

**COMMITTEE ON THE STATUS OF WOMEN**  
KALANA O MAUI, MAYOR'S CONFERENCE ROOM  
TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 12, 2013  
MINUTES

**I. Call To Order And Establishment Of Quorum**

Chair Potopowitz called the meeting to order at 12:13 PM.

Present: Chair Barbara Potopowitz, Vice-Chair Maria Ornellas, Dennyse Grace, Debra Cabebe, Carol Reimann, Susan "Netra" Halperin

Excused: Suzanne Hobbs

Ex-Officio Excused: Leslie Wilkins

Staff: Zeke Kalua, Executive Assistant  
Richelle Thomson, Deputy Corporation Counsel  
Michelle Esteban, Administrative Assistant

**II. No Public Testimony**

**III. Review and Approve Minutes From January 8, 2013 Meeting**

Commissioner Cabebe moved and Vice Chair Ornellas seconded the motion to accept the January 8, 2013 meeting minutes. Motion passed unanimously.

**IV. No Correspondence Received.**

**V. Presentation By Karin Phaneuf, Administrative Officer in Public Works**

Ms. Karin Phaneuf introduced herself and mentioned she is responsible for Human Resources at the Department of Public Works and interacts with two unions, HGEA and UPW. She said when hiring for clerks there are a lot of skills and experiences involved in hiring. She said when hiring for laborers, no skills are required and no testing or prerequisites are involved. She mentions laborers make \$10,000 more on their entry level than their lowest paid clerk with HGEA. She explained she didn't understand why in government clerks were making \$10,000 less, as to other professions, men and women are paid the same.

Ms. Phaneuf recognizes this as a federal, state and county problem. She said a remedy to increase the starting salary of clerk would be an expensive proposition. She shared that the classifications are not gender specific, although more men will apply for the laborer positions, and more women will apply for the clerk position.

Commissioner Halperin asked if Ms. Phaneuf has heard of women who are in a laborer positions being harassed-or is it a social challenge for them? Ms. Phaneuf shared she knows of one woman who is in a labor position with UPW in DPW and she has not reported any harassment or challenges.

Ms. Phaneuf shared that she believes there is a discrepancy in the County between these two classifications and thinks it is unfair to have qualification requirements for the clerk position such as testing for various skill levels and there is no qualification requirements for laborer. She shared highway laborer starts at \$34,000 with no skills or experience, and a clerk will make \$10,000 less, but needs skills and experience with the computer and will need to take proficiency tests. She said there needs to be an appeal to the unions.

\*Commissioner Grace joined the meeting at 12:23 PM

Ms. Phaneuf shared she talked with the unions and they said they were happy to look at the issue, if an employer asks for it. She felt that everyone who is at entry level in these classifications should have the same pay. She then said that there are single mother clerks who don't make enough for the necessities and are not qualified for state assistance such as Quest or Foodstamps. She continues that if the pay scale was the same at an entry level laborer, it would help single mothers and all women.

Ms. Phaneuf said the issue is complex and national with many entities involved. Vice Chair Ornellas understood that at the county level, the personnel department writes the description and to rewrite would start there. She stated that personnel were part of the county administration, and asked if Mayor would want to reclassify? Ms. Phaneuf said it was a possibility, but would not do that with out the union getting involved. Ms. Phaneuf said she sees the discrepancy in the clerks' series.

\*Commissioner Reimann joined the meeting at 12:27 PM

Commissioner Halperin commented on why would the employer want to pay more? Commissioner Cabebe suggested starting with the Personnel Director and work with the administration before going to the union.

Commissioner Grace commented to Ms. Phaneuf to educate the employees to give them the opportunity to analyze jobs and comparative salaries, and educate the staff to ask, and if they do ask be assured they will not lose their job. Ms. Phaneuf stated that UPW reviews these discrepancies on a regular basis, and HGEA has not looked at it for 25 years.

Vice Chair Ornellas mentioned the recent classification of the Lifeguards, and asked if they could introduce the clerks at that level. Ms. Phaneuf said yes and it would affect all the clerks in the county. Commissioner Grace agreed and it was the same findings when she worked in California. Chair Potopowitz mentioned reclassification. Ms. Phaneuf said again it would be expensive.

Ms. Phaneuf shared that men are being paid more because of their physicality and women are being valued less, but they are more proficient and need to keep updated with technology. The laborers have less to learn.

Mr. Kalua said he agrees with Ms. Phaneuf, but respectfully disagreed the disparity is on purpose. Ms. Phaneuf disagreed saying that it snuck up on us. Mr. Kalua added that we need to look at the classification and how they test. He pointed out that the classifications do not put gender specifications. He also added single mothers who would benefit from a \$10,000 increase, now would lose quest and food stamps, and as long as she can budget the \$10,000 a year, she'll be okay. He continued that it is education on the single mother's part. Ms. Phaneuf disagreed and said it's still not okay to pay the woman \$10,000 less, because of her partner's financial standing or if she's doing it on her own. Chair Potopowitz states that the major problem is the classification and how CSW could help Ms. Phaneuf.

Ms. Phaneuf asked if the Committee could bring this to the attention of the Mayor and he could speak to the Director of Personnel. Chair suggested bringing this issue to the Mayor. Commissioner Cabebe said that bringing it to the Mayor is fine, but as far as educating the public it shouldn't be about the county, it should be about the problem in general. Deputy Thomson reminded the committee about the invite to Lance Hiromoto, Director of Personnel Services, to speak on the County's viewpoint. Chair suggested having Mr. Hiromoto speak in the March meeting.

## **VI. Items For Review/Discussion/Action Of Committee**

### **1. Women's History Month Subcommittee**

Vice Chair Ornellas shared that they have received 25 nominees, no one was nominated for the Honorary Historical Award (Posthumous). She explained how the subcommittee voted.

Vice Chair suggested giving honorable mentions to those who were not chosen for this year. Chair agreed.

Chair suggested going through the categories. Commissioner Cabebe recommended trusting the subcommittee. Commissioner Reimann agreed with Commissioner Cabebe.

Vice Chair continued to explain the criteria and how the subcommittee voted. Commissioner Cabebe asked if CSW will be inviting all nominees, even if they were not selected to be one of the honorees this year. Commissioner Cabebe agreed and it was decided to recognize all the nominees with lei. Winners would be honored with lei, monkey pod bowl, and a certificate.

Commissioner Cabebe motioned and Commissioner Reimann seconded the motion in adopting the subcommittee recommendations of award winners. Four passed and one opposition. No abstentions. Motion carried.

Vice Chair recommended in the category of the Young Woman of Promise, should CSW do honorable mention for all including those who were also eliminated? Commissioner Cabebe suggested not doing honorable mention, but recognizing all nominees with lei.

Vice Chair asked Commissioner Reimann for the support in doing the monkey pod bowls. Chair would like official letters to go to the nominees, nominators, and County Council from the Chair through the Mayor's Office.

Deputy Thomson mentioned that the reception needs to be agenzized and publicize.

Chair asked if Ms. Kit Zulueta could do the graphics for the programming. Commissioner Grace also volunteered to see if a friend of hers could do it. Commissioner Reimann recommended engaging the PIOs and giving them information in advance and have photos on that day.

**2. State of Hawaii Women's Commission Grant Budget**

**3. Women's Issues Survey**

**VII. Determine Next Meeting Date And Agenda**

March 19, 2013

-State of Hawaii Women's Commission Grant Budget

-Women's Issues Survey

**VIII. Adjournment**

Vice Chair Ornellas moved and Commissioner Halperin seconded the motion to adjourn. Motion passed unanimously.

Adjourned 1:32 PM