

1

1 FIRE AND PUBLIC SAFETY COMMISSION
 2 COUNTY OF MAUI
 3
 4
 5
 6
 7 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
 8 REGULAR MEETING
 9
 10
 11
 12
 13 Held at Maui Fire Department Prevention Bureau, 313
 14 Manea Place, Wailuku, Hawaii, commencing at 9:00 a.m., on
 15 December 19, 2019.
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20 REPORTED BY: SANDRA J. GRAN, RPR/CSR #424
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

3

1 (December 19, 2019, 9:00 a.m.)
 2 CHAIR MISAKI: I would like to call this fire and
 3 public safety commission meeting on this Thursday, December
 4 9th, 2019, at the fire prevention bureau on Maui.
 5 Before I do a roll call, I just want you guys to
 6 know, because we don't have a court reporter, this meeting is
 7 going to be way more formalized. So simple things like when
 8 you ask a question, you need to raise your hand and I'll
 9 acknowledge you, then you can state your name and say a
 10 question. When we do voting, I'll ask for yes and you guys
 11 raise your hand and I'll call out your name and your vote so
 12 that it's all recorded, yeah. So thanks for your patience.
 13 So I want to do roll call.
 14 Kyle Ginoza.
 15 VICE CHAIR GINOZA: Here.
 16 CHAIR MISAKI: Linda Fernandez.
 17 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Here.
 18 CHAIR MISAKI: Jack Freitas.
 19 (No response.)
 20 CHAIR MISAKI: Jack's not here.
 21 Travis Tancayo.
 22 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Here.
 23 CHAIR MISAKI: Gregg Lundberg.
 24 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Here.
 25 CHAIR MISAKI: Dwight Burns.
 RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

2

1 ATTENDANCE
 2 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:
 3 Edwin Misaki, Chair
 4 Kyle Ginoza, Vice-Chair
 5 Linda Fernandez, Member
 6 Jack Freitas, Member (in at 9:04 a.m.)
 7 Travis Tancayo, Member
 8 Gregg Lundberg, Member
 9 Dwight Burns, Member
 10 Lisa Vares, Member
 11 Donna Sterling, Member
 12
 13
 14 STAFF:
 15 Bradford Ventura, Deputy Fire Chief
 16 Richard Kawasaki, Assistant Fire Chief
 17 Jennifer Oana, Deputy Corporation Counsel
 18 Richelle Wakamatsu, Commission Secretary
 19 Herman Andaya, Maui Emergency Management Agency
 20 Jamie Adams, Administration Assistant
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

4

1 MEMBER BURNS: Here.
 2 CHAIR MISAKI: Lisa Vares.
 3 COMMISSIONER VARES: Here.
 4 CHAIR MISAKI: And Donna Sterling.
 5 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Here.
 6 CHAIR MISAKI: Almost perfect attendance. And I'm
 7 the chair and I'm here.
 8 MS. OANA: And you're Edwin Misaki, for the record.
 9 CHAIR MISAKI: Yes.
 10 (Laughter.)
 11 CHAIR MISAKI: I'd like to call for the approval of
 12 the minutes. And if you do make a motion or second, please
 13 state your name.
 14 COMMISSIONER VARES: Lisa Vares moves.
 15 COMMISSIONER BURNS: Dwight Burns. Second.
 16 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay. It's been moved and seconded
 17 by Lisa and -- and Dwight that the minutes from the last
 18 meeting are approved. All in favor, raise your hand.
 19 Kyle, yes; Dwight, yes; Donna, yes; Linda, yes;
 20 Lisa, yes; Gregg, yes; and Travis, yes. There are no noes.
 21 And I'm not going to vote unless there needs to be a
 22 tiebreaker, yeah. Thank you.
 23 Is there any public testimony today?
 24 (No response.)
 25 CHAIR MISAKI: None. Thank you.
 RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 I would like to call on Mr. Herman Andaya for his
 2 MEMA report.
 3 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Mr. Chair, Members of the
 4 Commission. You have my report in front of you. I'll just
 5 quickly summarize what I have here. I attended the November
 6 meeting of -- on Oahu we had the administrative meeting and
 7 this is all the administrators from the various counties as
 8 well as for the state and we meet on a quarterly basis, so we
 9 just had that this past November.

10 We also had what's called the Hawaii Emergency
 11 Preparedness Executive Committee and these are emergency
 12 managers from various agencies -- federal, state, local -- and
 13 we meet on Oahu as well and we discuss various topics
 14 regarding emergency management.

15 We also -- I also attended the Hawaii Advisory
 16 Counsel Emergency Management Meeting, otherwise known as
 17 HACEM, and that's an advisory board to the governor. And so
 18 we meet -- we meet with them on a quarterly basis as well.

19 Let's see. We have a couple trainings that we've
 20 been -- we're planning for. We have, one, a hurricane
 21 exercise, a state hurricane exercise known as Makani Pahili,
 22 that's coming up and so we're already meeting with the state
 23 regarding that.

24 As well as another exercise that we do every year
 25 with the National Guard, the Hawaii National Guard, that's

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 known as the Hawaii -- the Civil Support Team, and so we work
 2 with the fire department on that as well as the police and we
 3 do this -- this large exercise. And there's -- oftentimes
 4 there's like photos on the people participating because
 5 it's -- it's an actual exercise. We have guys wearing haz.
 6 mat. suits and, of course, doing various activities. And it's
 7 really helpful with the fire department, especially haz. mat.,
 8 because it allows them to work with the -- kind of the haz.
 9 mat. team from Hawaii National Guard and so they kind of share
 10 information about how to deal with certain things and various
 11 scenarios.

12 Another thing I want to mention, it's not in my
 13 report here, but we're starting to update our hazard
 14 mitigation plan and so we'll be going to various communities.
 15 We're taking a different approach to this plan, we want to get
 16 community input, especially at the various -- like the remote
 17 areas, remote communities, because they -- they know more
 18 about -- about their area more than any consultant from the
 19 mainland would know. And so we'll be having meetings on
 20 Molokai, Lanai, Hana, in those places and meeting with people
 21 there and just getting information about the kinds of hazards,
 22 hazards and threats that they have in their communities,
 23 respective communities, and how is it that they're able to
 24 deal with that.

25 That's all I have, Mr. Chair.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Chair.
 2 CHAIR MISAKI: Lisa.
 3 COMMISSIONER STERLING: One comment.
 4 CHAIR MISAKI: I mean --
 5 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Donna.
 6 CHAIR MISAKI: Donna. Go ahead, Donna.
 7 COMMISSIONER STERLING: When you do reach out to the
 8 rural areas like you just mentioned, could you possibly
 9 include Kahikinui for the backside?

10 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Kahikinui?
 11 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Yes.
 12 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Okay.
 13 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Possibly for -- from Hana to
 14 Kahikinui-Kaupo, that area we were shut off for two years by
 15 road -- '06, was the --

16 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: The earthquake.
 17 COMMISSIONER STERLING: -- earthquake.
 18 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Yeah.
 19 COMMISSIONER STERLING: So that's a concern.

20 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Yeah.
 21 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Thank you.
 22 CHAIR MISAKI: Thank you.
 23 Dwight, you have a question?
 24 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Gregg.
 25 CHAIR MISAKI: I mean, Gregg. Sorry.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: I'll answer to anybody you
 2 wanna name.
 3 (Laughter.)
 4 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: The sirens, I noticed your
 5 comment on the sirens that of 74 sirens, 58 sounded, on the
 6 back. I know that's not us, that's the state, but there's
 7 gotta be tremendous liability if there was ever, God forbid, a
 8 need for those sirens to go off and we've known about them for
 9 not doing that, there's gotta be -- there's gotta be liability
 10 somewhere.

11 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: So we report -- we report to
 12 the state -- you're correct, Commissioner, that it is the
 13 state that's responsible for maintaining those sirens. We can
 14 only do so much. You know, we tell them that it's --
 15 (Commissioner Freitas entered the room.)

16 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: The siren is not -- it's not
 17 sounding. Sometimes there's times where they're telling us,
 18 Well, our -- our system shows that it's sounding, you know,
 19 that because we're not -- it's in a remote area, so no one's
 20 there to hear it to see if it's actually sounding.

21 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: So should we send a note, a
 22 letter as a commission to the governor, should we send -- you
 23 know, what is your recommendation on what we should do?

