

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE
Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

April 20, 2020

Online Only via BlueJeans Link

CONVENE: 9:09 a.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Chair
Councilmember Kelly Takaya King, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Riki Hokama, Member
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Member
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member
Councilmember Michael J. Molina, Member
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Member
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Member

STAFF: Shelly Espeleta, Legislative Analyst
Lesley Milner, Legislative Analyst
Kasie Apo Takayama, Legislative Analyst
Ana Lillis, Legislative Analyst
Yvette Bouthillier, Committee Secretary

ADMIN.: Michele Y. Yoshimura, Budget Director, Office of the Mayor
Scott K. Teruya, Director, Department of Finance
Kathy Kaohu, County Clerk, Office of the County Clerk
James Krueger, Deputy County Clerk, Office of the County Clerk
Traci Fujita, Director, Office of Council Services
Lance Taguchi, County Auditor
Mimi DesJardins, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

OTHERS: Autumn Ness
Lipoa Kahaleuahi, Executive Director, Ma Ka Hana Ka `Ike
Tova Callender, Coordinator, West Maui Ridge to Reef Initiative
Meredith Breeson, Maui Nui Marine Resource Council
Sandi Iokami, Maui Blooms
Alena Ornellas
Kalaimoku Ornellas
Kanaloa Nakoa
Rod Antone, Executive Director, Hotel Lodging Association
Duke Au Hoon (Hakuole)
Robert "Bob" Richmond
Leslie Wilkins, President and CEO, Maui Economic Development Board, Inc.
Leonard Nakoa

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

Faith Chase, Maui Faith
Niles James
Hökūao Pellegrino, President, Hui o Nā Wai `Ehā

Robert Hockett, Edward Cornell Professor of Law, Cornell University
Sean Tierney, County Bond Counsel
Christine Choi, PFM Financial Advisors LLC
John (Jack) Kulp, Treasurer, Department of Finance

PRESS: *Akakū: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the Economic Development and Budget Committee please come to order. Aloha kakahiaka kākou and happy April 20th. We'll start with introductions and a reminder for everyone to please silence their cell phone. I'm Keani Rawlins-Fernandez, the Chair of the Economic Development and Budget Committee. And we have with us this morning Committee Vice-Chair Kelly King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Aloha kakahiaka, Chair, and happy 420 to everybody out there. I know it's traditional to plant other things today, but I'm urging everyone to plant a tree instead maybe.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, everyone should plant at least one tree. Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Oh, make sure, Dave said he'd get...he's not sure about...

MR. HELLE: Your mic is on.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, okay. And Member Shane Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aloha kakahiaka kākou, mai Maui hikina.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka. Member Mike Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Aloha kakahiaka, Madam Chair. Greetings and blessings to you, my colleagues, and the public from another splendidly beautiful day here in Makawao.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Always such beautiful words. Aloha kakahiaka, Member Molina. Okay, Chair Alice Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Member Molina, we should have a meeting up in beautiful Makawao one day. So, I have to greet you from the people of Vietnam. So, all the Vietnamese people on Maui and everywhere, chao buoi sang. Chao buoi sang, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chao buoi sang.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Hopefully I said that one. . .*(laughing)*. . . Okay, Member Riki Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I'm ready, Chair, for cut-cut day.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(laughing)*. . . All right, you look...hey, you look good.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Tamara Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha kakahiaka kākou from Napili.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka mai Moloka`i. Member Yuki Lei Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I'm not as good as Riki's, but good morning, everybody, from beautiful Kula. . .*(laughing)*. . . Birds are chirping here, and I wish one day you would come and have the meeting up here. We would love to have you. Good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We should plan one up Kula, Makawao, Moloka`i. And Pro Temp Tasha Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Aloha kakahiaka, Chair. I read your memo. Good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning. I see that you did. All right. Let's see, who we got. We got Member Sinenci. We got...I'm just going to mess up my hair. We got Member Sugimura, Pro Temp Kama, and Member Hokama who read my memo with the treat in there that if you wear your hat on Monday during roll call that you would get an extra two minutes at any time that you choose during this week. So, mahalo --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yay! Whoo!

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --for participating and remembering your cute hats. I love that you really made it your own. And, Member Hokama, awesome hat. And then we got Member Sugimura with her Dartmouth mom...oh, okay, here's the hat. Here's my Moloka`i hat.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Gorgeous, wonderful. We're in sync today.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: From Corporation Counsel, we have Deputy Corporation Counsel Mimi DesJardins. Good morning.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MS. DESJARDINS: Good morning, everybody.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning. From the Office of the Mayor, we have Budget Director Michelle Yoshimura. And Committee Staff, Committee Secretary Yvette Bouthillier, Legislative Analyst Shelley Espeleta, Lesley Milner, Kasie Apo Takayama, and Ana Lillis is joining us to fill in Chester Carson. Welcome, Ms. Lillis. Okay, we have one item on today's agenda, EDB-1, Proposed Fiscal Year 2021 Budget for the County of Maui. We'll begin with public testimony. Oral testimony via phone or teleconference will be accepted from Maui County residents. Testifiers wanting to provide video testimony should've joined the online meeting via the BlueJeans meeting link at bluejeans.com/597785199 as noted on today's agenda. Testifiers wanting to provide audio testimony should've participated via phone conference by dialing 1-408-317-9253 and entering meeting code 597 785 199, also noted on today's agenda. Written testimony is highly encouraged by sending your comments to edb.committee@mauicounty.us. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes, and if you're still testifying beyond that time, I will kindly ask you to complete your testimony. You'll also hear the buzzer kind of go off. When testifying, please state your first and last name. If you're testifying on behalf of an organization or a paid lobbyist, please inform the Committee. I will post a link to the testifier's login chat so testifiers will be able to see where they are on the list. However, please be mindful of the use of chat during the meeting. Chat should be limited to the Committee's review of FY '21 Budget and should not be used to provide testimony or chat with other testifiers. If providing testimony, please be courteous to others by muting your microphone while waiting for your turn to testify. Participants who wish to view the meeting only without providing testimony, please view a live cablecast on *Akakū*, Channel 53. You can also visit mauicounty.us/agendas to access live and archived meetings. For a click here link to the BlueJeans meeting and for up-to-date information on the Budget, please visit mauicounty.us/2021budget. I'll remind Committee Members, the Administration, and the public to please be patient with us as we continue to navigate this new platform. And we'll proceed with public testimony starting...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, point of information.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Yes, Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Sorry. Okay, first of all, I want to let you know I did read your memo. But I don't wear hats in the house. Anyway, I'm looking at the agenda for today, and it's got three items posted. It has EDB-1, EDB-6, and EDB-77. So, is that a mistake?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, it's not.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's...so it's posted for the four days. So, we'll be taking them up at...on a different day.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But if Member...if the public wants to testify on those other items, they're also welcome to. So, mahalo, for that thought.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, I just had some people that were confused so I just wanted to clarify that. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Anyone else before we proceed with public testimony? Okay, mahalo.

. . .BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, we'll start with our first testifier out of eight testifiers who signed up, Autumn Ness followed by Lipoa Kahaleuahi. Ms. Ness?

MS. NESS: Aloha, I just got the memo about the hat day. So, I threw one on.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, you get an extra two minutes. Just kidding. You got three minutes.

MS. NESS: Thanks, guys, so much. I'm here to beg you guys really, there's no better way to put it, to fund a line item for micro grants for agriculture in this Budget. I've spoken with Debbie Cabebe from MEO, and she has expressed her support and willingness to handle this grant. And it's...I'm looking at something like \$2.5 million micro grants to farmers to fund expenses such as farm infrastructure upgrades, purchase of packing materials, and other product processing needs, refrigerators, storage equipment, machinery, farm equipment like tractors, tillers, things like that. I have sent a proposal with the language to each of your e-mails and to the Committee e-mail, so you can see it in full there. I also would like to argue that preference should be given to farmers of either Native Hawaiian descent or kuleana farmers. And efforts should be made to distribute these grants as fairly as possible between the Maui County districts Moloka'i and Lāna'i. I can't tell you how much I really believe that a cash injection into agriculture will A, rapidly increase the amount the food we produce locally and create jobs. I've mentioned before there is Federal and State programs that a lot of our farmers either don't qualify for, or they're in the form of loans or tax breaks. And that doesn't really help our farmers, even before COVID, and now especially. Let's see, a quick assessment of a wide-range of farmers tells us that in many cases with a very, very small support of capital, they can rapidly increase the amount of food they produce and the amount of jobs they provide. I looked at the Maui County Farm Bureau's statistics, and it says that right now there's about 800 farms on Maui. If half of those applied for some kind of cash support for things like irrigation, or a better tiller, or refrigerator to store their eggs, or something like that, that's \$6,250 per farm. And that's a lot for a farmer, and on the scheme of things, for the County it's not that much to invest in the future of agriculture. The other thing I looked at is how many jobs are provided through agriculture both directly and indirectly. In the State of Hawai'i, let me look, there were

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

something like...oh, I just lost it. Sorry. I went to the Maui County Farm Bureau Grown on Maui page. There are tens of thousands of jobs in the State of Hawai'i that are directly or indirectly related to agriculture. And only like a quarter of those are actually on farm. So, if you do the math, for every on-farm job that we produce, the people to deliver and package, and sell that food, those are all jobs that we're creating. Is that my time? Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. NESS: That's all I have to say then.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Ms. Ness.

MS. NESS: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Members, questions to --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I have a question.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: *...(inaudible)...*

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --clarifying Ms. Ness' testimony?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I have a question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura? Oh, you have to unmute.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: What...the farmers that you just said that are throughout Maui County, right. So, for this grant, what would they need to...what are the qualifying factors for them to be able to apply for this loan, or you wanted grant to give them. So, how much produce, or what is the qualifying factors?

MS. NESS: Well, I was speaking with Debbie Cabebe from MEO about this. And a lot of programs require, like the State and Federal programs, require that you have a minimum amount of sales, like ag sales. But I don't know that that's a good idea because some of our most productive farmers have started very small because they don't want to go into debt. So, they're current operating...they're currently operating at a very small level. But with a really small amount of support, they could double what they're producing. So, I don't think there should be a minimum amount of ag production. I'd like to work with MEO a little bit on defining...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay, thank you, thank you. Thank you. Thank you, Autumn, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. And some of that detail is included in the written testimony you submitted, Ms. Ness?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

MS. NESS: Yes, yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Member Sinenci, you have a question clarifying Member...Ms. Ness' testimony? Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Good morning, Ms. Ness. So, are you. . .(*inaudible*). . .MEO, those funds would be coming from General Fund or we're increasing the MEO funding?

MS. NESS: Yeah, thanks for clarifying. I don't want this to be in competition with existing like farmers' apprenticeship programs, or anything in the existing MEO budget. I'm asking for an additional line item specifically for this.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Ms. Ness. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, just along the same lines of Member Sinenci's question, it's not ag promotion. It wouldn't...you wouldn't want us to put it under the ag promotion item in the Mayor's Budget and increase that? You want to add a whole separate line item that isn't even there?

MS. NESS: Yeah, and I apologize this late in the game for coming up with this. But it's become that apparent since COVID started that this is the time to do this. So, yeah, it's a whole different thing.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I guess I'm not sure how we can 'cause we already submitted our priorities.

MS. NESS: Yeah, I know. I get it. I'm sorry about the timing.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, Members, any other questions? Okay, seeing none, we'll...today we're not going over...we're likely not going over grants. But probably in the next maybe two days. So, if you'd like to serve as a resource, we can contact you when the item comes up.

MS. NESS: Yeah, I'm here, anytime.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Okay, mahalo for your testimony, Ms. Ness. Okay, the next to testify is Lipoa Kahaleuahi, followed by Tova Callender.

MS. KAHALEUAHI: Good morning. Aloha, everyone, from Hāna. This is Lipoa Kahaleuahi, Executive Director of Ma Ka Hana Ka `Ike, nonprofit out here. And I realize I'm probably testifying on a grant-specific item so I'll just keep it short knowing that this might be discussed at another meeting. But just wanted to mahalo you folks for this platform and transitioning to continuing to allow us to speak on, you know, the budget and issues within our communities and being flexible in these uncertain times. And so, just wanted

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

to share our support of expanded County funding to support a Ma Ka Hana Ka `Ike kūpuna program or bolstering our kūpuna program out here to increase support to building for...to address kūpuna needs. We have the financial tracking systems in place. We have many years of experience in serving our community in this way. Thus far to date we've built over 40 kūpuna hale, over 75 kūpuna safety improvements which include ramps, rails, doorway enlargements, kitchen retrofits, and bathroom retrofits, just to give you some visuals. And so, we hope with our Councilmember that we can continue to expand and improve these...improve upon these projects directly for our kūpuna. We know that when we serve our kūpuna directly, we are indirectly serving an average of seven other members of their household, whether that be mo`opuna, or children and their growing families. And so, we know that this has a longer impact than just right now. And, you know, in these uncertain times, they're, you know, across our State, across the world with unemployment, we've been blessed to be able to continue keeping our employees employed and so that they can continue supporting their families. And we would hope that this would also continue to allow us to employ the...our employees and our, specifically in our building program and potentially provide other employment opportunities for our community members. Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Kahaleuahi. Member Paltin has a question for you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Lipoa. I just was wanting to clarify what amount that you're requesting.

MS. KAHALEUAHI: Sure. I think the proposed...so we currently receive a...we're at \$95,000. We have a line item and are extremely thankful for that. And I believe the proposed amount is an additional \$250,000.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you. And then I don't know if you know the answer. I'm super supportive of Ma Ka Hana Ka `Ike, but you know, being that Hāna is a small area, I was wondering if Habitat, 'cause they also are looking for money for kūpuna housing, do they do any services in Hāna that you are aware of for kūpuna's as you do?

MS. KAHALEUAHI: Not in a similar way. I know that they are currently working towards a new subdivision for our families out here. But I'm not aware of their services to kūpuna in a way that I'm proposing.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, mahalo. Thank you, Lipoa.

MS. KAHALEUAHI: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. And seeing no other question, mahalo for your testimony today, Ms. Kahaleuahi.

MS. KAHALEUAHI: Mahalo no.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Okay, our next testifier is Tova Callender, followed by Sean Tierney.

MS. CALLENDER: Good morning, County Council Chair. Thank you very much for this opportunity. It's nice to see you all in your natural habitats there. My name is Tova Callender, and I coordinate the West Maui Ridge to Reef Initiative. And I am testifying to ask that you please reconsider restoring funding to the budget for Maui Nui Marine Resource Council. The council, the Maui Nui Resource Council, fulfills a unique niche in bringing the community together in a lot of different ways to address abundance of fish and clean coastal waters. And I know some of our other partners are going to speak to that. So, as the coordinator for the West Maui Ridge to Reef Initiative, I want to speak specifically to one of the programs which is Hui O Ka Wai Ola. So, Hui O Ka Wai Ola, as you may know, is a coalition between the West Maui Ridge to Reef Initiative, The Nature Conservancy, and Maui Nui Marine Resource Council. And over the last four-plus years, by working together and by bringing a large group of highly-trained volunteers, we now have continuous coastal water quality monitoring. And this is critical. Each of those organizations that form part of this coalition have a unique spot in that, and Maui Nui Marine Resource Council has acted as the fiscal agent. So, that's why you're seeing that some of the funding which comes from the County is able to support that. But all of the groups who are working across Maui to try to make a difference to pollution impacting the ocean and figuring out how to address it, benefit greatly by having the information. You are all managers. You cannot manage what you can't measure. So, having those measurements on a continuous basis translates to action. In addition to the steering committee and the volunteer program and the daily activities, we have a technical committee that meets once or twice a week to look at that data, to analyze it, to figure out what are the changes we're seeing, what are the concerns, what are the additional types of testing that we need. So, the idea is not just to collect data to collect data. It's to collect it to actually make a difference. And we really can't do that unless we have it. So, all of the programs that Maui Nui Resource Council rolls out, and there are more over time, are important. But Hui O Ka Wai Ola is specifically something that this community needs in order to continue to manage the issues so we can have clean, clear waters that support life over the long term. So, thank you. Thank you for your time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Callender. Seeing no questions for Ms. Callender, mahalo nui for joining us today. Okay, next to testify is Meredith Breeson, followed by Sandi Iokami, out of 12 testifiers. Ms. Breeson? Oh.

MS. BREESEON: Can you hear me?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. BREESEON: All right. Sorry about that. Aloha. Thank you for giving us the opportunity to testify today. I'm testifying on behalf of the Maui Nui Marine Resource Council. And I'd first like to thank you for including funding for the Marine Resource Council in your budget in 2020. And I ask that you continue the same amount of funding for the Maui Nui Marine Resource Council in your 2021 Budget, which is currently missing. It's

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

a...not a line item anymore. This funding helps the 501(c)(3) organization conduct research to improve water quality in south and West Maui by keeping the Hui O Ka Wai Ola community program, that Tova just talked about, in place which collects water quality data in 41 different locations. And it's used by all different sorts of organizations and departments as well as scientists. This funding also supports the installation and maintenance of the oyster project in Mā`alaea Harbor which is helping improve the water quality in and around the harbor for all sorts of recreational and food industries. Lastly, Maui Nui Marine Resource Council improves the Pohakea Watershed to reduce the risk of uncontrollable wildfires and thus the amount of sediment reaching the ocean. Funding from you in the past has helped support these necessary projects as well as spreading awareness about coral reef health and educating the public on all sorts of oceanic and terrestrial topics through our monthly speakers held at the Maui Ocean Center. Thank you so much.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for your testimony, Ms. Breeson. Okay, seeing no questions for you, we'll thank you very much for your testimony today. Aloha.

MS. BREESEON: Aloha.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Next to testify is Sandi Iokami, followed by Rod Antone. Ms. Iokami? Okay.

MS. IOKAMI: Aloha. Are you there?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. IOKAMI: Hi, aloha. Mahalo for letting me testify today and...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Would you like to turn on your video?

MS. IOKAMI: Sorry.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Your video is blue?

MS. IOKAMI: I don't have my video on.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. All right, please proceed.

MS. IOKAMI: Yeah, sure. I would like to just please first of all thank you for letting me testify today. And I would like to please encourage definitely more money, funds, grants, to go to agriculture on the island.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Iokami? Ms. Iokami? Okay, we'll come back to you. Sorry for the technical difficulty. Okay, our next testifier is Rod Antone, followed by Alena Ornellas. Ms. Ornellas?

MS. ORNELLAS: Oh, is it my turn? Hello?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MS. ORNELLAS: Oh, shucks. I thought it was Rod Antone's turn. E kala mai. Okay, aloha mai kākou. My name is Alena Ornellas. I'm from Kumuwiliwili, ʻĪao, Maui. And I wanted to testify in support of this...supporting local small farmers with this micro grant system. I think it's a really good thing to do to support farmers, especially in this time right now. We can't depend on our food supply coming from across the ocean. And I think the best way we can do that is to put funding in the hands of small farmers, you know, like ourselves who, with you know, a purchase of one tiller, we could, you know, quadruple our production of kalo within six months to eight months, you know. And so, yeah, I just wanted to testify in support of that. And I'm bringing my nephews along. Here they are. I would like them to...they want to testify too. And this is a good way for them to get into our system. And if they can testify next, unless there's questions for me.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Members, questions for Ms. Ornellas? Okay, seeing none, please proceed with Kalaimoku Ornellas.

MS. ORNELLAS: Yes, yes, yes. Here, Kalai.

MR. ORNELLAS: Aloha. My name is Kalai and yeah, we're in Iao. And I support local farmers by giving this grant to us. And I don't think we can actually, like...what's that called...

MS. ORNELLAS: Depend.

MR. ORNELLAS: Depend, yeah, depend on our food supply coming from the ocean and across the ocean because if there's like no people that would do it that would bring it from across the ocean, how we're going to eat? So, it would be a good opportunity for us to get this grant or somebody for the grant to...for our farming, for local farming.

MS. ORNELLAS: Mahalo, Kalaimoku.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Ornellas. Okay, seeing no questions...

MS. ORNELLAS: Yes, mahalo, you guys again for being here

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And we have Kanaloa?

MS. ORNELLAS: My other nephew, Kanaloa, got a little bit nervous, but he also wanted to show some support for us local farmers, and I wanted to bring them on this stage and be able to show them that this is how we access our Councilmembers. And this is how we get our voices heard. And, you know, this is us. We are the small local farmers. So, we hope that you guys can support us. Mahalo.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, quick question.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Quick question, Ms. Ornellas.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you. Just want to find out...thank you for being here. And what is the cost of the tiller that you're talking about?

MS. ORNELLAS: So, like a normal tiller attachment sometimes goes from like \$4,000, maybe a little bit higher depending on the grade that you want to get. The one that we're looking at is around that amount of money. But it depends on your...what your...

VICE-CHAIR KING: I'm just asking about...no, I'm just asking about the one that you're looking at. Thank you.

MS. ORNELLAS: Some farmers will have cheaper things, or you know, more expensive items that they need to farm.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Seeing no other questions, please give our mahalo to Kalaimoku and Kanaloa for learning to engage civically --

MS. ORNELLAS: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --with their government. This is their place. So, please make your voices heard. Mahalo, and mahalo for your testimony. Okay, our next testifier is Rod Antone.

MR. ANTONE: Hi, good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MR. ANTONE: So, I get two minutes, right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Three minutes. I mean unless you want two minutes.

MR. ANTONE: Oh, no, two minutes, plus the three. Never mind. I thought we --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, you got your hat. . .*(laughing)*. . .

MR. ANTONE: --get two minutes with the hat. So, I also wear this 'cause you're the Budget Chair. I love Moloka'i. Rod Antone here, and...really...Maui Hotel Lodging Association, Executive Director. Yes, I am a paid lobbyist registered with the County and the State. Last time we talked about the jobs...oh, testifying for MVB funds to keep

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

the money intact with MVB. Last time I testified, I noted that we needed to get our people back to work faster. Thirty...about 30,000 filed for unemployment last couple of weeks. We expect more. Today, I want to talk about a second reason why we should keep MVB money intact and that is because we have a real opportunity right now to change the tourists that comes here to give them rules and guidelines. Right now, all they know is Maui is no ka oi, we're the best. We need tourists who are no ka oi. We need tourists who respect and follow what the locals want them to do. And before all this happened, before COVID-19 happened, I was working with the Mayor's task force on tourism. And, you know, we were coming up with rules and guidelines. This is with Terryl and Kai Nishiki and God, the guy from Maui Tomorrow, Al Perez. You know, a bunch of others, shareholders. And we came up with the tourist guidelines, and we talked about how we're going to get it in front of them. Should we put it in the hotel rooms? Should it be sent out as part of an online attachment after they have their reservation confirmed? Maybe in the videos at the airport. You know, with guidelines like obey the traffic laws, don't stop in the middle of Hāna Highway just to take a picture of a waterfall, respect local fishermen and divers who are trying to feed their families. Beach parks are well-used. Take your trash with you. Get rid of it at the hotel. Realize what kapu means. It means keep out, or no trespassing. You are hiking, you see something like that, hike around. Also, rules that are going to keep 'em safe. Don't turn your back on the ocean. Make sure you have a fully-charged cell phone plus, you know, water when you go hiking. Check the weather. Swim with a buddy. Know which beaches have lifeguards. Don't try to drive the back road to Hāna and maybe turn around at Kahakuloa as well. There's so much more, but you get the idea. The best time to change our messaging is when we are building the industry back up. And we need MVB to be able to do that to better manage tourists. And that's my testimony today. And any questions out there?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You didn't even need that extra two minutes.

MR. ANTONE: I know. For nothing...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So concise.

MR. ANTONE: But anyway. Yes, trying to be.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

MR. ANTONE: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Members, any questions? Seeing none, mahalo, Mr. Antone, for your testimony today.

MR. ANTONE: Mahalo, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sorry, one question.

MR. ANTONE: Oh.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

MR. ANTONE: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aloha, Rod. Thanks for being on and thank you for your testimony. You're exactly right. We're trying to put funding into managing our tourism just so that we have sustainable tourism. We're seeing, Rod, a lot of people asking for agricultural funding to...as another industry for Maui County. And so, we've been made aware that a lot of the hotels are part of this Avendra procurement amenity where they're not...a lot of 'em, even though buy local, we're not seeing the scale in which hotels need to be purchasing local, you know, considering that we ship, you know, around 90 percent of our import. So, is there something like that that the hotels are part of, an Avendra procurement amenity that they're buying outside of the County?

MR. ANTONE: You know, I can look into that. But from what I understood, the farmers...because the farmers weren't able to sell to the hotels and the hotels' restaurants, the biggest customers, they've actually...there's a lot of produce going to waste until the County stepped in and started buying it for the food give-away that they've been doing. But I mean, I personally know that the hotels love local. I mean a lot of 'em love buying local. But I can check into this Avendra Procurement amenity. I can ask them, and I can get back to you guys on that.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thanks, Rod, mahalo. Thank you, Chair.

MR. ANTONE: No problem. Thank you. Aloha.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha, Mr. Antone, mahalo.

MR. ANTONE: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, our next testifier is number...last four digits, 7496. Oh, Member Paltin? Sorry, you have a question? Mr. Antone, are you still there?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh. I just was going to ask him, last time Member King requested some information. And I was looking through the testimony, and I didn't see if he sent it yet. So, I just was wondering if he sent it, and we didn't get it. Or, if he still hasn't sent it yet.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Paltin. E kala mai for not seeing you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . I just was wondering 'cause he came back. He testified before, we asked a question, and I didn't see the answer. And he came back, and he didn't answer the question, so I just was wondering if I missed it somewhere.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Just want to let Member Paltin know...thank you for following up on that. No, I did not get an answer. So, it didn't come directly to me if there was one. But thank you for remembering.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, well, hopefully Mr. Antone is still monitoring the meeting and will get back to the Members' question. Okay. Okay, our next testifier is the last four digits 7496. Seven-four-nine-six?

MR. KULP: Budget Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MR. KULP: This is Jack Kulp. I'm here to testify in the next portion of the proceedings.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo.

MR. KULP: And I'm not even to testify. I'm to be available as a resource.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, the next two testifiers are Duke Au Hoon, followed by Robert "Bob" Richmond. And we'll have two testifiers after them, and that's all that signed up. Okay, Mr. Au Hoon?

MR. AU HOON: Aloha pehea `oe. Aloha kakahiaka --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MR. AU HOON: --`oukou. Keani Rawlins, aloha Chairs, aloha Council people. You know, honestly, this is my first time ever testifying for anything, ever testifying for anything. And last year was my very first time voting ever. This year will be my second time voting. And I voted for every single one of you. So, very happy with how everything is going. I am testifying on behalf for micro farming grants 'cause, you know, I'm a small business owner, owner of U'i Gallery. And as my business is considered a nonessential business, I've been out of work for the past two months, probably going on three months. But as you can see, turned my grass into my own little mala here. Got about five different kalo's, about 49 kalo in my yard, lots of different types of food. So, you know, honestly this pandemic really showed the outcome of our State. And, you know, how this pandemic really showed that our community wasn't ready for any type of crisis at this scale. And of course, none of us were. We're still at it. We're still trying to figure it out, of course. And, you know, of course with along with the other jobs that you guys have daily. Of course, I always put my opinions out there, but you know, I love the fact that you guys are able to hold these, that many people can actually testify now. But, yes, micro farming, you know, for the grants for them because the people who really actually came to help me out...you know, I did...I actually did. I signed up for a lot of the loans that...to help small businesses but was not able to get any of them. So, in order for me to get any type of food, a lot of the small farmers has been actually blessing my family

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

with food. Thank you guys for the County food drive that you guys did the other week. That was a tough one 'cause, you know, as you and I know that there was a couple hundred to almost I would say 1,000 people in that line. What hurt was when that State...when that worker came around and said there was no food to be passed out. Behind me there was a couple hundred more cars. That line came from War Memorial Stadium all the way around to...what is that...actually Lower Main. It went all the way up to St. Anthony School, that line. And I was in that line for about an hour and only moved a few inches. So, I'm in support of all farming. I'm in support of any type of situation that will help our community strive by our self. Honestly, and it's showing, you know, it's showing very tough right now 'cause right now we're not too sure if it'll be open next month, right. Not at all, we're not too sure. And that's three months of no income. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . . Three months of no government help for us small businesses who are now considered nonessential. My business is essential to my family. Two more months, my kids won't eat. Two more months. I'd like to give a shout out to Hope Chapel. They've been giving my family food. You know how hard it is to even think about what tomorrow will bring? Our hālau, thank you. Kapono`ai Molitau, who puts a halau community. . .*(inaudible)*. . .together. That's one of the only ways that I've been able to feed my family. So, please, we gotta manage this right, and this is the only time we got to get this thing on its feet to able to support our own community because right now we can't. Honestly, tell me, can we actually support our community right now? So, e kala mai, but you guys know, I'm always in support of any type of farming, for sure. And that's all I have for you today. Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo no kou mana`o iki ala, Mr. Au Hoon. We have questions from Member Sinenci, Pro Temp Kama, Member Paltin, and Committee Vice Chair King.

