

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

February 4, 2020

Council Chamber

CONVENE: 1:34 p.m.

PRESENT: VOTING MEMBERS:

Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Chair
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Kelly Takaya King
Councilmember Alice L. Lee (arrived at 1:50 p.m., left at 2:59 p.m.)
Councilmember Michael J. Molina
Councilmember Tamara Paltin
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura

STAFF: Kasie Apo Takayama, Legislative Analyst
Nicole Siegel, Committee Secretary

Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Molokai Council Office (*via telephone conference bridge*)

Denise Fernandez, Council Aide, Lanai Council Office (*via telephone conference bridge*)

Mavis Oliveira-Medeiros, Council Aide, Hana Council Office (*via telephone conference bridge*)

Gina Flammer, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci
(*seated in gallery*)

ADMIN.: Richelle Thomson, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel
Stephanie Chen, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel
Eric Nakagawa, Director, Department of Environmental Management
Tamara Farnsworth, Environmental Protection and Sustainability Division Chief, Department of Environmental Management

OTHERS: Gretchen Losano, Co-founder, West Maui Green Cycle & Grow Some Good

Faith Chase (*via telephone conference bridge, Hana Council Office*)

Brooke Cuomo, Student, Girl Scouts Troop 440/Kihei Charter

Marjorie Bonar

Ashley O'Colmain, Program Assistant, Maui Huliau Foundation and Education and Outreach Committee Lead, Zero Waste Maui Coalition

Taylor Guindon, Student, Girl Scouts Troop 440/Kihei Charter

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

Robin Proctor
Cheryl King
Jason Economou, Government Affairs Director, REALTORS® Association of
Maui
Zandra Amaral-Crouse
Jasee Law

Others (2)

PRESS: *Akaku: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

CHAIR SINENCI: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Aloha mai kakou, and welcome to the Environmental, Agricultural, and Cultural Preservation Committee meeting of Tuesday, February 4th. It is 1:34 p.m. I'm Shane Sinenci, your Committee Chair. Before we go on, may I please ask that everyone silence all cell phones on the Chamber floors and in the Chambers? Thank you. For introductions today, starting with my right, your left, we have Committee Vice-Chair, Ms. Tasha Kama. Aloha.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Aloha Poalo [*sic*], Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha Poalua. Also, next to her we have Councilmember Yuki Lei Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Good afternoon, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Good afternoon. Thanks for being here. From West Maui, Councilmember Tamara Paltin. Aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha awakea, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha awakea. And also we have from South Maui, Councilmember Kelly Takaya King.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Aloha and good afternoon.

CHAIR SINENCI: Good afternoon. And finally from Upcountry, we have Councilmember Mike Molina. Aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Aloha, Mr. Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha, thanks for being here. Council Chair Alice Lee is excused for now and she may be joining us in a little bit. For non-voting Members we have Mr. Riki Hokama and Ms. Keani Rawlins-Fernandez and they're always welcome to join us if they so choose. Administrative representatives, we have Ms. Richelle

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

Thomson, Deputy Corporation Counsel. Welcome. Also with her we have Ms. Stephanie Chen. Thanks for being here today. We have Mr. Eric Nakagawa from the Department of Environmental Management.

MR. NAKAGAWA: Aloha.

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha. Ms. Tamara Farnsworth, welcome.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: From the Sustainability Division, yeah, Environmental Protection and Sustainability. We also have administrative representatives Ms. Gretchen Losano, Co-Founder, West Maui Green Cycle & Grow Some Food [sic]. Welcome.

MS. LOSANO: Aloha mai kakou.

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha mai. For our Staff today we have Ms. Kasie Apo Takayama, Ms. Nicole Siegel, and in our District Offices, in Hana we have Ms. Mavis Oliveira-Medeiros, in Lanai we have Ms. Denise Fernandez, in Molokai we have Ms. Zhantell Lindo. Okay, Members, we have one item on the agenda today, EACP-16, Restricting the Use and Sale of Single-Use Plastic Disposable Foodware. For food...did I say foodware? Yeah. Yeah. For individuals testifying in the Chamber, please sign up at the desk just outside the Chamber door. If testifying from one of the remote testimony sites, please sign up with District Office Staff. Testimony will be limited to the item on the agenda today. And pursuant to the Rules of the Council, each testifier will be allowed to testify for up to three minutes. When testifying, please state your name and the name of any organization you may be representing. Pursuant to the Rules of the Council, if you're a paid lobbyist, please inform the Committee. We have established a connection to the Council District Offices. And, Ms. Apo Takayama, do we have any testifiers in our District Offices?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Yes, Chair, we have one testifier in the Hana District Office.

. . . BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. Ms. Mavis Oliveira-Medeiros?

MS. OLIVEIRA-MEDEIROS: Aloha, Chair. This is Mavis from the Hana Office, and I have one testifier; Faith Chase. Go ahead, Faith.

MS. CHASE: Aloha, Chair. Aloha, Committee. I am in favor of EACP-16, which would restrict the use and sale of plastic disposable foodware. And while this is important please also consider the verbiage "and encourage the use of environmentally friendly preferred alternatives." It is not enough to choose a compostable alternative when two of your lead compost facilities are suffering and close to ending. While I understand

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

you have had persistent testimony on this subject by tenacious testifiers, it is not enough to restrict this item without seriously considering supporting your composters. I believe this item deserves a communication onto itself. To date, Maui County has had three lead compost...has three lead composters and two are on the brink of closing. One has a contract that is set to end in July and one has severe new water issues. Please keep them in your purview as you make decisions moving forward. Please ensure that they forever have a place in your planning, whether it be Environmental Department or recycling department. This important area of composting has never had the depth of attention it has deserved. Noting that yes, west side has its Lahaina school composting project led by Gretchen, but in the scheme of things, this is minute for the level of compostable material that Maui produces. I will convey that pilot projects at every school should also be supported but that the tourism industry has not wholeheartedly dealt fairly with what is produced. While exciting trash-to-energy solutions appear to be making traction, this should never dismiss the education component to encourage reusable's and biodegradable options. Thank you for this opportunity to testify and I look forward to hearing the other testifiers that might provide new information that I am not aware of.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo, Ms. Chase. Members, is there any questions for Ms. Chase in Hana? Okay, seeing none, thank you for your testimony. Ms. Apo Takayama?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Chair, we currently do not have any testifiers in our District Offices, but we have seven in the Council Chamber.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. Can you please call the first in the Chambers?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: The first testifier is Brooke Cuomo, testifying on behalf of Girl Scouts Troop 440, to be followed by Marjorie Bonar.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. Ms. Cuomo, so you have three minutes to speak. The green light will come on, and when you see the yellow light come on, it's 30 seconds and then the red is to conclude your testimony. Okay?

MS. CUOMO: Okay.

CHAIR SINENCI: Go ahead.

MS. CUOMO: Hello, my name is Brooke. I have been a Girl Scout for eight years. I am in eighth grade at Kihei Charter, and I am here to talk about why we should ban single-use plastics in the Maui County. If there is about 166,403 people living on Maui and on Maui an average person in America uses 220 pounds of plastic per year, that would mean 36,608,660 pounds of plastic is used and thrown away in a year on Maui alone, not counting the tourists and visitors we have. So, where does this plastic end up? Fifty-six percent of plastic ends up in landfills. If exposed to ultraviolet radiation, they will emit greenhouse gases which is bad for the Maui environment. In the Maui County the landfills take about 60 tons of municipal solid waste each day.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

We are also surrounded by oceans. The ocean is where about 10 percent of plastic goes. Eight million metric tons of plastic enter our ocean each year. An elephant is only about five metric tons to give you a representation of how much a ton is. There are 150 million metric tons of plastic that currently circulate our Maui environment...our marine environment. But where does the rest of the plastic go? Well, 25 percent ends up being burnt in a fire, and the last 9 percent makes it into recycling. Only 9 percent of the trash that gets thrown away actually gets recycled. Microplastics are tiny pieces of plastic that come from larger plastics that have been degraded over time. Marine animals tend to eat them because of the microplastic's small size. After ingesting microplastics, seals and many other animals can suffer for months or even years before they die due to sharpness and chemicals in the plastic. Maybe you think landfills aren't so bad and maybe they're helpful. Well, let's look at how long things take to decompose. One banana peel takes about three to four weeks to decompose. One plastic water bottle takes 450 to 1,000 years to decompose. A paper towel takes two to four weeks. A plastic grocery bag is 10 to 100 years. Cardboard takes two months to decompose. Plastic drinking straws, a single plastic drinking straw is 100 to 500 years. You probably get the point. Plastic never truly goes away and it can affect human health due to toxic chemicals which we probably have in our bodies. It also spoils our groundwater. Not only does it cost billions to abate but it can attract other pollutants, it threatens wildlife, and poisons our food chain. It's not just humans we have to think about. Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Ms. Cuomo. Could you hold on a bit?

MS. CUOMO: Yes.

CHAIR SINENCI: We have a question from Member King.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. Thank you so much for being here. I hope that you get an A on that report because that was some amazing research. And I have two questions, one is the 9 percent of trash that gets recycled, where you talking about...is your information just for the Maui County or are you talking about like...

MS. CUOMO: Nine percent in general like in America I believe.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, in general, okay. And then my other question is, have you been able to get Kihei Charter School off of single-use plastic?

MS. CUOMO: No, but me and a few other people in my grade are working on trying to get them to use an alternative to like plastic spoons and things that many people use for school lunches, so.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, great. Thank you so much for being here.

MS. CUOMO: Yeah, thank you.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you for all your information. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member King. Any more questions? Seeing none, thank you for your testimony. Ms. Apo Takayama?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Thank you, Chair. The next testifier is Marjorie Bonar, to be followed by Ashley O'Colmain.

MS. BONAR: Aloha kakou. Tough act to follow but that's what I'm working for because it's the kids that have got to do this because we've done such a lousy job. So, this bill, speaking of lousy jobs, I will...there are a lot of changes that I would love to see and I think some that will happen, but there's an awful lot that we just don't have answers for. One of the issues I have with this is the prepackaged food exclusions, which I think is too broad-based and to me it opens up the possibility that all of a sudden an awful lot of food suppliers will say oh, well, we'll just prepackage it from the kitchen and put it out there and then we don't have to comply. So, we've got a problem with the unintended consequences. The other thing that I see as a major factor that's restricting how far we can go is Department of Health and finding a way to use reusable's. I'm old enough, probably the oldest person here, I'm old enough that I remember before we had plastic and we had melmac, but we didn't have single-use disposable plastics for anything, and we lived with it. We didn't have all this fast food. Oh, is that a good thing? But I think that my concerns, which are pretty deep, are nothing that are going to get addressed in this particular bill at this particular time. And part of what I'm feeling is, let's not get...let perfect get in the way of good. I know you've already gotten some suggestions, I think that Tamara has gotten some, and our Zero Waste Coalition has been brainstorming on some of what we can do with this. And it's got to be a much larger solid waste plan than just one piece at a time. This is part of it and at least get this part done. Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Ms. Bonar. Member King, do you have a question?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yes, thank you, Chair. Thanks so much for being here and thank you for all your work on the Styrofoam ban, because you were one of the people that was leading that charge. So, I don't think we've done...we have a lot of ways to go but we haven't done that bad a job. We're trying to do some corrections. And I just wondered if you had any language that you were proposing or your group is proposing in place of that, the second exemption which is that plastic packaging for prepackaged food?

