

# HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

## MINUTES

January 9, 2020

Council Chamber, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor

**CONVENE:** 1:31 p.m.

**PRESENT:** Councilmember Riki Hokama, Chair  
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Vice-Chair  
Councilmember Tasha Kama  
Councilmember Kelly Takaya King  
Councilmember Michael J. Molina  
Councilmember Tamara Paltin  
Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez (out 3:25 p.m.)

**STAFF:** Lesley Milner, Legislative Analyst  
Shelly Espeleta, Legislative Analyst  
Rayna Yap, Committee Secretary  
Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Molokai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)  
Denise Fernandez, Council Aide, Lanai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)  
Mavis Oliveira-Medeiros, Council Aide, Hana Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

**ADMIN.:** Karla Peters, Director, Department of Parks and Recreation (HFC-24)  
LoriAnn Tshako, Director, Department of Housing and Human Concerns (HFC-27)  
Curtis Jamison, Grants Management Division Administrator, Department of Housing and Human Concerns (HFC-27)  
Edward Kushi, First Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

**OTHERS:** Hanna Mounce (HFC-24)  
Bryan Berkowitz (HFC-24)  
Dale Wells (HFC-24)  
Jay Penniman (HFC-24)  
Alberta deJetley (HFC-24)  
Zandra Amaral Crouse (HFC-24)  
Steve MacKinnon, Maui Humane Society (HFC-24)  
(10) Additional Attendees

**PRESS:** *Akaku: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

---

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

CHAIR HOKAMA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . The Council's Committee on Healthy Families and Communities will come to order. This is our regular meeting of nine, January, 2020. Present we have this afternoon Committee Members Mr. Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Good afternoon, Chairman.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. King.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Good afternoon.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha auinala, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Aloha. Vice-Chairman Sugimura.

VICE CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good afternoon, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Aloha auinala, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: And Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha auinala, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for being here, Members. We have just two items today that we will start the discussion on, and I will take testimony at this time. Those that have signed up, thank you very much. You will be given three minutes by this Committee's rules. State your name, if you represent an organization we ask you share that with us. Speak on one of the two or both items. We give you three minutes per item and then the Members may have questions for clarification on the testimony that you have presented. Okay. We will not enter into discussions, debates, or anything else during testimony. So, at this time we'll ask I believe it's Hanna Mounce. If you will please come forward and share your testimony with us please.

**. . .BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .**

MS. MOUNCE: Okay. Thank you. Aloha, Members of the Committee. My name is Hanna Mounce. I'm the coordinator of Maui Forest Bird Recovery Project. Thank you for putting the feral cat problem on your Committee agenda. You also have a copy of my testimony in front of you. The hundreds and thousands of free-ranging cats that we have on our island has grown to a staggering level. I would like to urge the Council to give time and resources evaluating and then eliminating this issue as soon as possible. My interest falls under two major categories: disease and wildlife. Number one, as a mother and a farmer, the disease issues that free-ranging cats present to us and our

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

children is unacceptable. This is a non-native human caused and human supported pest that I am forced to tolerate and embrace on my own property, in public parks and at our children's schools. The presence of outdoor cats in Hawaii contaminates the environment with the parasite toxoplasma gondii spreading the disease toxoplasmosis to not only other wildlife, but also our born and unborn children. The threat of this disease is often ignored as a public health threat, yet people impacted from the disease may have a host of serious health consequences including multi organ failure. Recent deaths of species that do not directly interact with cats such as Hawaiian monk seals suggests that neighborhoods, beaches and waterways may be heavily contaminated with this parasite. This puts us at risk when recreating or growing food in our yards because of other people's irresponsible pet ownership. If these free-ranging cats are owned, they need to be contained. I am a biologist and someone who values the amazing and unique biodiversity in Hawaii. Cats are one of the most effective and indiscriminate predators on the planet. Our iconic species and remarkable biodiversity that has been almost completely wiped out by these such introductions. Predation by free-ranging cats kills more than 2.4 billion birds every year in the United States alone. Every single cat that is outside plays a role in this and we have cats on Maui from the top of the summit down to the ocean. Our remaining wildlife is in such a critically endangered state that any and every death caused by a cat that we have allowed to remain on the landscape is devastating. We may only have 50 individual kiwikiu left on the planet and we are not doing anything as a community to remove cats from the island even though they are a documented predator. How we can tolerate this for another year is difficult to understand. We introduced cats as pets and they should be controlled and treated as such, not free ranging on the landscape. Currently the County of Maui is not only not addressing the free-ranging cat issue, but also we are funding a non-profit organization that is promoting and encouraging the continued presence of free ranging cats. If we choose to allow cats to continue to roam freely across the island we are choosing the perceived welfare of those individual cats over the welfare of our children and our wildlife. Maui could be one of the first places in the nation to take a stand and say that we value our children and our native species over the poor lives that these outdoor cats have. Doing nothing is a choice. Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Ms. Mounce. Any questions for clarification? Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Mounce, for being here and for your testimony and work with the birds. I just was wondering the non-profit that Maui County is funding is that the Humane Society you're talking about?

MS. MOUNCE: Correct. The information that we are getting and being presented as residents online from the Humane Society and from Animal Control officers funded by the County is encouraging the presence and continued existence of free-ranging cats.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: How is that being encouraged? I don't under...

MS. MOUNCE: There's a whole page on the website that's dedicated to asking people to live with the cats in their yards and to tolerate them and not to remove them and that is firsthand information that myself and my staff have gotten from the Animal Control

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

officers and has admittedly been presented to us from that non-profit as what they are telling the general public.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Thank you. Ms. King, did you have a question for clarification?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: That was my question so that answers it.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Thank you. Mr. Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Chairman. Good afternoon, Ms. Mounce. Just a quick question on the disease, that toxoplasma gondii, what are the effects of it, I mean if someone contracts that, then what do they have, fever and everything else, and is it...

MS. MOUNCE: So, I'm not a disease expert, but the disease can be very serious. The parasite needs a host like a cat in order to be transmitted and it has, is often not even diagnosed as toxoplasmosis because the effects that someone can present can be anything from blindness to deafness, to organ failure, to seizures. There can be a whole host of results. When people contract it when they are pregnant, it can be deformation and severe birth defects.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Molina. Anyone else for clarification? Thank you for being here, Ms. Mounce.

MS. MOUNCE: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Bryan Berkowitz please. If you would come down.

MR. BERKOWITZ: Aloha. My name is Bryan Berkowitz. Maui County resident and co-founder and President Na Koa Manu Conservation. A local Maui based, non-profit chartered with supporting conservation outreach, education, research and management of native birds, bird habitat and watershed restoration in general. I'm speaking on Item 19-248, the feral cat problem on Maui. Because it is a problem. I'm testifying against the allowance of feral cats on the Maui landscape and in support of any type of enforcement, fines of people encouraging the feeding of feral cats on County property. Their estimates are 300,000 to 500,000 feral cats on this island of, what 150,000 people. Feral cats are responsible for the deaths of native wildlife through predation and the spread of toxoplasmosis as we've just heard. Both birds and marine mammals, the Native Hawaiian monk seal and endangered birds. It's also a risk to humans. The life cycle requires cats to continue the life cycle of the parasite. Eliminate cats and you've eliminated toxoplasmosis. I'm concerned about the feeding of feral cats on County property parks such as Kahana Beach Park. It's full of feral cats and feral cat feeders. It's adjacent to Kanaha Pond State Wildlife Sanctuary which contains two endangered Hawaiian birds. The coot and the stilt. Is there any kind of liability on the County's

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

part for the cats and the people feeding the cats here? I'm wondering about the Endangered Species Act, the Federal Migratory Bird Act, our beaches are one giant litter box and that's all I have. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Berkowitz. Members, any questions for clarification? Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Berkowitz, for being here and your work in this. You said Kahana Beach Park, was that...

MR. BERKOWITZ: Kanaha.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thank you.

MR. BERKOWITZ: Kahului.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Thank you. Any other questions for the gentleman? Thank you very much for being here this afternoon.

MR. BERKOWITZ: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Dale Wells, please?

MR. WELLS: Good afternoon.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Good afternoon.

MR. WELLS: Thank you, Council, for hearing me out. I'm just, I'm not real prepared for this, but I heard about the meeting at the last minute. So, Councilmember Hokama and other Councilmembers, I'm just a resident. I just live up the street. It's like a block and a half Church Street runs into Kaohu Street and I'm here to talk about actually three issues, even though there's only...I'm only signed up for the one. First there's the chickens, the roosters. Then the second one is the cats. And then the main one is the children. The roosters in our neighborhood, just today I counted 14 roosters just within 100 yards of where we live. It's crazy. The noise and they have a tendency to kind of hang around the corner there. The Church Street runs into Kaohu Street and they run across the street and whatever and the other day I saw a car literally swerve almost completely in the other lane just to avoid a rooster, because it kind of flew up and, you know, tried to run off the side of the road. Well, we have a lot of kids. There's two schools. There's one school that direction and another school this direction, Iao Valley School. And if there were kids at 2:30 p.m. or whatever time they leave school walking on the side of the street and that car swerved just to miss a rooster, a chicken, or actually also a cat, the cats run across there. There's been three incidences of cats running across the street. There was one that ran across the street, got hit, didn't get killed, but crawled under our house and died and it took us a while to discover it and it was pretty bad, but you know the smell. And so, we had to have it taken out. But then there was another one I was standing in the kitchen window washing dishes and I looked

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

out and the car went by bam, hit that cat and it was just the worse thing in the world to see this thing just flopping around. That's somebody's, either somebody's cat or it's a feral cat, but once again the car tried to miss it but the cats running and it couldn't miss it. But we only have on the west side of the street, you know, a little walking lane, or bicycle lane, I don't know what you call it the yellow line and then people's walls. There's not a sidewalk over there. And so, kids continually, they walk up this way, or you know, both directions, home and to school in the morning and then on our side of the street, the east side of the street, there's a sidewalk. So, that's my concern is the roosters and the stuff, they run out to the street, car swerves, misses the rooster, but might take out some children. And another one, I know it's not on the agenda, but I could certainly see that some speed bumps on that street would be nice. There's only I think two speed bumps, but we could use like maybe two more to slow traffic down. That could help, you know, in quite a ways.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you very much for your comments. Any questions for Mr. Wells, Members? We appreciate your time.

