

**URBAN DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
REGULAR MEETING
JUNE 3, 2014**

APPROVED 08-05-2014

A. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Urban Design Review Board (Board) was called to order by Mr. Michael Silva, Chair, at approximately 10:01 a.m., Tuesday, June 3, 2014, in the Planning Department Conference Room, First Floor, Kalana Pakui Building, 250 South High Street, Wailuku, Island of Maui.

A quorum of the Board was present (see Record of Attendance.)

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY -- At the discretion of the Chair, public testimony may also be taken when each agenda item is discussed, except for contested cases under Chapter 91, HRS. Individuals who cannot be present when the agenda items is discussed may testify at the beginning of the meeting instead and will not be allowed to testify again when the agenda item is discussed unless new or additional information will be offered.

Mr. Michael Silva: It looks like we've got a full house and a full agenda, so we'll get started right away. Item B, Public Testimony. So if there is anybody who would like to testify from the public now, we give you this opportunity, rather than wait through all of the communications, we just ask that you, if you do now, you would refrain from doing later. Is there anybody that would like to do public testimony now? Seeing none, so closing this session of public testimony.

C. COMMUNICATIONS

- 1. MR. WAYNE H. MURAOKA of WAILEA MF-15 LLC requesting Steps I and II Planned Development Approvals and a Special Management Area Use Permit for the Makalii at Wailea Project, a proposed multi-family development consisting of 68 townhouse units grouped in 17 clusters of 4 units, a Residence Club, a lap pool and jacuzzi, a garden pond, a micro park, a multi-use path, guest parking, tropical landscaped grounds, onsite infrastructure systems, and utility connections at the northeast corner of Wailea Alanui and Kaukahi Streets at TMK: 2-1-008: 120, Wailea, Island of Maui. (PD1 2013/0004) (PD2 2013/0004) (SM1 2013/0016) (Danny Dias)**

The Board may provide its recommendations to the Maui Planning Commission on the design aspects within its purview based on the proposed Special Management Area Use Permit plans provided for the project.

Mr. Silva: Moving onto C, Communications, item no. 1 (*Chair Michael Silva read the above project description into the record.*) And before we start I do need to say that our company is

involved with the project, so I'm going to recuse myself and not take place in any of the comments and discussions, so I will turn the meeting over to our Vice-Chair Bob.

Mr. Robert Bowlus: Okay, we've got the – pardon me – the application – applicant presentation. Anybody here to speak for the applicant?

Mr. Jordan Hart: Good morning. My name is Jordan Hart of Chris Hart & Partners. I'm here today with Glenn Tadaki, planner. The project developer is Mr. Bob Armstrong. He's also here with project manager, Wayne Muraoka. We have the architect, Roy Nehe and Lance Hirai from Group 70, along with Miles Nishida from Walters Kimura & Matoda.

So the Makalii at Wailea Project is a project on 9.35 acres. It is – excuse me – so let's see here – this is Kaukahi Street. This is Wailea Ala Nui. This is the project site here. This is Mulligan's on the Blue, Wailea Golf Vista, the Kealani Hotel, and Polo Beach. And so at this point I'm going to introduce Wayne Muraoka who's the project manager from Armstrong Development to discuss the project a little further. Thank you.

Mr. Wayne Muraoka: Good morning Mr. Vice-Chair, members of the Urban Design Review Board. Thank you for having us this morning and for your time. As Jordan mentioned location of the project is, is just an infill project and what is already designated for resort development, multi-family use in Wailea, closer towards the Makena side of Wailea, but within the, the boundaries of Wailea. We've already presented to Wailea Community Association and gotten favorable reviews from them. So in terms of the required community review – and we also presented to the Wailea community as well. We've already been through that and now are coming to you to present our project to you.

The project itself is on a very hilly parcel uniquely situated. This upper end is actually quite a bit higher than down towards Wailea Ala Nui, so it's a hilly property rising as you go mauka. It has incredible views looking to the south side of the Kealani Hotel, towards Molokini, Kahoolawe and the ocean, and then further south along the coast line. When we thought of developing this parcel there were a number of presentations that were made to us by various designers. We had a design competition. We chose Group 70. The reason we chose Group 70 was they had a vision for use of the property that we thought was not only a breathe of fresh air for Wailea, but it also propose a new way of living, resort living. A way that was more in tune with the land. A way that actually works with the topography better. A way that actually promoted sustainability as well as comfortable living. And what I want to focus on is four guiding design principles that we worked out with Group 70 in the initial stages of conceptual design.

Our first – we wanted to minimize the site work. We did not want to do what is so typically done which is take a hilly property and cut a huge grading slab on it and then build a big castle on it. That did not seem to be appropriate for this parcel. So minimize site work, and let the topography and the view corridors guide us in terms of the land plan. That was no. 1. No. 2, as we mentioned, we did not want to build huge monolithic structures that would be on a hill side looking down on the road. We went with small groupings of units. Four units per building.

And the buildings themselves step downward with the land. So wherever the road is, it's one story generally except where there's a little pop up for a third bedroom in some, some units. But generally one-story, the living level, and then stepping down with the slope to the master bedroom level down below. And that is repeated throughout the units in these four-plexes that are placed on the property in line with the contours of the land.

We wanted to have privacy for the units because our clients will need a certain amount of privacy buying in Wailea. But we also wanted the property to have connectivity within as well as to the walkable parts of Wailea. So what we are proposing is pads that connect with community within leading to pedestrian gates that then allow people to go down to the beach walk and to the amenities of the hotel. And to also in a walking community or running community to be able to take advantage of both inside and outside the property.

And the last thing is we wanted the property to be sustainable. So not only build sensitive to the land, but also lived in, in a way that's sensitive to the land. We have gotten very good at being conscience in the design process of making the buildings as energy efficient as possible using natural ventilation as much as possible, natural lighting coming in as much as possible. Connecting indoor/outdoor living in a way that the breezes that naturally flow up the mountain at times of day and down the mountain at night would be enough most of year without having to live in a cocoon that's air-conditioned all the time. We also wanted to provide as much of the needed energy both for the community common elements as well as the individual units from the natural resource that's abundant in Wailea. In other words the sunshine. And so we are hoping to do solar water to heat the pool water so that we don't use as much electricity for that. As well as solar PV to provide for common area lighting as well as what we think a reasonable load for the units lived in sustainably what that load would be for the individual units.

We're going to do 17 four-plex buildings for a total of 68 units. The style we have chosen, Mr. Roy Nehe, our architect will go into more detail. But in general it's a contemporary reinterpretation of the mid-20th century modern style, early stage wood style. We chose that with Group 70 because they pointed out at that time it was a time hope, confidence and belief in a better future with boundless potential. And we like that feel especially on the edge of Makena where we're not in the heart of old developed Wailea, but really on edge of, you know, where the future is going to be developing. And we also wanted it to have a preference for living lightly, simply and sustainably. We wanted to buildings to be light, airy, adventurous and fun. And we wanted to minimize the indoor/outdoor living possibilities. We think Group 70 did a fine job of addressing those, and I'd like to turn it over to Roy Nehe so he can tell you how he did that. Thank you.

Mr. Bowlus: Thank you.

Mr. Roy Nehe: Thank you Wayne. Good morning. We're here to show you how we tried to achieve those four guiding principals that we set at the very beginning of the, of the project. MF-15 as you all probably know is a very challenging site. It's a very challenging site. It rises from 170 at this upper end to about 90 at the road there, so there's quite a grade difference from top to bottom. There's also a 30 foot height limitation following the grade which is also

very challenging. Basically what we have done is we have tried to minimize the cut and fill also on the property. As you also may know the property is, is quite rocky so cost is a big consideration. But also having it lay on the site in a way that will make reference to the existing contours. The roadway off of Kaukahi here is entered and what the road basically does is it tries to follow the contours as much as possible and then let the buildings fold into that in way that kind of matches the contours as it rises and falls. To do that the roadway, it starts here, it rises, it kind of drops a little, and then rises again to this point here. And then it rises all the way up to the top at 170. All units are facing Molokini in terms of the prime view. Even the buildings within themselves they step four feet – a maximum of four feet in either direction, again, to follow the contours as we go up and down the site there. I think it should be noted that the developers did sacrifice a lot of units to create a plan like this. They could have built many more units, but they chose to come up with something that very sustainable and in keeping with what our goals were.

The buildings are arranged horizontally and vertically so that all units have either a full or a partial ocean view. And this is important because as we are going through the envelopes and the contours, it was very important to make sure that at least the living rooms of every unit will have that ocean view. And I think we're able to achieve that. We spent many days on site, taking photographs from different points of the site, trying to anticipate where the –. I think the only building that may not have, have an ocean view is the two units in this building on this upper corner there. That's sort of looking towards down the coastline towards Wailuku, and we're not quite sure. There's a lot trees there. We're not sure what's behind there, but there may be a little bit of ocean view there.

Let's see, the site was also arranged to take advantage of these micro parts. This is the lowest part of the – of the site at about elevation 100. What we have done is we've located an underground retention basin there to take care of all the site drainage. And we thought that would be the best use of that area. It also forms a park above that. And we have actually established a number of parks – here, here, here, here, here, and a small park there – and the idea is to incorporate this idea of connectivity within the site. We also have walkways with a gate leading out to Wailea here and out at this point there. So again we connect out to Wailea also in general.

The – next slide – in terms of the civil it's hard to see on this slide there, but kind of in detail, again within, within the buildings themselves you'll see many combinations of a two-foot drop between units. Again, a total of four-feet per building. And basically we're trying to overlay that on existing contours as much as we can. I think it's important to note that we achieved the balance cut and fill on this site which is a good goal to have. We tried to minimize retaining walls – whenever we can because of the rocking fill conditions we tried to berm – angle a slope instead of adding retaining walls. We do have a few retaining walls here and there just to make the plan work, but many of them are in the four to six foot range. We have one that's actually up to eight feet, but we have added landscaping in front it to kind of buffer the view of that.

I think that kind of sums up the civil portion of it. At this point what I'd like to do is turn it over to Miles Nishida our landscape architect who will tell us how all this works in terms of the

landscaping.

Mr. Miles Nishida: Hi. Miles Nishida, Walters Kimura & Matoda, landscape architect. For this project we're trying to promote simplicity with – and also to apply best management practices to select appropriate plant materials that will achieve visual, quality and also to make – which have low maintenance – low to moderate maintenance costs. To achieve this we set back the buildings from the streets to give the homeowners some property – buffering and privacy. The Naupaka heads – we'll have the Naupaka heads along the – I guess not on the whole edge, but basically on this edge to give the privacy and the buffering needed . . . (inaudible) . . .