MR. AU HOON: Sure.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aloha, Mr. Au Hoon, and you know, thank you for your testimony today. I was awakened by your video, your podcast the other day. And I got up that morning early and I got to see you on social media. So, and I must say that I watched your entire cast. So, mahalo for putting the word out there and being that alaka`i for your community. So, I was going to share with you some of the numbers for you to get additional help. But it looks like you had already contacted Small Business Development Center and the Maui Chamber of Commerce just for...

MR. AU HOON: I have. It's just waiting. It's waiting period right now, you know. The things for me, though, e kala mai, I was able to call my loan company for my home. And they...I actually qualified for forbearance so that kind of helped me out. And my gallery is on Dairy Center so that management company has been able to help too, so to shorten. Everything is just, you know.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: And then if you can leave your number private with the Staff, and I know there's a lot of people that want to reach out and kokua. Maybe we can hook you up with some people that want to provide donations. So, mahalo.

MR. AU HOON: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Au Hoon. Pro Temp Kama, and then Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Au Hoon, for testifying. I thank you because it's very difficult to come before a body of public officials as well as the public because, you know, your testimony is on BlueJeans. And people who want to just come in and listen, they can come in. And it's also being aired on *Akakū* so, you know, you're going out. But to be able to come and say I need help, so thank you. That's just the hardest thing I know for our people to do. So, I wanted to ask you, just you yourself as I look at your garden behind, did your intent to grow and to share, or you want to grow and maybe sell some of your stuff, or to just subsist for your family? What do you want to do with your farm?

MR. AU HOON: Honestly, to grow and feed the community, especially in a time like this, you know. As we all weren't ready for it, nor does any of the farmers or companies weren't ready for anything like this. But, yeah, it'd be more of a community-based kind of style that we'd be able to feed each and every one of our families as long as that these families are putting in what they possibly can within the farm, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes, yes.

MR. AU HOON: And, you know, of course making some money to hold up the farm in general.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah, yeah. Well, I thank you again for your testimony and for your courage. And just know that, you know, what we as a Council are going to do is the best that we can to support you and all of our farmers so that they can actually produce food for themselves. So, thank you very much. I certainly do appreciate you.

MR. AU HOON: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama.

MR. AU HOON: . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin, followed by Committee Vice-Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Au Hoon. I just wanted to clarify. You know, thank you so much for your mana`o, and I hear you, and I feel you. What we're hearing from other folks is stories like yours are a reason to invest in more marketing of Maui, 3.5 million to bring the people back to help folks like you. And I was wondering is that not what...

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MR. AU HOON: I was actually on that night, just you know, kind of impatient so I couldn't wait that long. I do believe that that 3.5 million should be going...it should...as of right now the way that it's going, we're not even too sure if it's going to be...our community will be back up to par the way it was a few months ago. I believe that we should definitely push majority of that fund into supporting everybody and anybody in this community, especially the small business community who is labeled nonessential during the crisis time. As of right now, tourism...we're always going to get tourists. That's not, you know...but the thing is, we...it really...this pandemic showed that we're not capable to support our own community versus the 30 to 40,000 people that come in and out weekly, you know. So, honestly, yes, I hope that that 300...that 3.5 million goes to supporting nonessential businesses such as myself and that it can support our community more than support outside interests 'cause majority of the resorts now...majority of the resorts' flow of money doesn't stay within our community, as I worked 17 years for Grand Wailea, you know. And Grand Wailea being one of the biggest resorts, I actually managed the pool deck at one point and the pool deck shares one cabana a day, at the most cost 1,200 to rent one cabana for a day. That pool deck makes 1.2 million in a day. So, I think we should really look at what the resorts have to offer to help the community, and I'm not too sure how they're helping the community. I believe that each resort should have a partnership with a local farmer here so that local farmer can then support that specific resort. And that's how we can really bring that money in is that any of these resorts here, how many that we have, or all the hotels that we have, they can all have a little partnership with specific, you know, farmers so that we don't have to...the resorts don't have to, you know, go off and go out and buy from mainland versus supporting our farmers here so --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

MR. AU HOON: --I don't know if that answers your question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin said mahalo. Okay, and last Member with questions is Committee Vice-Chair King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Au Hoon, for being here and congratulations on a very successful first testimony. You know it's successful --

MR. AU HOON: I know.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --if you get a lot of questions. But, no, I had a concern about your business is 'cause you said it was nonessential. I'm hearing that it's a gallery. Is that an art gallery?

MR. AU HOON: Yeah, it's an art gallery in Kahului Town, next to Tin Roof. Chef Simeon's there.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. And then I have...I think...yeah, I know where that is. And, you know, one of my concerns is that when we do open up, back up, there are going to be

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

certain businesses that are going to be slower than others. And, you know, the luxury items like, you know, art and jewelry, things like those are going to be slow. But I was just wondering is your attempt here, which I love, I love seeing your garden in the back, are you intending to maybe switch to gardening or farming?

MR. AU HOON: Well, the thing about my gallery is when we opened it, we actually opened it in order to assist local clientele. So, majority of my clientele for my gallery is actually in-state versus out-of-state.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, your sales.

MR. AU HOON: I wrapped my whole marketing around that, yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, your sales. Okay, I was just...because I've been following other countries that are opening back up slowly and those are the slowest businesses.

MR. AU HOON: Functional art, e kala mai.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, people get all of their stuff all ready to go and then nobody comes in the store. But I also wanted to mention that we have several proposals for helping with agriculture and farming. And there's a couple of, you know, organizations that help with...are going to be assisting with backyard gardening as well as, you know, farming. So, I hope you continue to do that even as your...as we come back online at some point. But I so appreciate you sharing your story and sharing your pictures of what you're doing there. Your kalo looks like it's doing really well.

MR. AU HOON: Hey, yeah, I scored like five different varieties. . . .(inaudible). . .

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah. So, anyway, thank you for supporting the agriculture side of it, priorities.

MR. AU HOON: Oh, I was born and raised into agriculture so I don't know. I might be coming next to you and planting some food.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Awesome. We got extra land everywhere, so thanks. Thank you, Chair.

MR. AU HOON: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King.

MR. AU HOON: Mahalo, Vice-Chair King.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And mahalo again for your testimony, Mr. Au Hoon, and for impressing upon everyone the urgency of right now and the matter of survival for a lot of people.

MR. AU HOON: Oh, yes, in about a couple of weeks --

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

MR. AU HOON: --you know, a lot of the paycheck-to-paycheck families going be hurting.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, mahalo, Mr. Au Hoon. He lā maika`i. Aloha.

MR. AU HOON: Mahalo to you guys. He lā maika`i ke a kupu.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ke a kupu. Okay, we have Mr. Rod Antone who heard our request for question. And so, he jumped back on to answer the Members' questions. Mahalo, Mr. Antone. So, really quickly, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Hi, Mr. Antone.

MR. ANTONE: Hello, Councilmember Tamara Akiko Maile Paltin. I like all your name.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, you pronounced correctly. I just was wondering last testimony time, Councilmember King asked you for some information and you said you were going to e-mail it. And I was looking through all the testimony received from then and now, and I couldn't find it. So, I was wondering if...

MR. ANTONE: This is about the Federal, yeah. Is it the Federal money? Okay, so...and the reason why I didn't e-mail it out is I only got part the answer, waiting for rest of it. But so the only Federal money that the hotels are eligible for, from what I understand, is the same Federal money that every business with less...with 500 employees or less is eligible for. That's the payroll protection program. And even my organization, we had to file for that, otherwise we would've had to shut down. Now, so now the question...and so if you guys aren't familiar with the program, it's a loan and you can pay, as long as you're paying for payroll for your employees, utilities, lease. You can even pay for mortgage interest. And that's so to keep people working for about eight weeks I think. The program's run out of money already.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Antone you need to answer Member Paltin's question.

MR. ANTONE: What's that?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King had a question.

MR. ANTONE: Oh, okay. But let me real quick, I was just going to...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Mr. Antone, thank you for following up. Let me just ask my question because it's pertinent to --

MR. ANTONE: Okay, sure.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

VICE-CHAIR KING: --. . .(inaudible). . . Because, you know, my question was more about that we're doing like a \$50 billion bailout for the airlines. And there's...

MR. ANTONE: That's not happening for the hotels.

VICE-CHAIR KING: That's what . . .(inaudible). . .

MR. ANTONE: . . .(inaudible). . .

VICE-CHAIR KING: Because I don't think...because some of these multi-national corporations like the one that owns the Grand Wailea and the Marriott and Starwood and all those, are not considered small business, so they wouldn't be applying for that small business loan. But there's a lot of corporate bailout in that first stimulus bill. So, that's what I was asking about. Did you do research into that to see if there's monies coming to these multi-national . . .(inaudible). . .--

MR. ANTONE: Yeah, no...

VICE-CHAIR KING: --. . .(inaudible). . .

MR. ANTONE: No, the hotels are not getting a bailout. If anything, if...and like I said, if you're a hotel with 500 or less, and there are...we have 'em out there. You can apply for the...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Rod, but that wasn't the question. The big question was about the multi-
--

MR. ANTONE: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --national corporations that, you know, we have them here as well. You know, we have Marriott. We have Starwood.

MR. ANTONE: They're not getting bailouts. That's the answer. They're not getting Federal bailouts. And I'll make sure. I will go back and e-mail all my...again, and so my association is not every single hotel. It's a lot of 'em. It's a lot of 'em. But like, Outrigger, they're not part of our association. So, but I will check with all my...I did check but more specifically I'll ask about Federal bailouts because --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, that was the question.

MR. ANTONE: --that question I asked in general was Federal money, yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, that's the question. Thank you.

MR. ANTONE: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then I just want --

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --how many in your association are 500 or smaller employees?

MR. ANTONE: Okay, you'd like me to follow up on which ones got the PPP, if any. If any of our smaller hotels got the Payroll Protection Program?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or how many...

MR. ANTONE: Yeah, no problem. I can tell you Maui...what's that?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: How many in your association even would qualify for it? 'Cause you said it's only for...

MR. ANTONE: Maui Coast, The Mauian, there's a number of smaller hotels out there. Maui Beach, you know, Maui Seaside. But I'll go back, send a e-mail blast out specifically. In fact, I already did on the PPE [sic]. And then I'll send another one out just to clarify Federal bailouts if anybody's gotten 'em. And I'll come back tomorrow 'cause we're going to be doing this tomorrow too, right?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or you can e-mail the Committee, either way.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Every day.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'll keep an eye out.

MR. ANTONE: No, I want to appear because some people say they haven't seen me so I gotta be on this as much as possible so they see I'm working.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Mr. Antone. Okay, our next --

MR. ANTONE: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --testifier is Robert "Bob" Richmond followed by Hōkūao Pellegrino.

MR. RICHMOND: Okay. Can you hear me okay?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, we can.

MR. RICHMOND: Okay. Aloha kākou. And thank you so much for the opportunity to testify. I'm testifying in behalf of the continued funding for the Maui Nui Marine Resource Council. I've served as the Chair of the Maui Coral Reef Recovery team for a number of years and had the opportunity to work closely with the Maui Nui Marine Resource Council. And I'll say as a marine biologist who's been working on the coral reefs of

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

Hawai'i since 1979, we all know that the coral reefs have been in major decline. Recently, this last few years has been particularly bad with back to back to back bleaching events. And from the human side, it's really the watershed discharges that are taking a toll on the reefs. The Maui Nui Marine Resource Council, in collaboration with community groups and with the Ridge to Reef group that Tova spoke about previously, has really been doing outstanding work in helping to protect the reefs and those people who depend on them for coastal fisheries, especially at a time like now. They've been very good partners in helping to leverage their community volunteers to bring in matching for Federal grants. We've been able to bring money in to help study Honokowai, Wahikuli, Olowalu, and Polanui. And the good news for you is that the work that they're doing in watershed restoration is actually working. But we are seeing improvements in the water quality and the coral reef quality and the associated fisheries. So, as a research professor at the University of Hawai'i at Manoa and the Director of the Kewalo Marine Laboratory who's been involved with this group for a number of years now, I think very highly of them and their efforts, and certainly want to congratulate the people of Maui for being probably the most proactive of the islands to be able to deal with coral reef decline, the associated fisheries and addressing the challenges that the communities face when they really do depend on their reefs for fish, for cultural resources, and the economics that come with it. Thanks very much for this opportunity.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Richmond. Seeing no questions, mahalo for your testimony.

MR. RICHMOND: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Okay, our next testifier is Hōkūao Pellegrino, followed by phone number with the last four digits 0376. Mr. Pellegrino? Mr. Pellegrino? Okay. Mr. Pellegrino, we'll check in with you after the next testifier. Okay, the next testifier is phone number with the last four digits 0376.

MS. WILKINS: Yes, aloha. And this is Leslie Wilkins. Aloha, Economic Development and Budget Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, and Vice-Chair King, and Members. I'm honored to serve as Maui Economic Development Board's President and CEO. We are a nonprofit with the mission to inspire and lead innovation in business education and community. We are valued-based economic development board guided by respect for our environment, culture, and sense of place. On behalf of our board and staff, I'll begin by saying thank you for your leadership in this unprecedented time. We know you have many difficult decisions before you. MEDB has worked to pivot all our programs to be responsive to the COVID-19 needs of our community which has changed work, education, and community engagement which are the pillars of our organization's programs. With the cancellation of three of MEDB's conferences, we have moved content to digital platforms. Our business development team partnered to present live webinars and customize one-on-one help to over 1,000 small businesses to apply for both the SBA Economic Injury and Disaster Program and the Paycheck Protection Loan Program prior to the fund's depletion. So, when...this Wednesday we will host another webinar helping businesses who did receive a PPP loan to track their expenditures to be eligible for loan forgiveness. On an ongoing basis, we meet with local businesses offering

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

technical assistance in finance, marketing, social media, increasing their web presence and access to capital. We realize that economic development must be linked with education and workforce development to ensure we are growing a skilled workforce aligned with the sectors we are trying to build in clean energy, healthcare, agri-tech, IT, geospatial, aerospace, cyber security, robotics, artificial intelligence, virtual reality, 3D printing, and entrepreneurship. Thank you for investing in us so we can invest in our future workforce and our future problem-solvers. Our programs extend from kindergarten to careers in addition to leveraging the County's funding with Federal, State, and private sector funding. We have an approximate 5:1 ratio. We also secure free industry standard software agreements for our schools. We are preparing our STEMwork [sic] students for higher education, but many of our graduates have industry certification credentials, technical skills which are allowing our high school students to enter the workforce with skilled jobs in coding, digital media, automotive skills, and GIS. Quite frankly, every business and industry needs a skilled STEM workforce. Our program outcomes build students to be resilient, critical thinkers, and problem solvers. Our hallmark is bringing industry and education together because we know that a homegrown talent pool will drive the homegrown solutions and innovations for Maui County's sustainable future. . . (timer bell ringing) . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for your testimony, Ms. Wilkins. And we have a question from Committee Vice-Chair King.

MS. WILKINS: Yes, thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. Great timing, Leslie, on that testimony. Oh, I had a couple things. One is I just wanted to ask you if you guys were doing education for teachers on how to continue interacting through technology with their classrooms while we're all, you know, sequestered and quarantined. And two, do you have a program that's actually helping businesses learn how to continue on with this type of interaction even beyond COVID-19 for those who want to...who are finding it more efficient and, you know, time and cost-saving?

MS. WILKINS: Absolutely. Two great questions. Yes, we're working with our teachers to help them with content and coaching for digital delivery of education. You know, we have a STEMwork [sic] afterschool program which is not able to meet face-to-face with about 625 students. And so, we have taken, and that is supported by the County, we are getting those devices, have gotten those devices out to homes and students and are sending content directly to our students. So, we were able to this week, we got a program which are several hands-on engineering kind of exercises and content age-appropriate for grade school and middle school students, and are getting those directly into homes to help not only our teachers, but also our parents who are becoming educators. For businesses, we're doing ongoing programs. The third in our series, webinars will be this Wednesday as I mentioned. We will continue that 'cause that is first and foremost. That technical assistance to support our businesses where they are to help them pivot. And you know, begin to come back online or during this time even helping them with online efforts. That one-on-one coaching is the hallmark of our business development.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you so much for that. And I just wanted to make a suggestion that I know --

MS. WILKINS: Absolutely.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --you have a women in, your women in technology program --

MS. WILKINS: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --that we've got some, especially at the head of this Committee, we have some women in technology that have been at the forefront of bringing these types of meetings for government, you know, continuing the government and testimony, and civic engagement. So, I'm hoping that, you know, you can push these skills forward as well because we've been getting a lot of support from the public on, you know, us going forward in holding these meetings and involving the public at a time when really no other councils are doing this. And then the Legislature shut down. So, anyway I just wanted to give a plug for our Council that we're headed up on...in the Budget Committee by a lot of women who are savvy on technology.

MS. WILKINS: Absolutely.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

MS. WILKINS: Our kudos and our heartfelt mahalo for using this to engage our community in the budget process. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, and then we have --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --a question from Pro Temp Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Leslie, for being on the call. You know, as I think about what, in terms of, you know, diversifying our economy, I think about, you know, farming and how that could be an economy within our own State. I think about the tourist industry and how that has just taken over. But I think...when I think about another industry, I think about the technology industry. So, I wanted to ask you, what would it take for the technology industry to be another economic engine for the State of Hawai'i?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, I think that's a much larger conversation. But, Ms. Wilkins, if you would like to just, you know, try to keep it concise to maybe two sentences.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MS. WILKINS: Yes, I look forward to a long conversation on that. But we have to remember that technology and IT is threaded through every single sector and increasing our capacity in technology will grow every sector with high-skill and high-wage jobs. But it's going to...it takes a focus and quite frankly what we've learned, it takes building those homegrown companies because we've seen the political will of companies that have come to Maui but when the political will shifts . . .(inaudible) . . . so those technology companies go elsewhere where it might be considered less expensive to do business. We're seeing a success in our homegrown companies that are led by Hawai'i-based folks who have roots here and are willing to put their technology challenge and businesses here. Examples of what we've seen was HNU Photonics, Maui Innovation Group, Pacific Defense Solutions, all run by Hawai'i companies hiring our Hawai'i kids.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Ms. Wilkins --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Wilkins. Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: --for that. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama --

MS. WILKINS: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --question?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Hi. I just wanted to ask a question for Ms. Wilkins please, Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Please proceed.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I know that MEDB has for decades been doing Kama`āina Come Home. So, I was wondering, do you have stats or data you could share with us as far as the successes in your tracking of our Maui County students that have gone out for training and your ability to attract them to come home and be part of our technology growth?

MS. WILKINS: Thank you for the question. And it's a program that's near and dear to all of us, especially I can speak to that firsthand as a parent, a parent who has a child that went off to college who's now in Boston. But our...we don't have the longitudinal tracking that we would like to have particularly because of the privacy requirements that our schools have in giving information out. So, it has to be done on a voluntary basis. So, I have a lot of anecdotal data, but I wouldn't...you know, I don't want to over say that it is statistically viable. We are working on that even more and we have a lot of our students home now who are taking the remainder of their courses online. And we are going to continue. I think one of the other things that we're working on is the Kama`āina Stay Home because there is a big opportunity for our students to work for international corporations remotely to log on from home and do a shift in all the major technology companies. We see a lot of people moving here that work for Microsoft,

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

Google, et cetera, who continue to work here because they can work remotely. But what we're working on is making sure that our young people are the ones that get those kinds of connections to jobs that are remote jobs that connect them globally but allow them to stay home.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, I appreciate that response, Ms. Wilkins, because I was kind of interested in the Mayor's Office kind of proposing to initiate that --

MS. WILKINS: Yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: -- Kama`āina Come Home --

MS. WILKINS: --and we are...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --but we know that it's been existing for like 20 years already so --

MS. WILKINS: Yeah, it is.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --I just...

MS. WILKINS: So, we're working on a new wave of that with new connection efforts. And I was really grateful that the Mayor and Office of Economic Development asked us to make that, you know, ramp that up again. And we think the window and timing for that makes it terrific. Also, there's a new program with the --

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . I agree with --

MS. WILKINS: --that will help us get better traction.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --. . .*(inaudible)*. . . lot bigger discussion. What I want to know is I believe we can make technology in this County grow by 100 percent within in the next five to seven years if we give it the right motivation and support from the County. And, you know, I'm looking at agriculture technology, healthcare technology. I'm looking at things like communications technology. Our County is geographically the right spot for anything in this State regarding communications. Without Lāna`i, that mountain, you cannot get into many areas that are geographically isolated because of gulches or valleys. And that is one of our strengths, our County. We are in a great beneficial, physical spot to do many things Statewide. And I need people like you in your field to help us come up with a plan to stop talking about it and doing the walk to make technology a big driver for this County for job creation, educational promotion, as well as stability of our local people. I don't need additional in-migration. I need stability, like you said, to keep kama`ainas home.

MS. WILKINS: I agree. Well, we are --

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, I appreciate...

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MS. WILKINS: --thrilled to be your partner and thank you for your investments. We...it's going to take public/private partnerships and investments to move us forward in this area. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: And thank you for mentioning private partnerships because somebody's got to pay the bill. And it ain't government that only has money. We don't have that much money. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Okay, mahalo, Ms. Wilkins, for your testimony today. Aloha.

MS. WILKINS: Thank you so much. Aloha.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We'll try Mr. Pellegrino again, followed by phone number with the last four digits 6421. Mr. Pellegrino? Okay, still technical difficulties. Okay, we'll go to phone number 6421. Six two...

MR. NAKOA: Howzit.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MR. NAKOA: Howzit. Good morning, good morning. You guys can hear me?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We can hear you.

MR. NAKOA: Yes, howzit. Leonard Nakoa. Mahalo, you guys, again for this so we can talk to you guys like this. No need drive all the way that side from Lāhaina. Mahalos. Earlier part had my nephew. He went chicken out. He never testify. He was with his aunty. I mahalo him for trying. I went call him up. He said the next time he going testify. So, this is awesome. He get one chance for talk story. I stoked. You know I testified Friday at da kine about the \$3.5 million no need go to tourism advertising. . . .(inaudible). . . about the micro loan to the agriculture. This is where the money gotta go for take care the ag people that actually doing 'em. That's why my nephew, the family he's staying with right now, they farmers. They take care their stuff so they need the tiller that she was talking about. So, this is awesome, awesome, awesome. This where the money gotta go. Awesome, guys, for bringing 'em up. But I hope you guys pass this micro loan thing. Yeah, and then Sandy Baz was talking about the money for go to advertising about making the tourist akamai. Do 'em already. They should be doing 'em anyway. The Visitors Bureau should do 'em. Educate these tourists. We've been talking this for long time. I know the Fire Department went have one video for educate these guys how for swim so they no get all jam up at Black Rock, like that. We should be doing that, period. We should've been doing 'em anyway. We no need that extra \$3.5 million for do that. Like I said on Friday, they coming and they coming at one. . . .(inaudible). . . Let's go ahead and control them from coming, slow 'em down.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

. . .*(inaudible)*. . . pumping the brakes and that way, we can take...use this money for take care our farmers. Never mind about the tourists, like that. But they coming no matter what. They already coming. We tell 'em no come, they already come, like 100 people a day. So, they coming already. We no need advertise that stuff. Yeah, mahalo, you guys. Please take care the farmers, and we going be awesome for we going be able to care ourselves. Thank you guys for your guys' time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for your testimony, Mr. Nakoa. Seeing no questions, mahalo again. Aloha.

MR. NAKOA: Yes. Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, let's see. I think I saw Mr. Pellegrino come back on. Mr. Pellegrino? You'd like to unmute yourself and proceed with your testimony? Followed by Faith Chase. Okay, we'll try again after. Okay, Ms. Chase?

MS. CHASE: Oh, aloha, Chair. Aloha, Council. I don't know how to best present this since this is an odd testimony for me. Forgive me, Tasha. I know this is your area, and I know my name is Faith. But in recent. . .*(inaudible)*. . .the unsheltered issues because of the COVID alarm, I really believe that the Department of Human...Health and Human Concerns and anybody who supports them needs to consciously move away from relying on faith-based organizations to be the leaders or the liaisons between the departments. At some point, there was a very strong pivot away from Salvation Army to Family Life Center. And while I understand VOAD has a national platform, for Maui it's really been broken. And of course, we have the political timeline that kind of sets us back every time. We need a neutral position that can be that communicator. I think we've got some good models. I know it's on the desktops of some of you Councilmembers. I just...it's really broken, and it's only this alarm that really shows the true colors. This is not my area. You all know that I stay more in water and trash. But, you know, I've reached out to the Department of Human Concerns. I've met with Lori Tshako, her Admin David. I've spoken to the Mayor's Office, Zeke, Brian Perry, Department of Parks and Recreation. John Buck called me on behalf of Mary Kielty from Parks and Recreation, Civil Defense. You know, nobody knows what to do. And it's way too far into this with no plan. Supposedly there's a report coming out today at 1:00 p.m. Even in that report, I really pray that there's a neutral voice. There's that person, that entity, you know, that can sort of not be faith-based driven. And it sounds so contradicting, and Tasha, you know I'm spiritually-grounded. But that separation from church and state is never more true now. And I didn't know this before. This is not my area. But if there can be a position within the Department of Human and Housing Concerns [*sic*], or maybe not within there. I hate to create a homeless department. Somehow that seems like it's giving it...you know, that's just a horrible title. But there needs to be...I predict with a vehicle benefits and a one-time salary maybe around \$60,000, that person who can be the liaison and that communicator between the department and you guys and the, you know, the field work. And I don't know what that looks like. And I will look at it more. But in closing, I just want to also support Robert Richmond with Maui Nui Marine Resource Council. They have done amazing work. They blow away all the watershed partnership entities, quite frankly. They are the best watershed management

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

advisors we have. And then also with MEO, closing, I'd like to just say that the ranch and farm. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . .worker program is a beautiful piece. And strangely enough, it's never really the outreach and the information. If you have a farmer or a rancher that works 25 hours, within two years, paid, like a check made out to that person, the Federal funding opens up for them. So, it's always been really unexplored. And when you guys talk about ag, ag, ag, ag, you know, there's that component at MEO that really could be exemplified. That's all. Thank you so much.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Chase. Seeing no questions, mahalo again for joining us to testify. Aloha.

MS. CHASE: A hui hou.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, we will go with Marty Martins, and then we will try Mr. Pellegrino again. Mr. Martins? Mr. Martins? Okay. Okay, Mr. Pellegrino? Okay, I don't think I see him on. Okay, and then we have two testifiers, first with the last four digits 5142. Five-one-four-two?

MR. JAMES: Aloha, Council. Aloha, Chair. This is Niles James, farm manager of Kupa`a. Can you hear very well?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry.