MS. BONAR: That's one I'm wrestling with and I've gone through bills, a lot of places that's something people are kicking down the road because nobody really wants, seems like nobody really wants to address it. And it's that finding acceptable substitutions, that's why I think it has to be something else. I mean we have a couple and Ashley has got some things--I didn't step on hers--that could make significant impacts just by a little wordsmithing. The other thing that I also...although it's not in this bill but I hope that you'll consider the need for a fee for bags, because as much as we aren't

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

seeing as many bags, we are seeing people walk in and they figure they're going to get paper or whatever, make 'em pay for it. The idea of the bag ban was to change that attitude to being responsible for what you're doing and shove it in your purse. It's not a big thing. Put a bag in your pocket, my husband carries one all the time; compact nylon bags. So, I think yes, I've been trying to work on...but unfortunately I'm leaving town, trying to work on some verbiage for this, because we need to find a way to keep everyone from saying oh, it's prepackaged, sorry I can do whatever I want.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: I just had a question. I was just curious, what did you use before single-use plastics?

MS. BONAR: We...for takeout stuff --

CHAIR SINENCI: Yeah.

MS. BONAR: --there was cardboard, tinfoil, and waxed paper tended to be mostly what we saw.

CHAIR SINENCI: So, you used your fingers?

MS. BONAR: Well, you didn't use your fingers. I mean things were wrapped up, you know. But we didn't have this plethora of takeout food. And I remember when you used...well there were paper bags. I still have one of the very first reusable grocery bags that was a market chain on the East Coast, a rubberized mesh bag that was kind of akin to the European string bags. I mean we found ways to do things but it wasn't a plethora; however, tinfoil and wax paper, typical Japanese packaging. I mean a lot of people here should be familiar. I mean it was common here too. So, it was heavyweight butcher paper, wax paper, and it folded...it's amazing except for liquid, how well you can contain other things.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Ms. Bonar. Ms. Apo Takayama? Oh, before we go on to the next one, we'd like to welcome Chair Lee. Thanks for coming. Okay.

MS. O'COLMAIN: Hello, Council. Thank you for having us. I'm Ashley O'Colmain, I saw you recently, that was a few months ago. I'm here representing Maui Huliau Foundation and the newly formed Zero Waste Maui Coalition. You know the work that I've done with Maui Huliau Foundation with the green events. The Zero Waste Coalition is a group of nonprofits, community organizations, so businesses, community members, and we just had our first kind of coming out meeting last week where we invited specific groups that are doing work on this front. And we have had over 45 people come. A lot of them...some of them weren't even invited, they were that excited about it. So, I just bring that up to say that people really are enthusiastic about reducing the amount of single-use plastic that we use so I don't think there's anything to be afraid of. I mean there's always going to be people opposed, but I think there's way

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

more people that are for this. Just with Maui Huliau Foundation last year, we...every year we've doubled the amount of events that we've done, that we're paid to be there and help them to choose the right products, reduce waste. That's over 50,000 people last year, over 45 events. I wrote it down somewhere but now I lost it. Forty-five events last year was...or 2018 we had like less than 20 so it's exponentially growing to the point where we can't control it. So, there's...people are onboard. I think that the bill, the couple things that I saw that needed to be added or revised that...the things that Marj brought up about the takeout containers, it's a pretty big loophole with prepackaged food. But you also need to define that like chips are not included in that, 'cause there's this whole rabbit hole of like prepackaged food. So, the worry is that more things will become prepackaged and therefore escape being...then they'll not be exempt instead of something that maybe was put in a to-go box in the past. And sorry, I don't have particular language on that, but we can...I can work with the coalition to help come up with something that makes sense. And then looking at Bill 40 too, I'm sure that they went through that I think pretty intensively. Defining plastic, there's a lot of utensils that are mixed with plants and so I just want to make sure that this doesn't exempt those, that they don't sneak in somehow, you know, something that's like 70 percent. It says 50 percent potato or it says potato and it's actually potato and mostly plastic, so just making sure that there's no petroleum-based plastic at all. And then defining out utensils, just making sure that it's very clear that it includes straws, forks, knives, spoons, chopsticks, little stir sticks, all those little unnecessary things that can totally be compostable very easily. I just want to say that we should go for as much as we can. We get to follow in the footsteps of Oahu on this one so it's a little bit easier than being the first ones to ban things so we can kind of lean on them a little bit. This is a worldwide trend and so I...yeah, there's nothing to be worried about, just making sure we're clear. And the Zero Waste Coalition is prepared and built to educate people and inspire them to reduce single-use in general. Thank you so much.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Ashley. Any questions for the testifier? Member King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. Thanks for being here, Ashley. So, this is, I think this bill is modeled somewhat after the City and County of Honolulu who recently passed it. Do you know if they had this same clause in here about prepackaged foods?

MS. O'COLMAIN: Yeah, I think the chip, chips were a big thing and so defining where the line is on that.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, they actually had more definition in theirs?

MS. O'COLMAIN: Gretchen, do you know...I wasn't on the...or Tamara, there was a phone call with...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: If you don't know I can ask them when we get...

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

MS. O'COLMAIN: Yeah. Yeah, I think they would know better.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: 'Cause I know the coalition's been working on it. But thank you for being here, thank you for your support.

MS. O'COLMAIN: Yeah, thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member King. And we were trying to get some of the Councilmembers from Oahu to come today --

MS. O'COLMAIN: Oh yeah.

CHAIR SINENCI: --but they couldn't make it --

MS. O'COLMAIN: That would be helpful.

CHAIR SINENCI: --today just to explain Bill 40 and maybe answer some of those questions that the Members might have.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Do we have a copy of Bill 40 with this, as part of our...

CHAIR SINENCI: Yeah, we're going to hand it out --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

CHAIR SINENCI: --after testimony.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

CHAIR SINENCI: So, if we need to refer to it.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Ashley --

MS. O'COLMAIN: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: --for all your work and helping us to educate the public at all the events. Mahalo. Ms. Apo Takayama?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Thank you, Chair. The next testifier is Taylor Guindon, to be followed by Robin Proctor.

MS. GUINDON: Okay. Good afternoon. My name is Taylor. I'm a middle school student in the Maui County and I'm also a cadet in Girl Scout Troop 440. I wanted to talk to you about why banning single-use plastic would be beneficial to the Maui County. To

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

February 4, 2020

start, banning single-use plastic would prevent tons of millions of pieces of plastic from entering our waste system each year, but it also reduces the demand to produce more plastics which is contributing to the global climate change. And plastic production also costs about 11.1 million US dollars per year. To cut down on our plastic pollution in Hawaii can begin the movement to stop the global climate crisis. Banning single-use plastics also reduces pollution in a number of ways. While doing all of this it ensures that our ocean has a fighting chance as the plastic pollution problem would become slowly less of an issue, but we have to start now. Those who support say that drastic changes are needed to cut down our plastic pollution. Most of our plastic ends up in landfills, ocean, water systems, and environments...and our environment. But as Brooke said, when landfills are exposed to ultraviolet radiation, they can emit greenhouse gases. By not using or, and/or producing these plastics, single-use plastics, it would downsize our future landfills here, therefore less greenhouse gases would be emitted into the air. The average cost of one ton of waste in a landfill is \$49. If you multiple that by the 139 million tons of waste in all landfills you would get the amount of money it costs for a landfill in America which is about \$6,811,000,000. Most common single-use plastics found on beaches are in order of magnitude, cigarette butts, plastic beverage bottles, plastic bottle caps, food wrappers, plastic grocery bags, plastic lids, plastic straws and stirrers for coffee, as well as foam takeaway containers. We could at least try to lower these single-use plastic invaders on our beaches, and Oahu already passed this, like it wouldn't be that much of a change. But beyond these, the impacts of the bans would have a cultural effect. Companies are forced to innovate and rethink their designs and sourcing sustainable materials while lowering the pollution, the global climate change, and helping us fix our ecosystem. Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo, Ms. Guindon. Any questions for Ms. Guindon? I had a question. Did your troop or your classmates get to think of some healthy alternatives?

MS. GUINDON: For the...

CHAIR SINENCI: For replacing single-use plastics?

MS. GUINDON: A couple kids in my school...we used to have potato starch like forks and utensils for our school to use for all the kids. For some reason they changed it back to plastic, and so we're trying really hard to ask them to try to figure out how to put them back in. We're trying to figure out how much money it would cost and to try to make it better for our school.

CHAIR SINENCI: They don't use metal foodware?

MS. GUINDON: No.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay, thank you.

MS. GUINDON: Thank you.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you for your testimony. Ms. Apo Takayama?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Thank you, Chair. The next testifier is Robin Proctor, to be followed by Cheryl King.

MS. PROCTOR: Aloha. My name is Robin Proctor. I came here today to speak about pesticides, but then it was changed to a different date so I here I am because I'm interested in this and this topic. And I'm really excited to hear the younger generation involvement and passion. Way to go because there's a lot we need to do to make things better. And so, I was thinking about when we were...when I was younger in school and we had dishwashers. Okay, that's one way to reduce plastics, to have, bring dishwashers and stuff back into the school system instead of throwing away silverware, plates, everything. So, I just wanted to give my support to what you guys are doing. And I'm excited, I'm newly back to the islands and I'm ready to help various causes. So, thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo for your testimony. No questions. Thank you. Ms. Apo Takayama?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Thank you, Chair. The next testifier is Cheryl King, to be followed by Jason Economou.

MS. KING: Aloha, everyone.

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha.

MS. KING: Thank you so much for having us here, it's so exciting. My name is Cheryl King, I'm with the Hawaii Association for Marine Education and Research among many other organizations I work with and for. And today I'm totally in support of this bill, this process anyway. Many of you know I've been coming to you in the past with a lot of data from our marine debris cleanups all over the island, and our reef cleanups, and especially down at Kaehu where we do our fourth Sunday of every month beach cleanups which we've been doing since 2012. We've picked up over 22 tons from that just little tiny stretch of beach alone, and I can come back next time with lots of examples of these items we're talking about and more, you know, actual super good data if you guys are interested in getting any of that information. But trust me, we do find a lot of these items on the beaches, and it would be wonderful if one day we showed up to a cleanup and didn't have to pick up those items. Of course we're going to get a bunch of other things, but just getting that stuff out of our waste stream would be a huge improvement. So, that's why we're here today, hoping that we can make that happen. And I'm a marine biologist, I've been doing this for over 20 years, and if we don't start making change now, it's just going to keep going on for another 20 years, and we don't have that much time to work with here. And since we have been doing this, our plastic bag ban and our polystyrene foam ban, that is...I'm so proud of us for doing that. We were leading the way and now we're kind of behind.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

Oahu is like beating us, you guys, we gotta catch up. So, we gotta really get our work going. And it's happening around the world, this is totally an amazing movement that's happening right now, and we just need to be part of it, not watching from afar, we gotta get in there. So, when we pass our bill, not if, when we do this, besides not having to pick up thousands of more single-use plastic items here in Hawaii, the best result that I see from this new global movement is the push for ingenuity to bring, to kick in that will create better products and waste management systems all over the world. Again, this is can and should be done so that we need to do our part. And it helps people getting, just really thinking about their impacts and what they're using on a day-to-day basis just brings everything to the forefront. And just the concept of bringing your own is so easy. And getting schools to have their own dishwashers, it's such a no-brainer, like we can do this, this is such an important thing. So, with our help, wasteful and harmful petroleum-based packaging and single-use products will be the norm of the past. And we need to support these brilliant minds that are making these changes and wanting a sustainable future like we do. We need to support the endeavors, not accept our horrible, the horrible status quo. Without these bills that focus on extended producer responsibility, we won't get there as fast, and time is ticking. I know we're just in the beginning of the process today but the end result is clear and desirable. I know that we can work together to move swiftly to put this into place and stop the production of millions more of these unnecessary plastic products that we're already drowning in. So, long story short, I support this. So, thank you so much.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo, Ms. King, for being here. We have a question from Member King.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, thank you.

