

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE
Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

March 31, 2016

Council Chamber

CONVENE: 9:06 a.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Riki Hokama, Chair (in 1:35 p.m.)
Councilmember Mike White, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Gladys C. Baisa, Member
Councilmember Robert Carroll, Member
Councilmember Elle Cochran, Member
Councilmember Don Couch, Member
Councilmember Stacy Crivello, Member
Councilmember Don S. Guzman, Member (in 9:15 a.m.)

EXCUSED: Councilmember Michael P. Victorino, Member

STAFF: Michele Yoshimura, Legislative Analyst
Steve Selee, Legislative Analyst
Shelly Espeleta, Legislative Analyst
Yvette Bouthillier, Committee Secretary

Ella Alcon, Council Aide, Molokai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

Dawn Lono, Council Aide, Hana Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

ADMIN.: Sananda Baz, Budget Director, Office of the Mayor
William Spence, Director, Department of Planning
Michele McLean, Deputy Director, Department of Planning
Jacalyn Takakura, Administrative Officer, Department of Planning
Patrick K. Wong, Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel
Edward S. Kushi, First Deputy, Department of the Corporation Counsel
Jeffrey A. Murray, Fire Chief, Department of Fire and Public Safety
Louis Romero, Battalion Chief, Department of Fire and Public Safety
Cindy Kagoshima, Business Administrator I, Department of Fire and Public Safety
Jeffrey T. Ueoka, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

Seated in the audience:

John Rapacz, Planning Program Administrator, Zoning Administration and Enforcement Division, Department of Planning

Clayton Yoshida, Planning Program Administrator, Department of Planning

Kathleen Aoki, Administrative Planning Officer, Department of Planning

Pamela Eaton, Planning Program Administrator, Department of Planning

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

Valeriano Martin, Assistant Fire Chief, Department of Fire and Public Safety

OTHERS: Richard Copley, Vice-President, Royal Kahana Resort
Lawrence Michaels
Ian Horswill
Kiumars Siah
Thomas Cook, Vice-Chair, Construction Industry of Maui
Jeff Brockman, Manager, Pohailani Maui
Others (5)

Milton Yoshimoto, Project Manager, US Army Corps of Engineers, Civil and
Public Works Branch, Honolulu District

PRESS: Akaku: Maui Community Television, Inc.

**ITEM 1: PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR 2017 BUDGET FOR THE COUNTY
OF MAUI (CC 16-29)**

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: . . .(*gavel*). . . Will this meeting of the Budget and Finance Committee please come to order. This morning I'd like to welcome Members. Mr. Carroll.

COUNCILMEMBER CARROLL: Good morning, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Good morning. Ms. Baisa.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Good morning, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Good morning. Ms. Cochran.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Good morning, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Mr. Couch.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Good morning, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Good morning. And Ms. Crivello.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Good morning, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Good morning. And joining us shortly will be Members Guzman and Hokama a little bit later, and excused today will be Mr. Victorino. So with that, Members, without objection, we'll open public testimony.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: I'd like to call the first testifier, Richard Copley. Please come down.

. . .BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

MR. COPLEY: Is this on? Can you hear me?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yes. Please proceed.

MR. COPLEY: Mr. Chairman and distinguished Members of the Budget and Finance Committee, good morning. My name is Richard Copley, I'm the Vice President of the Royal Kahana Association of Apartment Owners. To begin with on behalf of the owners at the Royal Kanaha Resort, we'd like to say that we are very appreciative of the County's willingness to match funds raised by the Royal Kahana so that we can now work together with the firm of Moffatt & Nichol to begin a sand source survey, a small but very important step towards finding a community-based solution to the chronic beach erosion issues that face nine resorts in the Kahana Bay community. For the past several years, it's become apparent to all of us that beachfront erosion in the West Maui area is accelerating at an alarming rate. Whether we attribute this to global warming, a rise in mean sea level, or El Niño, it is a problem we are faced with and a problem we must collectively find solutions for. While there are others here today that have the knowledge and expertise to discuss the issues as they relate to Kahana Bay in its entirety, I am here to share the effects that chronic beach erosion has had on our resort, a 236-unit condominium complex located beachfront on Kahana Bay. We are situated in what could be called an erosion hotspot, and for many years we've worked with the County to develop an acceptable plan that would protect our property from further erosion and at the same time a plan that is sensitive to the environmental needs of the entire bay. Since last fall, our association has spent nearly a half a million dollars to protect our property from further erosion, and yet last month, we watched as north swells washed away our beach causing for the first time in the 40-year history of the Royal Kahana, damage to our adjacent pool deck and other structures. Over the past six months, the Planning Department has partnered with the Army Corps of Engineers, Honolulu District who is here today to understand the coastal erosion problems faced by the nine condo complexes I referred to earlier in Kahana Bay. The conclusion of the Corps of Engineers' early study is that there's a Federal interest in protecting the condos and potentially restoring the shoreline. I am here today to support the Council funding to continue the partnership with the Army Corps of Engineers. And the Planning Department will explain later in more detail. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you very much, Mr. Copley. Members, any questions for the testifier? Seeing none, thank you for your, for sharing your views this morning. Our next testifier is Lawrence Michaels.

MR. MICHAELS: Mr. Chairman, Members of the Committee --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Good morning.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MICHAELS: --good morning. And I thank you for the opportunity of coming before you. My name is Lawrence Michaels, and like Mr. Copley addressed with respect to the Royal Kahana, I'm a full-time resident. I live here on Maui. And as such, I have been recruited by and act as a volunteer to the Army Corps of Engineers. The Corps has developed a recent study of which they developed as Mr. Copley was saying, both a national interest and a cost-benefit study to determine whether or not the Corps will participate in coming to a solution for Kahana Bay. Now the word solution is operative here, because we have expended enormous sums of money in terms of nine beachfront facilities. I am going to go back one step by letting you know that I'm standing here representing, if you will, or speaking on behalf of the interests of nine facilities in Kahana Beach, properties that are managed by Soleil Management, properties that are managed by Hawaiiana. We are coming together as a group similar to what Wayne Hedani has done at the Kaanapali Operators Association. So when we speak, we are speaking now as a voice of \$500 million worth of property. We are speaking with a voice of people who produce \$10 million of property tax. We're speaking of a voice that as I have seen in the Hawaii news...*The Maui News* that you anticipate to be \$23 million of the State taxes that will be coming back to the County as a result of the occupancy tax for hotels. I'd like to suggest to this Council that those numbers are at risk. You're calculating your budget predicated on those numbers, but those numbers are subject to significant diminishment if in fact we do not act and bring in the Corps now. We don't have a year, we don't have two years. If you saw what was happening to the Hololani, Royal Kahana, Valley Isle, it is an absolute travesty to think that our homes, my home is virtually being washed away. There are a thousand of your constituents that live in Kahana Beach. That's the approximate number of apartments and condos and timeshares that are there. They pay their fair share and we are in desperate need of help and we hope that you can provide it. Thank you all very much.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you, Mr. Michaels. Members, any questions for the testifier?

MR. MICHAELS: I'm sorry. Questions?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Seeing none, thank you very much for being here this morning. Our next testifier is Ian Horswill.

MR. HORSWILL: Good morning, Mr. Chair --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Good morning.

MR. HORSWILL: --and Councilmembers. Thank you for letting me testify this morning. I'm Ian Horswill, a civil engineer in beach restoration working in Maui. I'd like to thank the County of Maui and the County Council for approving the \$145,000 budget for the scoping study for the Kahana Bay erosion mitigation through regional beach nourishment study. This study is going to kick off this month, and those funds by the way were matched by the Royal Kahana with previous work that they did on offshore sand sources. The budget item for support today is the request for \$750,000 to match

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

the US Army Corps of Engineers dedicated Federal funds to complete the feasibility study being undertaken next month. This funding is critically important now. The Kahana Bay area has chronic beach erosion that is threatening the beaches and the properties of this area with nine condominium hotels in jeopardy. Sea level rise and increased storminess are causing this erosion which in turn threatens the loss of beaches for recreation, the habitat for endangered species including monk seals and hawkbay [*sic*] turtles, and the future loss of significant tax revenues with a diminishing tourist base. If the beaches aren't there, the tourists will not come. With 85 percent of the beaches in Maui significantly eroding, this County should not delay approving this \$750,000 budget item. This will provide for a big-picture solution that is time sensitive. This approval will lead to the potential Federal funding through the US Army Corps of Engineers of 5 million, up to \$5 million, to be fortunate enough to be considered as a focal project for the US Army Corps of Engineers. That should make this three-quarter of a million matching funding an immediate budget item this year. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Members, any questions for the testifier? I've got a question. It's not clear on the testimony form, are you with the Army Corps of Engineers?

MR. HORSWILL: No, I'm not.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay.

MR. HORSWILL: I'm with Rising Tide Engineering. We're a consulting firm.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. So you're a local engineer?

MR. HORSWILL: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. And do we have any or do you have any correspondence from the Corps that would support the statement of their interest in doing a feasibility study?

MR. HORSWILL: In fact there is a statement, and Mr. Milton Yoshida [*sic*] from the US Army Corps is here today to testify.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Oh okay. Okay.

MR. HORSWILL: He will be following the testifiers.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. He'll be a resource I guess. He hasn't signed up to testify, so. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Mr. Chair?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yes, Mr. Couch?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you. Thank you for being here. You're saying that this study is basically going to cost \$1.5 million. Is that a reasonable amount? 'Cause that's kind of high for a study it seems.

MR. HORSWILL: It depends on which study you're talking about. The initial study that is being done is \$145,000 with matching funds from the community of which to date that is based, the matching is based on the work that was done for the Royal Kahana. The follow-up study is \$750,000 to be...

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Which is going to be matched by the Army Corps of Engineers, is that what you're saying?

MR. HORSWILL: Is...that sounds right, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: So we've had one study, now this is the second study. I'm asking because you're an engineer and it seems like you've been through this before, and it just seems like it's a little bit higher than other studies we've seen. So in your experience as an engineer, does this seem to be in line with the cost to just do a study? I would see mitigation being that, the actual mitigation. But the study, that seems a little high.

MR. HORSWILL: Well, it's a very large area.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. Thank you, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, thank you. Any other questions for the testifier? Seeing none, thank you very much for being here this morning.

MR. HORSWILL: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Our next testifier is Kiumars Siah.

MR. SIAH: Good morning --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Good morning.

MR. SIAH: --to all. My name is Kiumars Siah. I'm a licensed structural engineer. I reside on Maui. I'm here to express my appreciation and support for the line item in the Mayor's budget that deals with the project that you, my, the gentlemen before me talked about. I'm not involved in that study. I have not been involved in the previous study either, but I think the concept makes sense to me. I'm familiar with the erosion on Maui at least for the last 13 years. I know the area. I think this is a subject that needs to be dealt with systematically, methodically, and in a larger scale...I know and I'm aware that the erosion has been looked at, at the local individual on each case. This to me doesn't make too much sense. We need to have an overall perspective of the problem and come up with something that makes sense and not only work for the one individual owner or a group, but overall we can apply it to the entire...not only on

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

Maui, the entire Hawaiian Islands. I do not know the specifics of the project. I hope that the project uses basically this approach. You come up with something that makes sense. That's all my hope. As I said, I'm not involved in the project. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you. Thank you very much, Mr. Siah. Members, any questions for Mr. Siah? Seeing none, thank you very much for being here this morning. Our next testifier is Thomas Cook.

MR. COOK: Good morning, County Councilmembers. Chair, Councilmembers, my name is Thomas Cook. I'm here on behalf of the Construction Industry of Maui, a nonprofit trade group affiliated with Maui Chamber of Commerce. I'm the Vice-Chair. I'm here to give testimony in support of the Planning Department's MAPPS project and letting you know that the...an investment has been made by the County to improve the permitting process. I believe that...I wanted to focus and emphasize the need to support the investment with the overtime for the personnel and also for the, a commitment by your body with regarding to the budget to make sure that this is implemented effectively. We desperately need in our community to be able to visualize and understand the entitlement and permitting process. Can you hear me all right? That right there is, there's 132 different types of permits. There's 77 of them the Planning Department deals with, 30 of them Department of Public Works, 20 the Fire Department, and 1 Parks and Recreation. This body is, has the duty and the responsibility to pass most of the ordinances and deal with a lot of the land use and budget...land use and permitting issues. It is, as you know, it's extremely complex, and our organization is working, we want to develop a, sort of an open-source informational tool working with the planners, architects, engineers, contractors, the government people, so that on a macro scale, we can demonstrate graphically the process. It literally would be this entire wall. I empathize with this body attempting to pass laws and even begin to grasp the complexity. I'm going to be a little harsh for a minute. Affordable housing, we don't have affordable housing because of this Chamber historically. We don't have affordable rentals because this Chamber historically. I'm not burdening...I'm not trying to be like adversarial, but the responsibility to be able to pass laws that are understandable and that are useable and track-able comes from here. And I've seen, you know, the Chamber quiz the Planning Department about transient vacation rentals and the rules and ordinances when the Chamber made the rules and ordinances, and they're asking them what the rules and ordinances are. So I don't want to deviate. Planning Department, it's a very dynamic group of talented people who need your support. I want to hold them accountable next year at this time. Time's up.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: You can provide a concluding couple of remarks.

MR. COOK: Okay. I would like us all to hold them, industry, and the Council accountable next year by measuring what progress we've made, and that way that we would measure that would be whether industry and government agree, wow, we've made some progress. It should be pretty obvious. So we need housing, we're dying. You can't get anything approved, and it's...we can do it. Thank you for the opportunity to

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

give testimony. I did not, I do not have written testimony. You have to look at on video, I'm saving paper.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: We believe in paperless to some degree. Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Thank you very much, Chair. And thank you, Tom, for being here this morning. I know how hard you've worked on affordable housing from the Maui Nui Housing Task Force. You made a statement and I just want to ask you to clarify. You can't get anything approved. You know we have tried really hard as a Council to approve a lot of affordable housing projects. We've changed a lot of...we've given a lot of exceptions and approved projects. So can you be a little bit more specific about why we can't get anything approved?

MR. COOK: Okay. Thank you, Councilmember Baisa. And that's, that was an over-generalization but it's accurate. Lack of certainty, to answer your question, lack of certainty in the process prevents people from building. I was tuned up recently, I thought that the market-price ratio and I was told, Tom, no, the market price, the ratio of affordable, all of that can work, what lacks is certainty. If someone's going to come and investment 30, 50, \$100 million into a real estate development and it's going to take multiple years and at the very last moment, the State Land Use Commission is going to pull some thread when you have all of your approvals and the project stops. There's too much risk. And what that does is it costs us locals, it makes everything we build more expensive, because if people could come and do a project in two or three years, it'll be less expensive because there's less risk. Materials aren't going to change, labor's not going to change. You take the risk and the uncertainty out of the equation, and we can have affordable houses, we can have affordable rentals.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: So it sounds to me like it's not just a County Council issue but it's also a State issue.

MR. COOK: It is. It's a governance issue. And the reason I was so harsh on the Council is because, you know, a thumbs-up/thumbs-down vote in a reasonably short period of time is really where this is. And you're doing budget hearings now, I'd like to see you hopefully...the entitled land in South Maui is, that has not been built yet that is going to be built out is a huge source of perpetual revenue. And, you know, I'm not a budget guy but taking that into consideration, I don't want to tax out the elderly and the working class on Maui, I want to hopefully welcome and embrace and then tax appropriately the wealthy. And through the property tax mechanism and entitlement process, you have your hand on the throttle to basically be able to increase County revenue which we could use to supplement and assist all the programs that locals need.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Okay. Thank you.

MR. COOK: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Mr. Couch?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Thank you, Mr. Cook. You said you don't have written testimony, do you...that looks like it came from a computer. Can you send that in pdf format?

MR. COOK: I can send that. And that was from the Planning Department. I can send that to you.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Understood.

MR. COOK: This...

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: And that, my next question is what is that?

MR. COOK: This is an explanation from Planning for the process mapping that they're...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Could you get a little closer to the mic?

MR. COOK: Thank you. This is sort of, this is their swim lanes and the process that they're doing for the MAPPS process. Envision this, not only the Planning Department but Department of Public Works, all the County agencies have to become educated, familiar, and being able to do this. We really need this to be a tool, not a weapon. Okay. We want it to be a tool. This isn't land use policy, this is procedural mapping, what happens when you submit an application, who reviews it, how long do they have to look at it, where does it go from there, how many times does it sit on whose desk. This is a wonderful, wonderful task. It's hugely complicated. They're going to need all the resources that you can give them and human capital. People spend a bunch of money for computers, bunch of money for programs. You have to invest in the people, and that's the investment that's going to stay with us because that's our community. So this is a very small snapshot representation of the graphing that'll occur of the processes. And yes, I will forward this to you, Mr. Couch.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Oh, to the Committee.

MR. COOK: Committee, oh, right.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Any other questions, Members?

MR. COOK: Thank you for the opportunity.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you very much, Mr. Cook. Our next testifier is Jeff Brockman, and then we'll go to the District Offices. And Lanai is unavailable, but we will go to Molokai and Hana.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. BROCKMAN: Sorry, I had to get my notes here. My name's Jeff Brockman. Good morning, everybody.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Good morning.

MR. BROCKMAN: I'm the manager of Pohailani Maui. It's a condominium project on the West Side, and I'm here today to support the Planning request for a \$750,000 match, the US Army Corps of Engineers dedicated Federal funds to complete a feasibility study for the protection of the Kahana Bay. And basically that's why, you know, that's what we're asking. We've got terrible erosion problems over there. We have a lot of buildings that are affected. People have a lot of money invested over there, and it's really not just the people who have money invested, it's also the tax dollars that could potentially go away because we're a tourist area. The beaches go away, the tourists don't come, their GET taxes go away, their taxes for occupancy taxes or whatever go away. The people who work cleaning those units, maintaining those units, all the associated stuff around, you know, becomes in jeopardy. So people have a lot of money invested out there, but it's not just them, it's also the community at large. So that's all I have to say. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you, Mr. Brockman. Members, any questions for the testifier? I have a question for you. One of the earlier testifiers stated there were 100 people out there. I assume that that's...I mean not 100, 1,000 that are impacted. Is that the unit count of the nine --

MR. BROCKMAN: That sounds...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --developments?

MR. BROCKMAN: Yeah, that sounds about right. I guess I'm thinking there's seven, maybe eight properties. Probably average 100-plus per, so it's pretty substantial, you know, and it's a real issue. We have, our property, we were fortunate enough to have a seawall installed way back when when they were allowing 'em which has kind of saved us. Without it, our front buildings would be gone right now. We've worked on that seawall, reinforcing it over the years. But it doesn't really protect us enough, because it doesn't go to bedrock and so water is constantly getting underneath it and causing sinkholes which are also an issue for us 'cause you can't really see the sinkhole until it falls in. Somebody could be walking there --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Right.

MR. BROCKMAN: --and yeah. But yeah, it's a lot of value there, you know, it's a whole, it's a big area and a lot of tourists and a lot of people who actually live there as well. So yeah.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you, Mr. Brockman.

MR. BROCKMAN: You're welcome.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Members, any other questions? Seeing none, thank you for being here this morning.

MR. BROCKMAN: Yeah, I appreciate it. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And we'll go first to our Hana Office. Dawn, do you have any testifiers?

MS. LONO: Good morning, Chair. This is Dawn Lono at the Hana Office, and there is no one waiting to testify.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you, Dawn. And we'll go next to our Molokai Office. Ella, do we have any testifiers on Molokai?

MS. ALCON: Good morning, Chair. This is Ella Alcon on Molokai, and there is no one here waiting to testify.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you, ladies. Is there anyone else in the Chambers that would like to provide testimony this morning? Seeing none, Members, without objection, we'll close public testimony.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you. And public testimony is closed.

. . .END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And we'll move forward with a presentation of the Planning Department, followed by the Department of the Corporation Counsel. So I'd like to welcome Director and Deputy this morning, along with Mr. Baz. And --

MR. SPENCE: Good morning, Chair --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --Director, would you like to start off?

MR. SPENCE: --and Members of the Committee.

MS. McLEAN: (*PowerPoint Presentation*) Good morning, Chair and Committee Members. This is the same presentation that we gave a few weeks ago to the Planning Committee, so to those Members who were present there, you've already seen this. It's relatively straightforward and relatively short, so we'll just proceed going through the PowerPoint. And I believe you have copies or Staff is distributing copies now. The Planning Department has four divisions plus our administration, and we staff eight standing boards and commissions, plus the community plan advisory committees

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

when the CPACs are put together. We staff the three Planning Commissions...Sandy wants me to move along. We staff the three Planning Commissions, the Hana Advisory Committee to the Maui Planning Commission, Urban Design Review Board, Maui Redevelopment Agency, the Cultural Resources Commission, the Board of Variances and Appeals, and the Community Plan Advisory Committees, Lanai and Molokai and coming next is West Maui. Our budget in FY '16 was 5.6...or excuse me, \$5.77 million. Salaries and Wages took up 68 percent of our total budget last year. What's being requested for this fiscal year is an 11 percent increase to 6.4 million, again, with about the same proportion of the total budget. In FY '16, we had 66 employees, 62 General Funded and 4 are grant funded. We're asking for an increase in 4 positions, in 4 General Fund positions for FY '17, so that's where the majority of the Salaries and Wages increase is coming from. Our administration group is the Planning Director and his support staff which includes myself, the Deputy, our private Secretary, Administrative Officer who's here today if we have questions for her, our Account Clerk, and Office Ops Assistant. And we're located in Suite 315 in One Main Plaza. All of our offices are now in One Main Plaza which was a move we did a couple of years ago that's really been helpful for our management. The Zoning Administration and Enforcement Division has 21 personnel. We're...and the increase in 4 staff members would all be in the Zoning Administration and Enforcement Division. They're in 2 offices in One Main Plaza. They review a wide variety of permits for zoning compliance, including building permit, subdivisions, and certificates of occupancy. They process telephone, written and walk-in inquiries for zoning confirmations. They issue flood development permits, sign and banner permits, and other administrative plans. They staff the Board of Variances and Appeals, meaning that they process the variance and appeal applications. And they respond to complaints, conduct investigations, and issue notices of warning and notices of violation when zoning and other land use violations are found. It's headed up by a Planning Program Administrator, John Rapacz who's here today if we have questions for him. And this entire Division has two clerical positions. One is a Secretary to Boards and Commissions who staffs the BVA; the other is a Secretary I. Among the requests we're making to you is for another clerical position. The...sorry, I should have noted that in this presentation, the bold lettering are supervisor positions and then the italics under those are the subordinates to those supervisors. So the Planner VI oversees a Planner V, a Planner IV, and two Planner I's. Our Administrative Planning Officer oversees four folks who review building plans, and also two Land Use and Permit Clerks. And our Supervising Zoning Inspector supervises five other Zoning Inspectors. This is a position that we did have some discussion in the Planning Committee about. Our Zoning Inspector positions are very difficult to recruit and retain folks. We've been working for a while now with the Department of Personnel to redescribe those positions. It's an effort that's been coordinated with the other planning departments in the State, because to change these set positions, we need agreement among the other participants in the union contracts. And so they've had the same problem that we've had. These are generally not very high-paying positions, especially given the demands placed on them. They're treated similarly to building inspectors or electrical inspectors who only have one Code to administer, whereas our inspectors have a wide variety of land use law to investigate and enforce. So we're working on revising those job descriptions so we can

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

pay our folks some more money and when we have vacancies, we'll hopefully be able to be more successful at recruiting. Lastly, we've requested to add four positions, and our order of priority would be a clerical position, that's the Office Operations Assistant I, then another Building Plans Reviewer, another Zoning Inspector, and lastly Land Use and Permit Clerk. Our Current Division is also located in One Main Plaza and three different offices. And they process all of our administrative...excuse me, they process all of our discretionary permits and many of our administrative permits. These are the ones who go before the Planning Commissions with all types of SMA approvals, bed and breakfast and short-term rental homes, Special Use Permits, Conditional Permits, Changes in Zoning. So these are also the folks who process the applications that come to the Council for approval. And they also staff with those permits the three Planning Commissions, the Hana Advisory Committee, the Urban Design Review Board, and the Maui Redevelopment Agency. It's headed by a Planning Program Administrator, that's Clayton Yoshida--he's with us today if you have questions for the Current Division--with the three Secretaries to Boards and Commissions given all the boards and commissions that this Division staffs. Two senior Planners who oversee six Planner Vs, five Planner IVs and two Planner IIIs. And then clerical support with a Secretary, Office Ops Assistants, and a Clerk, and one of those positions is on Molokai full-time. Our Long Range Division has 12 personnel. They're in One Main Plaza, Suite 601. You've spent some time with those guys lately with the Lanai Community Plan. They manage the community plan updates, they also staff the Cultural Resources Commission, and maintain our GIS land use database. Also headed by a Planning Program Administrator Pam Eaton who's here today, with two clerical support, a senior Planner who oversees four other Planners, and a GIS Analyst who oversees three other GIS Analysts. And lastly, our newest division, the Plan Implementation Division are in Suite 335 in One Main Plaza. They are preparing the community plan and Maui Island Plan implementation reports that everyone has heard so much about lately. They're also managing the Requests for Proposals for Title 19, we're calling it an audit actually, a review of our Zoning Code. They're helping with the Dead Sea Scroll Replacement Team project to replace our old paper zoning maps with a digital zoning map, and researching changes to our SMA boundaries. And that's headed by an Administrative Planning Officer, Kathleen Aoki who's here today, and she oversees a Planner and a GIS Analyst. Again, our budget in FY '16 was about 5.77 million, and we're requesting an 11 percent increase to 6.4 million. Salaries and Wages, about two-thirds of the total budget, and that represents a 9.3 increase from FY '16, with the four new personnel that we're requesting, as well as step increases, a couple of budgeted reallocations. As you heard from one of the testifiers, we are asking for a big increase in our Overtime budget for travel to cover when we have vacancies and also to implement the MAPPS project. And our Operations budget is about one-third of our total budget. We are asking for an increase from FY '16 mostly in Professional Services. We have two significant projects. One is to map Important Agricultural Lands. That's an effort where in the past we've asked for funding from the State Legislature which we have not received so we want to go ahead with that project funded by the County. We also want to look at the Maui Island Plan growth boundaries and be proactive and redistrict on the State level the designations for the Maui Island Plan growth boundaries. And also Professional Services includes the budget for the Maui Redevelopment Agency. Other

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

items in our Operations budget is our rent at One Main Plaza, the funding for our UH Sea Grant Extension Agent, and Wailuku First Fridays. And lastly, Travel is pretty significant for us for airfare and per diem for interisland travel and night meetings. And I think that's it. As you'll see there's no mention in there about Kahana Bay and the studies. It was a very, very recent proposal that came to us, and we do have a handout that we were able to print up late yesterday. I don't know if you want to get into that now or if you want to talk just strictly about our proposed budget as you have it in front of you and then we can talk about Kahana Bay separately, so whatever is the pleasure of the Committee.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah, we'll take that up at the end of the budget discussion --

MS. McLEAN: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --since it's a significant chunk of change.

MS. McLEAN: We were calling it our \$750,000 surprise.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Or the 750-pound gorilla. Okay. If you wouldn't mind walking us through the budget presentation which provides a little more details of what you've already gone through.

MS. McLEAN: Well, I will just read the mission statement, the purpose of the Department of Planning is to manage growth in a sustainable manner that balances our economy, culture, and environment. We support all five of the Mayor's Countywide goals. And we have one program, our Department and our budget is relatively straightforward compared to some of the larger departments in the County. The Director and Deputy and our four Divisions, and then on the outside there are the boards and commissions that we staff. Okay. Again, we function as one program with processing permit applications, preparing long-range plans, and enforcing land use regulations. And as such, we serve the entire population of the County. We process a wide variety of permit applications as one of the testifiers showed with that long list. We have more than 70 different types of applications. Some of those are very complex that would start at the Planning Commission level and come to the County Council for final approval. Others are very simple and straightforward and are handled quickly and turned around quickly by staff. Even though we're not the final issuing agency for things like building permits and subdivisions, most of those get routed to us for review for zoning compliance, because the Zoning Code has different building...has different standards for structures than the Building Code does. So most building permits get routed to us. Subdivisions get routed to us for review with land use regulations. And then we're responsible for enforcing not only County zoning but also State designations, also Special Management Area violations, Federal flood development regulations. So in that light, our activity goals and measures. We really do try to look for specific tangible measurables in terms of numbers. So one from the permit processing streamline objective is to reduce the number of permit application forms, to consolidate those. And we've been pretty successful in the past, it takes a little bit of time, but we're slowly working on those so it's just simply easier for applicants to

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

submit their applications. And we just pulled out some highlights of the types of permits that we process every year with building permits, zoning verifications, complaints investigated, Conditional Permits, and SMA Major Permits. That's just a random sampling of some of the permits that we process. Another service that we provide are getting requests for comments, whether they're walk-ins, telephones...telephone calls or written inquiries, we get a lot of those. The ones that we respond to in writing are another one of our measurables. Our next is increasing public participation. We're endeavoring to get all of our documents related to our board and commission meetings posted online as soon as the agendas are posted. The Council has done a great job in doing that, and we're working to be as successful as you have been in making that information available. So not only will it enable the public to look at what our boards and commissions are reviewing, it will save our staff time from getting those inquiries and then having to provide that information to the public directly. And then just keeping track of the number of public meetings that we conduct with our boards and commissions. Then...okay. Moving up to the positions that we're requesting. As we mentioned in the presentation, we're requesting for four new positions: a Land Use and Building Plans Technician, a Land Use Permit Clerk, a Zoning Inspector Trainee, and an Office Operations Assistant. So four new positions that would all be General Funded. The changes in Wages and Salary...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, before you move on --

MS. McLEAN: Sorry.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --Members, do you have any questions at this time? Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Yes, thank you very much, Chair. Looking at the goals and objectives, I'm just wondering so that I understand, are these numbers based on your including the new positions that you're requesting or on existing staff?

MS. McLEAN: I don't think that the addition of the four additional staff people would change these numbers. What it would enable us to do would be to accomplish these things more quickly.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: So whether you get them or you don't get them, these numbers will pretty much stay the same?

MS. McLEAN: That would be my guess, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Okay. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And, Mr. Couch, you had a question?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you. On Goals and Objectives No. 2...Goal 1, item...or sub...or Objective No. 2, you talk about number of zoning complaints investigated. In FY 2015, your actual was 1,052, and your estimate in '16, was only 450, and then you're going back up to 1,000 in 2017. Can you tell us a little bit about how that's

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

working? 'Cause I noticed you wanted another Zoning Inspector so that should affect that set of numbers.