24 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: You can -- you can certainly
 25 do that, that would help.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Okay.
 2 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: But, you know, we -- we've
 3 even asked that, Maybe you should have one person on the
 4 island, you know, so you should have a state employee on the
 5 island, 'cause, you know, there are -- there are a lot of
 6 maintenance involved with these, with these sirens, and so --
 7 but they do -- they do send people over quite a bit, but, you
 8 know, I mean, it's apparently not enough. So that's something
 9 we've asked for in the past as well, Why don't you send
 10 someone down here. Yeah, so...
 11 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Thank you. I understand the
 12 position you're in and it's not really your responsibility,
 13 but it is our responsibility as Maui residents to take care of
 14 our own.
 15 Mr. Chair, I don't know if this is the right time or
 16 not, but I would like to propose -- or make a motion that a
 17 letter is drafted and sent from the police -- from the fire
 18 commission --
 19 MS. OANA: Excuse me, Mr. Chair.
 20 So you guys are the advisors to the fire chief and,
 21 by extension, to Mr. Andaya, so a letter from the commission
 22 to the governor or an outside agency would not be within your
 23 authority. So you can make suggestions to the county people,
 24 but not outside authorities.
 25 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Gotta rethink strategy,
 RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 then.
 2 MS. OANA: And so if -- your letter would be to
 3 Mr. Andaya to please request that the state do this, you know,
 4 if you want to kind of write up a letter to him. And then he
 5 might forward it or whatever.
 6 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Forward it. Okay.
 7 MS. OANA: But our communication paths are directly
 8 to the county people.
 9 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Okay. Thank you.
 10 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Tancayo.
 11 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Just a comment, Gregg. Maybe
 12 we should look at requesting some kind of database to show
 13 what percentage and the numbers of -- you know, to show how
 14 bad it is, the situation. If we had that information and then
 15 backing it up with a letter, that might have more kick to it.
 16 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Sure.
 17 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: I don't know if we can
 18 request more information or some kind of chart that shows
 19 maybe the last two years -- year or two years, I don't know,
 20 the amount of sirens that are inactive or not -- the failure
 21 rate of them, I think that would be good. And then come back
 22 with a letter to show this is why, because for us this is
 23 unacceptable, something like that. Just a suggestion as a
 24 group maybe we should look for or request something like that.
 25 MS. OANA: So, again, requests -- your request has
 RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 to be Mr. Andaya and he can, you know, get the information, if
 2 he can, and then bring it back to you.
 3 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: So we could just -- I mean
 4 ask you to request something like that for the -- what do you
 5 guys want to go with, a couple years or something?
 6 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Two years, I think, would
 7 be --
 8 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Two years.
 9 COMMISSIONER VARES: With the locations.
 10 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: And the locations, just a
 11 flowchart that might show the failure and then we can go from
 12 there.
 13 CHAIR MISAKI: This is Chair Misaki. I have a
 14 suggestion. Maybe -- maybe, Herman, maybe you can figure out
 15 what council member can carry this message to our state
 16 representative, who can then take it to the governor. Because
 17 to me, this is a Kaloko Dam issue; right? You know, do
 18 nothing about it, then something big happens; right?
 19 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Yeah.
 20 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Okay. Well, we've -- oh,
 21 sorry. I can tell you that we've had concerns from the
 22 public, so they've come to us and said, you know, the siren
 23 hasn't worked for -- for some time now and our recommendation
 24 to them is talk to their -- to their state representative or
 25 their state senator, you know, so they can -- you know, they
 RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 can bring it up with the state agency, so we've done that as
 2 well.
 3 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay.
 4 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Yeah.
 5 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay. Commissioner Donna.
 6 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Thank you. This is Donna
 7 Sterling. About two and a half years ago I took it upon
 8 myself to request sirens for the backside of Maui from Hana to
 9 Kipahulu -- to Ulupalakua, and I started the process -- there
 10 is a process and I think we need to ask Herman if he could
 11 provide that process for new sirens in those locations only
 12 because they're backside. And what I found out about the
 13 process is you have -- I was assigned through the county
 14 council a person that would help me through the process of
 15 getting the installation and it -- yes, it is the county
 16 council and then you go to the state. Normally the sirens are
 17 on state land and that way they could get it clear, either
 18 Hawaiian Homes or the state. So I'd like to know if we could
 19 have the process of installing so we all understand the
 20 installation of a new siren backside and at the same time
 21 address the -- the inspector to go and when are you gonna
 22 hear -- you know, do the actual physical: It works, check off
 23 the box and everything. Thank you.
 24 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Chair, so is it -- is it like
 25 on the coastline or something or --
 RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Yes.
 2 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: It's on the coast land?
 3 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Yeah, yeah, yeah.
 4 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: So, I mean --
 5 COMMISSIONER STERLING: And it fizzled -- Sorry.
 6 Donna again speaking. So it fizzled because the lack of -- I
 7 couldn't get everybody from Kipahulu to Kaupo to come forward
 8 to -- to jump on board. It was a massive -- it was an
 9 attempt.
 10 CHAIR MISAKI: Thank you.
 11 Commissioner Lundberg.
 12 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Hi. Gregg Lundberg,
 13 commissioner. I'd like to request corp counsel to clarify the
 14 role of this committee -- the commission. It's my
 15 understanding that we're an advisor to the chief only.
 16 MS. OANA: So under the charter, the practice and
 17 procedure, they pretty much mirror each other, and so we've
 18 got rules, review and submit to mayor the request for the
 19 budget -- and I'll skip over 3, because I think that's what it
 20 pertains to -- receive, review, investigation any charges
 21 brought forth by the public; evaluate annually the performance
 22 of the fire chief in support of -- submit a report to the
 23 mayor, submit an annual report to the mayor and council on its
 24 activities, and such other powers and duties as may be
 25 provided by law.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 Those don't really pertain to this issue, but 3 kind
 2 of does. Review the operations of the department of fire and
 3 public safety and civil defense agency and make
 4 recommendations for changes that may be desirable to improve
 5 the performance of emergency functions and the provision of
 6 public safety services. So that's where I think this issue
 7 can fall under, you can review and make changes -- review the
 8 operation of the department of fire and safety and civil
 9 defense agency and make recommendations for changes that may
 10 be desirable to improve the performance of emergency
 11 functions. So you can make recommendations to them, that's
 12 what your authority is.
 13 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: So do our recommendations
 14 not include the governor?
 15 MS. OANA: No. You are the advisor to this
 16 department only.
 17 CHAIR MISAKI: This is Chair Misaki. So if I
 18 understand --
 19 MS. OANA: You have --
 20 CHAIR MISAKI: -- correctly, we can make
 21 recommendations to fire chief and to civil defense, that's it,
 22 but as -- but as community members, we can actually talk to
 23 our state representative --
 24 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Right.
 25 CHAIR MISAKI: -- about an issue; right?

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 MS. OANA: Oh, yeah. Not as a commission.
 2 CHAIR MISAKI: So that's where I would recommend
 3 that we get the statistics, each one of us, and we go see our
 4 representatives and, Hey, you know, with climate change, with
 5 storms, you know, this is -- this is an issue if we don't
 6 have -- if we don't have the ability to warn our public. And
 7 then if we -- if everybody goes to see their own
 8 representative, then they take it -- 'cause I think it's gonna
 9 turn out to be a budget item, right, within the state
 10 legislature to fund the people who are doing the maintenance.
 11 Right? That's what happened to Kaloko Dam, right, it wasn't
 12 getting the funding to do the right inspections. So to me,
 13 this is the same issue, so we should -- we should get that
 14 statistics and each of us individually, I would say, I would
 15 recommend that we go see our state representative.
 16 MS. OANA: Chair.
 17 CHAIR MISAKI: Jen.
 18 MS. OANA: That's a great idea and you can do that
 19 on a separate path.
 20 CHAIR MISAKI: Right.
 21 MS. OANA: But what I'm thinking is maybe we can
 22 invite someone to educate this commission about how it works
 23 and just like Donna said, kind of, you know, how does the
 24 installation, how does that even work. And then based upon
 25 all this information that you receive, someone can draft a

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 letter approved by this commission that will go to Herman or
 2 Chief with suggestion that they act on this. And it could be
 3 just, you know, you forwarding our request to the state, you
 4 know, The fire commission has opined on this and Maui County
 5 feels this is appropriate, you know.
 6 CHAIR MISAKI: This is Chair Misaki. Who would --
 7 who can we invite to lay out this process?
 8 MS. OANA: Mr. Andaya, do you know?
 9 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Someone from the state?
 10 CHAIR MISAKI: Someone from the state.
 11 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Yeah.
 12 CHAIR MISAKI: Can you identify that and bring that
 13 up next meeting?
 14 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Sure, I can.
 15 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay. Great.
 16 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Yeah.
 17 CHAIR MISAKI: Then let's -- let's leave it at that
 18 for now. In the meantime, it would still be good to get the
 19 statistics so if we want to individually go see our
 20 representative, yeah.
 21 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Okay.
 22 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Lundberg.
 23 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Given the new direction or
 24 new clarification, I would still recommend that this
 25 commission puts a letter together to Herman recommending

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 further action, 'cause I just think we want to be on record as
2 saying this is a safety issue that needs to be addressed, it's
3 been coming up for years, provide it to you as a
4 recommendation for corp counsel's direction. And I'd be happy
5 to draft -- do a draft of the letter.