MS. KING: Hey.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: No relation but I wouldn't be embarrassed if we were, because I really appreciate all the work you do and 'cause I've seen --

MS. KING: You too.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --your picture in various videos and pictures of marine debris cleanup, so thank you for that. Did you, were you involved at all in the Oahu ban, their Bill 40?

MS. KING: Just supported it from afar.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, okay. So...

MS. KING: No, I never went over to testify --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, okay.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

MS. KING: --or anything, no.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I was just wondering. And actually we're not behind them yet because theirs actually doesn't go into effect till next year so --

MS. KING: That's a good point.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --I guess we have the chance to get caught up and either catch up to them or even beat them, so. But thanks for being here.

MS. KING: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I appreciate all your work.

MS. KING: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member King. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. King, for all your work. I can totally relate. I just was wondering like within your testimony do you see a significant difference in, you know, switching from petroleum-based products that they would provide versus bringing your own and continually reusing it? Because I would imagine even if we switch to non-petroleum-based utensils, the, it could still end up in the waste stream and in the nearshore waters and whatnot. So, I just was wondering if you felt there was a significant difference in changing the culture to something that's less harmful, to changing the culture to something that's not disposable?

MS. KING: Oh, that's a very good point. Yeah, I mean ideally we would all bring our own stuff all the time everywhere for sure. When I kind of describe what we're trying to do with our zero waste stuff, essentially it's like if you had to choose a product that was, you know, not by any fault of your own but was going to end up in the ocean somehow, what would be that better or worse scenario? You know we don't want any of them obviously to get there and so yeah, changing our culture, changing our ideas that's for sure, but we don't, also don't want to blame it on the everyday folks that are using products that are created by these larger corporations to begin with. Like that's what the extended producer responsibility is all about, like getting these folks to come up with better alternatives so we won't have to have this issue, you know, if it does get littered or whatever. So, that's kind of what this kind of is a bigger picture about is pushing these companies to make these changes so we have better products to begin with. Does that answer your question?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah.

MS. KING: In my data, I can give you some data on a lot of stuff, but next time.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It kind of makes me think of, you know, like the bottle deposit fee, like --

MS. KING: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --if you just give out silverware and then have a five-cent fee and you turn in your silverware at the end or something like that.

MS. KING: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, that it's not...it's something that's reusable instead of single-use anything.

MS. KING: Totally. And there are programs like in Portland like the, what are those called, the --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. KING: --box...yeah, so people can go get a takeaway container from there, you know, a little vending machine sort of situation, get it out, use it, take it back and get their money back sort of thing. So, there's so many things that can be done but...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Do they take it back clean or dirty?

MS. KING: Both ways. Marj wants to really talk about this anyway.

MR. BONAR (from the audience): . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, you can't testify like that.

CHAIR SINENCI: Come to the, can you come to the mic?

MS. KING: Bottom line, there's a lot of good endeavors out there, but we also need to figure out what we need to do a data basis just 'cause not everyone --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Like baseline.

MS. KING: --is going to use all these all the time.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Baseline the thing.

MS. BONAR: You can stay here. You can stay here. No, I was really hoping to get it...sorry, I ordered...

CHAIR SINENCI: Hold on, Cheryl.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

MS. BONAR: Yeah, stay. Because environmental..._____ got a whole bunch of them that's she's been handing out. Reusable clam shells, they get used, you pick them up when you get lunch, and you can either return them...you have an app on your phone. You can either return them to one of those lunch trucks or the food trucks or to the place you got it, wherever you got it, and they reauthorize your app. Or in the like vending, reverse vending machines does the same thing. You put your phone in and get it. They're then picked up, washed at a commercial facility, and then returned--there it's a little extreme--by bicycle to keep their carbon footprint even lower. But returned to the vendors and they keep going. And in some cases, they've gone through 800 uses of one of those boxes. They've been able to track because of discrete numbers. So, it's a very reusable...it's something we, I was hoping we could do here. That's the next step. You see County Council has to authorize some way for a big commercial kitchen. We tried doing it with the college and that isn't going to work. But using reusable's is so much...and especially educational facilities or Meals on Wheels, any...God, sorry, I'm taking up too much time.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you.

MS. BONAR: But yes, there's definitely the way to do it. They return them dirty, you wash them commercially, and redistribute. We should be doing it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Ms. King.

CHAIR SINENCI: I just saw something on the television about Loop, so you would order your things and then after you use all of your products, you'll send the containers back, they'll fill it up and then they'll ship it back to you. But anyway, just on that lines.

MS. BONAR: It doesn't work here quite as well.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you. Ms. King, we had another question from Ms. Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, just I love your, what you're doing and I like this conversation that's happening. So, in little mom-and-pop stores, you know, I've gotten e-mails about that...we're talking about paper bags, I want to know your thought about this. And I would have wished to hear from the kids, but mom-and-pop stores are afraid to charge for, I don't know, five cents or whatever for paper bags although they want to encourage people to bring reusable bags but people don't. What is your feeling about having to pay for paper bags when you buy groceries?

MS. KING: Well, I wish we wouldn't have to come to that, yeah, I definitely...at this point 2020, people should be bringing their own and remembering that bag for sure. Maybe that's, we just need to do more education on that for sure. But paper bags aren't the

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

answer either 'cause it takes resources to make paper bags as well. So, I'm very torn on that whole idea. If anything, just don't give out bags and people will remember to bring their bag or put it in their pockets or just carry it two loads to the car. If it's a small store, they're probably not going to be buying a Costco-size version of a cart of groceries so they can just take it to their car.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Carry it.

MS. KING: Carry it, yeah. Or I mean I don't know what the true solution would be for that.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, you moved away from the thought of paper bags and --

MS. KING: Oh yeah, I don't think...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --reusable is the...

MS. KING: Yeah. I mean that's just --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MS. KING: --another waste that we don't need to have anything. So --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. KING: --bring your own I guess.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you for the question. Thank you, Ms. King.

MS. KING: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: I think the Hana Ranch Store just uses all the soapboxes or the soda boxes, they just put your groceries in cardboard boxes. Ms. Apo Takayama, next testifier?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Thank you, Chair. The next testifier is Jason Economou, testifying on behalf of REALTORS® Association of Maui, to be followed by Zandra Amaral-Crouse.

MR. ECONOMOU: Good afternoon. Thank you for having this discussion, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha. Thank you.

MR. ECONOMOU: Today, I am very proud to be representing the REALTORS® Association of Maui and our more than 1,700 members. Unlike a lot of other trade organizations and realtors associations throughout the country, RAM actually likes to address

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

quality of life and community well-being issues, it's within our charter. And one of the things that we recognize is that our well-being, our physical, mental, emotional, and economic well-being is tied to the environment here on Maui. So, this is just an excellent step forward. I commend you all for moving away from single-use plastics. I don't have any great insights as far as things to add to the legislation; however, I do want to say that Ashley O'Colmain is an incredible resource. I trust immensely, so I encourage you all to listen to whatever she has to say and follow her directions. And aside from that, RAM supports this and we thank you for taking steps to improve the health of Maui County.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Mr. Economou. So, just clarification, you're representing RAM today?

MR. ECONOMOU: Yes, I am representing RAM today and I'm also representing myself as an individual. I am a huge fan of this. If you've listened to my podcast, you've probably heard me rail against single-use plastics, and I love that the County has already been proactive in distributing the clam shells, distributing silverware, and the reusable bags. Just keep up the good work and thank you for being forward-thinking.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo for your testimony. No questions? Thank you for being here.

MR. ECONOMOU: All right, take care.

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Chair, the next testifier is Zandra Amaral-Crouse and she's the last person signed up to testify in the Chamber.

MS. AMARAL-CROUSE: Aloha koo mau hoaloha. Hello, my friends. Thank you, Council Chair Sinenci, for bringing this forward. As I look at this, I recall back in December 2018, when Elle Cochran brought this up. And what she brought up was a bill for an ordinance establishing a new Chapter 20.24, Maui County Code, relating to restricting the use and sale of single-use plastic disposable foodware. Thank you, Elle, for this. Be it ordained by the people of the Council [sic] of Maui, she writes, due to its ability to break down into small and microscopic fragments that persists for decades--as the young lady stipulated to you all earlier--single-use plastic disposable foodware has significant negative impacts and...on our environment,. contributes to the potential of death of marine animals and avian populations through ingestion, and has been found to be ingested by human beings in microscopic form. To that point as I read through this as the communication attached to your Committee, today I was reading through it, I was born and raised in Paukukalo, our farm was right at the ocean where we went out and torch every night. Plastics and things that disturbed our reefs, including on how we approached our reefs was something my father was very adamant about. And I really take my hat off to this Committee for bringing this forward again. Thank you, Chair Sinenci. Thank you, Councilmembers, for looking at this again. Because I think you all along with this young men and women know the importance of protecting the very sustenance that we depend on for our life. The ocean, the air, the land, and I think this will go a long way in doing that. I thank you all for bringing this

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

February 4, 2020

forward. I thank for the community members that came up earlier. And I look forward to a healthy discussion with you and your...between you and your Councilmembers. Thank you, Chair Sinenci. Thank you, Councilmembers.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo, Ms. Amaral, for being here. Thank you for your testimony.

MS. AMARAL-CROUSE: You're welcome.

CHAIR SINENCI: Any questions? Seeing none, thank you. Okay, so it looks like...anyone in the Chambers? Anyone? Oh, we see...okay. Mr. Law?

MR. LAW: Aloha awakea. I looked it up in a dictionary, I couldn't find it so I'll have to check.

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha awakea.

MR. LAW: Keani is not here to help me with my Hawaiian. Hey, what do you say...how do you say fork?

CHAIR SINENCI: Are those metal, metal...plastic forks?

MR. LAW: Always the...I looked that up in a dictionary, it says O with a line over the thing. So, Shane, when you...when the Chinese guys see your picture in the paper tomorrow, they're going to come looking for you because you're putting a lot of China guys out of business over there. So, yeah, the forks I've been...that's one of my things that...let me stick to my...oh yeah, Jasee Law from Kula. I'm glad to see my countrywoman up there because this is very important to me and I'm going to make sure she uses or...correct utensils. And thank you to your new Staff for doing this. This is kind of exciting but some people don't get too excited over plastic forks but yeah, it's a big thing. And the hotel industry is probably going to come looking for you too. Well, what took you so long? It's been two years almost. So, speaking of years I haven't heard the term tinfoil in a long time. Marj? That's like, I don't think...I think it's called aluminum foil now, but yeah, we need to recycle that too. Plastic is good. Plastic was invented to make life mo' bettah. I heard Hawaiians used to have to eat their plate lunch with their hands. The problem is when you fly your...oh, when you finish your grinds into the ground or you just fly 'em out the window which is not good either. So, you can wash them and save them for the next meal, it's actually...it's pretty sterile compared to the wooden ones. I believe the wooden ones get like little spots and mildew on. People are just lazy, they just don't like washing stuff like the other lady said, so yeah, we need more dishwashers. Hopefully with Mr. Nakagawa's help we can get some money from the Mayor and get those gasification devices going and I think that'll save a lot of trouble. It'll save me from having to save all my plastic forks until then too. If Maui Electric will play along, so if you could...I don't know where those guys went but hopefully somebody out there is listening and we need to have Maui Electric to buy the energy from Tim Gunter when he gets his business going and with the gasification thing. So, yeah, thanks again. Aloha, everybody.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Mr. Law, for your testimony today. Any questions? Seeing none, mahalo. Ms. Apo Takayama?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Chair, there's no further testimony in the Council Chamber or in our District Offices.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay, great. How are we doing on time? Okay. So, Members, seeing there are no more individuals wishing to testify, without objection, I will now close public testimony.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

. . . END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay.

