

**URBAN DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
REGULAR MEETING
DECEMBER 1, 2015**

APPROVED 02-02-2016

A. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Urban Design Review Board (Board) was called to order by Mr. Hunton Conrad, Chair, at approximately 10:05 a.m., Tuesday, December 1, 2015, in the Planning Department Conference Room, First Floor, Kalana Pakui Building, 250 South High Street, Wailuku, Island of Maui.

A quorum of the Board was present (see Record of Attendance).

Mr. Hunton Conrad: So we have a quorum, so we will begin even though one more member will be joining us. So calling to order. First item is that if anyone needs, wants to make a public testimony before it comes up in front of our commission, then you're welcome to do that now, but you may not speak again when the item, the agenda item comes up at that time. So I do have one, Trinette. Trinette wants to speak now or wait? Thank you.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY - At the discretion of the Chair, public testimony may also be taken when each agenda item is discussed, except for contested cases under Chapter 91, HRS. Individuals who cannot be present when the agenda items are discussed may testify at the beginning of the meeting instead and will not be allowed to testify again when the agenda item is discussed unless new or additional information will be offered.

C. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVAL OF THE OCTOBER 6, 2015 AND NOVEMBER 3, 2015 MEETING MINUTES

Mr. Conrad: With that, and then now it's number C on the agenda is to approve the minutes from the last two meetings. I was not at the October 6th so is there anyone that would like to make a motion to accept them?

Ms. Frances Feeter: I move that we accept them.

Mr. Robert Bowlus: Second.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you very much. And I did review the November 3rd, and they seemed appropriate to me, so anyone would like to make a proposal to accept those?

Ms. Feeter: . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Conrad: Okay. Second?

Mr. Bowlus: Second.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you Robert. So then the minutes for the last two meetings have been approved. Alright.

It was moved by Ms. Frances Feeter, seconded by Mr. Robert Bowlus then unanimously without any objections, the minutes of the October 6, 2015 and November 3, 2015 meetings were approved.

*(Assenting: R. Bowlus, H. Conrad, F. Feeter, D. Green, R. Spilker
Excused: D. Callinicos, R. Phillips, D. Sereda, F. van Ammers)*

D. COMMUNICATIONS

- 1. DR. SUJATA BHATIA requesting a Special Management Area Use Permit in order to construct the Kihei Wellness Center, a two-story approximately 21,958 sq. ft. building intended to house medical offices, clinics, and other medical related services for the South Maui region at 1488 South Kihei Road, TMK: 3-9-010: 077, Kihei, Island of Maui. (CIZ 2011/0003) (SM1 2011/0005) (Paul Fasi)**

The Board may provide its recommendations to the Maui Planning Commission on the design aspects within its purview based on the proposed Special Management Area Use Permit plans provided for the project.

Mr. Conrad: First item on our agenda today is . . . *(Chair Hunton Conrad read the above project description into the record.)* Paul Fasi is the planner.

Mr. Paul Fasi: Good morning. I'll be very brief in my comment because I don't want to be redundant. The applicant will be doing a presentation on the entire project. I did hand out to you this sheet this morning so it kind of gives you an overview of exactly where the site is. You can see that it's in a very urban central site in Kihei. And right next door is the Kihei Veterinary Clinic which came before this Board for review and went through the exact same Special Management Area application process, and is requesting the exact same change in zoning from R3 Residential to B2 Business Commercial. But that's for the Planning Commission and the County Council at a later date. Your purview today is basically to review the site and the overall building design parameters. So I will turn it over to the applicant.

Let me give you the land use designations real quick. The State Land Use District is Urban. It's in the Kihei-Makena Community Plan as Business Commercial. The County Zoning is R3 Residential. And again I would anticipate that when this does get to...to the SMA process and the Planning Commission and County Council, I would anticipate it would basically hold the same conditions that the Kihei Vet Clinic under because they're adjacent to each other. So this project has a long way to go, and this is the first step in the process. I'll turn it over to the applicant, and if you have any questions for the Department, I'll be happy to answer them.

Mr. Conrad: Thanks Paul.

Mr. Bryan Esmeralda: Good morning Chair and Board Members. Thank you for being here this morning. My name is Bryan Esmeralda of Munekiyo & Hiraga, and I'm here at the request of the applicant to present the plans for the proposed Kihei Wellness Center.

Before we begin I'd just like to take a second to acknowledge the project team, all of whom are here this morning and will be available to answer questions following the presentation. The applicant and land owner is Dr. Sujata Bhatia; architect, Ron Agor; civil engineers, Dominic Rosario; landscape architect, Russel Gushi; and the planning consultants for Munekiyo & Hiraga, myself and Mike Munekiyo are here this morning.

As Paul mentioned the project site is located along South Kihei Road. It's located approximately there. It is within the urbanized area of Kihei. So the property is identified by tax map key 2-3-9-010 parcel 77. It's approximately one acre in size, again, located along South Kihei Road, and it is owned by the applicant.

The parcel is located south of the Kihei Veterinary Center, again, along South Kihei Road. And...so the proposed building will be a two-story building with approximately 22,000 square feet. The plans that you'll see later show 17 office spaces which range in size from approximately 800 to 1,300 square feet. And they're intended to house wellness related services for the South Maui region. Parking is provided on the site. A portion of these parking spaces will be covered by the building, and you'll see that when the architect goes through the plans in a little, in a second here. And the project will also feature landscaping and other onsite improvements.