MR. WELLS: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Jay Penniman please.

MR. PENNIMAN: Aloha, Chair Hokama. Members of the Committee. I'm Jay Penniman. I'm the manager of the Maui Nui Seabird Recovery Project. Our mission is to restore the native seabird populations to the islands of Maui Nui. Seabirds are ecological engineers. Their ancestors built the fertile soils in which our native plant community evolved. The marine nutrients they transported to the terrestrial habitat created the conditions in which water from rain and fog drip is captured and transported to the aquifers that we depend upon for our agricultural and domestic uses. We and numerous other conservation organizations spend an inordinate amount of our annual budgets on feral animal control, primarily feral cats. I've attached a 2018 survey of 14 Maui Nui Conservation organizations and expenditures on feral cat control to this testimony. We are spending well over half-a-million dollars every year to protect our native wildlife. Cats are an ecological disaster. They are directly responsible for helping drive 63 species of birds and mammals and reptiles to extinction worldwide. In the United States alone, cats kill approximately 2.4 billion birds every year. Cats are the obligate host of the parasite toxoplasma gondii. This parasite is clearly implicated in the deaths of our endangered ilio holo i ka uaua, the Hawaiian monk seal. The parasite lives for over a year on soil and sand. Numerous studies link infection with toxoplasmosis to human psychological diseases and other wildlife diseases. Maui Humane Society has been practicing a policy of trap, neuter and return or TNR for feral cats brought to them. The scientific literature clearly documents that TNR programs fail to control feral cat populations. Native wildlife populations continue to suffer in the presence of neutered cats on the landscape. Please stop funding this policy. A far better method if feral cats are not euthanized is to implement a cat sanctuary program as has been successfully done on Lanai. The Lanai Cat Sanctuary is self-supporting, about \$600,000 annual budget. These cats are healthier than feral cats on the landscape. They are not subject to traffic maiming and fatality and they have regular veterinarian care. People who love

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

their cats and feed colonies should be required to get their cats off the landscape and into fenced enclosures. It will be better for the cats and our native and endangered wildlife. Feral chickens are another growing problem on Maui that requires attention of this Committee. Feral chickens are the ready vector for avian influenza if it were to arrive here from Africa, Asia or Europe where it has infected people with symptoms such as fever, muscle aches and conjunctivitis to severe respiratory distress, pneumonia, organ failure and death. Other diseases potentially transmitted through feral chickens to people are campylobacter, E. coli, salmonella and West Nile virus. We need to prohibit the outdoor feeding of feral chickens and implement control measures now. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Penniman. Members...yes, Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Penniman, for your work with the seabirds. I just was wondering were you talking about Maui having its own cat sanctuary program separate from what is going on on Lanai?

MR. PENNIMAN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And were you wanting the Humane Society to run that?

MR. PENNIMAN: I would encourage this Committee to find the organizations, the individuals who feel so strongly about maintaining feral cats to move them into areas. On Lanai we worked, when I was working there with the landowner, Castle and Cooke at the time and got them to agree to donate the land for that cat sanctuary. That same kind of outreach could be done here with different organizations. The people who are concerned for the cats on Lanai are the people who did that and I think if they want to maintain feral cats, they need to do it off the landscape and provide the kind of sanctuary shelter that is being provided over there.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And you were involved in the effort on Lanai?

MR. PENNIMAN: Yes. I was managing the Hawaiian petrel population over there at that time before Larry Ellison bought the island and Castle and Cooke was looking at doing a wind development out there. They had to do a habitat conservation plan and we managed to convince them that because they were doing that it would benefit them to remove the cats from the area where they were predated the native seabirds and water birds there at the wastewater treatment plant.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And are you willing to be involved in the effort for Maui?

MR. PENNIMAN: I would be willing to help facilitate in any way I could. I certainly have my time filled up dealing with seabirds and the issues that surround them beyond feral cats, but anything we could do to help I would certainly do.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Anyone else has a question? Ms. King?

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I'm not sure if this is a question for Mr. Penniman or yourself, Mr. Chair, but I just wondered if the cat sanctuary has eliminated the feral cat problem on Lanai?

MR. PENNIMAN: It has vastly reduced it. The people that are managing the Hawaiian petrel colony up on Lanai Hale still have to manage feral animals, but the feral cat problem in town has been reduced as I understand it to almost zero.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. So, if they do find feral cats, they just go right to the cat sanctuary is that what happens?

MR. PENNIMAN: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: You can be like me, bang. Any other questions? Okay. Thank you very much, Mr. Penniman. Alberta deJetley please.

MS. deJETLEY: Good afternoon, Chair, and good afternoon, Councilmembers. My name is Alberta deJetley. I am speaking as an individual. The Lanai Cat Sanctuary is a project that I was totally involved in. It started with a group of dedicated Lanai volunteers who were really aware of the amount of homeless cats that we had in the community and they started to do a spay/neuter, release program. The State came to the group and said that they were a group of 20 feral cats living by the wastewater treatment plant down at, right outside of town and that they could not be released back into the area. If we caught them we needed to keep them and that's where I became involved in the program because I ended up becoming the project manager for building the original temporary shelter which we had at the area right near the Four Seasons Resorts at Koele. From there we negotiated with Castle and Cooke and we were given four acres down across from the Lanai Sanitary Landfill out in an area by, near the Kaunolu Road. We built a sanctuary and that has become, you know, if you have lemons, you make lemonade. We took the sanctuary, we built it with almost no money. We used recycled lumber. All of our people working there were volunteers. All of the materials that we used were salvaged and from that today, we have a sanctuary where we have 11,000 visitors visited us last year. We have supporters from all over the world. We employ ten people and it has become the biggest tourist attraction on our island. It's a beautiful facility and I think it's well worthwhile for all of you to come to Lanai to see what can be done with what was once a problem has now become a very, very beautiful attraction. We only take cats from Lanai. We can't take your Maui cats. You need to address them individually, but what you need to do is I would suggest that you go out to people who love cats and have them form themselves into an association and to build sanctuaries like ours. It's truly beautiful and we're really, really proud of the work that our organization has done. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Okay. Ms. Kama?

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, how long did it take to actually go from when you all just started to organize and talk about what it is you want to do, to the building of the facility and as it is today?

MS. deJETLEY: It's been ten years. When the group first started, the founder of the Lanai Cat Sanctuary is Kathy Carroll and she started it with her neighbor who is Loretta Hellrung. Loretta's husband was a general manager at the Four Seasons Resort. So, these two ladies took it upon themselves to get people involved with them in trapping and neutering cats and from there it just moved on. The amount of volunteers that were involved in the project was truly amazing and we are not the only cat sanctuary in Maui County. On Molokai there's a small facility near, it's in Maunaloa, they have about 85 cats and that's a privately run sanctuary.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you.

MS. deJETLEY: You're welcome.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Sugimura?

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair. Nice to see you here, Alberta.

MS. deJETLEY: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: And the cat sanctuary I was there on Lanai in September and people were getting married and honeymooning and visiting your cat sanctuary so it's quite an attraction, I was quite surprised actually. How many cats are there and are all the cats spayed and neutered or what is the situation?

MS. deJETLEY: Before a cat can be released into the sanctuary it has to have a complete health check. So, we have different areas of the sanctuary. So, an incoming cat, like Mr. Penniman said, Lanai Company has been trapping feral cats. In the past they used to euthanize them, but now they're bringing them down to the sanctuary. So, that cat is kept in quarantine until a vet arrives. We have a vet visiting us every other week, every other week throughout the month. So, when he's there he sees about 30 to 40 cats at a time. So, he'll give them a complete health check, their vaccinations, microchips them, and then they're kept in quarantine for two weeks before they are released into the sanctuary. Thanks to a very generous...we get a lot of private donations. So, thanks to a very generous donor, we have expanded our facility. We have doubled the size of our facility and we can take more than 1,000 cats. We don't expect to be able to fill that space, but it's there if we need it.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: A thousand. Wow. Thank you.

MS. deJETLEY: You're welcome.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Paltin?

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks, Chair. I've got a lot of questions. I was wondering is it okay if Ms. deJetley can stay, she could be our resource person and then I'll hold my questions or would you prefer...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Or you can forward it and we can allow her to respond.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, ask questions now, or...

CHAIR HOKAMA: When we bring up the item. Yeah. We will do it, once we reach the item, Ms. Paltin, I want to conclude testimony.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. So, don't ask a question now?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. Ask it later.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Any clarification questions at this point in time for the testifier? Okay. Thank you, Ms. deJetley.

MS. deJETLEY: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Zandra Amaral Crouse?

MS. AMARAL CROUSE: Good afternoon, Mr. Chairman and Councilmembers. Toxoplasmosis. I was wondering what that is so I looked it up. Medically reviewed by University of Illinois, Chicago, College of Medicine on February 30<sup>th</sup>, 10<sup>th</sup> I'm sorry, 2016 is the reference I looked up. Toxoplasmosis is an infection...infectious caused by a parasite. This parasite is called toxoplasma gondii. It can be found in cat feces and undercooked meat especially venison, lamb and pork. It can also be transmitted through contaminated water. Toxoplasmosis, and forgive me if I don't pronounce these words right, can be deadly or cause serious birth defects for a fetus if the mother becomes infected. This is why doctors recommend against pregnant women scooping or cleaning cat litter boxes.

*... (music plays) ...*

CHAIR HOKAMA: Hold on please, Ms. Crouse.

MS. AMARAL CROUSE: Yes. Nice music though.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We didn't pay our bill so they're reminding us. Please continue.

MS. AMARAL CROUSE: Thank you so much, Chair. I think it's only humane for us to really look at some of the alternatives that have been presented today for our cats that go astray because finding them on the road run over is not humane. The chickens, I thought Kauai had the dibs on chickens, you know, because my husband and I went to

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

lunch one day about a year ago and in the park...I see Kelly nodding her head, but we got joined by all these roosters and chickens on the table and we didn't even feed them but it is becoming a problem and the humane thing would be to find a way to take care of them, malama, instead of allowing them to go free and being a health problem for our children and families. Mahalo, guys.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you.

MS. AMARAL CROUSE: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Any questions for the testifier? Okay. Thank you for being here this afternoon. Do we have any request from our district offices? Okay. With no further request for testimony, we'll close testimony, members. With no objections? Thank you. Testimony is closed for today's meeting.