**EACP-16 RESTRICTING THE USE AND SALE OF SINGLE-USE PLASTIC DISPOSABLE
FOODWARE (CC 18-430)**

CHAIR SINENCI: So, EACP-16, Restricting the Use and Sale of Single-Use Plastic Disposable Foodware. So, just as a historical, looking back, on May 14th of last year, our Committee took this item up and received information from the Huliau Foundation and the manager of Maui Chemical and Paper Company. On December 4th of last year, the Honolulu City Council passed Act 40, which restricts the use of single-use plastic goods and plastic bags. I'm now handing out a copy of Honolulu's legislation, and we'll have Councilmember...well, we was trying to get Councilmembers from Oahu to come today but probably...maybe at our next meeting. Because of its ability to break down into small and microscopic fragments that persist for decades, plastic disposable foodware has significant negative impacts on the environment. It contributes to the potential death of marine animals and avian populations through ingestion. And it's been found to be ingested by humans in microplastic form through the food chain. Plastic disposable foodware, whether it be smaller items such as utensils and straws or larger items like plates and containers have also been found to cause significant physical harm to marine animals and avian populations. The intent of the bill is to reduce single-use foodware in an effort to reduce waste in our landfills, reduce pollution in our land, and reduce the marine...and provide a healthier environment for people and ecosystems. Today, we have Ms. Gretchen Losano from West Maui Green Cycle, who was with us at our last Committee meeting. Since that time, she has started a food waste composting pilot program at Lahaina Intermediate School and has new insights into the amount of single-use plastic products being used at schools. In front of me is an example of plastics that she has collected at Lahaina Intermediate and had diverted them from our landfill. So, if there are no objections, Chair would like to designate Ms. Losano as a resource person pursuant to Rule 18(A) of the Rules of the Council.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you. Thank you, Members. And so, Ms. Losano, can you provide introductory remarks? Give us more information on what you brought today. Thanks for being here.

MS. LOSANO: Sure. Okay. Aloha. Thank you for having me here, I appreciate it. When I started doing the waste diversion at...it was at Lahaina Intermediate, it was just strictly supposed to be food waste. So, when you set up that program, you do basically a waste audit for a few days just to assess kind of what you're going to be doing, how much food waste you're expecting, and then you kind of design the program from there. So, this is the very first pilot for this whole project. Hopefully we'll be able to get it into as many schools on Maui as possible, because as you know, as you hopefully all know, food waste is probably the number one methane-producing component of our landfill. And so, the quicker we can get it out of the waste stream that ends up in the landfill, the better. So within the first couple days, I realized that I had this gap in my understanding of what was going on in our public schools. In every public school in Hawaii, we use single-use plastic for every meal. Sorry, it gets me like really upset, because I think that we all know that but there's not a visual of what that actually means. So, our children have gotten this sense of what is normal, and to them this is normal, using plastic forks and throwing them away, using single-use plastic ramekins. Even though we have five-compartment trays, they fill the ramekins and then they put those on top of the five-compartment tray. And the fact that we have done our children this disservice of thinking that this is normal is a gap in our way of thinking that we need to quickly adjust, because it is not fair to our kids for them to grow up thinking that this is normal. Because this isn't normal, this is insane, that's what this is. 'Cause we all grew up with reusable's. We all grew up with dishwashers. We had our trays, we had our reusable utensils and we washed them. And somehow from then until now this became the new normal. It broke my heart when you were asking what these courageous, intelligent young women thought was the solution, and they didn't say dishwashers and they didn't reusable's and that is our fault. That is our fault and we have to fix that. We have...that is our kuleana to fix this. So, what I have collected and washed, hand-washed, so these aren't gross. I mean I'm not a professional dishwasher but they, they're, you know, for all intents and purposes not gross. They don't smell. But it's a bag every single day. So, this represents just 30 days of food service, and that is coming from every single school in Hawaii every single day and going into our landfill. And we don't have that kind of space in our landfill when there are alternatives and we have different solutions. I do want to speak to a couple points that were brought up earlier, because I think that there's some things that needs to be clarified. The first testifier was talking about our composting facilities that are soon to be shut down or whatever. To be clear, those two composting facilities that exist right now are strictly green waste composting facilities, they do not accept food waste. And I'm working my best, my whole life for the last five years has been to start a commercial composting facility on the west side and also have a part in designing the Central Maui facility as well so that we can

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

February 4, 2020

remove as much of our waste stream that is compostable as possible. In Maui County, 70 percent of everything that goes into our landfill is compostable. We could be creating soil with 70 percent of all the things that go into our landfill. Another thing I want to clarify about one of the testifier's comments is that this single-use plastic ordinance is geared towards, 100 percent towards items that cannot be recycled in Maui County. Not one single piece of single-use plastic from a restaurant or from a school or from a hotel can be recycled here. They can be recycled on, in the United States in some areas, but they absolutely cannot be recycled here. We don't recycle number 5's, we don't recycle number 1's and 2's without necks which is what is predominant in the food service industry. So to be clear, all of the things that we would be essentially banning or restricting, they all go to the landfill right now. And they don't have to 'cause there's alternatives. And . . .(inaudible). . . Okay, sorry. Was that God? Okay, you can stop now. So, the alternatives are better. They're non-toxic, they don't create methane, there's all these things that is like, you know, but they're not, you know, meant to be a final solution by any means. I liked your comment, Councilmember Paltin, I thought that was, you know, very intuitive. Yeah, we certainly don't want to be using single-use anything, but there's situations where single-use is necessary, at least at this time. There's going to be a period of time where there has to be interim solutions, and that's how we need to think about this, you know, for the next five or ten years after we pass this we'll have to be using single-use in certain occasions, and working towards the places that we can reduce the amount of single-use is going to have to be our goal. We don't live, you know, in some idealistic world but we can create one, it's just going to take a while, so we need some solutions for the meantime. And let's see if there was anything that I...I think I hit on all the...oh, so the biodegradable options, I want to just make this really clear, the woman from Hana had a really wonderful testimony, but the reason why we have such specific language in this bill is because people often use biodegradable and compostable interchangeably which is how the industry has gotten so far off mark. So basically just so everyone in here understands, biodegradable utensils or plant-based utensils all contain a certain of plastic, of petroleum, because there is no law saying that you can call it biodegradable and then actually have to...you know, biodegradable is like 10,000 years, right, it can biodegrade. So, that's not what they're talking about. You know that's not what they mean when they say biodegradable, but these companies they, that's what they do, that's how they increase their profits, it's like a big deal. But compostable has to adhere to several standards, ASTM 6,400 and BPI certification in order to be certified compostable. So, compostable is the word that we all need to be using. We need to kind of get biodegradable out of our vocabulary, 'cause it's been co-opted by the petroleum industry and there's nothing we can do about it right now. But anyway, I think unless anyone has any questions I think I touched on all the points that I had written down. If anyone has any questions about this project, I hand-washed every single piece of that, it was really fun. Please pass this bill so I don't have to do it again.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Ms. Losano. We have a question from Member Paltin and then Member King.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Losano, for all your work that you're doing. I had a question when you mentioned about compostable, and I thought that at one time you were saying that you need a commercial composting facility for compostable items. It's not like you can put it in your compost and...

MS. LOSANO: Well, it depends on how good you are at composting. But it's basically it has to maintain a certain heat so people...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, the majority...

MS. LOSANO: Some people can compost really well. Like you talk to Gerry Ross, he can compost any of the compostable food service ware. But most people kind of are, you know, not as strict or, you know, taking the temperatures of their compost. And so, with compost for food service ware it's designed to mimic plastic and it's done a fairly good job. You really need a heat, a consistent heat for a few weeks of above 140 to compost those which is why my facility has taken so long to get going, because using the proper technology to have that consistent heat and break it down consistently is really expensive. But I just returned from the US Composting Council conference, and we have a new prototype that's being designed just for us so we're really excited. It's looking like it's going to happen really soon.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And so, there's no distinguishing between like backyard compost versus like professional level of compost in labeling of products?

MS. LOSANO: There is actually. Yeah, there's a very distinct backyard compost acceptable label. So, there's a lot of the new bags, a lot of the new polylactic acid bags that are mixed with, I think it's TPLA, I think they're mixed with talc. Those say on the bags backyard compost okay, and there's several products that say that as well. And then, you know, a lot of the fiber products, they don't take as high heat as the polylactic acid which is the one that's really supposed to mimic plastic. Those definitely require a lot higher heat. And, you know, they're not my favorite product, but they are definitely better for the environment than plastic itself. And, you know, like I said it's really meant to be an interim product. There is also, I was speaking with NatureWorks when I was at the conference and talking about this new polymer that may become more readily available. It's something that you manufacture like as an add-on to a compost facility which is something that the County is actually...we've been, you know, talking to the producer of this, it's called PHA and it's marine degradable and it's really cool. It would be something that we could actually manufacture here on Maui perhaps with the help of NatureWorks, which is the company that manufactures Ingeo, which is the PLA. They have their whole patent on the whole thing. But they're open to other polymers, it's just that having a polymer that's in a large enough quantity to be able to, you know, to be able to satisfy our single-use society, it's just like, you know, there's a lot of corn but there's a lot less algae that's grown from, you know, composting. It's kind of a new industry but anyway.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member Paltin. Member King and then Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. Thank you so much for being here, Gretchen. It's really great to see you back after that conference. I had a couple questions about, well, as one of probably original food waste processor on the island and the, maybe the oldest, we...well, my company just does a very small sector of it which is the cooking oil and the grease trap stuff.

MS. LOSANO: Thank you. Thank you for that.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: It's been a lot of years and we were --

MS. LOSANO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --partially responsible for the extension of the landfill for six years. But all that time that we were doing that, we were always told, you know, we worked closely with the co-composter, with Maui EKO and we were always told that the Department of Health, it was against their rules and regulations for anyone to compost food waste.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, that was always very frustrating to hear, because I think our island was actually the one that was the most enforced against --

MS. LOSANO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --on that, 'cause I think it's happened in other places from talking to people on the other islands. But have you found any kind of give there or any more support for composting --

MS. LOSANO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --food waste?

MS. LOSANO: I have. Actually I've talked to the Health Department several times, and they're actually really in support of our project. Mostly because we chose the technology that they had already approved from Oahu. So, we...I guess I can tell you what we're going to be doing, we're going to be using the GORE Cover system, the same system that Cedar Grove is using in Seattle which is like if you guys don't know it's like the mecca of all commercial composting facilities. So, it's an aerated static pile, like Rubens has at EKO, but it is covered because our County really or our State really needs in vessel, covered in-vessel systems if we're going to, you know, there's just a lot of reasons, different reasons for it. But that's why we chose this specific --

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. And that's what's allowing --

MS. LOSANO: --method.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --the DOH to finally allow food waste to be composted?