6 CHAIR MISAKI: I -- the only reason I'm -- I'm not
7 agreeing is because I think we should wait till Herman figures
8 out who from the state and then they can -- once we learn the
9 process, I think we can come up with a much better letter to
10 Herman. That's just my input.

11 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: All right. I agree.

12 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay.

13 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: We'll wait. We'll wait.

14 However, with all due respect, it's not getting fixed at the
15 Maui Civil Defense level, we need to ratchet it up to some
16 extent.

17 CHAIR MISAKI: Yeah.

18 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Well, Mr. Chair, if I may. As
19 you say, with all due respect, we're doing everything we can.

20 I mean, the most that we can do is tell the state, Fix this.

21 Would you please fix this. And I've gone and I've told them,

22 Hey, this is, you know. So I've done everything that we --

23 that I can, that I can do at this point. It's not my siren.

24 If it was my siren, it would be fixed tomorrow.

25 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Understood.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.

1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813

808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: You know, so, yeah, I -- I
2 mean, that's the most that I can do at this point. If you
3 want to write a letter to me, I can write back and say, Well,
4 I've forwarded your -- you know, your concerns to the state.

5 But I think what chair is saying makes a lot of sense that
6 we -- I can bring someone in from the state. And it's good
7 for them to hear from you. Instead of just me complaining to
8 them all the time, I think it's good for them to hear from the
9 commission coming down that, you know, there's a concern here,
10 you know, so...

11 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Ginoza.

12 VICE CHAIR GINOZA: Is it an issue throughout the
13 state to the other -- your counterparts in Kauai or Big
14 Island, do they also voice the same complaints?

15 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: They have, yeah, it's the
16 same.

17 VICE CHAIR GINOZA: What happens -- so the response
18 is just like, We'll get to it whenever?

19 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: So the state is the state.

20 VICE CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

21 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: I mean, they're not -- they're
22 not as -- I think we're a little more efficient, you know,
23 doing things. Because we're a smaller entity, too; right?

24 And on top of that, I mean, money-wise, you know, they're --
25 they have some -- they have some money issues too, you know,

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.

1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813

808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 so that's kind of --

2 For us here on Maui, though, it's like -- as I've
3 said, as I've talked, as I've mentioned to this board before,
4 this commission, like the siren is really kind of a last
5 resort. I mean, if it's -- you're on the beach, you don't
6 have your phone on you, you know, then that's where the sirens
7 will come in handy. But like for us here right now in this
8 room, we won't hear the siren, you know. Where we're going to
9 get our information from is our phones, so that's where we
10 should be focusing, you know. But there's redundancy,
11 there's -- you know, we'll be getting information by phone, by
12 TV, by radio, you know, social media, for that matter. You
13 know, sirens will be -- probably be the last -- the last -- I
14 mean, our last resort, you know, so...

15 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: I've got a -- I've got --

16 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Tancayo.

17 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: I don't wanna diminish the
18 importance of the sirens because I think any time that there's
19 going to be an event, we're going to lose electricity. It may
20 be a multiple stage, this happens this day, this happens -- we
21 loose power, there's a big fire, and then all of our
22 communication is gonna anyway except for maybe the final line,
23 the sirens. So I would hate to discredit -- you know, I know
24 we use our phones and stuff, but I still think there's an
25 importance for -- you know, personally I feel it's important

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.

1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813

808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 to have the sirens, you know.

2 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Mr. Chair.

3 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: 'Cause everything's going to
4 go back to basics in multiple events that happen.

5 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Chair.

6 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Sterling.

7 COMMISSIONER STERLING: So in '06 when we had the
8 earthquake, stories came out after the earthquake there were
9 fishermen down by Kaupo, they couldn't -- and the road closed
10 more than one week, so people on the beaches backside fishing,
11 they don't always carry phones, so, you know, it's a --
12 whatever apparatus you've gotta do to get the word out
13 backside, I'm for it, yeah.

14 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Let me respond.

15 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Thank you.

16 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Mr. Chair, I -- yeah. No, I'm
17 not trying to discount the sirens, I mean, we definitely need
18 sirens. What I'm trying to say is, you know, there's a
19 redundancy. So like for people who don't have cellphones on
20 them, especially on the beach, you know, so that's where --
21 that's where we have these sirens.

22 The other thing too is, you know, the sirens is for
23 like no-notice events, primarily for no-notice-type events, so
24 in case of like a tsunami, that's where you want to get people
25 off the beach, right, and so that's where the sirens will come

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.

1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813

808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 in handy, that's the reason why you have -- most of our sirens
2 are on the coastline. That's the value, the coastline, that
3 does -- so, you know. But, yeah, I just wanted to clarify
4 that I'm not trying to discount -- I'm not trying to say that,
5 Oh, we don't need sirens. I mean, I think we need every mode
6 of communication possible if you want to communicate or alert
7 people about no notices.

8 CHAIR MISAKI: Thank you.
9 Commissioner Freitas, before I take your question, I
10 just -- we went over this before you came in. By the way,
11 Commissioner Freitas is in attendance. We have a full
12 commission today. We have to go to more formal format, as you
13 can see, because we don't have a court recorder, so... And I
14 just wanted to note that Commissioner Freitas came in at four
15 minutes after the hour, 'cause we've gotta make that note.

16 But go ahead and you can ask your question now.
17 COMMISSIONER FREITAS: Yeah. Freitas. I -- I have
18 a comment. The legislature and the house of representatives,
19 they go on recess and we have representatives and we have the
20 senators here on the island. I -- my suggestion is bring
21 them, one of them in and explain to them our concern and put
22 the monkey on their back so that they, what they call, take it
23 and run with it. Because if you're going to do anything with
24 the state, you'll be retired and they won't do it, you know.

25 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay. Commissioner Tancayo.
RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: I guess as a final comment,
2 I'll throw this out. So I guess the letter, it's always good
3 to document, time stamp the issue acknowledging that there is
4 an issue, not just coming to this meeting and, Oh, still got
5 the same issue and all that we've done. But if we do that
6 letter, it shows the importance.

7 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay. This is Commissioner Ed. Can
8 we write a letter from the commission inviting a
9 representative?

10 MS. OANA: I would see that as asking for
11 information and a way to get educated on something, so I --

12 COMMISSIONER FREITAS: Yeah.

13 MS. OANA: -- I think that would be okay.

14 CHAIR MISAKI: So would somebody like to make a
15 motion that we write six letters to six representatives and
16 see who comes at the next meeting?

17 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: I'll make a recommendation.

18 COMMISSIONER FREITAS: I'll second.

19 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Or a motion.

20 CHAIR MISAKI: A motion. Okay. This is -- this is
21 Commissioner Lundberg.

22 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Excuse me. Gregg Lundberg.

23 COMMISSIONER FREITAS: Freitas seconded.

24 CHAIR MISAKI: So what's your motion?

25 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Jack seconded it already.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 CHAIR MISAKI: So what's your motion?

2 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: My motion is that I draft a
3 letter on behalf of the commission inviting several of the
4 state representatives to come to this meeting.

5 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay. And, hopefully, Richelle can
6 draft the letter, we can send it out so that we can add to the
7 agenda before our January meeting.