MR. JAMES: This is Niles James of Kupa`a.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo.

MR. JAMES: Thank you for having me today. I'll try to make this brief and quick on account that I'm planting seeds right now. But I am a farm manager on a four-acre regenerative permaculture farm. And I know this is not what this meeting is about, but I'm just going to bring it up just 'cause I was listening Friday. But imagine what we can do if we invested the money into farming that we have tourism. Would we have the same result in the agriculture industry in the farming industry? We've been investing into an industry that is neither sustainable or regenerative. And that's just a really big problem for an island that has limited resources. An example of that, Safeway throws away 500 pounds of fresh produce a day. That's about 20...*(inaudible)*...weighing 30 pounds each. And I know that personally because we used to take a lot of their food waste, and we used to turn that food waste into soil or compost which we use here on the farm to amend our beds, using no chemical fertilizers. And this is how we've created what we've created here, basically an oasis permaculture food forest. But in all of that of the four acres that we actually have, half acre of that is actually vegetable production. And 95 percent of our food comes out of that half acre which is worked by me and one other person. So, I'd like to say one-and-a-half person in terms of a full-time position and a half-time position. And we're supporting about 60 families a week right now sustainably. And when I say sustainably, I mean we can consistently do that. Sustainable is a consistent level across the playing field where regenerative continually goes up, industrial tends to go down. But here on the farm we like to say that we farm

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

soil and the crops that come out of it, the tier one would be, let's say a liliko'i. The crops that come out of it are basically our value-added product. And then the tier two would be a liliko'i jam. So, we're really here for the 'āina. And we're really here to be able to produce soil that's going to make enriched food and nutritious food. And that's really our huge goal. And that being said, we're trying to generate the highest revenue per square foot being about 200 pounds of carrots per 100-foot long bed, 30 inches wide. The new style of farming that is going into play in this revolution is also called market gardening, or market style, which you have tools that are basically necessary in order to not create high debt off of getting a big tractor, or something like that. So, we're just having foot paths that we walk in between and we don't have to worry about doing a tractor, although we do have a BCS to, push, two-wheel push tractor. That tremendously helps us which getting attachments and that tractor itself is about 10 to 14 grand. Each attachment is 2 to 3,000. And it actually helps tremendously in some of the aspects of again building soil in creating fluffiness and basically clay or rock. But I know we're also talking about creating more jobs and expanding food production so we need to talk about some of those costs that would free up a lot of time and efficiency. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . . Oh, wow. To kind of sum it all up, you know, you could basically...if you're getting a \$50,000 loan with refrigerators and getting all the...or, sorry, grant, and getting your refrigerators, getting your tractors, your attachments, and you're making things really efficient like automated irrigation which doesn't make. . .*(inaudible)*. . .time, you're now taking that \$50,000 and you're able to either have a full-time employee and a part-time employee. Or you're able to have three part-time employees that work 22 hours at \$15 an hour, which comes out to about \$991 a week. So, you're really able to increase food production, and at the same time create more jobs, and that's really what we're trying to do here in Maui County is create more sustainability, more food security, and more jobs, and be less dependent on the tourism industry and more dependent on our farming. Thank you very much for all your time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. James. Okay, we have a question from Pro Temp Kama. A clarifying question?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Yes, Chair. I just thought I heard him say that, Mr. James, you said that Safeway throws out 30,000 pounds of produce a day. Was that correct? Or did I not hear proper?

MR. JAMES: No. I believe I said we're getting 2,000...I'm so sorry. We're getting...we're supporting 60 families off a half acre of production. That's all vegetable. Ninety-five percent of that is based off of that. We're getting 200 pounds of carrots off 100-foot bed. So, we're looking at about two pounds per square foot. These are really good numbers...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No, I was referencing to, Mr. James, I was referencing your statement about how much food, produce that Safeway throws away and that--

MR. JAMES: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: --you have to use that for compost. That's what I was asking.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MR. JAMES: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you.

MR. JAMES: I'm so sorry. They throw 400 to 500 pounds of fresh produce away. That's just produce. That's not dairy, meat, or any of that. And so, we were collecting that every week on two-days basis which presumably that all goes to pig farmers which allows the pig farmers to be able to feed their animals. But we were taking 1,000 pounds a week, and we were putting it into our compost pile which is nitrogen based. We were mixing it with wood chips which is a carbon-based and water and...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay, thank you. So, there's 1,000 pounds of produce a week that you folks are getting from Safeway that they were throwing away.

MR. JAMES: Correct, and that's...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay, okay.

MR. JAMES: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

MR. JAMES: So, technically --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Pro Temp Kama.

MR. JAMES: --they are throwing 3,500 pounds.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. James, for your testimony today.

MR. JAMES: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, we have resources on the line, Members. And I was trying really hard not to limit your questions too much. But we really need to get going because our...remember when I said that Professor Hockett from Cornell University would be willing to provide us some information today? Yeah, so he's been waiting, and he's going to have to leave like really soon. So, if we want to get that information, then we have to hurry. Okay, okay. Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay, we're on our last testifier, Mr. Pellegrino.

MR. PELLEGRINO: Mahalo. Can you guys hear me, see me?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MR. PELLEGRINO: . . .*(sighing)*. . .Mahalo for bearing with me, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Darn, handsome buggah.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MR. PELLEGRINO: A little bit technologically-disadvantaged today for some reason. Mahalo to each and every one of you for allowing me to have this opportunity to share some mana`o. As you know, my name is Hōkūāo Pellegrino, and I'm speaking on behalf of Hui o Nā Wai `Ehā today. I'm the President of the organization. I'm also a small kuleana farmer in the ahupua`a of Waikapu for the last 21 years. And our organization obviously focuses greatly on water resource management. However, of our 500-plus membership base that we have, 60 percent of those are farmers all throughout Maui. And 67 of those particular members are farmers, kuleana kalo farmers, predominantly Native Hawaiian, that are within our region and who we represent as part of our, you know, water rights cases. And so, I wanted to just, you know, extend our strong support for the micro grants proposal. And the reason for that is because, you know, it's kind of doing very simple survey across a lot of our farmers in Nā Wai `Ehā, majority of those have never had any type of external resource, you know, financial resources provided to them, whether it's a grant or loans. And so, we support this proposal because I think this is an opportune time to really focus on supporting small farmers. And while our base predominantly is Native Hawaiian, we have a lot of farmers that we represent that are not, and we equally support as well. And I think, you know, across the island, not just in Nā Wai `Ehā area, there are a lot of small farmers in...that reside on kuleana lands that are in, you know, interior valleys from Kahakuloa to Keanae to Waihe`e to Olowalu. And I think, you know, if there's one thing this pandemic has shown is that we don't necessarily have the capacity to even take care of our own selves, let alone the visitor base that comes in. And agriculture is a really key component of that. And so, I humbly ask for your folks' support for this particular proposal. Our organization can be a huge resource in helping a lot of these families and small farmers with the process because we know that whether they're micro grants, or larger grants, or loans, you know, the process is complicated. And that's always a challenge for a lot of these farmers. And our organization has the leadership. We have the capacity to help to support these, not just communicating out to them, but helping to provide information, whatever data, and whatnot, to help them get these...to have the opportunities to get these grants. So, again I encourage you folks and to look at funneling monies into this particular proposal, and I appreciate your folks' support on this. Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Pellegrino. Mahalo nui for sticking with us. And there's no questions.

MR. PELLEGRINO: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo nui for your testimony today.

MR. PELLEGRINO: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Okay, that was our last testifier, Members. So, if there are no objections...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No objections.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, sorry. I'll do a last call for testifiers. Okay, is there anyone wishing to testify before we close public testimony? Okay, hearing none, if there are no objections, I will close public testimony.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so public testimony is closed for today. And we are taking testimony tomorrow morning and every day at 9 o'clock for the those that may have had technical difficulties today.

. . .END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

**ITEM 1: PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR 2021 BUDGET FOR THE COUNTY
OF MAUI (CC 20-56, CC 20-114, and CC 20-229)**

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, I'm going to go straight to Professor Hockett. Oh, okay, good. All right. So, he's willing to stay on. So, I will...I had set to reiterate the instructions that I provided. But because testimony went a little long and we want to make sure we're mindful of our resource member's time, I will go straight into our resource presentation. And then I'll reiterate the instructions for this week. Okay. So, as you all are aware, a lot of questions still remain about the availability of Federal funding to our County. To date we know of the seven point...\$7-ish million from the Department of Transportation. But as the Department stated, they are awaiting direction on how those funds can be used and when they can expect to receive it. To assist us with questions on some funding, I've invited Professor Robert Hockett from Cornell University. He authored the article, *Quantitative Easing for Communities*. You will also find a memo from him dated April 10th which is on Granicus, item number 73 which is under Testimonies dated 4-12...April 12, yeah, 4-12-2020 to 4-18-2020 on Granicus relating to an April game plan for community quantitative easing or Federal municipal liquidity facility. And so, he was on, and we're waiting for him to jump back on.

MR. HOCKETT: Oh, I think I'm here.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, there you are. Okay, good.

MR. HOCKETT: Can you guys hear me? Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We can hear you, Professor Hockett. Okay, and so we also have Finance Director Teruya is also monitoring, as well as our Bond Counsel, Sean Tierney, and Christine Choi who's our Financial Advisor from PFM Financial Advising, LLC, and our Treasurer Jack Kulp. Professor Hockett, mahalo nui again for hanging with us and for agreeing to, you know, provide us this important information today.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MR. HOCKETT: Okay, mahalo to you. Thank you so much. Thanks for inviting me. So, are there particular questions you'd like me to address first or should I just kind of say a few introductory things to begin with? Either way is fine by me. Yeah...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, the presentation from Professor Hockett will, again, primarily involve the municipal liquidity facility.

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah, yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And so, I think if you wouldn't mind starting with the presentation and then I'll ask Members if they have questions from there.

MR. HOCKETT: Oh, of course, sure, sure. So, you guys, I mean this is actually a fantastic funding opportunity. And I think because it's unprecedented, probably very few people are familiar with it. It'll take a little while for it to get kind of up and running and moving. I think precisely because it's unprecedented so there's no familiarity, and so there's not a sort of a established set of protocols already that people can kind of just immediately invoke. But the basic...I think maybe the thing to emphasize is that while it is kind of presented as a liquidity facility, or as a kind of tide over liquidity resource, it's looking already as though what the Fed really has in mind here is something more like medium-term financing rather than just short-term financing. And there's a couple reasons for saying that. For one thing, there's a rather large class of instruments that are listed under the category of eligible notes in the term sheet for the facility. For another thing, the maturities on the acceptable's or the so-called eligible notes, it's already...are already at 24 months. There was some anticipation back in March when there was sort of initial rumbling about the possibility of a facility like this. That they might be 12-month notes which would still have rendered them effectively equivalent to money market instruments. The very fact that we've sort of gone right out of the gates with 24-month maturities is kind of a signal that they're thinking in terms of something more than just a medium-term liquidity. And then the other thing maybe worth noting in that connection is that there's a lot of talk in the bond market from. . .*(inaudible)*. . .experts and bond market experts alike that we'll probably see three- to five-year maturities before very long. But in other words, the category of eligible notes will probably be eased further going forward unless there is some sort of miraculous end to the COVID pandemic. So, given that fact, it seems to me...well, actually given that fact and one other fact that I'll note in a minute, and I think there's kind of an obvious strategy to sort of push. So, the second fact that I think that's worth noting is that because again this is so new and so unfamiliar, and the Fed is kind of improvising or sort of making it up as it goes along, that suggests to me that there's a significant role that the states and the municipalities will be playing kind of as co-authors of this thing. Basically, in other words, the shape that it ultimately takes will not be determined simply or only by the Fed, by also by the users, also by the states and the cities and what they push for, what they lobby for, what they ask for by way of further easing or expansion, or what have you. And you combine that with the fact that the Fed keeps signaling effectively that it's there to do whatever needs doing. And you combine that with the fact that the term sheet for the facility is full of exceptions, exemptions, and references to capacities to petition core exceptions or exemptions. And

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

it all seems to add up to a picture pursuant to which, or in which, the cities and the states will play an important role in determining what this thing ultimately becomes, right. So, it's not merely something that's been kind of handed down to you from on high, so to speak. It's more like the kind of opening gambit and what I think the Fed anticipates will be a kind of partnership between itself and the cities and states. It's almost as though the Fed has made the...*(inaudible)*... judgment...*(inaudible)*... has sort of noticed that our Federal...*(inaudible)*... really functioning as Federal agencies any longer and that the states and cities have in effect become the sort of new de facto Federal agencies. And so, since they are now de facto Federal agencies, they shall be Federally funded in effect. It almost looks as though that's the way Chairman Powell and the remainder of the Fed Reserve Board are thinking. So, what I've been doing of late, is to try to set up, to try arrange a structure pursuant to which state and city officials can meet up with officials from their regional Federal Reserve Banks in order to sort of begin conversations about how to put in place some kind of an ongoing relation where basically the Fed or the regional Fed Banks on the one hand, and then the city and state officials on the other hand sort of work out in advance how the process should work, right. How the new instruments should be designed, and how the term sheets for those instruments, or the paper that has to...the various forms that have to be filled out in order to start up that issuing should proceed, and so forth, so that we can basically have a kind of smoothly functioning, seamless ongoing sort of funding pipeline for the Feds, the cities, and states, at least when they need it. So, that's kind of the sort of short, plain version I guess by way of sort of introducing the nature of the facility. And again, happy to chat further to, you know, probe any specific questions you guys might have further.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Professor Hockett. Okay.

MR. HOCKETT: Sure.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so we'll...I'll go one-by-one and see if any Members have questions. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. Yes, thank you for being here, Mr. Hockett. It's really interesting information about getting the Federal Reserve together with the cities and states but...or counties. And how would we...you know, right now that Maui County, because we have less than 500,000 population, we're not getting a seat at the table with the CARES Act. O`ahu, Honolulu has been able to go and get a pretty good chunk of that money, and if you look at it per capita, we're getting way less than what we would get if we were at the table. So, we're just sort of waiting to see what the State...so how do we...are we going to have a seat at that table even if we're at like 160, 165,000 population? So, what's going to happen with the smaller population cities and counties?

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah, so there's a couple of answers to that. It's sort of a two-part answer to that question, at least as far as the Fed is concerned, the new Fed facility. So, on the one hand, what the term sheet does is it says states are eligible just in virtue of being states. And then cities are eligible if they have 1 million or more people, and then counties are eligible if they have 2 million or more people. That means, in effect, that

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

you guys would have to work through the State, at least according to the term sheet. That being said, the term sheet also indicates that the State can ask the Fed for further or additional funding for specific municipalities if some specific municipalities are especially hard hit, or if for whatever reason, the funding that the state receives that it would then presumably be distributing across cities is not turning out to be enough, then the state would be able to sort of, you know, again ask for more for particular cities. Unfortunately, however, that would still mean that you're interacting with the Fed kind of through the State. And I'm not sure...it sounds like that might be a problem with you guys. It sounds as though maybe the State is not altogether solicitous of every single municipality. Is that fair to say?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well, I...just one follow-up, Chair. I feel like we're not, you know, we got this 1.2 billion coming into the state on the CARES Act I, and Oahu, or Honolulu is able to go directly to negotiate for their share. And if you look at it per capita, Maui should be getting over 60 million, but we're really only getting less than 10 million. So, the State, everything's getting filtered through the State, and the State is in huge debt. So, I feel like a lot of that money is going to go to settle their debt. And Maui may not be getting our fair share. So, how do we, you know...I mean I understand the idea of determining need, but there's also a fairness issue. If Maui has been in a more fiscally-sound position over the years because of the way we've handled our funding, we shouldn't be, you know, we shouldn't be suffering. We should still get our fair share. So, that's my concern, is how do the...how do...you know, we're not a municipality. How do the counties or smaller municipalities even get that, you know, get that seat at the table?

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah, the one angle I can see through which to do that, and again I don't know that it would actually bear fruit, but it would be worth trying I think, is that the Fed officials have said that the sort of working ideal that they're sort of acting on the basis of is that there would be an approximately equal per capita distribution. That basically if a city has twice as many people than other city, it would get twice as much money and so on. Presumably, there would be some basis on which some sorts of departures from that baseline might be permissible. So, for example, if one city was just extra hard hit, say, then you can imagine some disproportional flow in the direction of that especially hard-hit city. But given that the baseline, pursuant to which the Fed wants to be operating, is a kind of equal pro rata share on a sort of person-by-person basis. One angle I could imagine might be employed would be to approach the Fed and say, we understand that you were kind of thinking of it as an appropriate baseline that there should be a kind of equal per capita distribution. But under the current arrangement, we're not getting anything even close to that. So, is there any way that you, the Fed, would open up the eligibility a bit so that we don't necessarily have to work through the states? Could we, in other words, establish some sort of direct line between municipalities or counties on the one hand, and the Fed on the other, even when those counties are less than 2 million in population, or the cities are less than 1 million in population. And whether the Fed would agree to do that or not, it's hard to say. But my guess is that if things get bad enough, they might very well be willing to try to do something to make that work because they really seem to be very concerned with the facts that Federal agencies are just not doing what they would normally be

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

doing in circumstances like this. If we could open up a kind of regular channel of communication between you guys and the appropriate regional Fed officials, I think you guys are within the San Francisco Fed territory. Is that right? Do you happen to know? And usually the regional Fed Banks have branch offices in other cities, and so I'm guessing that San Francisco Fed has to have at least one branch office in Hawai'i. And I...but I'll have to look into that. They might actually have multiple ones. They might have one each island, for example. But I'll have to double-check to see. But if there are a way to open up a kind of an ongoing conversation, sort of an ongoing communications channel between you guys and the appropriate Fed branch in your territory, in your neighborhood so to speak, that would be a great way where we could...essentially it will be a great line through which you could get kind of daily communiqués and sort of keep abreast of what's going on in Fed thinking on a day-to-day basis. But also, a channel through which you could convey directly and kind of immediately those specific concerns or the specific hardships that you're facing right now. And then the regional Fed Bank itself might be able to come up with even additional facilities. But at the very least it would be able to communicate those concerns directly on up to the Board so that the Board might then in the next round in any kind of reconfiguration that it does address this particular weakness in the plan as it's currently done. I mean it's worth reminding ourselves I think periodically that again this is sort of done on the fly really quickly. And so, I think the first people who would be willing to admit to you that this is very much still kind of a work in progress would be the Fed Board itself. And so, I think any kind of pressure that we can bring to bear, or any kind of communication of urgency that we can do at the front end like this is apt to pay dividends of one kind or another in the relatively near term future.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you so much. And --

MR. HOCKETT: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

VICE-CHAIR KING: --thank you, Chair, for bringing Mr. Hockett to speak with us. I think this is really helpful on any advocacy you can be for, you know, smaller counties like us is great. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. And our attorney, Mr. Raatz, sent us...or sent me information that the Federal Reserve of San Francisco does not have any Hawai'i branch offices.

MR. HOCKETT: Oh, my goodness. So, there's no branch office in Hawai'i? Oh, my God.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, okay. So...

MR. HOCKETT: That's crazy.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Hockett?

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah, oh, sorry. Yeah, I guess maybe our sound is...that's crazy in itself, it seems to me. You know, that's another thing that we should push for. As it happens,

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

I actually...believe it or not, the president of the San Francisco Fed literally owes me a favor from something from last week. So, why don't...I mean not that that's decisive. But at least it would get me a hearing I think. Why don't I reach out to the San Francisco Fed president. Actually, I can still do that today since they're three hours behind us. Let me reach out to them today and see if we can't, you know, get them to open up some kind of a branch office or have some sort of a liaison at the very least over in Hawai'i because it's crazy that they don't, right. I mean, the...you know, the Houston Fed has a branch office in Dallas, in addition to Houston. I mean if you can...if you're going to have a branch office in a city that's only a couple hundred miles away from your main Fed office, I would think that you would want one, you know, halfway across the Pacific to the islands. That's just crazy. Anyway, one of...I'll try to work on that angle as well. It seems very odd to me that they don't. And if they really want this program to work well, it seems to me they're going to have to sort of branch out more and have more branch offices, especially if there's an entire state that doesn't even have one branch office, so.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you so much. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And just to...and mahalo for fielding some of the CARES Act question. Just a reminder to Members that we're like focusing on the municipal facility...liquidity facility which is bonds particularly. And so, we do have Ms. Christine Choi, our Financial Advisor. And I understand that she also wanted to provide some comments. Ms. Choi? Ms. Choi? Oh there. I can hear you now.

MS. CHOI: Okay. Okay, okay, great. Thank you. Good morning. I just wanted to share some thoughts. I'm with PFM. We're a nationwide financial advisory firm. We're working with a lot of state and local governments on this very topic and exploring and really trying to understand what this tool can be for a lot of issuers out there. And just to clarify, I know you had just mentioned but there is kind of two different programs. One is the grants which I think one of the Councilmembers had just been referring to and that the State had already received or received some of those amounts and were deciding how much to give the smaller local governments including Maui County. The program that Professor Hockett has mentioned is the municipal liquidity facility. And those are really short-term loan, short to medium-term loans that issuers will be potentially utilizing to help with any sort of cash flow issues that are arising over the next couple years. You know, for a lot of government issuers, there's going to be a significant impact who rely more on sales tax, and retail, and hotel revenues that will be significantly impacted by this that really need to utilize this type of program. And I think obviously the State of Hawai'i will also be severely impacted with just how much they're relying on tourism. And in terms of the eligible issuers, you know, Professor Hockett mentioned that counties have to be in the population of greater than 2 million. And really for Hawai'i, it's only the State that is an eligible issuer that can utilize this program. But there is a portion of the program that can be utilized if the State so chooses to help with local government. So, if the State decides to use this program, then it's definitely something that I think...in its current state that this is the way it is that Maui could potentially borrow from the State's form of borrowing from this program. And so, I think you had asked, or one of the Councilmembers had asked, how can the County, you

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

know, participate. It would really be through the State at this point in time. And really, it's kind of uncertain. I have...I also work as an advisor for the State of Hawai'i as their municipal advisor. And I know that they are exploring this program as well. I think there's still a lot of uncertain factors as to pricing and whether or not it'll be more attractive than what's available in the public market. And I believe, you know, our nationwide pricing group had circulated a *Bloomberg* article that was printed today that mentioned, you know, government issuers had a call with some of the Fed officials regarding this program. And they're still trying to determine whether or not that pricing will be more attractive or actually at a premium over public markets 'cause there may be some challenges to doing it at a lower cost just based on the way the Federal regulations are written. So, I think there's still a lot of uncertainty. We're very closely monitoring it. And I know there's a lot of questions that are being circulated. And the...from what, you know, folks in our firm have heard is that there will be sort of a Q&A response to help facilitate, you know, folks' understanding and use of this program. But I think as Professor Hockett mentioned, it is kind of evolving and folks are kind of trying to figure out how to utilize it which I think, you know, the idea and creation of this program is to help support local and state governments. And hopefully that that's something that will be effective in creating this program.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Choi. Okay, so we'll go to Member Sinenci, and then Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for being here. I guess my question was answered about addressing just the ten largest cities in the United States and with populations in excess of \$1 million [sic]. I guess my question for Professor Hockett, if he can just briefly touch on the special purpose vehicle, or the SPV. Can you explain SPV?

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah, sure. Yeah, so the Fed first began to use...sort of starting generically, the authority, the legal authority under which the Fed is doing this is basically Section 13(3) of the Federal Reserve Act. And that's the so-called discount window. And when the Fed first began to use that authority in a really big way back in 2008, 2009 to address that crisis. So, it started up a number of distinct facilities through which it would basically do the kinds of things that it's now offering to do for municipalities. And so, the way it does this is basically...what it does is it buys short-term or medium-term debt instruments, its own Federal Reserve notes, right, with money. So, it basically monetizes short-term debt, and in that sense it's replacing, right, it's replacing a liability that is not legal tender with a liability that is legal tender. And the way it does this is it first of all settles a trust, right, just basically founds essentially a legal trust, a simple legal entity that has the capacity to buy and sell financial instruments or buy and sell assets of one kind or another. And that's all the SPV is. It's just basically just a legal trust. You can kind of analogize it to a mutual fund or any kind of investment funds. Those are always...those always begin as legal trusts that have the capacity, the legal capacity, to own and to buy and to sell the financial assets of various kinds. So, all of the facilities at the Fed began experimenting with back in '08 and '09 operated out of SPVs in that way. And so, it's doing the same thing now. It's opening up a number of different facilities under Section 13(3), and then each one has its own SPV. An

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

interesting feature of the MLF SPV is that it's being initially capitalized by the Treasury Department. So, the Treasury Department gave it an initial capitalization of \$35 billion. And then the Fed is authorized essentially to lever up off of that initial capitalization. So, in that sense the SPV is a bit like a bank or a shadow bank, right. There's a sort of an initial amount of capital that's been put in. In the case of a bank, that would be put in by a . . .(inaudible) . . .department. And then the Fed is acting as a . . .(inaudible) . . .bank. . .(inaudible) . . .a lot more than that initial capitalization. And the...for right now at least the intention is to lever it up to about 500 billion, or half a trillion dollars. I have a funny feeling that if the pandemic continues along the course that it is right now, we'll probably see that facility grow larger. And we'll probably see the eligibility open up a bit further so that instead of the notes having to be two-year durations or shorter, they might very well get up to three- or five-year notes which would make it really a medium-term rather than a short- to medium-term facility. And my guess...I could imagine Treasury appropriating more money to put into the fund as well. So, my guess is that this SPV will be kind of a...I'm afraid to say permanent fixture, but a pretty...I think it's going to be a long-term fixture of our financial environment. To put things in a little bit more perspective, you know, the Fed balance sheet, basically the asset portfolio of stuff that's held by the Fed, grew immensely during the '08, '09 crisis. And it was...this was all said at the time to be temporary. It was said that the Fed balance sheet is going to grow during the crisis but then it'll come back down. But the Fed still has a huge balance sheet, even bigger than it was back then. But similarly, Fannie Mae, you might remember was taken into government receivership back in August of 2008. That was said to be temporary as well. It's still in government receivership. And I think what this really reflects is that we're in a...we're sort of in a new normal where certain...you might say that certain entities are so important for more than just monetary reasons that the public sector simply will not let them fail. And Fannie Mae basically holds most of the mortgage loans that are extended in the country. So, if we're going to have, you know, middle class that owns its own homes, we have to have a Fannie Mae. If we're going to have a Fannie Mae, basically for now has to be in Federal receivership. I think that the cities and states in some cases are in a certain sense going to be the new Fannie Mae, not in the sense that they're going bankrupt or that they've been, you know, mismanaged or that they're corrupt or anything like that. But in a sense that they're so important to the functioning of a nation now especially with the Federal agencies doing so little, that I don't think the Fed is going to let them fail. I don't think the Fed will let American cities or states fail, especially when they're the only thing now standing between our populations and disease, right, and death. So, my guess is that again this facility will probably grow and expand over time unless again there's some kind of a weird miracle cure that's suddenly discovered to the disease. But bringing this then back to your initial question, the good thing about the fact that we have a separate SPV for each facility is that there's no muddying of the waters, right. This facility is solely for this purpose. There's no possible...there's no legal purpose for which the funds in the SPV can be spent other than providing support to the states and cities under the MLF program. Was that responsive? Does that cover it?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes. Thank you. Thank you, Professor.

MR. HOCKETT: You bet. Oh, sure, of course. Thank you.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay, Member Molina, followed by Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you very much, Madam Chair and Mr. Hockett, and also Ms. Choi. You know, I appreciate your analysis. I mean I'm just a layperson so I'm trying to, you know, decipher what you're saying, and it's much appreciated. So, just going back to the issue of possibly opening a direct line of communication with the Federal regional office and its impacting on our ability to communicate to...or get our share of the allocation of the CARES Act to the State. If you could just briefly respond to that, and also with Hawai'i being the state it is, we're an oversea state and the decline in oil prices, I'm concerned as far as how...could we be eligible for more funds to be, you know, we're a special consideration I guess I'm trying to say. And we're so dependent on transportation for goods and services and the cost of oil now that it's in decline. I think it went...I think --

MR. HOCKETT: Negative.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --it hit negative today. Yeah. So, any thoughts on that?