MS. LOSANO: Correct. Because, you know, when you are composting food waste on a large scale, you know, we can be composting, you know, all of the cooking oil. There's...if you use the certain systems, they're really like full-proof. They're pretty amazing high-tech systems. And there's a lot less give and take, you know exactly what you're going to get, it's totally automated. It's, yeah, it's the most incredible technology. You know, it's working with the organisms that come to break down the food, and, you know, like handheld in your, on your phone basically, you can adjust the levels of air going into the piles and it's like, you know, adjust the moisture. It's pretty amazing.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, okay. So, it's good to know that that's changing and hopefully that will catch on across the State --

MS. LOSANO: Well --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --so.

MS. LOSANO: --I think that they still like the in-vessel system. So in-vessel systems are really where it's going. You know, there's a, there's going to be some pilots going in on Oahu that use a different kind of in-vessel system that is also really cool. I think it might be a little limiting for us on Maui, but for Maui these are really low to the ground, they're really good looking. They're just really compact and it's...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, well, I kind of want to get us back to the --

MS. LOSANO: Okay, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --reason that we're here. No, I mean it's good information, although I hope that you don't start composting cooking oil, 'cause I think making it into fuel is a much better use of it.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah, for sure.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: But are you able to in that same system compost the compostable food containers and...

MS. LOSANO: Yeah, that's why we chose it.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. So, that can be --

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

MS. LOSANO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --done like in higher speeds than what we're doing? I mean right now we know we can put it into the landfill, it's eventually going to compost but it's like years, right? So, your technology --

MS. LOSANO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --will speed that up and will actually make it into --

MS. LOSANO: Two months.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --reusable compost. Oh, that's amazing.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, that's great to hear.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah, two months.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I hope you do some kind of a public demonstration at some time --

MS. LOSANO: We will.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --because I would really like to see that. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member King. Member Molina, you had a question?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yes, thank you, Chair. And good afternoon, Ms. Losano. I appreciate what you're doing there, 'cause I think the best way to start is with the education of the young. Are you aware...and you're doing it at Lahaina Intermediate School, are you aware of any push towards the Department of Education or Board of Education to maybe make it mandatory to have core classes in environmental science a requirement? Because I think the more it's emphasized in our schools at the, even the younger age levels, I think we can really make some progress for the future.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: 'Cause, you know, displays like that, it's as the old saying goes, a picture is worth a thousand words, and it's hard to fathom that that's just a 30-day period --

MS. LOSANO: Yeah.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --and schools meet what, nine months out of the year? So, you times that by nine from just one school.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: And so, you're working with the, I guess the Science Department at, over at Lahaina Intermediate or...

MS. LOSANO: Well, so right now we're in the pilot phase, so I've had virtually every department reach out to me from the school. So, basically we're just developing the curriculum right now. Because there's, you know, even the Art Department, you know, they, they're like what are you going to do with all this stuff? Can we do like an art installment? I'm like oh yes, please, something. It's not going to go in my house. But yeah, so every department is...we're...this next semester is going to be...this current semester is going to be where we're developing curriculum and really having that conversation. The STEM program on Oahu is usually where this will fall, where the kids learn about all this stuff. But there's been a lot of different teachers reaching out with really cool ideas that make it accessible to every kind of class I think.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Great, well, that's great to hear and please keep up the great work. And this could --

MS. LOSANO: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --be the impetus, the pilot program for other schools in the State to follow it.

MS. LOSANO: That's what we're hoping.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Maui County can set, raise the bar or set the standard for environmental awareness starting with our young.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you.

MS. LOSANO: For sure.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Chair.

MS. LOSANO: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member Molina. The Chair would like to give the Department of Environmental Management some time to weigh in on the discussion. Mr. Nakagawa, any comments to share?

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

February 4, 2020

MR. NAKAGAWA: Yes, Chair. I think this is exciting I guess matter that we...I mean we've, we kind of talked about our overall plan and the future of working towards zero waste and this is definitely one step towards that. Of course we, as a Department since we're always tasked with fulfilling it, we, we're always more interested in the implementation and the education and how the transition for how us as a community will I guess approach that yeah. And so, but the passionate one here, Ms. Tamara will love to tell you a little bit about our program, so I'll hand it over to her.

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Farnsworth?

MS. FARNSWORTH: Mahalo, Chair. Aloha mai kakou, everybody.

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Thank you. Yes, I am passionate 'cause I care and there's so much evidence and data showing that we have to care and that we have to take action now. So, thank you for this opportunity to share my thoughts on this. My personal opinion is, I totally support this. My professional opinion is, I also support this. We are ready to implement this. We are ready to enforce it, and we are ready to provide education to the public. We're already moving in this direction. And, you know, we do have already our BYO program, bring your own, because we really are very much support promoting reuse over disposable or single-use. And the first R's, the first R is first which are refuse your single-use anything, reduce your sources of waste, and reusing anything you can. So, we've already been promoting all different kinds of bring your own types of products, including ones that may be affected by this legislation including like bring your own utensil kits, these clam shells which we are actually working on this go-box program. We're trying to do a pilot in Wailuku. We're definitely developing the program now. We would really like to see someone come and champion that to partner with the County, 'cause it's a huge amount of organization and coordination. But we are working towards that certainly. Source reduction is a primary, is primary for Zero Waste Maui and this legislation will go far taking, to take us in that direction. Bill 40 was recently passed and we'll be looking to them for guidance to see where they need to troubleshoot and to be working with their distributors there to kind of just work together with them to make this work should this be passed. I did have a couple of comments. Is this a good, is this the time to discuss the comments of what I just read here?

CHAIR SINENCI: We're going to go through it afterwards.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Okay. Okay. So, I also want to bring up the fact that this is not just a waste management issue, this is not just a litter issue, this is a...this is climate action, because fossil-fuel-based, single-use products which is what plastic is made out of, we, we'll be able to reduce our use of fossil fuel new materials and we'll also be stopping the emissions of greenhouse gases as these break down, whether they're in the landfill, whether they're in the environment. So, this is really climate action as well, and we want to remember that this isn't just about what happens after we get it

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

or after it becomes our waste, it's really about what we're consuming and what we are demanding. So, I want to keep that in mind that plastic reduction is climate action. And I, oh, I also wanted to mention that Kihei Charter School has actually contacted our office and they're looking at a recycling grant, and we, we're kind of interested in looking at them piloting a reuse kind of program at their school. You know I will disclose my daughter does go there, but she wasn't the one who contacted me about this, so. Well, they've talked about it in carpool, but I had a formal inquiry from a couple of teachers actually so we're looking forward to seeing what we can do in the schools and how we can partner with the faculty administrations and communities at that school and then hopefully using that as a model. And I think that's it. I do have like I said some comments on the actual language and what I'd like to see to make it more effective, so we can talk about that later. Mahalo.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo, Ms. Farnsworth. We had a question from Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you to the DEM for what you guys do and for being here. My, I'm not sure if my question is for Mr. Nakagawa or Ms. Farnsworth, being that this Department would be charged with the implementation and fines and whatnot, do you see it being primary complaint driven that you would be enforcing this bill?

MR. NAKAGAWA: Chair?

CHAIR SINENCI: Mr. Nakagawa?

MR. NAKAGAWA: Yeah, I mean Tamara probably go into it in more detail but it's like any other that...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The plastic bag ban.

MR. NAKAGAWA: Yeah, the plastic bag ban and whatever. I mean to me it all starts with the education I think and then the transition period for people to be able to comply, as well as like any other ordinance that we enforce whether it's grease traps or any other type of enforcement on whether it's restaurants or whoever. So, I think the community as a whole will always start out in a little resistance 'cause it's change, right, everybody doesn't like change. And when change comes, a financial cost to it, right? So, I think the key will be whether it's the plastic bag ban or the polystyrene ban, I mean it'll be education and then a timeframe for them to comply and then it'll become enforcement, right? And then after the enforcement when we educate everybody then it becomes complaint driven after that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then for your box, yeah, project where...that you were speaking about, I just was wondering did you make any connections at the summit with some investors or anything?

MS. FARNSWORTH: Did we make any...

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: From this past weekend, the --

CHAIR SINENCI: ESG.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --ESG.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Oh, the ES...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, you didn't go?

CHAIR SINENCI: The Ahupua`a Summit.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Oh yeah. I did not attend that. I wasn't able to.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh.

MS. FARNSWORTH: So, no, I did not. I was at a wedding. No. However, like I said, I'm looking for a champion entrepreneur to kind of take over this go-box type of program. So, yeah, but I wasn't able...I didn't attend that. I did want to speak a little to the enforcement which is that in the beginning...well, we...which is why we would like to have, you know, a certain amount of time to get everybody ready, educated. We did just go through this with polystyrene so I think we have a pretty good idea of what we need to do. After the law becomes, would become effective, we do do spot-check inspections at different locations. But I will say the community helps us, everybody would...calls us and goes I saw this, you know, container, I saw this cup, and the community has really been great at being a watchdog for us. However, we do also in the beginning of implementation stages, we do spot check and do inspections in different locations around the island.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, you guys are the polystyrene enforcer as well?

MS. FARNSWORTH: Yes, we are.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh. Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo. We have Member Molina, Member King, and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chairman. Just a question on behalf of someone in the gallery for you, Director Nakagawa or Ms. Farnsworth, where can the public get those reusable clam shells from again?

MS. FARNSWORTH: We do have a stock of these in our office. I will say that currently the Department of Health does not allow folks to just take this to say your food truck and pass it over. So, we are...we can kind of control our distribution of these currently,

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

because we want to make sure that we're not encouraging something that isn't safe or legal yet. Having said that, you know, if there's an event, someone wants to promote zero waste practices, you can contact our office and we have a process by which to request these. I also want to say that DOH could make rules to make it possible and so we would need State legislation to mandate that they create rules so that we could improve our bring-your-own practices in Hawaii.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, thank you. It seems like a lot of hurdles you got to go through just for that.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member Molina.

MS. FARNSWORTH: We can do it.

CHAIR SINENCI: Member King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, I think it's, we live in such a litigious society now that that's one of the main things I was told that if you were to take your own container and you washed it at home and, you know, I didn't grow up with a dishwasher, this was my dishwasher. So, I sympathize with you hand washing all this stuff. But that then someone puts their food in it then there's no chain of custody to say well, there's nothing wrong with our food, you know, and you must have picked up whatever you got from your container. So, I think that's a hurdle that has to be dealt with before we can go into that. But if it's something where we're just handing them something as kind of a rebate thing and then they take care of it and they put it through the dishwasher it might be a different issue. So, I think that's what we're dealing with. But I wanted to kind of ask on something that was touched on earlier was that when we did the Styrofoam ban, I don't think I...since that ban went into effect, I don't think I've been into a single restaurant and seen Styrofoam, you know, whether it was a takeout or I ask for, you know, to take my food home. And so, it seems to have been really effective whatever you did or...and I just wondered, did you get any complaints about Styrofoam that you had to enforce on after that went into effect?

MS. FARNSWORTH: Yes, we received a few phone calls and it was corrected by calling the establishment first and then we did go to visit a few of them.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

MS. FARNSWORTH: And that was corrected. I think we received eight phone calls for eight different folks, and they all said oh, we're getting rid of our inventory.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. But you're fairly certain that they had all been told early enough?