A variety of trees will be planted around the site to provide shade, edible fruits, fragrance and flowers. Throughout their project a loop trail which is coming through – it's walking trail will provide a recreational and educational amenity. Attached to the loop trail as Roy mentioned we have small parks and gardens. These will be sort of like theme gardens, like the lei flower garden, a fruit or an edible garden, and like a native plant material garden. Plants such as hala trees. Plants that are indigenous to Hawaii or . . . (inaudible) . . . will be put throughout the project site. The large slope areas will be planted with drought tolerant plant ground covers for erosion and pest control, and also to minimize the water use. The landscape irrigation concept is to promote a healthy growth of plant materials while conserving water. The design and layout for the sprinkle systems shall include the arrangement of sprinkler heads and piping control values together to irrigate and promote the desired landscaping effects. An automatic irrigation system will be provided to schedule an irrigation system efficiently. Features such as cycle and . . . (inaudible) . . . , water budgeting, multi start times and – will provide flexibility and minimize run off. A separate control value will be provided for sun and shade for some areas where we can control the amount of water we're putting down. And . . . (inaudible) . . . sensing devices will also be incorporated into the . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Nehe: I also want to mention that the buildings although they're all pointed towards Molokini island it also takes advantage – you'll notice north is in this direction here, although trades and the ocean breezes in this direction, and you'll see later in the plan how we achieve that by use of courtyards, front and back of the units. We think that's an important feature.

As Wayne had mentioned we were trying to recall the classic . . . (inaudible) . . . tones of the, of the mid century designs and a very honest architecture. Basic shed roofs, very clean volumes, with the inside outside experience, large lanais and trellises, and that's something we tried to incorporate in to this design. You can see this is a view from the street out towards the ocean. Some interesting elements, but each element in itself is a fairly simple structure and form. We have the roofs rising towards the view. The roof in the back it forms sort of a butterfly. It brings in natural light from the upper part of the roof into that bedroom space. We have a courtyard in the center there with the trellis and screen element. We also have introduced kind of Hawaiian tropic themes in, in other scheme elements in other important locations like the entry. This is a view from the ocean side. Again, this very clean floating roof raising all the way up to the roof. The floor below will be – is the master bedroom. Most master bedrooms you'll be able to actually walk out to garden space which will be a nice, nice feature.

In terms of the materials and the colors, we have a color board here. We have introduced materials like coral in, in key places at the, at the front of the building, at the entry, lower floor, and at the separately elements between units. We're using plaster with colors. Again, you can see the glazing on the corners, again, to create this floating roof effect. This you can really see the butterfly roof. These roofs will be filled with, with PV panels on many of the units. We see this as, as part of our efforts to, to reduce energy cost. And one of our goals is to produce a resort community that actually has lower maintenance fees and costs, energy costs. And that, that's one of our big goals for the project. You see here the color of the roof there, if I can reach there. We will have, again, PV panels on it, on certain areas of the roof. The color palette as you see there we're tried to create kind of an energized fun feel to the project. The greens kind of reflect the landscaping. The yellows also in terms of the flowers and things that will be surrounding these buildings. We think it creates kind of new contemporary feel to this type of architecture. We have some railing colors and trim material colors which is – sort of will tie the whole thing together.

These are some interior views. This view is from the living room area out towards the ocean. What you see out there is not really green, it's actually blue, but something happened in the slide there. But most of the living rooms will have that ocean view which is will be spectacular. You can see this roof again floating with the glass, large glass, and open, opening to the view. This is a view from the lanai. This is the lanai on the ocean side, lanai back towards the unit. These two doors will slide back here so that the lanai will open fully to the living room area. What you see back here is a rear courtyard that we've developed, a more protected courtyard. Again, those doors are intended to slide away so that it really becomes an indoor/outdoor living environment.

We'll go quickly through the unit plans just to give you an idea of what we have developed. There is some commonality between these. We have basically the end units and then the center units here. All the units have a very similar great room open kitchen plan as you can see here and here. All units again have, have at least one bedroom and one bath on the living room level. Part of it is to – the idea of perhaps in-laws or aging in place so there is a way to continue to live in your units as, as people do get older. The end units will have a two car covered carport. The center units will have a single covered carport with a tandem stall and a driveway behind that. These are the courtyards that we have developed to the rear. The idea again is that every unit, even the center units will have that natural ventilation from front to back, as well as bringing natural light fully into the units which will make it a very bright, very bright and comfortable space. Our hope is that people will utilize this and not use the air-conditioning to reduce costs and, and hopefully that will be achieved by use of these plans. The lower floors are basically the master bedrooms. The ends units will have an option of either a very large master bedroom suite, or a master bedroom and a single bedroom so it becomes a three bedroom unit. The end units or the center units – I'm sorry – there's an option to add a third bedroom over the carport which could be a studio or an older teenager, or, or just a third bedroom with a single bathroom. Many, many of these actually will have a nice view towards the rear, towards the golf course. But our primary view concentration is to the front, to the ocean. These units again, because this is, this is below this area here, we will be able to, I believe add some solar tubes which is sort of a round sky light that comes from the roof, again,

to bring natural light to the master room bathroom area. Again the whole idea is to lighten the space, to avoid the need for lighting during the day so you can, you can become a lot more energy efficient.

I think that kind of covers the basic unit types. Again you'll notice that the forms that we have chosen are very simple, rectangular shape. Again, we're emphasizing the space volume on the interior. Part of sustainability is to have very efficient systems for structure and, and that will reduce cost which will give more money to put in the systems like PV and other sustainable initiatives. And that's part of our, our push for the project.

This is the typical four – four plex unit. So we have all the living rooms on the upper level. Again, we have the court spaces to the rear to provide the natural ventilation. Lower floors are bedrooms. You'll noticed that we popped out the center units, so again to create the corner glass situation. Again, to really to give the feel that you're not really constricted by being in the center. In many ways, the center, the center units we believe might be very popular because of this third bedroom option over the carport which, which will provide a lot use space.

This is the resident club. As I mentioned earlier this is our front entry. You would enter, and there is a rise in the road here and then a rise back here so that you're entering directly in to the recreation center. We arrive at the entry area here. There's a water feature here. You enter over a bridge. To your right and the view, we have a lap pool, with an infinity edge here. It's up from here to the entry is something like 12 feet or something like that so that you're not really looking at the entry and the, and the car activity, but you're looking beyond towards Molokini island which is a – it's a pretty spectacular view there.

The building itself, although we have a sweeping curved roof here, you'll notice that we incorporated landscaping as part of the architecture. We also have trellises covering some parking at the entry area.

This is suppose to be the floor plan, but let me try to describe to you what it is. This is a bridge. We have an office area, some mechanical storage spaces back here. We have a mens and a women's bath restroom area which include lockers, showers, and a steam room. So it would be very comfortable, very generous. We also have an exercise hale as part of the recreation center which will have sliding doors that you can open again for the indoor outdoor experience. Back here is a covered lanai with an outdoor kitchen and barbeque area. Again all these spaces open out to the lap pool. And also we developed a small park here which can be used for outdoor events, and it would be quite a nice space. As Wayne mentioned the idea is that this residence club will be powered with PV and solar heating panels. The pool will be heated by PV panels, our solar heating panels. And we're going to be trying to – again, this is one of the big maintenance costs in, in projects and we're trying to reduce that cost to a great, to a great amount at this point.

These are some of the elevations. Again, picking up the theme of the buildings, you'll see a very simple shed roof, but the front edge is a, a curved fascia. Within this curved roof we've incorporated trellises and landscaping so it becomes part of the, the landscaping of the project.

Materials, colors, things will be very similar to the resident units. Use of coral, colors. Again, try to make it a very fun, inviting place to be. This area will have tremendous views towards Molokini. This back elevation is a little deceiving. This is a retaining wall actually so the back of the building will appear to be built into the hillside. We kind of reduced its impacts to the buildings above that and –. Then we have a few more views, kind of birds eye views, to give you a feel for what we're trying to achieve here. Many of the PVs, you don't see it on this roof here, but many of the PVs we're placing on the units above on the large roofs of the units above which no one will see, but it will be very effective in cutting down your maintenance costs in terms of this facility. And we all know heating a pool is not an inexpensive proposition, and we want to make sure this a very comfortable and sustainable environment that people can actually have fun and live a long time.

Mr. Muraoka: Thanks Roy and Miles. I'd like to close with the name. I know that's usually the starting point, but I think it provides a good summation opportunity. The name of the project, Makalii. What does that mean? It's the name, the Hawaiian name for Pleiades constellation which is highly visible from South Maui in the winter sky. Some people say it's the source of the Hawaiian people. I'm not sure of that. But what I do know is that it was used as part of the natural calendaring system as the Hawaiians would set their calendars to work with the seasons. It was also used as part of the navigational stars that the Hawaiians used. You've heard of the voyages, the Hokulea using only the stars. This is one of the constellation used for that. The reason we chose that name is we are going in a different direction than typical Wailea. We're going on a new voyage. We're, we're trying to create a new way of living Wailea that's not only luxury which is what Wailea's known for, but it's also sustainable. You know Roy mentioned the word sustainable, but he also focused a lot of maintenance fees, and yeah, that's important to our clients as well. But what's really important is we want the project not to be a draw on the resources of Maui the way luxury projects can sometimes be. We wanted to give back and use natural resources as much as providing a new way of living. And it's more in tuned with the land the way the Hawaiians live on the land. And it's for those reasons that we chose the name Makalii. It's going back to the way the Hawaiians lived with the land, but it's also moving forward on a new voyage in a way that we think is – will set the tone for how people choose to live in the future even in resort community. Thank you so much for your time. We'd be happy to answer your questions.

Mr. Bowlus: Thank you very much. How about public testimony. Are there any persons in the room that want to give some public testimony?

Mr. Kurt Wollenhaupt: Hello. My name is Kurt Wollenhaupt and I live in Haiku. And I work with the County of Maui, but I have nothing to do with this project and I just wanted to say words as a private individual. This project is, is really exciting from an architectural standpoint. Every time I drive past the IBM building in Honolulu or go to the Kahala Hotel or the . . . (inaudible) . . . Punahou, this whole era of architecture really is kind of something that – it is refreshing as the applicant said. And their environmental use, that's also exciting, having something different is Wailea. So I just wanted to give my comments as a private individual that I really like this project.

Mr. Bowlus: Great. Thank you very much. Any other testimony? Okay, seeing none, we'll close public testimony and we'll go to questions and discussions by the Board. Jane, can you start?

Ms. Jane Marshall: Makalii is, is little eyes. Is that how, how it's literally translated? I think that's what they use to call the Pleiades, the constellation of little eyes. Yeah. I – since the panels, the roof panels are not actually shown, can I assume that they will strictly follow the angle of the roof lines in all cases?

Mr. Muraoka: The PV panels will follow the slope of the roof. We all understand that at times people angle the panels to maximize efficiency.

Ms. Marshall: I understand.