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah, there's...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Member Molina, I'm going to narrow the scope.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, if you could condense it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 'Cause I know we all have questions about the CARES Act. But we specifically invited Professor Hockett to talk about the municipal liquidity facility, which is with the Federal Reserve and its, you know, purchasing of loans. And...

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The House of Representatives is actually getting a briefing today, right now, on the CARES Act. And so, hopefully some of those questions will be answered in that briefing that we can kind of check, that Staff is also monitoring. So, I guess the second question, Professor Hockett, if you'd like to speak to.

MR. HOCKETT: Sure, yeah. I think there are two Fed-related programs that you guys might be able to sort of make special appeal to on the basis of what Chair Lee just noted, right. One is that, yeah, if you're especially dependent on tourism, as somebody else mentioned before, and then also just on travel and transit in general, there's a kind of...you could say that Hawai'i is especially hard hit, right, and that it needs a sort of special solicitude. And there is room within the term sheet of the MLF in particular to request additional or further aid, right, further monetization of yet more in the way of debt instruments. And I think that you're, Hawai'i's case is probably an especially strong one for asking for additional liquidity support under that facility precisely for the

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

reasons that you just mentioned. A related point would be the small business assistance program, right. So, in addition to there being a CARES Act, sort of small business facility, there is also a Fed small business facility, also authorized by Section 13(3). And so, if you're able to make the case that small businesses are especially hard hit in Hawai'i, and I would think that would be a pretty easy case to make, then there could very well be additional funding that could be had from the Fed that would be earmarked particularly for basically Hawaiian small businesses. And if you could be tapping into that at the same time that you're tapping into the municipal liquidity facility, then you'd have in a sense two spigots opening up, both of which could be quite helpful to you guys during, you know, during this just really dreadful time. So, I would encourage sort of pursuit along that avenue as well. I'll try to put together a memorandum, something brief and useable, like the three-pager that I put together for the MLF, that you guys might be able to use for the small business facility too. I've been kind of meaning to get to that for the last few days, but the MLF stuff has got me kind of busy for a bit. But I should be able to turn to the SBA and small business stuff pretty quickly here too.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Great. Well, thank you very much, Professor. That certainly gives us a lot of hope. So, I appreciate your comments, sir. Thank you, Madam Chair.

MR. HOCKETT: Of course. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Chair Lee, and then Member Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair. Thank you, Mr. Hockett, for your presentation. I was just wondering, because this is a new program, would there need to be enabling legislation on the County level, on the State level? Or even on the Federal level at this point?

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah, I think it really depends on the State's law, right, what's already on the books in Hawai'i. So, some states, as you know, confer upon their public finance offices and their other sort of budget-making officials, a great deal of discretion to do new issuances and to seek additional funding. Other states require a separate...I'm sorry, a separate legislative authorization for every new act of that kind that's taken by public finance officials. And I just...I don't know quite how Hawai'i does this. In New York, there's a great deal of discretion that the state budget authorities have. In particular the Empire State Development Commission, which sounds like...or corporation, which sounds like a private sector thing because the word "corporation" in it, is actually a public instrumentality of the state of New York. And it has great discretion to issue new stuff. I don't know whether things are like that in Hawai'i or not. But I'm guessing that you guys' counsel would be able to answer those questions pretty quickly, right. I also don't know if you guys are a so-called home rule state, or not. Are you a home rule state with municipalities?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Not really.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MR. HOCKETT: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . No?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Not really.

MR. TIERNEY: This is Sean Tierney.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: But Mr. Hockett, I just want to make a point that because this program is still, as you say, evolving, you know, there's a certain level of uncertainty about it. And I think, well, for people like me, we tend to be more conservative and would want to have more hard facts, you know, and experiences from...by other municipalities. So, that I think Ms. Choi talked about a question-and-answer, you know, sheet. Maybe we can get a copy of that too when that becomes available. And thank you, I have no more questions.

MR. HOCKETT: Sure, one...maybe one additional thing I can say in response to that is so today we've introduced in New York legislation that I drafted last week, essentially establishing a commission here in the state. And the commission would be. . .*(inaudible)*. . .or charged with the duty of basically managing the relation between the state and the city on the one hand, and the Fed on the other, in administering the MLF facility as used in New York. We should have some experience that we'll be building up here fairly soon. And I'm very happy to keep...I can communicate all that stuff to you guys just for what it's worth in case it's, you know, useful. I'm doing sort of similar work for a number of other states too. And so, I'll very happily keep you guys apprised of developments as they occur in other states. And if it's okay with you, I'll do vice versa as well. My hope is to sort of function as a bit of a clearinghouse where I can kind of help, you know, keep everybody aware what everybody else is doing so that that way if like the state of Maryland comes up with a really creative use for this and it works really well, I can say, hey, have a look at Maryland. Or, if Hawai'i does something really wonderful, I can say to the people in Maine, hey, look at what Hawai'i's doing with this. So, hopefully we can kind of grow together in all of this with, you know --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you.

MR. HOCKETT: --in response --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you.

MR. HOCKETT: --to the experiments that various states do.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee --

MR. TIERNEY: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --and Professor Hockett. Okay, I think I heard...is...was that you, Mr. Kulp, that was trying to comment?

MR. TIERNEY: Oh, it was actually Sean Tierney, your --

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. Aloha, Mr. Tierney.

MR. TIERNEY: --I serve as your Bond Counsel. 'Cause it seemed like that was my cue on the, like legal question.

MR. HOCKETT: Oh, yeah.

MR. TIERNEY: Yeah, I mean generally, I think Christine's comments were well-taken that the County may be able to borrow on its own. And the terms might be even better. So, I mean we're just talking about cash flow borrowing with this current facility, and it's quite common for many municipalities to do annual cash flow borrowing. However, in Hawai'i, I don't think it's very common. I don't recall seeing it. Nevertheless, the statutes do reference borrowing pursuant to notes. So, I'd need to research it further because it's not very common, but I believe you'd have the authority to issue notes and participate in arrangements like this.

MR. HOCKETT: Good to hear.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Tierney. Member Hokama, followed by Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you for my opportunity for questions, Chair. First, for Professor Hockett, I would just say Hawai'i is the only state that recognizes counties by state Constitutional. So, we have constitutional standing as a county, compared to everyone else in the country that is basically statutory-created. So, that's the biggest difference. And so, we have a sense of greater home rule than others because of our constitutional standing, Professor. And I appreciate the Bond Counsel bringing that up, Professor, because I've worked hard to make sure that this County has financial options, and I would think at this point in time, unless you can give us comment on the pricing of the liquidity fund, why would I even consider the Federal program if I can get better interest and better terms under my GO borrowing?

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah, good question. So, couple things on that. One of the reasons that the Fed opened the facility in the first place was because the municipal bond markets were freezing up. They were becoming dysfunctional. And so, one way to think about the MLF is as a means by which the Fed can basically try to bring down borrowing costs in the private sector markets. And so, if it succeeds in doing that, right, basically if the private sector bond markets. . .*(inaudible)*. . .and you can get a better, you know, out of the private sector markets, there'd be no reason to bother with the MLF at all. You could just sort of think of the MLF as just something that's out there in order to influence the private sector markets in order to keep them functioning, and maybe also to kind of help keep the rates low. That being said, the expectation out there among the sort of bond. . .*(inaudible)*. . ., right, the sort of bond market watchers and bond market analysts, seems to be that the bond...that the muni market is apt to run into trouble again before long unless the Fed basically grows out the terms even further on the MLF to include three-year and five-year instruments. And so, you know, given all of that, I'm

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

thinking that you still want to have a relation with the MLF because the MLF is at the very least going to play an important role in determining conditions out there in the private sector markets including the borrowing costs that are prevailing out in them. So, if you guys, here's a hypothetical to sort of make this maybe sound more concrete, imagine you guys are tapping the private sector bond markets, and let's say that you can on the one hand sell very short-term paper at a pretty low rate, or you can sell longer term paper at a really ridiculously high rate. And let's say that you know that you're going to need money for longer so you really have to tap into the longer term market. Then you would have an interest in, when communicating with Fed, to say, look, can't you guys at the Fed do something to bring down the longer term rates in the private sector muni markets. For example, by accepting longer term instruments yourselves. And that's a kind of plea that the Fed would be perfectly happy to hear. That's exactly what I think lobbying them would consist in in a circumstance like this. So, what I'm really basically getting at then is that even, first to answer your question most directly, if the private sector rates are lower than the rate the Fed charges, then yeah, go with the cheaper rates. But second, keep in mind, I would recommend, that whatever rate is prevailing in the private sector markets is largely owing to something that the Fed is doing to keep those markets liquid right now because that's again what brought them into the MLF game in the first place, was the fact that those private sector markets were really breaking down. And so given that fact, given that the Fed is playing that role as a kind of an outside influencer of terms in the private sector bond markets, including the muni markets, you'll still I think want to be in some kind of regular contact with the Fed so that you can basically say, look, these rates are killing us. Can you, the Fed, do something to bring them down so that we can then borrow longer and not have to pay a ton of money. They'll be prepared to hear that, you know, and then to act on it, especially if they're hearing it from a lot of different states.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, Professor, if, on the Federal program then, if the County, if this County chooses to issue, the security has to be revenue-backed? Or could the County consider issuing a GO bond?

MR. HOCKETT: So, this depends...there's sort of are two factors that would determine the answer to that. So, currently the so-called eligible notes are all defined in terms of revenue anticipation of one kind or another.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Right.

MR. HOCKETT: And...right, and as you know, usually when we think of revenue anticipation, we're thinking of terms of, you know, maybe a year out or so. The fact that they're thinking about looking...first of all, the fact that they're accepting two-year instruments and thinking about three to five-year instruments, already sort of suggests that they're using the word "anticipation" here a little bit more broadly than one normally uses that word in this context. So, given that I think that there's going to be a lot more latitude to define certain kinds of issuance as revenue anticipation issuances than there used to be. So, if you could frame, if you could plausibly characterize a GO bond as a revenue anticipation instrument, and you just say, well, you know, we anticipate that essentially there's going to be an increase or a growth in state revenues or county revenues within

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

the next three or four years if we do this, then you're golden, so to speak. You know what I mean? You've got a plausible revenue anticipation story that you can tell that then justifies issuing these particular instruments and call it . . . *(inaudible)*. . . Makes sense?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Oh, that's part of my --

MR. HOCKETT: More or less.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --concern, yeah. If we use the State's vehicle, then more than likely under anticipation, revenue anticipation, the County might issue the note saying that we're going to secure it by what the State calls transient accommodation tax. But then for people like me, I don't anticipate any such revenue from the State next year.

MR. HOCKETT: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, how do I secure the financing?

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah. So, that's where it might become necessary to be somewhat creative in fashioning new instruments that are predicated on different anticipated sources of revenue. But that's...here again, the term sheet comes in kind of handy because it lists...there's a whole long list of various kinds of revenue anticipation instruments that are mentioned. And that again suggests to me that what the Fed is basically doing is giving you a kind of invitation to even if you have to, to invent new kinds of revenue anticipation instrument. And as long as there's a plausible story that can be told in terms of revenue growth in the next few years or so, thanks to the stimulus that's provided by this monetization of these new instruments, then I think you've got eligible notes within the meaning of the term sheet. And that's the key, right. The key is to have eligible notes, and then the key to eligibility in turn is revenue anticipation. But then the key to that, it's important to remember, is that it doesn't necessarily have to be some already existing form of revenue anticipation, like sales taxes, or property taxes, or what have you. It can be some new source of anticipated revenue. And again, as long as it's plausible, and isn't just sort of like, well, we anticipate that the fairy godmother's going to drop money on us. If it's not a fanciful story but a plausible story that sort of speaks to the possible generation of revenues in the next three to five years if we only do X, Y, or Z, then I think you've got a really good case you can make. And that the Fed indeed opens up the window more widely to include three to five-year instruments as everybody seems to think that it will, then you're in great shape.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Has it been determined whose debt sheet this is going to go on?

MR. HOCKETT: This is going...oh, sorry. Yeah, these will just be...these would be debts on the one hand of the county or the state that does the issuing, but the Fed would be the one that's monetizing those debt obligations, right. It's monetizing them by giving you money in return. It's kind of a swap basically. It's a temporary swap. And right now, what they're doing is they're swapping money for up to two-year instruments. What seems to be anticipated out there in the markets is that they'll eventually be willing to

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

swap money for three to five-year instruments, right. So, they would be technically your debts, but they would be debts that are presumably self-liquidating, at least if the revenue anticipation stories that you tell in connection with each new issuance are plausible stories, then they're basically self-liquidating debts. It's a bit like taking out a college loan and then getting such a great degree that you land a job that enables you to pay off your entire loan in a couple of years once you graduate, you know. That kind of thing.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah. Thank you, Professor. And of course, we --

MR. HOCKETT: Oh, right.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --still got a lot unpaid loans. Thank you.

MR. HOCKETT: . . .*(laughing)*. . .Mahalo. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Sugimura, and then Pro Temp Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you very much for spending your time with us. Are you in New York, you said? So, this must be afternoon for you.

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah, it's...I guess it's 5:30. Yeah, it's late afternoon in New York. But, you know, time means nothing now. . .*(laughing)*. . . So, it could just as well be one o'clock in the afternoon right now. . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, we're all huddling.

MR. HOCKETT: Exactly.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, I just wanted to thank you for spending the time educating us or sharing your knowledge. I do know that our Finance Department has done a great job in terms of protecting and making sure that we have such a strong bond rate. So, I'll look forward to you sharing your information with them. And then they can, you know, decipher for all of this and make sure we do the best choices for Maui County. So, thank you.

MR. HOCKETT: Right, of course. Thank you guys for having me. It really is an honor.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Hockett, for being here. You know, I feel like though I've been listening to the conversation, that I really don't have a good understanding of what it is we're actually trying to do, or what it is we're trying to

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

learn, or be educated about. So, is there any place that I could go online to read more about the municipal liquidity facilities --

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: --so that I can take at least take the time that I need to be able to I guess to learn it, to read it, and to get a clearer understanding about it? And then maybe ask questions later, Chair and Mr. Hockett?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. So, the information that I provided you is item 73 on Granicus. It includes Professor Hockett's articles as well as information on the Federal Reserve admin rule change itself. So, that's where that information can be found. And then if you have any questions, we can...we also have our Bond Counsel and our Financial Advisor, as well as Finance Director Teruya who know specifically our situation. But Professor Hockett has been so phenomenal in accommodating all of our questions.

MR. HOCKETT: Yeah, and I'm happy to send more to you guys as it becomes available so that this is a sort of...this will be a growing body of knowledge in a way since it's sort of just getting started. So, what I'll do is I'll keep sending your guys way anything new that comes out that you might be...you might find helpful to look at. And that way we can all kind of basically influence the development of this thing together in a kind of cooperative way.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Hockett.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Okay, and then, Finance Director Teruya, did you have a question? Okay, one moment. I'll unmute you. Okay, Director Teruya?

MR. TERUYA: Oh, okay. I thought I was talking. Anyway, a lot of my questions have been asked or answered by municipal advisor, our Bond Counsel, and Mr. Hokama. I know that I read that there's two Senators I think that are going...asking questions to the Fed whether or not they're going to be considering giving smaller counties the opportunity to participate. So, I know that's...that letter has been requested to the Feds as well, so. I don't want to take up too much of your time. It's getting close to lunch, and I'm sure everybody's hungry too. So, we will work with our Bond Counsel and our Financial Advisor to look at what's been presented and what would be most advantageous to the County. So, I appreciate the time to talk about that. Thanks, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director Teruya. Okay, so I just have one question. So, the MLF is set to expire on September 30th of this year, and our State Legislature is in recess indefinitely and may not return, reconvene session. I'm not exactly sure. I don't know if you could provide some, or anyone, if anyone would be able to provide information on how we would be able to access that funding, whether we would need the Legislature, or whether we would go through a State agency.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: If it's Federal funding, it's directly through the State Administration. And that is one of the things that has been asked of Congress in this upcoming legislation if there can be an option for direct payment to the counties without the pass-through to the State. So, that is being requested. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. But if that request is denied, and as it stands...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: It goes through the State...it'll go through the State Admin for the pass-through.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, great. Mahalo, Member Hokama. Professor Hockett?

MR. HOCKETT: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . I can throw in. Yeah, so, if you don't have to go through the State, then that would be great because you could, of course, decide and issue between now and late September. If it turns out that you can't and that you need to go through the State, I think there may be two options that are worth sort of pursuing. One is to . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Two ideas, one at the moment. Oh, I know. Yeah, of course. So, the first would be to see if there's any way that you can get the Governor to call the Legislature into emergency session, just even if it's just for this one purpose. Some states are already talking about doing that. A number of states are looking at possibly calling their legislatures into emergency session just to be able to make use of this facility before the time, so to speak, runs out. The second possibility, and these are not mutually exclusive, would be also to lobby the Feds to keep it open longer, right. I mean the currently scheduled September 30th closing date is just...that's just for now, right. And so, if there's...if it's extended further in terms of the terms of the instruments, in other words, if we move to three or five-year instruments, and if we move to sort of more and more availability or accessibility, the Fed would presumably want to extend outwards the sort of deadline as well and make that come later. But there's no reason we would have to wait for it to do that spontaneously. We could lobby them to do so. And maybe finally a third point just to emphasize is that the September date is just basically the date where they would stop, currently at least, where they would stop buying new issuances. The program and the SPV and all would continue on for, you know, at least two years since we're talking about two-year instruments. But so, what we're really talking about is how long is the window for selling new issuances open. And again, on that one I think we could lobby for that to...for it to stay open for longer if we had to. But maybe before that we could ask state legislatures to hold emergency sessions at least where the state has to decide because the counties or cities don't have their own authority to do it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Professor Hockett.

MR. HOCKETT: I feel . . .*(inaudible)*. . . I hope that was helpful. . .*(laughing)*. . .

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. It was. Okay, Members, any last comments or questions for Professor Hockett, Ms. Choi, Mr. Tierney, or Finance Director Teruya? Okay, seeing none, we'll thank Professor Hockett so much for joining us today and answering a lot of our questions. We really appreciated --

MR. HOCKETT: No...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --you provided...

MR. HOCKETT: Mahalo to you guys. Thank you so much. Happy to help anytime, okay. And truly an honor. I told David recently that you guys are my hero state, and I'll tell you why later, so I don't delay your lunch. But it's a special honor to be able to be of any help to Hawai'i in particular. So, thank you so much, you guys.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: We want to hear why we're the hero state.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Professor Hockett. . .*(laughing)*. . .

MR. HOCKETT: . . .*(laughing)*. . .Okay, mahalo. Thank you. See you soon.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Okay, Members, it is 11:42. We have a lot of work ahead of us. I will...if there are no objections, my plan is to reiterate some of the instructions for Members, and then we'll break for lunch. And then we'll proceed with Office of the County Clerk, followed by Office of Council Services, and so on. Any objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Okay, and I know I also didn't read the testifiers list that submitted written testimony. So, I can do that when we return from break, or I can save that for tomorrow morning.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, maybe County Clerk is fast, and we can do it before lunch? No?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: How many testimonies are there?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: About seven pages.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Wow.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

EDB-6: CONTRACTS NEGOTIATIONS AND COST ITEM PROPOSALS
(CC 20-45, CC 20-46, CC 20-208, and CC 20 209)

EDB-77: AMENDING FISCAL YEAR 2020 BUDGET: DEPARTMENT OF
POLICE (WAILUKU POLICE STATION FUEL TANK
REPLACEMENT) (CC 20-111)

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I can save it for tomorrow. It'll add a...because we get more and more written testimonies every day. And I'm trying my best to only read the unique testimonies, or testimony that we receive from individuals we haven't received previously. Okay, I'll go through the instructions that we'll be following, the process that we'll be following this week. I prefer to take lunch before we start to take up, or before we start discussing the offices and the departments so that once we start, we'll just continue. So, that's my preference. So, we have three items on today's agenda, EDB-1, Proposed Fiscal Year 2020 Budget for the County of Maui; EDB-6, Contract Negotiations and Cost Item Proposals; and EDB-77, Amending FY '20 Budget: Department of Police (Wailuku Police Station Fuel Tank Replacement). And it's...it'll be on every day's agenda until Thursday, all three items. Okay, so my updated memo dated April 16th indicated the process we'll follow for this week. For the benefit of the Members and the public, I will provide a brief recap. Members were given time last week Tuesday evening, Wednesday after our meeting concluded, and all day Thursday to compile their personal notes in preparation for proposed reductions this week. As a resource, Members were given a copy of Exhibit "1" with numbers from the Mayor's Proposed Budget. Today, I will be working off of an Exhibit "1" that incorporates all department proposed reductions that the department has presented and the Committee has discussed, and that the department provided follow-up information for...in the responses in red. And Members' priority proposals will be in blue. And further cuts and department is...and any further cuts that the department has proposed, but the Committee has not yet discussed will be in pink. That's the color code. And again, I'll have it. . .*(inaudible)*. . .the screen. That version of Exhibit "1" will be up on the screen as we work through each department's reduction. We'll work through each department's A, B, C Accounts, and CIPs, and Rates and Fees. And then if any Members' priority proposals in the same order as their review starting with the Office of County Clerk and work our way down in alphabetical order. Chair Lee also...so this part was not in the memo. It took some time to figure out. But Chair Lee and Member...Pro Temp Kama had requested swapping of priority proposals. And so, the process that we developed that I think will be fair is if Members withdraw any of their priority proposals, whether it's from their list of district priority proposals or Countywide priority proposals, they can have one item for Countywide. So, they can swap out from either list, but the swap will...must be to benefit the County-at-large, okay. Please make each amendment to be posed in the form of a motion and a second for approval. For all revisions made to the department's budget including allotted time for discussion, further individual reductions, and Members' proposals before each vote. At the same time, I also plan to bring up any proposed legislation as noted on the agenda related to the department's budget we are considering. Because this is decisions week, let's please all

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

remember to focus on that. This is the week we make hard decisions given the information we were provided so far amidst the uncertainty of available Federal and other grant funding, the \$5 million shortfall in RPT revenue, the TAT revenue from the State which unfortunately cannot be relied upon, and all while balancing the needs of our community in light of a worldwide pandemic. I recognize that this is not an easy task. In fact, this will be one of the most challenging budgets to date, but this is the job that we all signed up for, and I believe that we're all ready for. So, are there any questions regarding the process that we'll be following this week? Member Paltin, and then Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was wondering if we received the Exhibit "1" that you were speaking of. I couldn't find it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, that was sent to all Members, I think, last week Thursday.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: From EDB, or from you?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: From EDB.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, Member Molina, and then Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you very much, Madam Chair, for going over the instructions. I'm just kind of getting myself ready for the...for burning the midnight oil, so to speak. You know, Friday night we had a...quite a marathon. I think a 12, 13-hour marathon. This week you anticipate going past the normal, so-called work hour of 4:30, five o'clock? Any particular day you're looking at? I know today we're just doing Council Services, Clerk's and so forth, yeah. But I just want to prepare myself, so...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. So, my intention is to take up all the offices and departments that we had scheduled in the same order for the past two weeks. And if we're able to take up, you know, a department that was scheduled for the day after during our departmental reviews, then we'll take up that department. And we don't necessarily have to follow that order if we feel that, you know, it's four o'clock in the afternoon, and we don't want to take up, you know, a really large department like Department of Environmental Management. And instead we want to take up, you know, Department of Finance because we think we could, you know, work on that in an hour and a half, or two hours. Then we'll plan to do that. This is a new process.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, I'll really be, you know, today is going to be the experimental day to see how quickly we can move through.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Great.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then I'll be able to answer your question a little better.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you. And I appreciate the flexibility and, you know, be tough on us if you have to keep us on task. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Sinenci, and then Committee Vice-Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Budget Chair. Yeah, we were looking for some of the departments' reductions. They were starting to send them in. Would that be under EDB? We've been trying to locate those.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry. Can you repeat your question?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: We were trying to locate some of the departments' reductions that they were going to send in from last week.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: And have you seen it...go ahead.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, the...in the initial set of questions that we transmitted to the departments, it included Member Paltin and Member Hokama's question regarding a proposed 5 percent cut. So, that should...I'll ask Staff to confirm that we received all the departments' responses. And the question that I asked for, you know, departments to provide a list of, you know, items that, you know, that could be more than 5 percent so that it'll be a little easier for us, and we'll have that information so that we can make the hard decisions this week.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, but you had a Tuesday deadline for them . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, yes. Sorry, yeah, so the deadline was for tomorrow. Some of the departments responded already. But the deadline that I requested was for April 21st.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. I was kind of trying to figure out the information too. We did get Exhibit "1." We did get suggested cuts from the departments. I didn't see...I know that you had asked for and I didn't a separate listing of their priorities, like to say, these are the things that are priority that should not be cut. So, am I missing that or did that just not come in?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, that was the information that was requested by April 21st.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay. So, that might still be coming in. Because we got...I got the list of all the suggested cuts, and some of them were detailed, and some of them were just kind of...didn't even have dollars and amounts in them. But I also have seen since then a letter from the Mayor to the various departments asking them to prescribe a 10 percent cut for their departments. So, is that something that should be forthcoming too, or are we just working off of what we have so far?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We'll be working off of what we have so far.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

VICE-CHAIR KING: It's whatever was sent it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's Monday only and that's what . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, okay. I just wanted to make sure I wasn't missing something that might've come in. But I hadn't seen any...I saw the letter from the Mayor. I hadn't seen anything come in about it, or any suggested date when of he was asking for that amount, that 10 percent cut by. So, I just...I've got all the other stuff, and I'm just going to be working off of that then. And then on the...when you were saying that Members who eliminated one of their priorities can replace it with, is that like any priority you eliminate, you can propose a Countywide one? Or you're just proposing that we can each do one replacement?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, just one.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You'll have a...one opportunity to replace one of your priorities for a Countywide priority.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: You just answered my question. I was just wondering about that detail. So, I think in mine I'm going to be eliminating even another one so I might have three. But I can replace that with one Countywide, right. Is that what you're saying?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. So, you can withdraw an unlimited amount. But if you want to replace one with your withdrawing, you may.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay, and that will come up when we take up that department, correct?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay, any other questions or comments? Okay, seeing none. We'll break for lunch. It's 11:56, and we'll return at 1:00. Any objection?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, seeing no objections...Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, sorry, I was just waving at my husband who just walked in the door. I didn't have a question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay, no questions. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Hi, Bob.

VICE-CHAIR KING: He says hi. He's going to make me lunch.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aw...nice.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . lunch, Bob.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Will you make us all lunch, please.

VICE-CHAIR KING: He probably would.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: BLT.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(laughing)*. . .Mahalo, Mr. King. Okay, all right, Members, it's 11:56 on April 20th, and we will reconvene at one o'clock p.m. Okay. The Economic Development and Budget Committee is now in recess. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 11:56 a.m.
RECONVENE: 1:19 p.m.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the Economic Development and Budget Committee please return to order. It is 1:19 on April 20th, and we are starting. We're kicking off our decisions week with the first office, Office of the County Clerk followed by Office of Council Services, then the County Auditor, then Department of Corporation Counsel, and then Maui Emergency Management. Okay, so --

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --we received...Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. Again, I support your format how you want to go forward. I was just going to ask, this is one of the few times where, you know, along with Chairman Lee, I would ask that we might need to make some early considerations of revenue adjustments so that as we go through the various programs and departments, we can see how we kind of...where we stand financially as we move forward, Chair. Because, again, my thing is we've heard the difference in certification numbers, the impact of the TAT. We know there's going to be negative or reduced revenues from Water Department, Sewer Fund, Solid Waste Fund, Highway Fund. So...and then next year the projection is even less cash than this year. So, I would ask maybe that's something we need to talk about upfront so that we can make maybe a little bit more educated adjustment to the current budget proposal. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Okay. Oh, okay, and then we also have our County Clerk Ms. Kaohu on the line in case anyone has questions as we're going through. Ms. Kaohu, did you want to provide any comments on the reduction that we received this morning or...is self-explanatory?