MR. SPENCE: Thank you. Mr. Chairman and Councilman Couch, part of that is in FY '15, there was a big push on proactive enforcement and at, and largely at the request of the Council. So what, one of the things we did is we, the Zoning and Enforcement Division went out and proactively looked at online advertising, et cetera, and then we issued a lot of notices of warning. The, part of the decrease I think for the FY '16 estimate was following up on all those notices of warning and actually issuing violations. So the, we have this outstanding backlog of things to follow up on. The FY '16 estimate is more of those people actually filing complaints with our Department, and so, you know, we follow up with those as well.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. Well, as you know from our Committee, we still have a perceived deficit I guess in enforcing a use now that is becoming more and more prevalent in the news countrywide, so it's not --

MR. SPENCE: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: --just us. So one of the thoughts was that we kind of discussed in Committee for the Members who aren't a member of the Committee or weren't there, is potentially outsourcing at least the evidence gathering for a year or maybe two years so that...because part of this issue is that you've got, what, six enforcement officers now, five? And...

MR. SPENCE: Yes. And requesting an additional.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Yeah, you're requesting an additional. And not only is it for the short term and vacation rental issues which is a big chunk right now of trying to get everybody in compliance on that or get them stopped, but you still have all the other zoning enforcements that you --

MR. SPENCE: That's correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: --have to do. So would it be helpful if you had, were able to outsource at least the evidence gathering so that...and all the way up to maybe at least writing the notices of warning so that you guys can take a look at them and sign them and then following up? Because you've got issues where you do notices of violation, you guys issues the notices of violation and whatnot, somebody says okay, I got my notice of violation, I'm either going to pay my fine but continue to operate in a non-compliant manner. That's the other portion that needs a little bit more help. So is there something you can do...is there a way we can do this outsourcing now? I know Corporation Counsel, I talked with Corporation Counsel on this, and they're thinking maybe they can do it on their side as well. Not this Corporation Counsel, Mr. Wong, I talked with Mr. Wong.

MR. SPENCE: I think Jeff should do it all.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Yeah. So it's just, it's one of those things where we'd like to see the backlog get knocked down and --

MR. SPENCE: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: --then have your operators, your existing inspectors be able to not have that big burden on their shoulders once you get the backlog taken care of.

MR. SPENCE: Right. I think outsourcing at least the investigation part could really help, you know, so as long as there're really parameters that we keep and standards that we establish that would qualify things for notices of warning, and then evidence gathered for notices of violation. So I think that the, I think the other big help, I gotta give my pitch for the Office Assistant position as well. That would also help because then our Zoning Inspectors are not tasked with doing so much paperwork, and they'd spend more time actually doing the investigations rather than, you know, making sure that something goes on letterhead correctly, formatting the letters, you know, getting them signed, and issuing the proper copies to the various people, et cetera. That would save them a whole lot of time. And then finally of course we're asking for an additional enforcement position.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Mr. Ueoka had a --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --need to comment. Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you, Chair. I think our office would have to get into much deeper, further discussion with the Planning Department on any type of outsourcing for various reasons. Thank you, Chair.

MR. SPENCE: And, Mr. Chairman, one other comment. I don't know what Corporation Counsel's proposed budget looks like. I understand they're looking for another body or several. If we go deep into enforcement and we issue volumes of notices of violation, it's going to be Corporation Counsel tasked with enforcing and filing court papers and injunctions and all that. So it's one thing to issue notices of violations, it's quite another thing to follow through in court to get the injunctions and file the liens to, you know, collect the fines, et cetera, et cetera. So it's not, it doesn't stop with just our Department.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Spence. And I understand that. And that's some of the frustration I know the Committee has had is that yeah, it's a lot of work but it needs to be done. It's one of those things that it, yes, you have to go through

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

the process. Even if it's only a few people to make it, to say yeah, this Department is actually serious, but it needs to be done. And it, and we have to expend the resources to make people understand that we are willing to go that far. Right now it appears that well yeah, we're going to issue a notice of warning and a notice of violation and then okay. For most of the other stuff, people come into compliance, not an issue.

MR. SPENCE: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: It's where you've got this nationwide companies coming in here and saying hey --

MR. SPENCE: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: --advertising nationwide, it's kind of the Uber of vacation rentals, and that needs to be clamped down on a little bit so that we can get back to our regular, regularly scheduled work.

MR. SPENCE: That's correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: When do you...and I think all of us are very much looking forward to the MAPPS project and hoping as Mr. Cook was that it's going to help, well, dramatically speed things up and make it much easier for folks who are applying for permits to follow them and understand where they are in the process. But under the zoning verifications performed, I see you had an actual of 4,300 and you're anticipating 7,200 for a total for 2016. Will zoning verifications be possible online with the MAPPS project?

MS. McLEAN: Between the MAPPS project and the DSSRT project, yes. I don't know that that will happen during the course of FY '17, it might be FY '18 that that's actually in place, but absolutely, that's one of the goals of those two projects.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. And what is the reason that you see for the increase of verifications? Is that a sign that there's more activity or a sign that there's more concern or what?

MS. McLEAN: I think the actuals in FY '15 were surprisingly low, were atypically low, that in prior years, the actuals were higher, and so we didn't want to take that one year anomaly, if you will, and underestimate it.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Thank you. Members, any other questions on the --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --goals and objectives?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. And I guess trying to figure out your Goal 1, also in Item 2, zoning verifications performed. That is at 4,320 then 2016, 7,200, and then it drops to 7,000. That is verification as in what, for who, and why?

MS. McLEAN: The reason we get those requests, there's several reasons we get those requests. It's a requirement of all of our permit applications that it includes a zoning confirmation form. It's a single-page form that lists the property's zoning, community plan, Maui Island Plan, State designation, whether or not it's in the SMA, if it's in a historic district, if it's in a flood development area. It lists everything that has a bearing on the land use of that property. So applicants need to submit those and they need to be current, because those things change. When community plans get updated, zoning changes, so they need to be regularly updated when an application is submitted. Also, individuals do it if they're doing due diligence on purchasing a property, they want to know what the land use is. Prospective developers request those to see that what their development plans are for the property are consistent or what kind of entitlements they would need. So there's a big variety of reasons for people to submit for that.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. And so you're looking for a spike in people looking for verifications and the reasoning?

MS. McLEAN: No, that was one where the actuals in FY '15 were unusually low. In prior years, it had been higher, so we're just expecting it to stay relatively the same as it generally has been.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. And I guess this is something through the RPT discussion as in taxation and the classification of zoning and when those changes occur. Myself and Chair Hokama feel the disconnect does lie, one of the departments is in your Department. Yeah, us too, but 'cause we make final decisions on zoning changes. So where...is that in here anywhere as a goal to start, maybe it's with the MAPPS program to start looking into that and making sure that anytime some kind of zoning changes, especially when it affects the taxation of it, is somehow relayed to RPT, Treasury, whoever needs to know those changes?

MS. McLEAN: That isn't listed as a specific goal in the budget.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: I know but will you look into it or are you --

MS. McLEAN: Sure, sure.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --thinking, do you even realize that there is a disconnect there?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MS. McLEAN: Yeah, absolutely we do. I'm sorry, I thought your question was did we have a --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah.

MS. McLEAN: --goal in the --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Well no, I mean I was --

MS. McLEAN: --budget for that which we don't.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --not noticing it but was --

MS. McLEAN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --hoping that perhaps it's something that could be or implemented.

MS. McLEAN: Absolutely. Absolutely.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: 'Cause that is key.

MS. McLEAN: We are working --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: I'll tell ya.

MS. McLEAN: --with them continuously on the DSSRT project, and because the Real Property Tax Division has a GIS database for the parcel layers and we're trying to get our zoning maps to be in sync with those boundaries. And but with that, we'll, you know, the changes to their GIS database will affect how they administer property taxes. So in terms of specifically making sure they know when land use entitlements have changed on a property, absolutely we can endeavor to make that a much better process than it is.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Well that's good to hear. And it relates to existing, that have been changed in the past years, 'cause I found two TMKs that garnered almost a million dollars just because it was, it changed, we changed it, it was never, the information was never disbursed to the proper departments in order to charge them the proper taxation. So that was found.

MR. SPENCE: And so, Mr. Chairman, this is a really good point and I'm glad that it comes up. My understanding is that Real Property Tax got all the Change in Zoning ordinances. Apparently that's not the case. We will follow up on our end when we receive those ordinances. I'm also not sure if they receive district boundary amendments. Like we'll get several hundred acres go through the Land Use Commission from Ag to Urban. I'm not sure. And then they would be reclassified

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

some other way, perhaps Unimproved Residential or something like that. We can follow up with that as well and make sure that those things get to Real Property Tax.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Well, thank you. Sorry, Chair, if I digressed off of but I think it's --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No, I think that's...

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --an important point to bring up.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No, the Chair has no problem with that. I think it was also our expectation that this would be something that would be fixed with the MAPPS project, that it would be an automatic flag to the Real Property Tax Department. So hopefully that will happen. Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Chair, I just want one more piece of information, and then I'll get off of these goals. But I'm looking on Page 530 and in the middle, we're talking about conducting public meetings for boards, commissions, and community plan advisory committees. And it's the number of public meetings conducted and we're going from 110 estimate this year and planning 85 next year. And I'm kind of curious because if we're going to continue the community plan process, I don't think it's going to get any better. Can somebody tell me why we would drop 25 meetings?

MS. McLEAN: Because during the course of FY '17 we...the Molokai Community Plan has just completed review by the Molokai Planning Commission, so that will come to the Council. So we won't be having any public meetings, that the Planning Department will not be conducting public meetings for the Molokai Community Plan during FY '17, those meetings will be Council meetings.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: I realize that but aren't you going to start others?

MS. McLEAN: Then the West Maui Community Plan would be the next one, and we'd be looking to have the community plan advisory for West Maui impaneled late in Calendar Year '16, maybe beginning in Calendar Year '17, so toward the end of FY '17, those meetings would be beginning. So it would just be CPAC meetings for that in FY '17, and no commission, no additional commission meetings related to that community plan. And in FY '16, that was an estimate, I don't know what our final count, what our actual for FY '16 will turn out to be. But in FY '16, we knew that we were going to have CPACs and commissions for two community plans going, so that's why that estimate was high.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: It's still troubling to me that the community plans are taking as long as they are, and I'd like to see that process speeded up, not slow it down. I'm sorry.

MR. SPENCE: Right. And, Mr. Chairman?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Director?

MR. SPENCE: And, Councilmember Baisa, just because the number of public meetings will go down, that does not mean...and these are official meetings, agendaized, you know, through Sunshine Law, et cetera, and with the County Clerk. That just because those number of meetings are going down does not mean that for instance Long Range is not going to go out and do public outreach, do interviews, meet with community associations or public groups in preparation for the impanelment of the CPAC for the West Maui Community Plan. They will still be extremely busy, it's just not those specific meetings that require agendas and compliance with Sunshine Law.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: So you're only counting those?

MR. SPENCE: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Well, I think it's important, you know, I have a real thing about this community plan process which I really think is not good.

MR. SPENCE: And we would...maybe some time in Mr. Couch's Committee, we can discuss that. I would love to provide a full explanation. It's frustrating for us as well.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Right.

MR. SPENCE: We wish we could just bust right through them, and the way that things are set up, we just can't.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: I understand, and I'm not saying that, you know, you're doing anything wrong, I just think we really need a better way of doing this. It just takes too long.

MR. SPENCE: Agreed.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, Members, I think we need to move on from goals and objectives into the financials, so, Director or Deputy, would you like to walk us through that?

MS. McLEAN: Again, we're requesting the four additional positions, the Land Use and Building Plans Technician, Land Use Permit Clerk, an Office Operations Assistant I, and a Zoning Inspector Trainee. That's the, oh, yeah, the reason for the increase in Wages and Salaries for collective bargaining, so this is just the continuation. Then yeah, no, nothing really to talk about there. The expansion positions, the wages and salaries for the four requested positions is, that's only for a portion of the fiscal year, 'cause we wouldn't anticipate them being hired and working on July 1st, it would take a while to create the position descriptions and then recruit and interview and hire. So the FY '17 portion for those positions is budgeted for. As we noted, we are requesting an increase in our Overtime budget, not only for MAPPS but also just for the volume of

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

work that we have. Right now, we do put in a lot of overtime, and in our Salaries budget, that overtime is covered by the unpaid salaries when we have vacancies. We're grateful that staff is willing to work overtime, put in the extra time to keep up with the workload, and we just feel it's more appropriate for that to be properly budgeted. Plus when we have off-island meetings, night meetings, that's just routine overtime for us. The other expansions, small equipment needed for the new positions, computer and so forth. In Professional Services, we're asking for \$250,000 to map Important Agricultural Lands. As we mentioned before, that was a request that we've made previously with the State Legislature that we were not successful in getting funded, but this an important project that we would like to proceed with. A hundred thousand dollars for the Clean and Safe Program in Wailuku Town. And then another project we want to take on is \$250,000 to proactively redesignate the Maui Island Plan's urban, small town, and rural growth boundaries, where we would hire a contractor to prepare district boundary amendments for those areas, from Agriculture to Urban or from Agriculture to Rural for those growth boundaries. And that's it. Then we have...oh right. And that last bit we would really like to continue pursuing being able to conduct meetings on Molokai and Lanai by video conference. I think we would always send at least one staff person to the Molokai Planning Commission or the Lanai Planning Commission. I think it would be difficult to have no physical staff there. But in terms of sending different Planners who are working on applications, Corp. Counsel, for them to be able to be available, and we would probably be able to have more resource people available for those commissions than we do now. So just looking at the hardware needed to do that. Any questions on...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, Members, questions on A Account items first? Ms. Crivello, followed by Ms. Baisa.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Thank you for being here.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And then Mr. Guzman.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Thank you, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. So I'm looking at your detail, is that where we're at?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: That's fine.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. So...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: What page please? For the others.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Fourteen-eight as well as 14-9. On your expansion, is that actually actual new employees or is it to utilize or in an...how do you say, are you reclassifying existing employees?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. SPENCE: These would be new employees.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. And the, is your justification because your workload, you, all the overtime that you're having as well as your workload is overwhelming?

MR. SPENCE: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Or you just need new employees to meet...

MR. SPENCE: Particularly...Mr. Chair? Particularly in the Zoning and Enforcement Division, the workload has increased. We are having a difficult time keeping up with building permit reviews, those kinds of things, as well as the increased...as we previously discussed, the need for enforcement and support clerical for that enforcement. I should say predominantly for that enforcement. The...it's, it would help us immensely. You know part of...one of the goals and one of...and actually we're supposed to be reviewing building permits with a certain amount of time. We're consistently not meeting those goals because of the volume of work and the number of personnel. You can only, you know, even with our process mapping and reducing our steps, et cetera, it reaches a point where there's nothing that going to replace just warm bodies sitting behind desks looking at the materials in front of them. MAPPS will help, many things will help, but at some point you just need bodies.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. Well thank you. So also your anticipation for overtime, it's an increase, so \$60,000 anticipated overtime to meet permit volume deadlines. And I just need clarification. And 20,000 for the MAPPS implementation is, that's kind of basically how it's...

MS. McLEAN: Right. The 20,000 estimate is probably consistent through all the permitting agencies that the Administration feels is appropriate to implement MAPPS. Our FY '16 overtime budget is 40,000, and through February, we've spent just over 45,000. So we anticipate spending probably more than 60,000 in overtime this fiscal year. And that's always been the case, and that gets compensated for. It's in part because people are working overtime when we have vacancies, and so that unspent salary money covers that cost. We would rather have it budgeted properly and just have unspent salary money and have overtime be properly budgeted.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: So your expansion will not eliminate the overtime?

MS. McLEAN: It will certainly reduce it.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay.

MS. McLEAN: It will absolutely reduce it, but it's still very high. And we're regularly denying people overtime requests, because we don't want to exceed our budget. We're putting limits on 5 hours per pay period or 10 hours per pay period. When people are willing to work 20 or 25 hours per pay period, we're saying no, 'cause we don't have the budget for it.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. Thank you.

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Mr. Baz?

MR. BAZ: Just to add to the, the Premium Pay section and you'll see this throughout the different departments, includes the one-time lump-sum payments for Bargaining Unit 3 and 4. So in the Details, you know, specifically those payments are 31,200 of that 101,000 increase, so you can see that was, it's a significant portion of that as well, so I just wanted to make that clear.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Right. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Ms. Baisa, followed by Mr. Guzman.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Yes. I'm very excited to hear about the service, the professional services that are proposed. And I am much in support of the mapping of the IALs. It's long, long overdue and we need to get in compliance with 205. So I think that that's wonderful. But I would have, ask a little question and I don't know if, Chair, you want to discuss this now, but additional funding to continue the Clean and Safe Program. Can we find out how that's doing? Maybe just very generally, is it doing well? I mean what do we see?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: The Chair would prefer that we--

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Prefer to wait 'til...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --just focus on the A Accounts now and then we'll move into those questions, 'cause I'm sure --

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --some of them are related.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: I had questions similar to Ms. Baisa so I'll waive at this point.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Mr. Couch?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. You gave us an order of preference on or priority on your positions. Is that...you said Office Operations Assistant I is the first one. The Land Use Permit Clerk second? Or the...

MS. McLEAN: Plans Examiner.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Pardon?

MS. McLEAN: The Building Plans Examiner.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay, Building Plans...then Zoning Inspector and then Land Use Permit Clerk. What is the difference between the Land Use Permit Clerk and the Building Plans Technician?

MS. McLEAN: Building Plans Examiner reviews building permits for zoning compliance. The Land Use Permit Clerk does the zoning confirmations, so the requests that come in, the zoning and flood confirmation forms, the Land Use Permit Clerk handles those. They also can handle some minor permits like sign permits, they can process those. We're working on...before we had the vacancies earlier this year, we were working on some cross training for the Land Use Permit Clerks to do very, very minor building permits, but for now since those positions are newly filled, the folks are training, it's mostly zoning confirmations and then assisting with very simple permits. They also assist the enforcement folks with some of their paperwork because of the lack of other clerical support. So they're sort of all-around support positions.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Gotcha. All right. You know when MAPPS comes on and that's, you're right it's going to be, it'll be Fiscal Year 2018 before we'll see any effects of that. You're still going to get lot of calls for zoning requests. Yes you can point them to the site, but they're going to well I got R-3 zoning, what does that mean? Are you going to have something that you can also point them to, to say look, these are some of the things...this is your list of things? Only because yes, I think your calls will go down but not enough that you wouldn't need that Land Use Permit Clerk position. Even, I mean even if you half the numbers of calls which would be great if you could, you're still going to get enough calls that it's going to require a lot of people, I think.

MS. McLEAN: Right. And even if we get to that point where the public can go automatically and find out all that information, there is still such a massive volume of work that comes into that Division. For people to be able to empty out their in-basket every day is not even something we dream of. If we can approach that between MAPPS and some additional positions, the public will be thrilled, our people will be thrilled.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Well, there's a third thing that can happen and help that, and that is either consolidating the process or making sure we have the proper regulations in and not being over regulating in several other things. Are you working on...I know you've got so many things to do and every time we go through different zoning categories in Title 19, you try to streamline it, but an overall at some time are you

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

looking at it saying, you know, do we really need this code or this code and this code? What would the difference be other than, you know, taking a little bit longer to get a permit? On some, I mean there are some codes that are obsolete now, not necessary, not necessarily obsolete for whatever their purpose was but that purpose is no longer needed. I think there's a lot in there that we might be able to fix. Are you working on something like that?

MR. SPENCE: Yes. Okay, so...and thank you for the question. The Council, this year, this fiscal year, the Council budgeted \$75,000 for us to go and solicit proposals from contractors to look at our...we kind of divided it up into two things. But it's solicit contractors to look at our Zoning Code and to make improvements. The idea is to have an outside person with wide scope of experience in zoning looking at different zoning codes, first conduct an audit of our Zoning Code to look at the very things that Mr. Couch is talking about, where are there the inefficiencies, where are the vague things that we spend so much time trying to interpret, where there's disconnects in processing, et cetera, and then making a recommendation to us. The RFP, we're currently in the solicitation period. I think it closes...is it April 15th? It closes the middle of April. We will then look at all the proposals and select a contractor, and we still start that process. Once that audit is complete, we'll take a look at that, bring it back to the County Council, and if warranted depending on the recommendations and the options that are presented, you know, we'll come back to the Council at a later time and present that to you. And we'll see where the Council wants to go with that. But that's part of the big goal, that's probably the primary goal of doing this audit is to say hey, what's obsolete, how can we improve this, and go on from there.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

MR. SPENCE: Maybe we can pare down a few more of the permits that Mr. Cook is showing in the chart.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Any other questions on the A Accounts? I know this is not a, not necessarily a fair question, but --

MR. SPENCE: I'm waiting.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --it's going to come at some point during the process. If you needed to prioritize the four positions that you've requested, what order would you put each? Where would, which would be the one and which would be the four?

MS. McLEAN: The Office Operations Assistant would be first.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay.

MS. McLEAN: The second would be the Land Use and Building Permit Technician. Third would be the Zoning Inspector. And fourth would be the Land Use Permit Clerk.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Well, my notes have them in exactly that order.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MS. McLEAN: That's gotta be a good sign.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And the other thing, I just want to clarify and this may be for Mr. Baz, but I notice going through this, going through the Details, that there are a number of positions that are, that have increases with no change in step. We have increases with a change of one step, two steps, and I have one Zoning Inspector with a three-step change. And I, I'm, I just want to be sure, Mr. Baz, that those changes...I'll give you the example. The three-step is position PC-0077 and in the current fiscal year, it's at Step B and it jumps to Step E in this year's budget. I just want to be sure that that's a change that is required by the collective bargaining.

MR. BAZ: Yeah, Mr. Chair, the collective bargaining agreements have, in different units have either catch-up steps or one step. My office does not have that ability to track. We depend on the departments to know the tenure of the different employees, because based on their date of hire and their last step increase is when, what makes them eligible for either one step or two step or the max I think is three steps. Because there was no steps for a number of years, I think the max catch-up was three. But we have, maybe the Administrative Officer of Planning Department has that detailed information.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. If you could --

MS. TAKAKURA: Good morning.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --introduce yourself, please.

MS. TAKAKURA: I'm Jackie Takakura, I'm the Administrative Officer with the Department of Planning.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you.

MS. TAKAKURA: So regarding this particular position, PC-0077, with all of the Bargaining Unit 3 positions, they didn't get their steps for many years, and so finally when steps were restored for them, there were some catching up. And for a lot of them who started out as entry level A and then didn't get their steps, when the correction was made, they moved a couple of steps such as this one. So it's mainly catching up. And you'll see this I think in all the departments, especially with Bargaining Unit 3, because they went for many years without getting any steps.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: So it's, is it unusual that we would have a three-step catch-up? Do you recall how many steps they lost?

MS. TAKAKURA: Not necessarily, because if they started out with step A, for the first couple of steps they're every two years, and then after a while they become every three years. So with this person...actually I think they start at every one year, so because he didn't have his steps for so many years, the way it was calculated, he did end up getting a

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

couple of steps ahead, yes. And then he'll be eligible for another one in FY '17, and that's why it's budgeted for that high step or that advance.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: That additional step is --

MS. TAKAKURA: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --actually going to take place next --

MS. TAKAKURA: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --fiscal?

MS. TAKAKURA: So it's all according to the collective bargaining, catching up for Bargaining Unit 3.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. So you can assure us that that's all per contract, that we're not...

MS. TAKAKURA: Yes. And you'll see that with the, when they start out with the lower level steps. With the higher letters, because there's more of a gap of three years from getting one step to the next, you won't see that as much. But with the entry levels, when they're...the new hires who came, didn't get steps for a long time, then they're catching up.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Thank you. Anybody else have a question for the Administrator? Before you --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yes. Yeah. Actually...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --you go. Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah, thank you, Chair. And thank you, Ms. Takakura?

MS. TAKAKURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Hi. And just to get this out because I did have questions in regards to all, throughout all departments in regards to whether it's a reallocation to a higher pay scale or filled at a lower pay scale. I mean what is that? So what does that mean? When someone...so everything has basically bumped up because of the bargaining agreements, but some people's designation was reallocated to a higher pay with the added bargaining agreement too, and some were moved into a lower pay scale with the added bargaining agreement too. So I just kind of wanted a, I don't know if there's a way to explain it in layman's terms to understand what all those movements mean.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MS. TAKAKURA: A lot of times when you see a big difference in the previous amount budgeted and the current amount budgeted or say the FY '17 amount budgeted, it's because someone vacated the position who was at a much higher pay and it's been filled with someone who is newer, who is starting out at say step C or step A. The other alternative is when you see a big increase, it could be that someone with a low pay left the position and say we got someone from the State or already in the bargaining unit who was at a high step who transferred. So for example, I can probably pull some out. Let's see. We had a Planner III who started and he took the place of someone who was at a much higher pay. I think it was PC-0021. He's a Planner III. And so you can see that the amount dropped for PC-0021 and that's because we had a new hire, so he's starting at the entry-level pay. There's, there was one that had a big drop because someone had vacated the position.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: PC-0051 maybe, 14-5.

MS. TAKAKURA: Account Clerk, yes. So our Account Clerk was previously filled by someone who had been with the County for many years and she transferred, and then we replaced that person with another person who was somewhat of a new hire and that's why there's the pay cut. Also our Molokai Planner was filled with someone who had a higher step but he left and now is filled by someone is more of a newer employer, so that's why the difference in the pay.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Oh yeah, well that...thank you. That helps clarify in my mind how this all works. Thank you.

MR. SPENCE: And this is something that we do when we get vacancies like this, we look specifically at the position and the responsibilities and so, and just ask okay, do we need the level of expertise of say a Planner V or can the duties of that position be handled by a Planner III? And so we, I mean this is just a standard course that we go through when we get vacancies like this. We judge pretty carefully trying to save some money.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Well, very good. Thank you, Director.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair, thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you.

MS. TAKAKURA: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you very much, Ms. Takakura. Either the Deputy or the Director, you mentioned that you've got many more applications coming in. I know in years past, we've had similar surges of development activity. Do you have a sense or could you provide the Committee with your analysis of whether it is an increase in numbers that is causing the backlog or whether it's an increase in the process? You

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

know are we increasing what we're requiring of applicants so that what you need to go through is much more voluminous? Or is it the number of applications?

MR. SPENCE: It's a little bit of, I would say it's a little bit of both. With improvements in the economy, you're going to see more applications for all different kinds of things. But also whenever we adopt a new process, say like short-term rental homes, we have a brand-new process to go through. We get quite a volume of applications, and so all of a sudden, you know, and good for the applicant that all of this is administrative, you know, well predominantly. There are some that go to the Planning Commissions. You know it's good that these are administrative, but it's a huge amount of work and additional work to process these short-term rental home permits. And it's something that was necessary so I'm not saying that's a bad thing, but it entirely adds to the backlog of things. And if we have this moratorium, or not a moratorium, if we have this grace period coming up and some people are estimating that there's going to be, you know, this other wave of applications, that's, you know, going to increase the workload even more. So and it, I'm not saying anything bad about that, it's, I'm glad people would come forward to get the proper permits and not be operating under the radar. But it, just so everybody understands, it's a huge amount of work for staff.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah, I guess the, to Mr. Cook's point earlier, there are places where you can get a permit for a vacation rental home in a week, and I know we have a significant process with a lot of requirements of things that need to be provided to you all.

MR. SPENCE: Right.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: So there is a, part of me that says part of the problem is the process we've set up. Or not the, I shouldn't say the process, the requirements for an application. So as you know, we don't like adding positions if there are other ways that we can deal with this. So I'd like your thoughts and I don't need 'em now because...but I think we need to be thinking about areas in which we can roll back a little bit of what we're demanding each of the applicants to put together. Because it, you know, one of the things that he didn't address was the, just the cost to apply.

MR. SPENCE: Sure.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: You know the cost to go to Planning Commission is significant, the cost of, you know, hiring consultants without ever knowing whether you're going to have the ability to move ahead with a project.

MR. SPENCE: Right. And some of that goes back to the...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MR. SPENCE: I'm sorry?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No, go ahead.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. SPENCE: Some of that goes to the predictability that Mr. Cook was talking about. Just by way of perspective, the way that we used to handle for instance short-term rental homes was through the Conditional Permit process which comes to the County Council, there's...I know...let's say you wanted to do one in Hana, you would have three public hearings. You would have one with the Hana Advisory Committee, then the Planning Commission, and then the County Council, and then two readings of an ordinance. That's why you saw very few, because that process was amazingly burdensome. That has been pared down significantly, and that's why we see, you know, through an administrative process that's why we see, we have seen this increase in volume of applications, because it is something that most individual property owners can tackle. Okay. But that's, again that adds a huge processing burden. The, I concur with the Chair that it would be nice if we could come in and register and get permits within a week. We spent so much time with the short-term rental home permit process and there was so much public input and insistence that, you know, all these different safeguards be put in place, the notification, the requirements for applications, et cetera. And I'm not just saying public input but that was certainly a big chunk of it. All the safeguards, all of the specifications in place all add up to a very complex process.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Right.

MR. SPENCE: In other places that, well, that perhaps aren't as popular as Maui, that process is significantly easier. So it would take some doing to reduce the process. I'm not sure how the public would feel about that.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, we understand that, but --

MR. SPENCE: Yeah, okay.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --the point is that we're making part of the problem.

MR. SPENCE: Yes, sir.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, thank you.

MR. SPENCE: And that's...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: We're going to take a...I see some people crossing their legs so we'll take a ten-minute break. Please be back here...actually let's make it an eight-minute break. Be back here at seven minutes to 11:00. We're in recess. . . .(gavel). . .

RECESS: 10:45 a.m.
RECONVENE: 10:58 a.m.

CHAIR WHITE: . . .(gavel). . . The Budget and Finance Committee will please come back to order. Members, I know we are pretty much done with the A Accounts, but what I

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

would like to do at this point is move to the issue of the Kahana Bay funding request of \$750,000 while we have the availability of the person from the Army Corps of Engineers. So with that, Deputy Director, if you wouldn't mind starting that discussion --

MS. McLEAN: Thank you, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --and then calling upon the individual at the appropriate time.