Mr. Muraoka: And while we think that's a good parameter to consider, we chose aesthetics to govern. And in some cases we will lose a little bit of efficiency because they're not angled directly south. But in the other hand we can get more than makes up for the aesthetics.

Ms. Marshall: It's always a fine line to try to find, and that's, that's great. I'm glad you made that decision. But based on that, is this also going to power the steam rooms? I want every thing obviously.

Mr. Muraoka: It will reduce the electrical load no matter what the electrical load is for the common elements. So the answer to the question is, yes, it would generate electricity that we think will be sufficient to govern or to run the common elements, as – of which the steam room is one of them. We have chosen – well we haven't chosen – what Group 70 has proposed is a micro steam unit that you would set a timer on. So it's not running continuously like some steam rooms. Before you turn it and it takes 15 minutes to get to where it needs to be. And you're then in it for as long as you want to be when it's off. So it's a more efficient way –

Ms. Marshall: It's a wonderful amenity. Great. Bike storage?

Mr. Muraoka: What wasn't mentioned is we are planning outdoor storage behind the community center for large toys including transportation toys like bikes, boards, paddle boards, things like that. But it will be a common space as opposed to necessarily an each individual unit. We also anticipate some people won't want to do that, and that's another use of the entry court yard. If you want to just bike to your unit, roll it through the gate, and lean it against one of the walls, that would still work.

Ms. Marshall: I haven't thought of boards, but that's a good one too. Yeah. What are the retaining wall materials?

Mr. Muraoka: CMU and rock. So CMU walls, and also in certain places that are more visible, rock wall.

Ms. Marshall: Is it split face CMU or is it flat?

Mr. Bob Armstrong: . . . (Inaudible) . . .

Ms. Marshall: It will be rock. Okay. Just a rock face on a CMU wall?

Mr. Muraoka: We have done both in answer to your question. There are times when the slope is such that allows for us to actually build a rock wall. And there are times when it's more vertical when we did the CMU wall, with the rock facing.

Ms. Marshall: Okay.

Mr. Muraoka: And then stepped it so that it went no longer, or not higher than six feet where there was a planter pocket then . . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. Marshall: Nice. Ginger is a very invasive. Why would – my son is a park ranger in Haleakala and he spends his weeks pulling those things out.

Mr. Nishida: Well, I . . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. Marshall: Birds don't recognize those borders.

Mr. Dias: Chair, anybody testifying please identify yourself that we can get – and speak into the mic so we can get minutes. Thank you.

Mr. Nishida: Miles Nishida, Walter Kimura & Matoda, landscape architect.

Ms. Marshall: And, and I think ginger is beautiful. I just wondered if you would reconsider that because it's very invasive.

Mr. Nishida: We, we can reconsider. We're still open to options . . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. Marshall: It's a big problem in Haleakala National Park. What are the actual materials of the privacy screens? It wasn't indicated on your –

Mr. Armstrong: Yeah, I'm Bob Armstrong. Hi. It's either a combination of wood and aluminum.

Ms. Marshall: Aluminum. So it would be a powdered coated finish on aluminum?

Mr. Armstrong: Yeah. Yes.

Ms. Marshall: Those are beautiful. I was hoping you'd say bronze.

Mr. Armstrong: I wish I could.

Ms. Marshall: Yeah. And the wood would be what, what species?

Mr. Armstrong: Probably a Doug Fir.

Ms. Marshall: And you'd paint it?

Mr. Armstrong: Yeah. Some of the trellis areas. We haven't really made a decision fully on that yet, but we can envision some of those trellis pieces being painted a Doug Fir. Or it could be aluminum too. Again, it's still a little bit up in the air.

Ms. Marshall: Lighting fixtures. Is everything going to be a LED light, hung in a coconut tree, shining down? Is that the way you're going to light the site?

Mr. Nishida: Miles Nishida. Yeah, that's part of the concept for street lighting.

Ms. Marshall: Nothing else?

Mr. Nishida: I don't think that – we have anything else for street lighting.

Ms. Marshall: So there's no poles any where?

Mr. Nishida: I don't believe so. No poles.

Ms. Marshall: Great.

Mr. Muraoka: We did – Wayne Muraoka – we did similar lighting in our Kai Malu Project where they're on straps, and down.

Ms. Marshall: It's lovely. Moon lights. Yeah. You can get enough . . . (inaudible) . . . candles in that? Yeah? Good for you. Great. What about the wall lanterns, are they bronzed? That's the only light fixtures I could see on the exterior. You have it – you have something identified.

Mr. Armstrong: Right. Right. Those are – they're custom made. They're probably going to be a copper with –

Ms. Marshall: . . . (Inaudible) . . .

Mr. Armstrong: No, they'll probably – I'm not familiar with that.

Ms. Marshall: Okay.

Mr. Armstrong: But, no, they'll probably be copper and –

Ms. Marshall: With an acrylic lens?

Mr. Armstrong: It would probably be glass. It might be acrylic but – and they're custom made.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. And they'll be copper and they're just left to oxidize.

Mr. Armstrong: Yeah. Right. Yeah, we've – we've done that at other projects and you can create a pretty spectacular lamp without a lot of expense.

Ms. Marshall: Yeah. And you'd put in LED source in there, or are you going to put a sconce fixture in there, or what are you –?

Mr. Armstrong: We haven't determined that yet, but LED would be the appropriate thing to do.

Ms. Marshall: It's a beautiful project. I want to live there. Thank you.

Mr. Bowlus: David?

Mr. David Green: I also think it's a beautiful project. My only concern, I guess, I had more of a concern about all the LED down lights you had, but that's basically your street lighting. Is that right? That's going to be on all night?

Mr. Muraoka: . . . (Inaudible) . . .

Mr. Green: Pardon?

Mr. Muraoka: Wayne Muraoka. Yes, they probably would be on for safety purposes.

Mr. Green: Okay. I didn't really have any other questions. I like it.

Mr. Bowlus: Okay. Thank you. Marie?

Ms. Marie Kimmey: Yeah. It's a very unique project. I – I'm not sure – I think people are going to love it or hate, and I'm not sure where I stand.

Mr. Muraoka: We're, we're looking for 68 people who love it.

Ms. Kimmey: Yeah, yeah, I hear you. Okay, well my, my – what comes to my mind is are you planning this for the eventual use by people who will purchase and live in the homes, or, or will there be provision for a hotel-like vacation rental program?

Mr. Muraoka: Very good question. This is not zoned for nightly rental. Minimum six months is what this is zoned for. And what we have seen is that people buy for different uses. Wailea projects tend to run maybe from 30% to at the peak season 50% occupancy. So even though people are living there, many of them use it as part-time residence, second home residence during the winter. Some people do rent it out, but it has to be a long term rental.

Ms. Kimmey: Okay, thank you. That was, that was my big question. Thank you.

Mr. Bowlus: I didn't have too many comments. I do like the project a great deal. But for the benefit of the units above the highest and best prestigious units I would presume they'd looked down on the rec center or the residence club. Have you considered this? It looks like there's a lot of roof that you hid at kind of a grade level. Have you considered –? Well, what is the roofing material planned for that?

Mr. Armstrong: The rec center is metal. It's a standing seam metal, and the colors typical of the – on the color board.

Mr. Bowlus: Have you considered a turf roofing or landscaping into that to maybe to block some of the view of the roof down below? Because you're looking down on it

Mr. Muraoka: Yeah. –

Mr. Nehe: This Roy Nehe, I'm the architect. What we've tried to do on the rec center was to – what you see in the landscape plan is, is actually trees. And we've determined that the trees can be grown to a certain height and not block the view of the units above. Also, just the surface of the roof itself, being a mixture of trellises and landscaping, will be further break up that view. And so we don't think it's an issue. All the upper units will have tremendous views. We've looked at all the view plains, and they're looking over the units below as well as the recreation center.

Mr. Bowlus: Okay. Thank you. And then also on the pad – the pad differences on the grading plan, it looks like you've got 14 feet between the upper pad for the carport, and the lower pad for the bedroom level. And then it looks like you step up to the level above. I was curious is what the ceiling height is in that lowest master bedroom.

Mr. Nehe: I think because we are using the roof structure as the ceiling plain, I think what they tried to do is on that, that one bedroom on the living level, it probably starts at eight-feet and goes up to maybe 11.

Mr. Bowlus: No, the bedroom below.

Mr. Nehe: The bedroom below.

Mr. Bowlus: Yeah.

Mr. Nehe: The master bedroom below, I think we tried to allow for a 10 foot ceiling.

Mr. Bowlus: 10 feet?

Mr. Nehe: Yeah.

Mr. Bowlus: Okay. No, I think that's all. That's all I have. Thank you.

Mr. Hunton Conrad: Hunton Conrad. My first comment is that I also find it exciting and different, and that's nice to see. And I also like all the louvers so that's really cool. I like that a lot. And I think the overall landscape plan is very nice and I like the pocket gardens and all the different amenities that you're building into the site. I have a little bit of concern about a couple of the plants that you've specified on the plan, the Koa and Ohia being the two of them. Just because they're more of a higher altitude plant. And Ohia are not usually very happy at 170 feet above the ocean. So, it's not – it's not something I'm going to say I don't think you should have. I'm just making a comment.

Mr. Muraoka: Thank you. Miles, can you make note of the concerns or would you like to address them?

Mr. Nishida: Sure. I will make notes of the concerns. But actually like Wailuku Elementary too, the new school, we do have some Koa or Koaia.

Mr. Conrad: Yeah, the Koaia are fine. Yeah.

Mr. Nishida: Well, we actually have both, Koa and Koaia and they're doing really well, and Ohia Lehua out there right now.

Mr. Conrad: Well, I noticed – I know that they do well. They're just isn't they're indigenous.

Mr. Nishida: Yeah, they're not – that's not their natural spot.

Mr. Conrad: Not their normal environment.

Mr. Nishida: Yeah.

Mr. Muraoka: Do any of you – I know that was another, ginger concern. Do you folks have suggestions of plant material that you particular like for use in these types of projects?

Ms. Marshall: Naupaka. You're using Naupaka.

Mr. Muraoka: Okay, Naupaka.

Mr. Conrad: No, I mean, I think your other list of native trees is great, you know, and there are – you know there's a little bit, there's, you know, other bushes, Aalii, and there are other, you know, native bushes that I don't see on the plan. But I'm sure you're going to incorporating those. And this is a general plan, not a –. My only – I didn't have a major concern, I was just noting that Ohia are usually, you know, at 2,500 feet and higher.

Mr. Muraoka: Okay.

Mr. Conrad: And then the last thing is for me, I really like your playful colors. I just think they're a little, from my personal taste, they're just a little to bright. I'd like to see them grade off ever so slightly. Because my – what Wailea and, and the south shores, it's very, very hot, and very sunny, and very bright, and those look like extremely reflective colors.

Mr. Muraoka: I see.