8 Okay. Thank you. Can we move on to the next item?

9 MS. OANA: I'm sorry. So there was a motion by
10 Commissioner Freitas --

11 CHAIR MISAKI: No. Commissioner Lundberg.

12 MS. OANA: Second by Commissioner Freitas.

13 CHAIR MISAKI: Freitas.

14 MS. OANA: And did anybody vote?

15 CHAIR MISAKI: Oh. All those in favor, raise your
16 hand.

17 Okay. We have yes from Ginoza, Dwight Burns, Donna
18 Sterling, Donna Sterling, Linda Fernandez, Lisa Vares, Gregg
19 Lundberg, Travis Tancayo, and Jack Freitas. I should have
20 said just unanimous.

21 (Laughter.)

22 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Chair, one comment, please,
23 before we move on. Just a quick --

24 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Sterling.

25 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Thank you very much. So
RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 this is a good time because in January the legislature will be
2 convening on January twenty-something --

3 CHAIR MISAKI: Right.

4 COMMISSIONER STERLING: -- so it is a very good
5 window of opportunity to invite them. Thank you.

6 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay. Thank you.

7 Okay. So Chief Thyne is not here today, so first on
8 the fire department report is Assistant Chief Ventura.

9 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Thank you.

10 Good morning, everybody. Thank you for being here
11 on this holiday commission meeting, appreciate you guys
12 putting in the -- the full year and being here.

13 Chief Thyne apologizes for not being here, he's with
14 his family on vacation this week, so I'll be reporting out on
15 his information as well as mine.

16 But before I do, I just also wanna give word of
17 note, Chief Martin, this is his last meeting with us as well,
18 as he will be retiring in eight days, ten days or so. So
19 thank you to him for all the years of, you know, support and
20 work he's done in our department in various bureaus and --
21 we're happy to have had him.

22 And then, lastly, in the back of the room we also
23 have Jamie, she is our human resources personnel manager and
24 she is going to be doing the presentation at the end of our
25 meeting today.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 So that being said, in front of you is the report
 2 from Fire One and myself. I'll kind of go over it briefly.
 3 We meet every month with the mayor and managing director as
 4 well as other directors, talk about topics that affect each
 5 department. We have met with several of them, including
 6 budget director to go over the CIP. I went over the CIP with
 7 you guys last year in the budget -- or last month in the
 8 budget, it's our capital improvement projects, so we've been
 9 working with them on projecting out our six-year plan.

10 Makena lifeguards, every year we're faced with the
 11 same thing in getting an MOA with them, so that is in
 12 council's hands and as soon as they put it on the agenda and
 13 it's heard, it should be accepted so that we can continue to
 14 get funding from state leg. for Makena lifeguards.

15 This year we have several fire trucks on order, so
 16 we recently met with the -- our Hughes Fire, which is the rep
 17 for the fire company that we ordered from, and kind of just
 18 working out some issues and setting out some -- some trips to
 19 go look at the trucks that are being built. They're about
 20 one-third of the way done and we anticipate seeing them in
 21 February -- end of February/end of March kind of timeline.

22 The fire department has a relief association that's
 23 been around for several decades. It's in a rebuilding phase
 24 right now, so we met with them and tried to give them some
 25 guidance as to what their role is going to be with our

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 department. They're a nonprofit organization, so they have
 2 some different uses, different objectives than our department
 3 does, but they do support. So we're working with corp counsel
 4 in trying to get them whole and get them operating again.

5 Haiku Fire Station, we kind of have our hands all
 6 over that right now. We've been dealing with getting it
 7 cleaned up, getting Maui Electric out there, talking to
 8 council members, 'cause they have -- they're wanting to
 9 support it. Talking to the mayor, because Victorino wants to
 10 support it as well. So we're doing an assessment and it's
 11 becoming more active as we meet with architects and
 12 consultants as to what we can really accomplish out there.
 13 Infrastructure, there are some needs, so we're trying to kind
 14 of dig deep and see how far along we can take that project
 15 into next year.

16 And then Hawaii Fire Chief's Association was --
 17 every year we have a conference and that was about two weeks
 18 ago. It was Honolulu and it's a good training conference that
 19 we go to, networking as well as bringing in speakers from the
 20 mainland to kind of give us some trends across the nation and
 21 things we can anticipate seeing in our fire service as well.

22 And then kind of along those notes, last month I did
 23 the budget presentation for you folks and one of the questions
 24 that was asked was the money that we had put in for bulldozer
 25 operations and stuff, was that in addition to last year. And

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 I just triple-checked and it is, yes, so we put in an
 2 additional \$200,000 on top of the \$100,000 that we got this
 3 year, so that was about 300 -- 290,000 is what we're asking
 4 for this year for our dozer/water tankers with private
 5 companies that support us. And that's based off of this
 6 year's numbers and, you know, we -- we cannot tell the future,
 7 but we should be prepared for whatever we're faced with in
 8 this year.

9 Yes, Trav.

10 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: This is Commissioner Tancayo.
 11 Does that include -- can you guys use that money for training
 12 too?

13 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Not that particular money.

14 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Oh, only --

15 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Yes.

16 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Only active fire?

17 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Yes, yeah. So it's -- the
 18 way it's written into our budget is contract equipment for
 19 emergency operations, from what I understand, so that would be
 20 water tankers, bulldozers, front-end loaders, other aircraft
 21 from other private companies that are not contracted out by
 22 us, that would be other equipment that we have to contract out
 23 for emergencies.

24 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Commissioner Tancayo again.
 25 So does it -- does that -- do you guys have budgeting

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 available for training with those agencies or contractors, is
 2 that -- is there money available to do such things as training
 3 with the --

4 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Yeah.

5 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: -- different agencies?

6 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: So we did it about two months
 7 ago, we held a bulldozer class. We do have a training budget,
 8 so in our training budget, we can bring in instructors and we
 9 can pay for equipment. And so what we did was the class that
 10 we did a couple of months ago was a bulldozer class, we
 11 invited all of our contracted people, every private company,
 12 public works to come. Some of them brought operators and then
 13 a dozer was donated for the class and so we did a classroom
 14 portion and then a field portion and it was a one-day class.
 15 So that came out of our training budget.

16 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Okay.

17 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Question, Commissioner Vares?

18 COMMISSIONER VARES: Commissioner Lisa Vares. Is
 19 there any motion towards getting any of that kind of money
 20 recouped from the large landowner that is the landowner --

21 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Where the fire was?

22 COMMISSIONER VARES: -- where the fires are?

23 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Generally, in the past it
 24 hasn't been done. A lot of it's going to come to who started
 25 the fire and where did the fire start. It could start on

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 county land on the side of the road on a car --
 2 COMMISSIONER VARES: Right.
 3 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: -- or state land and burn
 4 into a large landowner --
 5 COMMISSIONER VARES: Okay.
 6 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: -- and then back on to county
 7 land, and so at that point who is responsible for the fire.
 8 It's just, you know, doing the investigation and determining.
 9 But we do apply through Maui Emergency Management for our
 10 large incidents -- that FMAG grant that we talked about is
 11 fire management, so anything that affects infrastructure or
 12 closes highways or airports, it -- those start to be some of
 13 the early qualifications for an FMAG reimbursement and so
 14 we'll apply. As soon as we see anything like that on the
 15 horizon that this fire could affect, we'll start that process,
 16 'cause then we'll get federal monies, but yeah.
 17 COMMISSIONER VARES: Thank you.
 18 CHIEF VENTURA: Okay. Moving on to things that I
 19 normally report out on, we have a lot of movement going on in
 20 our department this month. If you look at the retirees,
 21 between October and December, we have ten people retiring.
 22 Most of them are rank personnel, so along with the vacancies,
 23 we have to do promotions. So we're working for DPS, our
 24 department of personnel services, and we -- we have a lot of
 25 stuff going on. Everything that needs to be refilled,

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 promoted, one step at a time, 'cause we can't -- so we'll
 2 start at the top, promote a chief position, and then we'll
 3 work our way to the captains and then the drivers and then the
 4 firefighters. We also have a recruit graduation coming up in
 5 ten days, so we have -- 18 of them going online and then we
 6 have our agility in January and our academy starting in the
 7 spring sometime.
 8 So all of that movement goes through DPS, so we work
 9 with them to fill positions and vacate positions. And then on
 10 top of that, we're hire -- we're still working with DPS to
 11 hire our 15 lifeguards, our four admin. personnel, and all
 12 this other movement, so they're swamped with all the stuff
 13 too. And we've -- we've done everything that we can do on our
 14 end and we're just kind of giving them any support they need
 15 to hurry the process along.
 16 Department Improvements: One of the things that was
 17 a struggling for some of our members was just getting our
 18 simple duty shirts. We always had a vendor do it for us, they
 19 printed it and then they handed it out out of their shop, but
 20 their shop is not always open. So people would come from
 21 Lahaina, they go to Costco, then they go to pick up a shirt
 22 and the shop was closed. So we moved all of that shirt stuff
 23 to our warehouse, so the same place we issue hose and toilet
 24 paper out of, we now carry the duty shirts. So it's more work
 25 on our end, but it's going to be a better service to our

