

**CULTURAL RESOURCES COMMISSION
SITE INSPECTION
MAY 5, 2005**

A. CALL TO ORDER

The Cultural Resources Commission, consultants, and members of the public assembled at the Ukumehame Beach Park at 9:00 a.m.

A quorum of the Commission was present. (See Record of Attendance.)

Cultural Resources Planner, Dawn Duensing, called the meeting order. The election of a temporary chair took place and Commissioner Dorothy Pyle nominated Samuel Kalalau to serve as temporary chair, seconded by Commissioner Perry Artates, and the vote was unanimous that Commissioner Kalalau serve as the temporary chair for the May 5, 2005 site inspection.

Rory Frampton from Chris Hart & Partners, consultant, gave an overview of the historic sites to be visited. The sites will include: a stop at the Ukumehame Heiau to get a perspective of the valley and what's on the other side of the valley; go into the valley to view some of the old taro lo'i and some of the sites in the valley; and, time permitting, come back down the stream, cross the stream, and then go up on the other side to view the Hiki'i Heiau.

Commissioner Pyle requested a map showing the sites to be visited as it relates to the proposed subdivision.

Mr. Hugh Starr noted that once they got to the Ukumehame Heiau, they would be able to orient the group as to the location of the historic sites and the proposed subdivision.

Mr. Hal Hammett, Cultural Surveys Hawaii, distributed and explained a handout depicting the historic sites on the proposed Ukumehame Subdivision property.

Commissioner Pyle inquired whether the sites listed in the handout were all the sites that the Cultural Resources Commission agreed were valuable sites at the time, six or seven years ago. Mr. Hammett noted that the sites listed were only the sites that were picked, due to accessibility, to be visited during the site inspection.

Public testimony was entertained but there was no testimony.

At 9:15 a.m. the group disbanded and moved on to the first site.

B. SITE INSPECTION

1. EMBARK ON VISITS TO ARCHAEOLOGICAL AND HISTORIC SITES IN THE PROPOSED UKUMEHAME SUBDIVISION, PHASE I AND II

At 9:45 a.m., the group reassembled at the Ukumehame Heiau site and Mr. Frampton gave an overview of the proposed subdivision and its status in terms of the process.

He noted that the subdivision is a 45-lot agricultural subdivision and there are two additional lots being created, totaling a hundred acres, that the County has agreed to purchase to be used to relocate the highway and to provide for a coastal park. As part of the purchase and sale agreement between the partners of the proposed subdivision and the County, it was stipulated that the proposed subdivision had to go through an SMA and an Environmental Assessment even though the SMA line is down along the highway of the proposed project, but because the two access points touch the SMA boundary, the County required the whole proposed subdivision to go through the SMA process and an Environmental Assessment process. The deadline for the completion of the SMA and Environment Assessment process is July 15, 2005, per the purchase and sale agreement.

Mr. Frampton also noted that in terms of the archaeological survey, it was accepted by the State in 1999. There was a Preservation Plan, which established buffers on 10 archaeological sites, and that was accepted by the State of Hawaii sometime in 1999. And, in addition, there was a Burial Treatment Plan for an additional five sites, one of which was covered in both reports, so there is a total of 14 sites being preserved, and that plan was accepted as well.

Mr. Frampton mentioned that, at the last meeting, it was suggested that more information was collected, more oral history, and combine the oral history with archaeological history and do more work so that the people who purchase the property would have a better understanding of the special uniqueness of the place; they'd know what's important about the place; they'd know about the history of the valley; they'd know about the people from the area and the families that are still there. He noted that he and Donna Clayton, Pacific Rim Lands, thought it was a good suggestion that the research wouldn't be stopped but that, once they receive their permits, they would continue to try to get more information. He also noted that after meeting with the partners, Mr. Steve Goodfellow said that he was doing exactly that, taking that same approach, and he's been discussing it with Commissioner Kapu on other projects on the west side, and that Kamehameha Schools have been doing that also. So Mr. Frampton stated that they are very committed to doing additional work beyond the SMA permit where they would go do additional oral history, compile it with archaeological history, and sort of try to produce a document that can be an information document, not only for the purchasers of the lot, but it could also be filed at the Bailey House or Hamilton Library, or something like that, for public review.

Mr. Hugh Starr shared his knowledge of the valley. He noted that most of the land commission awards of kuleanas are actually from a certain point to back into the valley. Most of the land on the outside was konohiki lands but that there was one very big land commission award that came out of the valley and went down to the sea, approximately 80 acres, that was awarded to John Kanaina who was taking care of one of the ali`i and the land was awarded to him. Mr. Starr pointed out where there were once lo`i which was watered by ancient auwai. He also pointed out where there appeared to be five or six little kuleanas down in the valley. Mr. Starr stated that the rest of the land, with some exceptions along the river corridor, was not farmed. He also stated that most of the land commission awards were for lo`i.

Commissioner Pyle asked if Mr. Starr remembered how many land awards were given and Mr. Starr replied that his guess would be about 20.

