

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

March 10, 2020

Council Chamber, 8th Floor

CONVENE: 1:32 p.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Riki Hokama, Chair
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Tasha Kama
Councilmember Kelly Takaya King
Councilmember Michael J. Molina (out 3:56 p.m.)
Councilmember Tamara Paltin (out 4:45 p.m.)
Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez (out 4:27 p.m.)

STAFF: Lesley Milner, Legislative Analyst
Rayna Yap, Committee Secretary
Mavis Oliveira-Medeiros, Council Aide, Hana Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)
Denise Fernandez, Council Aide, Lanai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

ADMIN.: Lori Tshako, Director, Department of Housing and Human Concerns (HFC-47)
Curtis Jamison, Grants Management Division Administrator, Department of Housing and Human Concerns (HFC-47)
Deborah Stone-Walls, Executive on Aging, Department of Housing and Human Concerns (HFC-47)
Ruth Griffith, Senior Services Division Administrator, Department of Housing and Human Concerns (HFC-47)
Kaina Bonacorsi, Early Childhood Resource Coordinator, Department of Housing and Human Concerns (HFC-47)
Wendy Stebbins, Volunteer Center Coordinator, Department of Housing and Human Concerns (HFC-47)
Ed Kushi, First Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

OTHERS: Kaleo Cullen (HFC-24)
Jeff Bagshaw (HFC-24)
Makalea Ane (HFC-24)
Emily Drose (HFC-24)
Jenny Miller (HFC-24)
Bryan Kortis (HFC-24)
Fern Duvall, II, Division of Forestry and Wildlife, Department of Land and Natural Resources (HFC-24, HFC-13(8))
Hanna Mounce (HFC-24)
Benjamin Rodrigues (HFC-24)

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

Gina Flammer (HFC-24)
Faith Chase (HFC-24)
Martin Frye (HFC-24)
Julie-Ann Cachola (HFC-24)
Mona Kapaku (HFC-24)
Steve MacKinnon, Chief Executive Officer, Maui Humane Society
(HFC-24, HFC-13(8))
(22) additional attendees

PRESS: *Akaku: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

CHAIR HOKAMA: . . .(gavel). . . The Council's Committee on Healthy Families and Communities comes to order. This is our regular meeting of 10th March 2020. And present we have our Committee Vice-Chair Sugimura.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good afternoon, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Committee Members, Ms. Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Good afternoon, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha awakea, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Aloha. Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha awakea, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Aloha. Ms. King. And Mr. Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Good afternoon, Chairman.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Full attendance by the Committee. We have three items today, two regarding management of animals in the County, and as well as the review of Department of Human Concerns, Division of Housing and Human Concerns. So, we'll take public testimony. We have people who are interested in sharing their thoughts with the Committee this afternoon. Each person has three minutes to speak on the item. State your name, your organization. If you are a professional lobbyist or representative of an agency, we ask you share that information with the Committee. All noise-making devices shall be on silent mode. I would hate to ask people to leave. So, take care of your devices. And we'll start. The first person this afternoon is, I believe, Kaleo Cullen, C-U-L-L-E-N, please.

. . .BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MR. CULLEN: Aloha mai kakou, Mr. Chair, Members of the Council. My name is Kaleo Cullen. I'm a resident of Kahikinui, moku o Kahikinui, and Association President for Ka Ohana O Kahikinui. And I support, strongly support, item number three, the Axis Deer Management Plan. Throughout the years, I've witnessed what ungulates can do to our forests, as well as our neighborhoods. And at this present time, we're fencing off 4,500 acres up in Kahikinui so that we can bring back our koa forests, as well as all of our native plants. So, I strongly support the axis deer management. You know, these deers, they can hop fences eight-foot tall. So, we know what kind of damage they can bring to our forests. So, with that being said, you know, you can see 'em driving...I drive to work every morning at two o'clock in the morning, and you can see 'em alongside Kula Highway. So, you know how bad it is in my backyard. So, yeah, and with that being said, I strongly support item three, Axis Deer Management Plan.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mahalo for your time with us this afternoon. Any questions, Members, to clarify his comments this afternoon? Thank you very much for being here. We appreciate your comments.

MR. CULLEN: Thank you, sir.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Jeff Bagshaw, if you would come forward and share your comments, please.

MR. BAGSHAW: Good afternoon, Councilmembers. My name is Jeff Bagshaw, and I'm representing myself today. I'm in support of both measures. I would like to speak first regarding the feral cat issue. I was once a veterinarian's assistant, and I got to see a lot of cats firsthand and learned all about feline leukemia. And I had...my second love is a domestic short-hair that lives inside with me. And I've had two cats adopted from the Maui Humane Society. So, I'm a cat lover. But they must be inside. They must stay inside. Toxoplasmosis has been found in spinner dolphins and monk seals. It has killed 12 monk seals in the last 20 years and 3 spinner dolphins. And I'd like to point out that these are apex predators. They're eating fish. So, if toxoplasmosis is getting into these animals, we don't have scientific proof, but if you just follow the ecology, what...are you eating fish? So, are we getting toxoplasmosis in our fish? Possibly. I don't have data to show that but. So, you're going to hear some more about this I'm sure today, but I just want to say that I'm in support of that. And as for axis deer, I've witnessed some video footage taken from a helicopter going over the isthmus of Maui, and the footage goes on for two minutes. And from every direction from the helicopter hovering, you can see thousands of deer. So, what we can see, he's right, you can see it on the roadways. But what you can't see is the massive population that's building up. So, we have to take some kind of control measures. So, I'm in support of both of these. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your comments. Any questions for clarification, Members?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I thought at...

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sorry. Thanks. Mr. Bagshaw, did you say you were in support of all three, in the beginning, or just the cats and the deers?

MR. BAGSHAW: The cats and the deer.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

MR. BAGSHAW: I'm not familiar with the other measure. I'm sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thank you.

MR. BAGSHAW: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Anyone else? Thank you for being here. Makalea Ane?

MS. ANE: Aloha. Wau o Chana Makalea Dudoit Ane. No Mililani mai au o Kahului, Maui noho ana. O Environmental Coordinator, Office of Economic Development, Maui County. Aloha.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Aloha.

MS. ANE: I wanted to testify on both feral and non-feral for the cats, and axis deer. Kind of, sort of on behalf of the Administration, but kind of more on a personal level, especially for toxoplasmosis. Well, I guess on the Administration level, we formed a toxoplasmosis working group for Maui County made up of some of the testifiers here as well as the Humane Society so we can get a broad look at what these issues are, and also work with Statewide toxoplasmosis working group that's been to get formed for the past four years, I believe. And it's just what you guys are doing right now, really talking to the constituents and partners to see what's going on, and how we can work together to address these issues. And it's a very hard topic to decide what to do with animals that we love, but that shouldn't be out in the environment. And as the Environmental Coordinator, I've seen what cats, feral cats and wildcat populations can do to our native species. Birds, I think we're going to have some testifying...testifiers on what it does to our native bird population, but also our monk seals. So, that's why as the Environmental Coordinator, I'm very concerned that this toxoplasmosis is in the environment killing monk seals as well as spinner dolphins and but also, on a human health concern. And I guess I'm speaking as a mom of four kids that I loved swimming in Iao Stream with my kids, and I take them all the time. And we love playing in the water, and then after really finding out about this disease and that's in feral cats and they shed it into our water, and it can survive in the water, and go downstream and actually kill animal life in the marine environment. So, it can survive in extreme salty conditions. And it really gets our kids sick. And so, just on a personal level, I don't take my kids swimming in Iao Stream anymore because I know the dangers of swimming there. And it's very concerning for me. And then I also

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

wanted to talk about the axis deer problem. And it is a very hard problem to address because it affects so many people, our environment. The...our Council has put a lot of money into putting up deer fences and retrofitting fences through the Department of Water Supply. And, you know, this is to prevent them from going up into our watersheds. But then that also keeps them into close quarters with residents. So, we see, you know, damages to cars. We have our Ag Coordinator here. He's dealing with a lot of issues with axis deer affecting our crops. And it really is an issue that has to be addressed on all sides. It's not just talking about eradication. But it's talking about management. And I know that a lot of people want to still do subsistence hunting. But for the past years, we've let this population get so out of control that public hunting programs, though it is a part of the solution, it can't be the only solution. So, we have to address it on multiple levels and also create other industries. We have some people that have been able to bring down USDA certifiers to certify the kill, and the meat, and the processing part of it, and actually create an industry. So, if we can do it on multiple levels, we're not just shooting them from the air and leaving them to die. We're creating an industry here on Maui. So, I hope you consider all the different solutions. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. We'll be asking the Administration to participate with us, so we are happy to hear your additional comments. Any need to clarify what she has just presented because she will be asked to provide additional comments for...on behalf of the Administration. Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. I just wanted to clarify. Were you not familiar with the third item, or just no stance on that one?

MS. ANE: I'm very passionate about the feral cats and axis deer. What was the third on the agenda?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chickens.

MS. ANE: Chickens. I think there's a lot more issues with feral cats and axis deer that I would like to focus our time and effort on those two.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

MS. ANE: Sorry. Can I add one thing? We also have somebody here on island that's been affected and paralyzed by toxoplasmosis. It's one of our Admin's close friends that she contracted toxoplasmosis when she was young. And now she is a quadriplegic. And so, these things are actually happening here in Maui.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Anyone else has a question for clarification? If not, Ms. Ane, we look forward to your additional comments as we proceed.

MS. ANE: Thank you. Aloha.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Emily Drose? D-R-O-S-E.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MS. DROSE: Aloha, Council. Aloha, Chairman. Aloha, everyone, for coming today. I am Emily Drose, Community Cat Coordinator at the Maui Humane Society. And I just wanted to share my personal view and what I've seen growing up here regarding feral cat population. So, being born and raised here on Maui, I've seen many changes to our island in my 27 years of life, one of which has been the feral cat population. I remember at one point in time, I could not go anywhere without seeing a cat, much like chickens now. A lot of these cats were an eyesore. Poor animals in obvious need of food and medical care. Fast forward to today, and although I do still see cats from time to time, they're now healthy, thriving animals. Not only that, the number of cats that I used to see and the number of locations in which I would see them has dwindled down. I had no idea that this was all due to Maui Humane Society's spay and neuter efforts. If I had only known then what I know now. I had no idea up until a few years ago that trap and kill was our only source of population control regarding these animals. I had to idea that trap and kill would only result in years of failed, grim and a gruesome method to control population that would only cause a negative vacuum effect. I wish I had understood the negative impacts of trapping a cat, dropping it somewhere else, rather than having it spayed or neutered. I also wish I understand the limitations and situations regarding abandonment for these animals as well. I wish I knew of the several low-cost humane and effective deterrents that can be used on all types of properties or businesses in order to maintain a cat-free property. With the tools and education I have now, it is with great pride and responsibility not only as a former veterinary technician, not only as Community Cat Coordinator, but also as a proud Maui woman that I am able to hoona`auao a ku i kuu kaiaulu, educate my beloved community. Not only this, I strive to ease minds and dissipate any fears or any health concerns placed onto my community, brought on by unfactual media propaganda or biased unfactual personal opinion regarding community cats. There are so many reasons why Maui is the best, and one of which is when we come together and work together as a community, we accomplish great things. I am looking to you, my County Council, to support me in my endeavors on providing our community with resources, tools, education, managing and humanely co-existing with community cats. But more importantly, I want to continue to offer free spay and neuter services to anyone in our community to effectively reduce our cat population here in our Valley Isle. Mahalo i ko manawa. Thank you for your time.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your comments this afternoon. Anyone has a question for clarification for the lady? Having none, we appreciate you being here.

MS. DROSE: Thank you. Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Jenny Miller?

MS. MILLER: Aloha, Council. My name is Jenny Miller. I'm with the Maui Humane Society. I'm the Director of Community Outreach. And I thought I would just take a moment today to tell you a little bit about our spay and neuter program and how we are handling the feral cat population. We call the feral cat population these days community cats because they are owned by the community. There's no particular

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

owner with a particular address or feeder. So, they're all our cats, our community cats. So, for 30 years we've been at our location in Puunene and we are...we have completely outgrown it. But we have been there and for the last 27 years, we have been killing cats, thousands and thousands and thousands of cats. You could imagine what that does to the psyche of somebody who goes into the field of animal rescue and animal welfare and they find themselves doing that. Well, what we were finding was that it was having no impact on the overall community of our feral cats. Population wasn't decreasing. We were still getting as many calls, complaints from the public about cats. And it just seemed to be the definition of insanity, doing the same thing over and over again, expecting a different result, and it not happening. So, a couple of years ago, we did some research and noticed that there was an impact. A program was having an impact in many communities around the world, and that was a spay and neuter program. So, about three years ago, we've started a program that's completely different from what we used to do. And we're really proud of it. This spay/neuter program involves the entire community's support which is why we're going to be coming on doing a lot of public service announcements and explaining how the community can get involved to tackle this problem. We think there are too many cats. We want to work with the conservationists. We love all animals, and we certainly want to make this a solution for the community. So, what we do is we offer free traps for the public to come and pick up. We tell them how to trap the cats. If needed, Emily or I will go out together to their property and do an assessment. See where the cats are coming from, what the problems are, and how we can address them. The community traps the cats and brings them back to us, and we spay and neuter the cat for free. We have a day dedicated to spay and neuter surgeries, and last year our two-and-a-half veterinarians in our tiny, tiny little surgery clinic spayed and neutered over 7,400 animals. We're a passionate animal-loving community. And I always say to everybody, nobody works at the Humane Society to get rich. We're there because we love animals, and we work really hard. So, by providing the free spay and neuter services, and the opportunity for the public to get involved and entrap the cats, we are actually seeing measurable results in managed communities and population decrease when we're doing targeted trapping and actually able to count those numbers. We're having less calls and complaints. And we are...we're able to work with the public. If somebody doesn't want cats on their property, we absolutely do not mandate that they should start a colony. We respect the fact that not everybody wants a feral cat on their...in their properties. We will provide deterrence. We have them for sale. They're very inexpensive. We will set them up. We will connect them with resources to make those cats not be attracted to their properties. And after about ten days of using those deterrents, the cats will learn and leave the property alone. It just takes practice, and it takes time, and it takes a commitment. And we are here to say that spay and neuter is the answer that we have found, is the only logical answer to this problem. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Any questions for the lady? Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Jenny. I recently got a small animal spayed, and it was a nice process. It wasn't a cat, though. But I was wondering, have you been to the Lanai Cat Sanctuary at all?

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MS. MILLER: I personally haven't visited, but I know the general manager and the owner, and we know them quite well. That seems to be...they have about 600 cats, I believe. It's interesting. The cat sanctuaries, I'm not sure if you're familiar with Best Friends Animal Sanctuary.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, my question was --

MS. MILLER: Oh, sorry. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --why does it work for Lanai Cat Sanctuary to get it out. I mean they didn't kill it, but then you said when 27 years or long time of killing all the animals here, it didn't work. So, I was wondering like maybe we could make it work if we tried the cat sanctuary or something?

MS. MILLER: Yeah, the cat sanctuary seems to be a nice option in theory. It costs about \$1,000 per cat to care for them for the year, for the feeding and the vet services, the staff. And if we have estimates between 40,000 and 100,000 cats, you can do the math and see that it's really not a feasible economical option for us. They have a small island, a much smaller population of cats and a billionaire backing them. And it's just not...it's not feasible. We wouldn't have the money.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, my question is, if you need the veterinarians for cats if they're in a sanctuary, is it...wouldn't you still need the veterinarian to keep it healthy for the rest of the community if the cats are roaming free?

MS. MILLER: Yeah, absolutely. And one thing we do with all the cats that we spay and neuter is we offer a vaccination for \$5. That's the only cost. We deworm for free. But there is a need for low-cost veterinary services as well, and that's something that we are projecting to offer the community.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is a vaccination for toxoplasmosis?

MS. MILLER: No, it's not a vaccination for toxoplasmosis. That's something that I don't believe they can be vaccinated against. But I will mention with toxoplasmosis, the CDC states that undercooked meat is the number one cause of toxoplasmosis in the nation.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you.

MS. MILLER: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Next person is Bryan Kortis.

