

**URBAN DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
REGULAR MEETING
OCTOBER 1, 2013**

APPROVED 11-05-2013

A. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Urban Design Review Board (Board) was called to order by Mr. Michael Silva, Chair, at approximately 10:15 a.m., Tuesday, October 1, 2013, in the Planning Department Conference Room, First Floor, Kalana Pakui Building, 250 South High Street, Wailuku, Island of Maui.

A quorum of the Board was present (see Record of Attendance.)

B. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVAL OF THE JUNE 4, 2013 AND JULY 2, 2013 MEETING MINUTES.

Mr. Michael Silva: Call this meeting to order. Thanks everybody for bearing with us. It's nice to see everybody faces too. It's been awhile, a few months since the last meeting. First item on the agenda, or I guess, second item, is approval of the minutes. Were there any comments on the June and July meeting minutes? Seeing none, so we will approve those administratively.

The June 4, 2013 and July 2, 2013 UDRB meeting minutes were administratively approved.

C. RESOLUTION THANKING FORMER MEMBER ANDREW CARSON

Mr. Silva: The next item is resolution thanking former member Andrew Carson. Clayton?

Mr. Clayton Yoshida: Thank you Mr. Chair, members of the Urban Design Review Board. At the July meeting Mr. Carson did announce that he was resigning because he was – from the board – because he was relocating to New Zealand. He was a member of this board and also a sustainability teacher at the college. So for the record, I'd like to read into the record the resolution of the Urban Design Review Board thanking Mr. Carson:

WHEREAS, Andrew Carson served the County of Maui since April 2012 as a member of the Urban Design Review Board; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Carson has served with distinction and has performed his duties in the highest professional manner with the Urban Design Review Board; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Carson resigned from the board on July 15, 2013; now therefore
BE IT RESOLVED that the Urban Design Review Board hereby commends Mr. Carson for his dedication and untiring public service to the people of Maui County; and

FURTHERMORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Urban Design Review Board expresses their sincere appreciation for Mr. Carson's services and extends their best wishes in his future endeavors; and

FURTHERMORE, BE IT RESOLVED that copies of this Resolution be transmitted to the Honorable Alan Arakawa, Mayor of the County of Maui; and the Honorable Gladys Coelho Baisa, Council Chair of the Maui County Council.

So if the members can sign the resolution, then we will transmit it to Mr. Carson and to the Mayor and the Council Chair.

Mr. Silva: Great. Thank you Clayton. I know everybody enjoyed listening to Andrew and his, his requirements for the green and environmental conditions that he like to bring with the energy efficiency.

D. COMMUNICATIONS

1. **MR. WILLIAM SPENCE, Planning Director requesting comments as it relates to the Makawao-Pukalani-Kula Country Town Design Guidelines and the Kulamalu Design Guidelines on the proposed plans submitted by MR. BENJAMIN B. LEE, FAIA, LEED, AP, Principal of CLIFFORD PLANNING & ARCHITECTURE on behalf of the COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING & HUMAN CONCERNS (DHHC) for the Kulamalu Affordable Housing Project located in the B-CT Country Town Business District at the corner of Ohia Ku Drive and Aapueo Parkway, TMK: 2-3-066: 012, 013, & 014, Kula, Island of Maui. (CTB 2013/0007) (Erin Wade)**

The proposed project consists of 64 - 1 and 2 bedroom units with 1 and 2 baths housed in 7 - two story townhouse buildings and a Multi-Purpose/Community Building with a common laundry facility on approximately 4.179 acres.

DHHC is requesting exceptions from the Country Town Business District design guidelines to use the following materials for the project:

- a. **Vinyl windows from Jeldwen or Milgard; colors would be Desert Sand or Chestnut Bronze**
- b. **Asphalt shingle roof, Landmark Pro "Architect 80" by CertainTeed; colors would be Resawn Shake, Weathered Wood or Heather Blend**
- c. **Vinyl wood textured fencing - "Chesterfield" with CertaGrain Texture or "Imperial Select Cedar"; the color would be Natural Clay, Sierra Blend, or Weather Blend.**

The UDRB may provide comments to the Planning Department regarding the proposed plans with the planned exceptions as they relate to the Makawao-Pukalani-Kula Country Town Design Guidelines.

Mr. Silva: Next item on the agenda is communications, and I will read the agenda item (*Mr. Michael Silva read the following project description into the record.*) That was a mouth full. Erin, could you help us out here?

Ms. Erin Wade: Thank you. Good morning. My name is Erin Wade. I'm with the Planning Department. This item is before you today for – because the property itself is zoned country town business district. Now the county has approved design guidelines for Makawao-Pukalani-Kula as part of the zoning district. But this project itself also has design standards and guidelines which were approved by this body in 2006. And so those – while the project's elements are consistent with the Makawao-Pukalani-Kula country town business district design guidelines, the representations made about the project originally when it was approved and as in the design standards that you folks approved that these three elements vary from those standards. So we would like your guidance today about whether or not it is acceptable to proceed with variations from the standards that they represented would be part of their project. Are there any questions for me before the applicant makes the presentation? Okay, Mr. Ben Lee is here to present.

Mr. David Green: Can I ask you a question? Did I understand you to say that they, that these would not be exceptions to the design guidelines, but they are exceptions to what was approved several years ago?

Ms. Wade: Correct. Yes.

Mr. Green: Thank you.

Mr. Silva: So they are the Kulamalu Design Guidelines.

Mr. Michael Hopper: So just to clarify, on the agenda it talks about the, requesting exceptions from the country town business district design guidelines, and to understand that you do a review of those and actually determine that these are actually allowed by the, by the country town business district design guidelines?

Ms. Wade: Correct.

Mr. Hopper: Okay. So that portion it's actually not, not a problem at this stage in the department's opinion.

Ms. Wade: Yes.

Mr. Hopper: Okay.

Mr. Benjamin Lee: Thank you Erin. Mr. Chair, members of the Urban Design Review Board. Good morning and aloha. I'm Ben Lee. I am one of the principals of Clifford Planning & Architecture. We're the architects for the Kulamalu Affordable Housing Project and, and the chair has done such a great job that I don't want to repeat too much, but I'll quickly do a quick

presentation and overview, and then I'll be glad to answer any questions that you might have.