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 members and stuff, so something we were able to do pretty
 2 easily.
 3 Union Interactions: We had a meeting in Honolulu
 4 about the drug and alcohol testing for HFFA, so that's our
 5 firefighter's union. There's a big concern with accidental
 6 exposure because of all the CBD stuff out there and there's
 7 people that are failing drug tests 'cause they accidentally
 8 get exposed to somebody else's oil or -- there are all sorts
 9 of claims. Now, there's -- there's also edibles everywhere
 10 nowadays, there's gummy bears and brownies and everything, so
 11 they're worried about just somebody bringing something to the
 12 fire station, Thank you for putting out the fire in my
 13 backyard, the guys eat it and then they fail a drug test. So
 14 there's big concerns about that kind of stuff, it has not been
 15 decided how it's going to be handled, it's going to be an HR
 16 versus union battle to the end, I'm sure.
 17 (Laughter.)
 18 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: So we'll see where that goes.
 19 And then HGEA Unit 14 is our ocean safety lifeguards and
 20 we're -- we've passed negotiations, we're going into
 21 arbitration in January to try to settle that contract, so
 22 that's where we're at with them.
 23 The hotel association has been kind to us, they're
 24 supporting our fire stations that are in the most heavily
 25 populated tourist districts with both meals for Thanksgiving

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 and Christmas, so the guys were very grateful for that and we
 2 appreciate the support.
 3 Any questions on my report?
 4 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay. If not, Chief Kawasaki.
 5 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: Okay. Good morning,
 6 everybody.
 7 COMMISSIONERS: Good morning.
 8 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: Assistant Chief Rick
 9 Kawasaki. So last time we left here, I was telling you how
 10 green everything was, and sure enough, that afternoon -- it's
 11 nice and green, looks good, and then that afternoon we have
 12 fire right there, 300 acres. So our fires have kind of slowed
 13 down. We just had another one small one in Paia over the
 14 weekend last week. Thank you, Lisa, for bringing out her
 15 water truck to help us. So they're actually not really that
 16 small, I think that one was 600 acres, but in the history of
 17 this past year, those are kind of small.
 18 So you guys have my report here, I'll just touch on,
 19 you know, a couple of things that are not on the report. Like
 20 Chief Brad said, we have the apparatus inspection coming up
 21 January 27, five of us will be going to Wisconsin to check on
 22 our three trucks that are being build, a ladder and two
 23 engines. It's a midpoint construction inspection, we also do
 24 one at the end, a final inspection.
 25 So our Training Bureau: Graduation class is next

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 week Friday. We're graduating 18 recruits of the 20 that we
2 hired, two of them didn't make it, so -- with that, we start
3 off -- you know, once they get placed, we're 15 short because
4 of retirements, so we'll start off, you know, the whole
5 process all over again. We have their recruit agility tests
6 January 18th, I believe, and so we'll start that whole process
7 again to go through the agility test, interview the following
8 week, and then -- so that and probably start a class around
9 March 15th or so.

10 Also, we will be losing the use of the drug training
11 center that we do all of our training classes and -- you know,
12 for incumbents and our recruits down by the airport. Jack is
13 familiar where he picked up that trailer there. Anyway, so
14 they're going to do construction, so we won't have the use of
15 their training facility, so we have to come up with something.
16 Whether it's going to be out of our station or -- I don't
17 know, we've gotta figure it out.

18 And, yeah, so the last thing on the ocean safety
19 side is they are trying to get a new tower placed at that Pu'u
20 Keka'a area, Black Rock, lots of, you know, fatalities with
21 drowning there. And that's just still in talks and, you know,
22 trying to get the right people to approve it and all of that.

23 Other than that, if you guys have any more questions
24 on an issue forward or anything you have for me?

25 CHAIR MISAKI: Yes. This is Chair Misaki. I just
RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 have a comment. Travis and I couldn't help notice they plowed
2 the field.

3 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: Yeah, they --

4 CHAIR MISAKI: Took away the fuel, huh?

5 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: They've been plowing a
6 lot all the way up Haleakala Highway, they're grazing cattle
7 on the, you know, Paia side, so they've done a lot, but, you
8 know, we still have areas that can burn.

9 CHAIR MISAKI: Who is "they"?

10 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: Mahi Pono.

11 CHAIR MISAKI: Oh, right on.

12 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: Yeah. So this is all of
13 their property. The last fire in Paia was also on their
14 property, we believe there was a -- it started from a car
15 fire, whether it was stolen or abandoned, I don't know, I
16 didn't get the report yet. So that one threatened a lot of
17 structures all along Baldwin Avenue, but we got lucky and, you
18 know, we -- the guys stopped it from burning any structures
19 there.

20 CHAIR MISAKI: Well, thank them.

21 Commissioner Tancayo.

22 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Chief, so you guys lost total
23 use of the joint center?

24 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: Yeah.

25 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Is it temporary or that's it?
RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: No, it's just temporary.
2 They're start -- they want to start there by March 1st and
3 their construction contract is nine months, so it'll take us
4 probably till the end of the year next year.

5 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: And you'll have the use of it
6 again after that?

7 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: Supposedly, you know,
8 that's what they say, anyway, and nobody's told us otherwise.

9 But we still have all of our burn trailers, you know, those
10 containers there, but during their construction, I don't think
11 we're going to be able to use that unless we move it somewhere
12 and, you know, 'cause I don't think the smoke for the
13 construction workers is going to be a viable option.

14 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Okay, all right. Thank you.

15 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Sterling.

16 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Yes. So I would -- so the
17 area by the airport you're talking about; right?

18 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: Mm-hmm.

19 COMMISSIONER STERLING: You still have the land, is
20 it state land?

21 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: It's airport, so, yeah,
22 it's the state.

23 COMMISSIONER STERLING: It's the state. You're
24 just -- they're just going to shut it down or --

25 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: They're gonna remodel,
RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 basically.

2 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Remodel.

3 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: 'Cause it's leaking, it
4 has mold issues.

5 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Oh.

6 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: It's in very bad shape.

7 COMMISSIONER STERLING: But that's just the state,
8 yeah?

9 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: Yeah, the whole thing.

10 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Okay. Thank you.

11 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Freitas.

12 COMMISSIONER FREITAS: My impression was the state
13 co-owns the land.

14 CHAIR MISAKI: Thank you.

15 Is that it?

16 (No response.)

17 CHAIR MISAKI: Thank you.

18 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: Thank you.

19 CHAIR MISAKI: And for the last time.

20 COMMISSIONER STERLING: For the last time.

21 CHAIR MISAKI: Chief Martin. We can bring you back
22 by popular request?

23 ASSISTANT CHIEF MARTIN: Good morning. Sure, I'll
24 come back.

25 (Laughter.)