Mr. Conrad: Okay. So, again, it's not – I'm not going to make a motion that we change the colors, but at the same time, if you would take a look at maybe graying them off a little bit. Because in the bright sun, I think they'll appear as bright as you want them to.

Mr. Muraoka: Okay. So the general palette is okay, but you'd like them toned down just a little, or make them a little cooler.

Mr. Conrad: Yeah. That would be my personal preference.

Mr. Muraoka: Thank you.

Mr. Bowlus: Frances?

Ms. Frances Feeter: Yes, I had to say I really, really like the plan, which kind of surprises me. But what really jolted me is that we use to have a house on five acres and here nine acres, but you've done a marvelous job, I think, of putting them in. I appreciate that. I agree with the – I'd like the colors toned down a little. The avocado reminds me too much of – what we went through several years ago, everything was avocado. But, but, generally I like, I like bright colors, I like . . . (inaudible) . . . I think you've done a wonderful job. And I really like the solar tubes. We have some and they make such a difference inside on rooms. I like that. Thank you.

Mr. Bowlus: Fiona?

Ms. Fiona van Ammers: Yes, thank you. I think it's very beautiful. I love it. I do have some questions about the entries. I don't know if you covered this in the presentation.

Mr. Muraoka: You know, we did not include it in the packet, but we – when we went through the check list we saw that you might have a question. Do you have a specific question? Or we can go over what we have added to it as a supplemental.

Ms. van Ammers: Why don't – well – I just noticed that you're using some different materials within the county right-of-way. I'm not sure if it's a private road or not, but I was just – I wanted to know what the intention was and what it's going to look like.

Mr. Muraoka: Okay. I know there was some different types of zones in it. Roy or Miles?

Mr. Nishida: I think these are just like a flag stone type of thing, and we haven't really decided

what the materials is just to accentuate, give it a different pattern so that when you come off the main road you know that you're in a different community.

Mr. Muraoka: Is your concern the part that's closer to the sidewalk?

Ms. van Ammers: Yeah. In the overall – this looks a little bit different than what the overall panel is showing. I think the landscape overall plan was showing the stone work in the sidewalk within the road, but this is a little bit different. And so I guess my other question is what is the elevation view. Is there any grade change to these structures? This is just at grade.

Mr. Nishida: Yeah, it should be just at grade. There's not going to be anything where it's going to be tripping hazard for anybody. This is just differentiate that you know that you're kind of in a different environment.

Ms. van Ammers: And so and then the rock wall or are there any walls or entry way features that –

Mr. Nishida: There's going to be a sign wall in some place in this area that gives the name of the project.

Ms. van Ammers: Similar in nature material.

Mr. Nishida: Yeah.

Mr. Muraoka: . . . (Inaudible) . . .

Mr. Nishida: Which part?

Mr. Muraoka: . . . (Inaudible) . . .

Mr. Nishida: These are all plant material, but there, there is going to be a wall. I mean, that, that – the columns. That's part of the rock columns.

Mr. Muraoka: Now, we have not finalized the entry gate design, so I'm hesitant to show it and be bound to it. But we have some preliminary ideas on where we might go with it, and I'm happy to share it as a preliminary conceptual approach and have you give comments on it. . . (Inaudible) . . . Thank you. We're leaning towards something more like this which kind of captures the water element, but allows visibility through because as Roy noted off to the right of the entry will be a nicely landscaped rise towards the community center. And we think that's going to be quite a spectacular view as well as the water feature coming down leading the entry drive. So we wanted some visibility through as well as capturing the water feel which is part of it. This one has the water feel of the sky. And one of the things we've explored is trying to Makalii into it and stars didn't quite come out, so our logo actually has birds flying in formation that looks like the Makalii constellation. And so we tried to tie that into a gate design. Not quite as successful in our minds, so we're kind of leaning back to just the water part of it.

Mr. Bowlus: Okay?

Ms. van Ammers: That answers my question. Thank you.

Mr. Bowlus: Okay. Great. Well thank you very much. That's a very nice presentation and for . . . (inaudible) . . . I like the upper –

Ms. Marshall: Can I ask – can I ask a couple more questions before we stop?

Mr. Bowlus: Sure.

Ms. Marshall: Just about the solar, the solar tube. Are you using that product, Solatube? Solatube?

Mr. Nehe: There are many similar products. Yes, Roy Nehe, again. There are many similar products to solar tube. But the whole idea is to bring light into the lower level.

Ms. Marshall: I just wondered what the cap is on the roof. Are you using – is it going to be an acrylic bubble?

Mr. Nehe: Probably. It's located on the flat roof portion which will not be very visible to anyone. I know if it's very visible, and there are many, it does, it look too cluttered.

Ms. Marshall: Is there, is there a shallow parapet around the rim of that, of those sails or wings of roofs?

Mr. Nehe: No.

Ms. Marshall: No? It's just captured completely?

Mr. Bowlus: It will be at the low point of the roof.

Ms. Marshall: Yeah.

Mr. Bowlus: Because it all slopes down to the middle.

Mr. Nehe: Right.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. But you don't think that edge –

Mr. Nehe: If you see –

Ms. Marshall: – because it's consistently mentioned.

Mr. Nehe: It's going to be located on this, this roof in totality so it will not be –

Mr. Bowlus: It won't be visible.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. Yeah. No, I got 'ya. Thanks. Is that an infinity pool?

Mr. Nehe: That's the plan right now.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. Thank you.

Mr. Bowlus: It looks like they're at a little bit of early stages of design and development, but it's looking very good, I think.

Mr. Muraoka: Well one of the things – Wayne Muraoka – we wanted to do an infinity edge if possible. We found other infinity edge pools for projects is that there's tremendous heat loss if the waterfall is too big. And then it ends up sucking endless electricity just trying to maintain the temperature of the pool. So we've asked them to come up with a design that has the infinity edge feature, but possibly a shallower trough with landscaping in front of it. So we have the feel of a waterfall behind the plants, but it's not letting off as much heat so we can make it a more, again, as sustainable as a pool can be.

Ms. Marshall: Good idea. Thank you.

Mr. Bowlus: Alright. Well – and now the moment for recommendations by the Board. Fiona, would you like to start?

Ms. van Ammers: I – I don't have any objections to the project and no recommendations.

Mr. Bowlus: Thank you.

Ms. Feeter: I have no specific recommendations.

Mr. Conrad: Same here.

Mr. Bowlus: Well, I'd like to use your recommendation and I'd like to make a recommendation that we request that the applicant study toning down the colors, slightly, greying them down or reducing reflectivity to become more organic or natural or blend with the hillside perhaps a little more. That would be my comment.

Ms. Kimmey: Well, I guess my only recommendation is as was noted by several of you folks that have more understanding of landscaping that the plant materials be – it looks like you have a lot – maybe you should weed out, literally, some of them, just to be sure that everything will be compatible with this landscape and elevation.

Mr. Green: I don't have any specific recommendations.

Ms. Marshall: The intense colors has come up in this Board before, and I was thinking about

how Hawaiian music has become “Jawaiian-ized” and these intense colors can sometimes be “Jawaiian’ed.” So I think it’s a very valid point, you know, to think about what might –. I mean, I can see the modernistic, you know, sort of . . .(inaudible) . . ., you know, intentions, but it’s definitely be something to look at. Yeah. And I also have always admired – because it’s one of our early developments – the way Kapalua, a portion of Kapalua has small clustered buildings that gracefully march down the existing landscape, and it’s very elegant and I’m so glad you’re doing it that way. Thank you.

Mr. Bowlus: Thank you very much. I’d like to at this time request Michael to rejoin me at the –. Pardon me. Pardon me. Thank you very much. I missed a couple of items on my calendar. Danny, if you’d read the recommendations.

Mr. Dias: I got two recommendations. One is basically to tone down or gray the colors that they chose. And the other is to make sure that the plants chosen for this property are consistent with the elevation and location.

Mr. Bowlus: And perhaps reduce the quantity of the number selection, I guess. Not plant material, but the variety, varieties, limit the varieties.

Mr. Dias: Okay.

Mr. Bowlus: Thank you. Alright, so we need a motion. Do I hear a motion?

Mr. Conrad: I move that we accept the plan with the consideration of our recommendations as presented.

Ms. Feeter: Second.

Mr. Bowlus: And a second. Alright. All in favor? Any opposed? Motion is carried unanimously. Thank you.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you very much.

It was moved by Mr. Hunton Conrad, seconded by Ms. Francis Feeter, then unanimously

VOTED: To recommend approval of the plan as presented with the two recommendations as discussed.
(Assenting: H. Conrad, F. Feeter, D. Green, J. Marshall, F. van Ammers
Recused: M. Silva
Absent: B. Maxwell)

2. MR. DANIEL SANDOMIRE of ARMSTRONG HOMES, LTD. requesting a Special Management Area (SMA) Use Permit in order to construct the

Kalama Heights 100% Affordable Senior Condominium Project, a 40-unit 100% affordable senior preference condominium development on a 1.962 acre vacant lot at 101 Kanani Road, TMK: 3-9-017: 002, Kihei, Island of Maui. (SM1 2013/0017) (Candace Thackerson)

The Board may provide its recommendations to the Maui Planning Commission on the design aspects within its purview based on the proposed Special Management Area Use Permit plans provided for the project.

Mr. Silva: So thank you Bob. Candace, do you guys need a minute?

Ms. Candace Thackerson: Do we need a minute? No.

Mr. Silva: No? Okay. Moving on to item no. 2 (*Chair Michael Silva read the above project description into the record.*) And we have Candace Thackerson from the Planning Department.

Ms. Thackerson: Well, you pretty much covered everything. And the consultant is, again, Chris Hart and Partners and they've prepared a brief presentation which we can go through. And then we'll go ahead and we'll take comments and questions.

Mr. Hart: Thank you. Again, I'm Jordan Hart with Chris Hart & Partners. I'm here with Brett Davis, the planner, for the project. Also we have Bob Armstrong from Armstrong Development, with Daniel Sandomire, architect and project manager from Armstrong Development, and also Wayne Muraoka. The item agenda really does cover kind of the critical details, so I'm going to kind of breeze through the site orientation, really briefly, and then hand it over to Daniel Sandomire.

So the project's located in the Special Management Area. It's zoned A1, Apartments. It's community planned for multi-family. It's in the State Urban District. It's 1.96 acres in size. This is a regional area photograph. So we have the Piilani Highway on the right side. We have Auhana Road here. We have Kanani Road here. Kanoe here. South Kihei. Charley Young Beach. Hale Kanani Development. Here's a zoomed in aerial photograph. Another item to mention is the Kalama Heights Phase One. This project was initially part of a two phase project. The first phase was developed. The second phase was purchased by a developer that basically ended up losing it during the last cycle. Armstrong Development purchased the property and is continuing with a different project, but somewhat consistent with the same scale and character and so on.