**. . .END PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .**

**ITEM HFC-24: FERAL ANIMAL MANAGEMENT ON MAUI** (CC 19-248, 19-306)

CHAIR HOKAMA: We'll go straight to our first item, HFC-24, under the heading of Feral Animal Management on Maui. We have communications 19-248, as well as 19-306. One from Member Lee and one from Member Sugimura regarding feral animal concerns. This afternoon we have a couple of resource people, we have Mr. Steve MacKinnon. He is the Chief Executive Officer of the Maui Humane Society, and we have our Parks Director, Ms. Peters, who can speak on how the County is approaching this issue within our parks, or public facilities area. The Chair did not call any other departments at this time. My intention is to have the discussion today and then I plan to defer and come up with a proposal for a follow-up meeting that we'll post and have a public comment and additional discussion before decision making on a policy on addressing these issues. So, I'll let the Parks Director, Ms. Peters give us any comments from Administration.

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Chair. Good afternoon, Chair. Good afternoon, Committee. So, as far as the Parks Department is concerned, in our Code, it does state that within the limit of any park or with any recreational facility, it is unlawful for any person to establish feral animal colonies, although it does also state that any colony management authorized by a permit, license, lease or contract, issued in accordance with this Code, must be designed to reduce and eliminate the colony. So in 2017, our Department got a task force together and the goal of that task force was to provide feedback on the development of permitting managed feral cat colonies on park lands. There are a lot of draft items in this task force report which have not been fully executed at this time. So, we are looking, we are excited that this is on the agenda. We hear the concerns on both sides, the actual colony managers, as well as our wildlife experts. So, we just encourage and hope that we can get to a resolution. Thank you.

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. MacKinnon, if...welcome to the meeting. We would offer you an opportunity to share some comments if you wish at this time.

MR. MACKINNON: Well, good afternoon. Good afternoon, Mr. Chairman and Members of the Council. I wasn't really prepared to give any type of speech here. I'm fairly new. I'm still learning my way around, but I have been hearing from a couple of the Councilmembers, as well as the Mayor about both chickens and the cat issues and have been hearing from members of the community. I guess one point of clarification from one of the speakers as far as funding goes, the County does provide funding to the Maui Humane Society having to do with spay and neuter services, but it's exclusively for owned animals. So, those funds are not used towards any type of feral population. We do have a number of grants from different foundations that help underwrite the cost of spay and neutering of feral cats, but nothing is funded actually from the County as far as that goes. I can report that we are developing a much more active program. It's in its infancy right now. We just, literally just barely hired last week a community cat coordinator who will be coming on board a little bit later this month and their duties will be to work with the community, do education, as well as be out in the community neighborhoods, work with a number of people who maintain cat colonies, to be a resource for them, and one of the important things that we're gonna task this person also to do, is maintaining statistics. Right now, we have obviously a number of stories from citizens as far as what they've encountered, but we don't have any true solid statistics that we can use or we can provide to the Council, as far as how to manage this problem. My background includes, my last position was with the San Diego Humane Society. We had a very active team in our program. Nationally there is a number of programs that have generally the same type of approach where it is to trap, then spay and neuter and then release back into the community in those general neighborhoods there. Contrary to what one of the person testified saying it doesn't work, there has been many, many successes as far as how these programs are managed to bring down those populations. The reverse where some people have advocated a complete elimination of the problem, either by killing the cats, things like that. We have equal amount of information and also information about stories here on the island as far as that just simply doesn't work. That if you try to remove the population, it creates a vacuum and other feral cats will enter that, and we've worked with a number of resorts, Maui College. A number of other areas to manage and bring those numbers down and we're seeing that. But that's one reason why the community cat coordinator will be able track that and be able to provide that information to see how effective that approach is. So, I think I'm mainly here to listen, to hear what the concerns are and definitely Maui Humane will want to participate in any type of management of these issues.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for that comments, Mr. MacKinnon. Okay. Members, as I said I will be posting this again at which time we will have additional two things. I'm planning to bring a representative from the Health Department and as well as work with Parks Director, we will be having someone who can speak more specifically about the medical concerns and disease component of the issue so that will be at the next meeting for your information. Ms. Sugimura, any questions or comments you wish to provide at this time?

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, I'm glad to hear what you are...how you are going to proceed, and I'm curious, I've said it before in this body at different committees, but I know that Keopuolani Park has feral or axis deer, there's an axis deer problem, and if course we have a huge growing feral pig problem, and I wonder if you would also expand this to take up those items, or do you just want to leave it narrowly with these two animals?

CHAIR HOKAMA: My thing is since we discussing, I'm going to allow the parameter to be wide at this time. Because I would like to hear the general comment of all communities, so whether it be, all pigs, birds, pigeons, chickens, I mean look at what's out there now. The so called orange red big finches. That is an invasive bird. That's not native to this State. And we've got thousands of them all over the place. So, yeah, I'm gonna keep the parameter very wide. Policies may be more specific to the type of feral animal, but yeah, my concern is the health and safety of residents first. And so, that's what I'm gonna move forward.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, great. So, if you could add at the appropriate time, the axis deer and growing pigs and...

CHAIR HOKAMA: That will all be included. Goats, sheep, deer.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Because there's, of course it affects ag, which is a huge concern for, you know, all of us in terms of food security, but just in my area, the growing population in my yard, I have deer running around late at night. But, there is legislation with the State Legislature and Senate Bill 1650 that actually addresses feral pig problem and it went all the way through conference last legislative session. My office is tracking it and hopefully we can get it pushed with your help, with senator, the Senate side, through conference and get it passed. But, just for the feral pig problem, maybe about 3 million through that and I think the money is designated to go to Department of Agriculture, but that's a, you know, connected to what we are concerned with. but in light of all of that for us to be watching what happens at the Legislature, because it's opening next week Wednesday and there are some opportunities that if we kind of work together, maybe we can help solve some of these problems.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. So, I would say, Members, I'll keep the parameter wide for your ability to ask questions, as well as discuss.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Very good. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. Because I'm open to all things, including those have enter the State on the planes, that they better, I mean I'm thinking of asking the State to require them to fill the form before stepping on the plane. You don't sign the paper, you don't get on the plane, you don't get off in Hawaii. Because I've seen so many people think it's a joke and disregard those forms. Okay. It is not a joke to us who live here, endangered species and animals. Ms. Kama, any questions or comments at this time?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: None at this time, Chair, thank you.

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Thank you, Chair. Prior to your next meeting we can get some information about what other jurisdictions are doing about problems similar to what we may be having. I mean, Kauai, I don't know what their, if they've made any improvements there. But maybe other places on the mainland and see how they're addressing these types of problems, that would be helpful for our next meeting.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We will reach out, Mr. Molina. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We will send out the communications requesting information. Happy to do that.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. I'm glad we're talking about this and I'm glad that we can have a broad discussion, but I'm just wondering if there is a separation at the State or County level of what animals are addressed by what departments. You know, we've got the chickens and the cats we're talking about today. I don't know if the axis deer and the pigs are under the Department of Ag, and, you know, then we have these other, I didn't even know we had feral sheep, you know, goats and whatever. We have all these different animals and then we have...

CHAIR HOKAMA: We've got it on Lanai the mouflon variety. Big Island has mouflon, as well as the long hair, so yeah, we've got about three different breeds in the State right now.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, you know, so if we look at funding, I know we have a bill that we're supporting from the Maui County Council to put more money into agriculture and evasive species is one of those, but specifically what would that, what does the Department of Agriculture see under its purview versus, you know, the Department of Human Concerns, and things like that, so if we can try to figure out who's doing what...

CHAIR HOKAMA: We'll follow up. We'll follow up with Department of Ag, and I'm sure certain species \_\_\_\_\_, we'll check with DLNR because that was the hosting department that allowed the importation of foreign feral animals such as axis deer and others from Japan, and whatnot. So, we'll reach out to the various State agencies as well --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --regarding who has jurisdiction over --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

CHAIR HOKAMA: --what and we will...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. I think that will help us figure out how to directly address the problems because they're so...all...they're just...they're so widespread. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Yeah. Thank you. And one thing I wanted to say too, I will not eliminate any concern either regarding evasive species in the ocean. Okay. Because to me that's a problem too. The taapes and whatnot. They're an invasive species not part of our indigenous fish. Okay. So, I'm open to that. Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I'm happy that you are also open to those in the ocean. I know Molokai, we've had roi tournaments to try to eliminate some of those --

CHAIR HOKAMA: The muu.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --yeah, those, what are they called, gulpers. They eat all the baby fish. So, okay. So, I have two questions, well one comment first. So, the axis deer was actually a gift from the Emperor of Japan to King Kamehameha V and it was brought to Molokai first. How it ended up on the other islands I'm sure there's different routes they took, but they are all ancestors from the original herd that was brought here as a gift to our King. So I want everyone to kind of keep that in mind, you know, when we're thinking about of managing axis deer, because they have a history here. My question was to Ms. Peters. Happy new year. Twenty seventeen, you had the task force, the feral cats, feral animal task force. Do you have that report with the recommendations?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Director?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Chair. Yes, we do have a draft report that came out. It was identified though that the cat colony managers did not want to be, they wanted to remain anonymous and so, I would, but I can share what we did come up as a draft. Again, we would have to then formalize it. It's, it's really in rough form. But we did have some recommendations and so recommendations, let me see here. So, signage and education was one of them. Colony caretaker requirements where they would sign this document stating what their requirements were. There would be a permit that you would get as a cat colony coordinator and again, this did not run through Corporation Counsel or anything like that.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Mahalo for sharing those recommendations. Okay. So, I guess that can kind of help guide us as we move forward with this item. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Again, we'll work with the Department to make sure they can transmit whatever documentation prior to the next meeting for your review.

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I was wondering if the cat coordinator that you are hiring is also gonna be in communication with the Lanai Cat Sanctuary as to the things that they are doing and if it is a possibility over here. Like, for example, if they have four acres on Lanai, how much cats per acre is appropriate and those type, like for start, that's my first question.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. MacKinnon?