MR. KORTIS: Chair Hokama, Vice-Chair Sugimura, and Councilmembers, my name is Bryan Kortis. I'm here today representing the Humane Society of the United States, the nation's largest animal protection organization with over 10 million members. I

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

specialize in community-wide programs for the management of feral and stray cats. I've worked with hundreds of municipalities including New York City, have authored the leading guides on community-level programs, and I'm a frequent presenter and consultant on cat issues, both nationally and internationally. I'm also available to meet with you at your convenience. In the past, Maui has been widely-known for its extreme and seemingly intransigent overpopulation of cats. This began to change in 2015 when new leadership at Maui Humane Society decided to take a more modern approach after decades of trapping and euthanizing cats failed to make a difference. This new method involves intensive and high-volume spay/neuter of free-roaming cats. The approach is endorsed as the only effective means of lowering outdoor cat numbers by the Humane Society of the United States and the ASPCA, among others. Today, Maui Humane Society is in line with nationally-recognized best practices. Since 2015, intake of cats at Maui Humane Society has dropped from over 30 per 1,000 residents to approximately 20. Foundations from around the country have contributed millions of dollars of funding because of this early success. Maui is now known as an excellent example of how to turn around longstanding cat overpopulation. I'm aware of some conservationists and their followers oppose the spay/neuter of free-roaming cats. I would urge the Committee to focus less on the alleged harm caused by outdoor cats, exaggerated or not, and instead rigorously assess the best way to reach the common goal of reducing the cats' numbers. The solutions proposed to the Council by the wildlife community have been tried and failed repeatedly over the years. Eradication of cats in populated areas has never been achieved. However, studies show the constant killing of healthy animals results in high rates of mental illness among shelter workers, including suicide, post-traumatic stress disorder, and anxiety disorders. Sanctuaries are a fantasy solution given the expense and the number of cats on Maui. Laws such as cat licensing, feeding bans, and leash laws have never been shown to actually lower the number of feral cats. There is not a single community where eradication, sanctuaries, or cat-related laws have resulted in sustainable reductions. The only method that works is the one Maui Humane Society is using now, intensive and strategic spay/neuter. They deserve your support, not a step backwards. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your comments. Any questions for the gentleman on his testimony? We appreciate your presence --

MR. KORTIS: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --this afternoon. Fern Duvall, please.

MR. DUVALL: Good afternoon, Chair --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Good afternoon.

MR. DUVALL: --and Committee. I am here as an employee of the Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Forestry and Wildlife testifying on behalf of Suzanne Case, the Chairperson of the Department. And this is in consideration of at-large cat impact. Cats at-large impact wildlife by preying on them and by

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

transmitting diseases including toxoplasmosis, roundworms, hookworms, ringworm that can infect other cats, humans, and wildlife. A reduction of at-large cats in the landscape would help reduce the predation and disease impacts of Hawaii's wildlife. The Department of Land and Natural Resources encourages Maui County in its efforts to address at-large cat issues. We urge the Council to support ordinances that require cats be managed the same as dogs. This includes requiring cat owners to have their cats licensed and microchipped for identification of their cats. Having required reliable form of identification increases likelihood of owned-cats being reunited with their owners through required microchipped identification. The Department also supports requirements, incentives, or educational efforts for pet owners regarding keeping cats indoors and otherwise contained in fenced or screened enclosures such as catios that prevents their escape and their access to native wildlife. Options for cats that need to travel outside of their home could include secure carriers or leashes except in areas that might be set aside for pet socialization like currently designated dog parks. The Department recommends that cats both existing and newly imported should be required to be sterilized unless the owner is otherwise licensed and registered as a cat breeder in the County. The Department also encourages the County to support ordinances and enforcement of existing policies that would reduce at-large cats being kept on the landscape. These could include ordinances that would prohibit the feeding or watering of all animals on public lands or other lands within the County on which such feeders do not have permission from the landowners. Certain limited exceptions could be made for instances when the animal will be attended to by the owner, and the animal is not resident on the landscape outside the owner's immediate attention. The Department also encourages ordinances that require that owners pick up, contain, and properly dispose of any feces that their animals produce when on the lands they do not own. Feces, especially cat feces, can contain several pathogens and organisms that can be transmitted and sicken other pet animals, wildlife and humans. The Department notes that the Hawaii Invasive Species Council adopted Resolution 19-2 in January 2019 supporting the keeping of cats indoors and the use of peer-reviewed science in mitigating the impacts of cats. In particular, this resolution suggests not using a tool known as trap/neuter/return or sometimes trap/neuter/return/manage. These studies have demonstrated this tool does not result in the reduction of numbers of cats and in practice this often involves the maintenance of cat colonies including on public lands without permission of the landowner. This resolution can be found at the website in the testimony. The Department thanks the Committee for the opportunity to comment on the important topic of reducing cats at-large in Hawaii. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Duvall. Questions for the gentleman on testimony presented? Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks, Chair. I just...my question was, so if you don't support the trap/neuter, TNR program, then...and...I mean, we have so much ACOs out there and cats, like when they're outside, I see 'em on my neighbor's roof and things like that. Like how...like how would all those cats be handled, like realistically?

MR. DUVALL: Well, the problem with cats is the cat numbers on the landscape. And a start

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

would be to have them microchipped and identifiable so that in cases of a cat on a roof, you could actually find out who the owner is and proceed to tell them it must be inside or it could be cited. Much the same as not having feral dogs allowed in the community for obvious reasons. It's hard to believe that, you know, dogs are handled so differently by the County and County support of the Humane Society than is cats and looks...and is not looking at their impacts to the community.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Are you done, Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess maybe like I don't see how realistically like legislation would stop it, but like if we were to do legislation to address it like maybe would you support not managing County...cat colonies on County lands or public lands?

MR. DUVALL: Yes, it was also in 2000 that the Department of Health tried to prohibit cats on public lands due to human health concerns. But the big issue always stumbles on the fact that cats are not owned. And we just heard that they're considered a community item. Well, a community is so nebulous that you cannot proceed against a particular owner of a cat. So, identification of an animal is really crucial. If there's a dog bite incident, it's because the dog is microchipped or licensed that they can go to the owner of said vicious dog. You cannot do that for a cat.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Anyone else has a question at this time? Mr. Duvall, we appreciate it and if you have time to be around --

MR. DUVALL: Yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --we may use you as a reference for the State position.

MR. DUVALL: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you so much.

MR. DUVALL: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Next is Hanna, or Hana Mounce, M-O-U-N-C-E.

MS. MOUNCE: All right. Thank you, Committee. Thank you, Chair. And you pronounced it right. That's right. So, thank you for keeping the feral cat issue on the agendas. And the feral cat problem is what I would like to submit testimony on today. My name is Hanna Mounce. I'm the Coordinator of the Maui Forest Bird Recovery Project under the Pacific Cooperative Studies Unit at the University of Hawaii. I'm also an Upcountry resident of 15 years, a mother, and a local small business owner. Some of my concerns are going to echo some things we've already heard in testimony today. But I'm happy to elaborate. Cats are one of the most disastrous introductions that we have brought to this island. They're spreading disease to humans and wildlife. Cats

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

are also one of the most effective and efficient predators on the planet. Maui County has the opportunity to reign in this human health and community risk. The first step is to treat cats as the pets that they are and adopt the same regulations and enforcements as we have for dogs. This will quickly remove owned animals from the landscape and allow the County to see the depth of the issue of unowned free-ranging animals. At the moment, animal control officers tell residents that they must tolerate free-ranging cats on their properties despite the human health risks to themselves and their children and the large-scale depredation of native wildlife. There's no reason that residents should be forced to tolerate other people's pets pooping in their gardens and fighting on their porches. If these animals are owned, they should be treated and contained as such. The County should mandate the same expectations as dogs, and that all cats be licensed and microchipped. Cats must be kept indoors, or contained, or on a leash. Licensed animals must be spayed or neutered. Furthermore, the County must enforce the County Code addressing animals in County parks and stop the feeding and encouragement of feral animal establishments in areas where our kids play and that our wildlife lives. At your last meeting on this subject, people suggested ideas for dealing with unowned at-large cats if they were to be removed from the landscape, i.e., the sanctuary which has already come up multiple times. The only way any such strategies can be implemented is if we first require cat owners to take responsibility for their own pets. Cats are healthier and happier when they're treated as the house pets that they are intended to be. And a spayed or neutered cat still hunts native wildlife. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Any questions for the lady this afternoon, Members? Okay, having none, we thank you for being here. I missed Mr. Benjamin Rodrigues. Are you still here? Thank you. Why don't you come forward and share your thoughts?

MR. RODRIGUES: Hui, aloha, everybody. My name is Benjamin Rodrigues. I'm a resident of Kahikinui, and I'm in support of the axis deer. You know, I live in Kahikinui, and we're farmers. We live subsistence lifestyles and in order to live out there, we have such a massive ungulate problem. We have cows, deer, goat, at a huge population. They are no apex predators here to take care of this problem. And it's a growing problem. You know, our moku is home to some of the most rare forest remaining on our planet, less than 10 percent of forest cover. And looking at the deer problem and the growing population, these resources are at the expense of all of our others. They impact our roads, impact our farms. They impact our forests. So, I ask that you guys take into consideration these things and that Kahikinui is in support...you know, I work personally with Jake. I've seen the program that he's done. I've seen the animals come out of the forest. And, you know, to do the math and to see all of that meat go to the families of the homesteads that was given for free. And that worked and needs to be done. And without that work being done, there's not many other mechanisms to take its place. And, you know, these programs need support. You know, I did the math and about \$6,000 per operation to make this happen and to significantly lower the population. About 600 animals a year would cost about \$70,000 to really...and start making an impact. And to recognize a lot of these animals, they hanau every nine months. So, it's an exponential problem that just

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

needs to be constant with our attention and, you know, support these people like Jake Muise and KIA Hawaii and his team that, you know, a lot of their work and volunteer work has affected our communities, and it's appreciated. And that's all I have to say.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for being here. Any questions for the...okay, Ms. Sugimura first.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, thank you very much for coming to testify. And you may not know it but we had some testifiers that came at another meeting that brought up Kahikinui and showed us pictures of these...I mean was like these dead carcasses, well, carcasses of I think it was steer. So, do you have any... 'cause you said it was subsistence, and that the meat was shared with the community. So, can you explain?

MR. RODRIGUES: Yeah, so, you know, my community, right now I think the population is around 1,400 cattle. In our populations, 400 of them in our forests. You know, I'm not too sure about the numbers exactly in the forests, but we started the program basically in order to get in and out of the forests by hand, it's hard. So, helicopter and flying them out to a designated spot to harvest and taking 50 animals out of the mountain, 50 animals that would be impacting our forests. And, you know, the meat is not being sold. And for me as a hunter, as a gatherer and subsistence person, you know, usually we take the meat, the carcass is left in the wild that goes to feed the earth. You know, that's the cycle of life. After we make, we go in the ground as well, . . . *(inaudible)*. . . And that place, Lualailua, there is no significant sites directly that that animals was impacted, but I think it's one of the places that was appropriate. It's away from our houses, away from our community. And you'll notice after a few weeks, that whole pile will disappear, only bones to be left because the pigs, the...and everything else, the mongoose, will eat those things.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Ms. King, you have a question for the gentleman?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I do. Thank you, Chair. Thank you for being here, Mr. Rodrigues. I just wanted to clarify something you said in your testimony that you said 600 animals a year would make an impact, taking 600 out. Is that just the axis deer? Is that 600 ungulates, whatever?

MR. RODRIGUES: I think the axis deer, the population is...it grows much quicker than the cattle. But the big issue for us specifically are cattle. Every nine months, they're producing more calf. It's calving season. So, I think that number that we have was making a significant impact. Within two years we could significantly drop the numbers of ungulates if proper funding was given.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. And then the funding would be used for what? For access to the forest?

MR. RODRIGUES: I think a lot of it right now is the helicopter time.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. RODRIGUES: You know, like we've gone up, and we've had parties before in the past where we drive trucks up there. To access the mountain, it's kind of hard. There's a lot of risk. But with the helicopter, you know, I think it's like 17.50 per minute which is expensive.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, you fly in by helicopter, then you take the meat out by helicopter too?

MR. RODRIGUES: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, okay.

MR. RODRIGUES: And I think it's effective. It's the technology, you know, and some people aren't happy with that, but I see it to be the only really effective means for us to safely access and bring out that large amount of animal, usually about 50-plus animals coming out of the forest at a time.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I just wanted clarification on your response to Member Sugimura. Mahalo for making the time to come out and testify today. You said that after the cattle are butchered and meat distributed, that the remains would remain above ground, and that's something that you support. You don't support burying it?

MR. RODRIGUES: Well, that's more impact. You know, we don't know when you dig, there's iwi kupuna. And I believe it's a natural process, you know. And all of these things are not considered waste. It goes back into feeding the aina, you know.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, like a hundred remains of cattle left exposed on the land is something that you support?

MR. RODRIGUES: Well, I think that a lot of it, you know, personally as a hunter, you know, I've gone in the forests. I...and I work there, and I see the impacts of, you know, so these are...it's one solution. I'm not saying it's the only one. But it has proven to work, and I feel the meat has been put to good use to feed families. And I don't really see how leaving the carcasses above ground is a problem, you know. We have a pig population, that's what . . .*(inaudible)*. . ., you know. And that's nature's course. So, I don't see an impact.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Rodrigues. Mahalo, Chair.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just was wondering what your job was when you go in the forest.

MR. RODRIGUES: I do some volunteer work. I work with Leeward Haleakala Watershed Partnership. I do some volunteer planting. I also work for Auwahi Wind, I'm a part of their environmental specialists monitoring the take from our windmills, and planting trees to offset those things. And I live in the community. I live out there. I love the lifestyle out there. And for me, it's about being in that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. My other question was if the ungulates is a problem out there and you leave the carcass for the pigs. Isn't the pigs ungulates as well?

MR. RODRIGUES: Correct, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, are we...you're not worried about the pig ungulates, only the deer ungulates?

MR. RODRIGUES: The pigs...the deer and the cattle are significantly impact forests, whereas the pig wouldn't be going up into the forest and eating saplings, you know. The deer and the cattle, they have the ability to hop the fence. Cattle can break fence. So, it's kind of poho if you're going build fence if these things can impact them anyways. So, you know, the pigs, I haven't seen a problem. They do get into the fence every once in a while. They do impact. But when cattle come, they destroy stuff on our property, you know and...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I understand that. I just don't know why we want to feed more ungulates.

MR. RODRIGUES: Yeah, well, it's just one of the solutions. And even, you know, the work that they've done in Kahikinui has taken time to address some of the pig population as well. But for me, the impacts are shown from the deer and the cattle is significantly.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, we appreciate your response, Mr. Rodrigues. Anyone else would like...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Mr. Rodrigues, has the association reached out to the Department of Hawaiian Home Lands for any kind of assistance? Or have you folks applied for any grants to be able to resolve your issues up there?

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MR. RODRIGUES: You know, that's just one of our issues. Our community association has been focused on building a sustainable community. And we're currently building our capacity to handle these things. And, you know, I think our community focusing...one of the things we've been focusing on is building a school for our keiki, also working on economic development. So, we try to wear as much caps as we can at one time.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So, Hawaiian Homes has not provided you support?

MR. RODRIGUES: They do. They've...we've had some talks, and I think a talk is going to take place soon to address our public lands there. And we work with Leeward Haleakala Watershed Partnership, and they've been good partners in that aspect. And Hawaiian Homes has been a big help for us and in specific projects we've been working on. But the animal management is a huge thing that not only one organization needs to work on. I think it's takes a collective.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much for your presence today and sharing your thoughts.

MR. RODRIGUES: Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We appreciate that. Gina Flammer?

MS. FLAMMER: Okay, good afternoon. I'm Gina Flammer. I'm representing myself today. I'm going to tell a family story that some of you do know that I felt important to share. Last August my 18-year-old very healthy son became blind in his left eye. It was the toxoplasmosis. We had fed feral cats on our property. We had had a domesticated cat. It took five months of heavy-duty antibiotics, the double dose of what's even recommended, steroids. He can see, but the damage is permanent. The doctors equate it to having an old picture tube in his left eye where he can't really see color well. The objects are actually smaller. So, he was left with permanent damage. What I wanted to share, though, is that when you read the literature about it, you read that it's rare. You read that it hits only old people with already have problems. You hear claims like it's exaggerated. Well, it hit my family. It wasn't exaggerated. It did happen. It's reoccurrent. As we saw each of the doctors, they told us cases that they're having now of healthy people, teenagers that are losing their vision, and it doesn't come back. So, I'm so happy to hear you taking this up today. The State's taking it up, the Mayor. It is a huge problem. It's the number one cause of blindness today, and it's spreading like crazy. The more cats you have, the more you're going to have. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Ms. Flammer. Any questions for the lady on testimony? Thanks for being here this afternoon. Next, Faith Chase, please?