**DECISIONS
OFFICE OF THE COUNTY CLERK**

MS. KAOHU: It's pretty much self-explanatory, and I apologize for the lateness and the Members not receiving it timely. It's just based on what is needed now and what is needed to get us through this most current election, and then planning for future elections will come after that. And so, there's still opportunity for that item to be considered. But it's something that's nice to have right now perhaps, but not gotta have. So, that was the first one to be trimmed off the list.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Kaohu. Okay. Okay, Members...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, me too.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I mean, you know, that's pretty simple, the first one.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Just quick question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you. So, the original one, the original list that we got, Ms. Kaohu, it said 50 percent travel reduction. And I think at one point, we had tried to make a consensus on 50 percent travel reduction across the board. So, are you proposing this in addition to the 50 percent travel reduction?

MS. KAOHU: At this point in time, I would like to keep the travel intact. I did go run some hard numbers for air, ferry, per diem, and lodging for the voter service centers on Lāna`i and Moloka`i, and those are pretty close numbers and pretty tight. The reason that we can't have it all volunteer from those community resident...

VICE-CHAIR KING: No, that's fine. That's fine. I'm just asking if you were still planning to because I'm not sure how our Council...that Chair wants to go ahead if we want to stick to that 50 percent or if we're going just department by department. So, you're basically saying you need all that travel to conduct...

MS. KAOHU: And I just want to add, the one for the Legislative side is more of a contingency in the event that we have a Council meeting or public hearing scheduled on...in one of those communities that requires travel and mobilization.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay. All right, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay. Okay, Members, so...you know what? I need a...I need to take a quick recess. Any objections to taking a quick recess at the call of the Chair?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Members. So, okay, it's 1:24. and we'll take a quick recess. Reconvene at the call of the Chair. The Economic Development and Budget Committee is now in recess . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 1:24 p.m.

RECONVENE: 1:33 p.m.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the Economic Development and Budget Committee please return to order. It is 1:33 on April 20th. Okay, so before we dive into the County Clerk's Office, we'll do a quick overview of the Mayor's proposed Budget as it was transmitted to us. And for everyone's benefit it is Page 35 in the Program Budget, Budget Overview. So, you'll see that the County funds, so that \$869 million is on the top left. So, not including Grant Revenue Fund and Revolving Fund, so exclusively County Fund is a total of \$869,834,609. Okay, and then under that, you'll see Operating is \$704,223,280. And then below is General Fund, and General Fund is the revenue that we receive from the property taxes, and that's \$483,235,064. And then it's broken out into the different funds. And then you'll see the Capital Improvement which is proposed to be \$165,611,329. And then General Fund here for CIPs. Bond Fund, Bikeway Fund, and the other Special Fund. And then at the bottom, Water. The Water Department is self-funded with water users. So, that's all rates. And that's both

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

Restricted Funds which is \$4.4 million and Unrestricted Funds at \$16.16 million. Okay, so that's...and then you'll see in the Revolving Fund and then Grant Revenue Fund, and then the breakdown of Operating and Capital Improvement there. So, now that we have kind of like a broad overview of all the different funds and how, you know, where the departments breakdown is, then we'll begin. So, we're starting with the County Clerk's Office. And the County Clerk, as we see, is...their proposed budget was \$2,053,140. And the Department has proposed to reduce their original budget by \$100,000 which is 4.87 percent of their budget, and the proposal is the mobile voting center. So, the mobile voting center for Lāna`i for the 2022 Elections, model for Maui County and State of Hawai`i in mobile voting opportunities. So, now I'll ask for consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Question. Question, please, Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. This would be for our Clerk, Ms. Kaohu. So, Ms. Kaohu, I understand your recommendation. I have no problems with it. I would agree with you during this unique times. So, I can support that. My question is, though, how can we continue to offer that, this was part of the approach to address one, Lāna`i District walk-in voting capabilities as well as how to deal with the...our aging community and the lack of Election volunteers. So, you have any comment how we're going to approach it for this Election then since, you know, we're going to do away with some of the things we had anticipated to do to keep voter numbers up?

MS. KAOHU: Well, we're still planning on having a voter service center on Lāna`i and Moloka`i. And on Lāna`i, it's going to be in the Police Station. We hope to use some of the CARES money to apply the protocols that we're all using right now, disinfectant, washing machines, masks, gloves, extra staff perhaps to clean the electronic voting machines.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay. Have you noticed a good increase in the amount of Lāna`i residents who have moved toward mail-in ballots versus regular voting options?

MS. KAOHU: You mean leading up to this election?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Like you would say...yeah, you could tell me like 50 percent of your total registered voters have all converted to mail-in ballots because they see the future. Or it's to their personal family scheduling benefit.

MS. KAOHU: Hold on. Let me...I have that information. Well, I'd have to actually extract that particular question. But I do have 33 percent...33.3 percent is your voter registration turnout as of the last election. So, that could be worked on as far as encouraging more voter participation.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, Clerk, you know, thank you, Ms. Kaohu. I understand what we need to do, but I appreciate your recommendations. So, I appreciate it. Thank you.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MS. KAOHU: And we hope...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank...

MS. KAOHU: Oh, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No...

MS. KAOHU: Another component of the CARES money will be for outreach for that type of thing.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Kaohu. Okay, and then Member Paltin had a question earlier. Member Paltin, did you want to ask your question?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was...I just printed out Exhibit "1" during the lunch break and I had a question. It looks like in each section it says, parenthesis 1 provided that disbursement for Salaries and Premium Pay is not restricted by Section 5. And I'm not sure what is meant by Section 5. Like what...Section 5 out of.

MS. KAOHU: Are you referring to the Details?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, I'm referring to Exhibit "1." I don't know if...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. I'm sorry.

MS. KAOHU: Okay. That's part of the Bill, an exhibit to the Bill?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. So, I'm not sure if I'm going to unrestrict it or not, because I'm not sure what Section 5 is.

MS. KAOHU: I am not sure either and let me ask my Deputy if he's aware of Section 5.

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, yes. Chair? I believe that's...oh, thank you. I believe that's just a reference to Section 5 of the General Budget Provisions, which means that if we're exempted from that, that means we're not going to have our E/Ps restricted by the Budget. I believe...that's my understanding. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's correct. Mahalo, Mr. Krueger. So, Section 5, and you'll see that throughout Exhibit "1" so it's not just under the County Clerk, yeah. And that's the Budget Provisions for each. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, just let me know if I run afoul.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay. All right. So, I already didn't do my process correctly. So, I'm going to start again. Okay. So, we're reviewing the County Clerk's Office. We're starting with the A, B, and C Accounts. Do Members have any proposed amendment to the County Clerk's Office for the A Account? If you do, raise your hand, and please say it in the form of a motion. I move to amend the County Clerk's A Account by reducing "x" amount of dollars. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, I do have a question for Kathy Kaohu regarding her A Account. Your part-time Admin person...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: ...*(inaudible)*...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Were you keeping your part-time Admin person?

MS. KAOHU: Is it...I thought it was a full-time person...position.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay, sorry.

MS. KAOHU: You're throwing me off, sorry. Yes, it is our intention to hold on to that position.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, okay, okay. Then I'm fine, A Account. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay, if there are no amendments to Account A, then we'll move on to Account B. Are there any amendments
--

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --to Account B? Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move that we amend Account B by \$114,000 less.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, where?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: B...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry, what line item, you want to take \$114,000 out of what line item in Account B?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, it's a little rough right now, but we're going to...once we get into our groove, it's going to flow. I know.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, you want me to read off what I have on my IBR sheet?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is it one line?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's 2-7, Budget Details, Index Code 902015B-6235, Rentals, \$30,000. And Budget Details, 2-9, 902056B-6235...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin? Member Paltin? If you can do one item at a time. So, in Budget Details, page?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Two-dash-seven.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Two-dash-seven. Which item?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Nine-zero-two-zero-one-five-B, 6235, Rentals, DOT's HGEA office space. And my...do you want to have my rationale or...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, say I move to reduce this item by...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, do you want to do the entire thing?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, just \$30,000 in this item.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I move to amend the Clerk's Office B Account, Rentals, by \$30,000. Is that the motion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, if we're taking it item-by-item, yeah, that's the first one. But if we --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --combine it, it's \$114,000. So, you want to go item-by-item?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, so that in case Members don't agree with reducing that item by \$30,000. So, we're going to have Staff now share Exhibit "1" so we all see what that looks like by reducing the \$30,000. So, we have a motion on the floor, and a second by Member Sugimura. Okay, Member Paltin, you have two minutes to explain your rationale for the proposal.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, this is for HGEA rental space that the DOT is going to be exiting. It's only half-a-year funding. So, we're kind of...by doing this, we're taking a step that's not really needed. It's nice to have, but it's not necessary, I believe. And if you looked at it, it's \$30,000 for half a year. So, next year we're kind of committed for \$60,000 when we already know our revenues are going to be smaller and coupled with just keeping everything status quo. That's going to be at least \$214,000 savings overall

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

between the County Clerk's and OCS. And I think while it's a nice thing to do, it's not something that we can afford at this time. I know that the Clerk had mentioned that the machine is too big, but it can be, you know, stored offsite when it's not Election time, and so on and so forth. So, you know, we gotta make deep cuts. I rather make cuts in unnecessary things than people because we already have so much employment and we're...unemployment, and we need to keep people working and paying their bills and, you know, now is the time not to expand, but rather consolidate our expenses.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And I don't need two minutes, I guess.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so each Member will have one minute to explain their position.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I just have a...can I just ask a question, Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Go ahead.

VICE-CHAIR KING: My question is, you're reducing by \$30,000, you're leaving \$10,000 in there. So, what's the \$10,000 going to be used for?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Ten...\$30,000 is the expansion request. So, \$10,000 is probably rental that they already use for whatever reason. But \$30,000 was the expansion for the HGEA site so I...

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, you're good with the \$10,000. You just want to take out the 30.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think the \$10,000 is necessary. Okay, mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. And we'll go to Pro Temp Kama. You have one minute.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, if we don't...if we cut this particular item, we're saying that the Clerk's Office doesn't need the space. Is that correct, Member Paltin?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: To me it's just. . .*(inaudible)*. . .that it's status quo. It's going to be the same as it's been all this time. And it'll continue to be the same. You know, the...Robert...Mr. H this morning was saying that it could be three to five years out that

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

we're seeing like hard times. So, I don't want to lock us into double of what these numbers are for next year when we already know it's going to be a bigger...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Zero.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. So, just maintaining the status quo.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Paltin.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Member Sugimura, you have one minute.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Concur.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Very concise. Mahalo. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I would like to ask the County Clerk, Ms. Kaohu. You know, she has the \$30,000 under Clerk's Division, and then she has her \$84,000 under Elections. So, if she could give us some comment since she has it for two different program areas, her request for additional space at the David Trask Building.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Kaohu?

MS. KAOHU: Yes. The Liquor Commission space is being considered for the Elections Division. And then the Department of Transportation space is being the considered for the Legislative Division within the Clerk's. Elections has a very expensive counting and sorting machine that was just acquired and right now it's in our warehouse over by the airport, State warehouse. And...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, if we support you, because we understand the transitioning for Elections, yeah, with the potential mailing of ballots impacts and other things, why wouldn't it work where we, if we supported your Elections expansion request for HGEA, and then Elections leaves the 7th Floor. Wouldn't that give the Legislative side enough space?

MS. KAOHU: It would. There's some gaps in the information that I have as far as reasoning for that that I still haven't found an answer to. I'm not sure what the full master plan is for this side and whether that includes components of the Clerk's Office.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: And I appreciate that, Ms. Kaohu. But, you know, for right now, master planning is pretty out the window for me since right now I'm reacting to the virus. So, I'm just looking at how to make the operations run smoothly for good service without getting too much ahead of ourselves with master planning and resource commitments, if you can appreciate my position. So, thank you, Chair. I'm okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Chair Lee?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Boy, I just love this machine.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair Lee, you've been unmuted.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I'm trying to...my computer. I need a new computer when we're finished with the COVID problems. You know, we actually do need those spaces at HGEA. And what I guess Ms. Kaohu is not saying is, we need that 7th Floor for the expansion of OCS and Council Services. So, you know, we're tired of meeting...as a Legislative body we have like one conference room upstairs, and this is just inadequate. So, I almost wish we started with the big departments first because they got millions of fat to cut. This one that we're starting with, I mean we're getting down into the weeds. She doesn't have fat. You know, she might have a little bit potential savings here and there, but she really doesn't. And I wish you didn't even offer up the \$100,000. But since you're offering up, what, \$114,000 now, is it? Is that 114? Is that the motion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . me just...she told me to take it one at a time. So, the first one will be \$30,000 and the second one would be \$84,000. I went through every department and I trimmed all everything that I could. So, I wasn't discriminating against the County Clerk. I got...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I know. I know. I understand that, but don't forget, the County Clerk is super, super important this year and in the next few years when we have elections. So, what is the total, 85 and 34? Is that it? That's what you're going to be proposing?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Two-hundred-fourteen-thousand is the total with all the cuts on my worksheet. The \$100,000 Lāna`i voter center, \$84,000 for the Liquor Control space, and \$30,000 for the Transportation space. So, total of \$214,000 from this Department for me is what I'm proposing.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Well, I'm going to vote no on that 'cause I don't agree. I don't think we should make her office bare bones. I wish we would skip this one and go to the big ones, and you'll see where you can cut, you know, like millions out of their budgets. This one is like pennies. So, I'm voting no on this.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, Madam Chair, I'm all in the lines with Member Lee. This Department is really small and, you know, that's just my take on it. But, yeah, I think we gotta target the bigger departments. There is a lot of big CIP that can be deferred and make the cuts there. So, I really would...I appreciate Member Paltin, though, trying, you know, to make cuts where they're needed. And so, in principle I agree with her on that. But for this particular Department because they're so small, my feeling is I'm like Member Lee. I'd like to just leave them alone with their original \$100,000 cut that they proposed. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Sinenci?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I appreciate everyone's discussion on the topic. You know, I just wanted to be...remind the Members, too, that we've also got some of our communitywide and district proposals. So, on top of the reductions, we're also proposing additional funds into each of the departments as well. And so, while we're cutting, they're reducing theirs, we're adding additional funds to their Operating costs too. So, yes, I mean I'm okay at looking at some of the larger ones, and then if we gotta go ahead and really tweak the numbers, you know, just to keep some of these on the back burner. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay. Okay, and I'll also be voting against the proposal. Okay. So, really quickly. I'm sorry I didn't outline this. And I know this is a much bigger overview discussion, and it's...and we're going straight into the weeds and trimming what we can. But if Members can look at what the total amount that you've cut, or that you're proposing to cut, to see, you know, how that compares. So, what was transmitted to us from the Mayor, is \$870 million, right. And we've asked the departments to reduce their budget by 5 percent, so that's about \$43 million. And so, you know, \$870 million, you know, minus the 43 million that, you know, we would be getting if everyone gave us their, you know, like 5 percent cut. And so, we would end up with a \$827-ish million budget. So, if we're putting in more than the 5 percent that we asked the department to propose to us, you know, how much further do you think, you know, we're going to take the total budget down? I guess that's kind of...that was kind of my approach to it. So, but, you know, I figured each Member could, you know, look at it and see how they would be approaching it. So, everyone had an opportunity to discuss Member Paltin's motion to reduce the County Clerk's budget in B Account by \$30,000 which would remove the rentals...rental expansion proposal. Okay. And I'll call...

VICE-CHAIR KING: I have a question. I have a question, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'll call for the question. Is it regarding...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Process.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: ...*(inaudible)*... Okay. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: This is regarding process. Because I'm just wondering, we're going to...are we going to, after we go through this and go through Revenues, get another chance to either add or cut again depending on what happens with the Revenues side?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, this is it. We...this is...we just...we have this week.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, because if we make too many cuts, then I guess we're just going to reduce the revenues. Is that the idea?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right. So, last year, like you said, our budget was a program-driven budget. This year's circumstances is a lot different than last year. We will still

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

be doing our programming first, and then adjust the revenues after. But we're really taking a look at what we, as a Council, feel our priorities and what can be deferred for a year, or two. So, that's the hard decisions that we're making right now, which is why I've asked Members to put their proposals in the form of a motion so that we can vote on it. So, if Members feel like this is too high of a priority, then we would vote no.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, I just...the hard thing is that you had asked the departments to give us what their top priority was, you know. And we got the cuts, but we didn't get from the departments, you know, these items are top priority. So, we're going to be going through and making our own priorities.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right. Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm going to call for the question. All those in favor of Member Paltin's motion, please say, "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right, so that was Member Paltin, Committee Vice-Chair King, Member Sugimura, Member Sinenci. Okay, so there's four "ayes." Okay, those opposed, please say "no."

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: He said no.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, no, he's muted. Oh, he's muted that's why maybe I didn't...that's why I didn't hear.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No, I'll be voting "no" at this time.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

stay there. And if we gotta move the Legislative portion of people, maybe we should move them to the new service center so they don't have to pay rent. And, you know, it kind of worked better when it was the two together because now the County Clerks are going to be moving between two buildings to, like, I don't know how it's going to work when you have to turn in your things, your amendments, and such. So, and the whole package of it was going to be like cutting also 100 grand from OCS for the redesign of the 7th Floor. So, that would've been, like I had said before, \$214,000. But taking it one at a time, it's kind of piecemeal, \$30,000 here, \$84,000 there. And really, it's not the time to be expanding and spending more money. You know, if we can put this off for one year, who knows, maybe the rents will go down because, you know, of the situation with the virus. But that's my case, you know. I think it works well as it is. This past year there's been so many vacancies on the OCS side. There were so many empty cubicles, walking through there all the time. You know, there's empty space, empty space, empty space. And I think we can deal with it for, you know, another couple years and see if the rents come down and things like that. So, I realize that, you know, it seems nitpicky, but I went nitpicky through each department that I was able to, and I think if we do make the big multi-million-dollar cuts as well as the hundred thousands here and there, then we might have some time for our priorities. And I don't really think that we can raise the rent...or property tax on short-term rental when we're shutting them down like for however long this crisis lasts. So, I just was, you know, I was in slash mode. I don't know if that was my two minutes, but I'm done.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, sorry, it's really quiet. I don't know if the timer...alarm's quiet.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I didn't...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I know. It was quiet. Member Paltin, your third proposal, does it go together with that second proposal?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, it's in the other department. It's in the OCS department but it's related, but it's not in this department.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so we'll take the... 'cause you have two more. This is your second one. And you have a third one. And then...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, the first one was the one that we had consensus on in the start. I don't know if you want...it was the \$100,000 I proposed that --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --before . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Got it. Okay, Members, so that was Member Paltin's rationale. Committee Vice-Chair King, you have one minute.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, I just want to say that I agree. I mean I'm looking at this thing as a holistic project of expansion. I don't think this is the right time for us to be expanding 7th or 8th floor. And so, I'm going to support Member Paltin's proposal because I think we have to start...we're in critical mode here, and we got to hold the line. And I see other priorities out in the community that I want to make sure that we're able to fund when we get there. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, and then we'll go to Member Sinenci. One minute.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I'm supportive. If we can find alternative areas to store some of the voting equipment, then I'm in favor of saving these funds. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I support.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member...Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I vote no because we can't expect the Administration to take the Legislative Branch to the service center. They prioritize their departments first, so that's why, you know, it would be nice if they would take our offices, County Clerk...County Clerk's Office over there, but that's not going to happen. So, if we want to save our place in the queue at HGEA, we have to have the money. So, I'll vote "no."

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you. I support the need for Elections to get their additional space. I'm similar like Chair Lee. The Legislative component of Clerk's needs to be closely attached and in near proximity to the Council itself. So, I don't support the Leg side relocating.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I support the motion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And, Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Chair, I'll be voting against the motion. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, mahalo, Members. I'll also be voting against the motion. Okay, so I'll call for the question. All those in favor, please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Aye.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, all those oppose, say “no.”

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No. Okay, so I think that was six “ayes,” three “noes,” Chair Lee, Member Hokama, and myself?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I was a no.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And Tasha.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, and Member...Pro Temp Kama. Okay, so that was 5-4. Chair Lee, Pro Temp Kama, Member Hokama, and myself. Okay, and the motion passes.

**VOTE: AYES: Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Molina,
Paltin, Sinenci, and Sugimura.**

**NOES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, and Councilmembers
Hokama, Kama, and Lee.**

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, we'll bring up Exhibit “1.” Staff will bring up Exhibit “1,” and we'll make that amendment in Exhibit “1” in real time so that we know that it's done as intended. Okay. . . .(inaudible). . . is up. And, oh there's the \$84,000. Okay, so there's the...so if you see Row 76, decrease Rentals by \$84,000. Okay. And that can now be. . .(inaudible). . . Okay. Okay, Member Paltin?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just wanted...I mean I just wanted to point out that how weird the outcome is that the Clerks who deal with the Chamber are now going to be at the Trask Building. And the Legislative section is going to stay here so the Clerks like Joyce and Lauren they are going to be walking across the street and getting to the Chamber. But the Legislative side is like...so three or four of 'em are going to be at the Trask Building and then everybody else...I just...I don't know. It seems kind of weird.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, we'll take up the last item, which was proposed by the Department for the \$100,000 reduction of the Mobile Voting Center. I'll entertain a motion to approve the amendment.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura, are you --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I'll, I'll do the motion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --going to make the motion? Okay, moved by Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, I'll do the motion. You want me to go through the whole thing, page number and everything? You need it?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, that's okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. So, so moved.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, I need...well...okay, moved by Member Sugimura. I'll need a second.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, is this the original cut that they offered up? I thought we did consensus on that already.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, we're just going to do the motion, and we're just going to take the vote.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, I'll --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Second.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --second it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Like I said, we're starting again so that we can follow the process correctly. Okay, seconded by Member Paltin. All those in favor please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any opposed? Okay, motion passes unanimously.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Molina, Paltin, Sinenci, and Sugimura.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, now we're moving to Office of Council Services. Okay, oh sorry, and then we have Exhibit "1," and you'll see there that it's been reduced by \$100,000, the County Clerk's Office budget. Okay, so and there's no CIPs and there's no rates and fees for the Clerk's Office, so we're moving onto the next.

OFFICE OF COUNCIL SERVICES

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And Office of Council Services, and we'll start with Account A. In Account A, the Director proposed deleting Deputy Director by \$139,246; delete Council Service Aide by \$47,088; 2 percent salary increases for Council Aides, Councilmembers, Director, Supervising...and that's all the A's. Okay, and...so OCS, the total budget for the Office of Council Services is \$9 million...\$9,356,149, and the total amount that was proposed by the Department to reduce the budget was \$771,334 which is 12.13 percent of the budget. Okay. So, I will entertain a motion to approve the first three proposals --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So moved.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --by the Director.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Moved by Member Paltin, seconded by Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Could you repeat the first three again, sorry, Chair.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And for the second...for the third item under Account A, is the, recognizing the increase to Council Aides, Councilmembers, Director, and Supervising Attorney, to increase by \$29,414.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So moved.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, moved by Member Paltin. And I'll need a second for discussion.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, I don't have a second yet, but I have a question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We're in the middle of a motion.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, I just don't understand where the motion's coming from 'cause I don't see it on this list of the OCS pay cut...the cuts that they offered up.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Because it's not a, it's not a reduction. It's an increase in recognizing the 2 percent increase that the Salary Commission voted on.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, oh, okay, so it's not a decrease.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right. So, Ms. DesJardins?

MS. DESJARDINS: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Okay, so I understand everyone's concern. And there's no second to the motion. So, right now, there's no motion on the floor. Okay. Ms. DesJardins, can you explain what authority the Salary Commission has over the Councilmembers'...setting salaries for the Councilmembers?

MS. DESJARDINS: For the Councilmembers?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MS. DESJARDINS: So, the Salary Commission under Chapter 17, Section 8-17.1, the Commission determines the compensation for elected officials and appointed directors and deputy directors of all the departments. So, are you asking me...I know there's been some discussion about the salary for your director to be on par with the other directors...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, this is for the . . .(inaudible) . . .

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No, no, no.

MS. DESJARDINS: So, the Salary Commission...I'm sorry.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, you're right. It's just the Councilmembers.

MS. DESJARDINS: Right, right. No, so the Salary Commission doesn't set the salaries for the Councilmembers, just for the departments, the appointed directors and deputy directors. Is that what you're asking me?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I thought...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I thought Chair was asking Corporation Counsel if the Commission had jurisdiction over Councilmembers' salary and increases.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That is...yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Correct, yes.

MS. DESJARDINS: Right. So, I'm saying that the...yeah, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: And what is your answer, please?

MS. DESJARDINS: So, looking at the Charter, no, the Salary Commission does not have jurisdiction over the Councilmembers' salaries, only over the elected officials and appointed directors and deputy directors of the department. Is that your understanding?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We're elected officials, though.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: For 23 years, they've been setting the Members' salary.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, that's correct.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

MS. DESJARDINS: Well, you know, yeah, yeah, you're right. I'm so sorry. Yeah, you're an elected official, sorry. I'd received an earlier discussion about something having to do with the directors and deputies. But if you look at this, the Commission shall determine the compensation of elected officials and appointed directors and deputy directors of all departments of the County. So, yes, you are...your salary is also determined by the Salary Commission.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair? Question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. DesJardins. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. Ms. DesJardins, so if the...I understand the Commission makes recommendations, but is the Council obligated to fund those raises? Because I have some...I have concerns about us increasing our salaries when other people are getting pay cuts and losing their jobs. So, I understand that they made a recommendation, but I'm not in favor of funding that right now at this time. So, do we have that authority?

MS. DESJARDINS: Well, when I read the Charter, it looks to me like it's saying that they "shall" determine the compensation of elected officials. So, I don't --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Right.

MS. DESJARDINS: --know how you would get around what they determine. So, if they voted in a 2 percent increase, then...

VICE-CHAIR KING: But we have to fund that increase. So, if we decided not to fund it, then the increase doesn't happen. Isn't that correct?

MS. DESJARDINS: Well, you know, I mean the way I'm reading it is that they determine it and you have to fund it. I mean, that's the way it works under the Charter. It's not you guys get to decide whether or not you want to go along with what the Salary Commission determined.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. DesJardins. So, the Salary Commission has the sole authority to set salaries for Councilmembers and even if Councilmembers do not fund this addition to the Office of Council Services. Then that means there will be a shortfall in the Budget because OCS will still need to pay Councilmembers that amount. So, by not putting the 2 percent for Councilmembers' salaries into the Budget, we're not saying we're not taking it. We're shooting ourselves in the foot by not putting the appropriate amount into the Budget. But that's what would happen so we have to put it in. Member Paltin, and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Ms. DesJardins, you know, a few years back when we had binding arbitration and there were some Councilmembers threatening not to fund that, how is this different when we went through binding arbitration for Unit 14,

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

I believe? And then they said that if we don't fund this, then it would go to...then we wouldn't get our raises. How is this different than that situation?