MR. MacKINNON: Councilmember Paltin, as far as the sanctuary, we're not looking at that right now. That would be an independent approach from what we're doing right now. I think we can say that Maui Humane would be prepared to work with anybody. Just by coincidence earlier this week I was approached by a non-profit that's here on the island that works with cats and expressed an interest about generating a sanctuary. And my response was is that we're just getting our program up. We have this coordinator coming on board and that they are going to be talking to the coordinator's supervisor, as well as the coordinator to just explore that further. So, my only concern as far as the size of the sanctuary based on size of the problem, I did hear one of the speakers talk about in excess of 100,000 cats. And I think that one of the problems here, is we just don't have good data to be able to rely on. So, one of the key parts of this new person's position is to generate that data to be able to guide us, as well as the Council and neighborhoods and all, as far as exactly where the problem is, where the hotspots are. And, one of the elements is, that we've already been doing research and personally I've been doing the same, as far as how to manage these issues and I truly hadn't looked into the sanctuaries in any depth, but hearing what Lanai has been able to pull off, I definitely would want to explore that a little bit further.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then moving forward do you ever envision a time where the Humane Society would treat cats and chickens and such, like how they do dogs that are loose?

MR. MacKINNON: I mean, chickens and cats are two different challenges and I think we have a good program that we're looking to widen with cats. Right now we have no contract, no directive as far as any type of management response with chickens. I know, I've talked to a couple of Councilmembers, as well as members of the public who have said, we, not the Humane Society, but we the community needs to address that, and I would definitely agree with that. Unfortunately, my research so far has not found any super successful programs in that. I think the one that I was most impressed with was the country of Bahamas had a multiple module approach to a program that include contraception, eliminating them, hiring people to eliminate them, things like that. If the County would like to send me to the Bahamas, I'd be happy to go, but I think we're trying to communicate with them. The program that we found out is about seven or

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

eight years old. So, in some ways that's good because they may have some success to be able to pass on to us.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You're talking about chicken contraception.

MR. MacKINNON: Chicken contraception. Yeah, that's mixed in with the feed and you actively go feed the, you know the feral chickens. So, that's a possibility. I've been in contact also with an organization called Association of Advancement of Animal Welfare. They're probably one of the larger national organizations for any type of animal welfare issues. Asking them for guidance and we're actually looking for, we've approached a couple of universities for people who are experts in chickens to be able to give us some guidance. Primarily we've approached the University of California, Berkeley as...or UC Davis I should say, has a very probably internationally renowned medical center for animals and things like that, we're looking for guidance from there. So, we recognize the problem. Maui Humane can't solve it by itself, but hopefully we can also provide the resources and the research that can guide whatever group comes together to try to solve this.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And I don't know if you're knowledgeable enough in the situation, but as far as you know, making lemons out of lemonade and food sovereignty and whatnot, what about chickens, feral chickens as a food source? You know like chicken papaya or things like that. Is that a possibility?

MR. MacKINNON: From, I'd be hesitant to say Maui Humane could pursue that direction. Again, when doing my research and looking at the Bahamas' approach, they did talk about that as one of the elements of their overall encompassing program. So, it was, my understanding is, I think, we as a community get very spoiled about the types of quality of chickens that we're buying in the supermarket. These are not those types of chickens. But again, like I said, the Bahamas I was pretty impressed with because they seemed to weigh every single possible angle and that was one of them. As far as could this be a possible food source for low income, or transients, or soup kitchens, things like that. So again, I think that's, I'm very confident to say that there's not gonna be one element or one type of program, you do this one program it's gonna solve the problem. It's gonna have to be multiple things. There's no way we can go and kill off all the chickens. Just like you can't do that with cats and think we're gonna have an island free of this problem.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Because people still have pet cats and pet chickens so it will always be recurring.

MR. MacKINNON: Yeah. And we do have one of the speakers talked about feeding. We would definitely endorse, you know, some type of infraction that if you're feeding chickens. That's a small step, but that could be part of a multiple step process to try to address this. A lot of education. A lot of, you know, just to let people know what these issues are both with cats and with the chickens.

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Like for us, I mean, I don't have chickens, but my husband has chickens.

MR. MacKINNON: We know.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: They kind of, I mean like you know how you feed pigs slop and like that, the chickens will eat pretty much all the same stuff that the pigs eat, so I mean, as like maybe a compost or a food waste kind of program and chicken manure is very valuable, as well, so, you know, like there's a lot of ways to turn it into lemonade. My other question was if the chickens are on the contraceptive feed, are those edible chickens then?

MR. MacKINNON: There's current concerns with each one and the concern also is if that's an approach that...I'm not saying Maui Humane would do it, but if we locate somebody or a vendor that does this, obviously then there's concerns about other fowl, other birds eating that, other animals eating that, what's the impact. So, it has to be researched a lot more. And just an interesting little side note, just recently we had a citizen approach us and show us pictures of a very easily built chicken roost and their claim was that if you build a chicken roost, that the chickens will migrate to that to lay their eggs rather than just out in the bushes and things like that. And then all you have to do is go and take the eggs out and that's addressing the population.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well yeah, you just put a pod out and they do it.

MR. MacKINNON: Yeah. And so, we don't know how accurate that is. I have a feeling maybe in a few months I'm gonna be an expert in this area. But it's interesting. It sounds logical. Is that something that we could educate people to build a very simple roost that you put behind, you know, the building if you're a store, or some type of retail establishment, to put that in a common area, in a housing development, things like that, possibly. I think we need to investigate that a little bit further to see if that is a viable alternative, but I really do feel both with the cat issue and the chicken issue there's gonna have to be multiple approaches. You can't allow people to approach us and say here's the problem, step back and say you go solve it. It's gonna have to be a whole community approach. And I definitely, Mr. Chairman, I definitely appreciate this being brought to the table, by the Council, and, you know, we'll stay at the table as well to help try to figure out what the solution might be.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: As far as your organization with the mission and the vision statement is it for all animals, would that chicken and cat and feral pig problem fit within your mission and vision?

MR. MacKINNON: Well, it depends what the solution is. I mean, obviously, we're not gonna be advocating any type of killing spree or anything like that. One issue right now is the definition of what a feral chicken is right now. If the definition was changed from a legal standpoint, probably with the State, if they redefined it as a pest because of health concerns, safety concerns, things like that, it makes it easier to address some of these issues. We wouldn't be an advocate, nor would we participate in any type of removal

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

programs, for lack of a better term. But like I said we want to be at the table and if that's the direction the Council would like to pursue, we would want to be involved to make sure whatever direction you want to go is humane and a proper way to be able to manage the issue.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Thank you. Ms. Sugimura, any questions?

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Kama? Thank you. Mr. Molina? Ms. King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I just wanted to follow up on the idea of doing a cat sanctuary and I'm wondering if since it's the biggest attraction on Lanai right now, that would we be taking something away from Lanai if we did it on Maui. My understanding and maybe you know this, Chair, is that there's around 600 cats in that sanctuary?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Around there.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, that's what I was told so if it is four acres, that's about 150 cats per acre. So, yeah, getting that number, finding out that number over here, if we have 100,000-plus cats that would have to be huge. So, that might be a challenge, but I'd be interested to see that data if you guys come up with it. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez, any other comment or question at this time?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think I'll save my comments for offline.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. So, Members, yeah, if you do think of additional concerns or questions, forward it to the Chair and then we'll send it forward for comments and response and have it returned to the members of the committee.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I had a question...

CHAIR HOKAMA: But, you know, hearing your questions, hearing some of the responses from our resource people...hold on, Ms. Paltin. Again, yeah, I'm open to any proposals you may have. If the Humane Society has some ideas you want us to consider, we're open to those, as well and you can work it either directly to this Committee or via the Parks, our director. Very shortly we are gonna talk about Parks' budget and year budget in this Committee and what we'll be recommending to Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez's Committee for final action. So, part of it is how we're gonna approach these types of issues, yeah, Members, so if you could keep that in your mind frame as we go through this process

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

on this subject matter. Again, we're gonna find out what is under our jurisdiction versus the State. Which agencies of the State and County are involved. I appreciate the comment about whether or not certain things should be designated a pest and we'll talk about that in more detail at the next meeting too. And I think we'll also ask Police to come and bring up any concerns they may have regarding public safety. Anything else you folks would like to bring up on this item before we move on? Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just was wondering, you know, when you were saying if we have additional questions to bring it to you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If the Staff got that one question about how many cats per acre are supported by the sanctuary, like what is, yeah, I asked that one out loud, but I'm like....

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, Lanai the capacity is a 1,000.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Per four acres? That's the max.

CHAIR HOKAMA: That's Ms. deJetley's, I would say her current numbers that she's...they work with. Again, yeah, it's depending upon the facilities within the acreage, so with their current facilities, that's their number of capacity.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, like about 250 per acre cats or just...

CHAIR HOKAMA: And again, yeah, if they do more improvements on the site they possibly could house more. I know they don't want to go over a certain limit for comfort sake of what they can actually manage.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then, I guess I would just ask how they deal with the waste.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, we can forward that to them and ask those...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And how much pounds of food they go through and the cost of that.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. The nice thing about Lanai is the County does not put public dollars. Okay. There's no taxpayer money in this program, which is what I like. Because we need more for people stuff. Okay. That's my priority. People first. Any comments before we move on, Director?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Chair. We just look forward to the next discussion. I'll let the other agencies on board.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Mr. MacKinnon, any other comments you wish?

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

MR. MacKINNON: No, thank you very much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: One thing though I will say yeah, and we will do more on the next meeting is I want consistency on how we allow usage of our public properties. So, I am gonna propose any use of our park facilities or public properties that has animals must have an executed agreement with the County. You cannot just let your goats loose in our basins. You cannot just roam your dogs any place on the beach park. Okay. We got rules. We got regulations. We have liabilities. So, unless those people comply I expect enforcement to start arresting and citing, including the park rangers. And notify those violators that we intend to enforce. Okay. I'm tired of those calls of how come I cannot let my dog loose since all these goats are in this park anyway? Okay. We will follow our policies and we will enforce accordingly. Okay. Whether it's on Lanai, Molokai or Maui. We will do it the one and only way. Yes, Ms. Sugimura?

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, the growing population of and I heard this from runners or people who walk in Keopuolani Park, the growing deer or axis deer population in there. And I know we have homeless too which is probably a bigger concern, but I wonder if we have even looked at the axis deer problem at Keopuolani Park or if we have a, you know, solution or if you're looking at it as, you know, something that we may need to tackle, you know, with the number of people that walk there and...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Parks Director?