MS. CHASE: Aloha, Chair Hokama. Aloha, Healthy Families and Communities Committee. I didn't time myself so I'm just going to rattle and gosh, you know, my fellow friends, Councilmembers, maybe you could ask me a question at the end. I'm testifying on the

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

item where axis deer management is the topic of discussion today. I would like to include in my testimony three testimonies from the Economic Budget and Finance Committee meetings on January 23rd of this year. Sorry, I just had one for the clerk and the Chair, but I'll make sure that I e-mail it afterwards. Of course, you guys were all there 'cause all Members are on the Committee, right. In 2014, I was asked by Kaupo Ranch to work on the Maui County venison-to-market feasibility study. I have qualified comments to make today. Within that study, Jake Muise and I were scheduled to co-teach a class on the byproducts of axis deer. I, as the waste stream specialist concentrated on compost, and he concentrated on the market aspects of axis deer byproducts. During this time, it was made clear to Jake Muise that Maui County could not operate the way Molokai was with their 30 to 40 new moon harvest because we don't have a large animal mortality composting facility. It is noteworthy to mention that in addition to a respectfully incomplete feasibility study, a \$62,000 grant and an organized axis deer working group also had conflicts of personalities and served little to solutions due to what is described, personnel changes. I mention this merely to exhibit that this issue has had inadequate attention since 2014. Several things transpired that have made this axis deer issue difficult to navigate. Somewhere between the study and Jake Muise fulfilling grant-paid helicopter axis deer counts, he backed out of the teaching component for the venison-to-market feasibility study. His reasoning was that he had to advantage a money-making opportunity on Hawaii island. My opinion is that he himself saw the wide feasibility of profit and took the numbers he was hired to collect and diverted work towards to self-profiting mechanisms, completely contrary to the goals of the community-serving grant. I strongly feel that the approach Jake Muise takes with ungulate management is an ill-mannered approach. He did not approach the community in a thorough or sensitive manner. He did not respect or listen to the advice of local expertise. His involvement on Maui has absolutely ripped the Kahikinui community in half. And if anyone needs further info, you can see the *Star-Advertiser* article that published on December 1, 2019, front page. I will make sure that I e-mail that as well. In light of the extensive carcass dumpings by KIA Hawaii, LLC, a Maui game and land management organization is in the process of formation. Preliminary discussions within this new organization were initiated by the consistent reports of carcass dumpings that have been found island-wide, roadside, private ranches, Hawaiian Homestead. There have been reckless commercial scale carcass dumping found island-wide that have been confirmed to have been the activity of KIA Hawaii. If you need an example of a successful local hunting management program, you must confer with Kahikinui Game and Land Management Ohana as their 25-year nonprofit is a national model with perfect safety record. I might note nowhere in the recent approach does ungulate management lasts two years in the Southeast region did DLNR and its subsequent enforcement unit, DOCARE, Leeward Watershed Partnership, or KIA Hawaii confirm game counts. Nobody confirmed game counts with this longstanding 25-year KGLMO organization. They have immaculate records dating back to 1996. I'm short a few comments, but I will end politely.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We appreciate and we will make sure whatever you submit, we'll make copies for all Committee Members, just for your information.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MS. CHASE: I can close with one sentence and then --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Sure.

MS. CHASE: --I have comments on my second item. I just...I echo the comments of the other testifier that I agree that no one group can do it alone. It deserves multiple levels of involvement and other industries, you know, they deserve fair play in this axis deer market, not one entity. And I look forward to a full panel of area and subject expertise in this Committee. Thank you for taking it on. On the agenda regarding the budgetary concerns for the Department of Housing and Human Concerns, I recently had a meeting with administrators, with Lisa Darcy who runs Share Your Mana. And it was clear that there is no mechanism in place within the Administration to host a clearinghouse for those who have solutions to share. I tried to have a direct action as I left the meeting, and I was merely asked to come and report on their budgetary concerns today. So, I am. So, I'm taking the opportunity to mention that I will bring it up when you guys have your budget tour that there needs to be a CIP where the Department at least budgets or attention some sort of clearinghouse because people are frustrated with the housing situation. They come to that Department with, you know, solutions and then it just goes nowhere. So, I really...I don't know what that looks like, but I will formulate it as you guys make your tour. And I appreciate your time.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for sharing those comments. So, questions for the lady on her comments as it regards to the Human Concerns Division, anyone has questions for her under that area? Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez, you have a question for Ms. Chase?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I'm sorry. Are you only taking questions on the second item, or on either item?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, I just want to do one at a time so we stay...we can focus.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Anything on Human Concerns area, Members, you want to ask the...Ms. Sugimura?

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you, Faith, for being here. So, can you clarify what you described in the Human Concerns?

MS. CHASE: There is a term called compassionate response --

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

MS. CHASE: --when they do the sweeps and Lisa Darcy feels that modeling some of the things on Oahu that some...there was actually some illegalities. And she wanted to make that clear to the administrators. And so, they have been...that has been brought up for notice. So --

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, I...

MS. CHASE: --it's just the sensitivity of the sweeps was the premise --

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MS. CHASE: --of our meeting, and we talked about a lot of stuff.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. You spoke so fast so I didn't...

MS. CHASE: Sorry.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, got that. I know the program. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Anything, any questions for the lady for clarification regarding her comments on feral animals? Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Chase, for your testimony. I just was wondering if you could clarify by what...clarify what you meant by fair play.

MS. CHASE: There is meat that is being sold, and it has been commercialized and without, you know, tit-for-tat, pointing fingers, blaming, it seemed like it was a good idea in the beginning to be a resource, what it was intended to be that would serve a lot of people. And the meat distribution is not as what it might have been reported. And there are people profiting. There's commercialization and, you know, Molokai is pretty ho`opa`a, they're pretty solid on their not commercializing. At least they're a lot more vocal about it. So, and they are Maui County. So, I don't know. Maybe we might have to model some stuff that's going on in Molokai. But fair play, it just...right now it just seems like one entity is profiting.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And no other entities are being allowed to address the problem that's this massive problem of deer?

MS. CHASE: You know, that's kind of why I'm looking forward to an expert panel because KGLMO, they did an...they did a self-audit, and they have the game counts. And so, when Leeward and the organization for the Kahikinui homestead partnered with Leeward to do ungulate management, there's no record of them saying, hey, what was your count in 2017 for pheasant, quail, goat, deer, cows? And they have all that data. It's amazing. So, I just...there was...you know, sometimes we forget to look at that survey on the shelf. I don't know. I don't know how come it went wrong.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you. Yeah, got to look at the data.

MS. CHASE: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Got it.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, any other questions? Ms. King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. Thanks for being here, Faith. You did a great job going through the first one really fast. But I wanted to ask you if your group, 'cause I know when you were doing that, I remember when you and Phyllis were working on...

MS. CHASE: Right, we did a --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah.

MS. CHASE: --presentation together.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: A deer panel . . . *(inaudible)* . . . something, but did you guys ever talk about a rendering operation that would take care of all of the...

MS. CHASE: Actually, I'm so glad that you said that because the Department of Hawaiian Home Lands, there's some initial project ideas because, as well as housing Hawaiians, there is that component, the economic component. I know it's kind of contested on Honolulu, with Kapolei and the mall being on places where homes can be built. But there's some really progressive conversations about rendering facilities and, I'm happy to report, LAMC, which you know is my, you know, I always come here about trash and water to, you know, gripe.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: They're talking, there are ongoing conversations about...

MS. CHASE: Yeah, about large-animal mortality composting. So, if you imagine this, you need to have a cement storm runoff. You cannot just go, okay, we'll pile the animals and it's going to be okay. If we have crazy, unrealistic waters and rains like we've had, you have to have almost as much cement runoff with backup and barrels in case something like that happens as you do have those rows of large animal mortality composting. And, if you bury the carcass three feet instead of like six feet, some people think if you dig deep, then that's better. That's where all the microbial action is happening within the first three feet of the soil. And I learned that from my farmers union background. But anyway.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Aloha, Ms. Chase. Mahalo for your testimony. So, you said that there was a lot of dumping of carcasses around the island, island-wide. Why is that a bad thing?

MS. CHASE: Dependent on where it is, I've seen three physically myself in inappropriate areas. I mean if you want to consider tourism, on the side of the road is not really

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

garens, you know, not really hospitable. The one location, you know, Kahikinui is riddled with archaeological majestic finds and so, you know, while it's...some people disagree, the larger dumping in Kahikinui was really unfortunate. And, there's, you know, it's...it would've had traction had that 2014...it would've been part of that. So, personality conflicts really were the crossroads where this went bad in 2014. Everybody stopped talking to each other. And the way the ranches kind of looked at it when I was doing my survey, was with a little bit of a gold rush. Like people went nah, nah, nah, I'm going to get my mobile slaughterhouse unit, and I'm...and they stopped talking to each other. So, it really does need a County take, and maybe that County can be that strong intermediary, but certainly so far, we haven't had the experts in the field, you know, advising the steps that need to be taken. And I liken it to, you know, those little green army guys, those little green plastic army toys. You know, there's guys on the ground doing good jobs, taking really good counts. And all of a sudden, the boy, the boy with the toy with the toy helicopter comes along and everybody forgets about the ground crew. I mean that's just my try-to-make-you-laugh analogy.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Chase. And last question, Chair. For the...you said no confirmed game counts. Is that recent counts or...

MS. CHASE: Well, they've been locked out of the forests, the Kahikinui Game and Land Management Ohana, for two years; hence, the activity and the inquiry. So, their game counts go to 2017. So, 2018 are missing counts for obvious reasons. But when they started, you know, oh, we think the number is this, and we think the count is this. I mean I've seen numbers anywhere from 7,500 in my research to 80,000. It's like, that's a big spectrum, you know. So, can we get the right numbers? And so, you could do a really good basis on there. And it does come down to mongoose and cats too, you know. I don't see chickens, but. And all of the...I mean not that I have anything to say about those two other items, but the chickens and the cats and, you know, God bless all the people doing what they can for the cats but, you know, is issue, it would be nice to humanely to take care of animals correctly, the right way. They would be considered part of LAMC too, you know. So, the Humane Society is definitely part of that conversation, that trash composting conversation.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Chase. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you very much. We appreciate your comments this afternoon.

MS. CHASE: Thank you so much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Martin Frye?

MR. FRYE: Aloha, good afternoon, everyone.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Good afternoon.

MR. FRYE: Thanks for taking all the time to hear everyone's testimony. Some of these

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

issues are, they cause a little consternation, but I think the democratic process is the way forward. So, thanks for everyone for coming and contributing. I'm here today to comment on the feral cat issue. I work for the Maui Nui Seabird Recovery Project, and we protect endangered seabirds as well as other native seabirds. I just want to point out that the seabirds are what made life possible here in the Hawaiian Islands. Their contributions of nutrients from pelagic and marine sources are what enabled the soils to build up and for the entire ecosystem that we're now so familiar with, and that we all so much appreciate. That was made possible because of millions of years of contributions of seabirds to the land. Unfortunately, I didn't have a prepared statement today. This is my first time commenting. So, I want to thank everyone for the discussion because that's what kind of guided my thoughts as I sat. I wanted to address the question of the Councilmember regarding how is it that the sanctuary on Lanai costs \$1,000 a year for it to care for a cat, but here on Maui the proposal is that there's no cost of the caring for community cats. The answer, of course, is that the cost is pushed onto everybody. This is known as the tragedy of the commons. That's the thread that's been discussed here today whether the issue is deer or cats. We're watching our natural resources degrade, and in some cases completely unravel because of the idea that these cats aren't anyone's sole responsibility. And I want to reject the idea of community cats entirely. And I would also suggest that if it's true that all of us own community cats, then who is responsible for the deaths of endangered species that are caused by those cats? 'Cause that's a Federal situation, Federal law, and so if we're now being told that, oh, all of us are responsible for these animals that no one outrightly owns, then all of us are collectively responsible for the deaths of Federally-endangered species. And I would ask the Council if they're prepared to take on that responsibility, or if it would be wiser to in fact insure that every domestic animal is owned and contained, and that any of the animals that are not owned and contained, are actually a problem and need to be dealt with. The idea that we can do this with the trap/neuter/release is not something that is supported in many peer-reviewed scientific journal. There is a comment made that there's just media propaganda saying that TNR doesn't work. But it's actually peer-reviewed science that says it doesn't work. And if the Humane Society is able to spay and neuter 7,400 cats a year, in order to reach the number that TNR cites as being necessary to actually control the population which is going to be over 80 percent, well, there's almost half-a-million cats on Maui. So, at a rate of 7,400 a year, that would take us a long time to get to 400,000 cats. Thank you very much for your time. I appreciate it.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. Frye. Any questions for the gentlemen? We appreciate your comments. Thanks for being here.

MR. FRYE: Mahalo.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Julie-Ann Cachola? Ms. Cachola is the last one that requested to speak. So, if there's anyone else, make yourself known, and we'll provide you with an opportunity.

MS. CACHOLA: Aloha. Oops.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

CHAIR HOKAMA: Aloha.

MS. CACHOLA: Sorry, I'm short.

CHAIR HOKAMA: That's okay.

MS. CACHOLA: My name is Julie-Ann Cachola. I'm a Planner with the Department of Hawaiian Home Lands. Chair Aila and our Commissioner, Maui Commissioner Randy Awo, is very concerned about us having a presence at this hearing today. So, you got me. I've actually been working with Kahikinui for since 1992. I think it's like, I don't know, too many years.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .(*inaudible*). . .

MS. CACHOLA: Yeah, 28 years. And I am the Planner assigned to Maui, so I deal with Maui projects, and I deal with Maui homestead associations. You know, we're coming to testify in support of your axis deer management plan because we're a large landowner too. And we've had to do the same thing. It's really bad. I mean Molokai is really bad, and so if we can get a handle on it, the sooner the better. What we can share is some of our successes, so we've developed a strategy, and we've been implementing it, and it's been very successful. And there's a couple of things. We're not resource managers like DLNR, right. So, we're supposed to be building homes for our homesteaders. But we have all this land. So, we knew that we couldn't...we need to partner with other people. So, we had the Leeward Haleakala Watershed Partnership group. Now, keep in mind Kahikinui is a moku. It is nine ahupuaa. This is 25,000 acres of land. So, over the years, Leeward Haleakala had done grants and everything. So, we're closing us...doing a fence to enclose 4,500 acres, right. Our strategy was to look at the really...the big animals that are really causing the problems. So, we're not looking at the mongoose, and the cats, and the birds. They're not knocking our fences. They won't knock our fences down, right. So, we have to deal with these big bulls and the females that are reproductive, on the reproductive cycle. We did have a license with KGLMO for a long time, almost 15 years, I think. And what we saw was the herd was just growing, and I kept on saying, you gotta step up your game. This is...we need to get serious about resource management. This is not sport, game hunting. The other thing we realize, just really quickly, we cannot have a hunting program. So, you gotta look at that because only DOFAW, right, can have a hunting program. So, there's different laws that we had to address which caused us to go into this third-party agreement, and thank God, I just want to say, that we found this 'cause we've been looking for a long time. Who can meet this bill? We didn't want somebody to come down and just mow them down with, you know, just go in the helicopter and mow them down. The others were coming in by foot, and they couldn't haul the meat out. So, they would leave the carcasses with all the meat there. So, when we found KIA Hawaii, we thought we are shifting this paradigm. We're creating a new paradigm in resource management, and we were very excited about that because it was a win-win, right. We're taking the animals out; we're using that meat. I mean good protein feeding our community. It was a win-win. We thought it was actually going to change

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

the whole paradigm for resource management. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Cachola, we appreciate your presence this afternoon, especially sharing Hawaiian Home Lands Department's views and how you've worked with your beneficiaries in the Kahikinui area. We would ask that if you have the time, if you would stay and participate so that we can hear what is Hawaiian Homes' positions or approaches to how you would like to look at animal management.

MS. CACHOLA: Yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: But we appreciate your presence because we have DLNR here, and maybe it's good that each department hears what each other needs to support one another.

MS. CACHOLA: Yeah, we need to work together in this 'cause this deer stuff is really getting bad and...yeah. Thank you. I will stay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you, Ms. Cachola. She'll be back as a resource. Okay, we have one more lady that would like to manao. So, please, share your...hold on one second. We'll get the microphone to you.

MS. KAPAKU: Oh, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, yeah, hold on. So, share your name with us, please.

MS. KAPAKU: Thank you, Chair Riki Hokama and Council. Hi, Yuki, Tasha, and everyone. I had to come up and speak. I was up there, and I was here to support my co-worker, Julie. I'm on sick leave, as you can see. But I'd like to testify on behalf of DHHL. And the reason for that, listening to Faith, I don't think she has any clue what she talks about when she talks about Kahikinui. She's not a hunter. She's not a beneficiary. In fact, she has been a thorn. Our Hawaiian community is right here, and some of 'em are not speakers. But they're here. They make the time to come out of Kahikinui to support this 'cause this is very important not only to Kahikinui. It's to all of our homestead communities. It's well-organized. I'm there at every single project, the ungulate project. And let me tell you, the carcasses is not a problem. It's gone in a week. Come out there. It's well-organized. I'm there on behalf of the Department for health and safety. I take extra tarps. I take extra coolers, and I take extra ice. And I take safety-first kits to make sure we are making sure everything is safe. I have Ed here. He's one of the guys who assists in health and safety. And Jake Muise, I'm going to tell you, he's not there for the money. When you go up to Kahikinui, you know the people, you build this relationship. You cannot help but build relationship with the ohana. And to help, we're partners as Leeward Haleakala. Hawaiian Homes is the biggest partner. There's no place in the Department of Hawaiian Homes where the moku go from ocean to mauka. In all the inventory, Kahikinui is the only moku that goes from mauka to makai, nowhere else in the State. This is a very special place and we're putting priority because in this Kahikinui...I'm sorry. Can I continue?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, yeah.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MS. KAPAKU: It's very important. Our families don't...cannot meet the market today, the housing market. And what we're going to do with Kahikinui...one thing about this program is that it's a kuleana program. It's off the grid. It costs them nothing. They don't need permits 'cause we don't have infrastructure. They build what they can afford. And this is the area we're going to focus on. And not only this area, every island because we don't have enough money for infrastructure. But this is how, the kuleana program is how we can get our people on the land immediately. We're working in Anahola. We're working in Waimea. We're working in Honomu. And we're working Kahikinui 'cause this is where we got thousands of acres. And the ungulate...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Kapaku?