Again, Kanoe, Auhana, Kanani Road, South Kihei Road, Charley Young is down here. This is the Hale Kanani Development. These are site photographs. This is mauka of the site looking towards Charley Young. This is, with your back to – I'm sorry, looking towards – it's from Auhana, looking towards Hale Kanani. This is Hale Kanani Development here. This is from the southwest corner of the parcel looking mauka up Kanani Road. These are some other character photographs of the street scape around. Here's Kanoe. Here's South Kihei Road.

These are all, also basically street scape character photographs. This is from the intersection of Kanani and Auhana. Looking down you can see the phase one up here. Okay, this is getting into the project description so I'm going to bring up Daniel Sandomire from Armstrong Development to talk about the design components of the project.

Mr. Daniel Sandomire: Aloha. My name is Daniel Sandomire from Armstrong Development. The project description – I'm just going to read these to you really quickly. It's 40 units. It's 100% affordable. It's fee simple, for sale, with a senior preference group condominiums. These are three story buildings in an L-shaped formation and we attempted to break it up into really three building types, or three building form masses and I'll run through that with you. 39 of the units will be two-bedroom, two bathrooms, and then there's a one bedroom unit which is like a little bridge unit separating a couple of buildings. The amenities we've offer is a swimming pool, a covered pavilion with bathrooms, and a number of landscaped walkways. There will be a total of 88 parking stalls. 40 of these will be covered with a photo voltaic carport structure. And eight of these will be a combination of tandem and grass crete paving to cut down on the overall impacts of the parking.

So here is the perspective rendering looking at the corner of Kanani and Kanoe Street. We looked with the neighborhood and decided to push the building more towards the rear of the site. When we look an overall you'll see that Hale Kanani directly across the street really does crowd out the street, and we wanted to step back from that. By creating this L-shape we create a courtyard public area, and we can flank the outside of the site, the mauka side, which has some ocean view with the amenities, not to close to the residence dwellings, but part of their site and eyes on the street sort of thing.

I'll run over the site plan really quickly and talk about landscape later with our landscape architect David Sereda. The north building here runs one part of the L and then this east building is broken into two structures with an entrance off of, off of Kanani. This entrance location was carefully chosen to be directly across from the entrance to Hale Kanani, the development across the street. So by lining these guys up we won't have any cross traffic and that was a component we worked out and discussed with our neighbors.

Coming in, the PV parking roof structures in the middle will provide shade and be assigned parking spaces to each of the – one of the 40 units. The remainder of the parking spaces will be unassigned for either a second car if they have one or a guest or service providers. This area here will tandem and grass crete to cut down on the impact of the parking. And that's adjacent to the amenity corner with the pool and the trellis.

In general the site slopes down approximately 12 feet along the whole length of it. We're seeking a balance of cut and fill as we bench this area here, above us, the Kalama Heights project, approximately 12 feet above us, and then we'll bank it down and create a big flat area. This corner here, where the pool deck is will be approximately eight feet above grade, that corner, and we'll buffer that with planting and some soil embankment.

The building floor plans are paired back to back, two bedroom units, in three clusters. There

are two stairways, or three stairways – sorry. One at each end of the building and one in the middle. This middle will become a lobby with a small storage area and mailboxes and waiting. And there will be an elevator here and an elevator here. Coming up to the – coming up to the third floor where now it's just a roof that separates these two buildings. And you can see the roof plan with the massing, looking at one, two and three buildings. This is the pool building. It's a simple pavilion with two bathrooms and a storage area for miscellaneous amenities – barbeque, seats sort of thing. The elevation – the north elevation here shows the corridor side of the building which will be deeply shaded and open air to provide certain air flow through the buildings, through the units themselves, this bridge connecting them. This middle – this west elevation shows the entry elevation. And you see this is the guest side with lanais and awnings. We have an aluminum awning that will be stuck on to the outside of the buildings, providing shade for those bedroom units. South elevations again with the awnings and lanais. And the east elevation with the corridor and bridge walkway.

The color palette is a two toned colored palette with a darker stucco going up approximately mid span of the lanai on the second level, and then lighter color above. I'll just mention that the, the shingles are an asphalt shingle, certainty product that we're, we're looking at. These are the plans for the PV structure. This is a – we're trying to make this structure there, but relevant and appropriate to a residential scale. And we're talking to different vendors about this. So here's a conceptual idea of a PV structure.

Signage is something that – the project sign will be on an undulated stucco wall in a recess. It will be back lit. The Kalama Kai name related to the Kalama Heights project and the fact that it's makai of that. It will be back lit. The pool and site amenities, this is a close up from the rendering. Now I'll turn it over now to Chris Hart & Partners for landscaping.

Mr. David Sereda: Good morning. My name is David Sereda. I'm a landscape architect with Chris Hart & Partners. I'll just describe some of the landscape design features. As Daniel mentioned the site slopes approximately 12 feet from mauka to makai and which creates a condition necessity for a retaining wall. And in front of the retaining wall on the street side we'll lessen the impact of, of the, the wall with landscape planting. So there will be about five feet of exposed wall, facing the street and then we'll screen that will Naupaka. In terms of the site circulation, there's, for pedestrians, there's a concrete sidewalk that circle the buildings all the around and through a breeze way between the buildings. As well as a connection here to the pool so that the residents – there's no need for the residents to cross across the parking lot to get to the site amenities. The PV structures in the middle made it necessary to move our, our shade trees. We still meet the county's requirements for shade trees for parking lots. So what it allowed us to do was to put them along the perimeter of the parking lot and the shade trees that we've chosen are Pink Tacoma which are quite good for this for area, and are good street trees for their –. They don't have invasive roots. They drop a lot of fruit or flowering material. And they can handle heavy pruning and they actually do well in this climate. So Pink Tacoma trees for the street trees.

Along Kanani there's – the neighboring property up Kanani Street has approximately seven Monkey Pods that march along the street in the, in the right-of-way. And so what we've done

is carried that theme along this project's frontage as well. So we have three Monkey Pods along Kanani Street. The other plant material, it's a relatively simple plant palette that we've chosen. Some of the other trees including Singapore Plumeria. Some small flowering trees, Geiger trees which also do well in this climate, and Jatropha trees. We have three palm trees, coconut – four palm trees – sorry – Royal Palms in front of the building here to create somewhat of a sense of arrival. And, and we didn't want to put any canopy trees in front of the east building in order to keep the views open. So we put the palms in here. So we have Joannis Palm, Foxtail Palm, coconut and Royal Palm. We, we've chosen a couple of native species for the ground cover. There's Ilima Papa. We can use Akulikuli, the native Ice Plant, as well as the Naupaka, as I mentioned earlier.

So some of the other site amenities include, as Daniel mentioned, the grass crete for the tandem parking. We have two bicycle rack locations on the site, a typical parking lot light and 12 volt LED path lighting for the concrete sidewalks for the pedestrian lighting. And here's the – an image board of all the plant material. I won't go through all of this. But, the important ones are the Monkey Pods on the street and the Pink Tacoma street trees. So that concludes my portion. I'll turn that back over to –

Mr. Hart: So we'll take questions now.

Mr. Silva: Alright. Thank you for that presentation. I'd like to open it up for public testimony once again. Anybody would like to come to the podium. Seeing none, so we'd like to close this session of public testimony. So now we want to go around the table here once as a Board with any questions or comments. And then after that we'll go around one more time and then Candace can help us out with our recommendations. So at this time just questions and comments. Jane? You did so well the first time, you want to start off again?

Ms. Marshall: Is there a precedent for that parking pole in that neighborhood? I mean, why did you select that particular design?

Mr. Sandomire: I'm sorry, can you repeat the question?

Ms. Marshall: Is there a precedent for that parking pole, that parking standard, that parking light fixture in that neighborhood?

Mr. Sandomire: Daniel Sandomire. The shoebox light?

Ms. Marshall: Yeah.

Mr. Sandomire: It's a fairly standard, but I don't if it's particular to that neighborhood, though. No we don't have the reference in that neighborhood.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. Which grass crete is it? Is it the round, round plastic one or the concrete tiles?

Mr. Sereda: David Sereda, Chris Hart & Partners. We'll use the grass crete.

Ms. Marshall: You would.

Mr. Sereda: Yeah. I mean –

Ms. Marshall: So why did you put the plastic one?

Mr. Sereda: We'll probably use grass paved – sorry – grass paved product which is the round circular one.

Ms. Marshall: So that's the one you're planning to use?

Mr. Sereda: Yeah.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. So the grass crete really shouldn't be there – the concrete, the concrete version? You're not using that any where?

Mr. Sereda: That's correct.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. Which one is it? The plastic bender board, or the concrete edge?

Mr. Sereda: Typically we use the bender board.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. So the concrete ones really doesn't need to be there either?

Mr. Sereda: Well we – it's, you know, undetermined at this point whether we're – I mean we could use the concrete or we could use the –

Ms. Marshall: So you're just going to wait and see how the budget kind of works out? Is that what your plan is?

Mr. Sereda: Possibly, yeah.

Ms. Marshall: Just to be consistent I'd like you to – in fact what's your opinion about using ginger which is – has been such a problem on this island. People are pulling them out as you're planting them just because it's, it's crowding. I mean it's become a real problem in the park. And because of your profession I'm sure you know these better than I do.

Mr. Sereda: I wasn't aware that ginger was placed on the invasive species list. We've always used ginger. I know that Kahili Ginger is an invasive species. That could be what you're talking about which is the white flowering ginger. It gets about six to eight feet tall. That is invasive and that is pretty prevalent and that should be pulled out. But these ornamental gingers I wasn't necessarily aware of them being on the invasive species list.

Ms. Marshall: I'll find out a little bit more too and I can call you in your office.

Mr. Sereda: Sure.

Ms. Marshall: Yeah. I'll find out more about it too. I thought they all were a problem in the park, but I'll find out.

Mr. Sereda: I know Kahili Ginger in particular is a problem.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. Alright. Thank you.

Mr. Silva: Jane, did you want to share a little about your concerns about the lighting? I don't know if you touched it.

Ms. Marshall: I just hate. It's ugly.

Mr. Silva: That's a good enough. Thank you. Dave, any questions or comments?

Mr. Green: A question. So I saw you had grass crete on the sides. Is the parking lot – what's the parking lot material itself?

Mr. Sandomire: Daniel Sandomire. That will be asphalt.

Mr. Green: Okay. I don't know. It's just, it's just from an aesthetic –.

Unidentified speaker: . . . (Inaudible) . . .

Mr. Green: Yeah, unlucky. It's just the – I think the PV roof panels are great, that you're, that you're putting PV in there. It's just that the whole project seems to be a parking lot with roof panels on it, and it seems dominating. I don't know, can you use grass crete more widely? Perhaps it's not economical. It's just – it's just everybody has the view of the parking lot.