MS. PETERS: Chair, thank you. Thank you, Member Sugimura. Yeah, I just recently received another report of someone walking during the day and then there were a herd of those deer came through. So, we did reach out to DLNR and we're trying to work on, with them, on what the proper process would be and how to get, either move the deer, trap and move, or just figure out how we can better stabilize it where it is, but definitely we are looking into it because it is a safety concern for us and with the population there. After we did do a lot of thinning of the vegetation within the undeveloped areas of the park, we've noticed less negative activity as well as the deer population. So, we'll be trying that more and also working again with DLNR to hopefully get this under control.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. The last time I wanted to ask the Members if you want me to file, I've had calls, but I think this is more in the State lands particularly upper Iao. You see those white spots way on the top of the hillsides, that's somebody's goat that ran away. Okay. Those are goats up there. So, again, more than likely we're gonna have to contact DLNR because it's more than likely within their jurisdiction. We'll see how we can work cooperatively because I can tell you, the animals don't care who owns the land. They're gonna go where the food and water is. That much we know. Any other things before we defer this item, Members, you'd like to get information on? Yes, Ms. King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you. While you're at it can we ask DLNR about what's happening with that Kealia Pond area because they fenced it supposedly to keep the feral pigs out, but there's still feral pigs in there and we're seeing whole families going

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

through the Kealia Pond so I'm not sure how effective that was if there's a plan two, plan B.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We'll send communication and invite them to the next meeting, Ms. King --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --to participate. Okay. Anything else? Yes, Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I thought I heard that you said you were also concerned with the ocean ones.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, so if you have things again, we can, you know we'll be inviting DLNR to come forward and...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Maybe aquatic resources for the toau, taape and roi.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Thank you for that. We'll follow up. Since it's a big issue on all our three sister islands. Okay. Members, with no objection we will defer this item. Okay. Thank you.

**COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.**

**ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.**

CHAIR HOKAMA: This item under HFC-24 is deferred and we thank Mr. MacKinnon for being here this afternoon, as well as our Parks Director.

**ITEM HFC-27: FISCAL YEAR 2019 GRANT PERFORMANCE AND EVALUATION REPORT FOR DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND HUMAN CONCERNS GRANTEES (CC 19-327)**

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. We're going to go straight into HFC-27. This is on the current fiscal year grant performance and evaluation report for Housing and Human Concerns and we have our Director, Ms. Tshako present this afternoon. Okay, Members, this one is more about an update and a status for the Director to give us regarding this subject area. We also have Curtis Jamison our Grants Administrator present to assist the Director. And what the Chair is looking at is to see if our agencies are, what kind of difficulties if contracts cannot be executed or other concerns that we may be able to assist either the grantee or the Department in ensuring timeliness and compliance of requirements, as well as meeting the goals of the intent of the grant. So, we'll ask the Director at this time, Ms. Tshako for any opening comments. Before you do, I wanted to just again reiterate that I believe her Department has done the best on how they've approached the grants and giving us information and status and that I hope you don't mind, Director, but we are using your form as the general template of all other

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

departments and agencies on how to report back grant information and status, so we've appreciated the work you've done ahead of time, as well as Mr. Jamison's work on this area.

MS. TSUHAKO: Thank you. Good afternoon, Mr. Chair and Members. As the Chair noted, Curtis Jamison who is our Grants Manager Division Administrator is here and the credit for the grant report card and its format and its purpose actually goes to Curtis and his staff because they work in this area every single day. The Chairman previously sent a communication requesting update on, specifically on Lanai grants. And that came on December 20<sup>th</sup> and the Department responded to that. So, I think you all may have a handout or communication that reflects, one, two, three, four, five, six, seven grants specifically addressing Lanai non-profits. They are the Lanai Community Association for the Lāna`i Kina`ole Home Team and E Malama I Na Keiki O Lanai which is a preschool program. The Lanai Community Health Center for Integrated Behavior Health Programs. Kumpang Lanai, which is a program called Coalition for Drug Free Lanai. The Lanai Youth Center has two grants, three grants. One for plan and design and one for, and an older one for plan and design for a new youth center and I will defer right now if it's okay with you, Mr. Chair, to Mr. Jamison to talk about the status of those Lanai grants and a brief status update on the entirety of our grant situation right now.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Thank you very much. Mr. Jamison?

MR. JAMISON: Okay. Thank you, Chair. Good afternoon, Council. So, update on the grants right now for Fiscal Year '20, there is only two grants that have yet to route for execution. One of them is the, one with Molokai Community Service Council and the other one with the Cameron Center. The only other one that hasn't been executed yet is with Kumpang Lanai but that one is already routed and that will probably be finished in the next three weeks or so depending on the contracts with them so depending on how fast we get it back, we can execute that in about three weeks. But...

CHAIR HOKAMA: What was your challenge, Mr. Jamison? Missing information or missing document, required document?

MR. JAMISON: So, honestly originally the form, the application that was received they used outdated forms and incorrect forms to fill out information so we had to kind of go back and forth with them. It came in right at the end and it was a kind of a busy time of year. It took a while to kind of sort that information out, but...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. No, we're just trying to understand it because we usually get the phone calls when I cannot get my money. This happened so then, you know, we're wondering what happened, but you know, that's why we're asking you can you help us understand if there was missing documents and you couldn't proceed or Corp. Counsel wouldn't sign out because of no notary on the other side, I mean, you know, things. We understand things happen, but it always seems to happen toward the end of the fiscal year. So, that's one of the issues that, you know, we were trying to overcome.

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

MS. TSUHAKO: If I may, Mr. Chair, one of the things that I noticed when I became the Director is that there are certain contracts that were being executed very late into the fiscal year, and so in order to try and, you know, maintain some semblance of order and predictability both for the grantees, as well as for the Department staff, this year, we imposed a deadline of December 31<sup>st</sup> to try and get all of the grantees' applications and their documentation and all of the requisite material that we need in order to execute a contract in before the end of the year so that even though it's a really big push for a small staff, Curtis has a staff of 3 people to do 100 grants, we thought that having that, kind of those parameters would help us manage that process a little better. And I think that by and large most of the grantees have tried really hard to meet those time guidelines. So, just a couple I see he's noting haven't been executed yet.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Great. How often do you do any type of refresher or grant meeting where let's say last minute the Feds made a change in reporting or something so now you gotta go back to those that are getting Federal dollars or whatever it may be, Mr. Jamison. You meet with the grantee what, twice a calendar year or something? Or just during the contract process?

MR. JAMISON: How often do we meet with grantees to assist them with the process?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. Quarterly at least because of the quarterly reporting?

MR. JAMISON: Honestly it depends on the grant and the grantee. Some grantees require much more monitoring and work with them. Since this evaluation has come out and after we held the, when we were here the last time talking about it, we found it helpful because actually a few grantees have actually approached us to have discussions with us on how they could achieve, get better at what they are doing and achieve their goals more. As far as general technical assistance with them, we've talked about it and last year we held a workshop in June to kind of prepare everybody for this coming cycle to close out FY '19 and begin FY '20 where we shared with them the grant evaluation process and so that they knew exactly what was coming up, as well as the expectations regarding deadlines to have all grants and documentation in place by December 31<sup>st</sup>. And those, that was extremely helpful and we'll probably do another workshop moving forward. The division has also been discussing about actually doing workshops based on grant topics so grants regarding homeless programs. Maybe we actually have a meeting with them where we work more specifically with them or youth centers, substance abuse programs where you can kind of tailor the technical assistance more specifically to the issue that they're dealing with.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. 'Cause, you know, one of the things that I just wanted to make sure is again, usually meet with the agencies that are the troubled ones so you meet with them more frequently than those that are very good in their reporting, they do their single audit requirements very well. Have you been able to utilize the Maui County non-profit director's group as a conduit or as a support to get your information out to the various agencies? Director?

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

MS. TSUHAKO: Thank you for your question, Mr. Chair. I have not met with the entirety of the non-profit executive directors. I've meet with plenty of individuals, but, you know, what Curtis described was some really grant specific workshops that were held on Molokai, Lanai and here in Wailuku during June and those were very well attended, not just by the program level people, but also by executive directors. And I think that we'll continue to urge not just the program people, but also agency leadership to attend those so that they understand what the Department needs in terms of outcomes, in terms of showing the relationship between the request for funding and what the outcomes are and the benefit to the community. I think that process of dialogue and being really clear about expectations is really important and it helps us do a better job of providing service.

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, I'm happy to hear that because before I ask the Members for their, you know, questions or thoughts, one of the things I'm thinking about that I may be recommending through our Budget Chair, Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez is I'm looking at potentially competitive pots. It's the individual grant allotment to a specific non-profit. One of my ideas that I'm gonna talk to our Budget Chair about is maybe we would say "x" amount of dollars, whatever the number may be, for "x" program. Let's say, homeless program. Then the agencies can put in their submittals and those with the best are gonna get funded. But there's no guarantee of funding unless your submittal is qualified and good enough and if you're existing, you've already shown that you can hit the marks on your previous grants. Because I think that's maybe one of the ways we can get the measurements we want, is by making it more competitive and allow the agencies to really put pencil and brain together. Instead of just saying we're gonna give everybody money. I wish we was that rich. We've got big bills. You know it. I know it. We're gonna need to make adjustments on how we allocate and we know we're gonna have to put money in infrastructure. So, it's one of my ideas, I'm gonna chat with Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez as one approach of how to deal with the grants and get the measurements we want out of those agencies. So, I'm going to open it now to you Members for the department, questions or comments. Ms. Sugimura, Vice-Chair?

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair, I really agree with you and I love this, not love, I like this format and I think it provided us probably the most information from all the reports that I saw through the departments. And I like the...I was asking my staff to possibly put this into a format so we can get all the departments to kind of follow what you've done and congratulations because it was you fresh start in the department and by seeing the challenges of your over hundred grants, you put this together which made it an easier story for you to tell us and the public about what you are accomplishing. So, I would like to put that into some, have it so that all the departments follow this format, you know, once we kind of narrow what we want and, or add in. And Shelly who is my staff person, we were working on it through my Multimodal Transportation Department [sic] just so that the Department of Transportation could then provide similar, I mean, they don't have as many grants as you do, although their grants are pretty large, you know, dollar amounts. But still the amount of information that is needed to get out of it is probably, you know, similar in some degree. So, Chair, if we could work together and come up with something so that we can get this so that all the departments can follow this format. I like it a lot.