MS. FARNSWORTH: Oh yeah. So, we did a very direct education initiative with the distributors and the businesses before we did a public education campaign. We went directly to them and spoke with them and provided them information, invited them to the administrative rules hearing, and made sure that we were doing direct mailings and that we provided as much education as possible beforehand to help them get ready. The distributors actually were getting ready ahead of time and had stopped providing those types of items at least three to six months before so that their customers could exhaust their inventory. So, it went very smoothly and I think this would go smoothly --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah.

MS. FARNSWORTH: --as well.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I remember, I recall, you know, being part of that, and we didn't get 100 percent of the vote, but we were able to pass it through the Council. But I remember Member Cochran coming with information, coming to the Council with information. They had done I think just a call survey of 50-plus restaurants and nobody had more than a two-month supply of polystyrene containers. So, and then we, I think we gave them a year and a half or something until it was in effect. So, there was plenty time for both the distributors and the restaurants to exhaust their supplies. So, I'm surprised there was any supply left. But I'm happy that, you know, you were able to kind of dispel with the last few, you know, restaurants that were still using it, because I think we, we're talking about the same thing with the plastic, the single-use plastic ban. We're going to go through that same cycle of education, and there might be...this is going to be a little bit harder because there's going to be single-use plastic probably out in the public. I mean I don't think we're saying that people can't, you know, have their own at home that might you see out and about, you know, and people can bring stuff from the mainland. So, it might be a little bit more difficult. And that, I think that...I'm really anxious to hear what your suggested changes are to the bill, because I think we're going to be dealing with this just a little more detail of products that we're going to be seeing out there that we're going to have questions, the people who passed the bill, our Councilmembers as well as County officials as to what, you know, we're going to be seeing a lot of things like does this count as single-use, does it not count as single-use. So, the more concise we can be so that we know, you know, so people aren't making complaints about things that don't apply. And then people are policing the things that do apply. So, that's one of my biggest concerns about seeing these plastic 'cause I'm totally onboard with reuse. And, you know, I think that...I like the idea of someone saying well, you know, just

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

don't give bags out, because you can either take five trips back to your car or next time you remember to bring your cloth bags in. And I do that all time, I get out of my car and I'm halfway to the entrance to the grocery store and I went oh, you know, I turn around and I go get my bags. But eventually it's going to...if we're forced to, it'll become part of our consciousness and that's just, that's what we're trying to do is make it part of our consciousness. So, I really appreciate your support for what we're doing here and moving forward. And if we can get...if we can do like, you know, my friend Marj says and not let the perfect be the enemy of the good and just start moving forward then we can start shaping as we go. Because even the plastic bag ban, Chair, we had to revisit that. There were different thicknesses of plastic that people were calling, you know, okay because it wasn't...they didn't think of it as single-use. So, we had to go back and rewrite that and talk about the fibers in the bag. And we're probably going to have to do that with this, but I don't think it should hold up trying to perfect the bill. It shouldn't up us going, moving forward. So, I'll wait to hear your suggested changes and thank you so much for your support.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo, Member King. Ms. Sugimura, you had a question?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: First, I wanted to thank you for this visual. I mean it's amazing, just 30 days, 1 school, and thank you for washing it. That must have been a big project.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah. And are you talking to the DOE about going to other schools or is it something that could happen in the near future?

MS. LOSANO: I've been talking to the DOE actually 'cause the head procurement officer actually wandered in. She was doing an audit on one of the days when I happened to be there and I know her from several years ago when we were working on trying to get compostable's into the school food system. But I talked to her about the notion of dishwashers and they hadn't yet done the monetary audit as a result of Bill 40. It was actually I think like the week after Bill 40, I was like hey, what are you guys going to do? And she was like oh my gosh, I don't know. I was like okay well, I can help you 'cause there's several things, you know. And in certain circumstances there may not be a space for the dishwasher in the schools. But in a lot of instances there's still that infrastructure in place that new dishwashers can be put back into the schools and a reuse system can be implemented again. And I think it's, you know, it's a mixture of like just changing the way we think like Councilmember King was talking about, because we've been just doing this for so long. But I think they're looking into a few things and they're also looking into an exemption which would be really detrimental to not only the education of our youth but our landfills. And, you know, for us...for Oahu it's different 'cause they have H-Power, right, they just burn it all, but here this is just going into our landfill. So, an exemption for all of the single-use plastic would be, that would be really hard. So, we're still working on it. I was just e-mailing with her this morning actually.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, the DOE is looking for an exemption for Honolulu?

MS. LOSANO: They're thinking about it, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Gotta work on that.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah, right.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And then I have a question for the Department if I could? So, I think, Tamara, you mentioned about a grant that is available for schools to apply. So, can you talk about that? 'Cause I think that other schools might or other organizations might apply.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Okay. The Department has a recycling grant that we fund every year. This year I think we requested \$239,500, we awarded all of that last year to I believe 8 organizations. So, every year organizations, schools, individuals who have zero waste recycling waste reduction projects can propose their project to us, and we have a grant committee that evaluates them and then we award the grants. So, we are just working on our new proposal form right now, and it should be up online in the next couple of weeks. So, anyone who's interested in applying for the grant can go online to our website, Mauicounty.gov/recycle and look for the grant forms and they'll be up when they're ready.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. Sounds like something we should support, right? We just did the grants for --

CHAIR SINENCI: Water.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --yeah the watersheds and of course that's, you know, that's different, but I think we, the County supports 2.7 million in terms of support for the watershed projects, because they are water, you know, they help us preserve and protect our water system. But I know you're passionate, right, and when we worked on the abandoned vehicle, I mean I...do you have enough staff to do all of this? That's an Eric question.

MS. FARNSWORTH: We are strongly considering requesting additional staff, yes, particularly for the Abandoned Vehicle Program as we seek to expand it. I think that will be a subject coming up very soon.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. FARNSWORTH: As far as our other staff, I think, I mean we always welcome additional resources. And I think currently we do have a vacancy. We are looking to hire two more that were approved last year that we are just getting onboard with their position

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

descriptions and getting ready to hire them. So, yes, like I said we always welcome additional resources to do the work that we do.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member Sugimura. Members, we've reached our mid-meeting mark, and, so, we're going to take a quick break. When we come back, though, we're going to have Corporation Counsel help us with the process that we're going to follow, after the break. So, we'll be back at 3:15. EACP meeting is now in recess. . . .(gavel). . .

RECESS: 3:03 p.m.

RECONVENE: 3:20 p.m.

CHAIR SINENCI: . . .(gavel). . . Will the EACP meeting of February 4th please come back to order. It's 3:20 in the afternoon. And so, Members, welcome back. And we've passed out a new copy of the bill, which takes our previous bill and puts into its place part of our...well, the existing part of our Code instead of creating a new chapter. It is my intent to begin the discussions today and finish deliberations at our next meeting on February 18th. And so, we have Ms. Thomson to provide some remarks on how the process will go from here. Ms. Thomson?

MS. THOMSON: Thank you, Chair. So, what I wanted to do is get a good idea from the Committee, basically your comfort level with the things that you're looking to prohibit and then also the exemptions. And then what I'll do with Staff, with OCS and Chair Sinenci's staff is make sure that we come back with a draft that incorporates any of the ideas or changes that the Committee wishes. A couple of things that I wanted to point out in the bill that's before you today, let's see, so plastic, the current...this proposed definition includes polystyrene so all forms of polystyrene. Only foam polystyrene products are previously prohibited so we're potentially looking at prohibiting the solid and clear polystyrene that are currently allowed. So, that's something for consideration. One of the other changes for this bill is exempting certain types of prepackaged foods, and the definition is food and beverage contained in plastic disposable foodware that has been filled and sealed entirely outside the County prior to receipt by the food provider. So, food providers for clarity means both businesses but it also means personal home use. So, polystyrene foam food containers are not allowed to be used, you know, across the board, either for profit or privately or nonprofit use. So, when you're looking, you know, at expanding this, it will affect a lot more types of products. So, just so that you're aware of it.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Real quick, Chair, can I just clarify?

CHAIR SINENCI: Are...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, can I just asking you something really quickly about --

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

MS. THOMSON: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --that last comment you made? 'Cause we, this came up when we were passing the polystyrene bill so this would like ban...I mean the Cup O'Noodle thing came up, so this would ban those kinds of foods coming in too?

MS. THOMSON: So, it...

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Thomson?

MS. THOMSON: Currently...thank you, Chair. Currently, appears that...so this is under the exemption G, prepackaged food and shelf-stable food are exempt from the ordinance except for polystyrene prepackaged foods. So, if we wanted to continue to limit it to the foam kind of polystyrene, we would want to include, you know, that polystyrene foam prepackaged foods.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: But the way it's worded right now would include that and others?

MS. THOMSON: Right, it would exclude all of those so those would be --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh.

MS. THOMSON: --allowed.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, we can include them --

MS. THOMSON: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --in the exemption? Okay. Yeah.

CHAIR SINENCI: And, Members, just to remind you, because we had switched, we're not creating a new chapter, we didn't agendize this replacement and so that's why we can't do any amendments today. We can discuss it and look for changes that we can work on today, if there are no objections, for the rest of the meeting. And then our next meeting then we can make the amendments to the bill. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Hi. Sorry I was a little late. I had a question, so if I understand what you're doing is you're putting the disposable foodware into an existing section that previously banned the use of polystyrene? Is that correct?

CHAIR SINENCI: Yeah, so if you look at on Page 5, all the...this is the Ramseyer copy so all the bracketed ones with polystyrene foam, look at 20.26.050, Exemptions. So, polystyrene foam food containers would be switched to plastic disposable foodware.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I guess my question is, does doing this make polystyrene foam food service containers legal again?

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Thomson?

MS. THOMSON: No, those types of containers would still be prohibited. You're just adding additional types of plastic. So, polystyrene is just one kind of plastic, is how I understand it, so you're adding more types of plastic that would be prohibited.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, so like plastic is a broader term for polystyrene foam you mean?

MS. THOMSON: Right. And even polystyrene, polystyrene is the, you know, the white puffy polystyrene so that's the one that's currently prohibited. There's other types that are clear or rigid polystyrene. To me, it kind of looks like that container that was sitting here, you know, but they're the types of containers that, you know, like food trucks or takeout places are using right now.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh okay. So, we're just taking it up to a more broad level and then we would educate folks about, you know, that this polystyrene is still banned but additional types are also banned?

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Thomson?

MS. THOMSON: Yes, that's correct.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: We're expanding the ban.

MS. THOMSON: Right. So, we're adding to the ban both in terms of containers and then also utensils, so straws, forks, knives, coffee stirrers, all of kind of that type of thing too.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you. Sorry, I was a little confused.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you for the question. Member King, you had a question?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah. So, we're not adding any extra exemptions for polystyrene in this are we? Because we went from, well, the bill that was posted has four exemptions, and now we've got one...two...three...four...five...six...seven...eight exemptions. So, we didn't inadvertently add back any exemptions that we didn't previously have?

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Thomson?

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

MS. THOMSON: Thank you. And that's one of the things that as we take another pass through this bill, you know, provided that that's the Committee's direction is that we won't look at reversing any of the current prohibitions.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay great. Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Thomson, did the, it also include plastic plates and cups?

MS. THOMSON: Yes, it does. So, if you take a look at the definition of food service containers, so it's a pretty long list. Let's see. I don't see it in there. Okay. Food service container in the current ordinance means all plates, trays, cups, bowls, cartons, and hinged or lidded containers, clam shells, on or in which any foods or beverages are placed or packaged or intended to be placed or packaged. So, that's...sorry, I didn't notice that that wasn't in this current draft. But that is, that would still be in the ordinance. So, you're talking about a broad category of them. One of the things that, you know, appreciate your input on is whether beverages such as like water bottles, soda bottles, whether those are, would be included. Honolulu's ordinance specifically excludes them so that may be a kind of large category of items that, you know, I don't know if you're ready or not, you know, to tackle that.