We started this project about in April and – thank you. The mission, of course, of Housing and Human Concern is that they enhance the social well being of the citizens of Maui County. This is affordable rental housing. We're looking at 64 one and two bedroom units. It's in upcountry on Aapueo Parkway and Ohia Ku Street. It's right across the street from the Institute of Astronomy, and this project here is Kulamalu Cottages and it was also done by Janine Clifford of Clifford Projects at that time. And here's another aerial view of the project. I think, if everybody's familiar Long's Drugs store is here, the Institute of Astronomy is here, and the Kulamalu Villages is right here.

We've updated some of the, some of the early conceptual designs, but it is 64 affordable rental units. 40 two-bedrooms, and 20 one-bedroom units. The site plans has roughly two parking stalls per unit or 128 stalls, plus five additional stalls for the multi-purpose facility or the community center and also some guests parking.

And these are the conceptual elevations. We're pretty much sticking to that. We're about 60% completed with construction documents. There's basically a 12-plex units, two-stories, one and two bedrooms. The lower level is FHA affordable units. And there's also a certain percentage that also meets ADA requirements.

There's two building types, a 12-plex and an 8-plex. There's four units on the ground, and four units on the top floor. The sizes of the units are ranging from about 600 square feet to about 640 square feet for one bedrooms. They're one bedroom, one bath. And also for two bedrooms, it ranges from about 700 square feet to about 800 square feet. And that's also two bedrooms, one bath. I know that water is an issue in upcountry so we're trying to be efficient about our design. And also our landscape design would also be using zero scape. We have Brownlie & Lee as the landscape architects on this one.

The exceptions as the chair had mentioned is three things. One is using asphalt shingled roof. Land Pro Architect 80 is very much like wood shingles. That's what's recommended in the country town design guidelines. We have the boards here which we can pass around and show you the texture of the Architect 80 roof. The Housing Department and also the Mayor's Office has selected these blue tabs as far as the colors for the fencing and also for the roof. And we'll pass those around.

The second exception is the vinyl windows. We're looking at kind of a tan beige color for the windows, not the white vinyl windows. We did some checking with Hansador in Honolulu and the cost between vinyl windows and wood framed windows is about double. So a four by six sliding window is about \$700 or so, and for a wood frame, it's about \$1,300. And again in response to the Housing and Human Concerns budget requirements, we're proposing to use the vinyl windows. One for maintenance. It is up on kind of the hill side, and it's much more durable than wood. I know that the country town design requirements, some of the projects has street frontages that are wood. But I think in this case because of our budget requirements we, we request the design review committee to approve our vinyl windows.

Let's see. This is Long's Drugs store. This Kulamalu Villages. Let me back up. Even though the street frontages has wood windows, there is vinyl fencing and the interiors is also vinyl windows because you can't see it from the street front. We, we looked at Kulamalu Cottages and they do have vinyl windows. Ours would not be – we're not proposing to use the white color ones. The Institute of Astronomy is also using kind of the white frame vinyl windows.

So this is another image of our presentation boards. These are the Architect 80 roof. These are the two colors that Housing Department had selected. We're looking at vinyl wood fencing. Certain Teed has made – well has come up with a product that's wood textured which is pretty interesting. It does look like wood, but it's actually vinyl. So that from a distance you don't really notice that it's not real wood, but it's vinyl instead. And here again, the vinyl fencing would be more durable, much more cost effective, and we're looking at the natural clay color.

For the windows here again, we're looking at a tan desert sand window frame. We did look at chestnut brown or kind of a brown color as well. And here again the Housing Department preferred the more neutral color rather than the darker frame. This is actually a wood window. There's not really much difference in appearance other than one's made out of wood which costs twice as much.

We've got to update this a little bit on the schedule, but the total cost of the project is \$8 million. It's about 49,700 square feet in seven buildings plus the community center, so it comes out to be about \$150 a square foot which is pretty challenging to do. And we think we can do it if we're efficient and kind of caution about how much amenities we, we put in the site.

The schedule I want to update this. We started the project in April of 13. We're looking at completing 100% construction documents in the first week of December, before the Christmas holidays and my staff doesn't get mad at me. And we're looking at submitting it to Maui County in the first week of December for building permits. I was told that it might take five to six months for the permit process, and they will be asking for construction funds from the city council for the 15, the 2015 budget, which is in March.

And that concludes my presentation. Let me pass the boards.

Mr. Silva: Alright, thank you Benjamin.

Mr. Lee: We've also touched based with there's a Kulamalu Review Board at Dowling Company, and, and there's a stage one and stage two. We submitted for stage one review. They require submittal of stage two review after we complete close to 80, 90% of construction documents. Their preliminary comments is no objections to the asphalt shingle roof, no objections to the vinyl fencing. They do have some reservations about the vinyl window, but that's, the decision is still out on that. They've had made some exceptions both ways. One, they've required some to have wood windows, and some that does not like the Institute of Astronomy. So we'll be circling back with them as well. But the, the agenda or the item before you today is to request your approval of the exceptions of these three items.

Mr. Silva: Yeah, thank you Benjamin. We are, we are providing recommendations to the Planning Department, and then we'll leave it up to them to give approval. I want to open it up to public testimony. Seeing none, closing public testimony. Erin?

Ms. Wade: Thank you. I'm sorry. Unfortunately we – this procedural issue was just brought before us this morning about duplicative design guidelines for this particular site, and I only had the opportunity to review it when we just sat down against the Makawao-Pukalani-Kula. And I represented to you a moment ago that it was consistent and silent on the windows and roofing, but apparently that's not correct. It says actually it states specifically in the Makawao-Pukalani-Kula Design Guidelines, under Pukalani because this would be considered Pukalani, but "windows should be, use wood for wood frames, sash, muntins and screen frames." And for the roofing, it does say "use wood shingles or traditional style corrugated sheet metal as roofing material if visible from a public roadway." So I apologize for misrepresenting that that we just actually reviewed it against this, this morning, so –

Ms. Ann Cua: If I could add to that. In other cases, like in the Astronomy, in the Astronomy building, they had a very similar situation where we were dealing with the, the county's Makawao-Pukalani-Kula Design Guidelines which was a requirement of the country town business district ordinance that these be, that the county come up with these. Which we did. And in addition to that this particular project came up with design guidelines for their specific project. And so as each project comes in for business country town review by the Planning Department, we have to give them design approval. We issue them an approval number before they can proceed on with the building permit. And what we do each time is we do our review by looking at both the county's design guidelines and the Kulamalu's specific design guidelines which they came in for, to the department. We brought it to the Urban Design Review Board for their, for their recommendation. And so we have actually approved design guidelines for them.

