

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27

**MAUI PLANNING COMMISSION  
PORTION OF THE REGULAR MINUTES  
ITEM B.1  
NOVEMBER 13, 2018**

7 The first item is a Community Plan Amendment for Single Family to Public/Quasi-Public for  
8 approximately 0.3 acres and then there's a Change in Zoning for an R-1, Residential to P-2,  
9 Quasi-Public Quasi District for 0.3 acres and for the remaining 14 acres of the parcel. Paul Fasi  
10 is our Staff Planner today.

11  
12 **B. PUBLIC HEARINGS** (Action to be taken after each public hearing.)

- 13  
14 1. **MS. MICHELE MCLEAN, Planning Director, transmitting Council Resolution**  
15 **No. 18-24 referring to the Maui Planning Commission proposed bills to**  
16 **amend the Wailuku-Kahului Community Plan and land use map and to**  
17 **change the zoning for the Saint Anthony Church and Schools property**  
18 **located on Lower Main Street, TMK: (2) 3-4-019: 003 and 3-4-018: 106,**  
19 **Wailuku, Island of Maui. (CPA 2018/0003) (CIZ 2018/0003) (P. Fasi)**
- 20  
21 a. **Community Plan Amendment Single-Family to Public/Quasi-Public**  
22 **for TMK: (2) 3-4-018: 106 (approximately 0.3 acre)**
- 23  
24 b. **Zoning change from R-1 Residential District to P-2 Public/Quasi-**  
25 **Public District for TMKs: (2) 3-4-019: 003 (approximately 0.3 acres)**  
26 **and (2) 3-4-018: 106 (approximately 14 acres)**

27  
28 Mr. Paul Fasi: Good morning Commissioners, good morning members of the public. This matter  
29 arises from a County Council initiated land use entitlement change for the St. Anthony Church  
30 and School properties in Wailuku. There's a Council Resolution which consists of two proposed  
31 draft bills. They are number one, a bill for an ordinance to amend the Wailuku-Kahului Community  
32 and land use map from Single-Family to Public/Quasi-Public for property situated at Lower Main  
33 Wailuku, Maui, Hawaii TMK: (2) 3-4-018: 106. The second draft bill ordinance is a bill for an  
34 ordinance to change the zoning from R-1, Residential District to P-2, Public/Quasi-Public District  
35 for property situated at Lower Main Street, Wailuku, Maui, Hawaii, TMK: (2) 3-4-019: 0003 and  
36 106.

37  
38 Before I get into the government regulatory requirements I'm gonna be very brief. Jordan Hart is  
39 here from Chris Hart and Partners he's got a short five or ten-minute presentation. Hopefully I  
40 won't be too repetitive. I have a feeling that what he says basically is going to be what I'm going  
41 to be saying right now.

42  
43 So we've got two proposed draft bill ordinances. If approved, these changes would result in  
44 proposed land use designations being consistent with the existing and traditional uses of the  
45 property and allow for future expansion and development of the school. This is a simple change  
46 in zoning and community plan amendment. There is no development being proposed. The  
47 purpose of this today is to make recommendations and then it will move onto the County Council.

1 The school cannot do any modifications or improvements unless these zoning requirements are  
2 in alignment.

3  
4 The school is comprised of two parcels. One's 14 acres, 14.6 and the other one is 0.3. It's got  
5 some funny zoning in here. Parcel 0003 which is 14 acres the Wailuku-Kahului Community Plan  
6 is Public/Quasi-Public so there's no change to that. However, on Parcel 106, the 0.3, the smaller  
7 parcel, the community plan designation is Single-Family and so we want to move that in the  
8 Public/Quasi-Public. On the County Zoning, Parcel 003, the 14-acre parcel is R-1 Residential.  
9 We want to move that into P2, Public/Quasi-Public. Parcel 106, the 0.3 has a community plan  
10 amendment and a change in zoning. The County Zoning, R-1 Residential we want to move that  
11 into P2, Public Quasi-Public.

12  
13 As far as land use regulations, on the State Countywide Policy Plan, Maui Island Plan, Wailuku-  
14 Kahului Community Plan should you make the recommendations without changes everything will  
15 be in alignment? We can send it up to the Council and the school can move on with their business  
16 for future improvements.

17  
18 So the proposed action today will result in the zoning designations being consistent with the  
19 community land use map and current uses of the property. So basically we want to get rid of the  
20 residential component on the two parcels and move it into Public/Quasi-Public.