Okay, as Paul mentioned, the State Land Use District designation for the property is Urban. It is designated as Business Commercial within the Kihei-Makena Community Plan; and R3 Residential by Maui County zoning. And it is within the Special Management Area.

So development of the proposed project will require a Special Management Area Use Permit, and also a Change in Zoning to B2 Community Business. I'd just like to note that the SMA Use Permit and Change in Zoning applications were originally filed back in 2011. After which time the Planning Department requested additional information on the project to be able to process those. And earlier this year, on October 21st, 2015, that supplemental information was provided to complete the applications. So again before you today the applicant is requesting your review and favorable recommendation of the proposed project to the Maui Planning Commission.

And this is an aerial photo of the site. It's currently undeveloped and vacant. There is a pond feature here that is a Army Corp of Engineer's approved wetland mitigation feature, so that will remain in its current state. And these are photos of the existing site. Again, it's vacant and undeveloped. And apart from the veterinary office which is to the north of the site, it is surrounded by other vacant, undeveloped sites.

At this time I'd like to turn the presentation over to Ron Agor to go over the project plans.

Mr. Ron Agor: Good morning Chair and Board Members. My name is Ron Agor for the record.

I'm the architect for the project. On the slide, right now, we have the site plan and...the encompassing property line is here. We have an existing retention pond here. Upon my research, I found that it was done in the 90's pro-actively in the anticipation to the development of this property to take care of whatever runoffs that the development on the property would, would have. So what we have right now is a driveway here and, and parking along the south property line. The parking extends to the rear of the property, and a portion of it is covered where there's a second story offices above here. On the bottom left hand corner we have the trash enclosure. And the site has a, approximately, a 2,600 square foot space here with a veranda along side the street. And, and we had comments from the Kihei Business Association about wanting to see a pedestrian friendly structure. So in, in hopes that this could possibly be a health food store, patrons walking on the street could go in there, do their purchases and probably buy some food and sit outside on the veranda, creating a really good pedestrian friendly situation.

Along side the south property line and the east property line we're proposing a fence. And, and back here we're gonna -- I think it's a wire fence right now that we're gonna leave as is because it's very sensitive with this pond here and the neighboring pond, we don't want to disturb anything on this side. So we're going to leave that as is. Does the Board have any questions about the site before I move on to the building?

This is the lower level. We have five offices running the longitudinal direction of the property ranging from 750 to 900 square feet. And then we have this 2,600 square foot area I mentioned to you earlier. And we have a veranda here and we have a trellis above that we may be growing some vines on it. And then this, this is the element that would create a good pedestrian feature, a pedestrian relationship feature for the project. Next, next slide please.

On the second floor, we have a, a, the same amount of square footage; 2,600 square foot in the front, and longitudinally we repeat the space, five spaces, but in addition we have two more office spaces in this area which provides shelter for some of the parking spaces. The challenge on the design was to blend the project with, with the surrounding residential neighborhood. So we're keeping the profiles to 30 feet height, with the exception of this element right here, design element that goes up two more feet. And we did this just to break the monotony of, of this long wall here, but it's really not imposing at all. We incorporated board and batten siding and, and we've put in some balconies here to really give it the residential look. The front elevation, same thing, we have the board and bat siding, and a trellis here with round concrete columns and, and we're hoping to grow some vines over it. And, and you can see the balconies on the side, so it really lends itself to blend well with, with the residential neighborhood.

This, this is the rear of the property. Again, balconies, board and batten siding, and the north elevation, the same thing. This is a rendering, and know that when we do renderings like this it's really to show scale, form, and not necessarily the exact colors and, and features. For example, we show a solid fence here, and we may be doing a space fencing to let more air through. Yeah, but it gives you an idea that we are having a fence here. And, and another example is, is we're having an accessible walkway here as depicted on the site plan, but not, not depicted in, in this rendering. And again, the color, I'm going to be -- I'd like to pass out the

color board of the final color selection for each one of you.

So if you look at the top line of the rendition that you have, on the left hand side we'll start with the tile roof and, and we're going to go with medium-brown tile roof. And we've decided that the board and batten should be a lighter color so we're going to go with a light tan. And then the trims will be the medium brown; that is the fascia and, and this architectural feature that goes around, as well as the trellis. And then we have a couple of options for the, the bottom stucco area and that's to keep the, the same light tan as, as depicted on, on the rendering that you have. We're also considering a beige stucco to create a contrast, and the excessive creme, that, that's too far off, we're not going to go there. But they're basically earth colored tones and, and I guess whether we go with the light tan or the beige stucco down at the bottom should be acceptable.

The next slide, this is the rear of the building. This is the covered parking. This, this resembles the pond that, that's there now. And then, again, here's the fencing. Again, we may go with space fencing to let more ventilation in. And then the roof will be -- the roof and the siding color will be as we passed out to you.

This is an aerial view of the project. This is the building right here. There's open area here, open area around here, and it kind of gives you the scale of, of the project with relationship to the, to the surrounding areas. Do you have any questions on the architectural features at this point? We'll bring the landscape design.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you.