So, in, you know, this particular case, the majority of this project, as you can see, it, it fits well into Kulamalu. It is, the majority of it, is in compliance with both design guidelines when we look at, you know, heights, when we look at, you know, the fencing, the, the, the facades, canopies. I mean, for the most part it is compliant. And so there's just a couple of areas that are not compliant as was with the Astronomy building. And so that is what we're bringing before you, for you to help us in your professional experience recommendation as to, you know, if we can allow these, these specific items to, to go forward, or if they need to use the traditional wood and traditional roof.

Mr. Silva: Thank you for that clarification. Everybody's got it set now right? So now we're gonna go around the board with questions or any comments you would have for the applicant. Each time that the applicant does come up to respond, I'd ask you to state your name for the record. After we go around the one time, we will go around another time for recommendations to the Planning Department, and at that point I'd ask Erin to, to compile those when we get there. Bryan, do you want to start with questions?

Mr. Bryan Maxwell: Just one with, with solar and also your solar voltaics. Is that something

that's being considered for the project?

Mr. Lee: Yes, I'm Ben Lee from Clifford Planning, the architect for the project. We are considering solar water heating for each of the units. For the common laundry facility at the multipurpose building we are looking at solar panels. Very, very efficient, and certainly there's some, some incentive to do that. It's about \$2,000 per unit to have individual solar water heaters. We are also looking at the request of Housing and the city or the county to consolidate all the water heaters into one central area. That may be a little more costly and very difficult to see who uses which one uses more hot water than if it's a central system. But individual solar panels is, is something that we're going to be putting in the drawings.

Mr. Maxwell: Would that also – pardon me – would that also include any solar for the parking or anything like that?

Mr. Lee: We're looking at the central area, the parking. It's about 65 by 38 feet. It handles about 165 panels, and, and it's very attractive because you have public parking. It costs about \$1,000 a panel. We checked with Solar Tech in Honolulu, and that's, that's about \$165,000. It produces about three kilo watts, kilo volts, which is pretty, pretty good. But it does not include the structural, or the steel structure and the framing to support the solar panels. Probably a little more expensive these days because the new building code requires hurricane. So it's not so much. It's the up lift that might add some costs to the structure.

Mr. Maxwell: While we're on the power part, is, is there going to be a like charging stations for cars?

Mr. Lee: We can put some in if they have electric vehicles. Sure.

Mr. Maxwell: Yeah. I'm just – that's kind of like a new thing. I don't have one, but, you know, I see it popping up all over the place. I guess the other thing, have you considered for the materials – I haven't read through all this – but for this community center, to do something different like the roofing or the windows or something? Because that's almost the most exposed one to the street. Maybe that turns into wooden windows, nice windows with the different roof so it's kind of different from the other buildings.

Mr. Lee: It's possible to do that. If you take a look at maybe not very detailed on that site plan, the multipurpose is actually about 10 feet below the street.

Mr. Maxwell: Oh, really. Oh, it's a hole?

Mr. Lee: Yeah.

Mr. Maxwell: Okay.

Mr. Lee: The entrance is about, we would like to have it about 15% grade because probably it's not that steep, but it is kind of going into the hill side. And once it gets down to the project, the

project has been kind of graded once before so it would not be very visible from the street.

Mr. Maxwell: Okay, maybe, maybe that's something where you look at the roof and say this is a different building. I don't know. That's a compliment so you know that's a special building of some sort just to accent it. That's, that's all I have for right now.

Mr. Lee: That's a good point.

Mr. Silva: Thank you Bryan. Frances?

Ms. Frances Feeter: I don't really have any questions. I just thought I might say I looked, went back and looked at the design guidelines and I thought they were old enough to be slightly out of date and maybe you're not considering the new materials and the practicality of those in requiring some of these things. That's all.

Mr. Silva: Thank you. Morgan?

Mr. Morgan Gerdel: Okay, I was just looking at the site plan and I was wondering what is the grade difference between the Aapueo Parkway and the pad elevations where the units are sitting?

Mr. Lee: This elevation here is what we call 177.

Mr. Gerdel: Okay.

Mr. Lee: And the elevation on the street right up here starts – this is kind of a down hill slope. So there's a driveway here, and a driveway here. The entrance point here is about 195, so it's at least a good 12 feet before we get into this area. And once we get into this whole area because if it is, it is FHA required, it's 5% slope so, so that's pretty challenging. We are pushing the grades back as far as we could. And then this area here is also at about 177. We just looked at the civil drawings, this is about 1775. This is maybe 175, 178. So once you get into this area it's pretty flat. There's a little berm or kind of a slope right here. And then it slopes down about eight or nine feet at this point. And then it kind of tapers off where this particular unit is almost flushed with Aapueo Parkway. But this parking lot here, again, is maybe at elevation 176, 177. And because of FHA we have to have a 5% walkway all the way around and also going out into the street to the sidewalk. So that's, that's probably the most challenging part of the site. We're minimizing any retaining walls. Our civil and . . . (inaudible) . . . they said we can go 1 ½ to one slope, rather than two to one slope so we can maximize as much area we can get without having retaining walls. We may have two or three foot retainer walls. We're thinking about using key stone block because of the cost.

Mr. Gerdel: And my other question, are the units going to be naturally ventilated or are they air-conditioned?

Mr. Lee: No air-conditioning. These are all naturally ventilated, cross ventilation wherever

possible. Typically for each of the bedrooms, they would just have one, one window, but the kitchen, dining, living area would have multiple windows. The units, typically has a, on the second floor, has a small balcony, a little lanai deck, and that's where we're putting the water heaters because they leak. And so if they do leak, then it doesn't do any kind of water damage to the interior structure.