MS. KAPAKU: Yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I hate to cut you off but --

MS. KAPAKU: Sorry.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --I need to be fair with every --

MS. KAPAKU: I don't take questions.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --body, yeah.

MS. KAPAKU: Yeah.

CHAIR HOKAMA: But I will ask that since you are the manager for Maui Nui.

MS. KAPAKU: Oh, sorry.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah.

MS. KAPAKU: I'm not the manager for...I oversee all the neighbor islands. The manager for Maui is Toni Eaton.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. But you still got Molokai and Lanai, right?

MS. KAPAKU: Yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Well, that's part of this County.

MS. KAPAKU: Yes.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MS. KAPAKU: Thank you.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

CHAIR HOKAMA: So, we'll ask you if you would like to stay and be participating --

MS. KAPAKU: I would --

CHAIR HOKAMA: --as a resource from --

MS. KAPAKU: --love to.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --the Hawaiian Homes perspective, we would welcome your manao.

MS. KAPAKU: I would love to.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Questions for clarification, Members? Yeah. We got things to...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes, Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Just name and title for the record?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MS. KAPAKU: Oh, I'm sorry. I got excited up there when I heard Faith speak. I'm sorry. My name is Mona Kapaku. And I'm the Operations Manager for the neighbor islands district offices, outside of Oahu.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Department of Hawaiian Home Lands.

MS. KAPAKU: Department of Hawaiian Home Lands, yes, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MS. KAPAKU: And I'll take questions.

CHAIR HOKAMA: You have any questions at this time for clarification, Members? Okay, so we have no questions now, Ms. Kapaku, but when we bring up the item, if you would be around, we'd be happy to have you participate with us and other resource people. Okay. And thank you for helping her, Kaleo. Mahalo. Okay, anyone else wishing to provide testimony? Hana Office, anyone wishing to provide testimony from the East Maui District Office, please?

MS. OLIVEIRA-MEDEIROS: Aloha, Chair. This is Mavis at the Hana Office. There's nobody here waiting to testify.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mahalo, dear. Lanai, Ms. Fernandez, anyone wishing to provide testimony this afternoon?

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MS. FERNANDEZ: Good afternoon, Chair. This is Denise at the Lanai Office, and there are no testifiers.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Members, again Molokai Office is not available today. So, with no further requests, any objections to closing testimony?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, we're going to dive right in 'cause that's what people, some people are here for.

. . .END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

CHAIR HOKAMA: So, Members, any objections we take up HFC-24 and 13(8) at the same time?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

ITEM HFC-24: FERAL ANIMAL MANAGEMENT ON MAUI (CC 19-248, 19-306, 20-140)

ITEM HFC-13(8): NON-FERAL ANIMAL MANAGEMENT (RULE 7(B))

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, 'cause I don't want us to hinder the potential discussion. So, we'll cover the feral, non-feral components. Let's see, we'll ask Mr. Duvall from DLNR to join us if he's present. I've also asked Steve MacKinnon. He is the current Chief Management Officer of the Maui Humane Society, if he would join us, too, to give us comments. So, any objections, Members, regarding these two gentlemen, and Ms. Kapaku as potential resource people for their respective areas?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Come join us, please, Mr. MacKinnon. And thanks again, Mr. Duvall. Okay, Members, so again, we broaden it. It's feral/non-feral components, chickens, pigs, deer, goat, sheep, or whatever is potentially of concern. I can tell you from our last week's meetings in D. C. at the National, your colleagues face similar things in their areas. It may not be a deer or a...but they have feral pig issues, or . . .*(inaudible)*. . . They've got wolves, coyotes, okay. They've got other things that they gotta deal with regarding feral/non-feral issues in the 48s and our sister counties up there. So, this is not a unique thing only for us here in Hawaii. I will say, though, your Chair is not looking at a one-size-fits-all approach. If Kahikinui has a program that works for them, that's fine with your Chair. If it needs to be adjusted for Molokai's needs, then that's fine with your Chair. I'll allow each island and major moku area to work on their own management plan that works for them. Okay, that's

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

what I'm looking at. Everything is on the table with your Chair, including legislation I got from sister counties that would propose banning of any feeding of feral/non-feral animals in public places. Public places, okay. I've been...so, I'm reviewing that proposed legislation right now. So, that's all on the table for how we're going...may want to approach this issue. I would say if the world hasn't wake up yet, we better take seriously the issue of new viruses and diseases, okay. So, it can come from anywhere, another person, another animal, a plant, something in the water, in the ocean. Things are changing really fast. And so, your Chair is looking at all options for us to consider. And currently, I have no recommendations, but telling you that everything is on the table. Okay, with that, we heard a few comments from Mr. Duvall already, but, Mr. MacKinnon, anything from your perspective you'd like to share regarding this broad subject area?

MR. MACKINNON: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR HOKAMA: If you can press the button and have the green...yeah, go ahead.

MR. MACKINNON: Not at this time, Mr. Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Members, I'll ask Ms. Sugimura, do you have any questions you'd like to pose to our resource people at this time?

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: I just want to ask you a question --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: --on your opening comments. So, I've received complaints from residents of...well, pigeons also, but chickens, cats, and it's on their private property. But yet, it came from a public place. So, when we have discussions, I guess. I don't know how you address that. But we even got testimony from one of the neighbors here of...

CHAIR HOKAMA: I have pet store birds, people complain...I mean residents complain about pet store birds that's everywhere now out there from the green parrots to the orange-billed finches and everything that is not indigenous of Hawaii. Yeah, everybody's complaining about those components. So, again, everything's on the table including proposed State legislation on what can be brought into the State and what cannot be brought into the State.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Kama, any questions at this time?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I just wanted to ask what is the Department of Land and Natural Resources plan for this to manage these ferals, or ungulates, as we call them?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Duvall, you have any comments you can share at this time?

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MR. DUVALL: Is it on?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, you're on.

MR. DUVALL: Okay, yeah, I am with a different program than the ones that would actually be managing it. The issue is very often that the deer in large numbers are on private lands. On State lands, if you were legally hunting according to hunting rules of the Department of Land and Natural Resources, you can shoot any number of deer, of any age, during legal hunting opportunities. The big question is that we can't authorize those sorts of activities on private land. On private land, if the landowner gives permission for hunting of animals, and the person that he's giving that right to has a license, then from one-half hour before sunup to one-half hour after sundown, again they can shoot whatever number of deer of any age or sex that they would like to. That's very often not taken up by the private landowners, and we do have...we do visit private lands and talk to them about the safety of what firearms might be safe to use in the environment and what sort of measures they can take to reduce animal numbers with human safety being the foremost concern.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, I'd like to hear what the Department's plan is, the Department of Hawaiian Home Lands.

CHAIR HOKAMA: DLNR's?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Department of Hawaiian Homelands.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Oh, Hawaiian Homelands. Oh okay, I don't know if Ms. Kapaku --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: They're still here.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --is available, or Ms. --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Cachola.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --Cachola. Why...yeah, instead of walking up and down, Ms. Cachola, why don't you have a seat and join us, please? I'm sorry I didn't offer you your seat earlier. My apologies. Yeah, I can tell you on Lanai, yeah, DLNR has a Game Management Agreement, GMA, with Pulama Lanai. Or before was with Dole, and then Murdock, and then now it's Ellison and Pulama Lanai, to run a Statewide public hunt on game mammals. And as I was told, if DLNR ever loses Lanai, Statewide game mammal hunting is pretty much gone because everything else then is just as Mr. Duvall said, private land and you just need the private owners. But Lanai runs a Statewide public hunting program with the Department. And every year they must make a census, aerial census, of how many animals there are to help set the take levels.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: That's a good one.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Duvall?

MR. DUVALL: One other thing. I know that the Department is currently looking at Chapter 124 which is the hunting rules for the State of Hawaii from Division of Forestry and Wildlife, and certainly that will be going to the public. But it might be appropriate for the County of Maui as such to sit with the State while they're formulating that sort of thing. They're looking at bag limits or elimination of bag limits in certain areas where it hasn't been _____ in the past. So, I think it would be appropriate to look.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you. Good one, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. And I can tell you in the '60s when Lanai chose to eradicate, eradicate feral goats, we worked with the...the landowner worked with DLNR and by community effort only, we eradicated feral goats on Lanai.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Wow.

CHAIR HOKAMA: But there was, you know, requirements. You harvest what you shoot, unless it is at an area where it is too hazardous for you to collect whether it's the gulch, or the ridgelines, and whatnot. But we eradicated goats. It can be done. And not wasting the resource, either, as Kahikinui practices it. I'm going down. Mr. Molina, your turn, sir.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chair. I'd like to delve, you know, with the time allotted, into that proposal you have about penalizing those who feed feral animals because just this weekend I was walking along in our County park, Keopuolani Park. I see a lot of cat feed right along the walking path, and the cats having a ball eating all of that food. But it's, you know, basically unsanitary and unsightly. So, if you, you know, with your proposal if it's being modeled after other counties, or if our sister counties have something on their books, I think that's worthy of consideration, Chairman.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Well, again, yeah, I'll be providing a template to start that discussion. And again, where it moves, it will be determined by the Committee. But I'll be providing you folks with options and alternative approaches on how we may want to look at improving management.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Chairman, is it possible to have temporary signage installed in our parks? I mean, although it's not, you know, it is more of a...as a courtesy to the public, just don't feed the animals for now until actual, you know, legislation and penalties come into effect?

CHAIR HOKAMA: I'll...what we'll do, Mr. Molina, is meet with Corporation Counsel,

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

Department of Corporation Counsel, to get some legal guidance and see what is doable in the interim or short-term basis versus a long-term policy decision. And we can also check with our State delegation on how they might want to view game management since a lot of it is under DLNR's jurisdiction.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, great. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Ms. King, then Miss...yeah, we'll...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I just...Ms. Pro Temp Kama didn't get to ask her question to DHHL --

CHAIR HOKAMA: I'm sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --after calling them up.

CHAIR HOKAMA: I'm sorry, that's right. We brought Ms. Kapaku and didn't let you answer. Thank you for that reminder. Ms. Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, the question was what is the Department of Hawaiian Home Lands' game management plan?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Press the button, please, Julie-Ann, yeah.

MS. CACHOLA: First of all, we needed that census. And, you know, that was very helpful for us because KIA Hawaii had the infrared technology to be able to take a shot of our, the whole area and could code by species, and then locations. So, we could see actually where they were located, you know, how mixed up they were. So, we had, you know, the cattle, goats, deer, and pigs. I mean that was very valuable for us to see what our magnitude, what are we dealing with, right. And that was the problem, is that whatever was going on before was not enough, right. The herd was multiplying faster than we could remove. So, that's why we needed to step that game up. So, once you saw the order of magnitude, how much we...how many...what we're dealing with, and at the same time that fence is marching down, right. We were finishing leg, by leg, by leg. We're getting to the point right now where we're ready to close this 4,500 enclosed acre...enclosure. And now we...push has come to shove, right. We need to figure out, okay, how are we going to do this where we're going to move these animals out, but they're going to come right back in, right. So really, we had to put our heads together. So, we decided to go with the big bulls first. We're going...eradication, they're so big that helicopters can't even take them out. Now, the way that Jake does it is, you know, he tested different methods, but he uses a cargo net, so it's very humane. I mean like they pick it up and bring it to a central area where the meat can be processed. But with the big bulls, I mean, the helicopters can't even do that. So, they have to do that part in the field. Take those out, and then we also looking at the reproductive females because that's bottom line how they're going to, you know, how the herd's going to get bigger. Then we can look at the other species. But really the one that does the most damage for us is the cattle 'cause they're big. I mean they're

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

trampling, and what's worse is that once the fence is up, they know what's inside the fence. They know the sweet forest inside the fence, and so you're going to try and drive them out. They're going to just, you know, push that fence down and go right back in. So, we're looking at how do you keep them out. So, do you do salt licks? Do you provide water so that they don't have the need to go back in? You know, I mean that all works temporarily. But basically, you're talking about, you know, having to really manage the herd, right. And I wanted to also say when you talk about eradication, it's like...we can talk eradication now because we have a fence, and it's going to be closed, right. But if you're talking about, like when we're first starting this with forest of 25,000 acres, I mean it's hard to talk eradication. The only one that can talk like that is DLNR 'cause they have the sharpshooter, and they will go down and mow them down. That is a waste. That's...our residents at Kahikinui said, please do not do that. They know that eventually you have to do that. But don't let all that life go to waste, right. They pled with us, please, you know, it's easy to say DLNR, go do your thing, right. But they pled with us not to. So, we're...eventually we'll have to, yeah, 'cause we want to be able to do eradication within the fence. That's our plan, right. We're also taking out the...we're weaning out the young ones 'cause they haven't...they don't have the bad habits yet. And so, they have...our community lessees have DCC&Rs that call for a community pasture. And so, they have...they've been weaning out, and so they make...and actually, too expensive to do fence. So, they're using the topography to be able to put these wean-outs in. Hopefully, they're tame enough that we can actually do the community pasture. So, they will be saving the babies basically, right. And we'll be starting their community pasture program which has been on the books for a long time. So, that's kind of, the long of it. Right now, we still have the issue about wildfire, the fires, right, because that's a lot of fuel there. And how can we, you know, it's a huge area so how can we use the animals to help do that management and help keep the grass down. We're not sure how that...because that means we got to do another row of fencing that's going to be expensive. So, we're trying to work that out. Kahikinui was our first wildfire community-wise of all our homesteads, was Kahikinui was our first one. So, they've actually...we have several other homesteads that have gone through it since then. Kahikinui has been on the forefront of this issue of resource management, game management. Thanks for your question.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, before we do more questions, I'll get...I'll have our resource provide you with more information to confuse you more. So, Mr. Duvall, Dr. Duvall will give you a short PowerPoint on free-ranging feral cats as part of his information he's providing us this morning...this afternoon. So, Dr. Duvall, if you would run through this . . .(inaudible). . .