MS. McLEAN: Okay, thank you. We should lead off by saying that in FY '16, we requested \$320,000 to conduct the studies at Kahana Bay. There were two studies. One to determine if there was sufficient, appropriate quality sand offshore that could be used for beach renourishment, and also to study the types of structures that would also be used in conjunction with beach nourishment for beach nourishment to be successful. In FY '16, the Council approved half that amount, \$160,000, wanting the remainder, 160, to be paid for by the community who would benefit from these studies. And we were asked clearly and directly is this a one-time thing, will you be coming back to ask for additional funding? And we said it i a one-time thing, we will not be coming back to ask for additional funding. An opportunity has come up that we feel is too rare to not bring forward to you. We were made aware of this. The idea came up late last year and only a few weeks ago, were we given a clear indication from the Army Corps of Engineers that they would be interested in continuing the study of this bay. The process that they use begins first with a feasibility study that the Army Corps conducts. That feasibility study is paid for 50/50 between the Army Corps and then the non-Federal sponsor which would be the County in this case. If that...after the feasibility study is completed, the Army Corps takes all the feasibility studies that have been conducted, and they choose from among those which are projects that they have a Federal interest in actually pursuing and implementing themselves. And if that were to happen in this case, then 80 percent of that cost is covered by the Army Corps, by the Federal government. And so as I said, this is just a very rare opportunity for something like this. When it came forward, the first thing we thought of was oh, this was the project that we told the Council we wouldn't coming back to ask some more money for. But it really is a unique opportunity, and it literally, the factsheet that the Army Corps prepared is dated March 16th, that's how recent this is. And, you know, we had to do some real scrambling in the Department and in the Administration to decide to bring it forward to you. This obviously isn't in the budget that was presented by the Mayor. Actually the first time we had a chance to talk to the Mayor about it was the morning after he presented his budget to the Council. So I do apologize for the timing but again, it's an opportunity that just came about and we feel that it needs to be presented to you. We have with us today Milton Yoshimoto who's with the Army Corps of Engineers, Honolulu District. He came over this morning to be here. So if we could have him come to the podium to talk a little bit about the Continuing Authorities Program under which this project would be pursued. We also do have copies of the factsheet that they prepared, as well as some slides from the area if you want to get into any more detail whether today or at a later point.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Would you like us to distribute that?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MS. McLEAN: Sure.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Welcome, Mr. Yoshimoto.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Thank you, Mr. Chair and Councilmembers. Good morning. My name is Milton Yoshimoto. I manage civil works programs for the Army of Corps of Engineers, Honolulu District, and I will be the project manager for the Kahana Bay feasibility study should it go forward. I didn't come this morning prepared to do a presentation; however, I'd be happy to entertain any questions you have or clarify anything that was said to this point.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, the first question that comes to my mind is the cost of study. I'm assuming that the cost is \$1.5 million, is that correct?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Yes. Well, let me clarify that this is a two-phase process. The feasibility study along with the NEPA which would be addressed during the feasibility phase would lead to a design and implementation phase if we determine there's a Federal interest in moving forward. And so the feasibility study currently is estimated at 1.45 million of which the Corps will pay 50 percent. Now having said that, we are in the process of securing Federal funding to develop what we call a project management plan which will essentially develop a scope of work for this feasibility study. So there are opportunities moving forward to bring that number down, and we're going to make every effort to look at how we can still do justice to a feasibility study while bringing the cost of that study down. I understand that there's an ongoing study with Moffatt & Nichol so we're also going to be meeting with them to look at how we can share information so there's no redundancy between what's currently being done and what we're going to propose to do. The feasibility phase, the study, the objective of the study is to identify a recommended plan with a Federal interest, and if the County chooses to continue forward, we would go into the plans and specs phase which would be cost-shared at a 65 Federal, 35 local ratio. And, Michele, that's a clarification on your 80/20, it's 65 percent Federal, 35 percent non-Federal. And then in construction, the same cost-share ratio, 65 percent Federal, 35 percent non-Federal. So it's not a study just for the sake of a doing a study, it's a study that will lead to design and construction if the County chooses to take it all the way to that point.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: What are the elements that are covered during the feasibility study?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: The feasibility study first of all will address all of the NEPA requirements. It will also be doing a lot...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: For those of us who aren't with your lingo, what is NEPA?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: NEPA is the National Environmental Protection Act, more commonly known as environmental studies, Environmental Assessments, Environmental Impact Statements. Whatever is determined to be needed given the nature of the project that we're going to be undertaking. So it would include all of the NEPA studies. It would

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

include engineering studies, shoreline modeling, topographic surveys, geotechnical studies. We have a district economist which will be quantifying the benefits to the Federal government in moving forward. And it's important to note here that I keep bringing up the term Federal interest. In order for the Corps of Engineers to participate, there needs to be a determination that there is a Federal interest in doing so, and we do this by developing a benefit-to-cost ratio. So the benefits that accrue to the project need to exceed the cost of implementing the project, and if it does then there's a Federal interest. And if the local sponsor, the County of Maui is interested in continuing then we would continue on to design and construction.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: So the match, the non-Federal portion of the match can be made up of County money as well as monies from the association of folks that are...

MR. YOSHIMOTO: My, I think my recommendation would be that any private monies come through the County.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Right.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Right. So the County and the Corps will sign on to a cost-sharing agreement, and any private monies would come through the County to the Corps.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, thank you. Members, questions? Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Are we, we are going to get the slides? You had some or the Department had some slides? Is that right?

MS. McLEAN: Yeah, we're distributing the CAP factsheet, the Continuing Authorities Program factsheet, and then also some slides that we had put together that's based on some of the studies that have been conducted to date --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Gotcha.

MS. McLEAN: --in the area. And I can talk about that whenever it's appropriate to go there.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: So to kind of summarize how we're going to go about this if the County chooses to move forward. This is being conducted under the Army Corps of Engineers' Continuing Authorities Program which is our small-project program. Section 103 addresses storm damage reduction, and that's the section within the authority that we'd be conducting the work. There's a statutory limit, a Federal spending limit of \$5 million. That 5 million would include planning, engineering, and design. So if you start at the feasibility study, through construction, the Federal government cannot spend more than \$5 million on the project. If the cost sharing were to exceed that then the County would have to pay 100 percent of any cost above that. But having said that, the reason that we're pursuing it under this authority is because we feel that well, we're well within that \$5 million in terms of what the project would cost.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. Mr. Chair, if I may?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Please proceed.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: One of my concerns would be that the Corps' response or solution to this would be seawalls. Let's just put seawalls up and forget it. Which may protect for a long number of years, but it...I think a lot on this Council at least are very adverse to putting up any more seawalls. What is the Corps' thought on that?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Okay. Well, let me start by saying that this is not a Corps of Engineers' project, that the project proponent is the County of Maui, and the Corps is only participating at the request of Mayor Arakawa who wrote us a letter earlier this month. The County will be a part of what we call the project delivery team which includes all of the Corps team as well as any contractors that we'll have, and the County would definitely be part of that team and it would have a say in the final solution. It's been made clear to us what the County's preference is. If the Federally-recommended plan turns out to be something other than what the County's preference is, there is an opportunity to continue to pursue what the County would prefer in terms of an alternative. We call that a locally-preferred plan. And as an example if the locally-preferred plan exceeds the Federal-planning cost, then the Federal government will cost share up to the Federally-recommended plan, and the local, the sponsor would pay the difference.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. 'Cause I mean I think there's nine properties that are involved and...or eight, and a number of them already have seawalls at some state of disrepair. But even if you were to say okay, we're going to put in four more seawalls, I can't...seawalls are really expensive, I can't see it costing less than \$5 million.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Sure. And, you know, we do work all over the territories in addition to the State of Hawaii, and as an example, the former DPW Director in the Territory of Guam said no hardened structures, so anything we do would not be a hardened structure. So we're definitely, you know, listening to what the project sponsor wants --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: --and yet we need to go through this prescribed process and determine the Federal interest and what exactly would be in the Federal interest. But as I said, there is an opportunity to continue to pursue the local interest.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. And that's my last question I guess would be what defines Federal interest?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Federal interest is number one, the benefits to the project need to exceed the cost, and when I say benefits we're talking about what we call national economic development benefits or benefits to the nation as a whole. The alternative with the largest amount of net benefits, a BC ratio greater than one and the largest amount of net benefits would be the Federal recommended plan. The locally-preferred plan

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

would need to have a BC ratio greater than one, and then we would look at the cost of that locally-preferred plan in terms of whether the locals would buy up to it or if it's less than the Federally-recommended plan, we need to provide some justification to our headquarters as to why we're recommending something less than what is in the Federal interest.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Chair. I did say that was my last question but he brought up something, if I may follow up?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Go ahead and ask.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: What are...so you're saying okay, here's our recommendations, here's the local recommendations. What are the, in your experience what are the chances, you know, what are the odds of this getting, become Federal interest? I mean is it...are we...is it a long shot, is it almost a slam dunk, or somewhere in between?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: If I understand your question, you're asking whether there would, we would find something that would be determined to be in the Federal interest, a solution?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Correct, correct. If we're going to put down \$750,000 --

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Right. Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: --are we almost assured that we go to the next step?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: I can't give you any assurance. This initial step, this CAP factsheet that was handed out...I think it was handed out.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yes.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: That was...what we start with in the process is we call a Continuing Authorities Program factsheet. And, you know, the team took a site visit out there, we kind of looked at what data was available, what the problem and need was, and there was a determination that there's enough of a chance that there's a Federal interest at a project to recommend going forward. So the first step was this factsheet which went out there and took a look and said yeah, there's enough here to make us feel comfortable that there would be a Federal interest in continuing forward.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. Thank you, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Mr. Guzman --

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Oh yeah.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --followed by Ms. Cochran.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Thank you, Chair. Is the, these type of projects, are they limited to just the district like per year, or is this like a one-time deal and we can't utilize the same type of I guess project?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Well, no.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Do you understand what I'm saying? Like if we have another area --

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: --that has more priority than this --

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: --if we use up the 5 million in this...

MR. YOSHIMOTO: No, it's 5 million per project.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Per project.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: So is it also limited per year per project?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: No.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: So we can have multiple projects going on at the same...

MR. YOSHIMOTO: You can request multiple projects; however, it's competitive, and, you know, we're competing nationwide for funding. So you can request as many projects as you want, and we have other authorities that we address other than shoreline protection. We have navigation, we have flood control, we have ecosystem restoration projects, and so there's no limit as to how many requests you can put in; however, we need to compete for funding so it's unlikely that every request would be funded. You know it may take a year or two to get funding.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay. Is there any potential other areas that have, that you've been approached with?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Not by the County.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay. And you mentioned that Mayor Alan Arakawa sent you a letter?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Well, that's a requirement for us moving forward that, again, I go back to the fact that Maui County is the project proponent, this is not a Corps of Engineers' project, and we are only participating at the request of a non-Federal sponsor which in this case is the County of Maui. So in order to move forward, there needs to be a letter from the non-Federal sponsor acknowledging their understanding of the process and requesting that we proceed forward.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: And that, I mean just following up on Chair White's question on a private entity sharing the cost. Why does it have to go through the County?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: The Corps cannot partner with private entities for these types of projects or for any of our civil works projects. So we can go through nonprofits or partner with nonprofits, state government, territorial governments, county governments, but not private entities.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay, thank you. Interesting.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, very interesting. Thank you, sir, for being here --

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --and willingness to take a look at this proposal via this County. And so Mr. Guzman brought up some good points. You may know already that we have already US Army Corps participation with the restoration of Mokuhinia --

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --which is also in West Maui.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: So in reference to what Mr. Guzman was mentioning as in, you know, competition, actually would we be in competition with ourselves then?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: That's a different section within the same authority. So this is a shore protection. Mokuhinia I believe is a restoration. Yeah. So it's funded out of a different pot.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. So good, no, we're not competing against ourselves.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And the other thing is the question in regards to partnering with a nonprofit of sorts, and Mr. White asked or asked why does it have to go via the

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

County. I guess the particular condos could create such an entity, a nonprofit of sorts to become organized in order to maybe work more one on one with those entities and yourselves that could...

MR. YOSHIMOTO: I suppose that's a possibility, I'd have to run that by our council to make sure that everything was set up correctly. You know my experience has also been it's a lot easier and it's a lot cleaner just to be working with one entity. We've had projects in the past where we've worked with both the state and the county who cosigned the agreement and there are always conflicting priorities, conflicting interests, and it's a whole lot easier just to work with one non-Federal sponsor. But having said that, I would say it's not out of the question, but it would have to be set up to the satisfaction of our council.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Of course. Yeah, understood there. And so I still want to figure out the Federal interest and the benefit-to-cost idea. I notice that the title to this is storm damage reduction.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: So but everyone is talking beach nourishment and, you know, seawalls or no. So where, this is...

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Storm...

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: How is this in reference to the storm damage reduction in this plan?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Storm damage reduction just refers to Section 103 of the Continuing Authorities Program. So everything, every project that's pursued under Section 103 of the Continuing Authorities Program is a storm damage reduction. Similar to as an example we have Section 107 under that same authority which is navigation, and so it would be called, you know, whatever appropriate title that that section has to pursue these types of projects. So it's not necessarily saying that it's storm damage reduction per se at Kahana that's the issue, but that is associated with the section that we're conducting the study under.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Okay. That was, yeah, kind of throwing me with the terminology there. And is this handout from US Army Corps? I guess gives the over, aerial view? Oh, that's Planning? Okay. All right. That, I think that's all the questions I have at this time.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: But thank you very much for your time and interest.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Sure.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair, that's all.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you. Having looked real quickly at the--what did you call it--CAP?

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Continuing Authorities. Yeah, we call it CAP, it's short for, it's an acronym for Continuing Authorities Program.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: CAP program. It's showing three different alternatives and cost. Projected cost for a rock revetment was 1.6 to \$2.4 million. A steel wall...seawall, steel sheet pile seawall, 1.2 to 1.6 million. And then beach replenishment, 4.8 to \$6.4 million. Obviously the other 2 are cheaper, but the more desired one from I think most of the people on this body and I'm sure the Department as well would be the beach replenishment. The big difference in prices there or costs is, will that go, will that be a factor in your decisions? 'Cause I mean when, just looking at this for the dollar amounts, there's no, it's a no-brainer.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: First of all, the fact sheet was a very cursory analysis --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Sure.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: --of the problem and need, based on existing information and our experience with similar type projects. So, you know, the, as we get started with the feasibility study, everything's on the table in terms of the range of alternatives. Everything will be costed, we'll have a cost engineer onboard on our project team, it'll be costed out by the cost engineer. I would say that each alternative would have its own benefit stream. In other words, there may be some similarities in terms of benefits that accrue to the projects across the board, but each alternative would also have its unique benefits to that project. We look at a 50-year project life, a Corps project life. And so I think that...I guess if I understand your question correctly, would the high cost preclude us from pursuing the beach nourishment project? Not necessarily, it would all depend on our economic analysis and, you know, being able to cover the cost of the project with the benefits.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Well, I mean it's pretty obvious that the economic, and in strictly economic standpoint, it's much better to put the seawall or the rock revetment, including apparently the 50-year costs and benefits. What I don't want to, what I don't think I would want to do and I'm not sure if the other Members would is pay \$750,000 to have them say you gotta put a seawall in and that's it. You know that's my dilemma, Mr. Chair, and I would just like to know if there are a little bit more...I know you can't, but more assurances to say yeah, we're going to spend the 750 and we'll still fund the beach replenishment.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Right. I can't give you that assurance. I can say that there are ways to as I said continuing to pursue the local interest in terms of what the solutions are.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

And let me give you an example. Although, you know, from the numbers you just gave here from the study, the beach nourishment project was significantly more than a hardened structure. As an example, if you put a hardened structure out there and you lose the beach, there are economic repercussions obviously to losing the beach. So it's not as simple as saying what are you protecting behind the seawall or, you know, the erosion encroaching on private property. There are benefits unique to the beach replenishment alternative that you would...that wouldn't accrue to a hardened structure.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. Thank you, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: You know I, this dealing with erosion along our shorelines is a continuing study in what the heck is going to work. And I'm not real sure about just beach replenishment, because you're not...unless you change, you know, unless you can put some groins in or something to keep the sand there, because otherwise it, we may spend three times the money and it's just going to get washed away. I recall a number of years ago at the Westin Hotel in Kaanapali, they lost a significant amount of their frontage and they put in a rock revetment that was sloped. I think it was a steeper grade than the revetment that you show in here. I'm kind of intrigued with this revetment design, because within a very short amount of time, the sand came back and completely covered the revetment, and yet we required them to take it out. I'm, there's got to be something in between. If we're going to put in a revetment that's sloped like the one you've got in here, it leads me to believe that it's going to allow for the reaccumulation of sand or the ability for us to put, you know, replenish the sand and still have a hardened surface that's not going to allow for further deterioration of the shoreline. But I don't know what the happy medium is there, but there's, I think I'm intrigued by this because I think it's something that we're going to be dealing with in other areas of our County, and this is a good time to start getting a much better understanding of what we're dealing with.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: As I mentioned earlier, some of the engineering studies that we're going to be doing as part of the feasibility study, you know, our coastal engineers are going to be doing some modeling of the shoreline and a shoreline analysis to figure out what's going on out there. It's not a matter of just saying okay, you have an erosion problem so we're going to put something there to stop it. So there's going to be studies done to better understand the processes that are going on. To address your specific problem about putting a revetment out there and, you know, having to replenish, you know, I think in a beach nourishment project, you probably look at maybe T-groins to keep the sand to the extent that you can from washing away. But having said that, there is going to be a requirement for a periodic renourishment, because obviously you can't keep 100 percent of the sand there, it is inevitably going to wash away. So we would as part of the project come up with a plan for and intervals for that periodic renourishment of the beach.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, thank you. Members, I think we've had a really fruitful discussion on the...Ms. Cochran, do you want to...

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah, just in closing, Chair. I think the kind of maddening part is Page 15, Item 7 which states project study area of the beach shoreline is owned by the State and here we are, coming to us the County doing what's owned by the State. So I'll just leave it at that, Chair. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: I'm sure they'll be giving us more than enough TAT to cover it. Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: I...thank you for the discussion. I've learned a lot. But, you know, the book I'm writing, *My Mother Said*. My mother said be careful when you build on sand. What belongs to the ocean the ocean will take back. She would not let me build on sand.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And we've got lots of stuff built on sand.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: I'd like to also add one other thing. There was a comment about other areas on, you know, on the island or within the County that are in need also as far as the erosion problem. You know we have an authority called our Planning Assistance to States authority which is purely technical studies. But let me give you an example of something we've done in the territories for American Samoa. We've actually produced under our planning assistance authority, a shoreline atlas which identifies all the critical areas within the, around the island and a priority of where you need to start addressing it. And, you know, we would work with the County in terms of what the criteria is to identify what the priorities are, whether it's population or threatening a road or what have you, but it would be a comprehensive look at your shoreline. Identifying where the hotspots are and coming up with priorities for your planning purposes in terms of, you know, how you address the problems around the island. That's just an example of some of the things, some of the authorities we have and how we can assist. And that authority is cost shared 50/50, but no design, no construction, just purely a technical study.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Well thank you very much for being here, Mr. Yoshimoto.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: You're welcome.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And sorry to keep you waiting this long, but I think it's been a very fruitful and helpful discussion.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Thank you. And if there are any further questions, I guess maybe through the Planning Office it'll be forwarded to me, I'll be happy to answer them.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, great.

MR. YOSHIMOTO: Thank you.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you very much. Okay, Members, the Chair would like to open up for questions on B Account items. We've got other studies requested and other amounts. Mr. Carroll, do you have any questions on the B Accounts?

COUNCILMEMBER CARROLL: No, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: I had asked earlier, now I'm trying to remember. Clean and Sober . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah, to...

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Clean and Safe or whatever it is.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Clean and Safe.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Sober means safe.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, we hope they're sober too. So your question was in relationship to what is, what's happened --

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Yeah, what's happening.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --with the funding so far...

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: If we're going to be, you know, get more money for it, how's it going?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Right. Right. Department?

MS. McLEAN: Thank you. So far in this, in FY '16, we've only done the safe part, we haven't done the clean part yet. We have an RFP out now for the clean component of Clean and Safe. But the safe component has gone very well. I asked staff to give me a couple of examples. One is there was a homeless, mentally ill individual continually visiting shops and harassing employees and customers, and with the help of our person out there, the owner filed a notice of trespass and had the individual arrested. During that time, he violated a restraining order and is now at the State hospital, so he's getting the services that he needs. So the safety ambassador got him the treatment that he needed and the business, the relief from the stress. So the safety ambassador was with MPD previously so he knows their system and interfaces well with them. He knows where his boundary ends and theirs begins. So that's just one example of how the Safe Program is going so far.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Thank you very much. That's good news. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And just to follow on that specific item, what will the, how does the funding request for this year or how is it going to be used?

MS. McLEAN: It will be used for Clean and for Safe, so continuing with the safety ambassador, and then if we do get the Clean Program going, it would be continuing the Clean Program in next fiscal year.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And what is the level of participation by the businesses in Wailuku?

MS. McLEAN: Their level of participation in what? Financially participating --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: In assisting or financially --

MS. McLEAN: --or being active?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --or...

MS. McLEAN: They're really our eyes and ears, and so when it used to be, they would contact our staff with questions and concerns and suggestions, they're now contacting our safety ambassador and will also be able to contact the person in charge of the clean component. They, it's little by little they're expanding beyond taking care of their own, you know, they're more focused on their property and their customers, but more and more they're looking out for others. So we hope that will just continue to grow as the program gets implemented.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Okay, any other questions, Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No, that's it.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: On other items?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Oh, the other one was the mapping of the IALs, and I just said I think that's great, we need to get it done. That's all.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And thank you, Chair. The Clean and Safe, so that monies has gone to like security services, Police Department, where...I guess my question was where does the money go to? Who or an entity of sorts or?

MS. McLEAN: Right. The person we're calling the safety ambassador, it goes for that person's services. It's not, it isn't police, because police still have their law enforcement role to play. It's more being the connection, just someone on the street who can like in this case, make the, be the conduit between the business and the police. And let the business owner know, look, if you do this, this is what the police can do. And also just being a physical presence there.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And what's the dollar amount put to that program? Does it say? Oh, sorry, where is it? 'Cause I think there's a combo. Oh, 100,000.

MS. McLEAN: Right, it was 100,000 in FY '16, and we're asking for the same in FY '17, for the two together.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. And that will, the clean portion will be kicking into action and that monies will be like for that services of cleaning?

MS. McLEAN: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Kind of like I guess Lahaina Restoration Foundation does in Lahaina Town, Front Street.

MS. McLEAN: Right. Making sure that the --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Bins...

MS. McLEAN: --trash is emptied, and if there's graffiti, that that's get painted over.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Right. Okay, very good. And then also looking at your scope of duties as a Planning Department in reference to the Cultural Resources Management Program. I think we spoke about that and there was not really something in place or is there? I mean not that you ignore cultural things, I'm just...but a certain, I guess there's supposed to be something officially prepared and something that people can look at and then enforce, you know, the details within that program or plan or whatever it's supposed to be called. So do we have such a thing or...'cause it's in our Charter that Planning Department does. And I ask because I see you folks are really honing in on getting to these reports and things we were supposed to have had, so that was one of the points I notice in the Charter that if I'm not mistaken, we don't currently have either.

MS. McLEAN: We have a Cultural Resources Planner on our staff. Cultural resources is a very broad term. Her background is in architectural historic preservation, and so in that regard, she's very active in the historic districts and also with building permit reviews of structures that are 50 years old and older to see about appropriate mitigation or protection. She does also have some experience with other parts of cultural resources, archaeology, Hawaiian history. She staffs the Cultural Resources Commission, and so in terms of the things that are, that fall under their authority, she will process items that come before the CRC. And she is also working with the State Historic Preservation Division on doing architectural surveys of areas all over the island. In terms of there being, you know, like a plan that gets followed, I don't know of anything that that's formalized. But we do have the Cultural Resources Planner and we do have the authority of the Cultural Resources Commission that we staff.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. All right. I guess that could constitute as a program 'cause the Charter doesn't technically say plan but a program of sorts, so. All right. Well, thank you. Just had a question about that. Thanks, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you. Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Yeah, with the IAL study, yes we've discussed it I think in Committee. It's something that needs to be done and I'd like to channel Mr. Hokama in this one. The State is supposed to have paid for this, it's in the law that created the IAL. So I don't know how we can get them, but I'm assuming that if we pay for it and do it, that we can someday get the money back in reimbursement. I don't know. Yeah, just as soon as we get...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: I'll channel Mr. Hokama. Fat chance.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: I thought you were channeling Ms. Baisa by rolling her eyes. So I mean that's just one that it is in the State law that they were supposed to pay us so I don't know how we can enforce that. Maybe we can have Mr. Ueoka write a letter to them. The other one is the district boundary amendment thing. You're going to basically hire a firm to draw up the papers, to go to the Land Use Commission. Currently if we haven't...if whatever is happening at the State Legislature right now doesn't pan out, would that be per parcel that they would have to do this? And for--now I'll channel Mr. Victorino--for the public's information is we've got our district growth, I mean our urban growth boundaries that we've said, this body has said this is where we plan on our urbanization of Maui. So there's no reason why we shouldn't have the State...why somebody should have to go through the State Land Use Commission, each individual parcel owner to say...to have a district boundary amendment. We should, *we* should be able to as a County or as an entity say this is where our urban growth boundary is according to our General Plan so make it all Urban, and that will cut a layer out of issues that, you know, Mr. Cook brought up. That's a huge layer. It took a two-year process taken out, maybe longer.

MR. SPENCE: Longer.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: So if the State lawmakers don't make the change that we're asking for at the State Legislature, would that be a parcel-by-parcel project?

MR. SPENCE: It could very well be, and I'm hoping not. There's...so the Committee Members know, there's a bill before the State Legislature right now that would...right now it says require that the counties present their general plans and community plans to the State Land Use Commission. And so the Land Use Commission would, they would do the five-year boundary reviews. They would take up redistricting whatever is in the community plans and the Maui Island Plan. And I'm sure there would be some selection. You know we have some projects in there that may impact State or County facilities more than others. There may be some selection process within that. But this, you know, we'll see how this piece of legislation comes out. But the idea is to implement our plans. The idea behind this particular appropriation would be, you

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

know, we're often criticized for not, I mean Countywide criticized for not implementing the community plans and the General Plan, so let's take a big chunk of this. This is, implementation of our plans is redistricting and rezoning to what our plans say they should be. So we should, you know, this is a proactive step in doing that. Instead of what I like to term as passively/aggressively waiting for someone else to come and implement the plan one at a time.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Chair. And lastly, and, you know, I wholeheartedly support that as well, so far all of your requests unfortunately. And lastly, even if we have to do it Limited Term Appointment, I still think we need to get extra resources at least for a year or a year or two, to take down that backlog of the illegal vacation rentals. So if we did it, do you think you could do something with Limited Term Appointment depending on legal issues or outside agencies?

MS. McLEAN: I think as we've said before, any help will help. The, as with the positions we're requesting, same with LTAs, we wouldn't be able to start anything on those until FY '17 begins. We would have to start with writing position descriptions and then recruiting and then hiring. So it would take a while to see the result from that. And even if it were done privately which I realize there are civil service concerns about that, writing the RFP and putting that out would also take time. So eventually yes, of course it would be helpful, but it will take time before we see the results of that. But LTAs might be a way to approach it that just is this focus for a couple of years and then it's over.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Yes. Thank you. So if I recall, was it last year or the year before, I can't remember, from the Office of State Planning. Weren't they trying to assist us with getting the appropriations for the IAL?

MR. SPENCE: Yes. In regular session, regular Legislative Session 2015, we put forth HB 10...I believe it's HB 1042, and that had broad support from Office of Planning, the other planning departments, actually throughout the committees, each committee it went to 'til it finally came for funding, and then, you know, there's so many competing requests for funding in a State level that this one just fell short. And I think that's really unfortunate, because it is a State mandate to do and we're trying to do this. But it has broad popular support, it's just, it's where the money.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: For the \$250 to, that they couldn't do? Even that, for 250...

MR. SPENCE: Two hundred and fifty thousand?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Yeah.

MR. SPENCE: Yeah. We're...I'm sorry?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MR. SPENCE: Yeah, we had asked the State for 5, we're trying to, you know, and we thought that would...it's different than the other counties, because we have three islands with agricultural lands.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Right.

MR. SPENCE: In order to designate, that means three community, they're like community plan advisory committees, three advisory committees to staff, lots of travel, et cetera. That's why the price tag was so high. We're going to at least try to get this thing off the ground with 250.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Yeah. I question because of conversations I've had at the time with the executive director, if you recall, we've had the meetings with that. So that's kind of my concern why we're putting up the funding for that when it should...

MR. SPENCE: Yeah, I...

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Yeah. Okay.

MR. SPENCE: The State should fund it, but...

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Yeah. The other thing I have a question for is the Clean and Safe Program in Wailuku Town. Is it just our funding or are the businesses also contributing to this program? Is there a matching? And is this the only district that we provide this services for the kind of funding?

MS. McLEAN: For this fiscal year and proposed for FY '17, yes, we are the only source of funding and there isn't a match for those specific tasks. That's not to say that individual businesses and some of the community groups aren't also doing their own efforts to help Wailuku, but specifically for those things, it is just from the County.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Yeah, my questions relate to the IAL, Important Agricultural Lands. The, I think all the Members have stated their, I guess their concerns. I'm going to take a little bit of a different approach with Section 205-47. It's my understanding that you have to create, the County needs to create incentive programs in order for it to trigger I guess our obligation under the statute to move forward in getting the designations done. So until we do the incentives, then we don't have an obligation, and so that's my question to you is what is, what are we doing in the incentive portion of that HRS section?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. SPENCE: That's a fair question. And I will have to look at that portion of the statute again and read it in that light. But...

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: 'Cause that's what Kauai, you know, they created this group to --

MR. SPENCE: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: --create these incentives and then from there...I'm just wondering what the 250,000 is going to go to. It's like oh, are you putting the cart before the horse or the horse before the cart? You know are you going straight into it without...you know, I think it would be better if we got the incentive program off and running, that way you can leverage that to the State and say look, we've gotten this phase done, now we need your money because you've mandated this onto us to implement and identify the IALs.

MR. SPENCE: Okay. We can look --

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: That's just a...

MR. SPENCE: --at it. Like I said, we can look at it in that light. My thought was both at the same time because that would be part of the public input to, you know, because each island would have like an advisory committee and that would be part of the input that we would solicit. What are the incentives that you think are necessary? You know your island the best. What are the incentives that would help you in promoting agriculture here. But we could certainly think about it like you're suggesting.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Do you know whether Kauai, did they get monies appropriated from the State? 'Cause they also started out with 250,000.

MR. SPENCE: I don't think it was that much, and they ran through it very quickly. And they have still not made a final adoption of their IAL.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay. Another mandate from the State without --

MR. SPENCE: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: --any appropriations.

MR. SPENCE: And I'll say that Oahu is going ahead on their own.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah, it brings up the question, if the State...if the statute requires that the State fund it and the State is not accepting responsibility to fund it, does that give us the ability to modify how we approach it?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Chair? I believe that the, in the statute, it doesn't require the State to fund it. They're just mandating us to do it.

MR. SPENCE: I think there's...

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Is there a section --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, the Constitution...

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: --in there that says...

MR. SPENCE: I think there is a provision that they're supposed to fund in the original act.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: In the original act but they did an amendment to that act which was...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, by Constitution, if the State mandates the counties to do something, they must share in the cost.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Now that could be a dollar to our 250, 250,000, but...

MR. SPENCE: Here you go, County of Maui.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: I'll pick up the dollar with Ms. Baisa tomorrow in Honolulu.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: We'll try to bring one home.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Along those lines, the, in the, in that line item, we provided \$320,000 of funding last year, and it looks like the amount that has been encumbered of 145,000 is for the study, the Kahana Bay study. What do you anticipate using the other 150,000 for this year?

MS. McLEAN: We were budgeted 160,000 and we anticipate spending 147,000.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: But you still have a balance available of over 150,000. What...