MS. DESJARDINS: You know, I don't know the specifics, okay, of what you're talking about. If you had binding arbitration, off the top of my head, I'm going to tell you that if that's what you're told the salaries are going to be, you have to budget for that. But what I...all I can do is tell you that when I read the Charter, it's mandatory, okay. So, I don't know that I can really help you with that analogy, Ms. Paltin. All I can say is that when it says that it shall determine the compensation, then that what's you're going...you need to budget for that.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. DesJardins. So, that's civil service union contracts versus elected officials which is mandated in our County Charter. So, that's contract law versus Charter law. Okay, Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair. And I also think that it's hard for us to accept a raise when everybody around us...just today I got, well, last week and this, I got two friends that just lost jobs that I never thought they would because of the visitor industry. And the trickle-down effect is pretty deep. So, this is my question to Corp. Counsel, is that I wonder if we can go back to the Salary Commission and ask them not to give us the 2 percent what...it was a cost of living allowance, I think, the increase, and it's to be effective January 1, 2021, so next year, not for this year. And so, I just wondered if we could go back and say that, you know, under the circumstances that would they reconsider and, you know, not give it to us if that's what the majority would rule. But that's my heartfelt position that we are right now where it's hard for us to take a pay raise when everybody else is having a hard time feeding their families, you know. It's such a different situation. So, can you find out if we can do that?

MS. DESJARDINS: You know, yeah, and, you know, but just for today and like what you guys have to deal with in terms of passing this Budget, the Charter says what it says. I don't think there's anything that says you couldn't donate 2 percent of your salary back to the General Fund if you really didn't want to get a raise. I mean, but, right now going back and talking about what the Salary Commission can and cannot do in the future isn't going to help you do what you need to do right now to pass a balanced budget according to the law, yeah. I mean I hear what you're saying but --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MS. DESJARDINS: --from the legal point of view.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay, and that's what Chair was just saying. So, thank you.

MS. DESJARDINS: Yeah, exactly.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, yeah. I know I completely hear all the, you know, comments that the Members are making. Pro Temp Kama, then Member Molina.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, Ms. DesJardins, is there a way for us to make the motion to approve the Budget, and if the Council agreed, to give back that 2 percent? Could we do that in a motion?

MS. DESJARDINS: I don't know.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: And give back.

MS. DESJARDINS: Yeah, I don't know about that.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: What Ms. DesJardins is saying is that you would receive that amount in your paycheck, and if you wanted to donate it back to the County, is that what you're saying, Ms. DesJardins?

MS. DESJARDINS: Yes, exactly. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. DESJARDINS: But to do a motion for all of you folks to do that? I don't know that that's...it's kind of like off-point. But you certainly could donate 2 percent increase back to the General Fund, I would imagine. There's nothing to stop you from doing that. Each individual person who believes that that's what appropriate. But in terms of balancing your Budget and adopting something that's going to balance, you got to follow the law.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. Well, thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. DesJardins.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, it wouldn't be reflected in the FY '21 Budget. If you want to give the County back the 2 percent, you would have to receive it and then donate it back to the County. Okay. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you very much, Madam Chair. Question for Ms. DesJardins, as we move along in this process, built into this budget are the pay increases that the Salary Commission previously approved for directors, and I believe, the Mayor. Is that something that we have to also build into the budget, or is this strictly the Mayor choosing to make a decision to ask his directors not to accept their pay increase? How would that work in this case?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Desjardins?

MS. DESJARDINS: Right now, you're...I'm sorry, Chair. You're going to follow the law, and you're going to...if there were...if the Salary Commission approved or, you know, recommended salary increases, you're going to go with that. Whether or not later you want to make adjustments to folks' salaries is separate, in my view of what you have to do. I don't know if that answers your question or not. But I would be cautious to get too involved right now in how you're going to make this pono, if that's how individuals

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

are feeling about this, and just follow along with what the law requires you to do. The salaries of directors, deputy directors, elected officials...

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Yeah, and that was kind of what the basic question I'm asking. I mean what scope of authority do we have to fund the increases for the directors as recommended by the Salary Commission? So, that's kind of what I'm thinking along the lines as we move through this process. But thank you for your input and appreciate any insight from you down the road as we, you know, move on to the other departments as to...as it relates to this question. Thank you very much, Madam Chair, and thank you, Ms. DesJardins.

MS. DESJARDINS: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. So, again we're required by law to fund the increases as set forth by the Salary Commission. And if the department directors and deputy directors want to donate that money back to the County after they receive it, then that is their prerogative. That is under their authority to do. But they must...the County must pay them that because that is what the Salary Commission set. Mahalo, Member Molina. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. You know, we're not voting on all of the Mayor's increases, if we don't vote to take them out, they stay in. So, we don't really need to vote on this, right? It's...if we...I mean we don't need to vote to do the increase. The increase is in the Budget that we're looking at.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It was...whatever is already proposed in what was transmitted to us.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah. So, we don't need that. My point was we don't need that motion. But the other thing I just wanted to mention is that anybody who wants to, could also donate that 2 percent back directly to where it could do the most good, if it's not the General Fund, we could donate our money back to any of the social services that need the help.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, so I'm waiting to hear back from the Director because the amount that was proposed are lumped together. So, the Councilmembers' salaries, we don't have a choice. We're mandated to fund the 2 percent. The Council Aides, Director, and Supervising Attorney are not mandated by law, okay. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, Chair, thank you for your comment as well as Corporation Counsel. I would agree we need to follow whatever is by contract, by law, by Charter, and if anything, it'll be part of hopefully some savings throughout the year for

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

reapplication. But I make a motion to amend under Category A, Council Services, to delete the increases for the Director, Supervising Legislative Attorney, and Legislative Attorneys --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --so that would be a \$2,932 for the Director; \$2,700 for the Supervising Attorney; and \$5,238 for Legislative Attorneys.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Moved by Member Hokama, seconded by Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair, thank you. I'm asking the Members for their consideration for a couple of things. One, we already gave the adjustments to pay when we hired them. Council, I cannot recall when we gave annual step increases like collective bargaining personnel. We...you know, we never approached it this way in my 20 years of service as well as I don't see our Director as equal to an Administrative director's position. So, as far as pay compensation, I think we're getting very off track. I think we need to understand the role of Council Services and its unique employee status and adjust accordingly. But I'm not into following collective bargaining for our employees. If they want, they can apply and become a civil servant in another area. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Sugimura? You have one minute.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, as I said earlier when we were talking about the other positions is now is not the time. We need to tighten our belts and make tough decisions and when it comes in my turn, I'm going to even take a cut in my office. So, that's how serious I think these times are. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay. We'll go to Pro Temp Kama, and then work our way left. Pro Temp Kama, you have one minute.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I support Member Hokama's proposal. But I also want to know from you, Chair, when is it that you're going to ask whether or not we're going to withdraw our priorities? I'm not sure, so you can let me know that. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. If you e-mailed me your withdrawals, then I have withdrawn them. If you've asked for an amendment to your priority proposals, then I'm leaving it in your hands. And then I'll call it up when we get to the appropriate account in the department. And if you...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No, I just want to withdraw all of my priorities from the Office of Counsel Services. So, I'll go ahead and shoot you an e-mail regarding that, okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Okay, and we'll go to Chair Lee.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. I know you...I notice you're going from Pro Temp Kama down the line after you've already heard from Yukimura...Sugimura, and Hokama. So, which circle are we going in because somehow I get missed, you know? You know, like the abandoned vehicles.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I got skipped too, Alice. So...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, anyway, Member Paltin. So, Member Paltin, Chair Lee, Member Molina, Member Sinenci, and then Committee Vice-Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For my one minute, I just gotta say that I'll support the motion. I don't support the comments. I just don't support raises for anybody at this moment. And everyone that I'm not legally required to give raises, I won't be giving raises. I also hope that we don't cut folks' salary or lay folks off yet just because the outside industries. I've done that so much. So, I'm not supporting the sentiment. I'm just supporting the motion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. I understand what everybody's saying, but I do not support the motion because one of the reasons why we have a hard time keeping our people is that we're not competitive. And when I say that it's because these people have no job security, so they can't be really compared to...to civil servants or other types of jobs. You know, it's like you have job, if you're lucky, for two years. I mean if you don't get fired in the meantime. So, you serve at will, hopefully you have two years, but there's no guarantees. And so, I do support the raises, and I do support...I know it's probably the worst time for it to happen, but I still support the raises because I know what our employees go through. Thank you.

. . .(timer bell ringing). .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, perfect timing. Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay, and then we'll go to Member Molina, Member Sinenci, and then Committee Vice-Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. Tough one and I appreciate the arguments on both sides from Mr. Hokama and Ms. Lee. But so, we live in a real unprecedented time if you will, a lot of folks are hurting. So, I'll support Mr. Hokama's motion. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I just had a clarification for Mr. Hokama. Where was those raises in the Budget? Or if he could just repeat.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I think you would find them under Sub-Account 5250, Mr. Sinenci. That would be under the Account number 901041A, under the Council Services budget.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, Sub-Account 5250.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's Page 3-7.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you. Okay, and then, Chair, I just had a question for you. Did we get a list of Ms. Fujita's reductions?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We did.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I know you had a...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We did.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: We did? That was sent to us. Okay, I'll look for that.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's on Granicus. She submitted that.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's also listed in the presentation that she gave us that day. She was. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . . she already had all these proposals in the presentation.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, thank you, Chair. I'll look for those prior to the vote. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay, Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. I support the proposal because I agree that we...this is really tough times, and we should not be...I was really disappointed that we had to take a raise. You know, I think all of us should be staying the course, and are lucky to have jobs. But I also think that we worked really hard at the beginning of this term to bring those salaries up to where they should've been, and we got people caught up who hadn't gotten raises in several terms. And then we've been bringing them in at pretty high levels, you know, from what I've been seeing and the interviews I've been doing. So, you know, my thought, my idea was that we would try to hold the line on as many pay increases because, you know, and I understand the argument about not having job security. We used that argument in the beginning of the term too to get those salaries up. But I think we're all in a position where we kind of have to take a little bit of a hit. So, you know, not that I don't think there's good people that probably deserve raises.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then we'll bring up Exhibit "1" to reflect the adjustments to Member Hokama's motion as well as the 2 percent increases for Councilmembers.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: What? We have to vote again?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, no, no. I'm just showing...in real time, this is what it looks, the Exhibit "1." This is what it looks like for everyone.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, I see.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: If you're following along on your own hard copy, if you would like to make adjustments for your own notes, here is what it will look like.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Right. So, Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, my motion to amend was to delete the Director, Supervising Leg. Attorney, and Leg. Attorneys, just those three. I don't think I added the Council Aides. I forgot to do that, but you know I failed to make that clear to the Committee, yeah. I did not add component 3, the \$11,604.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is that a motion?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Well, first it was...more I have a question of clarification. Is that for the Committee's understanding, Chair, the three District Aides, or is this three Aides on the 7th Floor? I just wanted to be clear which aides we were talking about, please.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I don't know if Ms. Fujita is on the call. Ms. Fujita?

MS. FUJITA: Yes, I'm here.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Did you hear Member Hokama's question?

MS. FUJITA: Yes. So, the...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

MS. FUJITA: The increase is for the District Office Staff. They were what we discussed during the Chair's meeting, the last Chair's meeting.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, so this takes them back to January 2, 2019?

MS. FUJITA: No, no, no. These would take effect July 1st. This is for...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Because my understanding is Ms. Fernandez and Miss...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oliveira-Medeiros.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I apologize. Yes, our East Maui person, they got both confirmed on January 2, 2019. I feel they should've been adjusted too then. So, how can you defend telling me you're going to pay them two different scales when we never agreed to different pay scales, Director?

MS. FUJITA: I tried to keep everything fair, and all of these salary increases that were proposed were to take effect on July 1st, out of fairness to all the staff.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, why did Lāna`i and East Maui then get, you know...I don't begrudge the Moloka`i employee. I just want to know why we're not being fair in application of the three District Offices.

MS. FUJITA: Well, actually I was wondering...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . got higher seniority.

MS. FUJITA: I was the one that brought that actually to the Chair's attention when I realized that the other two District Office Staff weren't receiving the same salary as the other offices. I brought it to the attention of the Chair and asked that it be placed on the Chair's meeting agenda. I try to be as fair as possible.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: 'Cause I don't know what to tell my...our employee on Lāna`i why she's not getting an adjustment.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: She is.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: She was supposed to.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: For...yeah, as we go forward. But nothing was adjusted from the retro, right. Since when did we get differentials on District Office pay? Never, till now.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin, and then Committee Vice-Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I didn't have a comment. I thought we dealt with this in the Chair's meeting and so, I don't know what we're still talking about. It's not millions of dollars.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you. I think what we did in the Chair's meeting is we talked about the salary for the West Maui District seat going forward. And then we said, why should that be higher. So, then we brought all the other three up. So, at the point of the next July 1st, my understanding is then they'll be at the same salary.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's correct. That is correct. Council Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, not the other three, the other two. The two that were behind were Lāna`i and Hāna, right.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, that's right. Because...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's correct.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Lāna`i and Hāna. So, we wanted to bring them on par with the rest because those two haven't had raises, I don't know, since over ten years. I think 11 years ago.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair...Council Chair Lee. I have a question for Member Hokama. So, I...you know, many of us just got to the Council. So, who was responsible for ensuring that Ms. Fernandez did get a step increase?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: We did it annually, Budget and the Council Chair's Office is the overall administrative officer for us. So, the Council Chair would normally look for consistency in application to all the District Offices. And we've always paid the same. I have no problem to make appropriate adjustments. But my thing is, we apply it to everybody at the same time. That's all I'm saying, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I see. Mahalo for the explanation. And so, step increases for the Lāna`i District Office Aide was never considered?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Not in my 20 years, Chair. The only thing that Lāna`i did differently is we went to...we split one full-time position into two part-timers whereby we gave two people employment, part-time in employment. But we stayed within the same maximum amount as one position of the other two District Offices.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Hokama. So, the length of time that any District Aide was there was never considered for a step increase?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No, not...was also taken in same consideration when we looked at the rest of the Council Services staff.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Hokama, for that explanation. Okay, Members, I think everyone had an opportunity to speak to this motion. So, we will now vote on it.

VICE-CHAIR KING: What is the motion?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The motion is to remove the \$11,000 for the Council Aides. And that the Council Aide is the District Office Aide. So, the East Maui District Office Aide and the Lāna`i District Office Aide. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, Chair, just so we're clear, yeah, this request for \$11,000 more is what it currently would take if we add this \$11,000, to pay for our 3 current District employees? Is that how...Chair Lee, you see that? We need this money to pay what we already committed to pay the three District --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We have four District Offices.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --staff?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's correct.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Oh, four.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Four.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, the West Maui position is at the rate as the Moloka`i District Office. The Lāna`i and East Maui District Offices are the same. And so, this is the difference to bring them up to the West Maui and the Moloka`i District Office.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, so...oh, okay. I'm just going that, you know, the proposal is for three. So, I'm like you. I can count to two, but I couldn't count to three.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, no, the \$11,000 is for the 2.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, I just went off the sheet. It says for three.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. I see, I see.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, we're not deleting anybody, right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, no, that's why I'm asking for the clarification, Chair Lee. I just couldn't connect the dots.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, the motion...

VICE-CHAIR KING: There's no motion. There's no motion?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: He was just asking for clarification. Riki, were you just asking...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, because I never included that in my first amendment because I wasn't sure if that was the 7th Floor staff, or District Office staff. But now I know. It's District.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have a motion, if no one else wants to make one.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, it's in already.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move that we delete \$25,000 from the A Account, Page 3-4 of the Budget Details, 901041 for the Sergeant-of-Arms position. Seeing as all Councilmembers got a 2 percent raise, they should be able to chair their meetings more effectively.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Second.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Take self-defense classes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Motion by Member Paltin, second by Member Sugimura. All those in favor, please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Aye.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Did anyone need --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --to discuss? Okay, motion passes unanimously.

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and
Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Molina,
Paltin, Sinenci, and Sugimura.**

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. Member...okay, Member Molina, did you have an amendment to OCS Account A?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, just...I'm sorry, Madam Chair, A Account. Yeah, well, I have considerations for the premium pay, and the Council inauguration, and Members' accounts. Members' accounts will come under A, yeah?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: B.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Oh, B?

VICE-CHAIR KING: I thought it was B.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: A, yeah? Is that A for Councilmembers' accounts, yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I think it's B. I think it's A, B, and C.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, well, Madam Chair, I'll go ahead and make my proposal anyway, and you tell me if it's out of line. Let me know. Okay, this is under Index Code 901400 to 408, Member office budget, proposed reduction of \$148,869.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Second.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: What?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, no. This is, yeah, Madam Chair, if I could explain. Again, this is I guess the proposed increase, right, that we're considering. And just basically, to keep the funding levels for Council offices at FY 2020 amounts. And again, this is trying to keep in line with reductions. I just throw it out there for a conversation, and we'll see where we go because again, if we're looking at reductions from all departments and salary increases, and so forth, I feel we should at least just talk, discuss this. And see if we want to go in that direction, Madam Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can I have clarification?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, I was going to ask the same. Okay, go ahead, Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, Mr. Molina, could you phrase it in such a way that you are recommending maintaining the same level, as opposed to reducing a certain amount?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, no...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: That's what's kind of confusing.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, sorry, yeah. I just want to basically, it's just to keep it at FY 2020 levels. Sorry to add the confusion. So, no expansion, no increases. But just keep it at FY 2020 levels.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I second.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, that was my second. Yeah, I agree with that.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I agree.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Moved by Member Molina...okay, hold on, Members. Moved by Member Molina, seconded by Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, Member Molina just explained his rationale for the motion, and now I will take it, give each Member an opportunity to speak to the motion starting with the second, and then I'll go to Pro Temp Kama. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You have one minute.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, I agree. You know, it's hard times. We should...we should not be giving ourselves increases. And this is equivalent to \$16,541 per each of our nine offices, the increase. So, that's why the total is \$148,869. So, anyway, I support this

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

wholeheartedly, and I think that we can certainly make-do with the same amount that we have right now. So, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Pro Temp Kama, you have one minute.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. I agree, I mean, you know, we say to our people that we are in this together. And so, this is a way of showing them that we are in it together, that we understand that they're having to sacrifice some things. And we have to sacrifice, and we're looking for ways that we can do it. And this is a wonderful opportunity to show our people that we are going to be with them in this, even if it means cutting our own office budgets. So, I concur. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Well said. Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Hokama? Oh sorry. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Ms. Paltin, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Just was wondering if you could let me know what this amount equals out to.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, I believe it was a total of \$148,869, total.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: What would that...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: The number.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, what would it mean that we're getting? I don't...off the top of my head, the 2020 levels?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, so basically it goes down to 2020, it's what we currently have. The increases would've totaled \$148,869 for all 9 offices.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Do you know the number what we currently have?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I think it should be in Details.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We'll get that squared away later. We'll ask Staff to help you get that squared away. But basically, it's an increase of about \$16,000 per Member's office. It's not for Members' salaries. That's different. This is for Members' offices. Each Member had an opportunity to take their budget and separate it into A, B, C Accounts.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

So, not all of the \$16,000, which is the expansion, of what was from last...or this current fiscal year is all in A. But I understand what Member Molina. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . is saying. And so, if we approve --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I can see...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --this, then we would need to go back and look at your own budgets because it's separated into A, B, and C. And you've already included the \$16,000 increase in your individual budget and separated them into A, B, and C Accounts. So, if we approve this, then you'll need to go back to your budget, or go back to your office budget and figure out where that would...where that reduction would be reflected. Okay?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can I support --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --this, and if we take away the A, B, and C so that we have that flexibility? I mean we'll take it away, and then I mean 'cause...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, we're not doing that right now. We're doing Member Molina's motion which is to take away the \$16,000 per Member's office budget increase.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, without taking away the A, B, and C, I don't support it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Molina. I think this is a very responsible proposal from you. I have \$148,626, so I may be wrong, Mr. Molina, on my math. But I support your proposal.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I'll work on my math.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No, it could be mine, could be mine.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I'm good, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci? Member Sinenci, unmute.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I'm supportive. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. And...oh, did I skip you, Chair Lee?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Again, yeah. I'm so...I'm getting a complex over here. I feel I have concerns just like Member Tamara Paltin. Sometimes we're just so tied into this A, B, and C and if we are able to work through it, then, you know, the money part isn't so important. It's just being stuck having \$1,000 on equipment that you're never going to buy. I mean, you know, stuff like that. So, I agree with her. I would condition this vote to eliminating A, B, and C. And I would also request, I don't know if I have to, but maybe I have to, that the Chair's contingency also allow for paying for additional expenses. Let's say the Budget Committee in particular is...always has extra work to do. And oftentimes for some reason in the last couple years, we've had such a changeover in staff, OCS staff, that the Budget Committee's office staff, the Budget Chair's office staff, is then burdened with a lot of the work that OCS would normally do. So, that's, you know, I'm hoping that you would give me that kind of flexibility also with the Chair's account. And then I would vote for this. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay, and did I skip you, Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, no. I just had a comment regarding that. But I'll wait for my second round. I just want to make a statement about --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: There's no second round.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --A, B...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Everyone had one minute. We're trying to move forward because we have a lot of work, unless you want to be here till midnight every night which I know you have no problem with because you enjoy . . . (*inaudible*). . . But some of us have children that we have to get back to. So, I'm going to call for the question. Okay, all those in favor of Member Molina's motion, please say "aye," and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, with our amendment?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: No.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No, no.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, just by itself?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And then so motion by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee. And just to clarify when you say “we” you mean OCS’ budget will not have A, B, and C or...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, the Councilmembers, sorry. Councilmembers’ budget.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Councilmembers budget will not have A, B, and C.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for that clarification. Okay. So, Member Paltin spoke. Chair Lee, and then Committee Vice-Chair King, and then Pro Temp Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, I fully agree with that. And I mean, it’s not like we have huge budgets. It’s pretty minor budgets and everybody has been going through the same dilemma for the last several years when, you know, you’re stuck with the C Account when you didn’t need it in the first place. The other thing is that I’m hoping we don’t have to even make a motion on the Chair’s contingency fund because, you know, I would be happy to use it for anybody who needs it. Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Committee Vice-Chair King, and then Pro Temp Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. No, I don’t have a problem with the proposal. And I think we can just take care of the Chair’s contingency fund in a Chair’s meeting. Do we need to vote on that right now? That’s...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I don’t think so ‘cause it’s...the number’s not going to change. I didn’t ask for an increase.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, so isn’t that in Council Rules? We just take care of that with...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: We could.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah. But I...no, I don’t have a problem with the Council...with own budgets being flexible because it’s a lot of hassle when you have to go and find somebody to balance out your Council budget with to make those changes. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. I concur with the maker of the motion, the seconder, and all the other people that are going to come after me, I’m sure. But it’s nice to have some flexibility. Thank you very much.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. I hope no one goes after you. Okay. Member Sugimura?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I just want to say what's good for the geese, is good for the gander. When DEM comes up, this was one of the questions that they had about getting rid of A, B, and C to deal with the pandemic and doing CIP. So, no A, B, and C for DEM and no...I mean and CIP would be the only two accounts so that they could interchangeably deal with A, B, and C. And the rationale is exactly what you folks are saying. But I will tell you something else, is that all the years--I don't have that many years on the Council, maybe Mr. Hokama has more that he can add to this--but I never had a problem with A, B, and C 'cause all I had to do was ask the Chair. And the Chair would say, yes or no, or whatever. But it wasn't hard. I don't know what difficulties, you know, have existed. But, and there's not that much money either. So, it's just a matter of, you know, being able to budget it, I guess. But I still...I think we need the A, B, and C. Otherwise, let's have a, you know, massive discussion about all the departments. But that was one of the requests from DEM. That was exactly the request from DEM. He didn't say...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And, yeah, I don't know if that rule was equally applied across the board to all Councilmembers. Okay, mahalo, Member Sugimura. Next, Member Paltin. Wait, did you speak this time? You made the motion.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I made the motion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I'm trying not to skip anyone. Member Hokama? . . .(laughing). . .

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. For me, I'm a bean counter and disciplinarian. So, I don't have any problem with requiring Councilors to do the same thing I require departments and department heads to account for the money they're responsible for. And again, if you don't know where to put your money, then put it in Salaries, you know. That's the easiest place to put all your money if that's where you want to put it in A. But again, my office plans it out, and I can tell you I never had a problem in my 20 years of budgets for my office. And the one thing I will not agree is I don't think the Chair should be bailing out any Member for mishandling their own office accounts.

. . .(timer bell ringing). . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Molina, and then Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No, I appreciate the proposal from Member Paltin. I will call this the pandemic amendment. Flexibility I think is needed. So, I can support. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Sinenci?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I'm supportive of same, same here, because of the current situation, especially if we denied our Council increases and that we've...most travel has been cancelled. So, supportive.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay, and I'm also supportive of Member Paltin's motion, and I think it's a lot different than DEM. DEM has about \$40 million in their budget, and our budget is I think less than 1 million. And we don't have a whole lot of programs, and CIPs, and lots of different things going on. So, and after we're pau, everything is recorded after the fact anyway. And I think that it's a little different because Councilmembers change every two years and for those of us who joined the Council last year, we were left with a budget that we didn't make for ourselves. And so, it's a little unfair, and we're moving into the next term. Again, what we decide to do with our budgets if the next Councilmember joins and ends up with, you know, \$5,000 in Account C, it's kind of unfair, I guess, to the incoming Councilmember to get stuck with what a previous Councilmember set for them without their...they having a say. So, that's my rationale for voting for the motion. So, I'll call for the question. All those in favor, please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Raise your hand. Okay. Right. And then all those oppose, please say "no" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oppose

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so that is 7-9 [sic]. Those opposing, Member Hokama and Member Sugimura. Okay, all right.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Kama, Lee, Molina, Paltin, and Sinenci.

NOES: Councilmember Hokama and Sugimura.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Seven, nine?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Seven-two.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(laughing)*. . .Sorry, 7-2 which equals 9.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I want to take the nine, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR KING: You're using Mr. Hokama's math now.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I like that math.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . . *(laughing)*. . .Gotta keep it light, right. Just making sure you guys are listening.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, sure, sure.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Testing you guys. Okay, here we go. All right, Member Molina, do you have another motion?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think Member Paltin also has one.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, yeah, whoever you feel first.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any other Member have a motion to amend Account A in OCS? Okay, if not, then I'll go to Member Paltin...oh, did you have an amendment, Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, yeah, for A under premium pay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: For A.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh okay, go ahead. Go ahead, Mr. Molina.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, yeah, Madam Chair, my proposal is an A Account proposal. Can I do it now?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: A?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Or you're recognizing other Members? Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so we're still in A, A Account.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, all right, here we go.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura, did you have an amendment to the A Account? I wanted to give everyone an opportunity to make an amendment in the A Account. Okay, Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I thought I was going to defer to Mr. Molina. I thought he had a A Account. So, I basically looked at all of the increases that were promised to staff, and I would like to make a motion that just because of this is a pandemic mode that we defer increases to staff although it's highly they've earned it, and I'm sure they would like it, but to delete the pay increases for staff, for OCS staff. Do you want me to give you the...each individual one?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Page 3-4 and 3-5.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And amounts.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, I have it all listed individually. I'll go and add it up and then get back to you then, if you want the total.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Member Sugimura, I think Member Molina just deleted it from the Councilmember account. And then each Member designates how much they want to do to staff. Is that what...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, I'm sorry. I'm only talking...I'm talking about OCS staff. Are we still talking about our offices? OCS...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, OCS.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: We're talking about OCS, right. Okay. Or is Mr. Molina, are you still talking about our individual pots?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No, no. My upcoming proposal will be for OCS.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, but...