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 ASSISTANT CHIEF MARTIN: Good morning, everybody.
 2 COMMISSIONERS: Good morning.
 3 ASSISTANT CHIEF MARTIN: Val Martin, assistant
 4 chief. The Kaunakakai Cascade compressor system was
 5 installed --
 6 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: All right.
 7 ASSISTANT CHIEF MARTIN: -- at Kaunakakai. For many
 8 years we depended on the airport firefighters to help us out,
 9 they've graciously assisted us. And we still will if we need
 10 to, I'm sure we will have to service this -- our system in the
 11 future and they'd be able to help us. But, yeah, so we're
 12 happy to have our own.
 13 Participated in a Hawaii Public Radio discussion
 14 about a lot of the fires that have been going on. I think the
 15 state in general has been watching Maui, yeah, all of our
 16 fires and so many thousand acres that burned, so there was
 17 some discussion on that.
 18 We attended the annual employee recognition banquet
 19 that was held with the mayor at the Binhi At Ani Center and
 20 all of the employees from the county who were recognized.
 21 And we're working on that FMAG grant application
 22 kind of like what chief had said, touched on, we do apply for
 23 grants when we have a big incident or a big fire that may
 24 qualify, yeah. So one that got approved is the Kahana Ridge
 25 Fire that we had a couple of months ago, but in the overall

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 scheme -- and every dollar counts, I don't want to minimize
 2 it, but that -- it's like a small grant for us, because these
 3 grants, they don't pay regular salaries, yeah. It's only over
 4 time if we had to call back personnel, so the majority of our
 5 resources are -- are there, already on duty. And it was like
 6 a one day, day and a half fire, so it wasn't like a big, long-
 7 term one, so that's a small -- small FMAG grant that we're
 8 working with.
 9 We've been working with Maui Electric Company on our
 10 Haiku property and we are going to be clearing some of the
 11 overgrown brush in that area, but the power lines have got
 12 caught up in a lot of those overgrowing trees and brush, so
 13 we're working with Maui Electric to remove that. We went on
 14 site, worked with them and they're going to schedule the --
 15 the removal.
 16 Some of us attended the Hawaii Fire Chiefs
 17 Conference that was in the beginning of December, that was on
 18 Oahu. It was the annual conference. This coming one in 2020,
 19 it'll be here on Maui at the Ritz-Carlton Kapalua November
 20 12th through the 15th, 2020.
 21 And then some of the investigations that fire
 22 prevention recently went out of to notoriety: There was a
 23 structure fire in Hana. The occupant wasn't home, but from
 24 what I understand, I think it was more of a shed or a workshop
 25 out there, so we had one of our investigators go out.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 We did have a structure fire in Happy Valley that
 2 you might've saw on the news they arrested somebody. That
 3 was -- it was in November.
 4 And then there was a fire, a Kihei condo fire, you
 5 might've seen that one in the paper too and on the news,
 6 where -- that was an accidental fire. It was a ceiling fan
 7 above the bed and the ceiling fan failed and it overheated, I
 8 think, and landed on the bed, causing the bed to catch fire.
 9 So we do get accidental fires, yeah, and our guys figure it
 10 out sometimes, you know, and they go out there, but some -- a
 11 lot we cannot figure out, you know, 'cause fire destroys
 12 evidence, yeah, but some, some we can.
 13 And then this past weekend the same fire that Chief
 14 Kawasaki mentioned, the Baldwin fire, Holomua Road Fire, we
 15 opened up the EOC with Mr. Andaya and some other staff only
 16 because of the evasion issue, yeah. Whenever we hear that
 17 people or residents are being evacuated, we look at opening up
 18 shelters, so we needed to open up the EOC and it was great.
 19 Again, nobody came and utilized the shelter, but we'd rather
 20 have that than not have available the shelter. And I'd like
 21 to point out that Home Depot just -- they showed up and they
 22 dropped off cases of water at the shelter, but -- nobody was
 23 there, but I just wanted to point that out, that they -- they
 24 came out and they -- they helped the community. And they're
 25 not paying me to say that.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 (Laughter.)
 2 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: I'm just saying that. So
 3 that was -- that was impressive.
 4 And other than that, do you have any questions?
 5 CHAIR MISAKI: What are you going to do in your
 6 retirement?
 7 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Join the commission.
 8 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Home Depot.
 9 (Laughter.)
 10 ASSISTANT CHIEF MARTIN: Yeah, Home Depot, but --
 11 (Laughter.)
 12 ASSISTANT CHIEF MARTIN: I've got some that
 13 (inaudible) that I've gotta take care of, but -- yeah. It's
 14 interesting, as we get older, we don't think about it till
 15 later, but I think they could use my help, so I'll probably be
 16 spending some time that.
 17 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Tancayo, you had a
 18 question?
 19 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Yes. Thank you for your
 20 service, Chief Martin. I've worked alongside you and good
 21 luck in whatever activity you conduct in your retirement.
 22 ASSISTANT CHIEF MARTIN: Thank you. Thank you.
 23 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Hope you'll be happy.
 24 (Laughter.)
 25 CHAIR MISAKI: Thank you, Chief Martin.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 I would like to call upon our guest presenter, Jamie
 2 Adams.
 3 MS. ADAMS: Good morning, Commission.
 4 Commissioners: Good morning.
 5 MS. ADAMS: My name is Jamie Adams, I'm the
 6 administrative assistant to the Maui Fire Department personnel
 7 at human resources. I just made a short handout. My
 8 presentation will be brief.

9 Alongside me I work with Melissa Platiro, she is our
 10 departmental personnel clerk. We oversee 388 positions in the
 11 department, so the numbers from the Fiscal Year 2020 Budget:
 12 We have 388 positions, about 296 of them belong to the HFFA
 13 union, which is Hawaii Firefighters Association; 86 positions
 14 belong to HGEA, that's our Hawaii Government Employees
 15 Association, which is our administrative positions that I fall
 16 under as well as the ocean safety officers; and then you have
 17 6 UPW, United Public Workers, positions and that is our fire
 18 equipment mechanics and one building mechanic.

19 And what we do in our office is mainly we support
 20 the fire chiefs: We advise them in the civil service and
 21 union processes that relates to our employees, ensuring that
 22 their decisions are fair and consistent in the legal
 23 parameters.

24 We support the department personnel. We assist
 25 employees from the time they get hired until they retire or
RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 leave the department: This includes benefits, their time and
 2 pay, we maintain their employee files. And we've got to make
 3 sure that the contract and civil service requirements are
 4 still current and valid, so this includes annual physicals.
 5 We do do drug testing and performance evaluations, among
 6 other -- other things.

7 And we do also provide internal training on some of
 8 the HR processes that we need to be a little bit more
 9 specific. So recently we lead into Workday, which is our new
 10 HR payroll system, so it required going from paper time sheets
 11 to online time sheets, we had to. Melissa was very good at
 12 providing a lot of training for our firefighters to ensure
 13 that they understood how to input going from paper and onto
 14 the computer, which took some time to train.

15 So, again, regarding employees, from recruitment to
 16 hire, we assist the department in filling their position
 17 vacancies, working alongside DPS. We process new hires to
 18 ensure that all requirements are met. We assist them with
 19 their benefits, which includes medical insurance, any
 20 voluntary benefits, including flex spending accounts,
 21 Prudential Island Savings deferred compensation, and we do
 22 offer WorkLife Hawaii, which is our employee -- employees
 23 assistance program, as well as advise them about their
 24 retirement benefits and how to apply for their retirement.

25 Compensation: We process, approve, and audit
RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 applications for family leave, vacation, sick, compensatory
 2 time off, TDI, which is temporary disability insurance, time
 3 cards, their premium pays, and ensure that their work
 4 schedules -- because fire has shift work as well as ocean
 5 safety, we need to ensure their work schedules are accurate.
 6 And we process compensation adjustments like pay increases and
 7 step movements.

8 Another big factor in our department is workers
 9 compensation. We do have from firefighters to ocean safeties
 10 that get hurt on the job, so we process the claims to our
 11 third-party carrier, which is Sedgwick, and then we calculate
 12 the loss of earnings for payroll and we do report to OSHA.

13 Lastly, we do handle labor relations, which is the
 14 unions. So we consult with the unions regarding grievances
 15 from the employees, any new policies or changes. We assist
 16 the fire chiefs in the union contract negotiations, such as we
 17 might gather cost item requests. And work alongside DPS in
 18 providing how much rank per rank occurred in the last contract
 19 period so they know what to budget or propose in the new
 20 contract. Any disciplinary issues and a lot of contract
 21 interpretation.

22 We do handle drug testing from preemployment,
 23 random, reasonable suspicion testing, and then coordinate that
 24 with Clinical Labs and maintain the records.

25 Classification: We ensure position descriptions are
RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 up to date. We process reallocation, promotions,
 2 re-description of duties to the positions, and consult with
 3 the union, managing director's office, and DPS to approve
 4 these classification items as well as reorganizations, if
 5 anything changes within our department organization or
 6 function.

7 And then we maintain the employee performance
 8 evaluations and we can provide assistance in how to document
 9 and follow the Hawaii Revised Statute Section 76-41.