Mr. Russel Gushi: Aloha and good morning. My name is Russel Gushi, I'm the project landscape architect. As was mentioned earlier, on the site plan, most of the property is encompassed with the parking and the building structure. The remaining landscape area is comprised of two major elements. One is the retention pond that already exists there. It's a pond that . . . (inaudible) . . . has water throughout the year. So besides just being a retention depressed area, it's also, it can be a visual amenity. Part of the landscaping or what we're going to try and accomplish here is to enhance and embellish that pond with plantings which more likely being Hawaiian native plants, or . . . (inaudible) . . . type plant, or marshy plants that will soften the edge of the pond, and make it a little bit more visually attractive.

We're also looking at planting a clusters of ponds in the areas where we do have space to also to embellish the appearance of the pond, as well as to break up the lineal roof line of the building which runs pretty this entire land here. That way it won't be as monotonous, but it will be broken up in to sections. The remaining of the landscape areas is kind of limited. It's more, as you can see, more limited and more around the perimeter. And, these areas will be used to satisfy the County off-street parking requirements, which would be shade trees, and the ratio of one tree per five stalls, and as evenly distributed as possible. And also planting hedges in front of the fence to, again, soften the appearance of the fence from the property. As the architect, Ron, mentioned along the street side, where there is a trellis, we'll be planting flowering vines to soften the appearance of the building from that side of the building.

As far as irrigation, we're going to try to utilize drip irrigation as much as possible, and plant drought tolerant plants, Hawaiian native plants wherever reasonable, and install mulching instead of ground cover wherever it makes a good sense as well. Any landscape related questions at this point? Yes.

Ms. Feeter: I'm curious about the retention pond.

Mr. Gushi: Okay.

Ms. Feeter: You say there's usually water?

Mr. Gushi: Yeah, it's usually all year round. Part of it I don't think is the result of -- and I'm just guessing at this -- I don't think it's a result of constant runoff, but I think there's a high water table. So it's likely brackish water, and it's not clear like a swimming pool. It's kind of murky.

Mr. Bowlus: I have a thought on that. If, if it's to be a retention pond, how does it serve that function if it's already filled with water?

Mr. Gushi: Well, it's not full of water. It has water, and I think it's the, the -- and I'm not an engineer -- but I'm assuming that the pond was designed to retain the anticipated and calculated amount of runoff that would be generated from this project construction. And I'm assuming that they had already taken into consideration the high water table.

Mr. Bowlus: Okay. How low is it compared to the surface of the land?

Mr. Gushi: You know, I really don't know. I'm just looking -- I'm just basing on the visual site reviews that --

Mr. Bowlus: Thank you.

Mr. Gushi: The project engineer would be able to answer that.

Mr. Dominic Rosario: My name is Dominic Rosario. I'm the civil engineer of the project. And, yes, there will be water throughout the year, but it will have enough room to actually for the retention as well. So it would be low, but then it will -- it could fill up another three feet or so. It should get ample storage capacity.

Mr. Conrad: And, a question. So the, the Corp of Engineers when they engineered this thing, they engineered it for hard surfacing as opposed to the porous land that's there now. Do you know the answer to that?

Mr. Rosario: Right. Well, when they first did it, it was because for a development such as this, similar to this.

Mr. Conrad: Okay. So it was pre-engineered for all the hard surfacing, the roof, and the parking

lot.

Mr. Rosario: Correct.

Mr. Conrad: Alright, thank you.

Mr. Esmeralda: Thank you. So again the applicant is requesting the Board's review and recommendation of this project to the Maui Planning Commission. And that concludes our presentation. Thank you for your time, and again, we're here to answer any questions you may have.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you very much. So I'm going to go around and start with you David, do you have any questions or comments?

Mr. David Green: No. I don't really have any questions, but I must admit this, this looks like 50 shade of beige. And I like the color scheme of what you had earlier, little more contrast, personally.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you David. Robert?

Mr. Bowlus: I agree. And basically that's really my only comment, and why I like to original scheme better, the dark, the two layers of the dark and the light broke down the massing. Right now it looks so big and even though it's the same building, but one beige color. By stripping it as you did with the dark color on top I think it breaks the mass down considerably.

One other, one other comment, if I could. On your, on your rendering exhibit whatever -- it's not called out -- but I love the idea of the, of the . . . (inaudible) . . . in the front, a place to sit and have the table and chairs. But Kihei gets plenty hot, and it looks like you've got stripped shadows on the building implying that there's no roof over that. Is it, is it just an open trellis?

Mr. Agor: We're going to be planting vines over it to create shade.

Mr. Bowlus: Oh, vines and greenery over the top.

Mr. Agor: Yeah. Yeah. Instead of a hard surface.

Mr. Bowlus: Okay, for shade. Okay, good. Thank you.

Mr. Agor: And then we will revert back to the original color.

Mr. Conrad: Robert?

Mr. Robert Spilker: I just had an observation. There's 17 offices here, and I'm assuming -- and this may be a bad assumption -- there be a minimum two people per office. That fills up 34 people, and if they drive, it leaves six open parking spots, two of which are handicap for

customers. And I'm assuming these people are not just sitting . . . (inaudible). . . they're expecting customers to come. And I do not think looking at the plan there convenient parking if the lot fills. It's just an observation.

Mr. Esmeralda: Thank you for that. We'll take that into consideration.

Mr. Conrad: Frances, do you have anything?

Ms. Feeter: Well, I agree about the color. I like the other color better.

Mr. Esmeralda: Thank you.

Mr. Conrad: That's my only comment as well. I like the original coloring better. I would consider on the lower level having it less bright white just a little bit. Like a beige and green would look really nice in my opinion so thank you.

Mr. Esmeralda: Thank you.