MS. McLEAN: Oh, in Professional Services?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Right.

MS. McLEAN: Oh sorry. That's our RFP for the Title 19 study, audit.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: The zoning...

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MS. McLEAN: It's still out, so that contract has not been awarded yet. So that would be I believe 75,000.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, so that leaves another 75.

MS. McLEAN: We haven't paid out or the Kahana Bay study is a standalone line item I believe. I can't be mixing that. Let me look and see what our other professional services are for this year. No, I need our Detail. Give me just a second if you could, Mr. Chair.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah, my question really is we've got specific things that we're using, you know, you assigned those amounts to for this year, the Kahana Bay study and the zoning study.

MS. McLEAN: Right.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: We have the 250 for the IAL in that line item, the request for 408,000. What will the balance be used for next year? Because these are projects that are a one-time shot, so.

MS. McLEAN: Right. The Planning Department before we started, always had a Professional Services line item for studies or projects that come along during the course of a year. Oftentimes those are small purchases of under 25,000. I'm trying to think of examples of what we've spent those on. In prior fiscal years, we did...actually we're working on one now to examine whether we can amend the grading ordinance to recapture excavated beach-quality sand to be able to save that for County projects or beach nourishment projects. So that was a small purchase, less than 25,000 for a consultant to draft an ordinance and look into some of the legal issues surrounding that. What else? I'm drawing a blank on what some of our other ones are.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, the reason I ask is that in the, on the, in the Details, I'm not sure if these line up exactly but in previous years, we spent 126,000 in 2014 and then 26,000 in 2015. And I may be looking at the wrong line because they're not lined up in the Details. But --

MS. McLEAN: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --anyway, over and above the 250 there's 158,000 that you're requesting --

MS. McLEAN: Right.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --and at this point, I don't see a specific assigned item --

MS. McLEAN: Right.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --that you want to deal with.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MS. McLEAN: And historically there haven't been specific assignments for that. That funding, Sandy pulled up some numbers. The process map that Tom Cook showed, we brought in a trainer to train us in process mapping and that was a \$19,000 contract. So we just had Professional Services money to do that. It wasn't something that we anticipated at the beginning of the fiscal year, but we had the funds available to bring in a trainer. That funding is also used when we have contested case hearings to pay for hearings officers, and we don't really have a way of anticipating how many interventions and --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Right.

MS. McLEAN: --contested cases we're going to hold so we have funding available for that. Let's see. Yeah, so those are just two examples from this fiscal year of how those funds have been spent.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. And then under Professional Services in 909010, there's a \$75,000 amount that hasn't been touched yet. Is that the \$75,000 you're...

MS. McLEAN: For the Title 19.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay.

MS. McLEAN: That should be, I believe, 'cause that should be a separate index code for the Title 19 study.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. But that's a separate pot of money from the other.

MS. McLEAN: Right.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Anyway, as we go through the process, I think it would be helpful if you would give us some indication of the use to which that would be put.

MS. McLEAN: Okay. For FY '17 anticipated?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And if you can take a look at the amounts that were in that category in previous years.

MS. McLEAN: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: We realize you need professional service --

MS. McLEAN: Right.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --monies for things that come up.

**BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

March 31, 2016

MS. McLEAN: Yeah, we can give you a breakdown for should we say FY '15, FY '16, and anticipated for FY '17?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah.

MS. McLEAN: Is that...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah.

MS. McLEAN: Okay, we can do that.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you. And then the next question is under the MRA, there was an infrastructure study, but yet we have \$275,000 under Professional Services and we've only utilized about 50,000, a little over 55...over 50,000. We have a remaining balance of 221. Do you foresee how that's going to be utilized and has the infrastructure study been completed or encumbered I should say?

MS. McLEAN: I'm sorry, Chair, I don't have an answer for you. We can follow up in writing with that.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. If you could, that would be great. Then the other thing I came across in IFAS was a, under Grants, it's an EDA, economic adjustment assistance and it's a prior year carryover of \$1.2 million. Are you aware of what that's for? And...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What page?

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yes.

MR. BAZ: We can do some research on that and I will get the index code from your Staff. But from our recollection of that, that was for the original planning and design that was an EDA grant for the municipal parking lot many years ago. And even though on the IFAS books, it's showing that there's carryover, I believe that that grant has been completely cancelled so there should be no funds available to be spent.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. And then, yeah, the index code is 106205, Grant Appropriations, 6400. Yeah but that should be taken out if that's no longer available.

MR. BAZ: That's one that I'll have my staff review so that she can reconcile all that.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. And what was the status of the infrastructure study? Do you know if it's been undertaken?

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair, we're trying to verify right now that it actually got pass Council. I believe it got deleted in the Council deliberations last year and it wasn't funded.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: But in the budget it's...your...the deletion on Page 532 under Operations, Services, Professional Services: Deletion of one-time appropriation for to hire a contractor to conduct an infrastructure integration study as part of the MRA's reWailuku initiative. And so you've deducted it from the budget, so.

MR. BAZ: Yeah, let me double check here real quick. Is there something else you can discuss?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No, you can get back to us on that. Members, any further questions on the B Accounts? Any further questions for the Planning Department? Seeing none and since it's lunchtime, we will thank the Department for their participation this morning, and we'll look forward to your responses on those couple of items. And this afternoon, I am assuming we will move into Corporation Counsel, followed by the Fire and Safety Department. So with that, Members, I wanna thank the Department and thank you all for being here, and we will recess until 1:30. . . .(gavel). . .

RECESS: 12:03 p.m.
RECONVENE: 1:35 p.m.

CHAIR HOKAMA: . . .(gavel). . . We shall bring the Budget Committee's meeting back to order. We'll continue the Committee's review of the various departments and their requests for the Fiscal Year 2017. First, I'd like to thank Mr. White for taking over the Chair's responsibilities for the morning session, and I thank the Members for their work on the Department of Planning. I did get a chance to channel in on your discussions, and I heard various comments about some of the requests so thank you for your good work this morning. We are now going to start the review of the Department of the Corporation Counsel which is headed by our chief attorney, Mr. Pat Wong, with his First Deputy, Mr. Ed Kushi. And although Mr. Ueoka is also present, he is more here for the assistance of the Committee this afternoon than for the Department. Stating that, if there's no questions for the Chair at this time, I'd like to ask Mr. Wong if he has some opening comments he'd like to share with the Members of the Committee?

DEPARTMENT OF THE CORPORATION COUNSEL

MR. WONG: I think. . .thank you, Chair. I think if you look at our budget, and we're gonna go through it, there's not many changes, there's a few in there that I certainly can explain, and I welcome any questions that you may have regarding our proposed budget. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Mr. Kushi, good afternoon. Any comments you'd like to share at this time?

MR. KUSHI: Not at this time. Thank you.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much. Okay, Members, Details are 2-1, Program is on 123. So what you have on the screen on the Chamber floor is of course their departmental summary and how they are structured, how Mr. Wong has structured them. One twenty-four, Members, departmental summary. One twenty-five, it's his expenditure summary by ABC categories. So first, I will ask Mr. Wong if there's any comments you'd like to share with the Committee. Outside of expansion, any expansion discussions, is there anything on the existing operations either from a personnel standpoint or a equipment standpoint or an operational cost standpoint?

MR. WONG: So, Chair, if I may?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Uh-huh.

MR. WONG: They're primarily expansion requests that are in there; otherwise, it's a flat budget.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MR. WONG: There's one position that I've asked for a reallocation and that's relative to Risk Management --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MR. WONG: --and the Safety Officer II moving to a Safety Officer III, and I can explain why I believe that position should be appropriately identified with the reallocation, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. We'll hit that shortly, Mr. Wong. I would ask the Members if they have questions regarding ABC Accounts of the current operations, excluding expansions. Mr. White, any questions for Mr. Wong or Mr. Kushi at this time?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No but I would like to hear Mr. Wong's explanation for the reallocation and the three, actually four expansion positions.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Yeah, we'll get to that, Mr. White. Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. And thank you, Mr. Wong, for being here. We had a discussion at the earlier session this morning, about some enforcement about vacation rentals, and I know I discussed it with you a little bit. It had to deal with having somebody gather evidence for the Department, whether it be the Department of Planning or your Department. And can you explain to me where that would be better...and this would be a temporary thing until we cut down the numbers and make sure that everybody's aware that the County is serious and everybody comes into compliance.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Wong?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. WONG: Chair, thank you. I did view this morning's presentation with Department of Planning, and what I'll share with you is that our Department, the Department of Corporation Counsel does assist other departments in my view in great detail in...and in some circumstances handling from its inception to its conclusion investigative matters. With regard to the item that you speak of, Mr. Couch, we do have within our Department already, one Deputy that would assist and does assist when are made aware of proposed violations. We also have in the past, assigned our internal investigator to work with the Department of Planning and their enforcement officers. What I would suggest to you is slightly different than what may have been presented by Planning, and that is Planning certainly has the capacity to--with your approval--engage more live bodies towards enforcement. But as you heard Ms. McLean describe, they would need to do the position descriptions and train and so on, and so you're looking at a significant period of time before they can actually implement. What I'll suggest to you is, you know, with the expansion positions that I'm proposing, the three Deputy Corporation Counsels, I could use those positions. We can engage attorneys a lot faster, and they could focus on assisting the Department with that specific enforcement role. We do have deputies in our Department that are assigned to code enforcement, but we get those cases after the Department has already taken steps. We have assisted the Department of Planning with I believe improving their investigator and their inspector training which we've recently done, and we can I think add to and greater supplement I think quicker than the Department of Planning would be able to. So part of my mindset with the three expansion positions is our current deputies are, they're working very hard on both sides, litigation and counseling and drafting, and as we take on more responsibility as we have doing investigations and conducting those investigations, I think we need more help. So I'm suggesting that if we get more live bodies, we will be able to continue in our effort but also add to it, and that could be one quick component to add to those investigations. And it will I think address your concerns.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you. 'Cause I wouldn't want...that would take away from whatever duties you were thinking of but only for a period of time, maybe a year. So that once we get the backlog down, and that's the whole idea. My thought was either a temporary outside agency to do that or your, you know, you had mentioned that if you were able to get this, that that might help.

MR. WONG: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. All right. I guess we'll get more into that in the expansion. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, yes. Ms. Cochran, questions at this time?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No, not at this time, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No, maybe later. Thank you.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. Carroll? Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Not at this time. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Not at this time. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. I guess you guys are ready for the expansion. But let me just go quickly through some of the existing current year budget operations and the proposals to the current. I notice on 2-7 of our Details, you are asking for some Premium Pay increases. Is this continued requirements for the software, case management software and the need for some kind of training or something, Mr. Wong?

MR. WONG: Chair, if I may? Some of the Premium Pay requests is relative to, if you recall our FY '16 and FY '15 budgets, we implemented a software program to internalize our documents. We currently still store documents offsite, and now that we have the software up and running and we have the equipment in place, some of the clerical staff have diligently worked on weekends and afterhours in order to assist us in bringing all our offsite documents internally. There's two things that I requested in the Premium Pay, one is with the merger of our software and our current IT programs, the...I understand from Jacob that we'll be able to use instead of GroupWise there's another program that we'll be able to upload. And in order for us to have that merge with the legal files program, we need additional training, and that's the Outlook program. That's one thing. And then the other one for Premium Pay is to continue to bring our documents and have them scanned internally so that we don't continue to need offsite storage.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for that, Mr. Wong. Let me follow up on something that was dear to this, to the Council and this Committee from last year. As you may recall, Mr. Wong, this Committee, this Council had a lot of concerns about the County's position in collective bargaining agreements. And so when you look at Page 125 of our narrative summary under Operations, Members, you will see under Services we did bump it up 100,000. In the proposed budget they're reducing it by that 100,000. So let me ask Mr. Wong if he can give us some comment please. Because this was in support of the County having a very strong representative or professional negotiator to represent the County's interest as an employer in collective bargaining negotiations. So if I may, Mr. Wong, ask you to give us some comment back on what is your understanding of the current status. Have you utilized any of the funds that Council appropriated? And who actually represented the County in the recent Bargaining Unit 14 negotiations agreement please?

MR. WONG: Thank you, Chair. In quick order, the representative of the County's interests in the Bargaining Unit 14 negotiations was our HR Director Lance Hiromoto. Along with him was one of the deputies from my Department, Gary Murai. As it relates to the monies budgeted and for the engagement of a negotiator, I did have upon the

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

passing of the budget at the beginning of FY '16, I did have discussions with, myself with Mr. Hiromoto and Mr. Murai identifying the funds that were available for the engagement of a negotiator. I was left with the impression that as we were not the lead in the negotiations, that the State was lead, the concept of prospectively using those monies rather than engaging a negotiator but engaging expert support services for the negotiator was considered. It's not that those items could not have been acquired, and an example would have been I believe an economist that could certainly provide the negotiator with insight into the economics that this County faces. The budgeted item however was for a negotiator. I did discuss with Mr. Hiromoto and Mr. Murai whether or not they felt we should engage an expert. Consideration was made of that, and given the, I believe, the involvement of Mr. Murai and Mr. Hiromoto in those negotiations and the experts already engaged, they did not suggest to me that it was worth it for us to spend that money when there were economists there presenting already. So I did not want to duplicate the effort, and in the event we're able to...and mind you, Chair, there are other bargaining units that are coming forward for further negotiations. So, you know, I suggested that we remove that amount. If this body's inclined to reinstate it, may I suggest that it be reinstated with a little bit more latitude in being able to engage some other support expert testimony that the lead negotiator could then use to our benefit.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MR. WONG: If I may.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I appreciate your comments 'cause it will help us if we choose to reinstate this consideration, Mr. Wong. So thank you for that. Can you tell this Committee how the selection of the lead negotiator is done? Or is there, the State's mentality is we're involved so we take the lead automatically and there's no debate about it?

MR. WONG: That's primarily it, Chair, that the State...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Is that by State law?

MR. WONG: I'm not sure about that. I believe that the State typically does take the lead and...well at least, that's been my impression. I don't whether or not it's State law that dictates that so.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Or I thought, or you know, if you said no, it's a rotation and Maui will eventually get to be the lead negotiator in the cycle of contracts. I mean I don't know and that's why I asked if do we always have to be the subordinate. Because as an employer, we have equal responsibilities to fulfill an agreement so I don't know why we wouldn't have equal standing as employers, and I just pose that in that manner, Mr. Wong.

MR. WONG: Thank you, Chair. I think as we move forward we do know that Mr. Hiromoto retires this year, and Mr. Underwood is taking his place, and so I think we'll have a

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

little bit more involvement if I may. And it'll be an interesting negotiated effort as we move forward with the next three bargaining units.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. White, questions for our representatives from Corporation Counsel?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, I appreciate you bringing up that question, 'cause that was one of the items I had wanted an explanation on. Since we've just been handed for consideration of what amounts to about a 47 percent increase, and I was, when we put the money...and I understand Mr. Wong's explanation and I respect the narrow focus of the monies that we put in. But I am concerned that we're not, we're either not given much participation, or we're not taking advantage of what is given to us. So with Mr. Wong's negotiating capacity in other areas, I would appreciate it if you could with Mr. Murai and maybe Mr. Underwood give us an evaluation of the State, the current State law and the level of participation the counties are allowed. And that's especially in Fire and Police and those that are not populated by many people at the State level. But I think it's something that we really need to take very seriously, because we're seeing things like there are three step movements in some of the, you know, some of the A Accounts. And I understand the rationale, but I can tell you, you don't see that in the private sector. I'm not aware of many companies that have step movements that...so this is an anomaly that everyone in the private sector is going to have to end up picking up the tab. So I think it's of great importance that we take a look at how these negotiations take place, what the State law provides, and what we may be interested in looking at with respect to adjustments to the State law going forward.

MR. WONG: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Before I ask Mr. Guzman for, if he has questions. Mr. Wong, you know, it just came to me, but does the contracts and any of its financial implications in your experience have any type of impact or part of the consideration of the bond raters when the County goes before them for borrowing future monies?

MR. WONG: Yeah, I would anticipate that it does, because it does speak to the overall financial capacity so yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. Make sure we send a help document request of Mr. White to Corporation Counsel to assist them in the response, and if you can send also to Mr. Baz if he has any information he could share with us as far as potential impacts on bond rating regarding collective bargaining contracts and the financial requirements to fulfill those agreement.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Chair? Just an added note.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: I've stated before that the increase and I haven't recalculated this with the current year's budget, but over a four-year period, the increases that we're...the increased employment cost without any increases in the number of employers that we have amounts to somewhere in the neighborhood of \$42 million. If you use, if you were to use that \$42 million, let's say we gave the employees half of that. We were to take that \$21 million and apply it to bond repayments, my calculation...I may be a little bit off on this, but my calculation is that we would be able to fund a very significant amount of projects like Upcountry water system improvements, like the various things that we need to do in wastewater and other places. So we all know that we end up with a certain amount of money, and we need to keep investing in the capital resources, and we need to keep investing in our human resources. But I'd like to get a sense of how our costs from a public employee standpoint compare with the increases in the private sector. 'Cause I just don't see them myself. So anyway, just food for thought.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. Well, I appreciate your comments, and we can definitely continue additional discussion. But we'll forward the request as the Chair and the Staff understands it and await Mr. Wong and his Department to respond to us. I know...I'm going this way. Mr. Guzman, questions, sir?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Thank you, Chair. Were you referring in regards to the monies appropriated for the negotiations, is that under Services?

CHAIR HOKAMA: That was under Services.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So that's why you see a \$100,000 --

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Yeah, yeah.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --adjustment from this year to the proposed year.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay, very good. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Mr. Carroll, questions, sir? Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Not at this time. Someone asked my question. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No, thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. We kind of skipped over goals and objectives. Can we go back to that or?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, we're going to go, but I just wanted to ask if there was anything part of this summary, this financial summary component, ABC of the existing operations if you had questions in this area. 'Cause I really wanted to bring up that \$100,000 regarding the negotiator's appropriation that, that's what I wanted to bring up in this position of the discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We'll get to goals and objectives.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Crivello, any questions?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Not right now. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. And again we can, you know, Mr. Baz has a requirement he shared with the Chair, that he must take care of this afternoon so I understand why he's not here. But one of the things we can ask him but I'll ask Mr. Wong too, it is my understanding that I believe it was yesterday the Salary Commission made a decision to increase compensation for the first deputies to 95 percent of the head positions' salaries. What is your understanding of the effective date of this Commission decision, Mr. Wong? Is it upon approval?

MR. WONG: Chair, I believe it's fiscal year, beginning of Fiscal Year '17 so July 1.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, I didn't see the actual decision, written decision, but I was just informed that the Commission did make a decision. So if you could help us understand please.

MR. WONG: Sure, Chair. My understanding is that the Commission...and I too haven't seen the actual decision myself. But my understanding of the decision is that it identifies the First Deputy salary as 95 percent of the Director's salary which amounts to somewhere around 120,700 and change. And I also believe that the effective date would be July 1 of 2016.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MR. WONG: And I understand from Mr. Baz that upon his receipt of the letter from the Chair of the Commission that he would forward that to you for your consideration.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. I just find it interesting timing, we're already in budget and then they're making adjustments, additional adjustments I would have hoped would have been done prior to budget submittal so we can have a good sense of the total request before the tax base. But thank you for that comment. Any further questions on the existing operations of ABC? If we have none, I'm happy to entertain questions from

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

you as it regards to their goals and objectives which is on Page 128, starts on 128, Members. And if you tie it into any of the Detail pages, the Chair would ask that you help us with that information so we can follow accordingly. Ms. Cochran, I believe you had a question under this area?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah, thank you, Chair. So going to Page 128, Goal 1, Items 2 and 3 seem I guess in a sense interchangeable in a sense where...well, just looking at Item 2 first, it looks like your actual percentage of how many, percentage of employees you'd like to train drops. Or is that... 'cause 60 to begin with and then you just want to gradually increase by 10 percent every year after that kind of idea? For Goal 1, Item 2, and the percentage of employees trained by Risk Management annually.

MR. WONG: Yeah, if I may, Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Wong?

MR. WONG: So the actual trained as of FY '15 was 66 percent, and I believe the FY '16 estimate is to increase it by 10 percent.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. So not only 10 percent. Okay.

MR. WONG: Correct, so it would be 60 or 76 percent.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay, total.

MR. WONG: So we'll continue to provide the training that we do going forward, but we're trying to get to 100 percent sooner than later.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Very good. And then down to Item 3 then, and in return, it should reduce the workmen's comp frequency --

MR. WONG: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --obviously. I mean that's the end goal to training properly ahead of time. And that one looks like 19 percent, and you just want to increase the frequency by 3.

MR. WONG: Correct. So the overall number of claims that we have, we want to decrease that overall amount by 3 percent per year.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: I notice on the listing that we get in breaking down all the different departments, there were certain departments that historically have the higher rates. Obviously they're more physical as in Police, I guess Water Department, Public Works is in there, Department...DEM is in there. So I guess targeting possibly those higher-risk departments first or, you know, the reoccurring habitual type of things

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

that keep occurring you're going to I guess address those first and foremost most likely.

MR. WONG: Chair, if I may? It depends on the mechanism of injury and the severity of the injury. There are times when because of the severity of the injury, we in Risk Management want to immediately address and correct any changes. For example, if an employee and this has happened, if an employee falls from an elevated height, the first thing we check is whether or not the tie-off procedures were implemented. Our Risk Department does work with all the contractors and all the employees on their risk plans. So before anybody can...at least from our vantage point, before anybody starts on a project, we make sure that they have the safety plan in place first. We require that even of subcontractors that are engaged by the departments. Some of the subcontractors are not happy when we're there telling them that they're required to have their safety plan in place before they can mobilize. And we've had disputes with them but they have complied, and the purpose of that is preventative maintenance. In the event an accident does occur, we do have somebody onsite right away to document how the incident occurred and also to evaluate corrective measures. If for example a sidewalk needs to be corrected, we make sure that it's not only coned off immediately, but we also make sure that it's physically corrected in a short period of time so that it will not have another reoccurring injury in the same location.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Very good. Well, thank you very much for that. And yeah, that's all I have for now, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: I'm kind of intrigued by the goals. On page, bottom of Page 128 and the top of 129, there's goals related to reducing the time spent in meetings, and I'm real curious about how we're going to do this. It seems we have more meetings than we had before, so I'm just kind of curious.

MR. WONG: Well, one of my...

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: And longer ones.

MR. WONG: Thank you, Chair. Well, one of my thoughts is obviously this proceeding is being viewed and televised, and our deputies are able to have access to it on their computers. Some of us are able to see it on the television in the breakroom. And my suggestion is...and we've addressed it depending on what is the need of a particular board or commission and what's on their agenda. So one of the methods that we've employed is if you don't really need an attorney sitting here, well, that attorney can certainly view this proceeding while sitting at their desk typing on something else, so multitasking. The other one is there are circumstances where an agenda item or an agenda from a particular board or commission doesn't have any action items, and in those scenarios, I've suggested for the Department or the board that maybe the attorney can be on-call by phone rather than going to the event. And we've done that such that the attorney is available by phone and the board or commission does not

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

need an attorney sitting there. And in those circumstances there really hasn't been any need for the attorney to get a call. So the attorneys will...especially from the Counseling and Drafting Division will look at the agenda and prep in advance of the meeting, and if they discern that there's no action items, that Deputy will either ask me or Ed to consider whether or not they need not attend the meeting but allow the chair of that meeting to have their cell phone to call them, and we've done that. So I think that makes that Deputy a little bit more efficient with their time and they can work on things that need to get, that have shorter deadlines that need to get addressed.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Thank you. That makes perfect sense to me. You know in today's world, thank God communication is so much better.

MR. WONG: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. Carroll, questions? Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Thank you, Chair. On Page 130, Goal No. 6. I know we've discussed this before, but it looks as though you're trying to get the revolving fund structure ensuing after this fiscal year or this fiscal year. Can you refresh my memory? I forget how this whole incentive program works.

MR. WONG: Sure. Thank you, Chair. That's been an ongoing discussion that I've been having with our Budget Chair on how to implement such a revolving fund structure such that we can use the funds towards our operations and not all the money comes out of our General Fund. Examples are where the, our Department does one of, one or two things. One, either we file a lawsuit on behalf of the County or a County entity, and we secure recovery of fines, penalties or some type of judgment, and we are able to collect on it and bring the money in. In Fiscal Year '16, we've had active litigation where we have recovered monies. Those monies get automatically deposited into the General Fund. There's other areas that we have identified as potential areas where we can recover money, and those monies again get deposited into the General Fund. What I've suggested to our Budget Chair a few years ago, was...and I don't know if it was communicated to this body at all, was that I'd be willing to not receive any General Fund money, but let us as the attorneys take a percentage of whatever we get and bill an hourly rate for the times that the deputies are engaged. With that said, the Budget Director laughed at me and said that he didn't think it was prudent, because...I think and it's just my own personal opinion that with the amount of attorney time that's used to operate this governmental entity, it would be a huge attorney fee bill I think in excess of what the General Fund currently pays. But with that said, I did identify possible mechanisms where the legal department could pursue funds. For example, putting on legal seminars and having the attorneys in our Department present at these seminars and have the general public attend for a fee. That money has to go somewhere, and so part of my concept would be if we were able to develop a revolving fund, we would use that to deposit the monies and use that

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

monies to address some of the expenses that we currently incur rather than having all that money come out of General Fund. So that's my thoughts.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Good.

MR. WONG: We haven't implemented 'cause the Budget Director and I haven't had the opportunity to agree on whether or not some of those things can be done.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: On...I don't know if you can mention this in open session. How much have we I guess recovered in the last year, like 2015? Are you able to say on open session?

MR. WONG: I don't have a grand total --

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay.

MR. WONG: --but I can tell you it's in excess of high six figures.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay. But we've paid out more than that . . .*(inaudible)* . . . Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. I can tell you Mr. Wong proposes an intriguing scenario, so, you know, maybe it's for another meeting, we can, the right committee can discuss it, whether it be Policy Committee, Committee of the Whole, or this Committee. Various counties have taken various options to address how to deal with Corporation Counsel. Some are even elected. So we can continue that discussion. Mr. Carroll, questions for Mr. Wong or Mr. Kushi? Okay. Ms. Baisa, additional...

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. And I guess I'm still stuck on the whole risk management type section. But I think if any of this pertains to within departments and their calls on how they manage I guess say Parks for instance in...and this is just a reoccurring thing that bugs me every day I drive by this particular park and there's certain types of trees being grown which I know firsthand 'cause I saw it happen, toppled over onto a truck, crashed in its front windshield. This was before I was a Councilmember. Knowing that I'm sure County in the end paid for this person's...that tree is growing again so I'm just like can you please cut the tree down so this doesn't reoccur 'cause I've already seen it happen. So I'm looking at things of that nature. How are departments being taught to be proactive in a sense, you know, cutting away shrubbery around a blind curve or intersection or whatever to prevent reoccurring accidents and things that put us into, you know, litigative matters.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Before Mr. Wong shares his thoughts, I can tell you that within this Committee under Budget and Finance 1, one of the 7 bills for an ordinance that were transmitted by the Mayor is a proposal from the Administration regarding the Arborist. So I would recommend if you have an opportunity to please review the Mayor's proposal, 'cause it is your Chair's understanding that under State law the Arborist basically has one responsibility and that is exceptional trees. Okay. That is by State statute as I understand the law currently. The Mayor has a proposal for us for consideration, and I believe Parks will be relieved of some responsibilities, I'm not sure the total scope, and my understanding is that Public Works will assume some potential responsibility depending on the action of the Council on the final disposition of the Mayor's proposal. But you may want to look at that. I'll let Mr. Wong give you his comments, but then when Public Works and Parks come up, you may want to ask questions pertinent to this issue as it regards to the Arborist position.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah, very good. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Wong?

MR. WONG: Chair, if I may? As it relates to particular trees, you know, we at, from the risk management standpoint, we don't necessarily do an inventory of all potentially, you know, trees that could potentially provide a hazard.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah. And sorry, not to...I wasn't just speaking just in relation to trees itself.

MR. WONG: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: It was just an example --

MR. WONG: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --of a situation. So could be, you know, this hole that's, the manhole gets uncovered all the time for some reason. I mean just, that was just an example so I wasn't trying to hone in on just trees in general.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: But, you know, okay.

MR. WONG: So if I may, I'll try to address it this way then. As it relates to departments and their exercise of their roles and responsibilities, I do know that every department has a component of risk management. Some have safety officers in their department, and they're charged with the responsibility of following up on items like that. When our Department becomes aware of a potential hazard, we, again we dispatch immediately to investigate that hazard. If we discern that it is a hazard within the County right-of-way or within a County property, we take steps to protect the public against it, to warn against it, and to also to cure it. The issue of falling trees, that's just one

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

component of Parks and/or Public Works. It has happened in the past. A very recent incident occurred where we, the Department, our Department got involved, we became aware of a hazardous tree and we instructed the various departments to remove it, and we've done that. Where the hazard exists and we need to remove that hazard and we've taken those steps to remove it. We don't necessarily go looking for hazards that are out there, but once we become aware that one may exist, we immediately take steps to rectify it. I can tell you also that, you know, I only have a few safety officers that are dispatchers, only three, and yeah, we cannot certainly, you know, scour the entire County, so we rely upon the other departments to also keep us informed. I do know that we get calls from the other departments asking for assistance, and they do know that when a risk does arise, that they can certainly turn to our Department and we will respond immediately. Okay?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah. And thank you. Yeah. That answers my question. Thank you. And I'm looking, your Safety Specialist is that who you're, in referencing the people who carry through these duties?

MR. WONG: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And you're subtracting one?

MR. WONG: No.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh. There's...

CHAIR HOKAMA: We're going to deal with expansion and --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --adjustments --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --further down the review --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --Ms. Cochran.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah, I'm good. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Ms. Baisa answered one of my questions. I think that's, that answer also answers another, on another item I had. Okay, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Ms. Crivello?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: I don't have anything.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you, Chair. On Page 129 there's a Goal No. 3, Item 2. There's a note that in Fiscal Year 2015, we had 378 litigation items, and in 2016, it's estimated that we'll, that'll be narrowed down to 350. And there's a, as a percentage of items closed, there's a 20 percent rate in 2015 and a 2 percent rate in 2016. I'm just wondering is that a typo or is that how many we've actually settled? Because it seems like we've worked through more than that.

MR. WONG: That might be a --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Wong?

MR. WONG: --typo. I'm not sure that it's only 2 percent of all claims in fiscal year, to date in Fiscal Year 2016. I'd have to check that and get back to you. It might be a typographical error.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: It's not a huge thing, it just kind of jumped out at me. And that was all I had. Thanks, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Mr. Guzman, any questions on goals and objectives?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: No questions. But yeah, the 2 percent doesn't seem right, because COW's been working pretty tough these last...but yeah. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Additional questions, Members, on goals and objectives? If not, I'm going to ask Mr. Wong and Mr. Kushi to move forward and discuss the adjustments and the expansion requests that he's going to put forth for his Department.