21  
22 That will conclude the Department's presentation. Do you have any questions for the  
23 Department? If not, I'm gonna turn it over to Jordan and he can make a small presentation.  
24 Thank you.

25  
26 Mr. Robinson: Thank you Paul.

27  
28 Mr. Jordan Hart: Thank you very much Paul. Good morning Chair and Members. My name is  
29 Jordan Hart of Chris Hart and Partners.

30  
31 Mr. Robinson: Good morning Jordan.

32  
33 Mr. Hart: We're land use planners assisting St. Anthony's in this process. This is Council initiated  
34 community plan amendment and change in zoning but we're just here to provide background  
35 information to facilitate.

36  
37 The project site I believe everyone's familiar with where St. Anthony's is on Lower Main Street.  
38 These are the TMK maps. So there's the primary parcel, Parcel 003, it's 14 acres in size and  
39 then there's a...the corner right here, these are on two different TMK maps but they abut each  
40 other, is Parcel 106 which 0.3 acres. This is an aerial photograph of the church and school.

1 Church buildings are primarily on the north end and then the school buildings are in the central  
2 area, football field and then this is the additional parcel.

3  
4 Some significant buildings. The church was built in 1980. The previous church was built in 1873.  
5 The church was destroyed in 1977 in a fire. Damien Hall was built in 1925. Chaminade Hall was  
6 built in 1925. Maryknoll Hall in 1940, and the convent here was built in 1949.

7  
8 Community plan map, so the church parcel is Public/Quasi-Public...the primary parcel is  
9 Public/Quasi-Public, but one parcel is community planned Single-Family. Public/Quasi-Public are  
10 uses that are consistent with churches and schools. This is the zoning map...one thing I want to  
11 say about community plans as well is community plans are generally treated as future proposed  
12 zoning so it would have been anticipated that this parcel ultimately become Public/Quasi-Public  
13 but the zoning for both parcels is Single-Family, R-1. Both parcels are outside of the flood zone.  
14 Well, they're in Flood Zone X which is the area minimal flooding hazard. Paul went through the  
15 parcels and the designation changes. Basically both parcels are going to P-2 Public/Quasi-Public  
16 zoning and the small parcel is going to Public/Quasi-Public community plan designation. These  
17 are consistent with the uses that have been occurring at the site since 1848.

18  
19 In 2016, St. Anthony's completed a master plan for the redevelopment and enhancement of the  
20 church and school, primarily the school. As part of the recommendations in that master plan it  
21 was advised that the community plan...that the land use designations be cleaned up in order to  
22 facilitate renovation and enhancement of any church buildings as well as school buildings that are  
23 proposed. One critical item that the school is lacking is a gym. They'll require the height that is  
24 permitted under P-2, Public/Quasi-Public in order to do that gym. And so that's a critical need of  
25 the school.

26  
27 So in summary, you know this church and school had been in this community since the 1800's,  
28 1840 and you know, it's no change of anything except bringing the land use designations  
29 consistent with the actual use. Thank you.

30  
31 Mr. Robinson: Thank you Jordan. At this time, we'd like to open the floor for public testimony.  
32 And if anybody was there during the construction please step forward. First, Mr. Frampton.

33  
34 Mr. Rory Frampton: Good morning Chair. I wasn't there during the construction although it seems  
35 like a long time ago. My name is Rory Frampton. Seems like a long time ago, but I did graduate  
36 from St. Anthony High School. I'm currently on the Board of Directors. Yeah, Trojans and Joe  
37 Alueta too was a proud alumni and there's probably other people in the room or possibly on the  
38 commission.

39  
40 Mr. Robinson: You have two minutes left sir.

41

1 Mr. Frampton: Thank you. I can conclude in two minutes. I just want to thank the Commission  
2 for hearing this matter. Thank the Department for moving this matter along. Historically you know  
3 when the church and school were established there was no zoning on Maui. In the 1950's when  
4 they adopted zoning for Maui there was no Public/Quasi-Public District. It was just residential in  
5 which you allowed schools, churches and preschools were considered special uses. But of  
6 course, because the school and the preschool and the church were preexisting they were  
7 considered nonconforming uses...or well, the church and the preschool are nonconforming uses.  
8 The school is an allowed use in Residential. In the mid-80s they adopted Public/Quasi-Public  
9 Districts which would allow for schools and churches and preschools and that type of stuff. So  
10 this is really just bringing the current zoning up to date with the way we have our zoning on the  
11 books for Maui County now. So we humbly ask for your support to move this along.