Mr. Sereda: Would you like me to respond to that?

Mr. Green: Sure.

Mr. Sereda: Okay. It's David of Chris Hart & Partners. With the grass crete it needs to be more of a temporary parking situation so that if cars are parked on there more permanently the grass obviously isn't going to grow and irrigation becomes a problem.

Mr. Sandomire: Daniel Sandomire. I would like to be brought a point of budging, and it is a great concern. And this is 100% affordable, satisfying its affordability as a – for itself. So these are things that we've studied very, very closely.

Mr. Green: Okay, thank you.

Mr. Silva: Marie, any comments or questions?

Ms. Kimmey: No. I think it's admirable that you're able to do a 100% affordable. I'm not quite sure how. So I think that the design is, it is what it is. I think it's going to be appealing to those seniors who are lucky enough to move into it.

Mr. Silva: Thank you. Bob?

Mr. Bowlus: My concerns are really – I know it's an affordable project and, and kudos to you for that. That's definitely required. But, my concerns are with the site plan and I have no, I have no problems with the floor plans and affordable building. But it just looks like – I agree with David's comment that it looks like the entire project is focused on the parking lot and the PV panels. And you have a beautiful ocean view out there, and I'm concerned why that isn't more of the focus. And are there other site plan options that might be better options.

Mr. Sandomire: Daniel Sandomire. So actually. . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Silva: If you could grab the mic also please.

Mr. Sandomire: This is Daniel Sandomire. The views from the building were something we studied very carefully actually so there are from these top two floors a channel of views between – into that Cove Beach, that Charley Young Beach. It's flanked by these building which Hale Kanani which really crowds that street and blocks that view for us, and the other building on the other side which is directly across from us. On the third floor we do get views. This configuration gave us not just relief from the street, but also the most ocean views from lanais that we could achieve. By bringing it in this way none of these guys get views really. So pushing it back it created that perimeter view exposure.

Mr. Bowlus: Well, a comment would be that typically in more affordable projects like this that there's a perimeter road at the rear property line with the road and parking, and since all of the access to all of your units are from that side and that maybe the parking could be on the back of the buildings and not in the front, and it would be more convenient.

Mr. Sandomire: We, we studied those options as well. We, we have this point of entry that we wanted to maintain. A great difference from the other access was, was – actually our frontage stops there, so we had this locked in. And by having the parking in the back we ended up splitting the parking, and because we had to satisfy the requirements of two, two spaces per unit. So this is consolidating it, breaking it up with these PV structures, and really opening it up to the ocean view beyond is what we're hoping to achieve.

Ms. Thackerson: Can I? Candace Thackerson, staff planner. If you go to the project location map really quick. Yeah, that one. So, this is also a drainage swale back here so there's not going to be a like an access road for them to access the parking in the back, back here. So the way they have it with the buildings here and here, and the parking here, I have had some neighbors from in here come in and view the file, and they were all thrilled that the parking was

not right there. Yeah, they would rather look at the building and, and see like the architectural elements than see – than look right into the parking. So that was something that they were really happy about. So, just – you know, because I, I do see how you're saying everyone here is looking into the parking. But these neighbors were really excited that they weren't looking into the parking.

Mr. Bowlus: Is there access along Kanani Road from the high point of the property?

Ms. Thackerson: Oh, from this, you mean? Kanani here?

Mr. Bowlus: Higher, higher, higher. Right there. Can't you just come in from there?

Ms. Thackerson: You know, I just did one with the Maui Mall with TJ Maxx and everybody and the entrances were so close. Public Works really was not excited about having cars turning in and turning out when there's just a little tiny bit of space between the two entry points. So they do like them to be spaced out so cars don't stack and things. But – and they also are not utilizing, you can see when they show their site plan this part cuts. They're not building at all in that little portion to keep the drainage clear and everything because Kihei's got that, you know.

Mr. Hart: If I could add to the, the location, the driveway, was actually done in cooperation with the residents of Hale Kanani as well. They had a concern about the off setting of driveways and creating conflict with their access, their existing access.

Mr. Bowlus: Is there, is there tandem parking to meet the requirement? Is that being – is there tandem parking?

Mr. Sandomire: So the parking was part of our variance, the parking count. It's in excess of the two per unit, but we, we already had the 88 stall in our, in our variance, so we needed to keep that. There was a request by the KCA who we met with to reduce to the minimum. So this was a, a good compromise we felt by making them tandem, it complies with the – to the variance that we have, but it reduces the impact. Because if we – in earlier schemes, that area was totally paved out and –

Mr. Bowlus: No, I understand that. So I guess the tandem spaces will be used by the same unit. The same unit will –

Mr. Sandomire: They won't be assigned. No. We don't expect actually for two cars per unit, to the market. We, we think that just one car probably. But I'm anticipating that there will be uses like landscape maintenance, or people that come to, like service providers that may be there for a few hours and they may use them.

Mr. Bowlus: Thank you.

Mr. Silva: Hunton?

Mr. Conrad: I think my only comment is that I noticed that on the landscaping where the Pink Tacomas are, next to the swimming pool area it doesn't appear that there's any small shade living shrubs that – to hide the headlights and the front noses of the cars from the pool deck. And that would be my only recommendation that you try to make that pool deck feel a little bit more self contained environment, and not so much part of the parking lot by putting some under tree screen planting.

Mr. Silva: Thank you Hunton. Frances?

Ms. Feeter: I have to plead dumb because what is a 100% affordable. What does that mean?

Mr. Hart: It should more accurately be a work force housing, 100% work force housing. There's basically an ordinance that requires that a percentage of every project provide work force housing on –

Ms. Feeter: Does that mean cost?

Mr. Hart: That's a, that's a basically enforced reduction or fixing of the sale price of the units based on HUD affordability rates and people's incomes. And so basically what they're saying is that this project is going to develop units in excess of the, the standard requirement. It's going to be 100% affordable, or, or work force is more accurate.

Ms. Feeter: Okay. I was confused about that 100%. Okay. Actually for what you're faced with I think you've done a very good job. One thing that after seeing the exuberant colors of the last project, I'm a little disappointed to see how dull this looks. Is there any way you can put a little color on it? It really hits me that this is gray. I mean, I'm gray and I, I know these kind of people are going to be there, but that doesn't mean you have to look at a gray house. I would really like to see some color if you could. I don't know if you can incorporate that easily. I also like the use of grass crete. I think that's good. And of course, this is probably standard, but being old, I appreciate having the elevators in there. I know the third floor people will. Actually I don't have any negative or any recommendations other than, than that. Like I say for what you have to work with, I think you've done a pretty good job. And having all those PV panels, that's good and I like you're having extra parking because even though old people you may think one car per apartment, we're old and we have two cars so I appreciate it. Thank you.

Mr. Silva: Thank you Frances. Can I interrupt too? Do you guys have a sample board that you want to pass around? The materials board? Thanks. Did you have any response?

Mr. Sandomire: No, thank you.

Mr. Muraoka: Wayne Muraoka. We'll take some of the intensity of our colors and share with this project.

Mr. Silva: Thank you Wayne. Fiona, questions or comments?

Ms. van Ammers: Yeah. Yeah, I think it's a tough act to follow for sure. I kind of agree with the assessment on the site plan. It – it looks very parking eccentric. I don't know, do you guys have any elevation views from the road what you intend the site to look like? I just – there was no drainage – sorry – drainage and grading plan provided so it's hard for us to understand what the walls are going to be looking like. And I – yeah, I kind of have a question about, you know, this parking structure, the PV, what that's going to look like from the road.

Mr. Sandomire: Okay. So this street rendering that we have is an aerial obviously, but what we look at from the road, you'd be, you know, on the makai side of Kanani Street, you'll be looking out at approximately a five foot wall with three feet of berm upland against it. So you would see – you would see the tops of or the undersides of trees. In the distance you would see, possibly the PV structures, and you would see the roof tops beyond, beyond that. But the landscaping is really focused on that perimeter and trying to soften that, that impact and edge. That's what we're doing.

Ms. van Ammers: Yeah, that would be my recommendation if you can, as much as possible, soften the look. I think the wall, with the PV structure, that's, you know, adding to the intensity of this parking eccentric. It doesn't look – it doesn't look nice.

Mr. Silva: Is that it?

Ms. van Ammers: Yes.

Mr. Silva: Okay. I actually have a few questions and comments myself. I know that in the Kalama area there's an issue with drainage. Do you guys want to touch on the, on the drainage improvements that you have?

Mr. Stacy Otomo: Good morning Chair Silva, members of the Urban Design Review Board. My name is Stacy Otomo. Regarding the drainage, as you noticed, there's a lot of hard surface on the property so we are going to contain the drainage by an underground perforated pipe system on the makai side, between the pool and the PV structure. And those will be sized to meet the drainage standards as well as the water quality standards for the County of Maui.

Mr. Silva: Okay. Very good. Thank you. I also had a concern, I guess, with the grass paved. I was just curious how that, that tandem will actually work, how will it function if somebody's parked in front and, you know, if someone parks behind. And just the, I guess, the durability of the grass itself, if it's going to get parked on a lot. I think you touched a little bit on if you're going to get it grow and irrigation, and wondered if you guys just even considered doing like a permeable paver instead of the grass paved? And I know actually one of the stalls was marked as an accessible stall. So again I don't know how that would work if somebody is in front and the accessible in the back.

Mr. Sandomire: Right. That stall shouldn't be – it should be the one to the south of it.

Mr. Silva: Okay.

Mr. Sandomire: As far as the grass crete versus permeable paving, permeable paving also has maintenance issues that we chose, chose the grass crete. We don't expect this to get heavily used at, at all. The tandem stalls, we comply with the zoning maximums for tandem and grass crete so it's not anticipated to be heavy use.

Mr. Silva: So do you see that a car would drive and park in the first stall and not go all the way to the front? Is that the intent?

Mr. Sandomire: Probably.

Mr. Silva: Okay. I appreciate the bike rack. That's just a small touch, but something we always like to see on the site plan. I know you just had it – not on the site plan, but you had a detail. One other comment, I know that it's going to come up in the permitting, is just add a root barrier. I know you said there was Monkey Pod along the road. That would be something that Public Works, I'm sure are going to comment just – so just for your reference. And, and one other comment or I guess more of a, of a curiosity and how, how you handle senior preference about like, considering like discrimination, just from my personal knowledge of it.

Mr. Sandomire: So the way this would get set up is through an agreement with the County, Department of Housing and Human Concerns, will establish a protocol for that. But the affordability and, and age preference would be an offering time, and response would be given to the seniors and we would open it up to the open market following those.

Mr. Silva: After that.

Mr. Sandomire: A period of time, yeah.

Mr. Silva: Okay. Interesting. Anybody else have any more questions or comments? Jane?

Ms. Marshall: The third floor roof above the – I guess it would be second floor roof above the one-bedroom.