MR. DUVALL (*PowerPoint Presentation*): Thank you, again, Chair. And thank you, Committee, for being here and willing to listen. I'm here to present on at-large cats on Maui and the issues that are related to them. I've also been provided with two slides from NOAA, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Agency because Nicole Davis is out, I think dealing with either a monk seal or whale issue right now, so she can't be here.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

But she did provide me with two slides which I'll also incorporate. These are things that I'm sure you all know. The species of flora and fauna in the Hawaiian Islands have evolved here. They're unique and can be found nowhere else on earth. And it's really important to remember we only have two native land mammals, 'ope'ape'a, the bat, and the monk seal, if you call the monk seal terrestrial, I'm not sure. More than 50 percent of all U.S. Federally-listed endangered birds are Hawaiian. Once Hawaii had 129 different species of forest birds, for example. Ninety-five have now disappeared. Of the remaining species that are here, 70 percent of them are listed as Federally-endangered species. And actually, we think that maybe five of them have any chance of actually doing well into the next, let's say, 50 years. This is a slide from NOAA, and it is...they're really focusing now at the national and at NOAA level on toxoplasmosis because it's shown up in the Hawaiian monk seal. It had 12 confirmed monk seal deaths, and 8 of them were females. So, for a species that has only 1,300 animals, losing any female is really crucial. The other thing is the infections are really difficult. You can't say that the monk seal lingers, it's sort of sick for a while, and you can deal with it early on. It seems that once they have it, they don't show the signs until it's really close to the point where they die. The other thing that has currently been the case is that spinner dolphins are showing up with toxoplasmosis infections and have died from them. So, the toll of toxoplasmosis has taken 12 monk seals. All of those, with the exception of one, have been in the main islands. There's a distinct reason for that. The main islands have cats. The northwest islands where the seals are do not have cats. So, there's not toxoplasmosis getting into the fish or other resources that the seals are using. And so, it's really becoming increasingly clear that the deaths and the affliction to the seals is a localized thing. Where there are cats, there are problems. Where there are no cats on the landscape, there aren't the problem showing up. What is a feral cat? Sort of have to get to that point. Feral cats, they're more numerous than stray cats. And by stray, that's sort of animals like that are out in the community colonies. Feral cats are unowned, free-ranging, separated from any domestication, and they've never been socialized. They're not the type of cat that you're going to have in a colony and be able to change their behavior. They're also in the wettest mountains. They are literally everywhere. It's not in our towns. It's not just in our coast. It's in the wettest mountains. This a very plump-looking cat high up in the rain forest. Obviously up there it's feeding on birds and taking native things. A project I used to work on, now it's Pulama Lanai, is the Hawaiian Petrel, an endangered species that we discovered about 2006 on the island of Lanai. And we've worked to protect it. It's the second largest colony anywhere. We look at the productivity of the birds and sadly, we've found these birds dying even in the highest, wettest mountains on Lanai. And I'd like you to look at that trail that the dead bird is on. That trail is a trail from past generations of petrels that have gone back and forth to that location for breeding, and there's the current bird that knows where it is being removed. So, the reason that we have problems with cats, they are excellent hunters. As excellent hunters, they're one of the greatest threats that we have to the native Hawaiian birds. At the national level, half-a-billion birds are thought to be removed by cat predation per year. And cats, as we know, kill even when they're well-fed as pets, or spayed and neutered and re-released. That does not stop them from their effect on wildlife. Here's a picture of a cat that is owned and fed. It's a family cat, but it has a satellite tag on it. It shows you how far does the typical cat that you own go in its

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

daily wanderings. Well, you can only wonder what it's doing. It's very often once they put cameras on these animals that they will go to several people, up to eight different houses where they all consider it their cat when indeed its real home location is totally miles away. We did a study, for example, at Kanaha Pond for ten years. And some of it was also funded by the Humane Society of America to look at the problems that were being reported from there that shows that in 12 of the cats we actually had endangered species, which is double the amount, even though there were more mongoose that we looked at, that was double the amount of what mongoose take. Very often mongoose is listed as the big threat. Turns out, actually feral cats are a much bigger threats, or cats at-large. So, what is the problem with feral cats and free-ranging cats? They're skilled hunters and they're obligate carnivores, meaning they are killing. That's part of their nature, if you will. They have really high reproductive rates. They have exponential growth. They're introduced predators so the native birds don't actually avoid them. They don't see them as a threat. It's nothing they evolved with. They spread diseases as we've heard, toxoplasmosis, feline AIDS and feline leukemia, cat scratch fever. They're public nuisances. We get calls all the time about loud, nocturnal mating calls, or the scent marking in people's houses, on their cars, and the feces left in the environment. And this is just like what was reported about seeing cats being fed at a park. This is how feral feeding goes. It's not a new thing. This is from 1903 where Richard Perkins, a biologist at that time, says he saw 22 native birds killed by cats. And I really like his last thing, owing to the fact the cats are extremely shy and mostly nocturnal, few people have not lived much in the woods have any idea of their numbers. So, on Maui alone feral free-ranging cats are now estimated to number approximately 300 to 400,000. That is a Humane Society of America number that we were willing to work with. That is 413 to 550 cats per square mile. That means for every resident, there are more than 2 feral free-ranging cats. And the numbers getting neutered and spayed, we just heard 7,400. Though if you go into 400,000 cats, that's less than 2 percent of the population. You can spay and neuter 2 percent of any population. It is not going to prevent reproduction. At Kanaha Pond we, this was part of the study that the Humane Society of America also was looking at, we had traps. These traps show inside of a sanctuary where we trap between 10 and 60 cats. And, of course, the big problem is it concentrates cats as a predator in the environment, and it also feeds other things. That's a mongoose going to the cat food. So, the feeding presents really healthy cats and really healthy predators. Getting to why we pay attention to this, this is the wedge-tailed shearwaters, or uau kani. They're long-lived, takes 40-plus years. We know from banding studies they come to land only to breed in the main Hawaiian Islands. They form long-term pair bonds. They only lay one egg per year, and it takes seven years for a bird that's hatched and left the island to mature before it ever comes back. It takes both parents to raise the one chick. The loss of one parent means the loss of the production of that year. And I had some photos that people may object to, so I have sort of a warning of when they're coming up. This shows an egg, and then a parent that was sitting on it that was killed by a cat, and what's left is the wing. So, that...what happens to the pair? Who knows, whether they re-pair with another individual is unknown. Cat colonies that are near the colonies of birds are devastating. This is wedge-tailed shearwater adult so at least 7, probably 11-plus years of age returning to set up nest and to have reproduction for the year. We had

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

two cats, and we know that from cameras, that killed 143 adult birds in one night. How do we know that they're actually cats doing it? Well, we look at the inside of cats. This is the stomach, and I'm sorry for how graphic this is. It shows that this cat that we saw with the chick actually had two babies in its stomach. You can see the legs, and the wings, and various parts. So, yes, it's the cats eating them. And this is a quick series. Here's an endangered uau sitting up in the crater outside of its nest which is just to the left. It went back into its burrow. The cat that was nearby saw it. The cat goes into the burrow, and here's the result, a dead uau chick. So, before it's too late, we don't want another species added to extinct species of Hawaiian birds. This is at Bishop Museum. You can go, and these are the ones that are no longer with us, never to hear their song or their calls. And we can't keep looking the other way like this guy is. See the cat in the left-hand picture. We have to address it face on. So, what are challenges of cats? There's a continuous need for cat trapping. Cats return to bird colonies if they're re-released. Cat colonies near wildlife areas are really big problems. Anonymous cat owners, there's no responsibility for the actions of the cats. There's contention over what to do with them. And there's no benefit to bird management or recovery if the cats are back out there whether they're neutered or not. Here are zones where there are seabird colonies on the island of Maui. Technically, any cat closer than two kilometers from those gray areas is a problem, if you remember that last picture of how they wander. So, at landscape level we need cat leash and containment laws. Consensus on cat and wildlife areas where there's a big problem that especially needed to be voided. There has to be a mandate in such conflict areas such as on Lanai island. That, yes, put them in places that they cannot get out of, either catios or cat sanctuaries. And to have a zero free-ranging cat...have no tolerance for free-ranging cats in wildlife areas. And we are the only ones that have a voice to take care of what is the true Mauians. And so, we have to do the right thing. We have to do it right. We have to do it right for the cats. We have to do it right for the real inhabitants of the land that were here for millions of years, and for the seabirds in particular since they are the ones that led the Polynesians and the Hawaiians to the islands. Now they need our help. And then finally this is the State motto, but it also...our State endangered species law mandates that I have to deal with this for future generations. That I am...my mandate is to take care of the resources until it's the nation of Hawaii, the things that are really Hawaiian is why we're doing this. So, thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Dr. Duvall. So, to make us even more confused and learned, we'll have Mr. MacKinnon give his presentation. And then we'll take a break. And Human Concerns, we haven't forgotten you. Your budget is important to this Committee. Mr. MacKinnon?

MR. MACKINNON (*PowerPoint Presentation*): Good afternoon, Chair, Members of the Committee. I'm Steve MacKinnon. I'm the Chief Executive Officer of the Maui Humane Society. And I've been asked to just give a kind of an overview of the non-federal side of animal management, which essentially what Maui Humane Society is doing for the County. So, hopefully I can go through this fairly quickly. I'm very respectful of your time. But obviously, I'll be available for additional questions. I'm not going to read our mission statement. But we just had a strategic planning session

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

about a week or so ago, and we're really excited about what we'll be able to do over the next three to five years. That we have been working directly with the County for quite some time, as I'm sure you know that we have a contract with the County to provide animal enforcement duties as well as you provide us some funding for spay and neuter of domestic animals. I won't read all the programs, but we have a significant number of programs that services all the animal needs throughout the County. As you can see, not only are we the only open admissions animal shelter, but we provide all these other additional services. The open admissions animal shelter means that anybody who has an animal that they have to surrender for some reason, we will accept that animal. Before we actually bring them into the shelter, we work very hard to work with that family or that person to try to find other alternatives. If they're having difficulty with the landlord, if they're having difficulty with funding, or with feeding, or medical issues, obviously we'll step up and try to work that out. Really our main mission is to keep those animals in their homes. One critical area that we work very closely with the County is our Humane Enforcement Program. We have 11 officers. They do all of our criminal investigations involving neglect or abuse. Our officers are on during the day, but we have a presence 24 hours a day where we can respond to any type of emergency where we're called out by Maui Police or other areas, be able to provide that. And the key thing that we do with our officers is, it's a philosophy of education first, that we don't automatically issue tickets or citations or look for prosecutions. An awful lot of it is education. People may just not know that they need to take their animal to a vet, be able to provide certain types of needs, and certain types of behavior training, things like that to be able to make it work. So, we really work very hard on the education first before we ever go to enforcement. This is just a couple of numbers there. Just for the past months to kind of give you a sense of how busy our officers are out in the field, over 1,800 calls for service just last month. And you can see some of the activities all the way up to six major criminal investigations that we're involved with. We have other areas where we have pet adoption. We have a large turnover where we take in a lot of animals throughout the year, but we work very hard using a number of areas as described here to get animals back into their own homes, or to new adoptions including things like Wings of Aloha where we actually fly out animals off the island to areas that really would like our pets. They love the idea of actually having a Maui cat or dog in their home. In addition to our enforcement, a critical area is education. We're in the schools. We work with the kids. We work with adults. We work with community groups, HOAs, condo associations, anywhere where we can get the information out to be able to do education, keep people involved. And we use all these areas here that describe what we try to do. In addition, we're a component of the County's Emergency Management Plan. We work very closely with the Red Cross. Anytime the Red Cross opens up a shelter for humans where they don't allow animals to be there, we set up our shelter right next door to them. It puts people at ease while they're dealing with the stresses of having to evacuate their own area that they know that their animals are going to be kept safe. And we're now even working on, as the last bullet says, is working on an animal rescue team to be able to respond out in the field, and probably even off-island to be able to provide emergency services to animals in need. We do dog licensing for the County, end-of-life services when people come to that difficult decision of having to let one of their animals go, clearly a member of their family, we provide additional services. We're the

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

representative for the County for people meeting all the requirements from the State and in the County as far as bringing an animal in for the first time to the County. We have one of our staff members working at the airport to make sure they meet all those requirements before they allow an animal in. We do a lot of spay and neuter assistance. Some of my colleagues made reference to that in their opening statements. We did almost 7,500 spay and neuters last year. In addition to that, we have what we call a MASH unit which we've done 17 of those since 2015. We're very aggressive over several days where we even have vets come in from off-island to work with us where we're doing well over 100 spay and neuters each day to be able to address those issues. I think my colleagues also mentioned they just wanted to...prior to 2015, we did 25 years of...the primary effort was to just euthanize feral cats. We...a very conservative estimate, we did 75,000 cats, meaning about 3,000 a year. It didn't work. And I think what we found was what other cities nationally were finding that these types of approaches just don't work. So, in 2015, we did a lot of research and we went along with what's considered best practice, again nationally, and truly internationally, as far as the only thing that works in this area is to do intensive spay/neutering. And we've been doing that for that past five years. We see the results. We've got a number of different foundations and other organizations that fund this because they realize it's an effective approach. And they realize with Maui Humane and the County of Maui is doing something that we're a model that other organizations look at to be able to make it as successful. Just a note again, one of my colleagues did mention that for toxo, the number one cause is food-related illnesses, is undercooked meat. It's not...I mean, yes, toxo is within cats. But Federal CDC is saying that it's undercooked meat is the primary issue there. And in talking with State Department of Health, in 2018 there were 21 toxoplasmosis cases reported Statewide. And then for County, since 2009, there's been 11 cases reported for Maui County, and none of them involving children. So, just last slide, I believe, just to give you an idea of what we've been doing with the County, working with the community on literally a daily basis where we've taken in over 5,600 animals. And that's not just dogs and cats, all sorts of critters. We very actively return animals back to their owners. We have a great Hope Fund, 100 percent-funded surgery and medical treatment for animals. We've got an amazing volunteer group that they contribute hours throughout the year equivalent to an additional eight full-time staff. And we have over 100 foster families that have fostered over 2,000 animals last year. And just the last thing is that one of the measures that most animal shelters throughout the United States use what's termed as a live release rate meaning how many animals that we take in are we able to allow to release back into the community, either returning to their owners, being able to get them adopted, being able to do something other than considering euthanization. And for cats, 86 percent. Nationally, if an organization can reach 80 percent, they really celebrate because they're able to hit that number. That's an incredible number that an organization shoots for to be able to try to get 80 percent of their animals that are healthy, they're treatable, and to get 'em back into homes. And 86 percent for cats, 96.8 percent for dogs. That means of 100 dogs that come in, almost 97 of them go back out into the community, either through Wings of Aloha, back to their own families, or adoption. Those numbers are incredible, something that our staff takes extreme pride in because we truly exceed any national standard as far as what we're able to do. So, we take a lot of pride in our spay and

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

neuter programs. We're very confident of what we're doing as far as the issues that we're talking about today. And we're open to be able to work with anybody to make that program much more successful. But the results that we're seeing truly on a day-to-day basis, we have examples, my staff is still here, they can give you very specific examples of communities on the island that work with us and saw significant reductions in the problem that they were dealing with. Thank you very much, Mr. Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Mr. MacKinnon. That was very good. So, we did...some Members were provided a chance to question. So, we'll go to those that didn't get a chance. So, Ms. King, you had a question?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah, I have a couple of questions. I'll try to make 'em quick. But I think this conversation is really good today, Chair, because it, for me, it kind of...two things rose to the top. And one of them is the feral cat issue, and the other one is the ungulates. I don't know if it was because we didn't list anything else but chickens, but I heard nothing about the chickens from the testifiers. So, anyway, these are...my two questions going to...the first one is on the ungulates. And I wanted to ask Mr. Duvall, are all hunters required to have hunting licenses? 'Cause I think there's a lot of people that are hunting on their own land, and I was told that they don't need to have a hunting license if they're on a farm or something.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. Duvall, if you can press the button.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: For the axis deer and pigs and...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, you're on now.

MR. DUVALL: If you are inviting somebody into your property, they have to have, or should have a license for hunting even though it's on private land, yes. And that has to do with the ownership of game species, game mammal species in the State.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, so...but if you're hunting on your own land that you're leasing, do you have to have a hunting license?

MR. DUVALL: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR HOKAMA: Wait, press the button please.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: You need to push, yeah, keep...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Doc, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Press it down so...

MR. DUVALL: To my knowledge, yes, you would require a hunting license.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, everybody needs to have one?

MR. DUVALL: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, I'm not sure that's happening but that's...I guess that's a State issue. So, my comment that I wanted to make on the axis deer and the...I hear a lot about the wild cattle too 'cause I know people that hunt those. Is it seems like there needs to be a coordinated effort. Like everybody wants the same end goal, but there needs to be a coordinated effort because there's like these two major groups that, you know, seems like people are either supporting one or the other. And I...it seems like there's plenty of room for both groups to be involved in that. Maybe we need to create a special committee or a TIG or something to figure out how to create that management plan because it seems like there's a lot of deer on the island. There's plenty of food for everybody. And I've actually been, because I'm part of the Maui Nui Food Alliance that's trying to create a sustainable food system. So, we've been discussing the fact that every time someone talks about the amount of food that's on the island, if we have a major disaster, we have enough for two weeks. But nobody's thinking about the 100,000-plus deer that are running around, and however many pigs and chickens and goats and all the other food that's running around the island. So, that inventory I think is really important to our sustainability as well as to looking at how much of it you want to eradicate. But, so, you know, I see like there's so much potential. It's just everyone needs to get together to build the plan. On the feral cat issue, there's two schools of thought. And that's where, you know, we're not the experts. So, we're hearing on the one hand that spay and neuter works and releasing it back out. But then, you know, the point is being made that even spayed or neutered cats will go out and attack, you know, our endangered species. So, that's a huge problem for all of us. So, I'm not sure how to...you know, I feel like we need, you know, some kind of a working group there, too, to bring the expertise in try to...I think, Mr. Duvall, on one of your slides you said we need a consensus of what it means to have, you know, of cats versus wildlife. What is...we need to come to some agreement instead of just choosing what data we want to use because we get conflicting data now. So, I don't even know how to approach that issue because the numbers just seem so daunting. And the issue of...I mean it's really impactful seeing those pictures of the dead birds and the insides of...I mean we looked at 'em for...when we did the Styrofoam ban as well. We saw all that kind of stuff inside the birds, and now we're seeing that kind of stuff inside the stomachs of cats. So, I'm not sure how to...how you want to approach this, Chair. But it feels like we need a bigger group of expertise instead of us trying to decide, you know, what...which way to go. It's...it almost feels like an either/or thing to me. That's what's scary about it. We pick the wrong one, and then we're screwed for another five years or however how long we stick to it. But, Mr. MacKinnon, do you actually have numbers like, you know, if we have something like 3 to 400,000 cats on the island, and you've been doing this since 2015, how much have we reduced that feral cat population?

MR. MACKINNON: I would respectfully disagree with that number. We think a conservative number is around...in the area of 40,000, possibly a little bit more. We have plenty of examples of individual colonies that get managed. We've taken calls and worked with

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

resorts that have tried to manage the problems themselves by complete eradication. Didn't work. They actually had uprisings from their guests of what the activity that they were involved in. They contacted us. We've worked out ways to reduce those numbers and properly manage them. Educational institutions, medical facilities, things like that, where they contact us, they reach out to us, we work with them, we do education. At HOAs where people are frustrated because, you know, we have a rule with the HOA says you can't have animals and there's animals here. You know, what do we do? So, we work with them to give them suggestions on how to do that.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: No, I understand that and I've heard the presentation. I'm just asking is there any hard data to show that it's working, to show the reductions?