And then on the outside, underneath the balcony there's a larger concrete that the units can use for, I don't know, outdoor dining, barbeque, thing like that. There's a common barbeque play area – sorry. And also this multipurpose is designed so that it can accommodate future child care if necessary.

Mr. Gerdel: Yeah, I guess one comment about the windows. You could also consider casement windows in case – I know sometimes with small units, it can be hard to meet the ventilation requirement with the horizontal slider so a casement could help in that way also.

Mr. Lee: That's, that's a possibility too, open, to get more air into the units. Sure.

Mr. Gerdel: Okay. Thank you.

Mr. Silva: Thank you Morgan. Bob?

Mr. Robert Bowlus: I don't have too many comments. I like the idea that it's affordable housing. The like the name affordable housing. And we've got plenty of high end housing on Maui, and I think it's a worth while goal. I kind of an advocate for affordable housing. So if use vinyl windows and you can save money and make them affordable I think that's, that's a reasonable thing. And same with the asphalt shingles, I, I like your submission on the colors and, and the look and the planning. I think it's a very nice job.

Mr. Lee: Thank you.

Mr. Silva: Thank you Bob. Dave?

Mr. Green: Is the, is that a lake in the center of the – or is it just a pond or something?

Mr. Lee: No, it's just kind of an area to delineate –

Mr. Green: Putting green.

Mr. Lee: To delineate kind of a child play area, picnic area, for the residence.

Mr. Green: So are there any – does all sides drain into the middle?

Mr. Lee: We have a drainage plan. Most of the site is sloping towards this direction. The parking will have an internal drainage system so it will collect all the water, all the surface would be collected by the individual catchments typically in the center of the driveway. And also any

kind of major surface drainage runoff will be collected and facing to the county's drainage system.

Mr. Green: I also noticed that the front facades of the 12-plex and 8-plex are different. In particular on the 8-plex it looks like the stairs are visible on the front facade and they look like they're behind some kind of lattice screen on the 12-plex. Is that correct?

Mr. Lee: Yes. What we're looking at is for the exterior materials is board and batten siding, and horizontal lap siding, kind of a hardy board material. When we presented to, I guess, the Dowling Company and Kulamalu Review Committee, they had suggested screening the stairwell, and that's what you see on, I think, the handouts. Since then, they've basically said no. Perhaps we can just use decorative railings instead of the screen because it's pretty expensive to do. You know, because it requires a special framing and also an attachment to the roof for support

Mr. Green: So, but, so you're not going to do the screening on the 12-plex?

Mr. Lee: No, we're not.

Mr. Green: Yeah, I, I just think that – so that's gonna, that's gone?

Mr. Lee: Yes.

Mr. Green: Okay. I just think those stairs look so affordable housing from an aesthetic perspective. I understand that aesthetics, you're working with a budget, but just a comment.

Mr. Lee: We would like to put it in, but there's – it's going to be pretty interesting how we can bring in the project in budget as is.

Mr. Silva: Is that it Dave? Jane?

Mr. Green: I'm sorry. I'm done.

Mr. Silva: Okay.

Ms. Jane Marshall: What was that screen going to be made of?

Mr. Lee: We looked at, you know, four by four post and two by two lattice, maybe six inches on center.

Ms. Marshall: So it was going to be wood lattice.

Mr. Lee: Yes, it was wood lattice. It's possible to use a trex material which is not. Yeah, I agree. Wood be better, but it would be stained or painted.

Ms. Marshall: What is going to – do you know what is going to happen to the remainder of that site between your boundary and the Kupaoa Street boundary? There's a section of that site that's going to be left after you're done.

Mr. Lee: This portion here?

Ms. Marshall: Yeah, what's happening with that.

Mr. Lee: I'm not sure who the ownership of that.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. So it's just not, it's not part of the same owner's land?

Mr. Lee: No, this is owned by Maui County.

Ms. Marshall: Because it's such a defined piece, and it looks like you're, you're going up to about this point.

Mr. Lee: This portion right here?

Ms. Marshall: You're not going –. You're going all the way up to Kupaoa Street which is in front of Long's Drugs.

Mr. Lee: Correct.

Ms. Marshall: So there's going to be section of empty space between you and that boundary.

Mr. Lee: Yes. Is it private?

Ms. Marshall: \$158 a square foot. That sounds almost impossible. How realistic is that? I mean, it's really amazing. It's almost impossible. Have you had it professionally budgeted? Have you had contractors sharpen your pencils?

Mr. Lee: We have Michael Wright here in Maui County to kind of get a temperature of what the construction cost is. I know in Honolulu and Oahu, \$150 is just really, very, very typical.

Ms. Marshall: It's hard to renovate an existing structure for that, so, you know, more power to you. I understand. I mean, a lot of my original concerns about vinyl fencing and vinyl windows go by the way side because that's an amazing goal on your part. But you're not, you don't know for sure whether you're –

Mr. Lee: We're going to – in fact, Michael Wright just received our 60% drawings and he'll be coming up with the cost estimate, kind of a reality check, and we'll be meeting with the Maui County folks and Housing Department to double check on that. Added to that, just for your information, the site work is about a million dollars.

Ms. Marshall: Yeah, it's great that you don't have to do a lot of retaining walls. That's expensive. I noticed that there's some existing street poles that have, you know, been placed around the Astronomy Center. Is that what you're going to be using in your side? Are you going to take the same language inside your space?

Mr. Lee: Probably something not quite as decorative. But it would be, like I said, in keeping with design guidelines. We looked at having solar panels for the street lights. I was told, we've been told by our –

Ms. Marshall: You would use LED?

Mr. Lee: LEDs off course. And solar panels are very expensive fixture.

Ms. Marshall: Initially.

Mr. Lee: Initially. But that's still an option we can look at. And something we'll probably use as maybe an additive or alternative in our spec when we send out for bid.

Ms. Marshall: You could do a fundraiser and put plaques on each one.

Mr. Lee: I like that.

Ms. Marshall: I noticed there's four colors of fencing. See, I know you've addressed this since, but you have dwindled the colors of the fencing. You're not going to have four different choices.