MR. WONG: So the first one I wanted to address is the Safety Specialist position. Well, that's not up there on the expansion, but...

CHAIR HOKAMA: It's an adjustment so you can speak, please speak, you can also speak about the Law Specialist, Control Specialist.

MR. WONG: Okay. As is it relates to the Safety Specialist III, it's just a reallocation from the position from the Safety Specialist II to a Safety Specialist III. The individual in that position as a Safety II is currently and has been doing for the last several years the duties of the Safety III, and that individual I believe is integral to our safety operations. And so it's not so much a reallocation, but I think it's a recognition of what that individual currently does. He has the certifications and he has the capacity to perform at the Safety III position which he's been doing already, and all we're doing is now compensating him for the work he's already been doing.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Any questions, Members, on, as it regards to this position? Mr. Guzman, you have a question on this...

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Just briefly, Mr. Wong. A Safety Specialist is, what are the duties?

MR. WONG: I don't have the position descriptions in front of me, but I have currently three Safety Specialists and they handle anything anywhere from training on safety issues to responding to HIOSH complaints, and right now we have had active HIOSH issues that needed to be dealt with. And so not all the Safety Specialists in the Department have the capacity to do it, and so we dispatch the one that has that capacity to be able to address the concerns, alleviate the concerns, and close the matter.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Questions on the specialist position, Members? Okay. If not, let us move on and ask Mr. Wong regarding the Law Clerk III expansion position please.

MR. WONG: Sure. So the Law Clerk III, we currently have a Law Clerk III position that just recently became vacant, and I'm in the process of filling it. That person provides our receptionist services and support services that is not of the same level as a Law Tech I or a Law Tech II. And our anticipation is because we have a lot of scanning that we need to do and a lot of intake work that another law clerk...excuse me, a Legal Clerk III position would be beneficial for our Department, and it would free up some of the work from the Law Tech positions. The Law Tech positions support the attorneys directly in providing clerical support. The Law Tech II position is the supervisors that they also provide support work to the attorneys. The law clerk, the Legal Clerk position doesn't provide direct support to an attorney. They provide interoffice support and do the day-to-day things that we would prefer to have a Legal Clerk perform than a Law Tech perform, bringing in the mail, making sure that the documents are properly inputted, making sure that the assignments are properly received. So they're functional items that the law...Legal Clerk is able to do, and we believe and I'm anticipating that in the next year or so, we're going to need another person there simply because we have a lot of offsite documents that need to be scanned into our system. And so I would prefer to have a lower level tech than a Law Tech position doing that type of work.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

MR. WONG: Yeah. And it should correspondingly address the overtime and the premium pay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for that.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Chair?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Thank you. So, Mr. Wong, we had Finance Department here I believe the other day, and they were talking about document retention policy and they were requesting an additional clerk. And I believe Mr. Ueoka mentioned that to hold off on that discussion, because you, I guess apparently in your budget you had added a clerk. Is that something that...no? I misspoke. Is it reference to this? I mean scanning and...no?

MR. WONG: No.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay.

MR. WONG: I can explain.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay, yes, if you could.

MR. WONG: If you want to have an understanding of why I believe Finance has requested as it relates to document retention, a couple of years ago, one of the things that we took on was to look at our document retention policy Countywide. There is a group that was formed to look at the current policies, to review whether or not it should be changed in any way. And part of the trigger for that has been our responses to the voluminous requests for documents that we get on a regular basis but also litigated cases that require us to immediately hold documents once we are aware that litigation is pending. And in order for us to properly exercise our responsibility to defend ourselves in litigation, we need to make sure that when we anticipate litigation, we secure documents. And one of the things as part of that evaluation is whether or not the departments are complying with their document retention and document destruction policy. And the answer is for the most part yes, that the departments...every department has different types of documents, and everyone has different types of retention for different documents. Some are governed by State law, some is governed by our Code, and some is governed by our Charter. And I believe Finance Department may be anticipating that they have the need for a documents clerk in order to properly identify which ones are up for destruction, which ones are to be perpetually maintained, and how to do it. So that concept is a notion that I have spoken to all departments about, so all departments are looking at their documents, their policies in place to make sure that they have the correct policies, it's still timely. And if there needs to be changes, then they're working with our Department to determine which changes are to be made. So I'm, I wasn't aware that Finance was going to ask for a position. I did personally inform all the departments that I would be looking to the departments at some point this year to identify for us who would be their documents person. And some departments have multiple divisions, and so those departments would more than likely have different people in different divisions.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay.

MR. WONG: Okay.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Yeah, thank you for that clarification, because I believe it was Mr. Walker that mentioned the Corporation Counsel or something like that that he needed to get this additional clerk for document retention. And then there was a discussion with, you know, the County Clerk's record, you know, custodian records, authorization, and jurisdiction, so it makes it more clear. Thank you.

MR. WONG: Sure, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Just a question. I don't see a position Legal Clerk I or Legal Clerk II. Do those exist and what would the, would there be limitations on their activities if we were to provide it as a Legal Clerk I or II instead of a III?

MR. WONG: Yeah, there are those positions, I, II and III. We probably could use a Legal Clerk II rather than a III, but with the Legal Clerk III, we could ask that individual to do additional things that we could not of a Legal Clerk II. And so I wanted to stick with the Legal Clerk III, because I felt that there was more things that that individual could do as we moved forward to assist the attorneys and to assist in the operations rather than being limited to the Legal Clerk I and II positions.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Do you have a sense of what the difference is in the pay scale?

MR. WONG: It depends. For example...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: I know it depends on the steps --

MR. WONG: Correct.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --they're at. But if, for the equal step do you know what the differential is?

MR. WONG: It's anywhere between 8,000 to 12,000.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: So going back to I guess what you define as the step changes. I notice you do have on the Details, Page 2-3, you have a Legal Clerk III though the step is an SR-14E, and then this requested position is a Legal Clerk III but an SR-14. Will the legal...should this position be filled, will that eventually reach the step of SR-14E, and what is the difference with the Legal Clerk III that's on Page 2-3 cannot...or do they, does that individual already do scanning so you need additional help for the scanning?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. WONG: Yes. The current Legal Clerk III position that I currently have, that individual just retired.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Oh.

MR. WONG: She made her beautiful age of 70 and told me that she wanted to retire.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay.

MR. WONG: And I tried to stop her from doing that, because she was valued in my Department, but we currently are going to fill that position. That person currently operates the reception area, takes in all the calls, directs the calls, picks up and delivers the mail, inserts the mail. Every time a new request for legal services comes in, that person does the intake for that and then dispatches it to the Law Tech support. They also, she also does scanning. They also...I mean she does...they do a lot of work.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. No, I believe that the clerks are underestimated sometimes, not appreciated enough. But sounds like you appreciate your clerks.

MR. WONG: I absolutely appreciate --

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Yeah, okay.

MR. WONG: --my clerks.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Yeah, thank you. I was just wondering because now that she's retired, then you're, it's just going to be an internal move but this expansion position will be a new hire?

MR. WONG: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. White, any questions?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: I thought you were going the other way.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I'm sorry. I guess I'm having an aversion. Mr. Couch, question, sir?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: No, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran? Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No thanks.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Carroll, sir, questions? Okay, let us go to your request regarding additional deputies please, Mr. Wong.

MR. WONG: Sure. Well, I know last year, I proposed three additional deputies and that went nowhere. This year, I'm back proposing again three more deputies, and let me offer this. I did do an interoffice, a department-wide meeting. I did ask the clerical staff and I did ask separately the deputies to show me by raise of hand whether or not we needed additional support. So for the clerical staff, I did engage the staff, and for the attorneys, I had all of them in the same room and I said if we were given an option would the attorneys believe we need more support staff or more attorneys? And when I said support staff, none of the attorneys raised their hand. When I said more attorneys, everybody raised their hand. And then I went through with them collectively on their workload, and then we broke up into our two counseling and drafting team and our litigation team and went through their workload as I normally do anyway. I also receive from them bi-weekly reports on everything that they do, and that is transmitted to, that I transmit to the Managing Director and the Mayor so they have an understanding of what the legal department is involved in. The Litigation Division has expressed a need for additional attorney support, because we, for some reason we do have a lot of litigated matters that come in. We're at a point right now that I think one of the points that I typically ask the deputies is if your workload is at or about your eyeballs and you can still function, then I'm fine with that, but once you start bobbing below the water and it's incumbent upon you as a Deputy to tell me that you're becoming overwhelmed. And we have, for the last two years, we have been one Deputy short. We're all aware of, you know, his efforts to return. The other deputies have picked up the workload. And I think we're reaching that, at least for a few of 'em, the risk of burnout, and I don't want that. So I asked for three and the reason I asked for three is I believe that I need one on, one for counseling and drafting, one for litigation, and believe it or not, I do need...I've been handling all of the risk management responsibilities with my Risk Manager, but I think I need a Deputy to shoulder some of the risk management issues also. With that said, if you're inclined to provide me with any of the three, one, three, or none, I'd like to get an indication of that. I can certainly formulate the three to be task oriented, for example, to address some of the concerns that Councilmember Couch raised and dispatch the three to focus on items like investigating whether or not TVRs are improperly operating. You know I can do that quicker with three attorneys than not. The backlog is there, you know, we'll try to work within the confines of what we have, but I think that even though I believe our deputies can do more and I personally believe that we can continue to work as hard as we do and even harder, I'm hearing the voices other than mine saying that we need more live bodies, we need more help because we do have a lot of work. And they may, you may not believe it, but I am quite the taskmaster because I'm telling them I still think that they can do more work. One measurement of how I've kind of gauged where the attorneys are at, I think you work long hours and you're here late at night. I think at any given time, there's attorneys in my office still working long hours and on weekends, and that's par for the course I think for the legal field. We do those things because that's our job. I think we can use more help. I think we have enough work to keep three more people busy. I also think that we sometimes take for granted that the attorneys are going to be there. One of the topics

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

of and I had this discussion with Mr. Ueoka early on and that was do I pay overtime, and the answer is no. You can certainly request it but good luck. In my view, they're salaried employees just like I am, and whether we work 40 hours a week or 80 hours a week, it's the same salary. The job dictates the hours. So if you're not done with your job and it's due, then you better perform and get it done. That's my philosophy. I walk it because I'm there on the weekends and at night too, they know it. And so I think it's a good working relationship. I think the deputies perform at a higher level, and I think that the more we add to our team, the stronger the legal department is and the greater support we can provide for your and the Administration. So those are the reasons why I think three additional attorneys would be beneficial for our Department. If you feel that less than that is entitled, then I'll take what we can get.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Wong. We appreciate your candid comments regarding your operations, your philosophy to work assignment, expectations of productivity. We appreciate that. You know I've been around long enough that, you know, this is like the chicken and the egg, you need more attorneys, then eventually because you get more attorneys, then you need...then support staff has more assignments so then they need more support staff because attorneys are cranking out the work. And then Mr. Wong has...but I can tell the environment of Corporation Counsel in my experiences and view were, watching even my my father and the Board of Supervisor days, has gotten more and more demanding, a lot more complex, a lot more sophisticated in the litigation and lawsuits against the County, and I can understand why Mr. Wong needs potentially some deputies in specialized areas. And part of my absence this morning was to deal with a new legal factor that we are going to have to deal with. And that's why I appreciated some of the comments regarding Deputy Corporation expansions is the role of the County's legal officers like Mr. Wong, such as Ms. Toda, Risk Manager, as Councilors, policy setters, and appropriators, the impact of cyber on this County. Now that covers a lot of parameter under the term cyber, but it can be a costly item to this County. It can be very damaging to our reputation. We have access to very critical confidential information of our residents, and eventually some of the legal responsibility falls on us and Mr. Wong and his deputies. And it is a field that is getting more specialized, underwriters are more intense in understanding what they will be insuring and paying off in claims and settlements. The sophistication of those that wish to do harm to this County through that area of cyber. So I just share that with you in that I am very open to Mr. Wong's request of expansion and not sold on the total request yet but I'm very open to it. But I would also ask him at this time before I ask the Members for their questions, Mr. Wong, that I may be a little bit more open to giving you some type of temporary funding to be able for, to assess the permanent expansion, especially if we feel there is a need for you to have certain people in a specialized subject matter area. You mentioned one possibly for Risk Management, and I would assume as part of Risk Management, you would have some component of the cyber subject within that bigger area of Risk Management for the County. Would that be a good understanding on the Committee's part?

MR. WONG: Yes, Chair.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: So I just share that with you that, you know, in my experience with Mr. Wong, he doesn't ask unless he feels he can justify it and defend it, so he's back again and he gave you his comments why he believes it is a valid request. And I will tell you that I am very open to this request. So questions from the Members? Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Oh, thank you, Chair. Just a quick update or question on Judge Cardoza's Environmental Court. Haven't seen any cases come down the pipe for Committee of the Whole. Anything...is there any action in there? Do we need another Deputy to cover that, those type of cases? What...haven't heard much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Wong?

MR. WONG: Chair? Thank you for that question, Member Guzman. You haven't heard much because the few matters that identified the County as a responsible were not litigated in that courtroom. The only matters that are currently pending in Judge Cardoza's environmental law courtroom, have been those as against HC&S for the smoke issues. And so I knock on wood and cross my fingers that we don't end up with increased litigation there. We do have matters although they were being handled by I believe Judge Cahill. Yeah.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. Carroll, questions on this matter? Ms. Baisa, on expansion?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No, but I certainly admire Mr. Wong's persistence, because, you know, he keeps coming back, and my motto is if you don't ask, you don't get, so he's got that down. But I think we should consider it, it certainly is beginning to make sense. You know this County has grown so much and we're in such a litigious society today. It's not like when you and I were young, Chair, you know, nobody used to sue. I mean you just never heard of it, but today everybody sues everybody for everything. And his Department has a tremendous load that we didn't have before, so I kind of understand where he's going. So maybe if we can't give him all, we can give him some. Thanks.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, thank you. And again, before I ask Ms. Cochran, I appreciate Council recommending going to court and litigating when we feel it is to the County's best interest to litigate and not settle. Because I went through an era of trying to always settle, and we seem to be gotten more and more sued. Since we've battled back on grounds we felt were justifiable and the court's decision ruled in favor of the County, I think people then took a different perspective on just filing claims and lawsuits against this County. Ms. Cochran?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah, thank you, Chair. No, I don't have any questions at this time. But yeah, appreciate the explanations for the expansions. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. And I do echo Ms. Baisa's comments that, admire his persistence, but it is a different time so I think there is, I could support his request. It, they do a pretty good job there. I'm really impressed with everybody I see there. One thing is that if Mr. Ueoka would ever leave, we'd have to replace him with two people so.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Was that a compliment?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Oh my gosh.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Oh my gosh.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: I'm going to faint.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We might need a recess. Ms. Crivello, questions?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: I agree with what he said. I'm good, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, you know, I agree with Ms. Baisa's thing, if, you know her mother's saying if you don't ask, you don't get, but I remember asking my parents for a whole lot of things and never getting any of them. So just to, you know, because this is the Budget Committee, I just want to point out that 3 deputies would cost us at today's rate with the benefit load, \$628,000.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I understand.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And that's the equivalent of all the taxes from 837 households in Maui, the average in the Homeowner category. So, you know, I agree they do a good job. If you were to ask probably any department, raise your hand if you think you guys need more help, I think you're going to find people raising their hand in most departments. That doesn't mean they can't keep going at the level they're going and do, you know, and do a good job for the County. So I'm not sold on the number. I think, you know, there's probably some justification for some adjustments, but I'm not quite there yet. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, thank you very much. Again, you know I always say there's more than one way to skin that cat. So I will be in discussions with people such as Mr. Wong, sharing some ideas on how we may approach it then from the straightforward budgetary format that is what we have before us. Because I'm open and I'm sure Mr. Wong is open to variations of how to still accomplish the goal

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

through different paths. So I am like some of you have shared, happy with the performance of this Department. I believe he has secured very good deputies. He's responded well to filling vacancies, and I think at this time you're pretty much full, right, Mr. Wong? You don't have any so-called official vacancies right?

MR. WONG: I, Chair, I have one Deputy vacancy that I've interviewed very qualified candidates for, and I have one law, Legal Clerk III given two retirements.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MR. WONG: Two recent retirements.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, well I think that's still reasonable because some other departments have quite sizeable vacancies as we bring them forward and the Committee will discuss. Any further questions, Members, to Mr. Wong, Mr. Kushi regarding the expansions? Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Oh, expansion.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Anything on the expansions at this time, Members? Okay, if there's not, are there questions in other areas of this Department that would like to be presented by the Members? Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Yeah. Thank you. As much as Mr. Couch likes Mr. Ueoka, I wanted to know how do you go about like assigning a Deputy to a certain committee? And I did have Mr. Ueoka on my EAR Committee which he did a very fine job, but I'm not very satisfied right now. So how do make that assignments?

CHAIR HOKAMA: In your response, Mr. Wong, if you feel this is something of a more specific personnel issue then I would ask that you talk with Mr. Guzman in a more secure environment, 'cause I'm not comfortable with dealing with personnel issues in open meeting because of privacy concerns and rights of employees.

MR. WONG: Sure.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So I'll leave that to you two learned legal people --

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Very good.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --to deal within the parameters that is within proper protocol.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: You know, Chair, that being said, I'll just withdraw that question. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Any other questions, Members? And again though, I would still ask if you feel, please pursue with Mr. Wong.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you. And I want to thank Mr. Guzman for bringing up the point earlier about Environmental Court and you explaining we don't really technically have any items there at the time, at this time, but there are issues, items in another court with Judge Cahill or something or other. So those are technically environmental issues but because it started in that court it wouldn't go over into this Environmental Court? They have to work through whatever process at that court. Is that what's happening with those items I guess you mentioned?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Wong?

MR. WONG: Chair, my answer is kind of.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

MR. WONG: And kind of because the matters before Judge Cahill are on appeal to the ICA. And in the event they get remanded or sent back down to the Circuit Court, it depends on Judge Cardoza as the administrative judge to decide does this go into Environmental Court or does this go back to the court of original jurisdiction. So as we speak, I couldn't guess whether or not it would end up in one or the other. I do anticipate that there will be filings in the Environmental Law Court, it's just a matter of time. There's been hints in the community on a few things, and so I'm expecting that there's going to be a few matters before the Environmental Law Court that is presided over by Judge Cardoza.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay, thank you. And we have that expertise in our current deputies to address such matters in that particular type of court?

MR. WONG: Not necessarily. But I assure you that in the event we receive a complaint of that nature, we will have a Deputy assigned. It's just hard to anticipate --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Right.

MR. WONG: --what type of claims we're going to get.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. All right. Well, thank you very much. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Any other questions, Members, for Mr. Wong or Mr. Kushi on operations, ABC, adjustments, or expansion requests? If you do, please forward it to the Chair and Committee Staff, and we'll assist you in getting those responses for your areas of interest. If there are no further questions or comments, Mr. Wong, Mr. Kushi, we appreciate your time with us this afternoon. Any comments you wish to close with, Mr. Wong?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. WONG: I just want to thank the body and thank Mr. Couch for now making it unbearable for us to deal with Mr. Ueoka moving forward. Thank you very much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Couch, for that. Mr. Kushi, would you care to share any comments?

MR. KUSHI: Ditto.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Thank you. Well, we're not giving Mr. Ueoka a chance to comment. So we will be in recess 'til 3:15, whereby we will start the review of the Department of Fire and Public Safety. . . .(gavel). . .

RECESS: 3:02 p.m.
RECONVENE: 3:17 p.m.

CHAIR HOKAMA: . . .(gavel).we shall continue to do our requirements as assigned by the Charter. We're supposed to have Department of Fire and Public Safety here. If they don't show up in the next few minutes, the Chair and the Staff has a lot of things we are still needing to do. So I'm thinking of adjourning early. One thing I will tell you that I would like you to take a look at as far as all the new, additional departments as they come before use is when you look at the vacancies, especially when we know they are going to be recruiting, if I see a position with a step above the letter A, it's going to be adjusted back to letter A, because that's where the new employee is going to start. Not at L, not at M, not at G, they start at A, so the Chair's going to make those adjustments regardless of the departments' requests, and they're going to have to live with it in the A categories. 'Cause I don't appreciate them giving me a non-accurate number regarding A Account requirements. Okay. We have Chief with us for Fire Department. So, Chief, any opening comments you have regarding your Department for the budget at this time?

DEPARTMENT OF FIRE AND PUBLIC SAFETY

MR. MURRAY: Aloha, Budget Chair and Councilmembers. Good afternoon. Yes, I do. I would like to start off with our budget for Fiscal Year 2017 coincides with the two documents that I had sent up to you earlier a few months ago. One was our master strategic plan and also our annual report. So I hope you have those documents nearby, because we have a lot of measures within those two documents that can help us along. And as you know, we'll be asking for a few items, equipment as well as expansion positions, and I will field any questions that you may have with that as we move along. But at a glance, it should give you all of the performance measures and, within our programs that we have set before you for this budget season. Thank you very much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Members, we're going to do this like the other departments. Talk about operations, ABCs. If you have specific in A's, we can start off with the A's

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

adjustments and then we'll discuss expansion as the last component of the Department's review. So, Chief, currently under your current operations, how many vacancies do you have? And in what areas are they?

MR. MURRAY: Well off the top of my head, I don't have that document with me, I'm waiting for my business manager. But we have a Battalion Chief position, we have a warehouse specialist technician, we have an Office Ops II, we have several Fire Fighter positions open, I'm not sure of the count. I believe we are at roughly about 14.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. You will be able to give us the breakdown whether they're Fire Fighters I, II, III?

MR. MURRAY: Yes. We just got the report sent to us today so my Business Administrator is coming up with that information now.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: In fact let me pull it up, I might have it here. Thank you for your patience.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: While Chief is looking up his information, in his opening comments in regards to hope you have those documents with you. What, is that like your annual, the booklet, your yearend book? Or 'cause I'm trying to...

MR. MURRAY: The yearend booklet we had, it's called the annual report and that had all of our performance measures and our accomplishments and achievements during the year 2014 to '15. And you can see some of the progression. And then also I had this document here which is called the Master Strategic Plan that I had sent transmittal-wise through the Mayor's Office to you folks. And this is, we have done a strategic plan within our Department since 2001, and this is the most recent revision that we have done, and this follows the steps and guidelines by accreditation. So we have it aligned within that as well. So just in case you have some of that, I might be able to allow some, you know, questions and information that we have documented --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: --on that.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chief, for that...I just wanted to know documents 'cause --

CHAIR HOKAMA: That's fine.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --to go find them. Thank you.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: That was a good question. Okay, Chief, if you can get your business manager up to speed so she can respond to the questions regarding the vacancies in the areas.

MR. MURRAY: All right. She's getting that right now. I am unable to pull it up on my computer for some strange reason. All right, here we go. The vacancy report, we have Department Personnel Clerk and that was an opening due to a promotion; Purchasing Technician which is the warehouse person due to resignation; Office Ops II which is in our mechanic shop which was due to an internal transfer; a Battalion Chief which is due to a retirement at the end of the year. And we have two as of tomorrow, Battalion Chiefs that have retired, and we actually have Chief Romero here. He's retiring officially today is his last day after 25 years of service so.

...*(applauding)*...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Pretty young there, Chief. Congratulations, Chief.

MR. ROMERO: Thank you, sir.

MR. MURRAY: We have 5 Captain vacancies. We have 7 Fire Fighter III vacancies and 14 Fire Fighter I vacancies. So we are in the process of interviewing and selecting for the Office Ops Assistant II, Purchasing Technician, and 2 Battalion Chiefs. So how that works is we have to fill the Battalion Chief positions first and then fill in from beneath that, so we'll go Captain and Fire Fighter III and so on and so forth.

CHAIR HOKAMA: When is your schedule for your next recruit class please?

MR. MURRAY: Well, we are in, working right now to make that happen, and the reason why we haven't started one yet is that there was a process change in the Department of Personnel Services on our physical agility test. And so that held up the hiring from, that we wanted to do in January due to retirements and what have you. So our slated date now is for July 1st.

CHAIR HOKAMA: You have a sense of how big your recruit class you anticipate, Chief?

MR. MURRAY: We anticipate hiring for all the openings that we have anticipated which at this point would be at least about 17. And then we have 2 possible retirements before July 1st, so we would consider that as well.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Very good. Are there any specific districts or stations that are impacted because of the vacancies that we need to be aware of from an operational standpoint.

MR. MURRAY: From an operational standpoint, we have people that want to transfer from either Molokai or Lanai to Maui, but we right now are holding off until we can fill those positions, because it would be quite costly for us to do the fill-ins for those areas

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

because of the remoteness. So we have it spread out throughout the Department, evenly per shift as well so that we don't have this extra shortages which every day is a challenge for us on, even if we're full. So we're trying to get that out before the end of the year, that class.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Well, we do know you have your daily challenges, Chief, so we appreciate your comments. Members, for your information, 'cause I thought Ms. Cochran asked a great, the right question, this Committee is not in charge or has jurisdiction over the Master Strategic Plan that the Chief has mentioned. That was referred to Policy Committee. So I have no control over that document at this time. We would need to work with Mr. Victorino.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. I do recall I thought looking at it, so I was just trying to dredge that --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. It's in --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --up.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --another Committee's responsibility.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: So it wasn't here...okay. Okay. Very good, thank you. But I guess in assisting Department to carry out the plan, the budgetary cost comes via this --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Understood.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --Committee.

MR. MURRAY: Right. And --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And that would be the relationship.

MR. MURRAY: --I wanted that to be sent to you folks. I believe we sent it about five weeks ago so that you could have some time to peruse it, because then you can see the alignment between the budget, the accreditation, and the strategic plan. So I wanted the body as well as the people to know that there's a lot of thought that goes into our future decisions, and the building blocks per se for items, equipment, personnel, positions, all of those things, how they make sense. So I was hoping that, you know, there'd be an opportunity to take a look at that and if you had any questions, I'd be happy.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: Or if we can do it in Policy Committee, whichever way it'll work. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Thank you.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: And, you know, sorry, Chief, that's the, a disconnect on our side, because we will deal with the financial requests, allocations, and final appropriation approvals. And maybe that's something we can work with Chairman White to get referrals better assigned so that it makes sense when we do things such as budget review processes that we have the appropriate documents to assist all of us in making good decisions. So I will work with Chair White, 'cause I'm sure some other committees may have things that needs to be adjusted for their needs also besides our needs here. Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: What was the other document that he said?

MR. MURRAY: Our annual report.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: The annual report.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, sir.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Probably a little bit more germane to this. Is, was that given to another committee as well or?

CHAIR HOKAMA: I think that was just a document of information that we get from departments that are required to send reports to the body. But I don't think it's been assigned to this Committee, not the annual report.

MR. MURRAY: If I may, Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, mister...Chief?

MR. MURRAY: By Charter, we are required to send an annual report to Administration, so for us to maintain the transparency between our Department, we always have transmittals for everything that we send to them that can be shared with you, and we try to send up 9 of those copies or actually 11 of them. So it's just so that you understand that we've done our process of really looking into what our needs are, what our goals are, and how we're going to achieve that, and really know that there's a lot of work and thoughts that have gone into this process. And this is not just started this year, this is something that we've been working on for eight years now. So every step that we move forward makes a big difference in this process and in goals. So thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: What we can do, Mr. Couch, 'cause my sense is...and first I want to thank all of you as standing Committee Chairs of specific subject matter of doing the pre-budget meetings regarding your areas of jurisdiction. I think maybe one of the things we can work with Chair White is working with the various departments that for documents such as that annual report, if they can submit it by a certain point in time to our calendar, then you as Committee Chairs will have sufficient time to do that pre-budget review so that when we enter this process, the Committee has already had

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

a sense of what the departments will be talking about. And then for like Fire, Mr. Victorino should be the one as the subject matter Chair to be able to give us comment since it was under his jurisdiction. It was Planning Department's annual report, then we would look at you. If it was Water, we'd look at Ms. Baisa. But that may be something we can work on when they submit that report to give you ample time for do your Committee responsibilities. So I'll work with Chair White on that.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: So the question I guess I have is, is that report germane to the discussion you're going to have today? It talks about some of the things you want to talk today? Or can you just highlight when necessary saying this is in our annual report? Because generally when something comes from a department, it goes to Chair White and it gets distributed to the proper committee, so.

MR. MURRAY: Absolutely. If you can take a look at the at-a-glance, the first page, or actually 251 of our, right below our mission statement. Everything that is here is also in those two documents in different areas.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Well, Mr. Victorino is not here so we will go down the line and I will ask the Members if they have questions under Operations and anything under Category A, Wages and Salaries, Members? Mr. Guzman, you have any questions at this time?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Not at this time. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, one of the questions that comes to mind with the vacancies is the degree to which that has affected our need to employ the rank-for-rank recall elements of the contract. Do you have the rank-for-rank costs broken out?

MR. MURRAY: We can get that to you, Chair. One of the things, the rank-for-rank doesn't include vacant positions. It has to have a person that is assigned to that, so if it's vacant, rank-for-rank doesn't account for that. But if we're short, then a callback for manpower overtime will go into that category, so that gets split up.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Just so I understand it, if for instance you have a, after today you'll have a vacancy in the Battalion Chief, so that can be filled by any Captain as a temporary transfer?

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. So it's just if there's, if it's a sick or vacation --

MR. MURRAY: Right.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --the rank-for-rank...

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: It has to be for a leave.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, thank you.

MR. MURRAY: So if an individual is not assigned to that position, rank-for-rank doesn't, is not permitted for that position. Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And, Chair, I don't know, are you, is it open for discussion with respect to the expansion positions, or are you, were you just wanting to focus on existing positions?

CHAIR HOKAMA: I just want to at this point in time, focus on existing 'cause I know we're going to have some healthy discussion on expansion. But I'd like to get through the original operational requests and existing compared to the '16 Budget first, before we look at the '17 expansions.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. That's the only question I have right now.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Crivello, questions?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Not right now. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Before I recognize Mr. Couch, I want to thank the Staff and your offices, Members, we have been able to secure the strategic plan from the other Committee's binders. And so Staff has, will be distributing to you your copy of your plan from Policy. So thank you for your staffs' assistance. Mr. Couch, questions for Chief Murray?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Mine are going to be on goals and objectives at this point. Are you there yet or is that in combination?

CHAIR HOKAMA: I just want to deal with the financing of the ABs.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: No, I'm good. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: ABCs. Okay. Ms. Cochran?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. And the accreditation I guess it's still ongoing and you've, it looks like coordinate, you're looking for Accreditation Manager. Did we not start the funding on that yet? Or no, you keep asking and we...