Mr. Conrad: Anyone would like to make a motion?

Mr. Bowlus: I move to accept the proposal as proposed and amended.

Ms. Feeter: Second.

Mr. Conrad: My only comment is be sure that the parking has, you know, all of the County's guidelines. I believe it has or Paul would have presented to us, but if you would just take a second look at that. And with that I'd like to see a raise of hands for all in favor? Motion passes. Thank you.

Mr. Esmeralda: Thank you very much.

It was moved by Mr. Robert Bowlus, seconded by Ms. Frances Feeter, then unanimously

VOTED: to accept the proposal as proposed and amended.

*(Assenting: R. Bowlus, H. Conrad, F. Feeter, D. Green, R. Spilker
Excused: D. Callinicos, R. Phillips, D. Sereda, F. van Ammers)*

Mr. Conrad: Would you all like your packets back?

- 2. MR. WILLIAM SPENCE, Planning Director requesting comments on the design plans relative to the adopted Makawao-Pukalani-Kula Country Town Business Design Guidelines on the Country Town Business review**

application from MR. BENJAMIN LEE of CLIFFORD PLANNING & ARCHITECTURE in order to construct the Daniel K. Inouye Solar Telescope Remote Operations Building, a 2-story remote operations commercial building (approximately 14,000 sf) which includes office spaces, labs, data processing rooms & surface parking at 22 Ohia Ku Street, TMK: 2-3-066: 017, Kulamalu, Pukalani, Island of Maui. (CTB 2015/0008) (Ryan Quigless)

The Board may provide its comments on the proposed project design to the Planning Director relative to the Makawao-Pukalani-Kula Country Town Design Guidelines.

Mr. Conrad: Good morning.

Mr. Ryan Quigless: Good morning. My name is Ryan Quigless, staff planner, with the Maui County Planning Department. This morning, as outlined in the agenda, we're here to listen to comments on the applicant's request to deviate from the Makawao, Pukalani, and Kula Country Town Design Guidelines, and Kulamalu Design Guidelines in two areas. The first area is the use of aluminum doors instead of wood doors, and the second area is the use of vinyl window frames instead of wood window frames.

The Department would like to point out that neighboring building, the Institute for Astronomy, received support from the UDRB to deviate from the design guidelines to allow for a metal roll up door, and applied muntins as opposed to true muntins. The Board in that instance considered a research building to be a unique project because of its private research facility where the public is not encouraged to visit. So at this time I'd like to turn to the applicant to provide a power point presentation for your review.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you.

Mr. Ben Lee: Good morning Chair Conrad and members of the Board, my name is Ben Lee. I'm one of the principals of Clifford Planning and Architecture, and I'm also the project architect for the Daniel K. Inouye Institute Telescope Project (DKIST). This is a remote operations facility. It's basically data processing. As Ryan mentioned we are only asking for some exemptions from the design guidelines for use of vinyl windows and also aluminum entrance doors, and primarily because of durability, as well as for security reasons for the entry.

Our project is located on Aapueo Parkway and Ohia Ku Street, and it's a little red line that you see here. Here we go. It's about 1.44 acres from the corner of Ohia Ku and Ohia - Ohia Ku and Aapueo Parkway. Next slide. There it is again. The Long's Drugs store is right, just to kind of give you kind of a reference point in Kula. Next please. There's some beautiful views of the, of the site, and then this is the Institute for Astronomy, I guess, on the mauka side. Haleakala profile is a little covered by the clouds, and I think you can see West Maui on that side. Kamehameha Schools is to the left. Next slide. It's relatively steep at this one corner, but there is a flat portion of the site that we're proposing the project. This is the 1.44 acres. This portion right here is fairly steep. It's a two-story building it's, it's been . . . (inaudible) . . . through the

Kulamalu Business Town Design Guidelines, which is very, very similar to the Pukalani-Kula Design Guidelines that the County has. And it has their approval on use of the vinyl windows as well as aluminum doors, which is only one door, which is the front door right here.

We need to touch a little about parking. 28 parking stalls are required by the Code. We're providing about 40 plus stalls and two loading zones, and of course, two ADA stalls. Next slide. We do have a landscape plan. I won't go into details of that. Brownlie & Lee from Oahu is the landscape architect. Next. As I said, it's a two-story building. There's three colors that are shown here. It's kind of a, kind of light yellow. But these are offices on the ground floor. The entrance is here, around a central tree. ADA access ramp from the street. And then the purple areas are basically maintenance and shop, and also the storage. The green area is basically kind of a break room. It does have an outdoor area. The site plan will show that. And then this is, loading zone is back here.

Next slide, the second floor is basically offices, open office work stations, and offices around the perimeter, and the data center and remote operation crew, remote operations control room. Next slide. It's wood frame construction. We think it's kind of neat. Exposed wood truss. Exposed steel truss and wood truss. Exterior is steel frame and metal stud construction. It does have a metal roof and a skylight in the center area which basically provides a lot of natural daylight for the open office area.

Next slide. So this is the revised version. We did go through a couple of reviews at the Kulamalu Business Town Design Guidelines. Originally as you see in the model -- and we do have a model here for you to look at -- it did have a gable roof, and we changed that to a hip roof. We did put windows with muntins, and very consistent with their design guidelines. Exterior material is what they call EFAS, it's an exterior insulated surface finish which is a very light weight exterior finish material. Color range is basically earth-toned, a green metal roof. We do have a 108 PV panels, and the skylight is up here, kind of featuring the open truss. Next slide. Just a roof plan, underneath PV panels, hip roof design. Next. This is an old rendering of the project, showing the gable roof, and we did take out some of the more modern features, quote on quote, and basically the original design, the original concept pretty much maintains the same. It will be two colors and probably a stone base, maybe a 24, 36 inch level. Next. Another rendering, just from the downhill side of the project.