10 And in a nutshell, that's what our office does for
 11 the department. With that, any questions?

12 CHAIR MISAKI: So is it true human resources
 13 resolves problems we don't know and in ways you don't
 14 understand?

15 MS. ADAMS: I believe so, yes.
 16 (Laughter.)

17 CHAIR MISAKI: That's a funny one.

18 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Deputy Chief Brad Ventura.
 19 Just from our perspective, for what Jamie and her team do for
 20 us is immeasurable. We're -- we literally, between Chief
 21 Thyne and myself, talk to them daily because there's always
 22 some interpretation of a contract. As she mentioned, there's
 23 five different bargaining units, that's five different
 24 contracts we're working off of, everybody gets different
 25 benefits, so we might think we have it and we're -- we're, you

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 know, quoting something from a different contract, so we've
2 gotta make sure. So we're always working with her to make
3 sure we do the things most consistently and properly based on
4 what we're required to do, so there's a lot of back and forth
5 between her office and our office, like I said, on a daily
6 basis. So we appreciate everything that they do, yeah.

7 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Ginoza.

8 VICE CHAIR GINOZA: One question that always lingers
9 for me is -- and it was kind of brought up before as far as
10 the training classes, so many -- we lose sometimes one or two
11 and then we have all these retirements, so it seems like it's
12 always catchup.

13 MS. ADAMS: Yes.

14 VICE CHAIR GINOZA: And it seems like it could be
15 better planning. And I know it's restrictive with the way DPS
16 does things, but is that something that is systematic to even
17 the other counties where they cannot expand their recruit
18 class to kind of forecast or meet the forecasted need?

19 MS. ADAMS: I think that's -- yeah, statewide I
20 think that's a concern that -- or a battle as well because our
21 employees, the firefighters come in through a training program
22 needing to be certified in so many areas. It is not like
23 other county departments where we can hire temp, like an 89-
24 day appointment off the street from the public. We have to
25 have them trained, so it's always a -- it seems to be we're

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 always trying to plan and we don't want to have a catchup, but
2 it's county -- it's statewide, other jurisdictions have issues
3 with falling behind on their -- filling their vacancies. And
4 so it's hard because, again, of the recruit plan, so they can
5 only do so many in a year. I think City is kind of getting
6 creative in trying to plan for their recruit class, they're --
7 they're bigger in scope as well, so their training bureau is
8 bigger. But we try -- we're kind of trying to brainstorm to
9 see other ideas of how we can lessen the number of vacancies
10 and have enough recruits to fill.

11 VICE CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: So quick question.

13 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Lundberg.

14 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Commissioner Lundberg. So
15 you said you're only allowed so many per year, what was that
16 in -- in relationship to recruitment?

17 MS. ADAMS: So --

18 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: I just missed it. I'm
19 sorry.

20 MS. ADAMS: So when we request to fill, it's by
21 position, so that's the only way we can fill our vacancies as
22 well as plan out for recruit program, because it takes a lot
23 of coordination of the different trainings that they need to
24 provide the recruits. They can only do maybe two recruit
25 classes in a year.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Even --

2 MS. ADAMS: And we do it back to back for --

3 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: That would be hard. I think
4 the fundamental part of how we fill is we fill only with a
5 vacant position, so we start there, and we can only grasp the
6 open positions, and then we have attrition through training
7 and so we fall behind a little further. Our academy is
8 about -- from test -- or from agility to interview to academy
9 and graduation, it's like a nine-month process, so we can do
10 two in one year, so --

11 And then our facilities also enable us only to go so
12 big. And that's why I'm kind of pushing for a new training
13 facility, if we can get a classroom that holds 50 -- now we
14 have a classroom that holds 27, 26, 25 -- then maybe our
15 academies could be bigger. So there's a lot of pieces to
16 making it more productive, but one of the biggest things is
17 that we can't hire unless there's a vacancy. We do try to
18 project and we're trying to graduate as much of the -- the
19 highest percentage of the class as we can, but we're -- as
20 a department compared to the police, I think we're not falling
21 behind as quickly as like they are. Last year we graduated 22
22 and this year we're graduating 18 and we're already looking at
23 the last recruit class to only be 15. So our numbers are
24 trending in the right direction, but that's also based on
25 retirements, you know. We don't know when people are going to

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 retire. Chief Kawasaki might remember better than I did,
2 we -- in our department, we have the potential of -- how many
3 people have 25 years or more already, it's a big number, so a
4 lot of people could retire tomorrow if they wanted.

5 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: I think we're at about
6 forty-some people can retire right now.

7 COMMISSIONER FREITAS: Wow.

8 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Which is about 13 to 15
9 percent of the department.

10 COMMISSIONER FREITAS: Wow.

11 ASSISTANT CHIEF KAWASAKI: At one point we were at
12 50, almost 60 like a year ago, but then they went, so...

13 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Yeah.

14 (Laughter.)

15 CHAIR MISAKI: Thank you. So this is my last
16 comment, but -- so you can only recruit using hard numbers,
17 right, you cannot project, but you cannot set up like the army
18 does, have an army -- have a reserve system where you actually
19 train people, you know, once they finish their training, you
20 don't pay them, but they're in reserve and then if you need
21 them, then you can do stuff like emergency hires and stuff.
22 You cannot do stuff like that?

23 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: We've discussed it with DPS,
24 something of that nature, and it's -- it's also about funding.
25 If we have ten vacancies and we hire 12 people, we only have

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 money in our budget for ten, so we'd have to go find the extra
2 money to pay those people. During the academy we have to pay
3 them.

4 CHAIR MISAKI: Right.

5 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: And then I think once the
6 class graduates, if they go on reserve and they get zero pay,
7 then that problem gets fixed.

8 CHAIR MISAKI: Right.

9 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: But while they're -- if we
10 only have ten vacancies, but we're training 20, we're -- we
11 have to find money somewhere to pay these people and the 12
12 unbudgeted positions, they only give us -- they don't give us
13 a lot of flexibility on that.

14 CHAIR MISAKI: But once a position becomes -- once
15 somebody retires, the funding becomes available if they're in
16 the reserve; right?

17 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: I agree.

18 CHAIR MISAKI: Yeah. Okay. Just -- just a thought.
19 Any -- thank you, Jamie.

20 Any -- so before we go on, I'd just like to remind
21 everybody by January meeting -- and Richelle did come out with
22 the 2020 schedule, please mark your calendars. Before the
23 January meeting, you need to hand in your financial
24 disclosure, please get that done for Richelle. Okay?

25 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Are we -- sorry.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 looking for a job today, you go on the county website and
2 we're not -- we're not recruiting for firefighters, but you
3 can sign up for the test so that when the test is announced,
4 that you get an immediate notification and then you don't miss
5 the test.

6 DPS controls the duration of which applications are
7 open. Maybe Jamie might know how many days they're required
8 to have it open. It's a civil service thing, that's not us.

9 MS. ADAMS: This is Jamie Adams. Normally,
10 typically, for fire, because it's such a popular recruitment
11 for the trainees, they've only opened it up for ten days
12 instead of the two and a half weeks.

13 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Yeah.

14 MS. ADAMS: City on Oahu, they only open it for one
15 day because they get --

16 COMMISSIONER FREITAS: Wow.
17 (Laughter.)

18 MS. ADAMS: They get up to a thousand people
19 applying in that one day because people know they want to
20 apply and they get into the fire department. For us, we leave
21 it open shorter because we get 800, we can get up to 900
22 applications. So as Chief Ventura said, you can sign up for
23 email notification when the recruitment gets posted and
24 they'll fill out the application to apply online and
25 everything is notification online now.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 CHAIR MISAKI: Commissioner Tancayo.

2 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: I have a question. I'm not
3 sure if you can -- if you can answer this, but I was
4 approached several times in the last couple weeks about the --
5 the testing for the firemen's recruit training, a lot of
6 people made comments like, Wow, they didn't know it was even
7 available and it's already going on. It seems like the
8 announcements for the testing are happening really quick or
9 something like that, by the time they find out, it's like too
10 late, and why are they doing before -- like comments like they
11 used to take two to three weeks, you know, for them to sign up
12 for it or find out about it and now it's just happening really
13 quickly.

14 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Okay. So Chief Ventura here.
15 We're talking about the recruit?

16 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Yes.

17 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Is that what we're talking
18 about?

19 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Yeah.

20 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Okay. So there's lots of
21 ways to get notified nowadays. It's all done electronically
22 through DPS and anybody who signs up for the test will get a
23 very clear and early notification.

24 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: So you have to call --

25 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: So, basically, if you're

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Okay.

2 MS. ADAMS: So what -- if you do hear from the
3 public, your friends and family, that they are interested,
4 tell them to do the email notification and they're not waiting
5 or second-guessing when it's going to get posted or not.