Commissioner Pyle asked if those land commission awards were bought/purchased by what was Pioneer Mill. Mr. Starr stated that, no, and that Pioneer Mill appears to have bought a lot of them but that he thinks that they are in the valley but that he doesn't think it's ever been fully established exactly who owned all of the kuleana there. He noted that because most of the kuleana is not part of the proposed subdivision, the title issues have not been established. Mr. Frampton noted that any of those old kuleana that do have uncertainty with regards to title are labeled as exclusions and are not part of the proposed subdivision. He also noted that there are some exclusions that are in the valley and that they are committed to maintaining the existing access to those kuleanas.

Mr. Starr introduced Addie and Vincent Rodrigues, who had joined the group, and mentioned that they were from the valley.

Mr. Hammett, at this time, pointed out some of the major landmarks of Ukumehame Valley. He noted that most of the archaeological sites are concentrated pretty close to this valley and that Ukumehame Valley is one of the four major valleys on the way to Lahaina that was used for taro lo`i. In this particular valley, the taro was spread out as the valley is spread out. He also noted that the landscape of the valley was dramatically modified by the sugar company but that they assumed, at one time, like over a hundred years ago, that there were taro lo`i fed by auwai that came out of both sides of the valley.

Mr. Hammett pointed out the Ukumehame Heiau. He noted that they have identified graves inside the enclosure; also some platforms, paved platforms, at the southeast end that they have identified as graves. He also noted that the site was also included in the Burial Treatment Plan as a burial site even though it is a heiau.

Mr. Hammett pointed out the Hiki`i Heiau located across the ridge. And just above the heiau, right on the cliff, he pointed out where there is a series of very dramatic petroglyphs

with some very unique motifs. He mentioned that they have determined in the survey that there are many, many more petroglyphs than were ever observed before.

Mr. Hammet pointed to another site, which was identified by William Waiohu, of the Burial Council, that is a pile of rocks and rubble that was moved by the sugar company but identified as a burial site by Mr. Waiohu.

Mr. Hammet mentioned to the group that as they go up into the valley, they will see some of the taro fields that have been restored and are presently in taro. Also, they have identified many more terraces that are now abandoned, ancient terraces, that go up the valley. And further up the valley, there are more restored lo`i. They also have habitation sites, small ones, on the ridges and that there is one at the very far eastern end of the proposed subdivision, right on the edge, and, as part of that complex, there's a series of four structures and part of it is outside the boundary or straddles the boundary of the proposed subdivision.

Mr. Hammet also mentioned that the site with a platform with a chain around it was identified as the Lindsey family burial site, which is part of the river corridor lot, and that the burials there date back to the '30's, and that the Lindsey family cares for that site.

Commissioner Kapu asked how big the buffer zone was for the Ukumehame Heiau that was established by the Burial Council when the proposed subdivision was brought before them. Mr. Frampton responded 100 feet around the Ukumehame Heiau. Mr. Hammet noted that every site has a slightly different configuration for buffer zones. Commissioner Pyle inquired whether the auwai is included in the buffer zone, and Mr. Frampton responded that, as far he can see, it goes through the buffer zone and that it is slated as its own site slated for preservation although there is a provision that says it can be crossed or bridged as long as the whole thing is not destroyed. Commissioner Pyle mentioned that it would make sense to include the auwai in the buffer zone because of its close proximity to the heiau. Mr. Frampton informed Commissioner Pyle that, in order to do that, the buffer zone would have to be extended and, to do that, the Preservation Plan would have to be revised to amend the buffer zone. Mr. Frampton was uncertain on how to do that since the Preservation Plan had already been accepted by the State Historic Preservation Division.

Mr. Hammet explained what will be seen as the group moves to its next site. He mentioned that there will be two reservoirs that the plantation built in the '30's. Before the reservoir, they would see the site occupied by Paul Fujishiro. Behind a reservoir, there will be lo`i which the Lindsey family is cultivating. The group could also hike and see original lo`i in the grass and in the kiawe trees. And at the end of the road, they would see the land being taken care of Addie and Vincent Rodrigues, approximately 3 acres of lo`i land. And that would be the end of the proposed subdivision area.

At 10:15 a.m., the group disbanded and moved on to the next site.

At 10:30 a.m., the group reassembled at the lo'i site behind the reservoir. Mr. Starr noted that the lo'i is being tended by the Lindsey family. From here, the group hiked up the road into the valley and Mr. Starr pointed out the main auwai and an ancient auwai, and Addie and Vincent Rodrigues property, which is a separate parcel outside of the proposed project. At the end of the road, there was the main water intake, and this was the end of property for the proposed subdivision. Mr. Starr explained that the property mauka of the proposed subdivision is owned by the State of Hawaii.

The group then hiked back down the road, assembled, and then drove back down to the bottom of the valley. The group reassembled, however, Commissioner Rotunno-Hazuka and Commissioner Pyle were excused from the site inspection; therefore, at 11:15 a.m., the site inspection was adjourned at this time due to lack of quorum.

Respectfully submitted by,

SUZETTE L. ESMERALDA
Secretary to Boards and Commissions I

RECORD OF ATTENDANCE

Present

Samuel Kalalau, III, Temporary Chair
Keeaumoku Kapu
Lisa Rotunno-Hazuka
Perry Artates
Deldrine Kapuni

Excused

Lon Whelchel
Nani Watanabe
Kalei Moikeha

Others

Dawn Duensing, Planning Staff
James Giroux, Deputy Corporation Counsel