Next. This is the Institute For Astronomy at the University of Hawaii. I just want to kind of point out some of their vinyl windows that they have, kind of next door. There's a vacant lot between the Inouye Operations Center and the University of Hawaii building. Next. This is just a slide of the model that I said. We changed and modified the design in compliance with the Kulamalu Business District.

Next. This is our exterior palette. I have those two boards here; I can pass those around. What we're looking at is an aluminum window. I mean an aluminum window and also -- I'm sorry, a vinyl window and an aluminum doors. We looked at the possibility of doing wood, but I don't think it will just stand up to the weather and, and the -- I guess the harsh weather and the elements of Kula. And the aluminum front door basically provides the security access that's

required by our client.

Next. I want to show you a couple of projects in the neighborhood. Of course, this is the Institute for Astronomy. Next slide. This is Kulamalu Village. Actually Jeanine . . . (inaudible) . . . was the architect for this project as well. It's across the way from, from the site. And the next project is Long's Drugs store which we were the architects for this project as well. So there is some precedent for using vinyl windows. We are using a beige color, kind of an earth-toned color, rather than the white framed windows. And we have samples of that here as well.

I think that concludes the presentation. I have Heather Marshall here and also Mark Warner from DKIST to explain maybe, if you had questions about the operations of the facility. Just as a side note, I was here maybe earlier this year on the Kulamalu Affordable Housing Project. It was one of the Mayor's project which is right across the street from this project. And we are using vinyl windows in the earth-toned color as well as vinyl fencing. It's a wood textured vinyl fencing, and you know, some of the vinyl products really look, you know, very much like wood these days. So I'd be glad to answer any questions if you have.

Mr. Green: How many people do you anticipate would be working here on a daily basis?

Ms. Heather Marshall: The staffing level –

Mr. Conrad: Could you state your name please?

Ms. Marshall: Excuse me. My name is Heather Marshall. I'm an engineer with the National Solar Observatory. The staffing level is expected to be something on the order of 30 people, so we would have the parking for them as well as some fleet vehicles for observers and scientists and engineers and technicians going to the summit.

Mr. Bowlus: I have no comments.

Ms. Spilker: I have no comments.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you.

Mr. Lee: I'd be glad to pass around the color boards if you'd like.

Mr. Conrad: Would you like to see that? Yeah, that would be fine.

Mr. Lee: And also this is kind of the color range for the vinyl windows, and also for the aluminum doors which I think is very compatible and complimentary to the color palette that we've selected.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you.

Mr. Lee: Just as a side bar, my former life I was the Managing Director of the City and County

of Honolulu.

Mr. Conrad: Alright. Thank you. So I'm not sure in this case whether we should have two motions, separately, to accept or not to --. Oh, we have public testimony if you guys have concluded your presentation. Yes, we have one member of the community who would like to make a public statement. Trinetta? Trinetta, just a couple of things. One is that your testimony is limited to three minutes, and also this Board is here explicitly just on the design aspects of it, and so we're not a political body in any way. Thank you.

Ms. Trinetta Furtado: Aloha and good morning Chair and other members, Board members of this Board here. My name is Trinetta Furtado and I currently live in Hamakua Loa District in Haiku. I have been involved with many things regarding Haleakala, and this the reason why I strongly urge you to not accept this application. The reason most being that the project is still in litigation with Kilokilo, Haleakala and the Supreme Court, and the judges have yet to render a decision. And it is, as we've seen with the recent Mauna Kea case and its ruling in the Supreme Court all is not necessarily a done deal when it comes to the UH stewardship of the mauna. If you or I were in litigation neither of us would be and engaged in something contrary to the process, we'd be reprimanded for it. So I do caution you, please thread carefully here Board members. As a decision to come from the Supreme Court may have long lasting effects and implications that impacts the construction of this particular building as well as the . . . (inaudible) . . . And I believe that the County should not be wasting its time entertaining such an application for a private building that may be completely unnecessary. I thank you for your time this morning and mahalo nui.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you Trinetta. So now I'm going to ask for a motion...to accept or deny the entire process based on Trinetta's testimony and then secondly I think we should probably look at the windows and the doors separately if we're going to entertain motions on that as well.

Mr. Bowlus: So should we have our discussion first or we're just going to entertain a motion?

Mr. Conrad: No, we can definitely have a discussion. Anybody have anything to say?

Mr. Bowlus: Actually, I love the way the building looks. I love colors. I have no problems with the vinyl or the aluminum door.

Ms. Feeter: Yeah. I agree. I think vinyl is the way to go.

Mr. Bowlus: Right.

Mr. Spilker: . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Green: Yeah, I agree.

Mr. Conrad: So it looks like we're entertaining a motion to accept the windows and doors, and this project as proposed and send our recommendations on to the County Council that if the

building is built that we're recommending it be built as presented.

Mr. Bowlus: So move.

Ms. Feeter: Second.

Mr. Conrad: All in favor? Motion passes. Thank you. Thank you for your time.