Mr. Lee: No, it's just the one color which is, I think, the sand, the buff color.

Ms. Marshall: And, and you have decided on the roof color?

Mr. Lee: That's correct.

Ms. Marshall: So there's not going to be a couple of different roof colors?

Mr. Lee: Just the two kind of the darker.

Ms. Marshall: And actually that doesn't bother me. Multiple fence colors would actually bother me so you're going to have –

Mr. Lee: It will be just one color fencing and one color vinyl windows that's approved.

Ms. Marshall: Are you – have you presented any landscape drawings beyond the site plan?

Mr. Lee: No, in fact, I have a meeting with him tomorrow morning. Brownlie & Lee who has done a lot of work here in Maui County, is our landscape architect, and we'll be, I guess, working closely with him to, you know, do a conceptual landscape.

Ms. Marshall: Is that, is that suppose to be a part of this presentation?

Ms. Cua: No. The landscaping plan is going to have to go to the Planning Department for review.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. But sometimes we get that, and sometimes we don't.

Ms. Cua: Yeah, in this particular case we're only, we're only asking you to provide us comments on, on the design.

Ms. Marshall: And you mentioned, I'm quoting you, "kind of hardy board." Is it hardy board?

Mr. Lee: It is hardy board.

Ms. Marshall: And what is the rail design going to be? Is it going to be plastic? Is the rail going to – you know, the stair rail?

Mr. Lee: The stair rail is wood.

Ms. Marshall: It will be wood. Okay. Have you designed it?

Mr. Lee: We're – we have similar to what's shown on the drawings. It will be vertical pickets. Probably –

Ms. Marshall: Okay. It's very simple.

Mr. Lee: – five inches on center. Two by two.

Ms. Marshall: Well, good luck on that budget, and thank you.

Mr. Lee: Thank you.

Mr. Silva: Thank you Jane. I have a couple, couple questions. If you could clarify, is this, is this funding all from, I guess, government sources, county, state, federal? And what happens after the project is built. Who maintains and who takes care of this?

Mr. Lee: Maybe I can ask – Mayor's Office can comment on that part?

Ms. Wendy Taomoto: Wendy Taomoto, Department of Management, County CIP Coordinator. The project is a combination of affordable housing fund, county; and home funds, federal grant. Federal grant.

Mr. Silva: Okay. And, and what happens after they're built, who maintains the structures?

Ms. Taomoto: The Department of Housing is going out for an RFP to privatize the management

and the maintenance.

Mr. Silva: Okay. But it will be owned by the county?

Ms. Taomoto: Yes. The property will be owned, but we're gonna contract out the management and maintenance.

Mr. Silva: Okay. No, I was just curious because obviously it impacts the maintenance cost, so thank you. Another question, more for Ben. You mentioned you went before the Kulamalu Review, it sounds like it was just Dowling. Possibly is there any other neighboring properties that were involved like Institute of Astronomy or any of the Kulamalu Cottages?

Mr. Lee: Janine Clifford met with the Kulamalu Design Review Board. I wasn't present at the time, but I think, you know, the review board is composed of several members. I don't know exactly what the make up is. I can get back to you on that.

Mr. Silva: No, I was just curious if they had some other input from around, you know, the property owners. But I'd imagine, if there's like an HOA, like a homeowners association for that area.

Mr. Lee: I'm not aware, but I can double check and get back to you.

Mr. Silva: Okay. Thank you. So now we want to go around with recommendations to the board. They are requesting, I guess, our input on the exceptions to the three guidelines, or the three items, the vinyl wood, the asphalt shingle, and the textured fencing. So if there's anything else you want to add to that, please let them know. And Erin, you could compile for us? Alright, thank you. Bryan you want to start off?

Mr. Maxwell: First of all, I like all three of their options they have. I think that's fine. I think the only question I have is, especially when a private company comes to build, do they get the same treatment? Say they want to keep things at affordable, so that's, that's the hard part. You know, here, we're letting it go. One option, like I said, if that one building was really close to the road, maybe that something we keep as just kind of the same look. But that's just -. I think the three is okay. It's just something that has to be thought about. You know, all of sudden these other guys come and go, hey man these guys let them do this, this, and this, why can't we do it and we're trying to keep our costs down too, so that's just a thing that has to be thought about.

One of the things that I – just as an add on is maybe an area for bike racks for this area. Maybe an area for, especially in this bank if they're doing retaining walls, do it like a community garden. Maybe there's a spot that something like that could be put in there. Otherwise, you know, it's still pretty schematic right now. It looks good though.

Mr. Silva: Alright thank you. Frances?

Ms. Feeter: I'm going to approve the exceptions.

Mr. Silva: Go ahead.

Mr. Hopper: Just as a comment. This body's making recommendations to the department on their review. It does not have the authority to actually grant exceptions. The code says "design plans for the improvements within the BCT Country Town Business District shall be approved by the Planning Director in accordance with the established guidelines." So you're making recommendations to them, but the department's going to have to approve or not based on the design guidelines. And this body is not granting a variance or exception. The Planning Commission can do that, but not the Urban Design Review Board. You're basically somebody the department has said we would like your comments on this at this stage. So just to clarify it's not a variance or something that's been given by this body. It's a recommendation to the department, just to be clear.

Mr. Silva: So we would recommend for approval.

Ms. Feeter: Whatever.

Mr. Silva: Okay. Morgan?

Mr. Gerdel: Okay, I have a recommendation related to the asphalt shingle roofing. I would recommend using the Mountain Ridge Dimensional Shingle on the hips. It's a minimal material cost, and it will give it a more 3-dimensional look, kind of fitting more with wood shake.

Mr. Silva: Bob?

Mr. Bowlus: I guess I just have one more comment on, on the design and that might be leaning towards maybe more affordability but could I ask you what the roof pitch is? It seems like it's a fairly steep roof pitch.

Mr. Lee: This is Ben Lee again. The roof pitch is a 4-12.

Mr. Bowlus: It is 4 and 12?

Mr. Lee: 4, 12.

Mr. Bowlus: It looks much taller than the elevation so -. No, my recommendation would be to approve all three requests and I like the project.

Mr. Silva: Thank you Bob. Dave?

Mr. Green: I support the, the proposal.