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Thomson, can you explain that, the water bottles?

MS. THOMSON: So, with the definition of food service containers including beverage containers, if you prohibit plastic food containers, you're also prohibiting plastic beverage containers. One of the proposed exemptions is for prepackaged food and shelf-stable food but not including the polystyrene foam. So, that as I'm reading it would exclude, you know, anything packaged outside of the County basically. So, you know, we've kind of heard other people talking about chips and cookies and water and all of those, but I think one of the things that we're going to want to double check is what types of food are packaged within the County. And so, maybe, you know, work with that.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Ms. Thomson. And also, on the bottom of Page 5 under H, disposable plastic straws may be used by...under Exemptions, used by or provided by persons with disabilities. So, this was for health reasons for hospitals that they...some of the elderly might still need of plastic straws or those types of...so that's the last exemption on Page 5. Is there any other questions about the bill? Member King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah. Well, I just wanted to thank Ms. Thomson for that last comment, because I think you do really need to look at, you know, exempting prepackaged things from outside the County, and if there are people in the County making those same products and they can't use plastic but then someone on the mainland gets to and makes their product cheaper and can outsell...I mean so we have to look at the local manufacturers and packagers and make sure that we're not putting them at a disadvantage. If it's not good for local people to put something in

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

plastic, it shouldn't be good for someone from the mainland to put it in plastic either, so. So, anyway, I appreciate you looking at that issue carefully.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member King. Ms. Losano, did you get to review the bill that was handed out?

MS. LOSANO: I did yeah. One thing I think that we had talked about at great length with the polystyrene ban was the foam coolers, and I really think that we should add this into the ban as well, because not, maybe not necessarily the packing peanuts 'cause that's a hard one but foam coolers is one of those things that always ends up in pieces on the beach. And now Igloo is making like those compostable coolers. I mean there's all sorts of programs, you know, and a lot of times, you know, it's tourists going to the store and they're like oh well, I can just buy the foam cooler and then, you know, whatever, they don't care as much as we care obviously. So, I think we really need to add that in because it's totally unnecessary. Even the hotels can come up with some sort of like, you know, a lending out system for actual real coolers for their guests that they can, you know, be responsible about. We don't need foam coolers. Okay, sorry.

CHAIR SINENCI: Member Paltin?

MS. LOSANO: You know all about this.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I support it and it would really make my day if we could also add foam boogies, 'cause, you know, those things are really single-use. I mean --

MS. LOSANO: Yeah, the ones that...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --they snap in half and then they just leave 'em down the beach, and you can buy like a real boogie or rent a boogie, but foam boogies are the worst. You know like after a swell comes in and there's like ten foam boogies at the rubbish can, and it's dangerous too. Like people think that they can surf like six-foot waves on a foam boogie and those are the worst. I would really appreciate if we're going to do foam coolers which I totally support, foam boogies need to make it in there.

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Thomson, would that be a challenge or...

MS. THOMSON: Well, for this particular ordinance we're just talking about food service containers and things. But one of the things that I told Kasie is that, you know, really what we need to do down the line is combine the plastic bag ban with, you know, so we're dealing with plastics basically in one kind of organized fashion. So, if you want to, it's really not that much...to my...to me it's not that much extra work to combine the plastic bag ordinance, because there are things that we've talked about changing in that ordinance and combine it with this one. And then add foam boogie boards in there. So, you know, that would, that kind of makes sense because you're dealing with plastics all as, you know, one section.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm telling you it's revolutionary. Those foam boogies are bad news. Like safety-wise, environmental-wise, they're horrible.

CHAIR SINENCI: And they cause a bad rash.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, that too. I mean soft top is okay but foam boogies no. It's like a single-use boogie board really.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah, it's distinctly different than like the ones...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Wavestorm's can, foam boogie no.

CHAIR SINENCI: Member King, you had a comment?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, thank you. Yeah, just to follow up on that. Just while we're, we are focusing on the food service. So, basically what we're talking about if we all in agreement is removing the exemption B from, you know, just taking the polystyrene foam cooler and ice chest out of the exemption lists. If we take it out then it's banned?

MS. THOMSON: Thank you. And we might make it explicit that it is prohibited, you know, so go ahead and...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, put it into...take it out of the exemption then put it in somewhere else as a prohibited?

MS. THOMSON: Exactly.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. And then the Chair wanted to recognize Mr. Molina especially for his work previously in pioneering the plastic bag ban. So, Mr. Molina --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: --you get to see where your work has been ahead of its time and now it's still continuing. So, Mr. Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you for those accolades, Mr. Chairman. But, you know, in reality it was everybody pitching their heads together, you know, the, had the support from the Councilmembers at the time as well as, you know, people like Ms. Bonar and other environmental organizations that everyone collectively put their heads together. And, you know, it was the cutting edge, we were the first County to do it and then other counties followed suit. And we did like this have some resistance from the industry, the plastic industry as well, but you know what, it ended up being a real win-win situation for everybody. But, Chair, if you could offer me some guidance, we're working off the bill that's on the Granicus, yeah? The...

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: 'Cause I did have some questions. That's the, I guess I'm looking at Page 4, under Exemptions.

CHAIR SINENCI: We're working on the one that was handed out.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, the one that's dated today's date?

CHAIR SINENCI: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh okay. Okay, all right. Okay, I guess my questions was related more to the Exemption section and if there's any potential...I guess related to the packaging. So, I guess on the one we're working off on, off of today, maybe that's letter D because on the other bill I was looking at number two. But my question is, there's no conflict with the polystyrene issue right? With regards to prepackaged, because the polystyrene ban restricts use of polystyrene for prepackaged food. So, is there a conflict or not?

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Thomson?

MS. THOMSON: Thank you. And good eye, that was one of the concerns that I had with the initial version of the bill that is establishing a whole new chapter. I thought that there were portions of it that did conflict or were confusing, you know, in terms of what's a plastic food service container versus what's a polystyrene, you know, they're kind of intermingled. So, that in terms of continuing to prohibit polystyrene foam containers in prepackaged food, it's under G. And so, we're going to...I'm understanding we'll change that to include, so prepackaged food and shelf-stable food, not including polystyrene foam prepackaged food.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, thank you. And then one more question, Chair, a follow-up for moving down to the, for the significant hardship which is in letter number...letter I think E. Letter E, yeah, related to packaging. Is that...what is the definition of hardship in this case? Is hardship considered like a financial or inability to find proper foodware containers?

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Thomson?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: And if you could just help me understand what hardship, how hardship is defined as it relates to this.

CHAIR SINENCI: Oh, Ms. Farnsworth, go ahead.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Thank you. In the process of developing the administrative rules, we developed the criteria for that, for polystyrene, so I think we would do that as well for

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

this. So, we would dig more deeply into it and currently we ask...no one's actually requested an exemption for financial hardship yet, but we do have a form and we do have a process for it. So, we would I think replicate that. And basically they have to fill out why, what have they tried, how much of a hardship is it, you know, kind of to quantify it for...

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: So, ultimately it's probably more like at the discretion of the Director --

MS. FARNSWORTH: Correct, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --who shall make that assessment?

MS. FARNSWORTH: Yes, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. All right, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Mr. Molina. Ms. Farnsworth, did you have any comments on the bill that was handed out?

MS. FARNSWORTH: Yes, I did. Thank you. Well, most of it was covered and I really appreciate the foam cooler one 'cause I agree with that. And so, one thing that is...I really think is very important is to...in terms of waste reduction is to include a provision that anything, whether it's plastic or not must be provided by request only. That can reduce the usage of these by up to 80 percent before they even give it out. So, this is widely supported by the industry and, you know, those supporters of the bill across the board to just only provide it either, you know, by self-service or by request only. And so, we would want to add that into the prohibitions, at the bottom of the prohibitions, Section 20.26.040, we would want to add in some language and we have some that we could propose for that. Otherwise, I'm quite pleased. I think it covers a lot. There's a few details that could be massaged, but I think that is my main comment is that we should really be offering these by request only.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Ms. Farnsworth.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair?

CHAIR SINENCI: Member King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. So, versus, so what you're saying is versus outright banning them we should allow people...

MS. FARNSWORTH: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: 'Cause right now it says --

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Farnsworth?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --it will not be sold, used, or provided or offer for sale or sold in the County but what you're saying unless it's requested or...

MS. FARNSWORTH: So, no, it's definitely not in lieu of a ban. It's in addition to the ban which is that we...you can't...it mostly applies to utensils and straws. So, you know, usually a lot of times you'll get your plate lunch and then they'll put it...they'll give you all the utensils right along with it or they'll put a straw in your smoothie without you asking. And so, this would provide for you have to ask for a straw or you have to ask for utensils and all of those would be non-plastic.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh okay. So, you're saying even...okay, this bans all the plastic, so even the --

MS. FARNSWORTH: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --replacement --

MS. FARNSWORTH: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --to that plastic --

MS. FARNSWORTH: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --would on request only?

MS. FARNSWORTH: Yes. And just not automatically providing that without somebody actually wanting it, especially since we're promoting that you bring your own, all of those things. So, we would promote bringing your own first and then if you need one, you would ask for it.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. And I just would like to suggest too that you...because we do that with, we started doing that with water when there's a water shortage, right, because then, you know, you go to California you have to ask for water, it just, they don't bring it automatically. So, if we could put it in context of the fact that these are all items that are made with resources now, because even our wood or metal or whatever they're made of for the multiple use are still precious resources and so we're trying to conserve our resources by making that by request only. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member King. Member Kama, did you have any questions for the panel?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I was thinking about something and I can't remember what it was though, but I had something but I can't remember. When I do, I'll let you know.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. There was a question from Ms. Losano about the...well, Ms. Farnsworth, you mentioned that the DOE was going to ask for exemptions for schools on Oahu. Did you want to respond, Ms. Losano?

MS. LOSANO: Hello? Sorry. There's no light on mines. Oh, right here. Okay. I'm new here. She...I don't want to throw them under the bus, because I, you know, I really like them, they've had a lot of really good initiatives. But they mentioned that and I responded you guys have some time right, like we have time to figure this out, there's things, like there's things that we can do that, you know, all...let's not panic yet. But they did mention it, it was mentioned, and I think we need to do everything that we can to kind of facilitate a smooth transition without them having to go there, 'cause that is really what it's directed towards in a lot of ways. But I did, I remember something that I think you said that I think is really pertinent regarding the drive-throughs.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I remember, yeah.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah. Regarding the drive-through because I think that when we're doing all the education and I don't know if all of the drive-throughs were, you know, spoken to in regard, regarding the Styrofoam ban, but I think in this case with having to make the mandatory request thing happen, the drive-throughs are definitely something that we need to add to the list of educational material. And I know that there's actually a national network of signage and educational campaigns that I'm personally a part of for all of these ordinances that kind of streamline everything and make it a lot easier so that each county doesn't have to reinvent the wheel every time we pass something. So, there's, you know, there's like this coalition that's forming right now that is making all of this collateral across the board.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. LOSANO: The international...is it the national one?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. LOSANO: From Hawaii?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah, there's one actually that's national now that, yeah, it's all going to be part of, hopefully, the same thing so we don't have to do more work than we need to. Anyway, that was, I thought that was a really good point, yeah.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay, Ms. Thomson, you wanted to respond?