It was moved by Mr. Robert Bowlus, seconded by Ms. Frances Feeter, then unanimously

VOTED: to accept the project as proposed and send recommendations on to the County Council that building be built as presented.

*(Assenting: R. Bowlus, H. Conrad, F. Feeter, D. Green, R. Spilker
Excused: D. Callinicos, R. Phillips, D. Sereda, F. van Ammers)*

Mr. Lee: Thank you Chair and members of the Board. It's a pleasure always to be here.

3. **MR. WILLIAM SPENCE, Planning Director requesting comments on the design plans relative to the adopted Molokai Country Town Business Design Guidelines on the Country Town Business review application from MR. LUIGI MANERA on behalf of MR. JERALD JOHNSON for the Paddlers Solar Panel Structure consisting of the construction of raised solar panel array supporting structures above the parking lot on the west side of the existing building located at 60 Kamehameha V Highway, TMK: 5-3-001: 060, Kaunakakai, Island of Molokai. (Sybil Lopez)**

The Board may provide its comments on the proposed project design to the Planning Director relative to the Molokai Country Town Design Guidelines.

Ms. Sybil Lopez: Good morning. I'm staff planner Sybil Lopez. On behalf of the project that's on your agenda for...*(Staff Planner Sybil Lopez read the above project description into the record.)* Stand before you today, pursuant to Chapter 12-305-7, under the review process of the Country Town Business Guidelines that applications for new or reconstructed structures or renovations to existing structures involving 50% or more of each exterior elevation of the structure shall be processed as follows: that upon receipt of an application, the Director shall forward the application to the Maui County Urban Design Review Board for review and recommendations at its next available meeting date. So that is why we are here today.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you Sybil.

Ms. Lopez: So unfortunately the applicant or the owner wasn't able to make it today. So on behalf of the -- Luigi Manera, the consultant, he prepared a power point so that I'll be going through the power point presentation with you today.

So the Paddlers solar structure, this is who we are looking at; the applicant, the consultant, the engineer, and the location. The project area is 4,175 square feet. It's in the Urban State Land Use District. It's under the Business Commercial under the Molokai Community Plan. It is zoned as the BCT, or Business County Town of Kaunakakai. And it is in the special management area. So the flood zone is AE. The base flood elevation is seven to eight feet.

So the overview of the proposed project. The subject property is an inland parcel located just east out of downtown Kaunakakai, on Kamehameha V Highway, along the south central coast of Molokai. The property's north boarder has street access from and is fronting Kamehameha V Highway. Proposed improvements on the 38,895 square foot parcel of land includes the construction of a steel structure with roof made out of solar panels above 4,178 square feet of the eastern portion of the west parking lot. This would be Molokai's first, I would say, carport made out of solar panels. The proposed improvement have been designed utilizing the guidelines for the Country Town Business District of Kaunakakai to reflect the aesthetic character of the existing, neighboring buildings, and blend in with the surrounding neighborhood. So it actually sits outside of our, the Kaunakakai town, but it does -- you have to pass through on our main highway which is the Kamehameha V Highway. So all onsite infrastructure is existing and in place.

So for site 1.0 in our Kaunakakai Design Guidelines, under the building setbacks -- so Kamehameha V Highway has a minimum 20 foot building setback. Side and rear yard building setbacks may vary. So you see the Kamehameha V road, that's Hoolehua, so that would be going towards the airport. Kamehameha V going that way, going towards east end. So the solar -- the proposed structure is 20 feet setback away from that main highway.

1.B, side and rear yard building setbacks. So on the opposite end, right next to that is -- they're all vacant land, yeah, so there's vacant towards the east and vacant towards the south, so that setback is 12 feet.

So off-street parking, or 1.3 in our design guidelines. Locate off-street parking to the rear or along the side of the buildings except for the lots fronting the makai side of Kamehameha V Highway. Provide parking and define circulation for disabled persons within parking lots. Screen parking lots with landscape planting as follows. I'll skip to D. Provide a minimum two feet wide planting buffer along the side and rear yard or parking lots, and a minimum four foot planting buffer along streets fronting parking lots. Comply with requirements of the County off-street parking, MCC Chapter 19.36A. So 1.3...so this is pretty unique because it did come before you back in 2010 regarding the, the parking. So what it was recommended that they do 25% of the parking on that area would be of gravel, and the 75% would be paved. So the paved road would be towards the...the...highway side, and 25% of the unpaved would be towards the south side. Where they're pointing that is where the...handicap is located, and there's also additional handicap on the right side of the building. Yeah, just like that.

The loading zone is between the, the two existing buildings. There we go. So that's the loading zone. And the requirement for loading zone clearance would be 14 feet. So the structure would be up, 14 feet up. So as you can see there are...these trees. So these are monkey pod trees. We've got false Kaimani right here, and we've got the Rainbow trees over here on this side. So because of the original landscaping plan, they had to come in and update the landscaping plan to accommodate the proposed structure. So the recommendation, the department's recommendation was to have the landscaping around the perimeter to meet the 19.36A. And the two foot wide planting buffer along the side and rear yard of parking lots. And a minimum of four feet planting buffer along streets fronting the parking lot. The loading zone.

Okay. So this is out of the design guidelines, 1.4, site landscape planting, landscape planting. So we can go over that. So incorporate trees, shrubs and ground cover wherever possible. So this is on this end where the proposed structure is located. Root barriers shall be used for all tree plantings and be a minimum two feet deep. So these are the existing; one, two, three and all along here around this perimeter. This is a new monkey pod that we'll be planting with the root barriers being installed as well.