MR. MACKINNON: I think the hard data comes from...we have individual data from within Maui County, but I think what we can provide, and I provide the Chair maybe a few weeks ago with research data. There's significant data nationally of individual cities that put these programs into place and tracked them. So, we find consistently that they may tweak the program little bit, but every single one of them has seen significant reductions. And then we also have done significant research on where other organizations or municipalities have done complete eradication. And they find it doesn't work. So, where...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, no, I would just like to see the data for Maui County because I don't know if these other cities have the same issues with endangered species, you know, and the rare birds that we have left that we're trying to protect. But, you know, it would be good to see what you have as far as hard data from 2015.

MR. MACKINNON: I think, unfortunately, we don't have a total census of how many cats were on the island as Dr. Duvall's slide said 1903 where there was comments about the problems were back in 1903. We don't have, and maybe Dr. Duvall knows, of an actual census of an estimate of what it was in 1903, 1950, 2000, things like that. We can give you...so, I don't have specific Countywide statistics of our having impact. One reason why we have a community cat coordinator now is to track that, that data now. But we just barely started doing that. Nobody had been doing it up 'til now. But we can talk about individual colonies that we've identified that have a certain number that we apply the trappings. We do the microchipping. We do the spay and neuters. And then we track over time. This is not something that's going to happen, obviously, overnight that we're able to confidently say we see these numbers go down.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, all right. Thank you, Chair. I'm...

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, you made clear to me the issue of where we get accurate numbers, or reliable numbers. So, we're going to continue this, I'll let the Members...but one component I apologize for not bringing in, because they are a player, is National Parks, and the endangered species law because it's impacting our colleagues on the Big Island and Pohakuloa. So, there's even the military involvement now with Big Island. So, I appreciate you helping us focus that we need good numbers to make better decisions, and it's an area of I would say a wide spectrum of what it could be and what

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

it potentially is. So, I appreciate that, Ms. King.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah, and I'm still confused. We're getting conflicting information on toxoplasmosis, you know. And I know it's something that we all...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, we...I planned and I had hope we would've gotten some official comment from CDC in Atlanta. But we have not received anything --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --yet. But I'm sure they're working on their top priority right now, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah, they have another _____ virus this year.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So, yeah. Yeah, we've got one priority national, global priority. Ms. Fernandez-Rawlins [sic], any question you'd like to pose at this time for --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --the resources?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, one question, one follow-up, please.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry?

CHAIR HOKAMA: At this point, one question, one follow-up.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. So, I just...my question is regarding like feral cats. So, we had a number of recommendations, and it seems like there aren't any conflicts with the recommendations. So, I wanted to check with Mr. MacKinnon if there was any opposition to the recommendations provided by DLNR Chair Case regarding keeping the cats, keeping people's pet cats enclosed, leashed, or in carriers, require sterilization unless the owner is a licensed and registered breeder, the cats be chipped and tagged, and that owners pick up and dispose of all feces?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. MacKinnon?

MR. MACKINNON: Each one of the suggested areas probably has a different response. I can say with high confidence that any type of licensing program will probably fail. I'm very familiar with other cities, counties, other government entities that have done that. And they see 2 percent, approximate, compliance with that. That's also true as far as mandating that they can only be indoor animals. I guess the question becomes if you employ that as an ordinance or whatever, and responsible cat owners keep their cats inside, we still have community cats outside. What's the solution? What do we do with those cats? I mean if we have responsible pet owners throughout the County,

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

you know, following that ban and keeping their animals inside, we still have 40,000 or more community cats that are out there that have never had an owner. What's the expectation?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chipped and tagged and pick and dispose of feces.

MR. MACKINNON: Again, I think it goes back to the responsible owner. I think responsible owners should be doing that anyways. But again, I don't think that's the issue, and I don't think that addresses...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right. So, that's what I'm...that's the point I'm making.

MR. MACKINNON: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is that it seems to me that these recommendations are all not an issue, and the issue really is whether to trap and neuter --

MR. MACKINNON: Whether they'll actually address --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --or to --

MR. MACKINNON: --there's a larger problem.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --euthanize.

MR. MACKINNON: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right. So, I just wanted to get it all the way down to that distilled point.

MR. MACKINNON: Yeah, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, that's it.

MR. MACKINNON: Personally, I think if you employ each one of those areas that you described, keeping the cats housed, microchipping, I think it's a great idea for any animals coming in. Could be...you could require spay/neutering with the exception of breeding. But that's not going to address the larger issue of how do we manage the larger problem. That's a very small percentage of the problem of what those proposals would be addressing.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. And so, are there any plans to get a consensus since you said that that was part of the problem in getting to where we're at now is there is no good numbers, there is no census?

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MR. MACKINNON: Right now, you're correct. We don't have an official census. We have a very active community cat program where we're tracking the numbers now. And we're confident, based on what we're seeing personally here on the island, as well as what we've seen nationally and internationally, that our approach is working. But it's not going to correct it completely for quite some time. We're looking a generational thing as far as being able to spay and neuter these animals so they don't reproduce.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, you are working on a census. And Dr. Duvall, are you also working on a census, because 40,000 to 300,000, is a huge discrepancy?

MR. DUVALL: Yeah, I think my comment would be that we really do need to look at numbers and population biology for cats. And the Humane Society of America did have a cat researcher, I believe he was from Maine, come and work here with the last person who was hired by Maui Humane Society to be a community cat person. Because Kanaha Pond Wildlife Sanctuary was such a hot point, and we had ten years of work there, I can tell you that we have numbers where had 903 cats trapped inside of the sanctuary in just about a ten-year period. The study was done by the Humane Society researcher using the two-and-a-half acres surrounding Kanaha Pond, so over where Midway Center is, the beach park and the area fronting Kanaha Pond Wildlife Sanctuary. So, on two-and-a-half acres, he determined that there was probably 2,000 cats, individual cats, that he could detect in that. If you multiplied that number of cats by the acreage of the island, you would actually come to a number pretty much similar to what they're saying with the Humane Society had said which was 300 to 400,000 cats. The only other way that we can it is after we have these big fires. You can go out, and you can actually look at the number of cat feces because they don't burn. But the fire removes all the vegetation. You get an idea of how dense cats are on the landscape, and it comes out to, I forget, I think I did it across the _____ whatever type thing. We were finding for the burn of 5,000 acres that per acre you were finding maybe ten cat droppings. Well, you could figure that's only one cat, or maybe it's multiple cats marking territories. There are ways to census cats if the Humane Society or anyone was really concerned about numbers. But the biggest thing about numbers is if they did do 30,000 cats of them being sterilized over the last whatever number of years it was, but 86 percent of them are being returned to the environment. That's 86 percent of that number that is not...that is still able to harm the natural resources that should be far more dear to our hearts than the feral cats which are other animals. And so, if you look at the number of 7,400, that works out to 1.85 percent of cats. That is not a number that is going to have a population effect on the wild animals out there.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for both of your responses. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for your questions. Mr. Molina, you have something you would like to ask at this time?

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, for either Mr. Duvall or Mr. MacKinnon. Thank you for providing this information on the cats. Just, you know, when you get these cats, for example, at the Humane Society, you have sufficient storage I guess, or cages. Any future plans to expand, if we, you know, put the pedal to the metal with this, getting these cats, and I guess is it euthanization will take place if there's no place for these cats. 'Cause these are not the types of pets that you'll ask a family to adopt, right. They're wild and they're not domesticated. Can I get your thoughts on that?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, press the button, please.

MR. MACKINNON: Euthanizing hasn't been an option with the program. Yes, right now currently, yeah, we have space. We do need more space, but we have the caging. We have specific locations as the cats brought in, they're placed in an area that is less stressful while they're waiting to be spayed or neutered. And then they're released back into the general neighborhood. So, we don't hold on to them. It would be very, very unusual for us to consider getting a cat to be adopted. The only time that would happen is if we get kittens that are still very young, and they can be domesticated. Or, clearly where we run in on regular occasion, people who dump cats, their own domestic cats. And it's clear to us that those cats could be easily adopted. Other than that, the community cats themselves will always be returned back into the field.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Wow, this is an interesting dilemma, yeah. So, I mean we were trying to...I guess by doing this approach, we're just kind of slowing it down and eventually the cat will expire, but not be able to produce. So, and an estimated 30 to 40,000 cats out there, yeah. So, okay, not to sound cruel or anything but, you know, euthanization...

CHAIR HOKAMA: There's a lot of things to think about, Mr. Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, yeah. And, of course, just the cost in itself to euthanize anyway, too. There's an added cost to that. So, any considerations to approach the Council in the future for more funding in this area?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Mr. MacKinnon?

MR. MACKINNON: Thank you. Right now, the Council does fund a spay and neuter program but it's specific to domesticated animals. It's specific to not spaying and neutering community cats. So, all the funding for that area is through foundations and grants. If we had an inclination from the Council that you wanted to have us increase the program in some way to be more aggressive and increase that, you know, by additional staff members, additional medical staff, things like that, we could definitely provide a proposal that could increase the speed of that. But, like I said, right now we're literally maxed out. I mean we have, and I would invite any of the Councilmembers, we'd be happy to give you a tour of our facility on, particularly on Mondays and Thursdays. We're doing almost all community cats as an operation. It would require additional funding for staff time, medical procedures, and all if the County wanted to contemplate that.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, thank you, Mr. MacKinnon. I did a tour back last summer.

MR. MACKINNON: Great.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: You got a wonderful facility, your employees and everyone else do an outstanding--

MR. MACKINNON: Thank you very much.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --job.

MR. MACKINNON: I agree.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: You know, Mr. Chair, this is declared like an emergency. Would the Humane Society be eligible for some type of Federal or State funding to augment this type of program to step it up, so to speak, on dealing with feral animals?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Anything is possible, yeah. We're government, anything is possible.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: That's right. You know, coronavirus, that's an emergency. And this stuff, you know, potential --

CHAIR HOKAMA: And again --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --hazard.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --we'll be part of the discussion is, again, as depending on what Council may deem as a new benchmark or adjusted mission. If the Council adopts a policy that says we're going to...the goal for Humane Society is to reduce feral cats by 50 percent by X amount of years, and funding will be based on that. You don't achieve it, we cut funding. You know, there's many ways to skin the cat.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, I knew you were going to say that. That's a good one.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: But, yeah, a figure of speech.

CHAIR HOKAMA: So...

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah. Ms. Paltin, you had your question?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I never get one yet.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, your turn.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was wondering if you could, Mr. MacKinnon, if you could please--thank you for your presentation--go to the toxoplasmosis slide. It looks Maui has 11 of the 21 cases. Is that out of the like the seven populated islands?

MR. MACKINNON: That's what the State Department has tracked for the County of Maui. We didn't ask for a breakdown of how many were actually on Maui versus Molokai.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, 2018 it was 21 cases. But in...since 2009.

MR. MACKINNON: And 21 cases, that was Statewide.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, kay, kay.

MR. MACKINNON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. Got that.

MR. MACKINNON: And since 2009, 11 cases. So, roughly one per year, and a fraction.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

MR. MACKINNON: For Maui County.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then like if we were to legislate not to feed your...feed community colony on public lands, and instead like feed 'em in your front yard or something, I...or you know, on private land, would that have a effect, or is that...I mean could we designate sensitive areas to not have the cat colonies be in?

MR. MACKINNON: I'll remind the Council, we had the Director of Parks and Rec the last meeting we had, I think it was early January, where she recognized an ordinance was enacted for the County property. And it was a two-part approach that first of all, don't feed the cats. And the only people that could feed the cats were people that would be managing that colony, and they couldn't establish new colonies. It was the existing colonies essentially as they were eventually reduced. There would be only designated people, it would be a permitting process. The only problem was, is the ordinance recognized the permitting process, but then the process itself was never adopted.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh.

MR. MACKINNON: So, we're kind of in a limbo. I think we could encourage people not to feed cats. I think that's where we've heard a lot from HOAs and condo associations that one person within the condo association is doing the feedings, and the rest of the condo doesn't want that. Again, we've got processes to work on that. So, but I think again where we have a number of volunteers throughout the island that have stepped

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

up and are managing those colonies as they get reduced. So, I wouldn't want to see them, you know, just blanket nobody can feed these cats at all. But I think there's ways to regulate that where its irresponsible approach could be addressed. And where they could work with us, we could address these colonies. Get them captured. Get them spayed and neutered, and then controlled.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. You have anything, Ms. Sugimura? Ms. Kama, anything else at this time?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I just want to ask, where did the term "community cats" come from?

CHAIR HOKAMA: I have no idea. Mr. MacKinnon, you have an idea?

MR. MACKINNON: I might want to bow Mr. Kortis who's associated with the Humane Society of the United States. I know it became more and more common over the past five years or so, but he may know what the genesis was.

MR. KORTIS: So, when I started working in this field five years ago...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Identify yourself, please, once more.

MR. KORTIS: Excuse me?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Identify yourself, please.

MR. KORTIS: Oh, I'm sorry. Bryan Kortis. I'm representing the Humane Society of the United States. So, the term that was commonly used was "feral cat." But as we started to get more and more into the communities and the neighborhoods and work with these cats, we realized that that was too narrow a term. That a lot of these cats are free-roaming, but they're not feral. A lot of the cats that were reproducing were perfectly tame. So, what we found is that it's not...you can't really classify cats accurately as feral or not feral. There's a whole spectrum. So, that's where the term "community cat" came in as a term that's sort of all-inclusive of unknown, free-roaming cats for the most part. I would like to take one moment, if I could, just to correct something that Mr. Duvall has repeated several times.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, we're not having a debate yeah. So...

MR. KORTIS: Well, it's just an inaccurate statistic that he claimed the Humane Society of the United States has put forth. And I won't get into a debate, but we have never estimated that there are 300 to 400,000 unknown cats on Maui, never.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you for that. Okay, Members, with no objections, we'll defer these two items.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS

ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.

CHAIR HOKAMA: And again, the next meeting your Chair plans to bring in potential CDC comments as well as National Parks. And then I'll be touching base with Big Island and Kauai counties. They're also working on this challenge for them. Okay, we'll defer those two items, we are going to take a recess, and I'll say return at 4:00 because he'll be back at 4:05. Recess. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 3:56 p.m.

RECONVENE: 4:08 p.m.

CHAIR HOKAMA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . We deferred our first two items, Members. And again, thank you, we continue to be amazed at how much more information we get regarding that subject.

ITEM HFC-47: OPERATIONAL AND BUDGETARY REVIEW OF THE DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND HUMAN CONCERNS (EXCLUDING HOUSING DIVISION) (CC 20-82)

CHAIR HOKAMA: We will now review for the upcoming fiscal year, DHHC's budget as it pertains to Human Concerns Division. Housing will be done by our Committee Chair, Ms. Kama, at another date. We had an earlier meeting with the Department, and we appreciate the Department's willingness to make some adjustments and provide us with maybe some more accurate quantitative information that can help guide us in ensuring we give Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez's committee the appropriate recommendations for this area. So, I'll ask the Director if she has some comments she can share with us at this time, please.

MS. TSUHAKE: Thank you and good afternoon, Mr. Chair and Members.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Good afternoon.

MS. TSUHAKE: Thank you for providing the Department with an additional opportunity to come before the Committee this afternoon. We thank you also for allowing Deputy Director Munsell to appear before you two weeks ago to give you a broad operational overview of our Human Concerns programs and the work being done by divisions, such as the Maui County Office on Aging; Senior Services, also known as Kaunoa; the Early Childhood Resource Center; the Volunteer Center; Immigrant Services Division; and the Grants Management Division. The seventh office, the Homeless Program's

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

Office, will be discussed in more detail tomorrow at the Affordable Housing Committee meeting. And for our purposes today, the Homeless Program has been excised from this presentation even though it technically belongs to the Human Concerns program.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MS. TSUHAKO: So, this afternoon my intention is to address and follow up on some of the questions posed by Committee Members two weeks ago with specific discussions about funding, spending, equipment, CIP projects, expansion requests that were made for Fiscal Year '20, and current vacancies in the Human Concerns programs. And I hope to move very quickly and efficiently through the information on my brief PowerPoint so that the division leaders who are present this afternoon and I can address your questions and spend more time on that. And again, we thank the Chair for allowing us to be here today. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Director. We look forward to your presentation.

MS. TSUHAKO: (*PowerPoint Presentation*): Okay, let's go. So, as Deputy Munsell told you two weeks ago, our Department of Housing and Human Concerns budget is broken down into four main programs. The first is the Administration which is the Director's Office. The second is the Housing Program which Affordable Housing Chair, Ms. Kama, will be dealing with tomorrow. The Human Concerns Program is the largest of our budgetary program, and it encompasses Early Childhood, Grants Management, Immigrant Services, Maui County Office on Aging, Kaunoa Senior Services Division, Volunteer Center. And as I said, the Homeless Programs Division has been excised for the purposes of being subsumed under Member Kama's Committee. The fourth budgetary program we have in our Department is the Animal Management Program. That is primarily operated through a grant to the Maui Humane Society. So, I also provided a copy of the PowerPoint because I realize some of the slides are really hard to read. You guys didn't get a copy?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Do we have that --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .(*inaudible*). . .