12  
13 Mr. Robinson: Thank you. Any questions from the Commission? Seeing none, thank you. Next  
14 we have Tim, I'm sorry...

15  
16 Mr. Tim Cullen: I was a left-hander in Catholic School so my writing's never been great.

17  
18 Mr. Robinson: Aloha, please introduce yourself. You have three minutes Tim.

19  
20 Mr. Cullen: Aloha, my name's Tim Cullen. I'm the head of the school for St. Anthony School. I  
21 graduated the same year as Rory just different school miles away. But I've been here over a year  
22 and I need to share with you thank yous from both the parish and the school. The last couple  
23 years a lot of people have put love, effort and money into the school system. We're now K-12  
24 school system. We reconfigured. This is our second year as that. But internally everything that  
25 could be done has been done from every classroom being air-conditioned to new doors to  
26 technology infrastructure. The master plan that has been shared, the overview of it, that plan is  
27 a long range plan but as you know you can have a long range plan but then you have to put the  
28 work and effort into it to make it happen. So this is a step that allows us to move forward with  
29 more external things. Things that fit St. Anthony and obviously help our students, help the parish.  
30 So I also want to echo that I thank you for your time. I understand this is a volunteer group and  
31 so I appreciate that from communities I grew up in I understand that and I know that's giving back  
32 to the community and that's what we want each of our St. Anthony grads to do also. So thank  
33 you for your time. This does allow us to take future steps to kind of build a future for our students  
34 and our staff and the parish by having on site access to things that right now they have to travel  
35 throughout the community and fight for treasured valued space with gyms and other things. So  
36 your support is again appreciated and thank you.

37  
38 Mr. Robinson: Thank you Tim. Any questions? Thank you. Next Gary Passon. Is it Passon?

39  
40 Mr. Gary Passon: Passon. But we take Passon, all sorts of kinds. Good morning Commissioners.  
41 These will be very brief comments. Hi my name is Gary Passon. I'm on the board of St. Anthony

1 School and on the Facilities Committee and we just wanted to express our great appreciation to  
2 the Maui Planning Department for their effort to promptly move through this process and help us  
3 be able to move onto the next phase of expanding the school. So we just wanted to say thank  
4 you them and to the Council for their, for their making this opportunity available to us and to our  
5 partners, Chris Hart and Partners and all the folks that have worked so diligently to make this  
6 thing happen. So thank you and we're hopeful for a positive result today. Thank you.

7  
8 Mr. Robinson: Thank you Gary. Any questions? Seeing none, can we have the Department's  
9 recommendation please?

10  
11 Mr. Fasi: The Community Plan Amendment is to reclassify the project's area community plan  
12 designation from Single-Family to Public/Quasi-Public. The change in zoning is to reclassify the  
13 zoning district from R-1, Residential to P-2, Public/Quasi-Public. The applicant's proposed  
14 actions are consistent and supported by both the change in zoning and community plan  
15 amendment criteria. Therefore, the Maui Planning Department recommend to the Maui Planning  
16 Commission that it recommends to the Maui County Council approval of both bills without  
17 modification. Thank you.

18  
19 Mr. Robinson: Thank you. Commissioners at this time we have any questions for Jordan?  
20 Seeing none, I have one question Jordan just about the gym is when the construction for the gym  
21 does the permit come out and then notice comes out or is there no notice needed for the height  
22 of the gym?

23  
24 Mr. Hart: Hypothetically if we didn't get these change in zoning and community plan amendment  
25 we'd have to do a variance in order to do the gym and the Department hasn't been very supportive  
26 of proactive variances. You know, proposing to do something that needs a variance you know  
27 the preferred alternative is to actually get your land use designations corrected. So after we go  
28 through these noticed hearings at the Planning Commission and we had one meeting already at  
29 the Council, we're gonna have more meetings at the Council provided we receive a  
30 recommendation for approval here. Those would be the notices to members of the community  
31 that this is happening and then after we have proper zoning you would just get building permits  
32 just like any other landowner who has correct zoning.

33  
34 Mr. Robinson: Okay, thank you. So Commissioners in front of us is we have recommendations  
35 for approval or denial. We have two topics. We have one that's an amendment and one that's  
36 it's a ordinance are changed. Does anybody see a problem with handling both at the same time?  
37 Okay, any discussion or a motion for recommendation for the Council? Commissioner Kahu Hill.