Mr. Silva: Okay. Thank you. Jane?

Ms. Marshall: I do also, but I do have one comment. And I think that if at all possible – probably

not – if at all possible it would be really great to keep the lighting precedent on the exterior that's already started in that neighborhood. It's amazing how we're starting to see these distinct lines as you look up the mountain at night because, you know, one neighborhood is different in its lighting at night than the others. It looks very unnatural. So, I just think it would be really nice to keep that precedent, if at all possible.

Mr. Lee: We have instructed our electrical engineer to select down lights so there's no, you know, off lighting from light fixtures.

Ms. Marshall: Yeah. And color temperature, you know, so it's blue here, pink there. Anyway. But otherwise, I – I mean, the roof, I like your roof lines. They look great.

Mr. Lee: Thank you.

Mr. Silva: Thank you. I also do support all of the, the three exceptions recommending for approval. Erin, do you have something you want to add?

Ms. Wade: I just wanted to clarify Commissioner Marshall's comment. Did you mean the specific fixture, or did you mean the rhythm of the fixtures?

Ms. Marshall: I would say rhythm and color temperature would be more important to me than fixture type just because of what we look at when we look up the hill.

Ms. Wade: Thank you.

Mr. Silva: Can you explain rhythm? What was that?

Ms. Marshall: Spacing.

Mr. Silva: Okay. Spacing.

Ms. Marshall: Spacing.

Mr. Silva: Okay. I thought it, I thought it was a light show or something. Okay, so I believe you probably have all those. Erin, I think the one thing that, that maybe we want to talk about more was the roof shingles on the hip portions. I think everybody is in agreement for the three that were stated, but adding an additional item for the hips.

Mr. Gerdel: Yeah, the Mountain Ridge product, it's basically the same material, it just has a little more 3-dimensional look, and so it's a slight additional cost, in material. But it's a small area, so I think, it would give a more 3-dimensional look to the roof.

Mr. Silva: Okay. So you have those comments from us, our recommendations. I guess as a board we would need to make a motion, and it would need to be seconded, and then we would vote.

Mr. Maxwell: I'm trying to understand your comments, Morgan. Is it a product that they're showing? Is it a whole different product?

Mr. Gerdel: It's by the same manufacturer. It's just a different type of hip shingle. So it, it – like I say, it more closely replicates wood shingles. That was my thought.

Mr. Maxwell: Okay.

Ms. Marshall: \$151 a square foot.

Mr. Silva: Ann?

Ms. Cua: So from the department's standpoint, you went around the room and – I, I think we just want concurrence – yeah, concurrence from the board that you agree with that comment.

Mr. Silva: So what we'd want to do is what we were just talking about, maybe Erin if you could read all of the, all of the comments, and we can see if we can get a consensus.

Ms. Wade: Sure.

Mr. Hopper: Comments or recommendations.

Mr. Silva: Recommendations.

Ms. Wade: Okay, so the first recommendation was to provide an area for bike racks and an area for a community garden. The second was to recommend using Mountain Ridge dimensional shingles on the hip portions of the roof. And the third was to keep the street lighting precedent, that's already been set for the Kulamalu community in terms of the spacing and color temperature. And also Commissioner Maxwell provided a justification for these particular recommendations stating that it was a county affordable housing project.

Mr. Silva: So if there are – if there's no opposition we could forward that unanimously to the Planning Department. So does anybody oppose those three items that Erin mentioned? Okay, then we will forward those on to the Planning Department for review – or, yeah, our comments forwarded. Done. Okay. That's it. Thank you. Thank you for the presentation.

Mr. Lee: Thank you Mr. Chair and members of the board. It's been a pleasure coming to Maui County to present to you today.

There being no opposition, the board will forward three additional comments to the Maui Planning Commission.

E. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

1. UDRB Members' Report on the 2013 Hawaii Congress of Planning Officials (HCPO) Conference - September 18-20, 2013, Kona, Island of Hawaii

Mr. Silva: Okay, next item on the agenda is the director's report. First item there is the Urban Design Review Board members' report on the 2013 Hawaii Congress of Planning Officials conference, September 18th to 20th, 2013, Kona, Island of Hawaii. Bryan and I had attended. And I'm pretty sure we both really enjoyed it. I have written up some summary, some highlights of the, I guess, three of the talks that I enjoyed, and I got the most out of, and I wanted to share that with you. And then I'll ask Bryan to add any comments after I'm done.

The first one was the, I guess it would be the key note speaker, Dr. Jeffrey Burgett, and he was talking about the, I guess he gave a scientific presentation which I enjoyed being an engineer, I like the technical side of it, explaining the global warming process and the history of it. And I thought it was interesting. He did say that there is no real opposition from the scientific community. The fact that the, that we as humans are causing global warming. I didn't realize that was accepted by the scientific community completely, wholeheartedly. He had mentioned that the earth goes through cycles, warming and cooling, and the variations only been a few degrees. And since the industrial revolution, earth has been warming at an increase rate that is faster than any historic fluctuation. Somehow they said they were able to measure, I think it was carbon gas and frozen bubbles, something to that effect that can tell carbon and temperature rates historically. And I think the main, the main point was that the current working group, our generation is not going to see a lot of the changes. It's going to be more down the road, for the younger generations because we're still going to be within that normal fluctuation range. But once it starts getting off the charts is when it's going to be a problem.

We take changes now so we're not going to be the ones affected, but to preserve for the next generations. And pretty much their only solution was to stop using fossil fuel. That's all, that's all they had. They did recommend reading a book, *Change We Must*, by Nana Veary. I'm going to the library across the street, after this meeting, so hopefully nobody runs over there and beats me.

Next item, or the next meeting I went to was Public Access with Kuleana. There were a couple of talkers. One was talking more of the historic side. They had, I guess, historically, they were talking that the native Hawaiians gather resources outside of their ahupua'a, so meaning that they could go to different places in that access. Historic Hawaiian trails did cover long distances so they were again able to, to travel and have that right to travel. The Hawaii's Act of 1892, declared all roads at that time to be public access so that's where all roads actually get their, their definition from here in Hawaii. And it was everyone's kuleana, again, talking about ancient Hawaiians that maintained the access for everyone's use. The kuleana, along with use was a privilege more than a right. So not necessarily something that, that is given to you. But you have to take care of yourself.