MR. MURRAY: We keep asking. This I believe is probably our seventh year now. We are in the process. We actually have a deadline of 6:00 p.m. tonight to finish uploading all of our documents and then we will be totally entered into that process, and it will take approximately four-and-a-half more months to find out if we actually have, we achieved it. So how we have gone about that is our Assistant Chief Val Martin has been in charge of that, along with 49 other people that we have tasked on small parts and large parts of that to get done. And some of his duties have to have been put on a backburner because of this priority. So we are asking for a position for that, when we get across to that, and I'll explain that more in detail.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. That's fine. That was just one of my main questions, Chair. So I guess we'll talk in more detail in a bit. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: On expansions, yes. Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No, not at this point.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. Carroll, any questions on Operations? Mr. Guzman? Okay. One of the things, Chief, and maybe, Mr. Baz, in the future, one of the things that has helped me in our other life when we did our budgets was the projections of, from operating cost units for the balance of the remaining fiscal year and impact on the existing year's budget. And I would just then assume that it is part of the calculations to help present the 2017 proposed requested numbers. And I bring this up because I know one area that is of a big challenge to this Department and this Chief is the unanticipated incident callouts that impact premium pay. I mean, you know, the Chief doesn't say, you know, I expect one huge monster fire every month and it's going to cost us, you know, I mean we, I don't think he budgets that way at all so. But the Department responds when called upon. So sharing you some of my comments, Chief, and again I'm looking at your Premium Pay request from this year to next year and I ask you for some comments regarding this category. Because again I know you need to respond and lately it's been expensive for us to respond not only to fire but to ocean-related incidences. Can you give us some projections on how you're basing your overtime, impact of the vacancies on this overtime, and upon a ability to fill vacancies the net adjustment on the overtime? Can you give us some comments please, Chief?

MR. MURRAY: All right. Thank you for that question, Chair. As a whole, we try to look at the positions in certain steps and take an average across the board on historical data as well as projected data for overtime. We, historically we only asked for the coverage's of either that vacation with...it's not about the anticipated extra costs, we do the overtime for coverage of our personnel and that's for all positions. And then we also calculate training, we also calculate different hours of training for different aspects that we have to achieve for certifications and updates on that fiscal year as

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

best as possible. Along with that, we have other programs that are through the bargaining unit that we have to anticipate those hours, so those things are also calculated in. I really wish we had a process to look at what an average fire costs and X amount of personnel that we need to combat that. But we basically do it on historic numbers. And, you know, one of the things that works against us is that our training has changed, our tactics and strategies for combating fires has changed, not only structurally but wildland and brush, and all of those items we have changed so that we can be more efficient and lessen the load of overtime, and ultimately not subject our people to the safety and, the hazards of being in those environments. So but on the opposite end of that, the things that we don't control is the weather, the seasonal changes, the areas within our community that like for instance this last year of El Nino, we've had rains in areas that we normally don't and now the fuel loads are large. And then our other process of doing brush abatement starts to ramp up, and we've been trying to have that balance between the two and, you know, really hope for the best as we move forward. But as you know, our most recent large fire, over 6,000 acres was in the Kahikinui Hawaiian Homes District. That is, has continued for almost 2 months now, so for us to have that type of anticipation and looking at the resources because it's so far away and inaccessible because of the topography and the environment that we're in, sometimes causes us inability to have the proper amount of funding. So I'm not sure how we can find a formula to make that happen.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So, Chief, you know, this large incidence events that you had to respond to for public safety, none of it qualifies for any type of governmental reimbursement whether it be from FEMA, the Federal government, State of Hawaii, DLNR because it's their conservation land we're protecting? Is there any opportunities of the County to recapture some of its expenses it has put forward to battle these large incidents?

MR. MURRAY: Thank you, Chair, for that question. It's a very, very good question. The situation is that fire we weren't able to qualify for that FEMA grant that does allow repayment of the resources. We just didn't fit the threshold. There were other items in that area that we didn't qualify for so it takes us completely out of that. And this fire actually ran into State Forestry area, but they were on the ground with us a day and a half before it actually got to their property in anticipation to stop it for the indigenous plants and what have you. So there is some joint effort being done out there but not all the time the impacts have the parameters that we're able to reach for reimbursement so, but we did try.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. We appreciate the effort that is at least made, Chief. 'Cause who knows, they may say yes, we will give you some reimbursement support. So like my dear colleague from Upcountry says, if you don't ask, you don't get so it doesn't hurt to ask. Mr. Carroll, any questions for the Chief on this operational area or particularly under the overtime requirements of the Department? Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No, Chair, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No. Not at this time.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Not at this time. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: I'm good. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Guzman? Okay, thank you so much. Okay. Chief, the one that kind of catches me and I would ask if you could share some comments and maybe Mr. Baz can assist you, but under your B Account under Operations, I'm trying to get, maybe you're also trying to get a handle of this but can you give us some comment regarding the interfund reclassification numbers please? It's going from 8...round numbers from 90,000 to \$381,000. This is, on the narrative it's on Page 253, Chief, under Operations. It's that first line, interfund cost reclassification.

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Baz?

MR. BAZ: Those are for the grant revenue that's received from the Department. Those aren't funds that are going...they're going from grant revenue into the General Fund, that's why it's an interfund cost reclassification there.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. So the good news is the Department has been successful in securing basically almost another \$300,000 worth of grant funding. Is, that's how we should read it, Mr. Baz?

MR. BAZ: Out of the grant funding that they receive and I can get the total to you in a bit here, 3...\$291,000 is we're projecting coming, paying from those grant funds directly into the General Fund for cost reimbursement such as overhead allocation.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Okay. Understood. Materials and Supplies, Chief, this is more to what we give payment to what, some private property owners that allows us access to water resources or some type of access to incidents? Can you give us some sense of where this is going?

MR. MURRAY: All right, Chair, thank you. That specifically is for safety supplies, equipment.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. And so...

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair, are you looking at the Materials and Supplies object code on Page 253? The proposed...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Right now I'm just looking at the, you know, the lump sum, yeah.

MR. BAZ: Yeah, 1.9 million.

CHAIR HOKAMA: 'Cause it's about a 40 percent more increasing request, yeah.

MR. BAZ: Yeah. So as we get into the programs you'll see the detailed increases. This is just the Department summary --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, yeah, yeah.

MR. BAZ: --for the whole Department. Yeah and we can get into the different details. From my recollection, I think auto parts was a big one because they're not being able to replace their vehicles as quickly so the cost of auto supplies to repair their current vehicles went up.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. So, Mr. Baz, under Materials and Supplies, under Operations B Account, you know, and again I'm just going on the summary, we'll go through the cost centers by divisions. And then also but we have that Equipment under C Account, Machinery and Equipment, and that one is going to, also being bumped up.

MR. BAZ: Yeah. So yeah, the C Account, Lease Purchases is your copier leases, and Machinery and Equipment could be various vehicles or safety equipment, anything, you know, that reaches over that \$1,000 threshold or anything for computers.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Right. Okay.

MR. BAZ: So yeah, so on this summary page you'll see yeah, these large sum increases, and as we get into the detailed Program, we can go through and explain each one of those expansion areas as well as the changes in continuation.

CHAIR HOKAMA: That'll be fine, Mr. Baz and Chief. So let's go to Administration/Maintenance Program of the Department. That would start on 256, Members. And that would be part of 7-3 on the Details, Members. Chief, any comments you wish to share under this program area of Administration and Maintenance?

MR. MURRAY: All right.

CHAIR HOKAMA: And at this point, everything but expansion please.

MR. MURRAY: All right. Okay. That was my question. All right. On Page 258 on the lower section, the Continuation of Budget Changes, you have adjustments in salaries based

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

on collective bargaining increases and increases to the Secretary III for a full-year salary. You also have Miscellaneous Supplies. Okay. And that would be it. The only other thing would be the expansions.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Members, any questions under Administration in this program area at this time? This is the operational component of Admin and Maintenance. We'll talk about the four expansions after we go through all of the divisions on their current operational programs. Any questions on this area? Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Does that include Materials and Supplies? Or you're just looking for A Account?

CHAIR HOKAMA: You can go ABC under --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --current operations.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. I notice in, on Page 259, Materials and Supplies, Auto Parts, you're adding an extra 100,000.

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: And that's for, I mean that seems to be a pretty big jump.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah, I believe in the past, we have asked for that extra amount and we haven't gotten it, but we're trying to ramp up our services now because we finally filled the fourth mechanic. So, you know, prevention is the key to maintaining these high-cost items. So our program is, you know, up at least 20 percent.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Yeah, if we can do maintenance more than buying new vehicles, is this going to add a couple years to the life of the vehicle?

MR. MURRAY: It all depends on which vehicle it is, and I'll give more explanation as we move through those requests for those equipment and have some explanations for you, detailed.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay, thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Aloha, Chief, thank you for being here. So right off the bat, I look your Assistant Chief makes more than the Fire Chief and the Deputy Chiefs due to collective bargaining. Is that...

MR. MURRAY: Yes, and they also receive overtime when they are called back for large incidents and what have you.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay, okay. Interesting.

MR. MURRAY: I try not to look at that.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: So you also have...I'm not sure, okay, so we're going ABC. You have water delivery charges, is that used for fire hydrants? Is...

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Or during time of emergencies? Is that what that is for? Or is that on a regular basis?

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Baz?

MR. BAZ: Thank you. And, Member Crivello, yeah, the water delivery charges in the Administration Program pay for the Department of Water Supply to maintain the fire hydrants. Yeah, they go and flush them on a regular basis, especially the end-of-line ones to make sure that the water in there is still good.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Chair, another question --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Please.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: --regarding Detail Page 7-6. We have an increase of 96,000, I guess \$96,000 in Premium Pay, from 35,000 to 131,000. And this is based on Fiscal Year 2015 actuals. What was, do you have any expended amount for, so far for Fiscal '16?

MR. MURRAY: We're checking on that right now. Okay. As of February 29th, our actual is 109,811.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: I'm sorry, what was that again?

MR. MURRAY: One hundred nine thousand, eight hundred eleven as of March 31st.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chief.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No questions.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Carroll, questions? Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Not now.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. And the restoration of funding for shipping of the Weis Draft. We finally gave you money to purchase that item. Is that correct? We just recently did finally?

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And so now obviously you need to get it to where we bought it to be used.

MR. MURRAY: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Which are the outer, Lanai and Molokai?

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And that is 5,000 per shipping, like so each island? That's...

MR. MURRAY: No, that should be for on an annual basis.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, okay.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. All right. Very good. I'm happy that...I'm sure you're happy that you have that --

MR. MURRAY: Very happy.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --item finally.

MR. MURRAY: Very, very happy. Thank you so much because it allows our mechanics and fire staff to be in a safe environment to make sure that those pump tests get done. So thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And just trying to figure out what the...on Page 258 at the very bottom, the different R & M, Services and Contracts. These are ongoing leases and what have you for what in particular? Is that...it doesn't really break down what kind of services or contracts they are, there's just codes and numbers. And one's very reasonable at \$28.

MR. BAZ: Actually, Member Cochran, if you look at the bottom of Page 258 there, the last cell you're looking at, actually the budget was transferred from R & M - Services/Contracts to the copier leases and so those other items there.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, okay. So office type items?

MR. BAZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh okay, okay. All right. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Mr. Couch, any further questions? Thank you. Are there any other questions for ABC in Ops for Admin and Maintenance? Okay. Let's see, there is no...Chief, you can talk about the expansion in this program area.

MR. MURRAY: All right. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Oh wait, wait. Before we hit the expansion, my mistake, I know one area that Ms. Cochran always likes to go look at is goals and objectives. So any questions on goals and objectives for Administration/Maintenance division of the Fire Department? Two fifty-six. Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. On Goal and Objective No. 3, Page 257 at the top. You talk about be a leader in sustainable energy within the County of Maui. You are talking about number of projects completed relating to alternative energy and number of projects completed relating to energy use reduction. And in FY 2016 you estimated five for each of those, and then this year you're estimating one. Does that mean all your stations are done but the last one?

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Baz?

MR. BAZ: Thank you. Good question, Mr. Couch. So what the 16 goals had included was when our Energy Commissioner, prior Energy Commissioner who decided to leave us had been working on power purchase agreements and did utilize the, those, that type of installation of renewable energy sources at various fire stations and other County facilities. And so what they had been planning was for more of those to happen. And when we, as we proposed in 2016 Budget, but since we, that program is no longer being actively managed, we want to make sure that, you know, they have a goal that's achievable. So if we can one or two this year, it would be great.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. I thought we had another energy person as well. He's not doing that kind of work?

MR. BAZ: Yeah, Mr. Chair, when we bring up Department of Management, you can discuss what that energy specialist is doing, but his relation is more towards the regulatory requirements and some of the other activities that we're doing. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Crivello, any questions in this area?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: So as far as the...so did we reach the five projects, did we complete? Is it...in regards to that same goal that Mr. Couch asked. Are we...it says in 2016 estimate, are we just about completing the implementation of those projects using the alternative energy?

MR. MURRAY: Okay. This year, Member Crivello, we have not reached any of those.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Oh, or none, oh. Do we have intentions of completing it by June? I mean we have that, this estimate of five and then 2017, one, so.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah, I believe it's a funding issue.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: And we're trying to work with our energy person to see with the goals. We've done a lot of our stations already with grants that we had Federally, so those programs are done.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Any of the, any projects on Molokai or Lanai that was...

MR. MURRAY: Not for energy conservation.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah. Lanai is on the horizon. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: On Page 7-3 of the Details we have a Fire Services Officer position. My understanding is that's a, the person in that position is relatively new. Is that the, is that a salary that was assigned to that position for the prior incumbent or is that the, is that a new salary and how is it different from the previous incumbent?

MR. MURRAY: Mr. White, the, that position that you have there is FD-0292 on the bottom of the page?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Correct.

MR. MURRAY: Okay. That's the same person, no changes were made in that area.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: When did that person, when were they hired? This year?

MR. MURRAY: No. I believe a little over a year now.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Page 258, the Building Maintenance Repairer. Do you have enough repairs in a building to supplement this type of work? Or...

MR. MURRAY: We don't have any.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: You don't have any what?

MR. MURRAY: All of it. We don't have any building repairers in our Department.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Oh, so how...

MR. MURRAY: Everything gets contracted out.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Oh, contracted out.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: How much of it gets contracted out, what is the expense?

MR. MURRAY: I don't have the total cost but 100 percent of it is.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Oh, I'm just trying to see whether, you know, if the expense is...

MR. MURRAY: Right, the total cost.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Right.

MR. MURRAY: Got it.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Is going to --

MR. MURRAY: And that varies as well.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: --at least balance out the cost of the new hire.

MR. MURRAY: The person.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Right.

MR. MURRAY: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Right.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: Okay. We will work on that --

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: --'cause it's a multiple sub-object code so it's hard for us to track, but we'll get that to you.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So, Chief, you have no access to putting in a work order request to like Parks for a journeyman employee to do some specific type of work?

MR. MURRAY: Chair, thank you for that question. That practice has been stopped many years ago. I know we sent in a request about seven years ago, and there was I believe a little bit of help that we had in one of our stations and that was the last time that that happened.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. So, Mr. Baz, that, can you verify that that is what, that's an internal policy that there's no interdepartmental assistance if one department has the appropriate employee in the, a professional skill journeyman type of a plumber, a first-class carpenter, welder. Fire needs a plumbing team that takes the welder and the plumber, there's no interdepartmental --

MR. BAZ: Yeah, mister...

CHAIR HOKAMA: --use of those type of people?

MR. BAZ: Yeah, Mr. Chair, the short answer is yes, there is and there are ongoing instances where departments help each other out for different activities and functions. But there is no set, you know, I think the biggest problem is that we don't have a crew of workers sitting around waiting for calls for, from other departments. You know each one of the electricians in Wastewater or the carpenters in Parks or, you know, any of those type of specialized jobs, they're busy doing their work for their department. And for them to take time out to go and assist another department...on certain, you know, emergency cases that's okay, no problem, but as an ongoing policy that's not something that is currently active. You know the Mayor has mentioned, you know, during his consolidation of the baseyards, having specific crews like that that can go and fix all heavy equipment or that can go and fix all building issues and different things like that. But at this point, we haven't worked on that plan.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, well thank you for that. I guess we can, I can make more adjustments on the budget. Very good. Mr. Carroll, questions, sir? Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Nothing specific yet. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. I think if...I guess it must be in this budget somewhere for 200...or was spent, 200,000 for repainting of the Kahului building. And was, is that asking in this budget or was that done?

MR. MURRAY: We are asking.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, you are asking.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah, and that was a specific question we asked last year and we almost got it, but the actual, what was said was until that construction is done behind of our fire station, we're not going to give you that money, but just to let you know, it's completed.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Was the highway, the access road behind --

MR. MURRAY: No.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --which is now...

MR. MURRAY: Right. It was just because of construction and all the dust and what have you, you know, through --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Right.

MR. MURRAY: --those types of projects.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Right.

MR. MURRAY: So they were, they...this body felt that it would be beneficial to wait a year.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: This Building Maintenance Repairer type person would assist in something like this or this is strictly a contracted-out job?

MR. MURRAY: That would be all dependent. If there was areas where this individual could take care of prior to, I believe that would be a great project for that individual to be on prior to the painting.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Prepping.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah. Because there is some damage. That station has not been painted since 1991 when we opened it. So, you know, some type of maintenance needs to go in place. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Thank you for that, Chief. Just wanted to correlate work that I know is being asked and then where this body could be of assistance. So thank you.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Why don't we send a request to Finance and the Director can decide who is the appropriate employee, but whoever is assigned the responsibility of managing our asset inventory. What other responsibilities does this individual have as it regards to maintaining and protecting the asset value, so things like maintenance of the building, painting of the building. Ask them if they have policies or procedures in place. Because I think you bring up a good point, 'cause in the future, we are going to need to list and I don't want that unbalanced financial statement where we have more debt than assets. It's a potential that I don't want us to have to deal with in the near future with the bond raters. Especially with GASB 68. Miss...wait which way am I going? Sorry. Mr. Couch, questions? Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Are we asking expansion? No, we're still on...

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, not on expansion yet.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: All right.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: On the Tires and Tubes --

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --you have 75,000 in the budget for this year, and you're asking for 150 next year, but we've only spent 15,000 so far this year, so you've got roughly 60,000 left. So do we, it doesn't appear that we need the entire amount.

MR. MURRAY: Well, that's a very good question. That comes and goes on our run loads and what have you, so it's all dependent on situations. Sometimes we spend a lot on tires, sometimes we don't. And we just filled our fourth mechanic so we are trying to do all of those things pretty much in-house, and we also have a contractor that comes on a daily...not a daily but on a call basis to come in and fix those situations. Plus in our last budget, we purchased some of our anticipated changes so that was what was, is covering us now, so we had good timing and planning. So and we tried to standardize our vehicles so that we can, we know exactly what we can buy and we'll have a little cache of that, but we're pretty much out of that coming up shortly so.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. And then on the Premium Pay for Admin, that's a...I can't remember how much of the...increase of about almost \$100,000. Can you give us an explanation for that?

MR. MURRAY: It is based on actuals. Yeah, so looking at the actuals for 2014, it was roughly 99,000 and actuals for 2015 was 125,000.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. But so far this year, you've been able to cover all the premium pay with what was allocated...I see Mr. Baz shaking his head but he hasn't heard my whole question.

MR. MURRAY: Okay.

MR. BAZ: Well they, yeah, their premium pay is way over budget but their salaries and...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: I understand that.

MR. BAZ: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: But they're well covered in total under the total salaries. They still have 39.5 percent left with only about 33 percent of the calendar year remaining. So it seems that you've been able to cover that at the previously budgeted amount.

MR. MURRAY: Well, we had a substantial amount of vacancies in that program, clerical and what have you. So and we still do actually.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: I'm okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Any other questions in this area? Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Getting back to that building repairer person, maintenance. And this one person would roam all 14 of your different stations and also to your other islands?

MR. MURRAY: Yes, that is the plan.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Yeah, quite a lot of work for this person to come if it happens.

MR. MURRAY: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: I mean if we were to plan out that person's year, it would be full, yeah, and then some.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Thank you, Chief. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Further questions for the Chief in this area? Okay, Chief, you can hit the one everybody's been waiting for, your expansion requests.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: All right. Thank you, Budget Chair. On Page 7-4, we are asking for an Accreditation Manager. And the amount that you have there is for an eight-month salary. The next position we are looking for a Informational/Communication System Manager. That is to take care of our radios as well as our Department computers. And, you know, I believe Director Wong from Corporation Counsel talked a little bit about information and data and retention and all of those things that would also be under this person's purview. And next, we have the Building Maintenance Repairer which we've talked a little bit about. And then we also have a Operations Assistant II request as well. I'd be happy to answer any questions on any of the four.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Carroll, questions, sir, on expansions? Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Yes, Chair, thank you. On the Accreditation Manager, is that somebody that you would probably bring in or somebody that is already in the Department that has been helping you with this process? It's been a while. How long did you say we've been working on this?

MR. MURRAY: Well officially, we've been working on it since March of last year, 2015. Unofficially, we've been working on it since 2008. And we've front-loaded our training, our certifications, and all of the processes that help us move forward with this --

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Right.

MR. MURRAY: --so that the process wouldn't be as cumbersome as it is right now. That would come from within and that would be a Fire Captain's position.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: I'm thinking it'd be best to have somebody that's been with you that has the background, because accreditation is really a tough, tough thing. I was involved with it and I have a slight idea of, you know, what is involved here. And it's going to take somebody who has the background and the experience, so looks like an in-house kind of thing, you would move somebody up.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah, that was a really good question and that's true, it would be in-house.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Okay. Thank you very much.

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: You know I was around. I thought in the early 2000s, we gave the Department a position to handle this. Whatever happened to that position?

MR. MURRAY: That position is now the Fire Services Officer. About seven years back, we almost lost that position and we had to work with DPS to recreate that, and at that point, the needs of the Department was to have somebody handle the CIPs for the Department, as well as records management which is completely overwhelming at this point in time. And that person would help with all of the building, setting up the

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

contractors, setting up the bids, and all of those things to maintain our facilities. That person also today is our Public Information Officer. That was added duties that was on there. So we weren't sure exactly when accreditation was going to move forward, and with talks with DPS, they wanted us to make that adjustment for our needs currently and in the future so that's where that position went. And it also went when the person left, that's what kind of caused the issue.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. Thank you, Chair. So in regards to your Accreditation Manager, you said somebody...if that position is expanded for your Department, you couldn't utilize any of your existing captains, chiefs, or what have you to have the oversight and manage the accreditation? You would...and I'm sorry, so that Accreditation Manager would just focus on the accreditation?

MR. MURRAY: About 85 percent would be that person's job to do the accreditation, because it's a working, work-in-progress at all times. Every five years you get reaccredited.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Right.

MR. MURRAY: So the process of staying ahead of the game annually would be the full responsibility of this one person, and it, this individual would not be doing it alone, they would still have to reach out to our personnel to help in areas when necessary.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. So help me to understand, we...are...have we ever been in the process of reaching accreditation or...

MR. MURRAY: We are...we have uploaded all of our information now. The deadline was six o'clock tonight and I believe we are almost done. And I actually had this as an extra duty tasked to the Assistant Chief and his team of 49 extra individuals that some we had to pay overtime to do the work. Because it's very cumbersome, especially the first time that you go through it. So hopefully by August, we'll have some good news. But we've been working on this for the last over seven years now.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: I realize that, and your existing...I'm just looking at the Accreditation Manager expansion and looking at all of our bargaining unit, the agreements that we have and all the increase and everything else. So my question and I'm sure it will come from others too is we...is I realize you've utilized your Assistant Chief for what you're going to upload tonight, and could that continue? Do you still need to utilize 49 employees or do you have continuing work to have this process go on then?

MR. MURRAY: Thank you. We do have continuing work. It will be continuous work for this individual. One of the key components to having a person in there is the continuity of that and having the systems-based knowledge of working within that system to provide us, you know, always being able to be reaccredited. And someone has to be on that task every day because it is daunting. Right now there's so many projects that

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

we have on the backburner out of the Assistant Chief's Office that everybody else is trying to pick up that load as well.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: I realize that and I do value and crossing my fingers that, you know, you'll have the good news of receiving accreditation. But, Chair, I have another question in regards to the information/communication system. I don't know why our County government, every department has to have its own BMR, its own ITS, and what you're asking for is your own ITS person to take care of your radio systems and what have you. Are still connected with the Police Department?

MR. MURRAY: Yes, we are. That is a very good question. Right now when we did the switchover of the 800 megahertz radios, the Police Department had tasked a handful of people to make that happen and they did that for all of the departments. They have asked us numerous times, for over three years now for assistance of some person that could be there for the consistency of the process, not just the project that we just had but to maintain that on a daily basis. We have tasked them over and over and over again and they've asked us to put in, so what we've done is worked with them and see how we can mesh the two so that they can work together. Also, a lot of our problems, when we put in a request through IT, they are already overwhelmed so it's super, you know, we have to wait, things are down. We have national reports that we have to provide on a weekly, monthly basis, so those things can't be down for very long. And we work really well with them, but like every other department, they are overworked. And we can't continue to overwork the people that are volunteering or coming on their days off to work a little overtime to make that happen. We need to have someone that's there working side by side with the Police personnel as well as IT.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: So if I'm to understand you right, today your communications system, the maintenance, the upkeep and whatever installation you have is now handled by employees from the Police Department and maybe sometimes perhaps from ITS?

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: And we have personnel that we have within our Department that that is an extra duty for them, but they're not trained at that level. They're doing it so that they can take that information and send it to the Police --

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: I see.

MR. MURRAY: --at least from, concise from one group of people.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: I see.

MR. MURRAY: So yeah, that's, I mean and we've been paying overtime for two people to do that annually, so we're kind of at that point.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. Thank you.

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, I'd like to see you continue to train the folks that are already doing that for you so that we're not adding another position. As far as the Accreditation Manager is concerned, my concern is similar to Mr. Hokama's where you were given an accreditation position earlier and then moved it to another responsibility. But my, I also recall that we doubled the number of Battalion Chiefs a number of years ago. I can't remember whether it was 2009 or 2010, but it, again, to Ms. Crivello's point, we're growing and growing but we seem to keep needing specialized folks. And I'm concerned with, as you've been able to tell from earlier meetings, I'm concerned with continually adding employees. Is there any way that one of the Battalion Chiefs could be assigned the duties for accreditation instead of us adding another position?

MR. MURRAY: Based on their position, the answer would be no.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Then what about one of the Assistant Chiefs?

MR. MURRAY: As I stated earlier, they're already overloaded with their tasks, one in support services and the other one in operations. And if I may, if you look at our Police Department, they have three people assigned for their accreditation. We're slightly right behind in uniform personnel from them. We don't have nearly the support staff that they have, and I realize that they have other responsibilities than we do. But if you look at how our Department has grown over the past, the support staff has never come with the amount of people that we have. And on the Battalion Chiefs answer is that they are off two-thirds of the time. So if I needed somebody that for instance had to come in for one thing or another, I'd have to put them on overtime, including the people that would assist them with that. So on the accreditation issue, it's about the continuity for that program. And that program along with, you know, our other documents that we've had, our strategic plan, our annual reports, our actual reporting system on a national basis is how this whole process will come together. It will help us find the areas that we are not doing well in. It'll keep all of us in accountability for response times and what have you. Those, that person will work with our dispatchers, the Police Department on all of these items that we can find ways to improve. So the accreditation is about allowing our Department to achieve that level of excellence on a national and international level. So the answer is that we need that person to be focused on that task, and still 50 to 100 people still will be providing information to this individual and that possible team that he needs to put together depending on the needs and timing. So we need to have that clear-cut for that individual to help us maintain that process.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Have you spoken to the Police Department to see if they would be willing to transfer one of their accreditation positions to you guys?

MR. MURRAY: I would love to ask that question but I believe that that would be a union issue so I'm going to stay away from that.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: We can ask that question. Okay. Thank you, Chief. Thank you, Chair.

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We can shift E/Ps too. We're not required to fund and we are not required to maintain E/Ps. Mr. Guzman? The Chair has asked Staff to disburse to you premium pay with the last five years actuals by fund, program, and sub-object code as of February 29, 2016. It is handed out for you for your information as well as to make considerations on the Department's Fiscal Year 2017 request. Anything else in this division of Administration --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: --and Maintenance?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Sorry, Chair. You skipped over myself and Mr. Couch.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I'm sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: That's okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I apologize.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No, no it's okay. So yeah, in regards to the accreditation subject matter, just refresh my memory, what exactly is the benefit? I know the in-house, internal, better management overall, right, keeping everything on track thing. But you say, you know, it's an international, you know, accreditation and all this. So what else though? Does it give us better, you know, cost on equipment or any type of, you know, incentives moneywise? Or I don't know.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Chief?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Whatever that is.

MR. MURRAY: Thank you for that question, Chair and Councilmember Cochran. The short answer is it allows accountability and efficiency for our Department, because in most

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

cases, you're not going to fix what you don't think is not broken but it doesn't mean that it's efficient. So in this situation we are going to look through every process of the Department and if there's a task that we're doing that we're not supposed to do then it's going to show up. So it's our ability to provide the statistics and data to know that we are moving in the right direction with the goals set forth. So this process comes with, you know, there's a body of six that comes here. They go through every process, every policy, every standard operating guideline, all of it, and then they tell us hey, Chief, I think this area needs a lot of help. Your data and statistics are showing that you're not accomplishing the national standard. So in turn the benefit is to our community because right now we go to bed in hopes that all of us are doing our job, but this will assure you that we are doing our job. And it...so it allows for transparency and accountability from the Fire Chief to the newest recruit. And that's super important for us as a team. So as we train to get better, as we do all of our goals and our strategies and our tactics on how we do our job, this will reinforce that we're actually doing the right thing. And there really is no known benefit outside of knowing that confidently we can say yes that we are actually doing it. We'll be able to provide better statistics for you to make decisions on cost and funding that come to us, and know that we are spending every penny appropriately. But ultimately what it does is safety. So it allows us to be looked at with a fine-tooth comb that our operations is, we're accountable and we're maintaining that and we provide safety to our personnel, the community. Which we all know that when things go bad which we don't want to happen, if we put our best foot forward that, you know, they'll always know that we did our best and we can prove that we did our best because we have the numbers that prove it. So it's very critical for this community. The Police Department is accredited. Several departments to include Honolulu Fire Department and the Federal departments are accredited. And, you know, the Department of Defense has taken it upon themselves six years ago, to mandate that all departments in Department of Defense be accredited, so every single department is going through that process. So they see the value. And this is only my observation, this is nothing that I can put down in paper. But if you look at the grants that departments go for, and when the grant reviewers see that your department has gone through this process, I can guarantee they know that the process that you're going through for the grant itself is minute, because they know that you understand how these all of these items correlate to your operations and accountability which makes things efficient. So that's what I want all of you to understand that, that's our goal, efficiency and accountability, and ultimately that solves the safety issue. So thank you for that question.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah well and thank you for your comments and your passion to what to do the right thing efficiently for this County and for the community, and safety being number one of course. So I appreciate that. Looking at one of your threats, external factors, departmental threats which is community growth that exceeds the Department's service delivery capabilities. That's in one of your opening statements in the booklet. So how does that affect your accreditation if at all? Because it's stating right now as we sit here, that growth in this community, in this County has exceeded your capabilities. I know there's response times you need to meet and what have you, so as we go through the community plan, the island plans, if

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

we're going to keep extending outwards and needing your folks services, but as it is you're already...sorry I'm looking at...it's just one the sentence in Page 254 at the very bottom and it's bullet pointing your threats to your Department. And so how does that factor into your accreditation, your pursuit in becoming, you know, accredited? That seems like a really huge statement to me right now, and in regards to safety and if we're going to continue to build out this community, this County.