MS. TSUHAKO: Oh, okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --Lesley? Okay, thank you.

MS. TSUHAKO: So, this next slide tells you some of what we have in terms of the equivalent personnel, salaries, operations, and equipment for our Human Concerns.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .(*inaudible*). . .

MS. TSUHAKO: Sorry. You okay?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, you folks have it, Members?

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, yeah. Okay, Director?

MS. TSUHAKE: Okay. So, we also have a fair number of employees who are funded through grant revenue. Primarily through the Office on Aging, we receive a lot of grant revenue from the Federal government passed through to the State. That money is also used to directly fund operations that are contracted at Kaunoa. So, we have more than 32 equivalent personnel hired out of grant revenue-funded positions. And 11 FTE are paid via revolving funds for positions such as Leisure Instructor at Kaunoa and Enhancement Fitness Instructors at the Office on Aging. So, this really simple table just shows you the breakdown of General Fund and grant revenue-funded positions within the Human Concerns Program. As I said earlier, the primary beneficiaries of grant funding are the Maui County Office on Aging and our Senior Services, Immigrant Service, Early Childhood, Volunteer Center, and Grants Management are all County-funded positions. This one you have to put your reading glasses on unless you're really young. But this shows you our current list of vacancies as of earlier this week. So, we have vacancies in Grants Management Program for our Program Specialist. And then there's a block that I blocked out because it was Housing. But in the next block, you'll see the vacancies in our Maui County Office on Aging. And on the following page, you'll see the status and vacancies we have at our Senior Services Division. And if you have any particular questions about the vacancies or the timelines for the filling of those vacancies, our Division leaders, Deborah Stone-Walls and Ruth Griffith, as well as Curtis Jamison, Kaina Bonacorsi, and Wendy Stebbins, are in the gallery.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Did you want us to hold it at the end, or ask that now?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, you're going to...

MS. TSUHAKE: Yeah.

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, no, we'll let the Director complete her...

MS. TSUHAKE: I just have a few more to go, very short. So, you know, from previous appearances before the Committee and before the Council, you know that our Department manages much of the funding that's given to nonprofit organizations for social service purposes. And so, I wanted to include this next slide on the deck to give you some idea of some of the grant appropriations that remain unencumbered as of today. So, the \$50,000 was added via proviso for Homeless Programs on Molokai.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

And we haven't received any applications yet for that money, but we have been talking very actively with people on your island, Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez, about what could be done, what would be useful, and what would address a need that would make an impact for the community. So, we're still working on that. The second appropriation was for \$200,000 for a mobile hygiene unit for Central Maui. And we've met with numerous agencies as potentially the grantee for the fund and to purchase the mobile hygiene unit, but thus far we haven't found any agency that wants to take that project on. We thought that Maui Rescue Mission might be interested because they're already operating a mobile hygiene unit, but they studied it for a long time and determined that they didn't really have the capacity to take on that project. So, that funding is also unencumbered at this time. The third is \$250,000 additional proviso to...for homeless programs, and that also has not generated qualified applications. The fourth is \$75,000 for substance abuse education programs for student and adults. And again, that has not resulted in any qualified applications being submitted to the Department. Another unencumbered appropriation is for \$125,000, and that is unencumbered and comes from our Substance Abuse Programs line item. So, we have not received qualified applications for that. And I think originally at the...before the beginning of the Fiscal Year, we've had some ideas on different grantees and have since learned from the grantees [sic] that they're receiving funding from other sources which has decreased their dependence on the County funding. So, that funding has yet to be spent. I think both a good and bad situation because it means that agencies are getting funding from a wider variety of sources, but also that this money halfway through the fiscal year remains unencumbered. And the...oh, one more, I think. Yeah, and the last is in our Youth Alcohol Education Awareness Programs. We still have a little bit of money, 83,000 and change, to spend in that allocation. There was also same situation as with the previous one, the grantee has been able to secure funds from additional funding sources which is good, and so has not needed that same amount of support from the County. And I think during the Department's last appearance here, there might have been some questions about the...we get funding assigned to us for Capital Improvement Projects that are generated by nonprofits. And so, I wanted to provide you with kind of a snapshot of where those Capital Improvement Projects are. So, the first...one, two, three, four, five...the first five projects are all funded in Fiscal Year 2020, and they include a suicide study from Maui County which is being contracted right now. We're working...we've been working with the Department of Health and their suicide study group with Dr. Triolo as well as Dr. Pang and his staff to try and find a fiscal sponsor for them, and then to push that contracting through. Hale Makua got a \$200,000 grant to do master planning for Kahului facility and their surrounding area. So, that money is in the Department of Housing and Human Concerns, and we have executed that contract. But Parks and Recreation, whose land is primarily the land in question that might be used for Hale Makua expansion, is actually doing most of the monitoring of that grant to ensure that the deliverables are achieved. And then they give us word, and then we issue payments based on that partnership. So, that's worked out very well, and we thank the Parks Department for their assistance and cooperation with that. J. Walter Cameron Center also has a CIP project for 169,000. That one is being processed right now. Maui Youth and Family Services had \$200,000 in the budget for the construction of an administrative building. That's...the building is nearly

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

completed. And then the last appropriation on this page is for Boys and Girls Club of Maui, the Paukukalo Clubhouse, and that's been contracted, but the proviso added by the Council over the deliberations earlier made some specific requirements of Boys and Girls Club that they receive funding from the Department of Hawaiian Home Lands, OHA, or the State of Hawaii Grant-in-Aid. And so, planning and design is underway, and the agency has secured some funding from the State, and they're going to spend that money first. And the last project for Fiscal Year 2020 is a \$500,000 grant for new facility construction for Ka Lima O Maui. And that one is first planning is going to proceed as we expected it to. Fiscal Year '19, two projects, Maui County Council of Boy Scouts of America, Camp Maluhia renovations. That one has been contracted, and many of you may know that the Boy Scouts...the Maui County Council of Boy Scouts kind of had a merge with the larger Boy Scout association. I forget what it's called. Boy Scouts Aloha Council, yeah, and so that caused some delay in how well they were able to utilize the money that was appropriated in Fiscal Year 2019. But I think they're still waiting for some State funds to be released so that they can complete their project. Family Life Center received \$130,000 for facility renovations, and that's near completion. I think we're waiting on final invoices for payment. Fiscal Year 2018 and 2017, there were two grants for the Lanai Youth Center, planning and design for a new facility. That project was held up for a little while because of some site identification and then site control issues. I think between the County and some folks in the community, we may have...we met recently at the end of February. And it looks like the site has been secured, and we'll move on with spending the rest of the money in the planning grant. The County has...the Council appropriated money in the Fiscal Year '20 Budget to Parks and Recreation for a new skate park as well as the youth center. So, that gives you a quick wrap-up of our CIP and special projects for the Department. And that will end the PowerPoint.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Good job, Director. Thank you. I think you hit the points we brought up in the previous meeting. So, I appreciate that. We're going to start with CIP first, and get that out of the way because for me Budget Committee would be more concerned about adjustments to the CIP and to assist our Chair as she develops her parameters on the '21 Fiscal Year.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: May I ask, I just have two questions, and then I have to run to my flight.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Quick questions.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so one is regarding the CIP and special

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

projects. Thank you for a really well-done presentation, very thorough job. For the 25,000, you said that they're just looking for a fiscal sponsor, and under organization Lokahi Pacific is listed. Is that not the...

MS. TSUHAKE: Yeah, they decided on Lokahi Pacific.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. TSUHAKE: So, we helped the folks at Department of Health who were working on...in their suicide prevention --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And connect them.

MS. TSUHAKE: --group, connect them with Lokahi --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Great.

MS. TSUHAKE: --who's done --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good job.

MS. TSUHAKE: --project sponsorships like this for other projects.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Mahalo, Director. And then my second question is regarding your slide on vacant positions. There are two positions, on the second slide, Senior Services Program Assistant I, Congregate, and Senior Services Program Assistant III, Congregate. In the status it says, not filling due to inadequate funding in both positions. If you could provide an explanation for that?

MS. TSUHAKE: Yeah. So, those positions are both grant-funded positions. And so, when the Office on Aging receives Federal funds for those programs, and those Federal funds may be reduced, or cost for food, for example, goes up, there's not enough money to pay for positions from that grant revenue. And so, that is why we've not been able to fill some of those positions because the inadequacy is not of County funding, but of grant funding.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Got it. Mahalo for that explanation and for answering all my questions before even asking them. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. And so, Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez, so if you do have questions, we're happy to forward --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, great.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --for additional response for you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Perfect. Thank you so much.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Thanks, everyone.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, Director, quick one on the CIP, and then I'll let the Members . . . *(inaudible)* . . . their question on CIP. With the Boy Scouts, Maui County Council of Boy Scouts of America, and I again we know they did their...the thing with National. But National has filed bankruptcy, okay. And so, I need to know how would this project be looked at. Is this a potential asset under Boy Scouts of America? Because I don't need people to start putting claims against County of Maui assets.

MS. TSUHAKO: Thank you, Mr. Chair. That's a very excellent question. I'm going to defer to Mr. Jamison to see if he can answer your question.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for putting him on the hot seat.

MR. JAMISON: Curtis Jamison. I'm Grants Management Program Manager. Unfortunately, I can't answer that question right now. It's a relatively new development.

CHAIR HOKAMA: If you would please, you know, at least follow up so again, yeah, we don't want the County to be in a difficult position.

MR. JAMISON: Yeah, I spoke with the local resource that's managing it, and we're trying to set up a time for us to meet to go over that because I've also been working on the State funding. So, we have a scheduled meeting coming up.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, no, thank you.

MR. JAMISON: I'll inquire on that for you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, thank you very much for that. And for the Committee Members, the Lanai, the Department worked hard with Parks Department. I believe we have the site squared away. The youth center Executive Director and their Board of Directors, which is basically parents of 250 of our young people, worked hard many years to get this project to where it's at ready for construction. So, you may hear from some people that they didn't know about this project. I can tell you the youth center parents and the Director did outstanding, I think, community outreach. They was at the Pineapple Festival. They had their booth in the Dole Park at various events. Their parents are very active in securing this project to move forward. The interesting comment we got back was that those parents represent 250 kids didn't even know about that the school had a master plan. So, so much for the school communicating to the community what the school isn't doing for our youth. And I had my issues with the State. But this is a County project on County land, and we're going to move forward for our young people, okay. So, if you have questions, I'm happy to entertain them. But I will commend Human Concerns and Parks and Rec for going through the weeds and trying to get the due diligence done as well, best as possible. Okay,

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

Ms. King, any questions on CIP area at this time?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah, just a couple questions. One, did you...I just want to check, Ms. Tsuhako, did you check with Ka Hale A Ke Ola on that mobile hygiene unit? And were they just too busy with the first one?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Director?

MS. TSUHAKO: We did have discussions with Ka Hale A Ke Ola early. They had...at the time we talked to them, they hadn't even received the one that they ordered. And the one that they ordered, unfortunately --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah, I know about that.

MS. TSUHAKO: --I'm ashamed to say that, yeah, I'm ashamed to say that none of us thought about the handicapped accessibility of that unit. And so, we've had to ask them not to put it on the street, not to use it in our parks because of the risk of liability for the County. So, we worked that out, though.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MS. TSUHAKO: So, we have funded them so that they can purchase a separate unit that is handicap accessible. And that'll be brought to the same place that the original unit was...is located every day, and that will meet the necessary criteria for ADA access. And we've checked with DCAB about, you know, having fair and equitable facilities and things like that. So, at the time they weren't really able to say yes to that, and I think they're going to need to get this one unit on the road first --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MS. TSUHAKO: --before they can...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: And you have funding for that. Or, you need it for the future year? They've already funded that. I think it was 52,000 or something like that.

MS. TSUHAKO: Yes. We have already committed to doing that funding to help --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MS. TSUHAKO: --the service get provided.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, great. And then I did...I have a couple questions just about the positions that you marked in here that were temporary that are going to be expired. So, is that money that was only put in there for a temporary time? Or is that money that was put in there for new positions that you're deciding you don't need those positions anymore?

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MS. TSUHAKO: I'm not sure I understand your question, Member.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, on Page 3, there's one that says, temporary position to be abolished. And then there's a couple of them on Page 4 of your handout, position to be abolished, temporary position to be abolished. So, looks like you have three positions that are going to be abolished. And I just wondered if those were positions that you thought you were going to need, that you decided you didn't. Or, did you just ask for the money for a temporary period?

MS. TSUHAKO: Okay. So, thank you for your question, Member King. I'm going to defer to Deborah Stone-Walls from the Office on Aging as well as Ruth Griffith from Kaunoa to explain those temporary positions to you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, please.

MS. STONE-WALLS: Chair, thank you. My name is Deborah Stone-Walls. I'm the Executive on Aging. This position was...we created a temporary position in the effort to have a gap to fill the gap. We had someone resign, and we wanted to do cross training with the person who was resigning and the new person coming in. So, we had to create a temporary position to allow for training to occur. Once the position was vacated, then we no longer need the temporary.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. So, you have three positions that say they're going to be abolished. So, those are...those will just be retired, or are those going to sit there empty through the next cycle?

MS. STONE-WALLS: Yeah, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: That's my question.

MS. STONE-WALLS: Thank you. This position is from the Office on Aging and if Curtis, if you can go to the next slide, the other two are with Ruth at Kaunoa. And I'll transfer over to Ruth, if that's okay, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Ms. Griffith?

MS. GRIFFITH: Thank you for the question. My name is Ruth Griffith. I'm the Administrator for Kaunoa Senior Services. Actually, I can't see the slide.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I know.

MS. GRIFFITH: But...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .(inaudible). . .

MS. GRIFFITH: Nutrition, oh okay. So, one of them is an Assisted Transportation position which was in...on Lanai. And that position was actually replaced by a County

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

position, a full-time County position, which is a Senior Services Aid position. That position was a grant position, the Assisted Transportation. And now we have a County position that is full-time and can actually take on those job responsibilities as well as additional job responsibilities.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. And is that filled then? That's not a vacancy.

MS. GRIFFITH: That one is filled.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MS. GRIFFITH: The other one is the half of the Program Assistant on Lanai. That position does exist. It was just moving from one source of funding to another. And so, it'll look here as if it was abolished. But it's just a funding switch --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, okay.

MS. GRIFFITH: --from one account to another.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. That's all the questions I had. It's a nice report. Thank you so much for the follow-up.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, thank you. Ms. Paltin, CIP question?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I got a question on each. For the CIP one, was there any progress on the Lanai skate park?

MS. TSUHAKO: Oh, thank you, Member Paltin. Yes, there was. So, the Lanai skate park is going to be co-located very close to where the new site of the Lanai Youth Center is so that they're close to each other out of convenience and makes sense, right, to have the kids close by. So, the County, Kris Baptist from Parks and Rec is the primary Planner for that for the County and...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, it's not under Human Concerns?

MS. TSUHAKO: No, it's...the funding for the --

CHAIR HOKAMA: It's under Park.

MS. TSUHAKO: --creation is in Parks and Recreation.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, are we going to be seeing Parks before the Budget?

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes. But we consolidated two projects into one to get a better...well, we're hoping it's going to assist us with a better construction bid by consolidating. And so far, our young people are kind of excited with what is happening. So, that's how we approached, Ms. Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. And then I had one question about the vacancies, but on the other side of that, because we got Mr. de Crinis here and...or Mr. Jamison, sorry.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We're not borrowing money from him, yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Curtis Jamison, yeah. And we all liked your ranking of how you manage the grants. In my discussions when I meet with people, they weren't aware of their ranking. And I was wondering like if you give them feedback on the ranking, maybe they can get better rankings next time. So, they were...like I...I met with the Maui Adult Day Care folks and they didn't know. And I was like, you guys are one on the highest-ranked guys. And so, I just was wondering like the feedback process of the report card or what, if you will, like if that's part of the process. Is like letting them know their score and how to get a better score.

CHAIR HOKAMA: You have a response, Department?