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Premium pay. He said that premium pay. Even I know that.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay, so basically...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: One moment.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair, we already deleted the Director's increase, the Supervising Attorney's increase, and the Legislative Attorney's increase. So, is that something in addition to, Ms. Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yes. I'm just saying...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, no, I just...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: If you look on Page 3-3 and 3-4 in the Budget Details, the OCS staff are receiving, or recommended to get pay increases. And I'm saying that we should not because of the pandemic situation and the same reasons that we gave for the supervisory, or Legal Analysts and Director.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so was that motion clear?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Just dollar amount. Dollar amount.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just wanted to know the dollar amount that it adds up to.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I gotta add it up then. I have it individually listed, so I'll be back.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so why don't we table that one for now while Member Sugimura gets that tallied, and then we'll go to Member Molina--sorry, did I say Member Sugimura?--Member Molina's premium pay amendment. Okay, Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you very much, Madam Chair. Under OCS Index Code 901041A-5205 [*sic*], overtime, delete proposed increase of \$65,000 for premium pay for overtime.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Will you say where it is one more time in the Detail?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: It's Index Code 901041A-5205 [sic] under overtime.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so that's Member Molina's motion. Is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Even a second for discussion, you're not committed.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, hearing no...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay, second for discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second for discussion, and I'm not committed.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: . . . *(laughing)*. . . Yeah, thank you, Member Lee. Again, it's along the same lines like why we're looking at reducing, you know, where we can cut. You know, we're asking others to cut, so again, we're trying to set the example. State is looking at salary cuts. So, as to avoid such cuts, we should consider cutting premium pay before it gets out of hand. Additionally during this time, the Council should focus on cutting demand on OCS staff so we can...they can cut back on overtime. So, again, I think we should be considerate of our Staff members' health and safety by reducing our demands on OCS, if at all possible. So, I throw that out there for discussion and consideration, Madam Chair and Members. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay. Okay, we'll go to...just indicate if you have a question. Council Chair Lee, and then Committee Vice-Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Member Molina, so what percentage of the overall premium pay are we talking about? The \$65,000 represents about how much of a cut?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, gee, I don't know. I don't have my calculator right now. But I just looked at the number...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: It's not the whole thing, right?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: The whole \$65,000 that's...I guess that's the increase, right, proposed increase.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, the increase. Oh, I see.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: The increase, yeah, yeah. So, basically, keep it flat.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, you know, that they work overtime. I mean you can't...

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: All right.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: But I believe that Council Services Director asked us for an increase on the overtime, on the existing amount. So, this would be the increase, the \$65,000 increase.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Council Chair Lee. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, okay. So, I guess that was my question. So, you were just proposing to eliminate the increase in overtime, not the \$135,000, which I think makes sense because a lot of that 2019 increase was due to the HSAC Conference. There was a lot of overtime, and we won't have that again for four years. Well, now it's going to be five years because there's not. . .*(inaudible)*. . .that conference this year at all. So, by the time it rolls back around to us, it'll be five years. So, you know, I can support that. Going to the...that would put the premium pay back at current level which is \$135,000. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, any other questions, Members?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have a question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think this might be for Member...or Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: As of before the pandemic, I had tried to...I wanted to try and catch up with some of the items that have been on my agenda for like 10, 20 years. And so, I had added extra meetings. I know that the Paia one, Parks and Rec withdrew their permission for me to have the Paia night meeting. But would cutting this overtime mean not getting caught up on the agenda, and not having these extra meetings? I mean even if we have it on BlueJeans, I had Member Molina's Paia thing, and Member Sugimura's zipline thing scheduled for 1st May. And then I had the Kihei affordable apartments scheduled for the third week. And so, by cutting this overtime, is it going to stop us from catching...or stop Planning and Land Use from catching up on the things that we're trying to catch up on?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: That's a good question. You know, that's a reasonable question that probably Traci can answer better than me. So, is Traci on the line?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Going to Moloka`i and Lāna`i for their...to hear their island's Land Use meeting and what-not. Would that mean that's out?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Traci?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Fujita, are you still on the line?

MS. FUJITA: Well, the \$65,000 increase was not due to the HSAC Conference. It was actually to try to bring the OT back to the FY 2019 actual, 'cause there was a reduction. And what the impact that this might have, I'm not sure. It could have an impact on the ability for Staff to work, you know, evening meetings and the ability for Staff to get caught up on work. They tend to come in on the weekend to try to get caught up on work. It's been a struggle this year to try to keep the overtime below the amount that we have appropriated this year because it was a reduction. So, all we're doing is we're trying to bring it back to what it was. So, this increase, we're not asking for, you know, anything above what it was before. We're trying to reverse, I guess, the cut that was made, and it was made prior to this. So, I'm trying my best too to start trying to I guess let Members know about the impact and the possible overtime that requests may cause so that they're...so that Members are aware of, you know, each time when there's a request made, they can be made aware of, you know, the possibility that might incur overtime so that there's some awareness there.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Fujita.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I'll reserve my comment for when we get to the comment portion. That was just a question, right?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, this is your one minute.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. So, I'm just saying that, you know, people have asked me to go to Moloka'i and Lāna'i. People have asked me for nighttime meetings in their district, and I'm committed. I made the commitments before this happened. And I'm going to vote against it because I don't want to go back on my word. And I feel like, you know, this is a service that people really...they want to see us making the decisions in their communities. They want to be...have the access to these decisions. And I feel personally responsible. And I feel bad that some things are waiting on the docket for 10, 15 years. So, I'm going to vote against this one 'cause I think we need to provide that service for people. And I feel like I need to honor my commitments that I made. If we can't do the nighttime evening meetings, if we can't do the district meetings on different islands, then I'll just feel bad like I was a liar.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, anyone else have comments on Member Paltin's motion, or should I take...or does everyone have...okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: That was Member Molina's motion, right.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Did Member Molina not already speak to the motion?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Well, I spoke one time, yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: You said Member Paltin's motion, but it was actually Member Molina's motion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, sorry. Okay. So, Member Molina's motion, Member Paltin spoke, Chair Lee...

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Madam Chair, I have something to say, but I'll yield to the other Members before I get recognized for my second time and final time.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: No more second time.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, no more second time? Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Call for the question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, all those in favor of the motion, please say "aye" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any opposed, say "no" and raise your hand. Okay, motion fails 6-3...3-6...6-3, yeah, Member Molina, Member Sugimura, and Member Hokama voted for the motion and everyone else voted against it. Okay, the motion fails.

VOTE: AYES: Councilmembers Hokama, Molina, and Sugimura.

**NOES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and
 Councilmembers Kama, Lee, Paltin, and Sinenci.**

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION FAILED.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Sugimura, are you ready?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Well, yeah. You asked for the total numbers. It's \$42,407, but if I look at this according to the Budget Details there's some wages that are negative, so it's not all positive. So, I don't know really how to give you an accurate number, but

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

as much as possible that's what it is, but it's on Budget Details 3 and 4, Members, and it's basically our staff who works really hard. I don't deny that, but under the circumstances with pandemic that I don't think it's time to give raises at this time. So, that's my motion and the reason.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so in Budget Details...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Why would there be negatives?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I'm...okay, I'll read it to you. Legislative Analyst anticipate reallocation and redescription to Legislative Analyst position is a negative \$25,000.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We have Ms. Fujita on if you'd like to ask Ms. Fujita.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. Maybe we can ask...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, was there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Member Sugimura's motion. Is there a second to the motion?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Seconded by Member Hokama. Okay, so clarification on the motion. Ms. Fujita, are you able to explain why there are negatives in the adjustments?

MS. FUJITA: So, for the negative amounts, it's when somebody is hired at a lower amount than the prior employee. But I do need to note that for some of these salary steps and increases, they were part of resolutions that were already adopted. So, not all of them, but some of them.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, for that clarification. Are you able to let us know which ones we have not already set to make the adjustments for?

MS. FUJITA: Yeah, I could...we could figure that out. You know, my only hesitation is I really try to be as fair as possible and I have a hard time, you know, with giving some people increases and not others. I mean we've already...Council's already made that decision for the attorneys in the office. But, yeah, if we do that, we separate out the ones that have already...the resos have already passed and that means, you know, some are going to be getting step increases and salary increases and some aren't. But we can figure that out.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Fujita. And it looks like in the explanation of changes it does say, pay level increase pursuant Ordinance 4981. Step movement pursuant Resolution 19-103, as an example. So --

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

MS. FUJITA: Right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --it notes it on the side where we've already voted on setting their salaries at this, and this adjustment is to pay them what we already set them at.

MS. FUJITA: Right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, any more discussion, or shall I call for the question?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Call for the question.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Call for the question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, all those in favor please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any opposed?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Say "no" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, motion fails, one "aye," eight "noes," okay.

VOTE:	AYES:	Councilmember Sugimura.
	NOES:	Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Molina, Paltin, and Sinenci.
	ABSTAIN:	None.
	ABSENT:	None.
	EXC.:	None.

MOTION FAILED.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right, are there any final amendments for Account A OCS?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, Chair, one last one.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, Committee Vice-Chair King, did you have an amendment?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well, I was going to ask what we're doing...what we're going to do with their...they...OCS has a couple of amendments and one of them is related to...we deleted the Deputy Director so one of them is related to that furniture. I don't know if we actually need to make a vote on that...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Account A. Account A.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, we're still on Account A. Oh, sorry. Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Molina, last Account A amendment?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No, Madam Chair. I think mine is under Council Inauguration. I think this is a B Account but nothing for A.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so I'll ask for consensus on the A Account. Consensus?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, we're moving on to B. And we have some items that we received from the Department. Reduce cubicle desk for Deputy by \$3,000; delete document scanning/disposal project, \$170,000; delete closed captioning services, \$170,000; delete 7th Floor planning design, \$100,000; reduce Special Counsel, \$140,000. Those are all the amendments for Account B. I'll entertain a motion to approve the amendments as we, as received.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So moved.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You said \$5,000 for the...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I said \$3,000 for the cubicle desk for Deputy Director.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, our paper says \$5,000.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I had three.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Computer included...

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Their answers one said \$5,000.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, on their suggested cuts, it says \$5,000.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay, so it's \$2,000 for equipment which is C, so it's separated out.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, this says furniture/computer, so it's \$5,000 total.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so \$3,000 is in B, and \$2,000 is in C.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We're taking A...

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, we're just...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We're taking...wait.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, we're just doing \$3,000. Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. Okay, so motion by Committee Vice-Chair King, second by Member Sugimura. I'll call for the question. All those in favor, please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any oppose? Okay, okay, so motion passes unanimously.

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Molina, Paltin, Sinenci, and Sugimura.**

NOES: **None.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **None.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Member Molina.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry, Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, I said...you said, so...and I go, Member Molina.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh. . .*(laughing)*. . . Okay, so now we'll...so it...motion passes unanimously, and we'll make those adjustments to Exhibit "1." And now for Councilmembers' proposed amendments. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you very much, Madam Chair. I know this one might be real considered manini, but it comes under Council Inauguration, Index Code 901097-6221, Miscellaneous Other Costs. I move that we decrease the appropriation of \$3,000.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, moved by Member Molina, seconded by Chair Lee. If there's no discussion, I'll call for the question.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Madam Chair, can I speak to the motion just briefly as to why I'm doing this?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sure. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, no, again this is just to put the funding back at FY 2020 levels. And one of the reasons for this was you hear about all the schools having to cancel their graduation and ceremonies for students which is really tough, you know, for parents and grandparents. So, I believe we should keep the next Council's basics swearing-in with not a lot of frills, no pomp and circumstance. So, that's why I propose decreasing that...decreasing the increase or deleting it. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay. If there's no other discussion, I'll call for the question. All those in favor please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any opposed, say "no."

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Hokama. So, 8-1 motion passes; 8-1, Member Hokama.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES

Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Kama, Lee, Molina, Paltin, Sinenci, and Sugimura.

NOES: Councilmember Hokama.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Paltin has an amendment.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, the first one would be...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Are they together?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I beg your pardon?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Are they together? Are they like a...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No. They're both in two different sections. So, the first one is a reduction of \$1,900 from B. That's on Page 3-10, 901041-6240. Just, you know, eliminating retirement and service awards because times are hard.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: How much was it for, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I beg your pardon?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: How much was your reduction for?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, \$1,900.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, so that's Member Paltin's motion. Is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second, for discussion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Does it need to be discussed? I mean if no one supports it, then we don't need to discuss it. Member Paltin, two minutes.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess, you know, it's tough times and a lot of people are losing their jobs. I know people that have been working 30, 40 years in the hotel industry just got laid off like nothing. So, it seems kind of in bad taste for us, the County, to be spending money on retirement and service awards. That's it. I don't have two minutes. Hopefully, no one...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, Member Sinenci, seconder of the motion.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I'm supportive, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Anyone else needs to discuss this item? Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I just bring up a different perspective. And I appreciate the consideration from my colleague. But, you know, I think government is going to have to be looking at all employees, and this might be one of the nice ways we can say thank you. But I think we're going to need start promoting early retirement and some other types of termination types of programs for some of our employees to reduce the workforce base. And so, I don't have a problem with giving thanks to employees who have given good service. It's not a lot, but I think it gives recognition, and I think that's important at this time. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Okay, anyone else needs to discuss this motion? If not, I'll call for the question. All those in favor. . .(timer bell ringing). . all those in favor please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All those opposed, by the same sign.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oppose.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And raise your hand. Okay, Member Molina and Member...Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No comments, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, not comments. We're voting. Yes or no.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Oh, yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes to the motion of reducing the \$1,900 for retirement and service awards.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes, yes, yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so I have “ayes,” Member Paltin, Pro Temp Kama, Member Sinenci, Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Me too.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so that’s four, and everyone else opposes the motion. Okay, so motion fails.

VOTE:	AYES:	Councilmembers Kama, Lee, Paltin, and Sinenci.
	NOES:	Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Molina, and Sugimura.
	ABSTAIN:	None.
	ABSENT:	None.
	EXC.:	None.

MOTION FAILED.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, the next one, I move...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: ...*(inaudible)*... Oh, okay. Hold on, Member Paltin. Does anyone else have an amendment to Account B in OCS? Okay, Member Paltin, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to reduce Account B by \$25,176. This is Page 110 of the Program Budget, 901041B-6223, Council Services Travel Program, and just bringing it back to the previous year’s level.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, I’m sorry. Repeat where it is.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second. Second.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It’s Page 110.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, motion by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee, and please say where it is again.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Page 110 on the Program Budget, 901041B-6223.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, go ahead, Member Paltin. You have two minutes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just am bringing it back to the Fiscal Year '20 proposed amount. I imagine that we probably have some Carryover/Savings because, you know, travel stopped, and it might not continue into the Fiscal Year '21 that we're traveling. And so, I just decreased the increase to bring it to the Fiscal Year '20 levels. I think that's, that should be more than enough to satisfy our needs, hopefully. The Fiscal Year '20 amount. Don't need the full two minutes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Paltin. So, reducing it by \$25,176 to \$247,739. Okay, Chair Lee, as the seconder of the motion, did you want to speak to the motion?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Not really, but I did want to say something. I thought I heard Member Paltin say, well, since we didn't travel, we have that extra money. We don't have extra money. We have a zero. We start zero at July. On June 30th, everything that's extra goes back to the General Fund, and we start all over again, yeah. So, we don't carry over anything. Oh, maybe I misheard you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No one said that, my bad. I take it back.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay, does anyone else need to speak to this motion? Okay, seeing none, I'll call for the question. All those in favor of Member Paltin's motion to keep the travel flat, say "aye" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, any oppose, say "no" and raise your hand. Okay, motion passes unanimously.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Molina, Paltin, Sinenci, and Sugimura.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Paltin, was that your final amendment to Account B?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, and then we'll...Committee Vice-Chair King, do you have an amendment for Account B?

VICE-CHAIR KING: I'm not sure. I think we didn't do the reduce Special Counsel yet. I'm not sure if that's in B or C. The one that's on your list.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I did. We did that already. Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: That was included in the last...oh, okay. Sorry about that. I missed that one.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. Okay. So, we'll recap. I'll ask Staff to bring up Exhibit "1." Okay. So, you see the proposed reductions from Director Fujita reflected here as well as the reduction for the inauguration of \$3,000, and the reduction to travel by \$25,176. Okay. Mahalo, Staff. So, I'll ask for consensus on Account B.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Consensus.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. And then we'll move onto Account C. And we have that \$2,000 withdrawal or reduction for the computer for the Deputy Director. I'll entertain a motion.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So move.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Moved by Committee Vice-Chair King. Is there a second?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Members, do any of you have any recommended proposals for Account C? Okay, seeing none...oh, Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No, yeah, sorry, Madam Chair. Upon the completion of the recommendations for C Account, I have a priority for Council, for Office of Council Services which initially was a Planning proposal. But since that time, it's been recommended that I do the proposal out of the Office of Council Services. Will this be the appropriate time to take it up, or shall we wait until we take up all priorities at once?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, that's not the process. The process is we'll take it up when it comes under the account. So, does that fall under Account C?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: This would be under audit services. That would be C...it might be, come under C.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Audit services would be B Account, Professional Services.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: B Account. Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: B Account. Would we have to ask for reconsideration? I apologize. I'm sorry 'cause I was just trying to think where the priorities...when we would make these, so.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so whatever account that it's in, that's when we would take it up. So, if it was, you know, a salary proposal, then we would take it --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --up in A. If professional services, we would take it up in B. And if you're proposing to purchase equipment, then we would take it up in C.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, Professional Services, so it's B. And yeah, so we'll ask for reconsideration.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, okay. Can I...I make a motion to reconsider Council Office B Account.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Moved by Member Molina, seconded by Chair Lee. All those in favor, please say "aye."

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

can take as long as six months. So, we've heard many of the concerns. And so, this is why I propose this study. And being that we've made adjustments, I would ask for the Members' consideration for the up to \$250,000 for this study. Former Planning staff, they've also even told me, things that they've had customers get so frustrated, they cry. There's no training program for new employees. Policies, procedures, and review of permits can be inconsistent with the review. So, I feel we would be turning our backs on those members of the public who feel this way. So, that is why in a nutshell. I ask for the Members serious consideration of this proposal for an audit of up to \$250,000 for a study, whatever we want to call it. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay, Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I second...did I second the motion?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I believe so.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, so that's why you're calling on me. Okay, I seconded the motion, but I really don't think that this rises to the level of high priority. I know it's important, I know it's important, but given all the other issues that we've dealt with, I think maybe this could wait, and then as soon as things turn around and money gets more plentiful that we could take it up again. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Chair Lee. Anyone else needing to speak to the motion, please raise your hand. Okay, if...Committee Vice-Chair King, one minute.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I actually...I have a question for Mr. Molina. Is it a matter of provisoing the money that's in the Budget for Auditor, or is it adding an extra \$250,000 to the Budget for this particular...

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: It'll be an add.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so on top of...and do you know what our...where we're at right now in our Budget? Going back to the Audit Account? You know what that total...what that brings the total of the Audit Account to?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I think better to ask Staff to do the calculations on that. I may be wrong. This would increase it from \$405,000 to \$658,000.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Yeah, I'm just wondering if it could be done for less than \$250,000. Where did that figure come from?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, which is why I stated up to 250. It may be less, but according to the County Auditor, he did anticipate it would go beyond that. Like I said, in 2006 it was \$120,000, and now when you factor in inflation, it's been 14 years. So, you could call it a guess. But I would propose it as up to \$250,000.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, and you feel this is outside the scope of the County Auditor?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, anyone else wanting to speak to the motion? Please raise your hand. Okay, seeing no other hands raising, I'll echo the comments that Chair Lee provided. And I won't be voting for the motion. I think it's important, but I think two things happened. Member Molina has put the Planning Department on notice, and we had that discussion when we had the Planning Department come before us in looking at their customer service. And they said that, you know, they would work on improving that through training. And so, I'd be willing to give them a year or two to work on that, to improve that. And, you know, if necessary, approving this proposal in a year or two. So, I'll be voting against the motion.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, Madam Chair. Yeah, thank you. I appreciate those comments and the comments from my Members because, again, we can't be turning a blind eye to this stuff. And I'm hoping the directors really...I know they said they were in shock. But, honestly, I'm in shock when they said that, you know. Or they were surprised. I mean it's out there in the community. There's...you know when we brought that up at the last meeting, that's when we received even more calls about it, in support of it. So, I just wanted to share that with the Members. And, you know, if this is not considered as high a priority as other matters, you know, so be it, and I respect that. But I'm hoping that it does serve notice to this Department that they better address it because we can't have phone calls not returned, customers getting maybe verbally abused. I mean, we got to weed out...every department has some bad apples. And maybe it's due to training or whatnot, but I'm...this is one of the main intents why I wanted to bring this to the attention of everybody. It needs to be addressed one way or another. But thank you for your patience, Madam Chair. I know we got a lot on our plate, and to my colleagues. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Molina. So, I'll call for the question. Okay, all those in favor, please say "aye" and raise your hand. Okay, and then all those opposed, please say "no" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, it looks like it's 7-2, the motion fails. Those voting for it are Member Molina and Member Sinenci.

VOTE: AYES: Councilmembers Molina and Sinenci.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

NOES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Paltin, and Sugimura.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION FAILED.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. All right. Were there any other amendments for Account B? Okay, I'll ask for consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Okay, now we're back to Account C, and we made one amendment which is, was to reduce Account C by \$2,000. And there were no other proposals to amend, so I'll ask for consensus. Members, consensus on Account C?

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. All right. So, that...there aren't any CIPs for OCS or Rates and Fees, and we did one priority proposal for OCS. So, I guess I'll ask for consensus for the...I think we're good. We had consensus for A, B, and C separately so I think we're good. Okay, so...

MS. ESPELETA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's...

MS. ESPELETA: Chair, sorry. This is Shelly.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Espeleta?

MS. ESPELETA: Hi. Can we get...hello. Thanks, Chair. Can we get clarification on Member Kama's four priority proposals? There was one for A and three for B.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, Member...

MS. ESPELETA: Are those still up for consideration?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Pro Temp Kama withdrew all her priority proposals for OCS.

MS. ESPELETA: Thank you for clarifying.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for checking. I appreciate that. Staff is on it, so we don't miss anything. Okay, all right. So, that completes OCS, okay.

COUNTY AUDITOR

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Next we have County Auditor, and he's joined us. Aloha, Mr. Taguchi. Okay. Okay. All right. County Auditor's proposed...well, actually we came to consensus on four items when we...when the County Auditor came before us. And that was to delete the Office Support Clerk; to add that \$50,000 that was meant for Office Support Clerk to Professional Services; and to add computer services and installation for \$4,000; and add computer server for \$10,000 for a total of \$1,302,678. Oops, sorry, I skipped around. Okay, so for Account A...so these are all the changes that we already made. So, are there any amendments to Account A? Do Members have any amendments for Account A? Okay, seeing none, I'll ask for consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Okay, and then we'll move to Account B. Are there any proposed amendments for Account B?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I have Mr. Taguchi's under Professional Services.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, Mr. Taguchi has proposed reducing Professional Services by \$68,000. Before this proposal we added \$50,000. So, if anyone would like to make a motion, I'll entertain a motion to approve the reduction of Professional Services by \$68,000.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So move.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: So move.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Second.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, moved by Chair Lee and seconded by Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, you already explained it. And we already had consensus on it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, just wanted to clarify. So, that...under Professional Services, right now it says \$200,000 was proposed. But it's up to \$250,000. So, now we're reducing from \$250,000 by \$68,000. Correct.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's correct.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And we have Mr. Taguchi nodding his head, for the record. Okay. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. For Mr. Taguchi, so with the proposed reduction, you do not see any difficulties with the... 'cause I'm assuming we're going to need to do more COVID audits, particularly with our expenses and that we're going to account for because of revised procurement procedures to get the supplies to areas of need and employees of service. So, you're comfortable with the revised number, Mr. Auditor?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Taguchi?

MR. TAGUCHI: Thank you. Yes, because the original proposal I had in there contains an amount that allows me to get special counsel if necessary. I don't anticipate in the next fiscal year utilizing special counsel at this time. So, I think I can do the...some of those reviews or audits. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . that you talk about because of the COVID-19 using those funds. So, I'm okay with the reduction.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, no, I'm...if you're comfortable, Mr. Taguchi, then I trust in your professional opinion. I just take into account the President's own words today regarding the issue with the small business loans from Congress that he has no problem getting money back from grantees that he feels have not utilized it appropriately. And so, I'm assuming audits is going to be a big determinant in the Federal government going after misuse of public funds. Thank you.

MR. TAGUCHI: If I can make one comment.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Taguchi?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

MR. TAGUCHI: Mr. Hokama, I totally agree because I've seen articles about procurements made by the Federal government where even to the extent of...I think I saw an article where it said that the Federal government gave 55 million to a company that was bankrupt to purchase PPE. So, I'm fully aware of what you're talking about. I understand.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Taguchi. Mahalo, Member Hokama. Okay. Seeing no other needs for comments or discussion on this motion, I'll just for the record also share the concerns that Member Hokama shared. But Mr. Taguchi said that he's confident with the amount that he'll be getting so...and we can always make a budget amendment if necessary to accommodate the need if there is one later in the year. Okay, so I'll call for the question. All those in favor, please say "aye" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, any opposed, by the same sign and say "no." Okay, so the motion passes unanimously to reduce Professional Services by \$68,000.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Molina, Paltin, Sinenci, and Sugimura.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, are there any other proposals for Account B? Okay, seeing none I'll ask for consensus.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. And we'll move on to Account C. Any proposals to Account C? There are two that we already approved, but are there any new ones? Okay, seeing none, I'll ask for consensus on Account C.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, we got consensus on Account C. And there are no CIPs or Rates and Fees under this office, so that completes our decision-making for the County Auditor. Mahalo for joining us, Mr. Taguchi.

MR. TAGUCHI: Thank you.

MS. ESPELETA: Chair, this is Shelly Espeleta again.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Espeleta?

MS. ESPELETA: Sorry. Hi. Sorry. Can we just confirm that the \$4,000 for the installation software for the server is a B?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I'm sorry.

MS. ESPELETA: Under the B Account versus C?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. ESPELETA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, the computer services, the installation part of it is \$4,000 under B, and the \$10,000 is under C, just for clarification. And, Ms. Espeleta, would you mind sharing your screen to bring up Exhibit "1" so we can all take a look at that? Okay, so here's the County Auditor. There's the \$50,000 added, subtracted, and then added, and then subtract again. And the \$4,000, and then the \$10,000. Okay. Mahalo, Ms. Espeleta. Okay, and that concludes the County Auditor. Mahalo, Mr. Taguchi. Okay, Members, it's 4:11. Are there any objections to taking a ten-minute break before we take up Department of Corporation Counsel?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No objections.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Before we take up which department did you say?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Corporation Counsel.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh. Oh, yeah.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, all right. It's 4:11 on April 20th, and we will reconvene at. . .*(inaudible)*. . . 4:20. We'll just say 4:25, round it, okay. All right, the Economic Development and Budget Committee is now in recess. . . *(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 4:12 p.m.
RECONVENE: 4:33 p.m.

