and what the...unless it's identified in the documents.

MR. BAZ: This will be the last year of this contract, like it is specified and the future contracts, we do plan on splitting out Paratransit Services from the Public Transit Services contract so that will be specifically identified in future years.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Okay. That's my concern.

MR. BAZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER WHITE: Thanks.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Mr. Victorino?

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Yeah. Thank you, Chair. The question I have was this contract is Paratransit is a separate contract so it's on...no, no, I mean I erase. The service is a separate service, I apologize. That's what I meant to say, Mr. Baz. Thank you for shaking your head and getting me correct. It's a separate service on demand. So is this part of the working relationship with MEO or this is totally separate?

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Mr. Baz?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

MR. BAZ: Thank you. The Paratransit Program is a complementary Paratransit to the fixed route system. It is a Federally required item, is currently part of the Roberts contract and it will continue to be for this next fiscal year. Roberts and MEO have been working together to meet the needs of the community and that's some flexibility that has been put into the MEO contract to allow that.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Thank you and I just wanted because, you know, the public has been told that and I just wanted to make sure that was occurring. And thank you for confirming that. Now, if a person on a wheelchair comes to a public bus stop to go on to the regular public transit we're still able to accommodate them. Is that correct?

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Yes, that's correct.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Okay. So, I mean, there's no differ...you know, in other words there's not always on demand. There is some that uses the public transportation system. We just put seats up and lash 'em and whatever else you need to do. That still exists?

MR. BAZ: Yes, Mr. Chair. Our vehicles that our on the fixed route system are ADA accessible so disabled riders do ride it but the Paratransit services are separate services.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Yeah. Okay. So that was more...again that's on a demand, I call, I need the help and all that. And overall, one of the biggest complains we had last year was the training of these drivers, especially Roberts. Has, Ms. Winer, more work been done to make sure training, you know, so that they do a safe and adequate job to protect our disabled?

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Yes, in fact, we're working with the State to access what they call RTAP funds, which are specifically for training opportunities, and we are also developing a continuing education where those opportunities can also be offered. We would also extend that to MEO as well, MEO personnel. So if they have new people coming on, we would also offer that.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: And the last thing I have is you put over here under your objectives, key objectives, goal number one, percentage of reduction cost per passenger trip. You put down actual 16 and then 1 percent, 1 percent over the next two years. How do you get 1 percent and 1 percent? I just...I'm curious how we get that number.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Marc, you wanna do that? Well I can, you know, in this particular case because we don't have --

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Okay.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: --the experience, we put it at a benchmark.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: I see.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 4, 2012

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Because what we have to be able in order to know what that percentage is, we have to develop a tracking mechanism and that particular tracking where you know how many people are on a particular bus at any given time. Obviously, you wanna increase the number of passengers that are on a bus in order to achieve our greater efficiency. So that tracking...well we don't have any historic information on that. That was why we, we're using this as a benchmark. So next year, we may be able and I know MEO, as well as, some, Roberts have been providing us with that information so that we would be able to achieve some effectiveness. And believe me, just simply because we have larger ridership and only so many buses whether Roberts likes it or not, they have to achieve efficiencies by putting more riders on our buses.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: But this one in particular is Paratransit.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: There's not, not the the public system at this point, right? So, how to do you, you know, Paratransit now, if I'm correct, you have some tracking 'cause it's more on demand, right? So someone calls, then you know it's one or two people on the...so this one I would think you'd be able to ascertain information. This is what Mr. White was talking about. How much per passenger the cost because you have some tracking? The regular public ridership, I understand is a little bit more difficult.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: And I think to answer your question because we have...this is the first year that this type of performance based budgeting has really been implemented.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Okay.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: It's not that the information wasn't there. It's that we weren't looking.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Okay.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: So that's why this year, I think, this is a really good direction for us in terms of our performance as well as other departments to go. So I hope to be able to give you a more, I would call, meaningful answer next year when we come back before you.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Well, I look forward to that next year. At least I know the direction you're heading and I can appreciate that.

MS. JOHNSON-WINER: Thank you very much.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Thank you, Ms. Winer. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PONTANILLA: Thank you. Your favorite question. Achievable 1 percent. Mr. Couch?