Mr. Sandomire: Yes.

Ms. Marshall: That's just a roof?

Mr. Sandomire: Yes.

Ms. Marshall: It's not going to be used as –

Mr. Sandomire: It's a low sloped roof. 1 and 12 slope. And what it does provide is a, like a small bridge between, at the garage. This elevator lobby will be open here on two sides, so it would have a bridge like effect at that third floor.

Ms. Marshall: I wondered what the awnings were going to be made of. What's the material?

Mr. Sandomire: Aluminum, pre-finished powder coated.

Ms. Marshall: Okay. That's a nice addition. That add a nice texture to the facade, and it's also very useful.

Mr. Sandomire: Yes.

Ms. Marshall: Thank you.

Mr. Silva: Any other questions or comments? Seeing none, so we'll go around one more time with recommendations. And then Candace can jot those down for us and summerize when we're through. Jane, any recommendations?

Ms. Marshall: No thank you. Thank you.

Mr. Silva: Dave?

Mr. Green: No, I don't have any comments or recommendations. I would just say that after hearing all the constraints you had with the site, etcetera, etcetera, even though I'm not wild about the parking lot eccentric, I do appreciate the affordable housing approach, etcetera, and I think it would be a nice facility for your target market.

Mr. Silva: Thank you Dave. Marie?

Ms. Kimmey: No. I have no – no recommendations.

Mr. Silva: Thank you. Bob?

Mr. Bowlus: No recommendations.

Mr. Silva: Hunton?

Mr. Conrad: My only recommendation is to include some lower screen planting to separate the parking lot from the pool area.

Mr. Silva: Okay. Thank you Hunton. Frances?

Ms. Feeter: No recommendations.

Mr. Silva: Okay. Fiona?

Ms. van Ammers: I have two recommendations – minimize the retaining wall height as much as possible, and optimize the vegetation to cover the wall and the carport. Specifically from the frontage view.

Mr. Silva: Okay. And I would just like to add one also was just to, to show the accessible parking moved away from the tandem, so in case somebody – or in case the accessible car does park behind somebody, they don't have to be inconvenienced by having to move the car, accessible person. So just move the accessible parking, the one by the pool. Anybody else? Candace can you – I have four – if you could summarize please?

Ms. Thackerson: Yeah. We've got the hedge material, to separate the – and screen – the pool amenities from the parking lot area. So like a soft landscaping border there. As well as minimizing the retaining wall height as much as possible along the road with – and then the second one was the landscaping as well along the road – to soften the hedge and the appearance from the roadways. Which I did noticed on the landscaping site plan, there's pictured Hibiscus. And then in the rendering there was no Hibiscus, so I think that's foreseeing and we're going, oh, look at that wall, but I know 'cause I do the LPAP as well, the landscape parking plan for it. Well, it will go with it, that there will be hedge material there. There will be the – I think it was the Hula Hibiscus or Yellow Hibiscus around there so, there will be something. It won't just be looking straight at the wall.

Ms. Marshall: Can I add – I'm sorry.

Ms. Thackerson: Yeah, go ahead.

Ms. Marshall: Can I also add something about – we're having trouble with this parking lot and details matter. Perhaps that shoe box light which just exacerbates the commercial parking lot look be looked at again.

Ms. Thackerson: Okay, that the applicant –

Ms. Marshall: An alternate, an alternate –

Mr. Silva: Look at an alternate for the parking lot lighting.

Ms. Thackerson: That the applicant pursue alternate lighting for the parking lot. Alternate light choices for the parking lot. Okay. And then lastly, that the accessible ADA parking stall be moved out of the tandem spot to a single spot, closer probably to the doors, I'm sure.

Mr. Silva: To the pool, yeah, closer to the pool. Okay. Anybody has further discussion? I don't know if there anybody really opposed? If there's no opposition of any of those? Yes, the applicant. Daniel?

Mr. Sandomire: . . . (Inaudible) . . .

Mr. Silva: Okay. It would not be included in the tandem.

Mr. Sandomire: . . . (Inaudible) . . .

Mr. Silva: Yeah.

Mr. Conrad: Okay, that wasn't –

Mr. Silva: Okay. So I think just to clarify, just say it's not included in the tandem. I think that's –

Ms. Thackerson: Yeah. Yeah.

Mr. Silva: So if there is no opposition we can forward those recommendations unanimously. Anybody have an issue with any of those five recommendations? Seeing and hearing none, so we will forward those recommendations unanimously. Thank you. Thank you very much.

Ms. Thackerson: Thank you.

Mr. Muraoka: Thank you.

**The Board recommended approval with five recommendations as provided.
(Assenting: B. Bowlus, H. Conrad, F. Feeter, D. Green, M. Kimmey, J. Marshall, M. Silva, F. van Ammers)**

Mr. Silva: And Erin did you need you need any time to set up? We have one more. Hunton, we have one more. Yes, you can get up, I guess. We'll take a five minute break. Let's convene at 10 till.

(The Urban Design Review Board recessed at 11:44 a.m., and reconvened at 11:52 a.m.)

- 3. MR. WILLIAM SPENCE, Planning Director, requesting comments relative to the Paia-Haiku Country Town Business Design Guidelines of the amendment request by MS. TATIANA BOTTON of the proposed modifications to the plans to the permitted single-story commercial building to create more outdoor space and to change the surface materials of the exterior of the building from grooved T1-11 to a combination of plaster and 1x6 T&G on property situated at 151 Hana Highway at TMK: 2-6-004: 011, Paia, Island of Maui. (CTB 2012/0011) (Erin Wade)**

The Board may provide its comments to the Planning Director on the amendments on the design aspects of the project as they relate to the adopted Paia-Haiku Country Town Business Design Guidelines.

Mr. Silva: . . . are going to reconvene with the next item on the agenda. Item no. 3 under Communications. *(Chair Michael Silva read the above project description into the record.)* I'm having problems reading today. Sorry. Erin Wade is here from the Planning Department.

Ms. Erin Wade: Thank you everyone. Normally I wouldn't bring such a minor change.

Mr. Silva: Shall I interrupt you, real quick, Hunton is on our board and he is recusing himself. He is in the audience now so just for the record. Thank you.

Ms. Wade: Thank you. As the chair said this is for 151 Hana Highway. Normally for such a minor change, I wouldn't bring this to the Board. We would be able to change – going from one material to another. The only real issue that I wanted to get your advisement on was the entries. So this was the original project as it was approved, the facade, and now you have before you what's being proposed. The original had three bays as this one retained, but all of the three entries had a recessed entry which is recommended in the design guidelines. It's not required, but recommended. What's now being proposed is an alternative to pull back the third bay and provide an entry courtyard, but eliminate the recessed entries. So that was the reason staff brought it before you for your attention today. And if you need, need to refer you to the location in the design guidelines, for the recessed entries, I'd be happy to do that. But I know that Marty Cooper is here to represent the applicant so he'll explain further.

Mr. Marty Cooper: Good morning Chair, members of the Board. My name is Marty Cooper. I'm an architect. I happen to be a partner with Hunton as well, so I got roped into this. There's basically three – you should have a – okay, good. I'm glad everybody has this. There's basically three things that we're, that we're looking at doing for our client. The first one which is the one that Erin mentioned is in that center area, the center lease space, we wanted to push that back and allow for a courtyard. We felt that it would be – effectively it would be more inviting.

Ms. Marshall: I don't – you haven't drawn this, right? You haven't drawn this yet?

Mr. Cooper: It's right in front of you ma'am if you keep going. These are MAGs original drawings, below them are our drawings.

Mr. Bowlus: Later in the section.

Mr. Silva: It's the last pages.

Ms. Marshall: Okay.

Mr. Cooper: So there's a floor –. No, no.

Ms. Marshall: I'm sorry. I apologize. I'm sorry.

Mr. Cooper: So if you look in that center section ma'am, you can see the courtyard and you can see how Erin had mentioned that we pulled the entries back a little bit. So we're all – are we all on the same page? Okay.

Ms. Marshall: I'm sorry.

Mr. Cooper: Not at all. That's, that's the first and main issue, design wise. The second one is if you look on our page A2, you can compare the two, back and forth, which is why you have the MAG drawings. But on our page A2, which would be your last sheet. If you look on the south elevation which is the one that's facing the street obviously, we didn't, we didn't step the parapet down. We actually made it a little bit more conforming with the actual roof form. And if you look at the north elevation, from the back, you can see how the parapet only pops up on the two sides, right and left. So that would be the second item. And the third one has to do with finishes. The client wanted to have a little bit more, let's just say, less nondescript. They wanted to actually have a nicer product, and so we introduced the distressed wood which, if I'm allowed, I'd like to pass out for you to see.

Mr. Silva: Please do.

Mr. Cooper: In addition to that we added more – thank you – more stucco, and the color, is the connected gray. It's underlined. It's the third one down in terms of the color. So it's basically those three items that we're in front of you for.

Ms. Marshall: Can you describe the west elevation?

Mr. Cooper: The west elevation is up against an adjacent property, and all it is a . . . (inaudible) . . . area separation wall block. It's not visually accessible by the public.

Ms. van Ammers: Can you give reference to where we are, like, other businesses?

Mr. Cooper: Okay. This is the vacant lot that Josh Stone use to own, and he had a bunch of little small structures in there, and it's on the – it's on the Haiku side. It's on the ocean, Haiku side. So if you come down Baldwin Avenue, and take a right, you're going to have – there's a taco stand, which is good food, that's why I remembered it, fiesta. And then there's – what's the other one Hunton?

Mr. Conrad: . . . (Inaudible) . . .

Mr. Cooper: Yeah, across.

Ms. van Ammers: So the other side of the. . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. Marshall: That's too far.

Mr. Bowlus: That's about a block up.

Mr. Cooper: That would be a block further towards Hookipa.

Ms. van Ammers: Okay.

Ms. Wade: Directly adjacent to the property where the fire wall is that he was describing is the indigo store with the wine corner, that's the one with the front parking lot.

Ms. van Ammers: Okay.

Ms. Wade: Okay.

Mr. Cooper: I'm really glad Erin's here.

Mr. Silva: Any more for the presentation?

Mr. Cooper: Not at all.

Mr. Silva: Okay. So, I see no one from the public that would be testifying, so I'm opening and closing public testimony at this time. So now we'll go around the, the Board, with questions and comments the first time, and then the second round we'll, we'll include our recommendations. Fiona, do you want to start us off this time?

Ms. van Ammers: Sure. I, I have no objections. I think it was -. Yeah, I was just trying to get a sense of what the traffic was, so I think the courtyard kind of makes sense. I have no objections, no comments.

Mr. Silva: Thank you. Frances?

Ms. Feeter: Okay, I have no objections. It looks like an improvement to the property.

Mr. Silva: Thank you. Bob?