There was representative for Peoples Advocate of Trails Hawaii, PATH. And she talked about how they worked on getting trails for public access on the Big Island. I know that they have been on, on Maui. Some of . . . (inaudible) . . .

Last one was the New Hawaii Coastal Inundation Products and Tools for Land Use Planning. NOAA has a pretty cool tool out there now that if you go to their website, you could look on a map, and could dial in at the bottom what level sea rise you want to see so you could see how that effects. So it's really good, again for planning. And it was nice. It was pretty much a follow up to the global warming key note speaker, but geared towards actual sea level rise. Well, it's National Organization of the Atmosphere Administration, NOAA, so they have of the United States, but they do have Hawaii specifically and that's what they were showing us in the meeting. They said that widely accepted sea level rise is one foot by the year 2050, and three feet by 2100. They did mention that the most dramatic changes are about the three to four feet, so again echoing the, maybe not in our generation, but future generations, 2100 we're really going to see the effects.

And then they were also working on another map viewer that they showed us for Waikiki. But it combined sea level rise with tsunamis, with flooding, storm flooding from the water shed above so that was – Waikiki was definitely devastated. So when you see that, yeah, for sure, and then that's where the airport and the harbors so not, you know, again for us to plan better. Something we've got to look at. If you guys want to look at that viewer, if just maybe Google NOAA sea level rise viewer. It's pretty interesting just to how that is. Bryan?

Mr. Maxwell: Yeah, I did take some notes. . . . (inaudible) . . . bear with me. Well, one of the other – I don't know if you ever listened to the Mayor talked over on the big island, he's a very likeable guy. He's just –. Some of the things he brought up were the three E's was – that he, he looked at his administration as well as anybody that's doing projects and what have you is looking at experience, expertise, and education. And he tries to really push that on to everybody. You know, get, get – surround yourself with people that are, you know, all about that.

The other part is caring, courage and being committed. And, you know, one of the things that he, he was saying is like, if anything goes right, it's because of my staff, and if anything goes wrong, it's because of me, which is really refreshing in this day and age where he's really taking on responsibility of such a large county. And we have the same thing here within the three islands.

One of the things that they had done is they did a quick slide show of the island and went to a lot of different places which was kind of interesting.

Mike had talked about the global warming stuff. I'm just going to read through this real quick. You know one of the things they were looking at was best practices on their lands. And one of the things that they had talked about, they had brought Kauai. And Kauai as you know a lot of the land went from sugar cane to what do we do with this kind of thing? And one of the things that they're really working at right now is taking a lot at – you know, you have a lot of farming, ag, you have all this land, but they're really looking at it. I mean, we've kind of run across the same problem going what do we do with all this land that went from pineapple to what? We have land all over and saying is it good for ag? Is it in close proximity to where you can take to market. And one of the things that they're trying to look at is on Kauai is to see if they can

have periods that the farmers can bring, kind of like, we have trash recycle the same thing, at a central place where you can get it, and you take exporter or bring it to market. So they're really taking a look at their lands in many different levels, economically, as well as, you know, what elevation is it at, what can we grow. So what they're – we're looking at is saying, hey, how can become more sustainable so we don't have to import all this stuff? Where can we grow, what kind of crops that we can use what's on the island. And in Maui, I mean, we're really fortunate we have a lot of stuffs upcountry and other places that we're growing, but I'm sure we can do a better job and, and continue doing that.

I was just writing down everything. There's this one that I thought was kind of interesting. Let me see if I can find that real quick. The one the lady was talking about what Hawaii meant. You remember that?

Mr. Silva: There are a lot of other members in the room that – not members of the board – but, you want to –

Mr. Maxwell: The one lady she went, you know, clean your own house. Stop pointing at people. What can you do? She's one of those – I think the grandma said, you know, clean your own house. Make sure that you take care of your own business before you start pointing to everybody. But they said a glass of water is ha, which is breathe of life. Hawaii is the water of life, and i which is spirit of life. And that's, that's kind of Hawaii meant and everything.

There's a bunch of other stuffs, but they, they had talked about, in Kauai, they had talked about the smart street study, which we've been doing here, and how we can, you know, basically make Maui better. Some places it may work, some places it might not work, but I think it's well worth taking a look at. We had some of the improvements in Wailuku town. We have the, the roundabout in Kihei and how that, you know, where you pick up the kids and all the communities. And you can walk to school. You can ride your bike. But, you know, Hawaii is a little bit different than the mainland because a lot of time – and that's a big thing is that there's a lot of Hawaii, the culture and stuff like that. Probably half of this was just about how the cultures being trying to interact with the planning and, you know, how you respect, respect the aina, especially on new projects where you're digging into places that you're really not sure what's going on. But, I think what, what happens is each island, you know, is going through their own changes. I mean you look at the mass transit that they're building, and they're finally moving forward on their stuff. But each island has their own challenges, but it's really nice where all these guys come together. I mean, I saw guys I worked with 20 years ago. I was able to talk to them about projects that they're working on the big island or in Kauai or whatever, and it was neat to see what their challenges were. And I think that the great opportunity is next year they're having the conference here, so it's a really good opportunity to go and check out the different talks, and just get to know some of different people. I mean, some guys are really smart, man . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Silva: Yeah, so the, the various planning departments are the ones who put on the conference so Maui's Planning Department is going to be putting it on next year. Ann, would you like to add?

Ms. Cua: Yeah, thank you for bringing that up.

Mr. Maxwell: Well, I think, I think honestly, I think, we should help you guys out so I'm willing to help you guys.

Mr. Silva: We're here as a resource.