38  
39 Kahu Hill: Mahalo Chair. I just want to say it's really nice, it's just beautiful to have such a historic  
40 church and school coming before this Commission this morning and for people to go to pray and  
41 learn. Just wanted to say that's really nice coming before us. Mahalo. Honored.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39

Mr. Robinson: Do you have a motion in that?

Kahu Hill: Sure. I guess I'd like to make a motion that we approve both of these for the 14.33 acres and the 3.133 the change in zoning for R-1 to P-2 Public/Quasi-Public. Is that enough, Chair?

Mr. Robinson: Yes. Corporation Counsel.

Mr. Galazin: Yes, thank you Chair. And my suggestion would be while it's...makes a lot of logistical and practical sense to deliberate on these matters together I think the final vote should at least be done you know, one after the other so that we have a clean record for each vote. That way one could be challenged without the other having to be challenged if there is...if that ever does come up but it certainly makes sense to talk about it in your deliberations before you get to a motion to go ahead and discuss everything in total because they are, they are intertwined and that makes sense. You don't want to waste time rehashing something about the change in zoning that you already talked about in the community plan amendment. So I would encourage discussion on the them ...(inaudible)...but the motion at the very end should be first motion for the community plan amendment and then if that's approved, second motion for the change in zoning.

Kahu Hill: Chair may I restate that?

Mr. Robinson: You're fine.

Kahu Hill: Okay, good.

Mr. Robinson: Do we have a second?

Ms. La Costa: Second.

Mr. Robinson: We have a motion from P D. La Costa, P Denise La Costa. Sorry. Any discussion on the motions? Commissioner Carnicelli.

Mr. Carnicelli: Chair just as a x-altar boy and someone whose family members attended ...(inaudible)...school I'm in full support of the motion so thank you.

Mr. Robinson: Thank you. Commissioner La Costa.

1 Ms. La Costa: I too, am in support of the motion. It's basically housekeeping more than anything  
2 else. There will be no changes except they'll add a much needed recreation facility for our kids  
3 so mahalo.

4  
5 Mr. Robinson: Anyone else? I also had two kids that went there so, it's a great place. Joe, if  
6 you'd like to read number one please for the vote?

7  
8 Mr. Alueta: Thank you Mr. Chair. The first motion was to recommend adoption of the community  
9 plan amendment from Single-Family to Public/Quasi-Public for TMK: 3-4-018: 106 of  
10 approximately 0.3 acres.

11  
12 Mr. Robinson: All those in favor approval of recommendation please raise your right hand. That  
13 is seven. Thank you.

14  
15 **Community Plan Amendment**

16  
17 **It was moved by Kahu Hill, seconded by Ms. La Costa, then**

18  
19 **VOTED: To Recommend Approval of the Community Plan Amendment to the**  
20 **County Council as Recommended by the Department.**

21  
22 **(Assenting – A. Hill, P D. La Costa, L. Carnicelli, K. Pali, L. Hudson,**  
23 **C. Tackett, S. Castro)**

24 **(Excused – T. Gomes)**

25  
26 Mr. Robinson: Joe, number two.

27  
28 Mr. Alueta: There haven't been a motion.

29  
30 Mr. Robinson: I thought it was combined. I apologize, but let's go ahead.

31  
32 Mr. Carnicelli: She did combine it.

33  
34 Mr. Robinson: That's okay.

35  
36 Mr. Alueta: Oh you did.

37  
38 Kahu Hill: We did.

39  
40 Mr. Alueta: Okay, so the same people who made the same motion so the next one is for a change  
41 in zoning from R-1, Residential District to P-2, Public/Quasi-Public for TMK: 3-4-019: 003 and for  
42 3-4-018: 106 for 14 acres for recommend the change in zoning to the Maui County Council.

43

1 Mr. Robinson: All those in favor please raise your right hand. That's seven. Thank you.

2

3 **Zoning Change**

4

5 **It was moved by Kahu Hill, seconded by Ms. La Costa, then**

6

7 **VOTED: To Recommend Approval of the Zoning Change to the County Council**  
8 **as Recommended by the Department.**

9

10 **(Assenting – A. Hill, P. D. La Costa, L. Carnicelli, K. Pali, L. Hudson,**  
11 **C. Tackett, S. Castro)**

12 **(Excused – T. Gomes)**

13

14 Mr. Fasi: Thank you.

15

16 Mr. Robinson: You're welcome. We'll take a five-minute recess before our next item. Thank you.

17

18 Respectfully Submitted by,

19

20

21 CAROLYN TAKAYAMA-CORDEN

22

23 Secretary to Boards and Commissions II

24