MS. THOMSON: Thank you. Just one quick thing, I will check before we bring this matter up again regarding the County's ability to prohibit these items in State facilities. So,

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

I'll have that information for you, you know, before we move forward so that you know whether the ban will apply or will not. If it does not apply then that could maybe one of the things that you suggest in your legislative package that they look at, you know, prohibiting these items that are being prohibited across the counties.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair, can I just follow up with that?

CHAIR SINENCI: Member King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, are we able to prohibit the Styrofoam, like the clam shells in the State, the little State kiosks where they sell food and any other State cafeterias or food service places?

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Thomson?

MS. THOMSON: Thank you. I know that that topic came up when we were going through the polystyrene foam ban, and my memory is that we cannot, you know, prohibit on, you know, schools from using polystyrene. But it's a two-year-old memory so I do want to check it and make sure that that's correct.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. I haven't seen any...well, I haven't been in the, a school for a little while since I haven't had kids there, but I haven't seen any Styrofoam in any of the, you know, the State-run snack shops or whatever. So, I don't know if that's just because they don't use 'em or because they...because it's banned or because they're looking at our ban in, for our County facilities and maybe they have a conscious. So, maybe we can find out why...maybe...Ms. Farnsworth, do you know?

MS. FARNSWORTH: Chair?

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Farnsworth?

MS. FARNSWORTH: We...I would gander a guess that it's because the distributors do not provide them so they can't get them locally.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. So, that could be the same with the plastic, if we, we're banning them from coming in then there's no place to get them and then...

MS. FARNSWORTH: Or also they'd have to go out, far outside to get that type of product. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member King. Did we answer your question, Member Kama?

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Well, no, I was going to...I wanted to make another comment about the drive-throughs. I mean I assume that when I go through a drive-through and I order something that I don't have to ask for the straw, but now I'm going to have to ask for the straw if I wanted one as I drive through. So, will drive-throughs have, be able to have something that says you must request this if you want it, because it will not automatically...I mean --

MS. LOSANO: Signage, yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: --will they have something like that?

MS. LOSANO: Yeah, they would definitely signage. It would be very clear. Nobody is going to have to think too hard about this, it'll be like...we don't want this to be like terribly inconvenient, but yeah, there'll be probably signage like before, you know, at every drive-through like, yeah. And it will just be, remember to ask for your straw. It'll probably be some like funky little picture and, you know.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Or how about remember to bring your straw 'cause you can give all of us one of those little packets that you have, right? We'll have it on us in our car.

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Farnsworth?

MS. FARNSWORTH: I believe in the language that we have, D, food provider would be able to ask if you want it, to say do you want a straw with that, do you want utensils with that? So, and something about to the affirmative answer that yes, you want it. So, they would probably implement that practice at the drive-through. Or both, put signage or both, yeah.

MS. THOMSON: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay, Ms. Thomson?

MS. THOMSON: Thank you. One of the questions that we had is, in terms of the effective date, to give, you know, the, to give the food providers sufficient time to use up their supplies and also to get the education, you know, out there so that it's, you know, not a shock. So, is a year, does that seem reasonable or a year and a half, so that we can draft that in?

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Farnsworth?

MS. FARNSWORTH: I would recommend implementation or effective date January 1, 2022. That will give us more time, the, our Department more time to get the businesses ready. This is going to be more comprehensive than the polystyrene so we want to make sure everybody is ready. It might seem like a longer...it is a longer time, but I think it'll help the Department and the businesses to get onboard and make it a more smooth transition.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Ms. Farnsworth. Mr. Molina, you had some comments?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you, Chair. If I could add some historical analysis regarding the plastic bags and its implementation. I recall we passed the plastic bag legislation around the summer of 2008, and in the implementation of the law it went into effect January 1st of 2011. And I know there was a big promo from the Department with a BYOB promo and so I recall it happening in January of 2011. So, that was roughly maybe two-and-a-half years that we gave the businesses if I'm correct, so just wanted to throw that out there. So, but yeah, I can see the point, you need to give the businesses time --

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --to exhaust their existing supplies.

CHAIR SINENCI: Member King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah, I understand about giving the businesses time, I just think that we do it as soon as possible and, you know, I would like to see maybe a year and a half, 'cause I think we're moving in that direction already. There's already a lot of restaurants that have done away with plastic straws and, you know, that will ask you before you giving you plastic utensils. But, you know, if we're serious about, you know, we talk about this in terms of climate action, you know, if we're serious that we're in an emergency then we've got to translate that urgency to the general public. And giving too long a leeway, you know, I mean I don't even believe that it's practical to look at 100 percent renewable's by 2045, because I think we're going to be underwater in a lot of areas in 2045 and it's going to be too late. So, but anyway just, you know, just to consider that we are in a climate emergency, we want to move quickly or at some point if we keep pushing things out, it's not going to be significant and meaningful, in my opinion.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member King.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Last question.

CHAIR SINENCI: Member Kama?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, where would the ban on plastic prescription containers fall under? They don't?

CHAIR SINENCI: I believe that would be an exemption under letter H. Ms. Thomson?

MS. FARNSWORTH: I'm not sure that would be included in this at all because it's not food per se.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

February 4, 2020

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No, I want that to fall under the same category that the boogie boards fall under.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Oh, oh, oh. Well, perhaps that's something we could take a look at as we are combining and expanding these. Oh.

CHAIR SINENCI: Go ahead.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Mr. Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Farnsworth? Okay. Mr. Nakagawa, did you want to chime in?

MR. NAKAGAWA: Oh, oh no, Chair. I was just going to say that, yeah, I don't think medical plastic containers is pertinent to this addition to our polystyrene kind of with the single-use.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MR. NAKAGAWA: Yeah. So, maybe in the future, you know, yeah. And I think overall once again I think as we take these steps, these necessary steps but as we continue along, I think the culture will change anyway. You know what I mean? Like, kind of like, I mean, I'm not a smoker so sorry if you're a smoker. But like smoking, I mean it was a no-brainer before, right, everybody smoked, they smoked in buildings, and now it's looked upon like hmm, he's a smoker now. You know what I mean like it's more of a culturally change and I think it's the same will come with the waste. I mean as we slowly move toward it and educate and do that kind of stuff, I think everybody will naturally have their bags, naturally have their own utensils, you know what I mean, that kind of stuff. So, we already have our flasks now, I mean, you know what I mean, that only took what, less than five years, right? I mean so I think eventually everybody will. So, but I think we do need and, you know, Member King is right, I mean I guess like, you know, it's, affects climate, that kind of stuff, but I think on the flip end, if we don't give the time then we only run into problems. We all know that right, when we try to implement new things right, and so.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Mr. Nakagawa, for your comments. I did...looking at Honolulu City Council's Bill 40 in Section 6 it says this ordinance generally takes effect on January 1st of 2021, provided that certain sections and revised ordinances of Honolulu as enacted in Section 4 shall take effect on January 1, 2022. So, I guess my question would be are their...well, that was some of the challenges of creating a new bill that would have had conflicts with the polystyrofoam [*sic*] bill. So, now that we've just expanded that bill to include more plastics and we've just broadened it now to include more of the foodware. So, maybe that can be a discussion for when we'd like this to take in effect. Right now with the bill, Section 4, the ordinance takes effect one year after its approval, so we can have that discussion on when we want to have the ordinance takes place. Yeah. Ms. Sugimura?

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, this is great and the lingering thought that I have for the Department is we do wonderful things like this, we still have that whole pile of the single-use bags. That was a great example, you know, as a prop of the effect. So, what does the...this you can do in my department, I mean my Committee meetings, but what does the Department need to get us to be, you know, to be more efficient I guess with the waste that we're creating? 'Cause we're still going to have waste of some kind, and we can't do H-Power, I think we don't have enough waste to do what Honolulu does. But where do we need to go in that direction for your next steps?

CHAIR SINENCI: Mr. Nakagawa?

MR. NAKAGAWA: Yes, Chair. Yeah, I think we kind of touched on this a little in our last year's with infrastructure, when Alice Lee was in there, and she wanted an overall. And I think, I mean...and quite honestly I think it, you know, in our presentation then the future goal was this zero waste and what would it take to get there, right? It's kind of a crystal ball for me. I mean Gretchen guys they might know a little bit more 'cause they know...they're engulfed in it. But we do have our Integrated Solid Waste Management Plan, and I think one of the testifiers was talking about how all of this combined has to be integrated into like an overall waste management, and that's true. I mean I think that, you know, we already started the, that Integrated Solid Waste Management Plan, the update. We're formalizing the scope of work and should begin shortly, and that takes, according to Tamara last one took like almost 2 years, right, around 18 months to 2 years. And so, when we figure that out, figure out update, what the technologies are out there and figure out, you know, kind of what is the best financially feasible plan for us as Maui, as a community here then we can kind of from there figure out, you know, what are the resources we need, what is the manpower, what is the capital investments that we want to put in. Do we, you know, and kind of what's out there. I mean I guess Tamara and I we talked about this yesterday and trying to figure out, you know, we don't know what holds in the future either, right, as far as technologies and as far as emerging technologies. I mean what if something magically can happen that helps us, you know, with this waste. But as Tamara pointed out to me yesterday, it's kind of like but it shouldn't be looked at as a fuel source, right, I mean 'cause you still need fuel, fossil fuel to kind of make this waste which then goes to that fuel source, you know what I mean? So, it's kind of, it's got to be looped around somehow. So, hopefully with this Integrated Solid Waste Management Plan kind of wrapping up is, that'll give us a little more clarity on how we can deal with waste overall in general for the community, yeah, with all the different waste, whether it's municipal solid waste, green waste, all of the different types of waste streams that come to us, yeah.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo, Mr. Nakagawa. Ms. Chen, did you have anything to add?

MS. CHEN: Not at this time. Thanks, Chair.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you. Okay, Members, so I think we've heard all of your comments and the Staff has recorded all of your input. Like I said, this was the larger, deeper discussion of the bill. And again because we had enlarged, you know, kind of expanded on the original bill and we didn't actually agendize that bill. So, at our next meeting on February 18th, then we'll go ahead and make the necessary amendments and then we can go from there on the 18th. Is there any other questions or additions that we want to make, comments? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just had a question, is...so you're going to make the changes that we talked about today and then post it on Granicus and then we read it before we come in?

CHAIR SINENCI: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, sorry.

CHAIR SINENCI: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks, just clarifying.

CHAIR SINENCI: Yeah. Thank you, Member Paltin. Okay. So, Members, so, if there are no objections, the Chair will defer this item.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS. (Excused ALL)

ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. Thank you. And we wanted to thank Ms. Losano and all of our testifiers today that came. Our departments, mahalo for coming, and all of our testifiers that provided some really good insight into this issue and for all of the hard work that they've been doing out in the community, helping to educate our County, as far as single-use plastics. So, thank you, Members. This concludes today's Environmental, Agricultural, and Cultural Preservation Committee meeting. Thank you very much. This February 4th meeting of the EACP is now adjourned. . . .(gavel). . .

ADJOURN: 4:03 p.m.

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

APPROVED:



SHANE M. SINENCI, Chair
Environmental, Agricultural, and Cultural
Preservation Committee

eacp:min:200204:ds

Transcribed by: Daniel Schoenbeck

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

February 4, 2020

CERTIFICATE

I, Daniel Schoenbeck, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 18th day of February, 2020, in Kula, Hawaii



Daniel Schoenbeck