MR. JAMISON: Yeah, sure. We...what we did was we actually planned it ahead of time. So, even before the ranking came out, we made them all aware of the elements that we would be evaluating them on. And then we informed them of the schedule that we would be providing to the Mayor and to the Council this review. So, they had all the opportunity to engage with that document. If you're an organization that scores very well on that evaluation, there's really not much more to improve on. And the ones that have deficiencies, by the time the evaluation comes out, they've already been made well-aware of their deficiencies. And the organization, and the Department, and the Division are already working to remedy those. So, by the time the evaluation comes out, 'cause it's at the end of the year, they should be well-aware of where they're struggling, and we've already given them, through the course of the year through technical assistance, how to improve. So, it doesn't come afterwards, here's your score, here's how you improve. It's the other way around. Here's your deficiency, we're trying to help you improve, and then at the end of the year this is where you sit. And then we start it again next year, and we just pick where the deficiency is. We start working with them at that level.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. And then for like the vacancies, I was wondering on the Aging and Disability Service Specialist II and the Aging and Disability Service Specialist IV, the status was April 1st for both of those to be, one was to be reallocated and one, the position description, it looks like to be updated. And I was wondering, so that's almost a year ago. Is there a problem with personnel? Or, like has it moved forward from that point?

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MS. TSUHAKO: Mr. Chair, I'd like to ask Ms. Stone-Walls to respond.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you.

MS. STONE-WALLS: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for the question, Councilmember. Just in the course of trying to be sure that our organization has the correct flow of personnel in appropriate places, we did a slight reorg last year. And we were looking at how we may need to change our organization to meet the influx of need. So, we've...and we've been working at filling other positions. I'm the only one that does those actions. So, it's just taken me some time to get the paperwork ready and turned in. And so, we still very much need those positions, but we were determining which functions we needed people in most.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think I get that from the status, but I just was wondering has there been any progress 'cause...from April 1st 'til now.

MS. STONE-WALLS: Right. I've had a couple of people functioning in TA positions to cover, especially the IV position. And I wanted to move to fill the V position first to have that supervisory position filled that we're still waiting for a list on. So, there's just been a movement internally of our personnel. So, we've had...we've been trying to make sure people are in the jobs that best suit them. And so, while we've been working that out, we've been using TAs, temporary-assigned people.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And so, just to be clear, you're waiting to fill this temp position that's to be abolished? Is that the one you're talking about, Aging and Disability Services Specialist V?

MS. STONE-WALLS: Thank you for the question. No, that one was an overlap position so that we could have cross training for the V position. We didn't want a vacancy with...and then have to go through the recruitment and have that position be vacant for many months. So, I guess Personnel...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's the only V --

MS. STONE-WALLS: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --level vacancy that I see.

MS. STONE-WALLS: Right, because that position now has a person in it. So, this one was the temporary one we used to be able to have two V's, without having to do a reorg. So, we had that cross training...our plan was to have the cross training happening. So, in order to do that, we had to create kind of like a...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: LTA.

MS. STONE-WALLS: Yes, yes.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, we need that at the beaches, too. 'Cause when...

MS. STONE-WALLS: So, I guess that's how you do it. But then it makes your vacancies look a little funny, but it certainly helps with the overall flow of your workload.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, then the original V person that when you knew that you needed a crossover, was it because they were retiring?

MS. STONE-WALLS: Yes, ma'am.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, we really need to do that at the beach, too.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for that. Ms. Sugimura?

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'm...good presentation, very detailed. So, appreciate this. I just wondered if...I want to first of all thank the Council and the...we did that reso to support the elder abuse bill, and it's alive. It's alive on the Senate side. So, thank you very much, everybody, including your enthusiasm from your Division. And I wondered, you know, these...the grant appropriations unencumbered, was that created because we put, the Council put money in the Budget and not necessarily you were asking for it? Or, I mean I'm not only looking at you, but just in general. The reason why I said that is when we had Public Works before us, we said, oh, is there anything that, you know, we can help you with? Kind of like a, you know, closing, and we were told that talk to us, you know, before we put things in the Budget. She didn't say it like that but, sort of, so that we...they know what we're thinking, you know. And I just wondered if sometimes we cause this to have appropriations or grants that are unencumbered --

MS. TSUHAKE: I think...

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: --because of that.

MS. TSUHAKE: Thank you for your question, the thoughtfulness of your question. I think sometimes from a legislative point of view, there's a feeling that, you know, if you give the Department the funds, then we can address the issues that you guys hear about directly from the constituents. And sometimes that's possible, and sometimes it's doable. But other times like, specifically for example, on Molokai, or specifically with the Central Maui mobile hygiene unit, we're not always...the Department is not always able to massage the capacity of nonprofits to take the funding, or to get agreement that this particular thing is the thing to do to address homelessness in a certain place. So, I'd say it varies. But I, you know, as a Director I would certainly welcome the discussion prior to the money being inserted. I would certainly participate if invited to. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. I don't have anything else.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Ms. Kama?

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: The only question I had was, you know, on the CIP, the Maui Youth and Family Services administrative building construction. Is that the same location, or is there another location that they're constructing?

MS. TSUHAKE: No, it's up at the Maunaolu --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Campus.

MS. TSUHAKE: --campus site, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. And then there was I think another one was doing something. I can't remember if it was another program I was just looking at was doing construction too. And I was...oh, Ka Lima, I think. So, they're expanding their facility, too. So, they're just expanding it, but they're staying at the same site?

MS. TSUHAKE: I'll have Mr. Jamison answer that 'cause I'm not familiar with that CIP.

MR. JAMISON: That's a good question. Currently, they operate out at the Cameron Center.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes.

MR. JAMISON: But they have a site just adjacent to the Cameron Center.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes.

MR. JAMISON: So, they're going to expand on that property, is they're going to build new facilities there, and they're going to try to move as much of their programs out of the Cameron Center.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay.

MR. JAMISON: So, it's just...it's going to be in that same location, just be adjacent.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: It's on...but it'll be on their property?

MR. JAMISON: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. That's what I needed to know. Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, couple things we're going to do, before we adjourn very shortly, is we heard from Mr. Jamison, but you have anything you wish to share regarding your area of responsibility regarding the Budget at this point in time?

MR. JAMISON: No, I don't have any...

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

CHAIR HOKAMA: Like, you know, you're going to, you know, I hope you guys took notice we are asking for this additional support in this program area. Or, you know, we implemented software so you notice we got rid of two positions. Or, is there anything you'd like to state at this time before we make our recommendations to Budget Committee?

MR. JAMISON: I can't think of any at the moment right now. I mean I know we're short-staffed. We lost a Specialist. That's one of the vacancies listed.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, and then...and, Director, I appreciate the patience of your staff. So, those other two ladies back there, they're going to have come forward and say what they do for the Division.

MS. TSUHAKE: Oh, please.

CHAIR HOKAMA: And how they're budget...yeah. So, before these other two ladies disappear, though, because they still have a responsibility, you are aware...we're making an assumption that you're aware that in the new Federal budget by the President, he has wiped out HOME funds, TANF funds, CDBG funds, and yes, our Hawaii delegation is going to work hard to restore. But at the end of the day, the President controls what is released. So, even if it's there, he may not release the money. His thing is military, okay, right now. And so, your program areas, do they have any comments they wish to share with us, as well as, because I'm sure you already talked to the Association of Nonprofit Directors. Is there anything you can tell this Committee this afternoon regarding coronavirus preparation, and how this County's agencies are going to either one, already informed and on notice to be prepared? Or, no, we haven't started anything. Or, yes, we have a game plan already in place by the Mayor, and that our residents can take comfort knowing that the County is already on the ball.

MS. TSUHAKE: Thank you very much for your question, Mr. Chair. The Department is working very closely with the Mayor. The Mayor convened a meeting this afternoon with nonprofit leaders to broadly discuss coronavirus and the challenges. We're really relying on CDC information and Department of Health information so that we give accurate information without spreading unnecessary panic, both, you know, within the community and especially in the nonprofits. I think most of the nonprofits who've been long-time grantees of the County understand that one small clause in our contract which says, availability of funds, right. So, I think in the event of a major disaster, the Mayor has every right to halt contracts and redirect funding. I think all nonprofits and their boards understand that. We're not there yet. We're not close. But that's an option that the Administration could exercise if was needed. We're encouraging, especially divisions such as Deborah's and Ruth's, to take especially really, really concentrated strategies of keeping people home when they're sick. So, not exposing our elders to sick employees, asking employees to stay home if they're sick, making sure that everybody on site practices the good hygiene of the handwashing and, you know, not touching your face, and your mouth, and your eyes, sanitizing all the surfaces in a really thorough way. And this includes the vehicles in

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

which the Meals on Wheels are delivered. It also includes the vehicles in which our Assisted Transportation clients are delivered. So, taking the time to do all those things to keep people safe. Kaina Bonacorsi, who's our Early Childhood Resource Coordinator, I'm sure has talked with her grantees about taking those precautions because, again, even though it's not a highly vulnerable population of young children, young children also live with adults who may be taking care of elderly. So, it's multi-generational. We have to keep that in mind as well. So, to answer your question, Mr. Chair, the Department is aware of the risk. We have been dutifully attending all of the Covid-19 briefings with the State as well as within the County. And we're doing our best to keep the people that we serve safe. But thank you very much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: No, we're happy to hear that as Members of this Council. And again, you need to let us know one area that if you need, which is supplies, we want our facilities, branches to be properly stocked. And obviously with soap, water, sanitize tissues, or whatever it be, you know, we want to make sure that your facilities have the appropriate precautionary means. Ms. Stone-Walls, any quick comments you'd like to share for your program area as the challenges you're getting with Federal funding or our global disease virus?

MS. STONE-WALLS: Thank you, Chair. We...one really great thing that's happening is we're working with the other triple As and...across the State and the State unit to order a month of meals for home-delivered meal recipients and other folks who are frail. In the event that any of our meal programs close we'll be prepared to have food security for our seniors. So --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Great.

MS. STONE-WALLS: --we're excited about that. And on a good note, a very positive note, the Senate last week, I believe, passed the Older Americans Act. We're waiting for House passage of the Older Americans Act. Reauthorization that will be for a five-year period, that over those five years includes a 35 percent increase, progressive increase. So, it's 7 percent the first year, and then 6 percent...it's weighted out year after year. So, that is very good news on the Federal funding level. Typically, the Older Americans Act enjoys bipartisan support. So, at this point we don't anticipate any difficulties with that.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, good, good.

MS. STONE-WALLS: So, thank you very much.

CHAIR HOKAMA: But we're legislators. We know the President had to take 8-point-something-billion dollars of cash from somebody for this coronavirus emergency funding to the states. Ms. Griffith, anything you'd like to share with the Committee in your...in a short time?

MS. GRIFFITH: Yes, thank you, Chair. I do want to reassure you that Kaunoha is doing everything that we can to keep the seniors safe. As Director Tsuhako said, we are

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

making sure that all the surfaces are clean and making sure that the seniors are educated about washing their hands. In addition to that, we have distributed flyers this week to all of the seniors in all of the homebound programs as well as all of our leisure congregate programs. Those flyers are available and posted at all of our senior sites. The staff has been instructing the seniors, trying to dispel myths, make sure that they understand what the truth is, and encouraging them to take proper sanitation procedures when they attend any of our programs. In addition to that, we have made contact, each of our programs, Assisted Transportation, Congregate, and Meals on Wheels for the frail, have made contact with our sister organizations in Hawaii County, in Big Island. We're trying to contact Kauai now, and also on Oahu, so that we can share ideas. So, we have made those calls this past week, and we have...are trying to put together a group e-mail so we can share ideas and stay on top of it together. That's kind of one of the major things that we've done this week. The staff is doing a great job in keeping themselves healthy, as far as I've seen. They don't come to work because...if they don't come to work if they're not ill, it's not because they're catching it from each other. That's something we actually monitor because we have to do flu and cold season every year. So, this is not a first for us. Those protocols already exist for us. So, we just add to those protocols and just tighten them up for Covid-19. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for that update. That's great news. Okay, Director, we'll move to our younger people division.

MS. TSUHAKO: So, joining me is Kaina Bonacorsi from our Early Childhood Resource Center.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Please give us your thoughts this afternoon.

MS. BONACORSI: Good afternoon...sorry. Good afternoon, Chair Hokama and Councilmembers. My name is Kaina Bonacorsi, and I'm the Early Childhood Resource Coordinator. And I guess if I were just to have a thought is I really appreciate the thinking that the Council puts in and the inquiry being made. And want to provide an assurance that... 'cause I know sometimes the question is, is this a State thing? Is this a State function? But just to put in the assurance that I have a keen awareness of our early childhood system. And at the State...or at those conversations, ensure that we're not supplanting our services that are here, and that we are actually looking for how we service the gap groups to keep our families working and caring for their young children. So, it's just an awareness that when we put things in or make requests, it's with that knowledge, or looking into those situations in mind. So, I guess that's...

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. One quick question --

MS. BONACORSI: Sure.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --yeah, 'cause I think we all have concerns, yeah. Do we have a high percentage of our young people in this County that does...whose families either doesn't support immunization or vaccines? Or vaccinations, I guess is the right word.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

MS. BONACORSI: I will go back and get the exact numbers for you. But I thought actually Maui County, that number was pretty low. And without me going and looking at the data, which I can go pull up pretty quickly, I thought we were at about a 2 percent.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, yeah, if you could, you know, help us --

MS. BONACORSI: Follow up on that.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --with some current --

MS. BONACORSI: Sure.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --data --

MS. BONACORSI: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --because I was surprised how many they told us, at least 50 percent in Hawaii wasn't immunized when South Pacific American Samoa had the deadly flu --

MS. BONACORSI: The out...

CHAIR HOKAMA: --last year. And their people were dying.

MS. BONACORSI: Okay. I will go get that data for you. I can probably have it to you by tomorrow.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Just in case I want to see if there's any correlation to potential caseloads in this County.

MS. BONACORSI: Okay.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, yeah.

MS. BONACORSI: Can do.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Anything else you want to share about --

MS. BONACORSI: No.

CHAIR HOKAMA: --regarding our keiki?

MS. BONACORSI: No.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay.

MS. BONACORSI: Thank you folks for the support, though.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you for being here.

MS. BONACORSI: It's really good.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. And Ms. Tsuhako?

MS. TSUHAKO: Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Not the last but...

MS. TSUHAKO: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Last, but not least.

CHAIR HOKAMA: That's right.

MS. TSUHAKO: I want to introduce Wendy Stebbins who's our Volunteer Center Coordinator. Wendy?

MS. STEBBINS: Good afternoon...oh.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Press the button ____.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yeah, you need the green light. There you go, ____.

MS. STEBBINS: Good afternoon, Council Chair and Councilmembers. Yes, I'm Wendy Stebbins, and I'm the Volunteer Center Coordinator. I've been in the position about 12½ years, and right now I'm just thinking like we appreciate your continued support of the Volunteer Center. Volunteers are the life, you know, the lifeline of most of the nonprofits. And we do recruitment for the nonprofits. We do training for the volunteer leaders of the nonprofits and help with recognizing community volunteers. Lot of the nonprofits do not have the staff or the funds for a volunteer leader position so they're usually juggling many hats so we try to help with any gaps in the services that we can.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Well, we appreciate your patience just waiting here with the rest of your Division. So, thank you. Ms. King, any questions you'd like to ask at this time?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: You know, I don't have any questions but because you brought up the coronavirus and everyone's been talking about how --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --they're addressing it. I want to put this out here for this Committee --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Sure.

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --since we're Healthy Communities that are we addressing what we need to do in the Chambers. You know, making sure that what...that the common areas are getting wiped down, the handrails, the doors, and everything when people come in here. I had a phone call this morning from a constituent who was upset because on the County website, we're recommending that people not gather in big groups and not meet. And they're saying but then you're still having Council meetings, and you got people in the Chambers. So, somehow, we have to reconcile what we're doing with the messaging that we're putting out there. And I just want to kind of throw that thought out there. But if we could --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Great comment.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --talk to the Clerk's Office too, and make sure we're getting the areas wiped down --

CHAIR HOKAMA: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --more often.

CHAIR HOKAMA: We're going to need Public Works cooperation, the Clerk's Office as well as Chair's Office. But, no, it's a great comment. And I think we all need to do our part to make it as safe as possible. So, again, we read what Hale Makua is doing. You know, Wes is having his visitors prescreened right before entering the facility. So, I think we can do our part in making sure our facilities has sufficient soap and water and towels, sanitation, lotions. And again, your Chair is not...is concerned but not to the point where the people's business cannot continue under appropriate parameters, yeah. The people still depend on us to provide service as best as we can in trying times. So, we shall be there for our community as best we can. Director, any closing comments before we adjourn?

MS. TSUHAKO: Just another thank you, Mr. Hokama, for inviting us back and enjoyed the conversation today. Thank you.

CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay, if we have any questions, Members, forward it for Department to respond timely. Okay, no objections, we'll defer this item.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS. (Excused: MM, TP, KRF)

ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.

CHAIR HOKAMA: This meeting is adjourned. . . .(gavel). . .

ADJOURN: 5:00 p.m.

APPROVED:

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020



RIKI HOKAMA, Chair
Healthy Families and Communities
Committee

hfc:min:200310:rlk

Transcribed by: Reinetta L. Kutz

HEALTHY FAMILIES AND COMMUNITIES COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

March 10, 2020

CERTIFICATE

I, Reinette L. Kutz, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED this 2nd day of April 2020, in Makawao, Hawaii.


Reinette L. Kutz