6 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: The days of looking in the
7 newspaper is gone.

8 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Yeah.

9 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: And so don't --

10 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Yeah. So, Chief, that's
11 exactly what's happening, so grandmother's are grabbing me by
12 the arm and telling me, Hey, by the time we heard, it was
13 already done, that's what's happening right now.

14 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: 'Cause they're hearing it --

15 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Right.

16 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: -- fourth person.

17 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: They're older and they want
18 their grandchild -- grandson or whatever to come home, they're
19 trying to figure out ways, and that's where that comes from.
20 Thank you.

21 CHAIR MISAKI: So this is -- Chair Misaki. This is
22 happening in every organization, even, you know, people stop
23 by the office that I work in saying, Oh, they want an
24 application and I've gotta tell them, You've gotta do it
25 online. It's happening everywhere, so we just live in the

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 electronic age. So I think it will help for us to explain
 2 it --
 3 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Yeah.
 4 CHAIR MISAKI: -- to people who are concerned.
 5 COMMISSIONER TANCAYO: Yeah. Thank you.
 6 CHAIR MISAKI: Thank you.
 7 Thank you for explaining that.
 8 Commissioner Sterling.
 9 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Right. Commissioner
 10 Sterling. I have two comments. The first is I want to
 11 mention I like the notice that -- it's in our packet every
 12 meeting that we come to now and it states --
 13 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: The monthly update?
 14 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Yeah, the list of -- yeah,
 15 here. It's called the Fire & Public Safety Monthly Update,
 16 which is a good communication.
 17 The other thing is we don't have a court reporter
 18 with us and I -- I don't know if you've any other plans except
 19 for audio. Could we have a video camera like the county
 20 council does with -- videos are really good, videos are
 21 accepted in the court of law, and I just want to throw it out
 22 there for recommendation or discussion.
 23 CHAIR MISAKI: I don't know.
 24 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Okay.
 25 CHAIR MISAKI: It might be a capacity issue.

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 DEPUTY CHIEF VENTURA: Yeah. Well, just I -- my
 2 comment only -- Chief Ventura here. Maybe corp counsel can
 3 guide us on this as well. First off, it's a -- one, it's a
 4 budget thing, so I don't know if somebody would be available
 5 to do it that would charge us three times as much, in which
 6 case it's not our budget. And then the other thing is I don't
 7 know what's required at the commission meetings.
 8 We would love to continue to have the stenographer
 9 here, but the story behind that is that there's too much work
 10 in the state of Hawaii and not enough of them, so basically
 11 they have to get rid of accounts, and so our account was
 12 gotten rid of. So it's not that we're not paying them, it's
 13 just that they have too much work, so we -- it's going to be
 14 transcribed, though, it's going to be recorded and then
 15 transcribed into written minutes and then it'll be available
 16 at the -- you know, for your review.
 17 Is that correct, Richelle?
 18 MS. WAKAMATSU: Yes. I also have a comment that we
 19 always invite Akaku to come, which is usually the video
 20 recording, but they're on availability too. So they're
 21 included in the emails for the meeting dates and times, it's
 22 up to them to show up to the meeting to go actually record it.
 23 But, yeah, it's availability of the court reporters and them
 24 sending people from Oahu, we're down to these little recorders
 25 on the table to be transcribed (inaudible).

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay. So as chair, I just wanna say,
 2 please have patience and not say too much.
 3 (Laughter.)
 4 CHAIR MISAKI: You wanted to say something?
 5 MS. OANA: I'm sorry, I was on a text from another
 6 client. Commissioner Sterling, did you want to ask me
 7 something?
 8 COMMISSIONER STERLING: I just didn't know the
 9 process now where we go from here if it's going to be
 10 acceptable to have just the recorder or --
 11 MS. OANA: So basically it's a Sunshine Law issue.
 12 The Sunshine Law has a provision for providing minutes and
 13 there's no requirement that a court reporter has to do the
 14 minutes, it's kind of a special thing so it's easier for us,
 15 and, of course, it's more detailed than summary minutes. So
 16 the Sunshine Law requires minutes posted at certain times and
 17 everything. Across the county, there's like a lot of boards
 18 and commissions and only certain ones actually hire court
 19 reporters. I know board of water supply does for contested
 20 case hearings and liquor commission -- I'm not sure if both
 21 the commission and the liquor adjudication board, but they do,
 22 I know. Things like even planning commissions, which are
 23 pretty heavy-duty commissions, they don't. Maybe they do in
 24 contested case hearings, but not all of contested case
 25 hearings and not at all at the meetings. So they will have a

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 recorder and then someone like Richelle from the planning
 2 department will actually type it out. And in the past they've
 3 typed it out word for word kind of like a court reporter does,
 4 who's talking and all the motions made and everything. Now
 5 the Sunshine Law has been revised and it doesn't require
 6 verbatim minutes, they allow summary minutes, and so it would
 7 be -- for planning commission, it would be someone like
 8 Richelle actually listening to the whole tape and then
 9 paraphrasing, you know, maybe a fire case discussion into like
 10 a paragraph.
 11 So, you know, there are benefits of both, we could
 12 do it either way, verbatim or, you know, Richelle would just
 13 type everything out, or summary minutes. It kind of depends
 14 on how detailed you want it and I guess also the importance of
 15 the issue you're talking about too. So a court reporter is
 16 not required, but other -- there are other requirements for
 17 the minutes. So it's okay right now for the court reporter to
 18 basically take that and just transcribe the minutes.
 19 We're going to have to see, though, so read the
 20 minutes next time --
 21 (Laughter.)
 22 MS. OANA: -- from the recorder.
 23 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Yeah.
 24 MS. OANA: Because if not, then we're going to have
 25 to change things up. So if any one of you see these minutes

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 the last few months and say, This isn't working, 'cause I
 2 don't know who said that. Because the court reporter, since
 3 she's not here -- and she's usually taking notes and she's
 4 watching who's talking and she has a chart of where
 5 everybody's sitting so she knows who's talking. And this
 6 method, you know, I know I didn't acknowledge who I was when I
 7 talked, she could just say, Unidentified Speaker. And then if
 8 she can't hear what I or any of you say, she'll say Inaudible,
 9 so it can be a little junky. So if you guys are having
 10 problems with that, maybe we -- whether it'd be better to have
 11 the recorder or it could just come down to Richelle just, you
 12 know, doing it -- not necessarily like the court reporter did,
 13 but just record it and just take it back after the meeting and
 14 type that.

15 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Okay. Thank you for
 16 explaining that process. Thank you.

17 CHAIR MISAKI: I think -- this is Commission Chair
 18 Misaki. I think the biggest difference between taking notes
 19 and the court reporter, you can see it's -- all the times are
 20 in there and I don't think Richelle's gonna put all the times
 21 in there like our minutes, so that's going to be a big
 22 difference. But for me, either way is good.

23 But, anyway, unless anybody has anything else?

24 COMMISSIONER FREITAS: Move to adjourn.

25 CHAIR MISAKI: Okay. It's been moved by Jack to

RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 C E R T I F I C A T E

2 STATE OF HAWAII)
 3 COUNTY OF MAUI) SS.

4
 5 I, Sandra J. Gran, Certified Shorthand Reporter for
 6 the State of Hawaii, hereby certify that on December 19, 2019,
 7 at 9:00 a.m. the proceedings was taken down by me in machine
 8 shorthand and was thereafter reduced to typewritten form under
 9 my supervision; that the foregoing represents, to the best of
 10 my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings
 11 had in the foregoing matter.

12
 13 I further certify that I am not an attorney for any
 14 of the parties hereto, nor in any way concerned with the
 15 cause.

16
 17 DATED this 3rd day of January, 2020, in Maui,
 18 Hawaii.

19
 20
 21
 22 _____
 23 Sandra J. Gran, RPR
 24 Hawaii CSR 424

25
RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com

1 adjourn.

2 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Second.

3 CHAIR MISAKI: Second by Gregg. All those in favor,
 4 raise your hand.

5 (Response.)

6 CHAIR MISAKI: It's been approved by the entire
 7 commission.

8 (The proceedings were adjourned at 10:15 a.m.)

9
 10
 11
 12
 13
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25
RALPH ROSENBERG COURT REPORTERS, INC.
 1001 Bishop Street, #2460, Honolulu, HI 96813
 808-524-2090 courtreporters@hawaii.rr.com