So we are looking at it on the south side, so behind this picture taken, is a vacant property, and we're looking at the Kamehameha V Highway. So it's unpaved right now of gravel, and you can see the monkey pods on the left side. And so on the right side where the car is that's where the location would be for the proposed structure in this area. So to meet 1.4C, to provide and maintain an automatic irrigation system for site landscape planting; and 1.4D, to select the plants that are appropriate in size.

The Department is aware of what the monkey pod roots can do, so we are working with the applicant to accommodate 1.4D. And 1.4E, to the extent practicable, preserve, impact or relocate onsite all existing healthy and mature canopy trees. And just to kind of give you an overview on what's around, like I said there's a vacant, vacant property on the left and to the south is all vacant. It does --. So we have Kamehameha V on the top, and on that side we have Mohala Street. So if you know the area there's abundant monkey pod, coconut trees around that area. So this is overlooking, coming from -- on Kamehameha V Highway you can see Mohala Street as you turn in, and I'm coming from the east side going west, so this would be the front entrance of the Paddlers Inn. So this is the opposite side of where the proposed structure will. So you can see on that end they do have a lot of shrubs, trees, that, that sits along side the perimeter of the property itself.

So 3.0, Architecture in Kaunakakai. The style and character of new project shall, should relate to the following qualities of the existing town. The height and mass, limit building heights to two-story, maximum of 30 feet. So this is a two-story building. The existing building does have a two-story, height 30 feet; the 13 feet, 6-inch top of structure. And this is the same existing building, I think, they came in back in 2012 with the antenna, the telecommunication antenna, so this would hold the only -- well, not hold, but facility within that town, within Kaunakakai town, where the majority of the population is located.

So 3.5, roof and canopy, encourage simple shapes and light weight form. So this is the solar

structure itself. So this on top will be where the panels are, and the panels are proposed to be laid flat. 3.10, the color. Minimize the uses of several different colors, three colors maximum, soften muted colors are encouraged. Utilize matte or egg shell finish. Non gloss or non glare. Be compatible with adjacent buildings and the business district along Ala Malama Street. Because it's not within the Ala Malama Street, it is outside, the design guidelines would want it to be compatible with that whole area, the district. So three colors maximum that they choose would be the same colors that is on the existing building. So the canopy will be, will be solar panels, dark gray in color, and they'll use the exact same as the existing...that, which would be compliant with 3.10.

So identification of building materials. So the proposed structure will be steel painted, matted dark brown to match existing building trim. The canopy will be solar panels. Signage and graphics, there will be no new signage or graphics; and the color scheme of the steel structure will be painted matted dark brown to match existing building trim. Just like that. And the description that you have also within your packet this talks about -- the next few slides would just talk about the panels itself. The durability, what type of panel it is, and what it holds as far as wattage. Which they'll be using. And the next one we'll be talking about the tracking system, to roof track, that they'll be using, the installation, and what type of materials that they'll be using with this structure. And, it's in your packet.

So like we said the new proposed structure will be above half of the parking lot on the west side. And they do have existing panels on, on this building. This is the roof, and the second building. So they need additional building -- additional panels in order to supply what it is now at the restaurant. So we have restaurants -- the Paddler's Inn restaurant, and upstairs you've got office and retail; and it's along side with this, the second building. And it's just showing you the racking system, again, and how it's gonna be installed and the wiring. And the electrical conduit would be...it would be attached to the existing, which is located on this side of the building. So because there's already existing, all the electrical conduit will run to the same panel, the same board.

Again, the solar structure location. More on the location. Sorry, it was about 10:30, 11:00 a.m. so you can see how the shadow goes right into that area. Mahalo for your time. You guys have any questions?

Mr. Conrad: Thank you.

Ms. Lopez: You're welcome.

Mr. Bowlus: I have no questions.

Mr. Green: I think it's good thing. Solar is always pretty good, and it looks like it complies all the requirements.

Ms. Feeter: Great idea. Perfect location.

Ms. Lopez: Just to let you guys know that they do have an SMA application open. So after going in front of UDRB, the next step is to go in front of the Planning Commission with both, with this SMA.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you. So can I see a motion to accept this as presented?

Mr. Green: So move.

Mr. Bowlus: Second.

Mr. Conrad: Seconded by Robert. All in favor? The motion passes.

It was moved by Mr. David Green, seconded by Mr. Robert Bowlus, then unanimously

VOTED: to accept the project as presented.

(Assenting: R. Bowlus, H. Conrad, F. Feeter, D. Green, R. Spilker

Excused: D. Callinicos, R. Phillips, D. Sereda, F. van Ammers)

Ms. Lopez: Thank you so much for your time. Mahalo.

Mr. Conrad: Thank you.

E. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

1. Reports from members who attended the 2015 Hawaii Congress of Planning Officials (HCPO) Conference, October 14-16, 2015 at the Hawaii Convention Center, Honolulu, Hawaii (deferred from the November 3, 2015 meeting)

Mr. Clayton Yoshida: Yes, Mr. Chairman, members of the Board, the first item is the report from the members who attended the Hawaii Congress of Planning Officials Conference in October on Oahu at the Hawaii Convention Center. This was deferred from the last meeting because of the length of the meeting. I guess Fiona is not here, but Frances is here.