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

CHAIR HOKAMA: My plan is to go through Chair Lee since she has a reach of all the committees. Because I'm still looking forward to what OED is going to report back to Chair Rawlins-Fernandez. We told them what they presented to us on the OED grants was not acceptable and to return back with additional information on the statuses and the Chair has been patient. We are still waiting. And it's been months. So, you know, if those grant administrators is gonna just allow us at budget to make the call, then that's fine with me. But I don't want to be unfair to the grantees. Yeah. So, I appreciate your comments. Anything else?

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Ms. Kama, anything at this time?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes. Thank you, Chair. So, as I'm looking at the remarks column and I see that quite of few say things like applicant lacks measure of client success in community reintegration and there's this lack in their reporting. So, if you see that lack what are you doing to ensure that what our expectations are in terms of the outcomes that we're looking at are met?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Director?

MS. TSUHAKO: Thank you for your question, Councilmember Kama. What happens behind the scenes with, that's not reflected really in the report card that you see is the work, almost minutia that goes on between the program specialist and the agency. So, if you can imagine having a caseload of 30 to 35 grants and having, you know, deficiencies with reporting. So, maybe the agency is reporting...the first quarter they might report, we did ten of this and the second quarter they report doing five of them, but their cumulative number is not 15, right? So, it's the small things that don't match in the reporting that need to get worked out at the level that Curtis and his staff work with them. So, it's sometimes, it's those small things. Other times it's really big things, like, you know, we may get a report, a quarterly report, that says this is the outcome that we're looking for and then the next time they submit their quarterly report, they might dig up in their electronic files an older version of the form that has a different goal and they didn't look at it to check and see that it's this year's goal that they're supposed to be reporting. So, unfortunately some of that still occurs. Where, you know, I do this, I keep old forms in my electronic files and then sometimes you just cut and paste. Then you forget. Oh my God we're not doing that same reporting thing anymore. So, it's kind of like working with grantees to get them on the same page. Like, make sure you use updated forms. Make sure you're using the same goals that you submitted. Right? It's those things that take a lot of time and I think it takes time and effort from the Grants Management staff and it takes time and effort from the grantee as well. But those are, that's the type of level of detail that are addressed by the Grants Management staff in order to get an accurate picture of what that agency is doing. So, for example, when we had that grants workshop in June, one of the things I told the grantees is that in order to receive taxpayer funded money in grant form from the County, you have to not only be able to do the work that's being expected of you. So, you gotta accomplish that. That one-to-one work, whatever it is right? Is it taking people off the homeless streets and

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

placing them into shelter? That's what you have to do. The other thing that grantees have to do is they have to be able to accurately account for how the County funding is spent. So, you cannot just do half of the job. I can be really good at accounting, but if I cannot house homeless people, then I shouldn't be paid to house homeless people right? And if I can only house homeless people but I cannot show you how that money is being spent, how it's allocated, how I'm accounting for that funding versus money that I get from the State, then that doesn't work for us either. So, collectively we have to raise the capacity of the non-profits to do both parts. And that's what we're aiming to do. Through our direct intervention with the agencies, also in a larger sense.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Chair? So, what we get is this report, is this an annual report or, is this, this is the annual right?

MS. TSUHAKO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. So, if I look at the previous report that you gave us, or if we look at another report in a year from today and I look at the same, because I keep my eyes on certain agencies, and it's the same thing. I don't want to see that right?

MS. TSUHAKO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: And so, when you look at how, are you looking at what they reported last time to what they report the next time so that they're not making the same errors all the time?

MS. TSUHAKO: Yeah. I'll let Curtis answer that because he's closer to that.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay.

MR. JAMISON: Yeah, in short, yeah, we do. We compare and that's actually where we find a lot of discrepancies and then we're able to bring it up with the grantees and we normally bring it right back to them for clarification on that. So we're able to see how the grantee progresses over the year, if either they make an error and then we help them and they correct that error and then we don't see that error again versus sometimes we see, we help them with an error, they correct the error, the next quarter the error shows up again so then they have to correct it again. So, then it starts appearing on the annual report, repeated. You'll see some that says repeated reporting errors and things like that. Our goal is to eliminate as much of that as possible by working with grantees. So, sometimes we'll go down and see with them how do you keep your records? How do you keep your information? To see if there's either systematic ways we can help them. Some of them we put the auspice on them as well. This is, you get the money and this is what you said you're gonna do, so you guys gotta kinda get your act together a little bit and make these adjustments as well. So, we're always willing to work with the grantee to help them move forward in that department. But, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Right. So my deepest concern is those grantees that are year after year, after year, after year come and receive funding and it's like if they've been doing

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

this for years and years and they're still making mistakes, I mean, there has to come a time when you're such an expert at this that you don't make any mistakes because nothing changes that great in terms of the application, in terms of your deadlines, in terms of your reporting out, right? So, that's just my whole sense of oh my gosh, ha`ina `ia mai ana ka puana again, you know. So, I just to figure out when does this all stop and we get to a place of consistency or expediency or efficiency or, so that place of okay, good job, that's all. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for those. I can tell you some of our sister jurisdictions upfront tell the agencies you can only have funding for three consecutive years and then you're not gonna get money and then they give them, I forget what was the break, then they can reapply later. But there's no guarantee they get every year funding. So, those jurisdictions usually go with three-year cycles. They'll fund you for three years, but you better be able to budget for the fourth year without that county money.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Or even a sustainability.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. Again, you know every jurisdiction has limitations and unique situations, but that's how some of our sisters, entities have done it on the mainland. Mr. Molina, questions sir, comments?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Thank you, Chair. Just with regards to the matrix that was provided to us by the departments. More on some updates on some of these entities that have received grants, Page 1, regarding Boys and Girls Club, Paukukalo Clubhouse Plan and Design states as of June 30<sup>th</sup> no County of Maui funds have been requested, nor has the three-to-one State match been met. First and second quarter reports not submitted due to little or no progress on the project. Any, has anything changed since June 30<sup>th</sup> on this matter?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Department?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I see the Director's...

CHAIR HOKAMA: That's the CIP project, there, Mr. Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. It had to do with the clubhouse plan and design.

MS. TSUHAKO: Thank you for that question, Mr. Molina. So, I just conferred with Curtis and we don't know current up-to-date today information about that. I think one of the provisos if I'm not mistaken, there was a proviso on that grant that said that the agency had to obtain a financial commitment I think from Hawaiian Home Lands or OHA before that money would be released. And I'm not sure what, I haven't seen Kelly in a long time, so I'm not sure what the reason for not, for no movement on that just yet.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. So, it sounds like something internal with them between them and OHA I guess.

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

MS. TSUHAKO: It could be, I mean I think if we had proof that the proviso condition was met, it would be, you know, we would be moving along in that process.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Chairman, just a couple more...

CHAIR HOKAMA: So, Mr. Molina, you want us to get the actual status for you?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Whichever way. Because I know some of these are still not complete, I guess they were held up or for various reasons. So, that's kind of a...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Well, my thing is since Leg is gonna start soon, if that's something that will help you present your position at the Legislature to our Maui delegation that either ask the Governor to release or have "da da da da" execute their departmental requirements for the County funds to be released. I mean, at least you could come up with one plan. So, we happy to get you, assist in getting you the current status information. We'll send a letter to Boys and Girls Club.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. And then also for the Ohana Makamae, as well too. I guess there were two. One was for 103,207 line item and 45,000 target funds, so updates on those two grants.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Do you have anything on that, Director?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Page 7.

MS. TSUHAKO: I can tell you, Mr. Molina, that about three weeks ago we, you know, we had a meeting with the Executive Director of Ohana Makamae because I had expressed some concern about Hana being such an isolated community and this being the sole provider of service. And looking at that situation, relative to the difficulty the Department has had with the agency as a grantee, spoke to Councilmember Sinenci about that and he coincidentally had a meeting scheduled the next day with the agency. He talked with the agency. The agency subsequently came in and talked to us. We had a really honest conversation with them and I think the perception of the Executive Director was, well, I've been doing everything that I'm supposed to do. And because of the really excellent recordkeeping that Curtis' staff had, we were able to actually show her in terms of the communications that, you know, look, there's this really big gap. These things haven't been done since July. And what we did that day was we took time to explain to her that, you know, when you have 30 to 35 grants and there's a deadline and if somebody misses their deadline, then their stuff when they turn it in goes on the bottom of the pile and then you just do your work chronologically according to who turned their stuff in first. And so, the question was repeated e-mails, reminders, and please do this, please do that. And what I'm encouraging Curtis and his staff to do is to, yeah, you can encourage people to do that, but there should be no need to babysit any agency who is getting money from the County. Right? That's your job.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I totally agree with that.