Mr. Bowlus: Yeah, I agree, I like the courtyard a lot. My question is on the - if there were homeless in Paia then what would, what would you do to protect the courtyard? And across the street at the Rock and Brews, you know, they went through great pains to secure their courtyards to keep people from climbing edges and sleeping behind the bushes in there. Is this - are there going to be tables out in there or how do you visualize that use?

Mr. Cooper: Well, at this point, it's pre-tenant, so we don't have that. But the anticipation is that we would have some sort of seating out there.

Mr. Bowlus: But you don't see a fence or a wall or anything?

Mr. Cooper: Not at this point, sir.

Mr. Bowlus: Or iron gates locked off or anything?

Mr. Cooper: Not at this point.

Mr. Bowlus: Okay. So I have nothing, no other suggestions.

Mr. Silva: Marie?

Ms. Kimmey: I think it would appear that by providing the indent courtyard you're kind of complying with the idea of having recessed entries for the building. So I believe that I think that that's an accepted solution. I have no other comments.

Mr. Silva: Thank you. Dave?

Mr. Green: Just to clarify the facade you want to go with is, is not that one.

Mr. Cooper: No sir.

Mr. Green: It's the one on your drawings.

Mr. Cooper: Yes sir. And we're adding the – on, on Hunton Conrad & Associates A2, yes sir.

Mr. Green: Okay.

Mr. Cooper: It would be the south elevation and we're adding the distressed wood above the awning. And we're also showing it below the windows and then introducing a different stucco color where the columns are.

Ms. Marshall: This is below the windows also?

Mr. Cooper: Yes ma'am.

Ms. Marshall: Above the –

Mr. Cooper: And above the roof.

Mr. Conrad: . . . (Inaudible) . . .

Mr. Cooper: The east elevation.

Ms. Marshall: Yes, I see that.

Mr. Conrad: On the east elevation, that pop out is also wrapped to that material.

Ms. Marshall: And what's the north?

Mr. Conrad: Pardon?

Ms. Marshall: Is it also the north also? It looks like it's the same scale.

Mr. Cooper: North is stucco.

Ms. Marshall: It's stucco.

Mr. Conrad: Yeah, north is just stucco.

Ms. Marshall: They just changed that.

Mr. Conrad: Yeah.

Ms. Marshall: Yes it is. And is this, is this the color of the awnings?

Mr. Cooper: Right where you thumb is. Yes, ma'am.

Ms. Marshall: It is. This is the window, the store front, this one?

Mr. Cooper: Oh, the windows themselves, that's the stucco.

Ms. Marshall: But what are you going to color the store front facade? How's that going to look like?

Mr. Conrad: It's going to be the white that was originally intended by the –.

Mr. Cooper: So in –

Mr. Conrad: Hunton Conrad. It's the white that was originally intended by the previous architect.

Mr. Cooper: That shows up in –

Mr. Conrad: With the white. So it would be – now it would be white trimmed, distressed grey would, and a green gray plaster color.

Mr. Cooper: So the original colors are on A6 on the left side from MAGs drawings.

Mr. Conrad: And then unfortunately there isn't a color board to it. We never saw the color board either.

Ms. Marshall: And what's the composition tile color is going to be?

Mr. Conrad: The tile roof is a brown, so it will be kind of a grey brown. And then the awning, the corrugated metal roof awning, at this point, is intended to stay red. The owner is holding that back as a possible change after she's seen the project develop a little further.

Ms. Marshall: Yeah. Is this treated?

Mr. Conrad: Yeah. It's a white cedar.

Mr. Silva: Any other comments Jane?

Ms. Marshall: No thank you very much.

Mr. Silva: Okay. I also did not have any comments.

Mr. Bowlus: I have, I have one other comment.

Mr. Silva: Sure. Bob?

Mr. Bowlus: Just a comment, not a recommendation. My only – the only thing that distresses me about this building is there's not offices above it or apartments above it. Because this is such a down, downtown, great Paia spot where people want to live, and they'd like to be closer to town and people could walk the restaurant across the street. It just seems it would just be almost underutilized such a fabulous site. So that's my only comment.

Mr. Cooper: Understood.

Ms. Wade: I can respond to that. They're limited by their parking, by the onsite parking requirement.

Mr. Silva: Any other comments or questions? Okay, so we'll go around one more time with recommendations to the Planning Director. Jane?

Ms. Marshall: I don't have any comments.

Mr. Silva: No? Dave?

Mr. Green: None.

Mr. Silva: Marie?

Ms. Kimmey: I just – this is back to being a question. Does the new plan not have the big wave building sign?

Mr. Conrad: The answer is yes.

Ms. Kimmey: Okay. Than other than that I had no questions or recommendations.

Mr. Silva: Okay. Bob?

Mr. Bowlus: No recommendations.

Mr. Silva: Frances?

Ms. Feeter: No recommendations.

Mr. Silva: Fiona?

Ms. van Ammers: No recommendations.

Mr. Silva: I also have no recommendations, so that means we're all unanimous. So we will forward no recommendations – I don't think we've done that before – to the Planning Director. Thank you Erin, and thank you Marty, thank you Hunton.

After discussion ensued, the Board did not have any comments or recommendations to forward to the Planning Director.

D. Presentation on Country Town Design Guidelines (Erin Wade)

Mr. Silva: Moving on to the next item on the agenda is Erin Wade with the presentation of the Country Town Design Guidelines. She did miss, unfortunately, our orientation. Even though Hunton is an experienced member, everybody needs a refresher, so we'll all get a refresher on the Country Town Business Districts from Erin.

Ms. Wade: Thank you. I very much apologize for missing the orientation. We, our whole family, got whatever that miserable flu was, so – but we're better off now. Country Town Business Districts is part of the Zoning Code, Chapter 19.15. The purpose and intent of these districts is to establish development standards for the businesses in rural communities, preserve and maintain a unique urban design character. It generally addresses what we think of the towns of Paia, Hana town, Makawao, Lanai City, and Kaunakakai. But there's smattering of Country Town Business in whole bunch of different areas – Haiku, Pauwela, Pukalani, Waiakoa in Kula, Pulehu by Kula Hardware, Keokea, Waikapu, and Haliimaile, so a little bit all over the map.

The design guidelines are applied to all work to structures – saying that all work to structure shall be done in a similar and compatible architectural design character to surrounding commercial buildings. So there are some sections of that are – there are some areas in the communities that are zoned Country Town Business Districts but don't have defined design guidelines. When that's the case this is the standard that we use.

Design guidelines are guide – are rules and regulations of the Planning Commission. Typically in the design guideline documents which I think you folks have all of them, and I actually referenced this in the last, in the last presentation. But, for most of the communities we do have design guidelines documents. There's sections on architectural design and style, and the comment, you know, there's a good example was this last case about their specific notes about building entries and architectural features. We can see what all of those are.

A lot of the design guidelines also have site design guidelines defining not only set backs. And in most cases that it should have either a zero set back or like in Makawao they might have a slight setback. But it relates to the pedestrian and not the automobile. It talks about landscape planting, site furnishings and all those kind of things. A couple of them, not all of them, have street and utility design guidelines. Lanai City and Makawao have these – talking about travel ways, drainage, and street lighting, and street landscape planting. I wish more had this because it would be helpful for me with Public Works.

The process for Country Town review is that the Planning Department takes in the application and does an initial review for completeness. Then depending on the age of the structure, it will either get routed to SHPD and/or our Cultural Resource Planner for comments. Then it comes back to us and a determination is made whether the applicant has been consistent with the design guidelines or if some things could be amended for better compliance, and then it's determined if we can do an administrative approval or refer to UDRB. Today was a really good example of one where almost 100% of the project was – could have been administratively approved. There was just that tiny one where there was the recommendation about the recessed entry, so I brought it to you. But in most cases people come in, are consistent with the design guidelines or are willing to have a conversation with the department about how to be consistent with the design guidelines, we're able to do an administrative approval in those cases. Are there any questions? Told you it be short.

Mr. Silva: Alright. Well thank you very much. Next item on the agenda is Director's Report from Clayton.

E. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

1. Status of Board Vacancy

Mr. Yoshida: Thank you Mr. Chair and members of the Board. We've been following the agendas of the Council Policy and Intergovernmental Affairs Committee. There hasn't been a nominee yet for the Urban Design Review Board, though, there have been some for Lanai Planning Commission and Maui Redevelopment Agency, and other boards. So I guess we would inquire with the Mayor's Office if, or whose turn it is to submit a nomination because they never submitted a nomination –. Well, there were two vacancies as of April 1st, and they submitted one name, so we still have one vacancy.

Mr. Silva: You said whose turn was it, is that what you said? Whose turn to submit an applicant? The Mayor does them all right?

Mr. Yoshida: Yeah, I think there's – I don't know – the Mayor has so many days to submit a nomination to fill the vacancy, and then it rotates with the Council and the Mayor – and then the Mayor – until there's a nomination.

Mr. Silva: Okay. No, I didn't know that. Okay.

2. Agenda items for the July 1, 2014 meeting.

Mr. Yoshida: So we'll check on that and we can report on the next meeting. Our next meeting is scheduled for July 1st, and we have the SMA Use Permit for the Kaanapali – Maui Kaanapali Villas improvement project. The Board reviewed it before, about three years ago, but there's been some amendments to those plans. So we actually had to turn away some items from today's meeting because we had too many items. We would have too many items otherwise. But that's the item that we have for the next meeting.

Mr. Silva: Okay.

Ms. Marshall: That's the first time you said that, since I've been here.

Mr. Yoshida: Well, sometimes it's not the number of items, it's the item itself. Like if we – you know, we did Makena HM, and we know the applicant is going to do like an hour presentation going over the various facets of the redevelopment of the – or renovation of the current hotel and the building of the new hotel and all the other amenities, so, but for today's case we just had more demand than we were able to accommodate. So we had the Maui Kaanapali Villas item for the next agenda.

F. NEXT MEETING DATE: July 1, 2014

G. ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Silva: Okay. At least that. Okay. Thank you Clayton. And as Clayton mentioned, July 1st is our next meeting, and meeting adjourned. Thank you.

There being no further business brought forward to the Board, the UDRB meeting was adjourned at approximately 12:12 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by,

LEILANI A. RAMORAN-QUEMADO
Secretary to Boards and Commissions II

RECORD OF ATTENDANCE:

PRESENT:

Robert Bowlus, Vice-Chair
Hunton Conrad
Frances Feeter
David Green
Marie Kimmey (Alternate)
Jane Marshall
Michael Silva, Chair
Fiona van Ammers

ABSENT:

Bryan Maxwell

OTHERS:

Clayton Yoshida, Planning Program Administrator, Current Planning Division,
Danny Dias, Staff Planner
Erin Wade, Small Town Planner
Candace Thackerson, Staff Planner
Michael Hopper, Deputy Corporation Counsel