Ms. Feeter: You just want me to say a few words? This is, this is the booklet we got, Island Futures and you can see there were lots going on. The main trust that I could see was technological. Let me just kind of pass some of this stuff over. I was -- I'm a little technologically challenged myself, but the first speaker was this guy from, was it New Jersey? Anyway...Baltimore. And they do an extensive planning with this technology -- well I guess people that know more about than I do. You can map out the reason you want it, you can show the heights of buildings, and you know, the whole thing that they do technologically when somebody comes in and applies something, they can actually see what it would look like on that site, and decide whether it fits and so forth. And so the whole, it seemed to me the whole trust of this conference was how to become technologically savvy in using planning in those tools

for planning because there was a lot, a lot on that. And I really enjoyed this David Early. He was from southern California, and he's done a lot of work with the cities in California. I think even in Honolulu, he said, and he was a really good speaker. Probably the best speaker of the whole event was Robbie Alm. I don't know if you know who he is. He was Vice-President of Hawaiian Electric and he has been very active politically. He's a tremendous speaker. Actually he was using Mario --. Not Mario. Who's our football player? From Hawaii?

Mr. Green: Marcus Mariota.

Ms. Feeter: Marcus Mariota. His daughter was good friends with Marcus so they -- he used a lot of examples of . . . (inaudible) . . . and so forth and he was an excellent speaker. But one thing that I got something out of, for the lay person, Kauai has quite -- he had one thing on hazard, on what to do with hazards and tsunamis and so forth, and Kauai has quite a program to educate their citizens. They actually have what is kind of a fair. I would call it a disaster fair. But they have, they have all kinds of things going on to educate people about what to do in an emergency, and I thought that was a really good thing.

And well I went to a couple of seminars that Sam Aruch. I don't know if you know Sam. He's here on, on Maui. But he was with the Nature Conservancy in Molokai so I knew him, and so I went. And he had a company, Natural Resource Data Solutions, that does a lot to do with this planning and development using technology and so forth. And there's also one on sustainability that was good. But anyway, I don't, I don't want to bore you too much. But I, I did get a lot out of it. There was a lot of that was over my head because, because, I'm, just as I say, I'm technologically challenged. But it was interesting. Thank you for sending me.

Mr. Conrad: Alright.

2. Status of the Board vacancy.

Mr. Yoshida: Okay, thank you Frances. Regarding the Board vacancy, the Department has nothing new to report. However, we would like to remind the members that if you know of someone who would be good to serve on the Board, this Board, probably, you know, they should fill in an application form and submit it to the Mayor's Office. Again, the Mayor will be submitting nominees. Well, we're going to go through a change over again in March/April, so some of the member's terms will end in March, and we'll get new members in April. But hopefully if they can find people to fill the vacancies. But this is the month to probably apply so that they will get the full consideration from the Mayor's Office. So if you know of people who are interested and would be good to serve on this Board, I guess the applications are online, and can be submitted to the Mayor's Office.

Mr. Gary Mukai: Clayton, I have a question. You know when it comes to filling vacancies on this Board, because, you know, this Board has, I guess, requirements as far as, you know, the discipline that you come from, and geographic area, like this vacancy that we have now, is, is there a restriction on --? In other words, does the person have to be an architect or no need

to be? Are you looking to fill a Molokai?

Mr. Yoshida: Yeah, I think for the vacancy that we have now we wanted someone with more of an engineering background. Because we have several people with architecture backgrounds, like Bob and Hunton. We have David Sereda with Chris Hart & Partners who has a landscape architectural background. We have our geographical requirements covered with David Green from Lanai, and Frances from Molokai. So we thought if we could get another engineer onboard then, you know, we'd have the different disciplines sort of speak. We have architecture, landscape architect, engineering represented. Of course, we have alternate members who are, have engineering backgrounds. We're looking for a regular member.

Mr. Conrad: Okay.

3. Agenda items for the January 5, 2016 meeting.

Mr. Yoshida: Okay, and then this is the last meeting for calendar year 2015 for the Board. We'd like to wish all of you happy holiday season. Our next meeting is scheduled for January 5th, 2016; first Tuesday in January. We don't have any solid agenda items right now, but hopefully in the next four weeks we'll probably get something together. But, again, we thank you for your service to the community throughout the year 2015. It was quite a challenging year with all those sign variances. . . (inaudible) . . . and some developments in controversial areas like the Walgreen's in Kihei, the Walgreen's store in Kihei, but thank you for your work. That's all we have to report Mr. Chair.

F. NEXT MEETING DATE: January 5, 2016

G. ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Conrad: Alright. Thank you very Clayton, and happy holidays to you and your staff. Meeting's adjourned.

There being no further business brought forward to the Board, the UDRB meeting was adjourned at approximately 11:15 a.m.

Respectfully submitted by,

LEILANI A. RAMORAN-QUEMADO
Secretary to Boards and Commissions II

RECORD OF ATTENDANCE:

PRESENT:

Robert Bowlus
Hunton Conrad, Chair
Frances Feeter
David Green
Robert Spilker (alternate)

EXCUSED:

Demetrios Callinicos
Raymond Phillips
David Sereda
Fiona van Ammers

OTHERS:

Clayton Yoshida, Planning Program Administrator, Current Planning Division
Paul Fasi, Staff Planner
Ryan Quigless, Staff Planner
Sybil Lopez, Staff Planner
Gary Murai, Deputy Corporation Counsel