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

MS. TSUHAKO: That's your job, you know. That's your job. So, pretty soon we're gonna transition into a position where we're gonna treat agencies like adults, right. And if you miss the deadline, tough. Right? And you guys are gonna get the complaints, you know. This body and the Mayor will hear the complaints from those agencies. But I think reasonably we should expect grantees to do what they need to do. Just like us too though, it goes both ways yeah? So it's like if we take too long then it's up to us to stand up and say, you know what, I'm sorry that took me a week longer than it should have. That's my responsibility.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: It's called accountability. Yeah. It works both ways yeah, so good. I appreciate you taking that approach. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, thank you for asking that because that's always one of the questions on why does the County help pay for certain executive director's salary amounts. They make big money. So then, so they should earn it. I'm with you. Ms. King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah. Thank you, Chair. This is...and do you share these scores with the agencies because I think this is such a great tool to be able to show them what the scores are that they're getting and then they can see that you know maybe where they're falling down. But, Chair, I wanted to kind of go back to something you said about trying to put out large amounts for subject matter and then having some of the agencies bid on it and I wonder if, I like that idea, but then I also, it makes me a little worried about some of the grants we're giving out that, you know, we've been sort of, almost considering fixed costs and then we kinda did that with some of the agencies, the non-profits last year, to cut down the amount of time that they had to keep coming back and sending multiple people to testify. But because we have some of the agencies like MEO that runs our, you know, bus services for seniors, Ka Hale A Ke Ola that runs a facility for homeless shelters. The youth centers. I wonder if it's possible to get a list from your Department on which agencies, you know, should be considered possibly for some kind of a three-year funding and then look at it in three years. Because it wouldn't even be that easy to make a transition in one year for some of these agencies because they are pretty entrenched in the facilities that they are running and the services they do so if you try to bring someone else in in one year to take over some of these services I don't think it would be possible for some of them. And if we could get a list of those upfront, you know, that we could, that we know are doing a good job, that are doing a good job reporting, that we don't have to put out to bid or if we are going to, let's give them a couple years to, you know, if the goal is to see if there's someone better out there that can do it, then there needs to kinda be prepared, we need to be prepared for what it is exactly that we're looking for that we're not getting. So, I like the idea. I think it's a little bit far out to try to do it in one year turning over some of these pots of money to RFPs, because there's not a quick...and I watched this with the landfill there's not a quick date that one agency can be out and the next day the next agency comes in. And that was one of the pitfalls of the Anaergia contract. It was you know, they couldn't get EKO out on this day and have anybody else take over the next day because there's all this equipment. There's, you know, I mean tons and tons of compost that has to be removed. There's no way to transition that quickly. So, that would be my concern about trying to do that in one budget year without having some forethought and preparing for

## HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

January 9, 2020

---

it, you know. So, that at some point...I mean, I like the idea of competition and I like the idea of if there are agencies that aren't working on completing the work they are supposed to do that, you know, give other agencies or organizations a chance. But I think it has to be done in a little bit more preparatory way so that we're not cutting ourselves off at the knees and trying to transition somebody else to run our senior buses or someone else to run the homeless facility and, you know, having it. Just so anyway that's kind of my thought on that is that we want to be prepared for it if we do it. So, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I appreciate those comments. No, that's exactly what I wanted today, Ms. King, get your thoughts, and again, I agree. Not everything will fit under the competitive pot option. But my thing is it doesn't hurt for us to take a look if certain things makes sense. I agree with you, certain things...we may even want to look at multiple year agreements.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah. I like that idea.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Two-year agreements, the biennium like the term of the Council kind of thing right. So...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: You know I like that idea because I think it also gives the non-profits a chance to plan.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Instead of going year to year. Like we don't know if we're going get our funding next year. So, if we can, and then they don't have to spend a lot of their time coming to our budget sessions and, you know, bringing all, you know, 20 people with them, but they can do their work. So, I think if it's done, if the Department can do, you know, can start doing that kind of assessment, like which ones would we be ready to put out to that kind of proposal, which ones, you know, are just doing such a great job right now that we don't even need to consider that, and then we can just, you know, if we can give them three-year agreements we can let them just do their work and plan for the next three years. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, thank you for those thoughts. Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I'm really enjoying this discussion. So, I wanted to first make a comment on OED's grant process. I know we've briefly talked about that and one of the things that the Director, oh sorry, is she Director? Ms. Fukumoto mentioned when I did schedule the overview of the grants, OED grants, is that she only has one person. So, I wanted to ask Director Tsuhako how many people do you have working on grant management and reporting?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Director?

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

MS. TSUHAKO: Thank you for your question, Vice-Chair. Curtis has himself, he has two program specialists and he has office assistant, operations assistant, so there's four people all together.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, Curtis and then three other office assistants?

MS. TSUHAKO: No. Curtis, two program specialists, and an office operations assistant. So, the bulk of the Department's grants are managed through Grants Management, but we also have an arrangement in our Department where topic-specific grants are managed by the office where it's housed in. So, let me give you an example, so there's a grant that we executed this year for Lanai Kina`ole, which is a healthcare agency mainly targeted at the elderly. So, that contract is managed at the Office on Aging, because it's their area-specific grant. Our Lanai Malama I Na Keiki Preschool grant is managed by our Early Childhood Resource Coordinator. So some of those 100 or so grants that we have in our Department are kind of farmed out based on their area of specialty of the rest of our Department. The first-time homebuyer...I mean the rental assistance program is now managed at the Housing Division. So, there is a couple of grants that are farmed out based on specific topic area.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for that explanation. So, in creating this evaluation spreadsheet, is it just Curtis that works on this spreadsheet or do the other managers, grant managers also provide input?

MS. TSUHAKO: Thank you. That's a good question. So, Curtis and his staff do the bulk of it, but the program specialists in the other divisions who also manage those contracts do the comments, do the evaluation of the grantee's performance, et cetera.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Great. Do you feel that the amount of staff that you have, Curtis, office assistant, two program specialists, and the grant managers are sufficient to do this work? To provide this type of reporting to the Council? And is the goal for this reporting to be an annual report or would you like to shoot for like a quarterly report, or a semi-annual report?

MS. TSUHAKO: Let me take your questions in a couple parts.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. TSUHAKO: It is an annual report. It's meant to be an annual report in the Code. If you think about how our contracts are organized and the payment schedule goes quarterly where we give an advance in the first quarter and then the second quarter, et cetera. It would be really challenging to have the staff be...have to do this process in a smaller amount of time, in a shorter amount of time. I think looking at things from an annual point of view gives this body, as well as the grantees a better picture of the entire year of performance. Because let's say, I mean for example, if you have a new grantee who doesn't have any idea how to do quarterly reports, if you were to evaluate them at the end of the first quarter, they'd probably do very poorly unless they're exceptional. Right?

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

So, if you only look at that in that one small snapshot of time, it's not gonna give you a really accurate or maybe optimistic view, perspective of that grantee. So, I think annually is the right timing for that. I think it's also very burdensome from the Department's point of view. Right? It is a good tool to reflect the work that has occurred between the staff and the grantee over the year. And I think a year is a good time for that. In terms of the ability to manage the number of grants that we had, you know, it's hard as a Director to say, well we wouldn't be able to use another position. But what I can tell you is that the people that Curtis has and the program specialists in the other divisions who get farmed out these contracts over the course of the year do a really good job and I feel very confident as a Director in telling you that my staff is competent in doing this work and we can handle the amount of grants we have. Now, if for example, this body were to go hog wild and you were able to generate a 100 more grants that were assigned to the Department, we would have a struggle with that. But I think at the rate we're going and where we are right now, the ratio of staff to grantee is manageable.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Do you know what that ratio is?

MS. TSUHAKO: Well, because the program specialist in the other divisions don't...they do more than just the grants management piece for their own work stations, I would say that it's probably about what 30, maybe 32, 31 or 32 each for a program specialist.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo. And the reason I asked if it was broken up so like the grant application column that's like a one-time thing. Use of funds, you know, each quarter could be a different score. The responsiveness, you know, could each quarter be a different score. And so, I'm just wondering, you know, at the end of the year if that's the only time that they are being evaluated, how accurate is that final evaluation. If it's not being, you know, scored throughout.

MS. TSUHAKO: Okay. So, I think the way that I would explain that is throughout the course of the year, the grantee and the program specialist communicate very frequently with each other. So, that level of interaction is actually feedback for the grantee. For example, if you are a grantee and you kept turning in reports that were wrong, that had errors all over it, right, and I circle it and I say please check your number over here and make sure it's correct and then resubmit. And I send it back to you and then you change the number, but it's still not correct. You just change the number. It happens. Don't laugh. It happens. And so, I send it back to you I say "Oh, Keani, it's still wrong. Can you make sure you check?" Okay. And it goes back eight times. That, the cumulative effect of those eight times back and forth is your feedback that something not right, right? So then, okay, so then it may be come into the office and show me how you got to those eight different numbers that you gave me. Something's not right in the way you're calculating this or something. So, come show me how you're doing that or Curtis and the specialist go down to the office and say show me your records. What did you use to populate these cells with that information? So, those steps, that remediation that the staff takes in order to address the inaccuracies in the reporting is the feedback that we give throughout the year. So, my hope is none of the agencies who see this report card go, oh my God, how did I do, you know, why is my score only 2.0 on this?

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

Is it, they're like, oh yeah, I mean it did take me 15 tries before I got the second quarter and the third quarter report right. So, it shouldn't be a surprise.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for that response and I understand that. I think the last time we scheduled this item, what I had asked for from the Department was like an objective criteria on how the agencies receive their score. Just so like what Member King was saying, this feedback is good for the agencies to receive and if this is what we the Council will then be looking at and the Department will be basing their recommendations off of to determine which entities would become like a fixed cost in our budget, that it would be good for the entities to know how they can improve their score. Like, if they know what the criteria is and how they're being judged to earn this score.

MS. TSUHAKE: So, may I ask a clarification then? So, are you asking us to expand upon the descriptions under each of those headings, like grant application and say exactly like, application was complete, addressed all the requirement elements? I mean, is that what the level of detail in an explanation that you are looking for in this document?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I mean, I guess it would be like, how do you get that score? So, you know, would it be a clear description, it like a score of .5 funding used, .5 program activities, .5 strong measurable, you know, .5 positive change, .5 and the highest you can get, you know, like the same thing with the max score is a score of 5. And then that way they can see, oh okay, so I guess, you know, my program activities was a .2, so perhaps I should strengthen that area so that I can improve my score. And the last time, Member Paltin had suggested using weighted scores for things that kind of are a little more important. I can't remember your response to that. I don't remember if you said that they are all equally important. But I had agreed with Member Paltin in that, you know, meeting the community needs, you know, is probably the most important and maybe instead of an equal score of max five points, it would be, you know, max ten points or something.

MS. TSUHAKE: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, and then...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. You can report back to us, Director, if you're making any revisions or adjustments to your form. If you'd share that information with the Committee please.

MS. TSUHAKE: Thank you. We will.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Thank you. Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Director and Mr. Jamison. Based on, I guess dovetailing off of Member Rawlins-Fernandez's question and I had some of my own, but I think maybe she was asking like a blueprint. Like if somebody wants to

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

get a five in a category and they're getting twos or threes, like an instructions on how to get to the five. Like in order to get a five you need to have all your paperwork in on time, there needs to be no error, I mean that is kind of common sense, but what it is the cutoff between a five and a four and what will make you bump down to a three or how do you get out a three to a four I think was what she wanted to know kind of. But for me, in, as now we're kind of more ma`a to the system of the grants in each of the different departments, are they...that award grants, like the difference between OED and DHHC and transportation and whatnot. Are all of these grants that you folks deal with, the Council and the Administration, the Mayor, budget team are the ones that are selecting who gets all of these? Like for OED they have people apply, as well as, you know, we proviso things, but are all of your grants selected by us during the budget and the Mayor and nobody applies?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Director?