Ms. Cua: Yes, what normally happens is typically the county planning department on each island and as well as the state put on the conference. Maui hosts it every five years, so we're up next year. At this year's conference, they, they were very gracious in giving us time to, number one, introduce our conference. We've already picked the date and the place. It's September 10th, 11th, and 12th, 2014, and it will be held at the Sheraton Maui, in Kaanapali. So although the planning department hosts it, Maui County is, you know, everybody that's here is hosting it. So if you could help us out by starting to spread the word to the professional community, anybody that would be interested. We are known for putting on really good, solid conferences, and that's what we plan to do. And so, again, you can help us now by spreading the word, reserving the date on your calendars. You know, I don't know how many we'll be able to send. But, you know, now that it's on Maui, it's probably a lot easier, so, you know, stay tuned for that. But if you could already mark your calendars, start spreading the word to people that you know in the professional community because registration is, is how we pay for this conference. It's not county funded so we need our numbers. And we try and shoot for 300 people in attendance. It's a three day conference – Wednesday, Thursday, and Friday. Friday is half day.

Ms. Marshall: Is it also, you know, are manufactures there with booths and samples, or is it really just a conference?

Ms. Cua: No, historically we've had. We've had that. We're, we're thinking about that for this year. The – we're not sure if we're going to do that because one, one challenge at the Sheraton and with other hotels is our planner session is going to be happening upstairs in their ballroom, and breakout sessions will be happening downstairs in their breakout rooms. If we have exhibitors they'll be upstairs. Let's say, you know, Thursday afternoon when we do breakout sessions they'll all be downstairs. So, you know, it would be challenging to get people back upstairs for that. So you know, we're thinking about it. You know when people pay for a space they want traffic and so again we're, we're revisiting that thought.

Ms. Marshall: Actually downstairs where people are standing around, sipping coffee would be a perfect place for exhibitors.

Ms. Cua: True. Except we're in planners session upstairs. You know what I'm saying? We have to set exhibitors up in one place.

Ms. Marshall: Yeah.

Ms. Cua: And whether we set it up upstairs or downstairs, there's challenges for when

something is happening in a separate place. That's what we're wrestling with.

Mr. Silva: Thank you. Good luck with the planning, and I'm sure you guys will put on an excellent conference. Looking forward to it. Next item is the meeting schedule. We did get that in our mailer. Clayton, do you have anything to add to that?

2. 2014 Meeting Schedule

The Board may adopt or modify the meeting schedule.

Mr. Yoshida: Yes. We have – we're proposing the first Tuesday of every month except for the month of November when the first Tuesday is General Election Day. So we want to – trying to get concurrence from the board so we can reserve the room.

Mr. Silva: Can we just revisit one item. I know these meetings used to be held at 9:00 a.m., is that right? But we wanted to accommodate the outer islands, the Lanai and Molokai. I don't know if Frances and David, does that schedule work? The time works for you guys or – with the boats or how ever?

Ms. Feeter: . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Silva: Yeah, 10 o'clock is okay with everybody. Yeah, sounds good.

3. Status of the UDRB vacancy

Mr. Yoshida: Okay, I guess the status of the vacancy due to the resignation of Andrew Carson. I'm not aware of any name that's been reviewed by the Council Policy Committee yet, but I guess the advantage is the board does, this board does have alternate members. So we'll inform you if and when the name comes across the policy committee.

Mr. Silva: That doesn't affect our quorum at all, right, if we have alternates, yeah?

Mr. Hopper: Not the requirements for quorum. It wouldn't affect the requirements for a quorum, but if a member were not be able to make, then an alternate could come in. But, yeah, the quorum is based on the members to which it's entitled not included the alternates.

Mr. Silva: Okay.

Mr. Maxwell: Are, are you guys seeking recommendations? I mean, what kind of person are you looking for? Somebody like –

Mr. Yoshida: Well, I guess the appointments are made by the Mayor, so, you know, any person who is interested would have to apply through the Mayor's Office and then whoever the Mayor

selects he would send down the name to the Council, and the Council confirms or doesn't confirm.

Ms. Feeter: Is there a certain number that's suppose to be on the board?

Mr. Silva: I think there's nine active members, and four or two alternates. I don't know. But nine active.

Mr. Yoshida: Yeah, there's nine regular members. It's suppose to be nine regular members and four alternate members. Right now you have one vacancy due to Andrew's resignation.

4. Agenda Items for the November 5, 2013 meeting.

Mr. Yoshida: Our next meeting is scheduled for November 5th. And I guess the outlook is we're going to be busier the next three months than we were the past three months. We cancelled two of the three meetings. You know, especially in the areas, we received several applications, special management area use permit applications in the Wailea and Makena areas. So at the next meeting, on November 5th, probably we'll schedule the Piilani Suites Hotel in Wailea, on Wailea Ike Drive. The developer is R.D. Olson, the same developer of the Courtyard by Marriott Hotel near the Kahului Airport. That's the primary item we have scheduled for the next meeting.

Ms. Marshall: The same developer as the – what is that?

Mr. Bowlus: Courtyard by the Marriott.

Ms. Marshall: Yeah, the Marriott. It's the same developer as that Courtyard by Marriott near the hotel. Is that what you're saying? Did I missed something?

Mr. Silva: That's what he said. Yeah.

Mr. Yoshida: Yeah, I'm not sure. I know that they did the courtyard, the Kahului Airport Hotel.

Ms. Marshall: So is he on Piilani Highway?

Mr. Yoshida: No, it's on Wailea Ike, Wailea Ike Drive, coming down from the highway, on the right hand side, going down towards the shops before you hit the turn to go the . . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. Marshall: On the same side of the street as the . . .(inaudible) . . .

Mr. Yoshida: About 200 rooms. Okay, that's the primary item we have for the next --.

F. NEXT MEETING DATE: NOVEMBER 5, 2013

G. ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Silva: Okay. Thank you. So as Clayton mentioned, next meeting is November 5th and meeting adjourned. Thank you.

There being no further business brought forward to the Board, the UDRB meeting was adjourned at approximately 11:25 a.m.

Respectfully submitted by,

LEILANI A. RAMORAN-QUEMADO
Secretary to Boards and Commissions II

RECORD OF ATTENDANCE:

PRESENT:

Robert Bowlus
J. Morgan Gerdel, Vice-Chair
David Green
Frances Feeter
Jane Marshall
Bryan Maxwell
Michael Silva, Chair

EXCUSED:

Linda Berry

OTHERS:

Clayton Yoshida, Planning Program Administrator, Department of Planning
Ann Cua, Staff Planner
Erin Wade, Staff Planner
Michael Hopper, Deputy Corporation Counsel