MR. MURRAY: Well, thank you for that question. And it is a big bite to take out, but if we cannot do our self-assessment and be honest about what our threats are then we'll never improve. And this wasn't an easy sell to my personnel and we're still trying to sell it. But it's not their responsibility to maintain the safety and the accountability for this Department, it's mine and the next Fire Chief. So the next Fire Chief might not have that passion, he might be wanting to run in some other direction. But this process will assure your investment in our Department and our community that we're doing the right things. Because I can assure you if you lose accreditation, every single one of you are going to ask why. So it's not just me expressing my feelings and my thoughts and our accomplishments to our Fire Commission that continues to maintain my job, but it's actually getting it done. And that same thought process goes to every member within our Department. So that's how this process allows us to get better, and it's better for you, when you call 911, you're going to get the best. And there were a lot of negative faces when I presented this whole process that we're going to go in this direction. People I've known for 25 years, looked at me and go, really? But if you look at...we would pay our people the same price whether we're accredited or trained or not, based on the collective bargaining unit, so in turn, this process helps get you the top personnel with the money that you're paying for now. So we could have gone status quo eight years ago, you know, do some crossword puzzles, but that's not what we intended to do. That was never our goal. If you look at the process and all of the information that we have printed, that has never been our goal. Our goal is to change the culture so that we are there for our community. We have bought a place in our community and we're accountable for it, and it's not just me saying it, it's the numbers and the data and our people doing the same thing. So that's what the ultimate thing is with that. So I really, really appreciate that question. And I'm sorry for getting a little emotional, but I felt that was our responsibility and for us to lead by example and make it happen. No fire chief wants to go through this. I just came back from Florida where we sat at the Centers for Excellence and we sat in the hearings when departments were going through. There was one department that spent 11 years going through this process and 3 fire chiefs. It is not easy and our personnel has done an outstanding job thus far. Not to say that the Department wasn't doing well and we weren't moving forward, but this puts us in a spot where it's not a person speaking, it's the data that's speaking to you. So for me that would find great comfort for all the work that has been done by our Department members, our staff, so that the people realize that hey, we got somebody top notch coming to us. And that was our goal from day one. That was asked for me to do eight years ago when the Commission picked me, and this is something that I'm going to carry out. And eight years is a long time. You know, not everybody felt that it was the greatest thing to do, and they still don't. But I can assure you when it's all said and done, you will feel very safe in our ability to respond to you. So thank you.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And, Chief, and thank you very much for those heartfelt comments, and never have a doubt in my mind that you folks aren't going to be, you know, stand up to the call. But real quickly, so I heard you about tonight you have to do these filing papers by six o'clock, and hopefully by August of this year, you can get a final yes, you're accredited answer? Or you said hopefully you get something by August.

MR. MURRAY: Right. So if we get called to the Centers of Professional Excellence to appear at the hearing, that's when they decide. So every step of the way if we get to a point where we're not able to make August then we go to the deferred list, and then we're going to have to hustle to make it by March. So part of the parameters is that information all being uploaded tonight. So we got personnel doing that as we speak, and we should be closing it in probably by 5:15 is our goal.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay, thank you. And, Chair, lastly you mentioned Department of Defense has mandated departments to go through accreditation. As we see there's money attached to becoming this accredited status, will they provide that?

MR. MURRAY: Pardon me?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Will DOD provide some funds to help assist these departments or municipalities to become accredited?

MR. MURRAY: I cannot speak for the Department of Defense. I'm just saying that the Department of Defense saw the value of being accredited, and they wanted to be sure that all of their departments fire-wise were taken of and accredited. So you got Navy bases, Air Force bases, Army bases, Coast Guard bases. All of those are at, you know, a level that they can operate and it's DOD-wide. So there were about six DOD departments that went through those hearings, and it's not an easy task.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: All right. Well, thank you. Thank you again for --

MR. MURRAY: You're welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --all your work and passion and that. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. And that's only for Federal facilities. Okay. DOD is only with the Feds, has nothing to do with us. And so in Hawaii, Chief, our understanding is the only municipal accredited operation is the City and County of Honolulu Fire Department.

MR. MURRAY: Yes, sir.

CHAIR HOKAMA: All other counties are not accredited.

MR. MURRAY: No, they are not.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: And the two that you mentioned as far as our understanding is Barking Sands, Feds, and the Navy Region of the Hawaii Fire Emergency Services, Feds.

MR. MURRAY: Right. Pearl Harbor. Also known as Pearl Harbor and Hickam.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So Hawaii County, Kauai County, no. Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Chair. My questions have been answered.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Are there other questions under Administration and Maintenance program area for the Chief? Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Just the same question we always have when we see high-priced vehicles. The \$80,000 for the Ocean Safety Battalion Chief for the four-wheel-drive SUV.

MR. MURRAY: Yes, sir. All right. Your question is?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, the question is can we manage with a 40,000 or \$50,000 SUV?

MR. MURRAY: Well, to answer your question, this vehicle would be a response vehicle as well as an operable towing vehicle, and about \$15,000 of that cost is for the response package where you provide lights, sirens, and the towing capability for that. And so that would be the total cost for that.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: What have they been using for Ocean Safety? The only thing I've ever seen is the pickup truck.

MR. MURRAY: Yes. Ocean Safety has six vehicles if I can remember correctly. They have pickup trucks as well as an Xterra-type SUV. And this is for a new vehicle. Right now, our person that is assigned to that Division is using a 16-year-old vehicle until this whole process moves forward, and then this is our goal for the new one.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Other questions in this area? Did we send the question for me regarding information required for justification of equipment and vehicles? Okay, we will be receiving a response that Chair wants specific information about every large piece of equipment that's being requested and the specifications. I don't need one fancy chrome-covered vehicle to do off-road work. So we are going to scrutinize this. The Chair is also looking at standardizing fleets, but we are only going to be looking at the potential savings like Honolulu of only certain type of vehicles and manufacturers to reduce the needs of what I would call inefficient inventory of parts and replacements. So in the '60s the County went with Chrysler, that's when you saw all the Ramblers and whatnot going, but we did fleet programs. I'm looking at reinstating fleet

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

management back for this County, and that's for all departments, all departments. Any other questions in this area? Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: While you're asking for that, I wonder if it would be appropriate for us also to request a list of all the, you know, the full inventory of vehicles and backups that are available on each island.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, we can do that.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And they may have that readily available.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Because the Department's, we have limited equipment on Lanai, I'm sure Molokai also for the departmental requirements. So we'll forward that question.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Anything else in this area, Members? You want a break before we hit Training? Or you guys rather hit Training? We'll hit Training. Chief, let's go into Training.

MR. MURRAY: All right, thank you. Our Training Program as you see the, consists of the Training Bureau and the Health and Safety Bureau. The program description, and all the key goals and measures will be on the following pages. So some of the outcomes that we want to see from the Training programs is an efficient, effective and responsive government; a prepared, safe and livable County; a healthy and sustainable community. That's for our employees as well. So all right, so the areas of this bureau and it may include more areas, but the main purpose is to coordinate all training activities for the Department from new recruits to chief officers. Training programs focus on emergency response, preparation for suppression, technical rescue, emergency medical services, and hazardous materials incidents, as well as support and promotion of professional development for all personnel. We serve the Department personnel as well as other County and State departments and agencies. They also do research. They evaluate tools and equipment for effectiveness, certifies personnel at appropriate levels, conducts command and control training, provides facility apparatus and props for realistic training, and evaluates the effectiveness of each. I'll be happy to answer any of your questions on this program.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Chief. Mr. Carroll, questions for Chief in this area of Training?

COUNCILMEMBER CARROLL: No, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Baisa, questions in this program area?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No, no questions, but in their strategic plan, very important that we keep that up and do a good job. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: No. Sorry.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Not right now, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: What additional responsibilities are being assigned to the Office Assistant to justify the reallocation?

MR. MURRAY: I see you...the numbers that you have there on Page 17-...I mean not 17, I'm sorry, 7-18. This position was already reallocated through last year's budget.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: It says that the increase is part of the reallocation as well, so I guess the notes are not correct. Okay. And then what is the purpose of the additional funding for the standby? Additional 25,000.

MR. MURRAY: That would be for our Health and Safety Bureau. These three individuals that work in that Bureau are tasked with all-hours response for our Fire personnel for medical monitoring. We medical monitor all of our people after the first 45 minutes to an hour if at all possible at an incident, before they return into the hazard area. They also respond for the rehabilitation of hydration and food products for our personnel. And they would be on-call. Right now, they haven't been on-call. In 2009, we stopped the standby pay for all of our 40-hour divisions except for our Fire Prevention because of the arson investigation and what have you. But that, the union agreed to be a part of the solution, and we just haven't gotten it back since. So we have asked to put that back in those divisions.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. The reason I ask is that it, the amount for 2014 and '15 was about half of what you're requesting for this upcoming year.

MR. MURRAY: Yes. About a, I want to say about a third of that is we couldn't get a hold of those people because they're not on standby. So at some point, we had to reassign someone else to make sure that that got done. And usually what causes the problem there is now we're moving that response of the hydration and all of those medical monitoring couple hours back, so that goes against our safety requirements. So what we're trying to do is get our response times for those things a lot quicker and back to how we had it before.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And then the external defibrillator. Where is that going to be housed and how is it utilized? Is it, is that a lot of defibrillators or is that...I'm assuming that's multiple defibrillators. On Page 7-26.

MR. MURRAY: Yes, that would be, yeah, 30 pieces.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And then the SCBA bottles, is the 75 the normal replacement cycle?

MR. MURRAY: Yes. Our normal replacement was at 50, but last year we cut it down because this body asked us to, so we did. And hopefully we can get it to about 50 and 60 annually.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: I'm okay. Thanks, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: You're asking us for another 210,000 for gym equipment, and you say new. So what are the new equipment you folks are purchasing since I don't see it, I'm assuming it's not a replacement? You folks saying it's new so what are you folks planning to purchase? And is this for all stations or a specific station?

MR. MURRAY: Yeah. All of the equipment that we have now we had through a grant process about 16 years ago. We have replaced some of the items here and there, and what we're trying to do is standardize that whole process in each station, because that's part of our wellness and fitness program goal. And we put this in every year, and I think this is the only year that it moved forward. So...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: So this is the first time we've seen it then?

MR. MURRAY: Yeah. You know I've put it on eight years now, so I think this is the first time that it's come through in its whole. So we're excited just to get it this far.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. So what are you looking at, Chief? This is for stamina building, conditioning? Can you help us understand the request please?

MR. MURRAY: Okay. This is for our improved fitness levels in aerobic and conditioning. These to include treadmills, weight sets, rubber mats while they're working out, and help us maintain a consistency in our programs for our individuals to stay fit for their response.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: You know as part of that physical component of, during the job, is that the initial job review, you have the written test, you have a physical test.

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I just did the Police one, I can tell you that. So you run through the windows, you yank the fire hose, you drag 'em 50 yards, you know, you run it within a time requirement. Does the firefighters after in operations still utilize the course as part of a measurement of fitness and conditioning?

MR. MURRAY: No, they are not. This has been an extremely hard task to move forward in consultation with the union. There is national programs that allow for fitness, because there's a high percentage of our firefighters throughout the nation that died due to heart attacks. So what we have now is a peer fitness program, and it doesn't get measured, it's non-punitive, but it's a process that we allow our firefighters to stay fit while at work. And this is just one step moving forward for us to have some kind of consistency as we move towards that goal.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Is this in coordination with the Risk Manager, Chief?

MR. MURRAY: No, it is not. It is a part of our national standard that we are trying to achieve through National Fire Protection Association and their suggestions as well as the union's programs. 'Cause they have programs that they provide that they can help us, but each individual department has to put together a policy, and we just haven't passed that hurdle yet.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So, Mr. Baz, has...the Chief's comment which kind of is very serious regarding the amount of I guess cases where the firefighters are dying from heart attacks. Is this an issue for us as it regards to work comp claims, the amount of settlements we have to put forward for employee benefits? Is this a factor that the Council and this Committee needs to be aware of from a financial perspective?

MR. BAZ: Thank you, Mr. Chair. You know any case of an employee having issues, you know, especially something like a heart attack on the job is an important factor that we want to make sure we try to mitigate as much as possible. The Safety Program of our Risk Management Division does training and different things Countywide. But specifically with the Fire Department, they're actually one of our better workers' comp areas, so I want to, you know, give them the kudos for doing a good job in making sure that their employees are, you know, doing the job as safe as possible, you know, with the right tools and the right manner. So, you know, the efforts that they've put in to keeping their own safety gear and activities and functions in place is one of the reasons why we wanted to support them in this physical fitness area this year. And yeah, you know, I've been here five years and it's never made it past in the Mayor's proposed budget before, but we thought it was something that would definitely enhance their ability to get the job done safely.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Chief, are you aware of what kind of impact in the last, during your tenure as Chief, how many firefighter and heart attack incidents have you been made aware of?

MR. MURRAY: We have been super fortunate and it is very little, about a handful, and all of 'em except for one had corrective action taken. So in 2012, we sustained our first line-of-duty death due to a heart attack. So these types of programs bring it to the forefront, and we want to see how we're doing nationally. And it was already on the radar, and that incident has just pushed us to keep it as close to our thought process and goals. So...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Have you already set your benchmark and your benchmark year to measure everything from?

MR. MURRAY: Actually we have been revamping this program about three times already. We're just trying to get it through the acceptance process with our union. So they've been actively working with us to move it forward, and hopefully at some point in time, we'll be able to do that for you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. So at this time then, Chief, this is a Maui Fire Department initiative, this is not part of the Statewide contract or all county departments are participating in? This is something that's unique to your Department and your personnel at this point in time?

MR. MURRAY: At this point in time, yes. It's a national movement.

CHAIR HOKAMA: But it's not part of a contractual agreement within the union and us as an employer?

MR. MURRAY: No, it's not.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Chief, under operations in this program area, you have...it's not a large but you're asking for additional funding for the Joint Training Center. Can you give us a status of this center's construction please?

MR. MURRAY: All right.

CHAIR HOKAMA: This is on 7-22, Members.

MR. MURRAY: All right. As you know, we do have a Memorandum of Agreement with the State of Hawaii, and we are on a parcel near the airport that we share a building and facilities for training. And I'm looking for the specifics of the cost items. So what this does is help us maintain that area. The State also puts money in to maintain it. We utilize construction materials. Of course we try to get the best deals for those because some of it has to do with our fire ground operations. So we try to get damaged items and this helps us provide that for our firefighters, whether they're cutting through a roof or working in the burn box which is a, basically a Matson container that we utilize

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

pallets and what have you to simulate a structure fire, a residential structure fire. And these are the funds that we utilize for all of those programs that we have on an annual basis there.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Chair, could you tell us what page you're on again?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Seven-twenty-four. Seven-twenty-two and 7-24 is as it regards to the center.

MR. BAZ: Page 263 of the budget document itself has the detailed, the purchase of the burn box upgrade at \$20,000.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So since you mentioned that burn box and that would be under equipment and that's, my understanding that is on 7-26, Members, the burn box. That's under Training, hazard material equipment. So when you say burn box upgrade, Chief, what, can you give us an understanding of this upgrade?

MR. MURRAY: So the Matson container, we have it modified to simulate a residential structure, and over time, the firefighting operations which is live fire, between the heat and the cooling of that areas, we have to do maintenance. Either replacements after a while and/or repair to the structure itself. And we utilize different types of material. Sometimes we have our own guys welding it or what have you. So but we try our best to stay within those parameters for that.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, okay. Let me go back again to this part of I guess the center's...you're asking us for the \$13,000 for ongoing lease requirements. That's on 7-24 of the Details, Chief. Were we...this is the only option that is provided to the County? A lease? Was there any other discussions besides a lease regarding this area?

MR. MURRAY: Director Baz will be answering that.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Mr. Baz, if you can help us.

MR. BAZ: Yeah. Mr. Chair, you're talking about the R & M - Service/Contracts. The...I'm going to have to go double check our notes here, but that money should have been transferred out of that sub-object code, 6138 of R & M - Service/Contracts to 7105 for the copier lease, moving it to the C Account. That was...this is one of the problems that we had to fix this year via resolution was because the budgeting of that item.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, okay. Thanks for that. Thanks for that.

MR. BAZ: And then it's offset by transferring money in from Miscellaneous Supplies, you see the \$13,000 negative up in 6035. And that's why you see it is a positive number in R & M - Service/Contracts, but that number had been offset by those, money coming out for the ongoing lease and then the two monies coming in. So the...yeah, your question regarding is that the only option? No. We have different, based on different

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

circumstances, again, the option of either purchasing copy machines or leasing copy machines. We really leave that up to the department and the program as they see the most prudent, whether it be for cost purposes or for efficiency of maintenance purposes, different things. We look at the different factors of those categories.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. You know since we're talking equipment and whatnot, Chief, under your training equipment, can you tell us, explain to us what your request, what is a rapid intervention air pack? I was, I found that kind of intriguing your description. So we know it's not an SCBA bottle, so could you give us an understanding of what is this air pack?

MR. MURRAY: All right. Thank you for the opportunity. Okay. That would be specifically for the Training Division. It won't be out at the stations. I believe these items are much more durable for the training purposes, 'cause they get banged up a lot.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So this is only for training, this would not be utilized in any way with your hazmat team?

MR. MURRAY: No, those items are much more costly.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So this air pack is what, like a self-contained suit, bodysuit? I'm trying to get a handle of what you're asking us to support the Division in.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah, so this items are for, specifically for training to protect the bottles. So our bottles as you know run over \$1,000 apiece and they have a lifespan. So this equipment allows us to protect that so we're not damaging. So what we normally do is take our older ones and move it to that Division so that we're not damaging high-cost items. So we basically are fronting the new ones out online for the guys to use every day, and we're trying to recycle the older ones that can be utilized at training. And this is a protector of that unit.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. And so as I understand under Training Program, hazmat needs 1 \$55,000 4-wheel-drive vehicle and then training needs 3 \$55,000 4-wheel-drive vehicles. So you're actually asking for this Division from this Committee for 4 replacement vehicles, right?

MR. MURRAY: Yes. We are trying to standardize our equipment. In the past...and some of the vehicles that we've had in that areas were there before I was assigned to that, about 16 years ago, and we are trying to standardize our vehicles so when we need them, we have the ability to tow, respond, move equipment. We're able to utilize those vehicles to put a skid mount package on there so it becomes a miniature wildland vehicle if we need. Our, the Health and Safety Bureau, their SUV, it was a 1991, so 24 years in age and needs a replacement, over 207,000 miles.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So, Chief, this would be divisional equipment, not an equipment assigned to a specific employee of the Department?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: No, that would be divisional. And then with the Training Bureau, we would be replacing a 2000 Chevy Blazer, a 1998 Dodge Ram, and a, I believe was a 2000 Chevy Astro Van, and that we cannot get parts for. Actually the Ram and the Astro Van we struggle. Yeah, and they're totally not efficient.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So, Chief, when you...I was happy to hear your word of standardization. So hearing that, you are looking at all four potential vehicles if we forward it to be all of the same manufacturer make?

MR. MURRAY: Yeah. When we try to go through the bidding process, that helps us lessen the cost, so that was one of the goals. And this is the first year again that we could get all of these on. We've been asking for this for eight years now. I'm speaking only for our administration.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. So that means then you can standardize even your parts inventory.

MR. MURRAY: Absolutely. So we can turn around time for maintenance. It makes it a whole lot more efficient in our shop.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I'm happy to hear that, Chief. Thank you.

MR. MURRAY: You're welcome.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Guzman, questions for the Chief in this program area?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: I have none. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Carroll, questions for the Chief in this area? Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. And getting back to that gym equipment. That's for all 14 stations?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Chief?

MR. MURRAY: Yes, all 14 stations.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And so I want to refer to Page 7-21 which also asks for \$8,800 for gym equipment. So where is that one going? I don't know. Middle of the page, 6060, Small Equipment. So it looks like changes say deletion of one-time appropriation. It looks like a minus 1,200 but there is a proposal of 8,800.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Baz? Chief?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. BAZ: Thank you. Mr. Chair, so the 6060 Small Equipment is, you know, stuff that's under \$1,000. It would be, you know, yeah, I mean not full sets of equipment. These could be minor replacement items that the different firefighters, yeah, I mean the different stations need, maybe a replacement mat, that might be once-in-a-while kind of stuff. You can see the actual dollar amount going down there, because they haven't been buying a lot of small equipment under this area. So it was actually reduced from last year. The \$1,200 was last year's request.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. But it's all for fitness-type equipment or no? I'm just trying to...

MR. MURRAY: Yes, it's for fitness equipment for our Kahului Fire Station which is our largest exercise room that on a daily basis is open to about 18 people and that's just from the ones from the station, including our training. So anywhere from 25 to 30 people can utilize that area.

MR. BAZ: Yeah, so looking it up actually, Mr. Chair and Member Cochran, that \$1,200 was a one-time request from last year, for Fiscal Year 2016 that my office deleted because it was a one-time request. So those...the \$1,200.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Right. But I mean it just kind of threw me that there's two sections asking for seemingly the same thing, fitness gym things.

MR. BAZ: Well, that request was from Fiscal Year '16, so it's a deletion of that request.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: But it's still asking for 8,800 in that line item.

MR. BAZ: Well, in Small Equipment, but that could be all kinds of different --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, okay. Okay, okay.

MR. BAZ: --small equipment. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, gotcha.

MR. BAZ: Anything under \$1,000. It could be a hand tool for them to, screwdriver.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

MR. BAZ: I mean it really could be anything, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. So that 8,800 isn't necessarily just for gym?

MR. BAZ: No. The...

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: The deletion was for gym.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. BAZ: The deletion was for gym, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, got it. Got it.

MR. BAZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay, sorry. Kind of...I guess it's getting late. And then looking, Chief, at your strategic planning booklet here, it looks like that is your lowest ranking which is your peer fitness category. Peer fitness meaning people don't think other people seem fit? Is that what your...

MR. MURRAY: That's my lowest average, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Your peer review is saying you're out of shape. Is that that one's saying?

MR. MURRAY: At times they're brutally honest with each other, but that's where the whole peer situation happens, right. So your peers help motivate you, and some people just aren't motivated. And that's why a program is necessary for us to move forward so that at least your weakest link is not that weak, you know.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. But I see the, that's your lowest scoring section so that's I'm sure could be the reason for finally this item moving forward to boost that number up. So very good. Thank you.

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh and real quickly, in reference to the Joint Training Center burn box, and I have had the opportunity, thank you very much for your Department of letting myself and staff tour the facility and --

MR. MURRAY: Thanks for coming.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --taking a look at what happens there in joint work with airports. And so they have, they kick in also funding to help assist in this --

MR. MURRAY: Yes, they do.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --place?

MR. MURRAY: Yes, they do.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. All right. And yeah, I think it's very, it's a good training center, well maintained and well utilized too, so.

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yeah. Awesome. Thank you very much, Chief.

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Questions? Other questions, Members? Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you, Chair. Is there, have you looked for grant monies to replace the gym equipment?

MR. MURRAY: Majority of the gym equipment in Kahului Fire Station was done by a grant upfront somewhere in 2004. We had all of it done by grant.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Right. But could it, could these replacements be done by grant? 'Cause I'm sure there are health grants out there.

MR. MURRAY: There are health grants. Right now, that's not the top of the heap when you're going for grants. It seems to cycle at certain points in time based on the needs, and that hasn't been on the radar for at least 12-13 years.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. And then the other question I had was how many trucks do you have in this Division at this point? There's I think eight personnel.

MR. MURRAY: In training?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah.

MR. MURRAY: Okay. So we have a total of eight personnel and yeah, eight firefighters. No wait, seven firefighters, I'm sorry. And...okay, your question was how many vehicles we have --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Right.

MR. MURRAY: --in that program?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah. Are we replacing all of them or are we replacing four out of six or?

MR. MURRAY: Okay, let me think. So I think we're replacing three out of I want to say five or six, and those other ones are, I believe there's only one that is in the range that is...oh no, two of them that are comparable. Fairly, one is fairly new and another one we'll be coming in probably in the next two years.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah but we have four vehicles being replaced there. So of those, of that department, you're saying you have six vehicles or seven vehicles? You can get back to us on that. I don't need an answer right now.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: Okay. Yeah, one of the real problems is those divisions have never been able to put in for a new vehicle except for Health and Safety, there was one vehicle that they got. Historically they've always got the hand-me-downs, so by standardizing the process, we can utilize those on the weekends or what have you for incidents if we need it. And it'd be able to be rotated if need be for incidents.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: So if we buy the Battalion Chief's Ocean Safety vehicle for 80,000, the hand-me-down can go to replace one of these?

MR. MURRAY: His hand-me-down is a Crown Victoria, that used to be my car. I mean they could use it and if that's all we got, we will.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well and anyway, if you can let us know how many vehicles you've got, that would be great. Okay. That can come when you get the request for the equipment list.

MR. MURRAY: All right. Thank you, sir.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Other questions? If not, any questions on Page 266 which is Goals/Objectives or 264? Two sixty-four is the objectives for training and 266 is for Health and Safety. So I'm going to ask the Members if they have questions for the Chief regarding these areas of measurements. Mr. Carroll, any questions on Goals/Objectives and measurements for the Training Division?

COUNCILMEMBER CARROLL: No, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No, they look good to me. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank...

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: I think we've discussed them enough. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No questions, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: No questions.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Thank you, Chair, no questions.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Guzman? Okay. We're going to take a short break and then get into Fire/Rescue Operations with the Department. So why don't we get back at 5:40 'cause sooner we come back, sooner we can finish, sooner you go home. . . .(gavel). . .

RECESS: 5:32 p.m.
RECONVENE: 5:41 p.m.

CHAIR HOKAMA: . . .(gavel). . . Okay, Members, let's get back to order. The Chair will provide the Members an option. For some, I understand your need for nourishment so we can do a dinner break. I'll give you one hour, then we shall return and then we shall finish this Department whatever it, long it takes. Or we can finish up Fire/Rescue Operations and Prevention, adjourn for the evening. We have two Council meetings tomorrow and a Committee of the Whole meeting. And on Monday then it is my intention after Mayor and Managing Director, we will have Parks and then we can finish Ocean Safety at that time. So that's the either/or option I will allow you folks to have a choice in.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Second option.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Finish up?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah, I think we finish up.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Take no dinner break --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: No dinner break, right?

CHAIR HOKAMA: --finish up the two divisions and adjourn for the day?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No dinner break, yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, so, Members, we're gonna concentrate, we going focus, we going finish Fire/Ops and Fire Prevention, adjourn. We will conclude Fire Department's Ocean Safety transfer on Monday as when either before or after we deal with Parks Department. Is that clear?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yes.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, let's rock and roll, Chief. We are on Fire/Rescue Operations if you can give us your comments on this program, please?

MR. MURRAY: Thank you for the opportunity. As you know this is the largest of our programs and the bread and butter of what we do. So I'll entertain any questions.

CHAIR HOKAMA: That was concise. That was concise.

MR. MURRAY: Follow orders.

MR. BAZ: Goals and objectives are starting on Page 270.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, yeah. So, Members, please if you have your questions, please be prepared to ask them. I will start with Mr. White at this time if he has a question for our Chief as it regards to fire ops.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: None at this time.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Are we on AB...A?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. So if we look at 7-42.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Oh I'm sorry, are we talking expansions, Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Not yet. Not yet.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, I just want to deal with his --

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: I'm sorry. Yeah.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --current operations and nothing to do with the expansions.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: You can talk about his proposed request from the current operation, so let's say on Page 272 of the summary, you know, if you said I notice a 115 percent change in Premium Pay from current year to proposed year, Chief, give us comment. Those things are great. So, Chief, since I posed a question already on behalf of the Committee, and again we understand unanticipated incidences that you are required

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

to respond to. And so we understand you deal with those, that factor of unplanned, unscheduled. But this request for such a nice chunk increase, can you give us some comment on the basis for this \$4 million of Premium Pay?

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Baz?

MR. BAZ: Thank you. I did transfer to your Staff, and they passed out a premium pay report for Fire and Public Safety up 'til February 29 of 2016 and the --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, we knew that.

MR. BAZ: --four prior years. So when I was analyzing their request, I basically trimmed it down to what they had spent in 2015. So if you look at the 2015 numbers, they spent almost 4 million, \$3,994,000 of Premium Pay specifically in this Fire/Rescue Operations Program. So even though the '16 adopted budget only has \$1.9 million appropriated, that's why you see the significant increase. The \$4,194,000 proposed is specifically related to their actual expenditures in that Fire/Rescue Operations Program. And also just to note for up to February 29th, they've spent 2.7, a little over \$2.7 million in Premium Pay for this program.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Baz. I'll ask Ms. Crivello if she has a question for the Chief?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: No, I...are your Premium Pay based on actuals? And, you know, if I look at every station, all of the stations and, you know, are they actually based on actuals for the fiscal year?

MR. MURRAY: Yes. The proposed, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. It's quite a bit, yeah. Thank you.

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Mr. Chair. And, Chief, this is my perennial question to you. Because of your often requests for, you know, very, very expensive trucks --

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: --are you starting to work on a program that when there's a callout to say a traffic injury or anything, you have a separate vehicle, a smaller utility vehicle that goes out there with two people instead of the whole station? Or and that vehicle can also be used to, when you have to do your other things where you don't

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

need to take a big, huge million-dollar truck to go to something that a smaller utility vehicle could go to?

MR. MURRAY: We already try to do that in some cases, not all cases. That's where the accreditation process is going to help us figure those things out, and allow us with the research to say hey, this is what we can and cannot do, and does it fit the standard? So that remains to be seen.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. All right, well, I'll ask again next year. Maybe, maybe, I don't know.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No, no glaring questions here. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No thanks.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Carroll? Thank you, sir. Mr. White, any questions at, for the Chief under current?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Not with current, no, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Members, anything under operations or equipment that you'd like to ask the Chief under Fire/Rescue Operations?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Notice that there's reductions from Medical Supplies and going, and increasing to Repairs and Maintenance in your various stations. Why is that?

MR. MURRAY: Our medical supplies for the whole Department is purchased through our Health and Safety Bureau so we've made the adjustments in those areas so that they're at the appropriate purchasing area.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: So in other words you're purchasing it through another process?

MR. MURRAY: Yeah, we're purchasing similar amounts, but it's in the place that it's appropriated now. Right.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay.

**BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Anything else at this time, Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: I cannot help but notice increase of 255,000 for the Molokai station. Am I seeing this right? Total 533,000. Is that correct?

MR. MURRAY: May I ask...