MR. TSUHAKO: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Thank you for your question, Member Paltin. It's twofold. So, there's a deadline established, I can't remember what it was. Yeah. I think it was in August or September. There was a deadline established so the Department said to grantees or to potential grantees, hey, if you want to be included in the Mayor's budget for 2020, please submit an application. So, the application included generally the same grant application that would go in to using to build a contract. So, it wasn't just a skeleton. It was all of the information. So, we had that deadline, agencies responded to that deadline, submitted requests, and Curtis and his staff went through all of those, came up with questions, came up with comments, came up with recommendations, brought those to the Deputy Director, and to me. We reviewed those together and then organized them and presented those to the Mayor as our Department's request for funding for fiscal year. So, our contracts actually do, are for two years. So, the, we're starting a new, this is the second year of the funding cycle. Yeah, FY '20 is the second year of a funding cycle. So, when Fiscal Year '21 starts and if agencies get funded, meaning they're in the Mayor's budget and this body approves and approves funding at whatever level, then barring some big change, like the agency folding or a huge economic crash, that agency can expect to get funding in the next fiscal year as well. So, we did both. So, there was an application. There was a screening. Department reviewed proposed grantees and funding amounts to the Mayor and that decision is with the Mayor ultimately on what gets transmitted to the Council as his request.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, all the monies that you give out are decided by the end of the budget's cycle, nothing is, there's no applications coming in after the budget like how OED does. Like they have like say \$140,000 per district for cultural and art or something. Yeah. And then they'll take applications after the budget. Yours is all prior to the budget?

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, no, no, no, no, no, no. OED money is not like that. OED money historically is what the members want out of that pot, under either cultural or economic development and normally it adds up to whatever each district gets. OED's responsibility is to put the grant out for what the member of the district wanted in the

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

budget process and got approved by the Council. It's not their discretionary funds at all.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I didn't put anything for West Maui.

CHAIR HOKAMA: But if you have projects, then you tell them, this is what you want with your district pot. It's for the district. It's not for the OED specialist to decide. That is for you as the member of the district to decide.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. So, I guess my point was like in looking over these numbers and whatnot, the percentages that seem kind of low, seem to be for those types of organizations or those filling the needs that there isn't a lot of competition to do. Like, maybe like, I mean, I don't want to name names, but maybe folks that are dealing with substance abuse, or you know, there's not a lot of options in a certain area or within the County and is that why low scores are tolerated because we don't have a lot of, to choose from?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Director?

MS. TSUHAKO: Member, I don't want to say I tolerate low scores, because I don't, yeah. That is something that I'm very dogged about. My expectation is that if you get County funded grants to do this work, you gotta do the work. So, but I will tell you that there is a consciousness at the Department, as well as I'm sure with this body that we don't have a really big pallet of providers who are ready and able to step up. Should one, you know, should one entity fail or be deficient, there's not 20 agencies behind them waiting to jump into the fray. So, it becomes a delicate balance of trying to build up the capacity and address the deficiencies so that we can in good conscience continue to fund that service. 'Cause maybe the community doesn't have any other option but this agency. And what would happen to that community if they didn't have that service, you know. So, it may not be crossing all the T's and dotting all the I's that the Department wants to have, but if they're doing a service that's so important to the community, then we step up even more to try and help them to meet that, to meet those thresholds of performance so that we can continue to have that service for that community. So, again, I don't want to tolerate sloppiness or deficiencies in performance either administratively or programmatically. But we want to do what we can to help those providers do a better job because our community needs the service.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. And then, the other question I had was I like the remarks section. And when you make the remark that a program doesn't, that the County is the sole funder of the program, and we know these programs have been around a long time, is that for informational purposes or do you also go to the program that we're the sole funder of and say, hey, you know, like 80 percent of the other grants we give out look for matching funds, or at least, like you know, make an effort. Like is that us being the sold funder of the program only for us to know or is it like putting them on notice, like, hey you're one of the only guys that the County is the sole funder of and what are you gonna do about it? Do you have plans? Have you made applications and not got funded? Or is that...and in sharing with the agencies their scores, do you

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

show them the whole spreadsheet so that they can compare themselves to other agencies, like what their percentages are and maybe pair up agencies that are doing great and say hey maybe you guys can like go learn from how they do theirs so they can kind of work together so it takes a little bit of stressor off of our staff and our resources to always be saying, like hey you need to get your reports in on time. Maybe you should put it on your calendar and like have reminders every day or go talk to these guys who are getting fives and like learn from them or something like that. Like how do you go about those things?

MS. TSUHAKO: Thank you for your suggestion and I hope that many of the grantees whose agencies are listed on these pages follow your sage advice. So, the reason for identifying the County and its place in the funding picture for each of the agencies is twofold. One of them is just inform all of us, right? The second is to also, what we also do is in the application form itself, there's an explanation saying that, you know, the County expects you to look for other sources of funding because we don't want you to be dependent on us, you know. The Chair and I have spoken many times about this, you know. Agencies cannot be dependent on the County solely for funding, because there may be a time when we don't have the resources that we have now. When the County cannot be as generous to fund these activities. And so, in order to prepare for that and in order to reduce dependency on County funds, the process of going after other funding sources, whether it's private foundations, whether it's State GIA, whether it's Federal funds, we have to encourage, we have to almost demand the agencies do that work. That would be negligent of them, in terms of their own responsibility to their agency to not seek other funding. So, we make that pretty explicitly clear in terms of the application and what we ask for, as well as in our conversations with them. We talked about that at the trainings that we did over the summer. That is the County's expectation. Do not depend on us. And do not feel entitled to funding. There should be no sense of entitlement for anybody.

CHAIR HOKAMA: That's a nice goal there, Director.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then, you know, when you were saying it's a two-year cycle, does that mean that this budget year, that it's all of these we don't have to review because they're already funded or this budget cycle is the end of the two years and we have to reevaluate and these people may be coming back to us to get funded? And then we go and say like well it looks like you have a problem with errors and timely reporting, is that gonna happen this budget cycle that we're gonna...

MS. TSUHAKO: So, '20, this current fiscal year, 2020 is the second year of a budget cycle. So when this body, the Budget Committee convenes in a few months to review the County budget for Fiscal Year '21 and you decide to fund agencies, and essentially barring any reduction in total funding, that agency should be expected to get a second year's worth of funding for Fiscal Year '22. So, you could, I mean, that's not what the Department did this report card for.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, that's not.

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

MS. TSUHAKO: That wasn't the purpose. No, it's required, you know, by what, the 3.35.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. Code requirements.

MS. TSUHAKO: Yeah. So it's not the Department's aim to do that in particular, but I think what it offers is it offers the Department, as well as the grantees, as well as this body an opportunity say, oh, okay, so you're asking me for \$2 million this year, you know...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And you got a 65 percent which is equivalent to a D.

MS. TSUHAKO: Right and this course suggests that maybe you're having, you know, challenges with articulating your goals and your outcomes really clearly. So, it's not clear that this money is really going for this purpose, or, you know, whatever the situation may be. And I think it gives an agency really an opportunity to kind of cement the relationship between what they're saying and asking for versus what they're thinking is gonna be done.

CHAIR HOKAMA: You know what, Members, we're going to cut it right here, because we're just regurgitating certain things, yeah. For me, the purpose of this review was to give you a sense of the status because I can tell you now, I'm not happy with all the agencies. So, we may not be recommending funding for certain agencies to Budget and Finance Committee. Okay. That's just the way life is. What we want to know if you have issues or problem grantees, either they failed their single audit requirements. Because the Feds don't let you return audits 12 times. When you submit your audit, you better be on it. Okay. Or you're gonna get one failure and one ding for the single audit requirements. So, I'm with you. Stop babying the agencies. If they want to find out what it takes to get better, it's up to them, the ED and their board of directors who has the fiscal responsibility to get the agency on the track. It's not the County to hold their hand and say you need to do this if you want our money. If they want our money, they do what they need to do period. Okay. There's other agencies that are willing to take the spot. So, I don't have time to deal with non-satisfactory performing entities. For me, we don't have the time or luxury to babysit anybody. Whether they're 20 years old, 40 years old or a brand new one year olds. Okay. We are gonna defer this item because there's additional things I believe the Committee may want to discuss prior to us forwarding recommendations to Ms. Keani Rawlins' fiscal committee for the budget deliberations. Are there any requests to the Chair for information regarding any of the items? Director, is there anything you'd like to say, or, Mr. Jamison, that maybe we can assist you with?

MS. TSUHAKO: No thank you, Chair. Thank you for having us this afternoon. We appreciate this opportunity.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Jamison, anything?

MR. JAMISON: No, I agree. We don't have anything else, but thank you for the opportunity.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. We appreciate your good work. And again --

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: --see how you can make the adjustments of improvements from the Member's comments and notify us how you want to approach it and we'll work with you. So, Members, with no objections, any...to deferring? Yes, Ms. King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Sorry about that. I just had one request.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: If this is easy for the Department to do, is it possible to take this spreadsheet and prioritize it by score so we can kind of get a list of, you know, from the highest score to the lowest scoring?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Director, any issues?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Is that easy? If it's a matter of just like resorting?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, yeah, next report.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah, I think that might be helpful.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Any other requests? Yes, Ms. Sugimura?

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: I just want to thank Mr. Jamison for coming up with this format, 'cause it certainly has expanded knowledge and possibilities that...thank you. Thank you very much. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. No other business. Thank you, Members, for being here.

**COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.** (Excused: KRF)

**ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.**

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

CHAIR HOKAMA: We are adjourned. . . .(gavel). . .

**ADJOURN:** 3:42 p.m.

APPROVED:



---

RIKI HOKAMA, Chair  
Healthy Families and Communities  
Committee

hfc:min:200109:ta

Transcribed by: Terianne Arreola

**HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**January 9, 2020**

---

CERTIFICATE

I, Terianne Arreola, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 30<sup>th</sup> day of January, in Makawao, Hawaii.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Terianne Arreola', is written over a horizontal line.

Terianne Arreola