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: For Premium Pay? And if that is correct, what is the cause? Are you sending people from Maui to Molokai or? That is --

MR. MURRAY: May I ask what page?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: --on Details, 7-50, the Molokai station, 911057A-5215. It's such a big increase for Premium Pay.

MR. BAZ: Yeah, so, Mr. Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Chief? Mr. Baz?

MR. BAZ: Yeah, thank you. Member Crivello, if you look right above that the actual expenditures for 2015 for the Molokai Fire Station in Premium Pay was \$507,000. So the increase that they're requesting is from 507,000 of actual in '15, to a reality of 533,000 for the proposed, so.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay.

MR. BAZ: Yeah. It's just the budgeted amount for Fiscal Year 2016, was so low so that's why you see it looks like there's a huge increase.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Okay. That's still a lot though.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Couch, questions at this...Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Did we talk about expansions?

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, not yet.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, okay. No, nothing, Chair. Thanks.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No thanks.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Carroll? Okay. Anyone has questions in operations or equipment at this time? Mr. White?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Actually not on the equipment but, Mr. Baz, is it possible for us...for you to break out the cost of the rank-for-rank recall?

MR. BAZ: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Chair White, I do not have that capability. Nothing gets reported into our IFAS system like that for rank-for-rank.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Chief?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: But do you all have it, Chief?

MR. MURRAY: Yes, we'll do the breakdown for you.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. 'Cause I think it's important for us to understand, you know, the projected cost was \$2 million a year so I think it's important for us to get a handle on exactly what that cost is. And if it's a lot less than that, that's great news. If it's more than that--

MR. MURRAY: Bad news.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --not so great news. So thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. We'll follow up and work with the Chief to get you, the Committee the responses. Okay. Anything...let's see. Fire/Rescue Operations. Oh, Chief, under fire operations, 7-79. So, Chief, yeah, you know, if you look at 7-79, Chief, of the Details, this is what you can help us understand. Okay. 'Cause the Members are all aware of the Ocean Safety Division coming from Parks to your Department now, and we understand your general responsibility by us reviewing Bargaining Unit 14's contract. And then here on 7-79 under Molokai station, I know there's another station, but you have rescue watercraft with trailer and sled --

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --under Fire which is...so what is the determining factor when it comes under Fire and Fire/Rescue versus Ocean Safety?

MR. MURRAY: We have no Ocean Safety personnel on Molokai. This would be entirely the Fire Department's responsibility.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. So for Lanai, you would treat it in the same manner as Molokai, sir?

MR. MURRAY: We would send our resources from Maui to Lanai. We don't currently have a ski...

CHAIR HOKAMA: A ski operator?

MR. MURRAY: Yeah, or a boat on Lanai.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. The State has a boat. They don't use it but they have a nice Boston Whaler. Chief Romero --

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --can verify that, that there's a boat there that we could...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR HOKAMA: Your mother would be happy. Okay, no, no, and that's a good explanation, Chief. Okay. So but for Lanai I'm going to, our community is going to wait 45 minutes before any personnel response then? More or less?

MR. MURRAY: Yes. So we have our ground personnel get as close as to the ocean situation as possible, give us an update, and our rescue team would be mobilizing in the process to fly there. So hopefully it's much less than 45 minutes. It's all based on the information that we retrieve.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you for that. Appreciate that. Chief, are you having issues with the radio program? Because I know Police has responsibilities, you folks have shared, some shared systems, if I could use that word without being totally incorrect. Is there issues with the radio program and whatnot between departments that is having you need additional resources regarding maintenance?

MR. MURRAY: Maintenance in-between the departments, right now majority of that work is being done by the Police Department. You know after the upgrade, we've had much better coverage and capabilities with the communication. So right now while it's still new, it seems like everything's working well.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, okay. And then one last one, just so I can get clarification because Kahului station under Fire/Rescue, you also have watercraft with trailer and sled requested. So help us...help me at least and the Committee understand when you would put your request in your Fire Department division versus the Ocean Safety component. What is, would be the determinant so that Kahului now has a, under Fire, watercraft equipment? So you have a specific firefighter assigned or you're going to use an Ocean Safety employee regarding this?

MR. MURRAY: This specific one we will be using Fire personnel. That would be assigned to our rescue unit.

CHAIR HOKAMA: And that is a Fire Fighter III, Chief?

MR. MURRAY: Fire Fighter II.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Fire Fighter II.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: Or anybody on that crew would be certified to operate that equipment from the Captain on down.

CHAIR HOKAMA: At the incident, who would have control? The Ocean Safety guy, the firefighter?

MR. MURRAY: Fire.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Fire would have incident control?

MR. MURRAY: Yeah. Fire would have incident command responsibilities, and they would work in conjunction with Ocean Safety if they are summoned to that call.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, okay. And then are you working on your protocols and everything for response?

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We can appreciate some of the fluidity right now on that situation. Ms. Baisa, any questions?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Not at this time.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. And looking at, just trying to tally up the total for I guess Machinery and Equipment, and you kind of break it down, I guess this is for Mr. Baz or...break it down in a lot of different sort of line items. So 12, for example 12 personal protection equipment, then another line down 12, another line 25, another line 15, another line...so it keeps going. And there's a reason for not compiling it all into one big total? Is there like each? 'Cause the numbers are all the same, it's just obviously I guess one's going to one station, another batch are going...something of that nature, but it doesn't really say.

MR. MURRAY: Right. That is our turnouts, our firefighting gear. So the numbers will coincide with the people assigned to that station --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, okay. So I guess...

MR. MURRAY: --and a replacement.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. So I guess it's just easier to track, to correspond, like have in our budget line item...

MR. MURRAY: Per station, yeah.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. It just seems so, you know, redundant, over and...no, I mean I know it corresponds with something, but to get like a nice big, we need, you know, 10,000 --

MR. MURRAY: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --of these turnouts and here's the total amount.

MR. MURRAY: We did that last year.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Oh, and we kept asking, nitpicking?

MR. MURRAY: Very similar, yeah, and we got 50 percent.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: So I believe the deal was for the other 50 percent.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Gotcha. So this makes it look smaller as we go with 15, 25. And then the other one is you have two areas where you want to purchase rescue watercraft with trailer and sled.

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: So one does notate it's for Kahului, the other one doesn't say where, but I'm taking it's probably for Molokai that Mr. Chair just asked about. So I'm looking at Page 275, and that one...two...three...five items down, so you see the Vessel and Marine Equipment. Then also on the next page, three...four items down, it's for the same thing but it does notate it's for Kahului. But 275 doesn't notate where that sled --

MR. BAZ: Apologize.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --watercraft is going.

MR. BAZ: That's just our notes, they didn't transfer, but yes that one is for Molokai.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. So no --

MR. BAZ: That was the one --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --you're trying double dip --

MR. BAZ: --Member Crivello...

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --I'm just asking.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. BAZ: Yeah.

MR. MURRAY: No.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay, got it.

MR. BAZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Just checking, you know --

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, I appreciate the question.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --there's a blank there, not telling us. Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I appreciate the questions.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: All right, very good. Other than that...and so jumping up to the utilities, I can talk about that?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Cellular Phones at \$500 for 3 of your Captain positions. That's for the entire year for three phones? \$500? I mean that is dirt cheap. I just want to know what plan you're on if that's the case.

MR. MURRAY: Well --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: I mean wow.

MR. MURRAY: --we're on the government plan.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah. And all of our companies have access to phones, so yeah, we...connectivity, it's where it's at.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. My husband and I pay that like in a month practically. I'm like I'm on your plan. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Mr. Couch, any questions, sir? Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: No, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No, I think you already asked the questions about the radios, the 50,000 and 43, so I think I'm okay with that. And maybe Ms. Crivello knows why

**BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

March 31, 2016

Molokai needs a \$100,000, 4-wheel-drive diesel truck, but maybe you can give us a little more help with that.

MR. MURRAY: Okay. That would be a replacement crew cab for...yeah, if my memory serves me correct, it's for Kaunakakai Fire Station. Their unit is at ten years and they utilize that for rescue as well as other fire fighting. Yeah, it's 11 years old. It's a 2005 F-350.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Will you be providing us with the details --

MR. BAZ: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --on each of the replacements?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, we've put in that request --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --Mr. White, so upon receipt --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: That's fine.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --we shall distribute.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: You don't need to answer the question any further. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Chief, quickly, I don't know, I guess you would put it under miscellaneous, but is there occasional need for you to use satellite communication systems for communication requirements within the Department or interdepartmental?

MR. MURRAY: Unless.

CHAIR HOKAMA: You're in black zones, black holes --

MR. MURRAY: Right.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --what I call black holes.

MR. MURRAY: We've had the need in the past. Very, very few opportunities. In the past, we have utilized Civil Defense's ability to have satellite phones. But with this new 800 system, the coverage is so much better, and in some cases, the regular cellular phone works as long as we're not in a natural disaster when everybody wants to get on the phone. We've been fortunate.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. But access is available to you should you need to use that mode of communication?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: Yes, yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. And all I know is it's expensive per minute so cell phones are dirt cheap compared to satellite phones. Okay. Are there other questions under Fire/Rescue Operations? If not, I'm going to ask the Chief to talk about the expansion request in this area. Chief, can you give us some comment on your expansion in this program?

MR. MURRAY: All right. For the fire operations program we are --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes.

MR. MURRAY: --asking for three Fire Fighter IIIs, and that would be located for our tanker drivers in Hana.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Questions, Mr. Carroll, regarding the expansion position for Hana?

COUNCILMEMBER CARROLL: Not really a question, but I think the expansion positions and all the ones we've talked about over the years, every time it comes before us because of the greater need and the greater population, I would hope that Hana and all of the other places, that we could seriously consider granting them.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Thank you. Ms. Baisa, any questions or...on this expansion?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Where are these positions going, all to Hana?

MR. MURRAY: Hana.

CHAIR HOKAMA: The three goes to Hana --

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: They're all going to Hana?

CHAIR HOKAMA: --for the tanker, I believe.

MR. MURRAY: Yes, the tanker.

CHAIR HOKAMA: This is for tankers, the tanker.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Okay, all right. I understand. No problem.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. And yeah, I'm sure this neck of woods needs this, so very supportive. Just where do you house them?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Chief?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: It would be at the Hana Fire Station. We have an area for those personnel, because there would be just one per shift. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. So they don't live there full time, all year, you know?

MR. MURRAY: Not majority of them.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. 'Cause I know it's hard pressed for places, accommodations for even our workers in that community. And then looking down at I guess Materials and Supplies that are associated with these positions. What are the related...I'm looking at 274 and it also jumps over to 275 in regards to related operation costs. One is \$900 and the other is 750 I believe, but it doesn't really break it down for what that is. Is that...no, that wouldn't be their turnouts 'cause that's on something else. Materials and Supplies, Small Equipment, some kind of small equipment for them, \$900, so that would be what, \$300 apiece. And then next page again at 750 under Other Costs. Oh wait, sorry, that's physical examinations. Where is that?

CHAIR HOKAMA: So, Chief --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: So...

CHAIR HOKAMA: --part of the question that Ms. Cochran is asking, is this all required from the Department to provide by collective bargaining agreements? Is this the things you're asking --

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --that are, as an employer, we are required to provide the employee? 'Cause that would be one way to help us understand this request.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah. Every item on there except for the cell phone.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Is it mandated --

CHAIR HOKAMA: It's part of what the employer --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --by union?

CHAIR HOKAMA: --provides the employee.

MR. MURRAY: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. And so the \$900, is there a kind of guesstimation on what those items would be at all?

MR. MURRAY: Right.

**BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: 'Cause it seems like uniform --

MR. MURRAY: I believe --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --things are taken care of.

MR. MURRAY: --would be the SCBA unit, too--yeah?--and all safety equipment. So if you look on the line below, No. 7, that talks about turnouts specifically. Then all other equipment would fall into that Small Equipment. So whether it be gloves, boots.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay, thanks.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Couch? Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: No. No questions right now. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you, Chair. The question I would have, I think we asked this last year when this came up, on the number of the Hana firefighters that actually live in the district as opposed to driving in. I recall there was more than 50 percent of them actually lived out there.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah, about 40 percent live out in Hana --

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: 'Cause...

MR. MURRAY: --which is a little different than Lanai.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Just the thought occurs to me that if we have people that live out there with cell phones today, if we could train one individual as a driver that could respond when, you know, when needed. I don't...how often does that tanker truck get called out? I know the number of fire callouts by station are not very high. There's like 5 percent of the calls.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: Right. What that district poses is a lack of water supply. So the tankers rolls...they assign a person from the engine to be on that tanker as water supply. So because access water supply in that area, it will roll on any brushfire or fire call.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: So who mans the tanker now? A Fire Fighter I?

MR. MURRAY: Right now a Fire Fighter I TAs to that position. Temporary assignment, yeah.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: So only on the call, as-needed basis. So that was something that the...so in collective bargaining, what we do is we do a consultation and work that whole thing out, whether the individual has a TA, time to check it out, response in a call, and that's just the union's way of kinda working with the employer based on the situation that we have. But those trucks require more training and more continuity and skills for that vehicle, yeah, especially on the roadways.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Is it correct to assume that when a Fire Fighter I is getting training on the tanker truck, he's getting temporarily assigned to a Fire Fighter III?

MR. MURRAY: Only if there isn't an assigned person to that truck. So for instance if they were getting trained, they wouldn't get TA, but if they're actually operating they are getting TA, yeah.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. So every time the tanker rolls, whoever is driving it is getting the TA?

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. That sounds to me like a good way to handle it rather than assigning three more folks out there. But if you could find out for us how many callouts we're talking about that the three would cover.

MR. MURRAY: All right.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: And I think we have that from last year.

MR. MURRAY: I believe so.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: So maybe we don't need it, but...

MR. MURRAY: But we'll give you the updated one.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Chief.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Can you come back to me, my...I got a glitch real quick. I had it and I do have two questions but for some reason it --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Other questions, Members?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: --glitched on me.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I will let Mr. Guzman have some time to find his place.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, ma'am?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: It's, it has to do with Hana and fire trucks. So the bridge and I can't remember the name, sorry, Mr. Carroll, the bridge that kind of goes above Hamoa, and I'm told that our trucks and things cannot come from Kipahulu into this bridge so thereby everything has to detour through Hamoa. Are you aware of this issue?

MR. MURRAY: I believe the Department of Public Works has solved that issue already.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: So your trucks are able to traverse the bridge now?

MR. MURRAY: I'm pretty sure. The last time I was there which was just recently it's --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: --way better than what it used to be.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay, just checking. 'Cause I've been told...

MR. MURRAY: We're talking about the curve right above Hamoa old airport? Yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Sorry, Chair...Chief, what?

MR. MURRAY: That was that bridge between Haneoo Road's two entrances, right? The one right in between that?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yes.

MR. MURRAY: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Yes, yes.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah, it was repaired.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Okay, just wanted to double check on that. Making sure that our equipment can get to where it needs to go and not traverse through a residential, very narrow kind of precarious place that has a lot of tourists and things that...

CHAIR HOKAMA: That's why we allow our Fire Department personnel to exercise citations. They're authorized to provide citations regarding clearing of the road in their ability to respond.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. As in ticketing --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, ma'am.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --since it's Police Department's...

CHAIR HOKAMA: They are authorized by law.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Didn't know that. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: They can give citations. Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Thank you, Chair. On Page 275 on the repainting of the Kahului station. I actually have seen that, the deterioration. But is it...before we were talking about the repair and maintenance guy, and so...

... (unknown audio plays) ...

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Five dollars.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: A lot of glitches going on today. But anyway, so this 200,000, that's going to cover like the scraping of the paint off? Because I know it looks very old.

MR. MURRAY: We are hoping that the 200,000 covers that. The prep and, the prep for the building before we paint it, yeah, we're hoping that...

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: When was the last time it was painted?

**BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: It was never painted. When we built that in...we opened that station in October 1, 1991. It has never been painted since.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Yeah. I know it's peeling, so --

MR. MURRAY: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: --yeah I seen that. And then also on the, down here, the 180,000, 6,000 per portable radio for 30 radios. What type of radios is, you know, like 30 of them at 6,000 each, I mean...

MR. MURRAY: Those are our 800 megahertz radios. Each one costs roughly about 6,000. It's actually about 6,300.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: That's a big-ticket item there.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah, it's a life safety issue as well.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: And what's...currently you're using the old style or what, why do we need to upgrade this?

MR. MURRAY: Those are so that we can have adequate backup that can be put into place immediately.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: So these are backup units? Are they replacing the existing radios that you have?

MR. MURRAY: Okay, we're checking for sure right now.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: Okay. These are to replace damaged radios.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Oh, that are non-functional right now.

MR. MURRAY: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay. So you have 30 of them that are no good?

MR. MURRAY: And then we also have it for damaged radios which doesn't happen very often because it costs \$6,000. Supply callback crews if need be, and outside agencies for large incidents. So for instance we utilize radios for our dozer operators that were out in Kahikinui so that we could have constant connectivity. And our backup cache has already been depleted.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay. And this will cover the entire County, the other stations that are off island?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: Yes, the whole Fire Department, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Any further questions, Members, on the expansion? Any questions on goals and objectives in this program area? Mr. White, questions in objectives and goals regarding the measurements?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: No, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Couch? Any questions, Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Oh I said no, I'm sorry.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I'm sorry, I didn't hear.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: We were wondering if you heard him.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: I said no.

CHAIR HOKAMA: You need to channel better.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: No.

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Speak into the mic.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No, thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No thanks.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Carroll, any questions, sir? Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: No, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Let me direct you then to Fire Prevention. That's on 580 of the Program Budget. Five eighty-one, excuse me.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Two eighty?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Two eight-one, excuse me. Chief, any comments you want to share regarding Fire Prevention Division?

MR. MURRAY: No.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. I'll ask the Members if they have questions. Mr. Guzman, anything at this point? Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: No, not at the moment. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Couch?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: This is on anything or just...

CHAIR HOKAMA: It's a small program area so I'm going to allow you to ask your questions in any area of the Division at this time.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. Chief, on the goals and objectives, Goal 1 and No. 2, talking about complete 100 brush and weed abatements annually. In 2015 you did 194 and you estimated 120, '16 and 2017. Do you know what your actual is so far in the 2016?

MR. MURRAY: I can get that information for you.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: And didn't we add extra money for you to do more in this area? I can't remember if we had done that.

MR. MURRAY: On the --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: I remember we talked about it a little bit.

MR. MURRAY: --brush. Yeah, we've had a lot of discussion. I don't believe anything was added to it.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. All right, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Baz?

MR. BAZ: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chair. The number of brush and weed abatement inspections completed annually or the second quarter report that was transmitted to Council in our budget implementation report was 114 year to date. Yeah so they've already exceed the 100.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Good.

MR. BAZ: So it's not like they're slowing down at all.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: No, not at all. All right, thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: No, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: No, but I, my staff sent me the list of callouts for fire in the Hana station, and in 4 years and 9 months which is I think 57 months if my math is correct, we had 61 fire callouts. So I think we would have 3 additional people out there for a little over 1 call per month. So anyway, there may be other reasons to justify the 3 Fire Fighter III positions, but 1, a little more than 1 call per month doesn't quite reach that level in my mind. So I just wanted to add that. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. Guzman?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No, but I would like to say that on Page 285, on the goal for reducing the threat of fire and property loss, I'm really happy to see that we were able to or are going to be able to increase the number of lots that are cleared. And I really wish we could move that up, but it's nice to see it's going up. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, and I had that particular goal highlighted that Ms. Baisa mentioned. And I just, I guess how does it relate to the Olowalu property? I think West Maui Land isn't clearing, and then they had gotten some kind of reimbursement through us --

MR. MURRAY: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --to clear their own land. This is their own private property, correct, that they cleared and then we gave them money for cleaning up their own property?

MR. MURRAY: No, it wasn't just for their property. They assisted us in adjacent properties through...

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: County-owned properties? Were they County?

MR. MURRAY: I think it was more than just County. I...so we basically were trying to do a mitigation situation --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Right.

MR. MURRAY: --that we had a grant process for that they already, they paid up front, and then we came back for the adjustment so that we could actually pay them. So this was through a grant process. But that was to help do firebreaks throughout that area.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Yeah, I mean I'm all for abatement, but it just kind of...I wonder why we...it should be a person's own kuleana to make sure that their own property are, you know, taken care of and deemed safe for the community as a whole. And to come back to us to help pay for their work they should be doing anyways, and I went cruising around the area that they cleared, and to me, they've piled, stockpiled the mulch or whatever they had cut, clear cut and I don't see how that's not going to catch fire. In fact, they look like they probably generate fire. 'Cause I mean composting piles generate heat.

MR. MURRAY: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And so there's just mounds of this all over the place scattered throughout, in between dry brush and what have you. So and I'm not a fire prevention person but just thought otherwise on how, I don't know, preventative it all was.

MR. MURRAY: That's a good question. So the situation was that we accepted the funding that was grant generated. So we are basically just being the entity to take the money and repay them for the work that they done, they did. So no County funds were expended, but there were resources within our Department that helped make that happen.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And that's part of this Revolving Fund that comes through our...no?

MR. MURRAY: No, the Revolving Fund is for brush abatement which is I believe \$5,000, and that's for us to hire a company for usually for that, any type of price that low you would be for in a residential area.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. And then looking at Page 282, Goal 3, No. 2. Percentage of fire investigations deemed caused by arson shows actual 19 percent of our fires are deemed arson?

MR. MURRAY: Yes.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And then I guess you're hoping that 0 are going to occur from here on out.

MR. MURRAY: That is the goal.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: But I guess whether that's realistic or not, you know, hopefully it is but judging that it's going to drop. So what happens with these types of cases? I mean is there a recourse to going to that person who purposely set something on fire and it costs the Department and yourselves time, energy and money to...how does that relate to a budget?

MR. MURRAY: Well, we work with the Police Department closely, and once it's deemed a criminal act, it's turned over to them for prosecution. And however that lays out during that process, we are very rarely within that process unless we actually go to trial, and then they'll summons our investigators to come out and...but usually...

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: No reimbursement.

MR. MURRAY: Yeah. It's turned over to Prosecutor's Office.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: So never do we ever recoup any kind of money from these, from the person, the perpetrator or whatever, the arsonist per se or cause of the fire --

MR. MURRAY: We...

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: --person?

MR. MURRAY: It's all dependent on the situation and the damage caused, what have you. Yeah, we don't know what the outcome would be. We would be remiss in trying to calculate that.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay. Okay. Thank you. Chair, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Let's see which way was I going there. Mr. Carroll, I didn't ask Mr. Carroll if you have any questions, sir? Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. One thing, Chief, I would ask for you to give us some comment under Fire Prevention is this additional 20,000 you would like for this MAPPS implementation project. Can you give us some comment regarding this project please?

MR. BAZ: Mr. Chair, I'll make that comment.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Baz?

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. BAZ: Thank you. So the MAPPS implementation team made a request through the Department of Management to assign premium pay allocations and to increase premium pay allocations throughout the different departments. And so I don't know if you've noticed it in Planning Department there was some premium pay expansion today specifically related to MAPPS. So as they, maybe when they come up, we can specifically talk in detail about it. But as they are implementing the MAPPS project, they were going to require staff to be working overtime, to do their own job and to learn the new system. And so that's why that premium pay is requested throughout the County.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We didn't request the consultant to do training and implementation during standard hours?

MR. BAZ: Well, they have to do their own job too, their regular work. So rather than...I don't know if you remember when Water Supply was thinking about or trying to replace their billing system, they wanted to hire temporary employees to do the daily work and then have their staff do the new billing system.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I remember.

MR. BAZ: The way that MAPPS wanted to do it was to not...because each person's job is specific and there's going to be a wide breadth of impact, it would be easier just to pay overtime to the people so that they can get their current job done and learn the new system.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MR. BAZ: Yeah. The...

CHAIR HOKAMA: And that's coming from Department of Management?

MR. BAZ: Yes, yeah. So when Department of Management comes up on Monday, we can discuss this item with them.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yep. 'Cause I really want to see the other side of the coin, because it seems to be costing us more than I'm going to get a benefit from. So we hope we can...they can convince us otherwise. Members, further questions for, under Fire Prevention or goals and objectives? If not, I'm going then go quickly to the Revolving Fund component. They have a few requests under Revolving Fund. Their General Fund is pretty straightforward under Fire Prevention. They do have their expansion requests on MAPPS program, turnouts request. But under the Revolving Fund, I would say the grant revenues, the one that stands out is your extraction equipment, Chief. New specialized extraction, one piece. I'm assuming every island has one extraction equipment? And is that a good understanding on this Committee's part, or only Maui has extraction equipment? This is on 7-119 under Grant Revenue for \$50,000. Vehicle extraction...specialized vehicle extraction equipment. Hang in, Members, we're almost finished.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: All right. We just got there. That would be a grant from the State highway...National Highway Transportation Safety Administration --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MR. MURRAY: --for specialized vehicle extrication equipment.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We only have, the Department has currently none or the Department currently has how many pieces of extraction equipment, Chief, would you say you have currently?

MR. MURRAY: We should have all of our units, engines, and specialized units have extrication equipment assigned to it for vehicle accidents. I'm trying to...would we be able to answer that question for you? 'Cause I don't have the details of that specific item.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, Chief. No, no, again, we would prefer you respond accurately, so if you need some time, please, we understand.

MR. MURRAY: Thank you very much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. We'll forward that. Members, further questions for the Chief under Fire Prevention and/or the Grant Revenue portion? Mr. Carroll, any questions for the Chief? Ms. Baisa?

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: No thanks.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cochran? Mr. Couch? Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: No, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: We didn't discuss the two additional Fire Fighter IIIs did we?

CHAIR HOKAMA: For which area?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Two expansion positions in Fire Prevention.

CHAIR HOKAMA: No. Chief, can you give us comments on those two position expansions?

MR. MURRAY: All right. Thank you for that opportunity.

CHAIR HOKAMA: That's two Fire Fighter IIIs I believe you're requesting, Chief.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: Yes. We are asking for two Fire Fighter IIIs. That would be our addition to our Fire Prevention Bureau as inspectors. If you look at the amount of inspections that we have, we have roughly about 6,000 commercial units that we need to inspect on an, a five-year basis. So we need more personnel to make that happen, because not only do the inspectors do inspections, they also are assigned arson investigations, public education. We have been trying to utilize our Lieutenant's position, our Fire Fighter IVs. Our Captain does investigations. There are a lot of people in that Division that are doing multiple job duties, and this would allow us at least to get our inspections done. 'Cause if we can prevent fires from happening, that would provide us cost savings on the operations side.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: At some point, can you provide us some information as to how many inspections you're behind and --

MR. MURRAY: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: --that type of thing?

MR. MURRAY: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Guzman, questions?

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: No, thanks.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Carroll, any questions, sir? Ms. Cochran? Mr. Couch? Ms. Crivello?

COUNCILMEMBER CRIVELLO: Not right now. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Further questions, Mr. White?

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Yeah. I'm looking...I just realized that those numbers are probably in your goals and objectives. But under the need to inspect 700 establishments annually, you were able to do 901 in 2015, and 194 weed abatement inspections and your goal was 100. You did 33 public schools and your goal is to conduct at least 150 fire safety presentations and you did 229. So it sounds to me like you guys are, the crew is doing one hell of a job now.

MR. MURRAY: Yes, they are.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: So you're exceeding your goals with current staffing. So I'm not...maybe you can...I don't need an answer now but if you can provide us some additional perspective on why they're able to achieve it now. Because it doesn't seem to me like we need that, the additional two guys at this point, or gals.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

MR. MURRAY: So there's a lot of overtime that we do based on the requests that come to our Division and through our Department. So a lot of these inspectors are working on the weekends quite often, and in the evenings and what have you. So we...

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Well, couldn't they be scheduled for an evening?

MR. MURRAY: I know we had that discussion last year, but they still have to do their duties in the day. So if we were to reschedule them at night, we won't get as much of those inspections done, but we would be able to provide the service for whatever the request is. So we'd have that covered, but there'll still be the inspections during the day and the follow-up that we wouldn't be able to do during the day. So about four years ago, the State Fire Council which I am a member of, which consists of the four county fire chiefs, they made a decision to change the HRS through legislation. We were mandated to inspect our facilities which would be 6,000 every 3 years, and they moved it to 5, and no department in, county department has been able to even achieve what they are responsible for on an annual basis. So that is one of the reasons for us to do the request as well.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Okay. But we're still doing 900 a year, so.

MR. MURRAY: Right. They hustle.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Thank you, Chief. Or thank you, Chief and Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. White. Members, further questions for the Chief regarding this program area? Chief, do you have any comments you'd like to share before we complete your first pass with the Committee for this year?

MR. MURRAY: No. I want to thank you and Members for having us today, and we appreciate all the questions and look forward to our next meeting. We're very, very fortunate to have the items move past Administration to you, so we're very thankful for that opportunity. I hope we fend well as we move forward, but thank you very much for your time.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. So, Members, we will be asking the Chief to return Monday so that we can finish up his Department and the last program division which would be the Ocean Safety component which is going to be something new for the Chief and us as it regards to this Department. If you have questions, additional questions you may think about, you can forward it, because again, we have not completed this Department. It will be done on Monday more than likely afternoon, and therefore if there's no further requests to the Chair or the Staff or to the Fire Department...yes, ma'am? Ms. Cochran?

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Chair, just so Monday's schedule, are there other departments we'll be reviewing besides...

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Monday, we have the Office of the Mayor, Department of Management. We will finish Fire, and then we will have Parks and Recreation. So it'll be kind of a long day also.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. But I appreciate you folks working with me, because I know you will have great demand of your time and energy tomorrow.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: And Monday, we'll be accepting testimony?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Oh yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Oh yes. We will be taking testimony. We're going...I'm going to adjourn this meeting so it'll be --

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Adjourn, okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --a brand new meeting on Monday too for testimony.

COUNCILMEMBER COCHRAN: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Yes, ma'am?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR HOKAMA: Oh, Members, do your best or at your site, I gotta do a better job at this site, but we do have two Council meetings tomorrow and one Committee of the Whole.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Three special meetings.

VICE-CHAIR WHITE: Two.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Two.

COUNCILMEMBER BAISA: Two.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Two special meetings.

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, we have one Council meeting and one special Council meeting.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: We have to . . .*(inaudible)*. . . We recess...we end the one Council meeting and start a new one. Yeah.

BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 31, 2016

CHAIR HOKAMA: Oh yeah, yeah you're correct. You're correct. I'm sorry about that. It's one-and-a-half meeting and then --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Yeah.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --Council . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Mr. Baz, you have anything you wish to add before we adjourn?

MR. BAZ: No, thank you, Mr. Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much, Members, for your perseverance. We are going to adjourn this meeting. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

ACTION: DEFER pending further discussion.

ADJOURN: 6:42 p.m.

APPROVED:



RIKI HOKAMA, Chair
Budget and Finance Committee

bf:min:160331:ds

Transcribed by: Daniel Schoenbeck

**BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

March 31, 2016

CERTIFICATE

I, Daniel Schoenbeck, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 20th day of April, 2016, in Kula, Hawaii



Daniel Schoenbeck