DEPARTMENT OF CORPORATION COUNSEL

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the Economic Development and Budget Committee please come to order. And we are now on Corporation Counsel. Corporation Counsel's overall budget is \$4,858,689 as was proposed in the Mayor's Budget. We received proposed reductions from the Department totaling in \$363,500 which is 13.37 percent of their budget. All of their items fall in Account B. So, we will take up those items when we get to Account B, and so we'll start with Account A. Are there any proposals from the Members on Account A? And I'll check first with GET Chair Molina, and then I see Member Paltin's hand up.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yes, thank you, Madam Chair. No considerations for Account A; however, I do have a consideration for Account B.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Member Paltin, for Account A.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to reduce Account A by \$39,744 for their expansion Safety Specialist position. This is Page 1-5 of the Budget Details, Index Code 905310A, Risk Management. And...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. The reason for this...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, hold...hold on. Moved by Member Paltin, seconded by Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, Member Paltin, you have two minutes. Please proceed.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, the reason for my recommendation to decrease this amount and not fund this position is basically what they want the position for and the position description doesn't align with one another. In many of their answers to their questions, they said this is not a Safety Specialist position's responsibility. And yet, they asked for a Safety Specialist. So, I think there's not an understanding of what a Safety Specialist does, that they're trying to make a position for somebody that doesn't do those things that they want them to do. It falls more in line with maybe a Loss Control Officer, or something else. So, I don't think that we should be perpetuating giving a position where everybody else in the position says what they need the position for is not the jobs of that

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

position, position description, job description, and whatnot. It just...it doesn't make any sense to me to do that. So, I'm proposing to not do it. Pau.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Paltin. Okay, and Committee Vice-Chair King as the seconder.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: One minute.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, no, I had this on my list too. It's that...it looked like it was one of the security guards that they proposed to do away with that security screen. So, I had that on my list for a cut as well. But Member Paltin's saying no, that's not the position.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, it's Safety Specialist III is the position.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The security guards comes under B with...under Account B. It...and that's with the I think \$200,000 security services. That would be a contract so it's B.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: This one is A, like a County employee.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. I'll wait till I get to the other...the other item is all inclusive then, that \$200,000 I guess.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, the Professional Services.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Would anyone else like to speak to the motion? Okay, Member Sugimura, you have one minute.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. You know, I called the Department about that 'cause it was like loss control related. You're right. And I guess we all have seen SeaRay who's been helping us with this type of specialty. But it's really not his specialty that he's been filling in. So, when I talked to Moana, she said that they basically are trying to hire this position to do the work. And I think Council must send their Department challenging questions way beyond the expertise of their existing staff. Not that SeaRay is not doing a good job, but they wanted to hire somebody that could elevate that position so could handle the needs of the County. So, I'm not too sure about all the positioning that Tamara Paltin is talking about. But in terms of skill set, they need somebody at a higher level to take care of the challenges of the County as we have grown. And added that...if you remember, I don't know how...I think it was three years ago, that was under another department, maybe Planning, and it moved over to Corp.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

Counsel. Or, maybe two years ago, three years ago it moved over to Corp. Counsel. So, this is the evolution of them taking on more responsibility.

. . .(timer bell ringing). .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay, any other comments, discussion to the motion? Member Hokama, one minute.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you. Chair, I appreciate this motion to amend. I'm seriously considering it. In fact, Chair, later on I might ask the Committee to consider that there be no expansions or no reallocations for the upcoming Fiscal Year '21 Budget considerations. I think from a cash point of view, I think Personnel or Budget Office could give us the amount. And I would say I think the Committee would be surprised, the seven digits we can get out of stopping expansion and reallocations. Thank you, Chair. So, I support the motion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Any other need to discuss the motion? If not, I will call for the question. All those in favor of the motion please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Raise your hand. Okay, all those who oppose, say "no" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: No.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so the motion carries, 7-2, Member Molina and Member Sugimura.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Paltin, and Sinenci.

NOES: Councilmember Molina and Sugimura.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, are there any other proposed amendments for Account A? Okay seeing none, I will call for...I forgot to double check mine. Okay. Okay, I'll ask for consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Members. There's consensus. We'll move next to Account B, and I will first go over what the Department submitted to the Committee. Delete annual maintenance of security cameras and badge access systems by \$200,000; delete air purifiers by \$50,000; delete eLearning by \$75,000; delete travel to Lāna`i, Moloka`i, and Hāna for the Wellness program by \$31,500; delete Board of Ethics webpage and scanning project by \$7,000. Okay, those are the items, and please let me know if anyone needs to separate any of the items before we vote on all of them together. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Point of information. When you said \$200,000, I believe that one was for the X-ray and the security service. The annual security maintenance contract, wasn't that one \$220,000? Was my first question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. And my second question was the amount for the air purifiers in our Budget Details is \$67,500. So, when they say delete it by \$50,000, is that just a portion of the amount, or was that a wrong amount? One-dash-twelve-seven-zero-three-nine.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. We have...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: . . .(*inaudible*) . . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We have Budget Director Yoshimura on the line. I'll ask if that was meant as a reduction by \$50,000. Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Madam Chair...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: So, the air purifiers, the request was for \$67,500, as indicated on Page 1-12 of the Details. She...the reduction is for \$50,000.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. So, it's a reduction, not an elimination. No further questions. I'm all good. Consensus. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. Just questions to of information. So, I just wanted to clarify that the \$200,000 was for Item 905022B, which is what, I think, Member Paltin was clarifying, that that was for the security X-ray machine. And then, the next --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

VICE-CHAIR KING: --line that says...what?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. YOSHIMURA: The \$200,000, Page 1-8 of the Budget Details, the 220...the \$200,000 was for the security guards, the installation of the X-ray machine --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: --for the second floor of this building.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Not for the stopping the...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . really quickly.

MS. YOSHIMURA: No, that's misstated there in your response.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: The \$220,000 is needed for the security contract.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so that's not being proposed for the cut. But the other, the \$200,000 includes the next line which says, do not have guards or security. That's part of that \$200,000?

MS. YOSHIMURA: The \$200,000 is...yeah, the security guards are part of that.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Part of that. Okay. All right. And oh, the other question I had, Chair, was the delete travel to Lāna`i, Moloka`i, and Hāna for the Wellness Program, that...when I looked at the Wellness Program, it looked like the total Wellness Program. Was that Wellness Program just for Hāna, Lāna`i, and Moloka`i? 'Cause it looked like that amount was just cutting out the entire program.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

VICE-CHAIR KING: It's on Page 1-10.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Correct. Yeah, that was a program for the entire County. And that's what's being...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. 'Cause you just...it was misstated on this too. It looked...it shows like it's a program that's...that you're just cutting out Lāna`i, Moloka`i, and Hāna. But I think what you're doing is cutting out the entire program.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. The only two questions I...I mean those are main two questions I had. So, I'm good. Thank you.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, can I add?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: So, the air purifiers, they're actually a C...Category C expenditure. So, it should come under Equipment.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. Mahalo.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. And then did you have a figure for the reduced travel budget?

MS. YOSHIMURA: We're taking 50 percent off of the travel for the entire Department. It'll be \$46,963.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Nine-sixty...and is that, Chair, that's not part of what we're doing right now. Correct? Is that C?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We can add it.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Okay, thank you. Support.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, any other questions before I entertain a motion? Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Chair, clarification. So, again, one of the reductions for the B Account is the 200...is it \$200,000 or \$220,000 for the security maintenance contract? 'Cause I thought I heard 200. But I'm looking at the Details.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . So, in the Budget Details, it's for \$220,000.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And we're leaving that in. That that's not what's being proposed to be deleted. What is being proposed to be deleted is the security guards and the X-ray machine, right below it, for \$200,000.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Right. Okay, so that's being proposed to be deleted. Okay, because just give you a head-up, my proposal will be to...well, anyway. All right, I was going to combine the 2, the \$200,000 and the \$220,000 as a proposal to reduce totally. I would --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, we're going to do this first.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --explain my reasons.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We'll do...

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, we'll do that first. Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay. Okay, Members, it's...Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . the \$46,963 travel reduction. Is that a part of this? 'Cause that wasn't what you read. That's what Ms. Yoshimura read. But it's included?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's what I was going to say.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, so I'll entertain the motion for all that I read with the clarifications...you know, I'll just do it again. Delete guards and security screening X-ray machine at Kalana O Maui Building for \$200,000; delete eLearning for \$75,000; delete the Wellness program for \$31,500; delete Board of Ethics webpage and scanning project by \$7,000; and reduce travel by \$46,963.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So moved.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, moved by Committee Vice-Chair King --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --seconded by Pro Temp Kama. Okay, Members, Committee Vice-Chair King...no, we don't. I think we talked enough about it, yeah.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah . . .(inaudible). . . Call for the question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so I...well, I actually would like to amend the motion to separate the \$7,000, if anyone wants to make that motion. If not, it'll remain in the motion. To remove, delete Board Ethics webpage and scanning project.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So moved.

VICE-CHAIR KING: . . .(inaudible). . .the motion?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, moved by Member Paltin to separate the Ethics webpage and scanning project, and was there a second?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Second. I'll second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second by Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, so I guess I have to call for the question on the amendment to that. All those in favor of removing the Ethics webpage and scanning project from the deletion, please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye. Okay, so it looks like the motion passes with Member Paltin, Committee Vice-Chair King, Member Sinenci, Chair Lee, Pro Temp Kama, okay. So, that's one...oh, and myself. One...two...three...four...five...six. So, 6-3, with Member Sugimura, Member Hokama, and Member Molina opposed to the motion of separating.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, wait, wait, wait. I think I supported. I supported separation.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, all right, so 7-2, to separate the \$7,000. Member Sugimura and Member Hokama.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Kama, Lee, Molina, Paltin, and Sinenci.

NOES: Councilmembers Hokama and Sugimura.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

ACTION: APPROVE amendment to main motion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so now I'll call for the question on all of what I read except for the \$7,000. All those in...

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair? Sorry.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: So, the travel number that I gave you included the travel that was part of the Health and Wellness Program. So, I want to make an adjustment to the travel number to \$41,813 because \$5,150 was already accounted for in Health and Wellness. Sorry.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I'm sorry would you repeat the number? Forty-one-thousand...

MS. YOSHIMURA: Forty...\$41,813.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, any objections to that correction to the motion?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No objections.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So moved.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'll just say no objections, okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Friendly amendment.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, that's just a correction. Okay, so all those in favor please say "aye" and raise your hand.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, any opposed, say "no" and raise your hand. Okay, motion passes unanimously.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Molina, Paltin, Sinenci, and Sugimura.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE main motion as amended.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so now I understand Member Molina had a proposal to Account B. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yes, thank you very much, Chair. It relates to Budget Details Page 1-8, Item code 905022B-6132, related to the contract, the Security Maintenance Contract. Again, I throw this out as a possible reduction to...because now we have an invisible enemy as well to deal with, and of course when these proposals were made, COVID-19 wasn't much of an issue. So, I believe individual departments seem to have safety concerns that they could implement on their own, much the way, you know, Corp. Counsel and the Council have done. So, for me I would suggest that we delay this expenditure until all departments have had an opportunity to implement their security measures, especially in how to deal with the COVID-19 crisis as eventually we'll start letting members of the public, more members of the public and more workers back into the County building. So, my reduction will be \$220,000. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, moved by Member Molina, seconded by Member Sugimura.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And I think Member Molina already spoke to it. Okay, Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well, I guess my one...I like the idea of having the departments, you know, do their own security, and I think they're already starting to. My one concern is part of what's under that amount is badge access for the building. So, when the badge access doesn't work, for instance, downstairs on the 1st Floor when we're trying to get in, then who do we call? I mean I think that's part of what they're doing. Is there anybody from...maybe Ms. Yoshimura could speak to that? Like what are essential, Countywide if you will, activities that they perform under this that aren't specifically department related? For that \$220,000.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair? Chair, that's our annual maintenance contract for all the security...the entire security system that we have in place at all of our facilities. So, the cameras that we have installed in this building as well as like the Service Center and other areas, the badge access. So, they coordinate all of our security measures for the County. And so, this is an annual contract that we pay to have those services provided.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, and then they...that looks like a new expenditure because there was nothing in the Fiscal Year 2020 adopted. So, I guess that's probably Mr. Molina's concern too. What is that, you know, what are we...what were we doing before?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Okay, so if you...if I could refer you to Page 1-8 of the Program Budget. You would see under 6221, Miscellaneous Other Costs, second line from the bottom. There was \$195,000. And we had indicated in the comments that the...it was for the hardening of the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd floors, is the \$30,000 we're asking for. But that 195, it was in there...hang on. We had used that 195 that's in column Fiscal Year 2020 adopted, that's actually the \$220,000 that's been moved up to 6132.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so the contract is increasing?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yes, it is. The more facilities, or the more security measures we add on, then our contract will increase. I believe we added some stuff last year for cameras above the cashiering functions in some of our facilities. I think we added some security measures at Kalama Park. So, that's all been included in the maintenance contract.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. All right, thanks for that explanation.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Any other need for clarification or discussion on this item? Member Paltin? One minute.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Based on their written response, it seems like it would be more costly for each department to contract out this service individually. And what they described as the annual services like, you know, cleaning the camera lenses once a month and checking the system, and I think kind of to me if each department wants to do additional security measures or whatever, but this seems like a broad contract that handles all these maintenance things. And so, I think, you know, in fiscal responsibility it's better to have just one contract that combines all the price rather than having each department to contract with that company. And then they have many accounts and then they charge more. So, that's just my two cents based on the department's answer to that question of what's involved with the annual security maintenance contract. Pau.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Any other need to discuss this...speak to the motion? Okay, seeing none, I'll echo Member Paltin's sentiments, and I won't be voting in favor of the motion. Okay, I'll call for the question. All those in favor, please say "aye" and raise your hand. Okay, all those oppose --

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I feel so alone.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --all those opposed, please say “no” and raise your hand. Okay, motion fails, with Member Molina and Pro Temp Kama voting for it.

VOTE: **AYES:** **Councilmembers Kama and Molina.**

NOES: **Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Lee, Paltin, Sinenci, and Sugimura.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **None.**

MOTION FAILED.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Mahalo, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Do you have any other proposals? Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No, mercifully no. Not at this point. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Molina. Okay, any other proposals? Oh, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to reduce the B Account by \$300. This is Page 1-7 of the Budget Details, Index Code 905018B-6240. And in the interest of fairness, I cut retirement and service awards across the board ‘cause of hard times. We got people in the private sector being laid off after 30, 40 years...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, okay, you made the motion. Hold on. You made the motion. So, hold on for a second to speak to the motion. Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, second my Member Sinenci. Okay, you can continue what you were saying, Member Paltin.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just, you know, it's those types of things in this climate is frivolous to me right now, and you know, it's taxpayers' money. And during good times, yeah, but with the private sector suffering so much loss, it's a little bit of a slap in the face to them to me. Pau.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, Member Sinenci, as the seconder.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No, I'm just supportive and just to continue...continuation from the last item as well. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Paltin [sic]. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I'll be voting against the motion. It's one thing for us to cut out our portion of the recognition awards. But it's another for the departments. The departments are really on the frontlines. And many of them are, you know, retirees and/or those...it's not only retirees that are recognized. But it's those who have worked for the County for 10 years, 20 years, 30 years, et cetera. And I believe that they are very deserving of recognition. And I like I said, many of them are on the frontlines with the COVID virus matter.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Anyone else wanting to speak to the motion? Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, and I want to thank Member Paltin's, you know, being consistent and being fiscally conservative. But it's hard to put a price on employee recognition. So, in this case, I'm kind of with Member Lee. And in the times that we live in, it's important that recognition is something that we also need to prioritize. But at the same time, you know, I thank Member Paltin for at least, you know, showing that she's consistent and trying to be as fiscally responsible as possible. So, regrettably I cannot support the motion. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Anyone else wishing to speak to the motion? If not, I will echo all of what Chair Lee and Member Molina shared in their comments and will also not be voting for the motion. Okay, I'll call for the question. All those in favor, please say "aye" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, and those oppose please say "no" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, motion fails. Those voting in favor are Member Sinenci and Member Paltin.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I believe that is what the Department shared with us. But it's a reduction of \$50,000. So, there's still a --

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, it --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --remaining amount.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --yeah, so for me, yeah, Chair, again you know, if there's no other comment from Admin, I think \$50,000 is worth a...is a smart expense to minimize any potential cases against the County regarding health impacts from those mold or bacterial issues that may still remain in certain areas of our old County facilities. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Anyone else wishing to speak to the motion? Okay. Oh, Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well, I just wanted to say that it looks like there's going to be \$17,500 left in there and they cost about \$1,200 a piece so, you know, maybe 12 units or something will be deployed, and it would be good to see how well those work. I'm not sure where they're deploying them but, you know, and then take a look at that and see if they're working and if they're actually worth what we're paying for them.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, I'll call for the question. All those in favor, please say "aye" and raise your hand to reduce the \$50,000.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, all those oppose, please say "no" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, motion fails, 2-7...oh, okay. Two-seven with Committee Vice-Chair King and Member Sinenci voting in favor of the motion.

VOTE:	AYES:	Vice-Chair King and Councilmember Sinenci.
	NOES:	Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, and Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Molina, Paltin, and Sugimura.
	ABSTAIN:	None.
	ABSENT:	None.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

EXC.: None.

MOTION FAILED.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, so that \$50,000 will remain in the budget. Okay, are there any proposals? I believe Member Paltin mentioned that she has proposals for Account C. Please proceed, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I move to decrease C budget by \$150,000 for security equipment for Waikapu, and I'll continue if I get a second.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, moved by Member Paltin, seconded by Member Sugimura. Member Paltin, you have two minutes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. And my reason for recommending this cut is answer number 28 in the Department's answer is that they didn't have any concrete plans and they were leaving it up to their Safety Specialist III to come up with something. So, it's a moot point at this point.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Answer number 28.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can I...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura, as the seconder. And then Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: No comments.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, so I was wondering if the Budget Chair...the Budget Director had any comments on behalf of the Department?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: So, the appropriation was put into the Corporation Counsel's Office under Risk Management because we wanted to have a uniform system for security. The request is for the Waikapu Baseyard that we have acquired several years ago. Public

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

Works, who has excess or who has outgrown the baseyard with all of their pavement preservation equipment, wants to utilize the Wailuku...Waikapu Baseyard for like a baseyard or a storage facility. So, what we wanted to do was put security measures there to avoid any type of vandalism or we wanted to make sure the equipment stays safe. And that's why we're asking for the security funding. And I believe...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, thank you.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Oh, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, oh no...

MS. YOSHIMURA: I believe the Department of Public Works did explain that when they came to the Committee last week.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, and I checked on it myself. I know that they're...they have experienced a lot of vandalism. So, I cannot support the motion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay, any other...okay, so we have Committee Vice-Chair King, followed by Member Hokama.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. We have \$150,000 for security equipment in Waikapu Baseyard, then we have \$45,000 for Wailuku. Is...just kind of what the difference is, and you know, is this a brand new system? And we haven't had security in Waikapu before, or are we just improving the other one?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That was my next motion, was the Wailuku one. And the answer . . . *(inaudible)*. . . Page...on number 28, it says we do not have details for the Wailuku and Waikapu Baseyards at this time. These items were placed in our budget in the event we have a Security Manager who will handle the Countywide coordination and installation of security equipment. Public Works can address the details of the requested equipment purchases. So, without a Security Manager, I'm not sure if we would be installing and maintaining and coordinating.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so, Ms. Yoshimura, you don't have those details either?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, at the Wailuku Base...okay, so Waikapu Baseyard is new. And so, that's a new request. The Wailuku...the Wailuku Baseyard system is to be upgraded. So, they have a system now that is outdated, and so we wanted to bring that system in compliance with like the rest of the County facilities. And so, we're asking for that monies. And we're putting it in Corporation Counsel again for consistency purposes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, and then that...have you...those quotes, have you already gotten those quotes and you have...they have plans for installation?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yes. Public Works had requested it in their budget. They have been doing the legwork on that. I just moved it from Public Works to Corporation Counsel.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Member Hokama, and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. I have the same concern as Chair Lee regarding vandalism, theft at the site. So, Budget Office, currently there is...Fire and whatnot has no system at the current baseyard? I know Fire Department did some relocation of programs so no security is currently at the area?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Councilmember Hokama, no. Nobody's actually...the Fire facility is a different...in a different area than what we're talking about in this Wailuku Baseyard...Waikapu Baseyard. So, there's nothing there now. So, it'll be installing everything new.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, okay. You wouldn't know by round estimate the amount of losses the County has regarding theft, burglary, and pilferage and whatnot? Do you have a sense of how much it's costing us to make...to, you know, and that's why we're looking at security better?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Sorry, I could get that number for you. But our pavement. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . . preservation equipment are high-cost items. So, we want to make sure they're protected and remain in an area where vandalism won't occur.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, understood. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Sugimura? Unmute.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Sorry. So, it makes me wonder if this should actually belongs in Public Works if it's on their baseyards, rather than in Corp. Counsel. I mean, I know Corp. Counsel has the, you know, loss and risk portion, but it sounds like it would be more of a Public Works item. Can we move this to Public Works? Director, somebody?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, you could put it back into Public Works and have them administer it themselves. The reason I put it in...under this program is so that our security systems all become uniform and for consistency purposes. And so, each department doesn't go out and get their own type of security cameras or, you know, level of security maintenance. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. I did go on a site visit to Public Works, the Wailuku Baseyard. And they were talking about this need so. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . .Administration directs this kind of decision.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Sugimura. Anyone else to speak to the motion or ask a question? Okay, I guess I just have one question, Ms. Yoshimura. So, in the response that Member Paltin read that we received from the Department, who would then make the plan for the security protection plan?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, we still have other employers in Risk Management that would probably assume the duties. But as we start to expand security systems throughout the County, we got one person who would be...who would oversee all of the security equipment. Would be helpful as a Security Manager...I know they asked for a Safety Specialist and the reason they did that was because there's no such thing as a Security Manager in the classification system for the civil service positions. And so, the closest they could come up with was the Safety Specialist. And then the duties would be defined as a Security Manager.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Point of information. The Loss Control Officer...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin, let me pause my minute. . .*(laughing)*. . . Okay, Member Paltin, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: In reading the position descriptions provided in the Corporation Counsel answers, the Loss Control Officer sounds like the position that they need. I mean we're talking about loss control, right. I mean you're talking about theft and things like that. So, I'm not clear why they're pursuing Safety Specialist when they...all the Safety Specialist people say this isn't in...this isn't their job. When you read the Loss Control Officer's job...I mean theft and that kind of thing is in the description, per the Department's answers. So, I kind of gotta disagree.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, if I could refer you to the responses submitted by Corporation Counsel Moana Lutey, question number eight, explains about the classification system and why we're calling it a Safety Specialist III. But we could revisit this and provide you with more detailed information.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Ms. Yoshimura. Okay, so with my remaining time for my minute, my follow-up question was that if we. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . .if we put it back under Public Works, would they have more capacity to carry out the work needed in this...in Fiscal Year '21, and then in Fiscal Year '22, we move to make this happen under Corporation Counsel?

MS. YOSHIMURA: That would be possible too. It would just be moving the funds from Corporation Counsel to Public Works and having probably the Highway Administration office take a look at it. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Quick follow-up I guess. Based on what Ms. Yoshimura said, if there are no objections, Members. Okay. So, if we were to put it under Highway Administration, would that still be General Fund?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yes. I think so because the garage is under the General Fund.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: So, we'll put it there.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Sinenci, you have one minute.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Just for clarification, Ms. Yoshimura. We did just delete a Safety Specialist III. Is that connected to this, the same issue? Category A.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Sorry. Councilmember Sinenci, the position that's on Page 1-5 of the Budget Details, is that your question? The Safety Specialist III?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yeah, so that's the position that we're talking about for the Security Manager.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just delete that one?

MS. YOSHIMURA: I believe you folks already deleted that position.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Anyone else wishing...I think almost everyone spoke to this motion already. So, I will call for the question. The question is deleting \$150,000 for the security equipment...for security for equipment at the Waikapu Baseyard. Okay, everyone clear? Okay. All those in favor of the motion, please see "aye" and raise your hand. All those who oppose, say "no" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, motion fails 7...7-2 with Member Sinenci and Member Paltin voting for the motion.

VOTE: AYES: Councilmembers Paltin and Sinenci.

**NOES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and
Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Molina, and
Sugimura.**

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION FAILED.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: I just wondered if you were wanting to make a recommendation to move the money to the Public Works Fund.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, I'll move, yeah, okay. So, I'll make that motion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, will you please make the motion.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, the motion will be to move the \$150,000 for security for the equipment at the Waikapu Baseyard from Corporation Counsel to Public Works Highways Administration.

VICE-CHAIR KING: To be funded by the General Fund.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: To be funded by the General Fund.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, moved by Committee Vice-Chair King, seconded by Chair Lee. Okay, any discussion? I think we kinda discussed it enough.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Sorry.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura? Oh, sorry, Member Hokama, followed by Ms. Yoshimura.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. Real quickly, I appreciate every Member's comments earlier. I see it just slightly different. I prefer Corporation Counsel continue to be the one that does the Countywide structure. But I prefer Department of Management to implement the whole thing, Countywide departments. I don't think Public Works is good enough or capable to do Countywide system on this security component. So, for me, it's a lack of confidence in Public Works. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, I was going to suggest if you're moving the monies to Public Works and it's going to be General Fund, if you could move it to the Special Maintenance Program, and have it administered from there.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any objections to that amendment to the motion?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No objections.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Okay, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, my comment in one minute is, you know, if we want to do a reconsideration for A, for instead of Safety Specialist III for Loss Control Specialist instead, duties summary, develops, analyzes, implements, coordinates, and monitors the loss control activities of the Countywide Risk Management Program, develops and monitors the loss control reporting system, provides technical consultations to other departments in loss control and performs other duties as required. So, I mean the reason why I'm suggesting the deletion is because they don't have a Security Manager to oversee it. And if we're going to still have the equipment purchases, then we might as well just fund the Loss Control Specialist position. But that's my two cents. Pau.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Paltin. Anyone else wanting to speak to the motion? Okay, seeing none, I'll...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can we add back the position?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, well...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: To the main motion?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Well, it's not adding back the same position. Member Paltin is recommending we add a different position for Loss Prevention instead of Security Specialist. So...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And it's the same thing...salary.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, we would need to get comments from Ms. Yoshimura on that.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, I liked your idea about putting, you know, for the installation, getting this over to Public Works so it could be installed because I think the security is important. But I think the position needs to be developed a little bit more. We shouldn't...I don't think we should put a position in place just for these two items. And so, you know, letting them take this year to develop that position that is going to oversee Countywide I think would be a prudent thing to do.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, the addition of the position or --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. YOSHIMURA: --Control Specialist would be the overall person for the security systems throughout the County. And if you're looking at adding that position, it's a SR-24 and the starting salary on that is 49,6...\$59,616 per year. So, we can calculate the eight-month salary if you want us to do that along with the fringe.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . gave us on Exhibit "H."

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, that's actually \$20,000 more than the Security Specialist III . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. YOSHIMURA: Well, the Security Specialist III at \$39,744 is based on a eight-month salary. So, the...okay, so it would be the same amount if you went with a Loss Control Specialist 'cause it's both SR-24.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And then to Committee Vice-Chair King's concern, would that position be ready if we were to put it in? To do the...carry out the kuleana?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yeah, so we would have that position be created. And then be prepared to take over all of the systems. Going back to Councilmember Hokama's point of putting it back into the Department of Management, that's also a consideration because it is a overall Countywide function.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Ms. Yoshimura. And then I guess if we were to put it under Management instead, would they have the capacity with the current staffing they have to carry out that responsibility?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MS. YOSHIMURA: No, it would probably take one additional position to create a position under the Department of Management and then having that function be under that office.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, that's why I don't like to get into the weeds of Administration. My feeling is that there is a very important need for a security system for Public Works. We know this as a fact because that used to be my committee. I've had many interactions with the employees. They tell me there are times when they order brand-new equipment and before you know it, the tires are gone, or it's vandalized. You know, thousands and thousands of dollars go into buying, purchasing expensive equipment. So, obviously, if you're going to do that, you have to provide for security. So, who, you know, the description of the person, I don't know. I don't know what that SR-22, SR-24. Normally. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . .you let that, you leave that up to the department to figure that out.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Oh, Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: So, yeah, it could be recommended that it be a Loss Control Specialist. When we go through the creation of the position and the Department of Personnel Services will actually pretty much determine whether or not that's the right position, whether it's a different, you know, if it should be a Safety Specialist, whether it should be a Loss Control Specialist. So, the final determination on the actual position will come once we create the job description. And just as background, back in like maybe 2017, we did have the security system under Department of Management.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Ms. Yoshimura. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, just listening to this, we know we have a need. When I did my Public Works site visit, you know, they talked about it. But as far as overall administration, I like what Member Lee said and Member Hokama. So, if you put this Security Manager or Loss Control, whatever you call it, let Administration decide what that's going to be. But we know we have a need. Let's put that position in the Managing Director's Office and he can take care of this equipment and make sure that we reduce our losses. So, that's what I'm hearing. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. So, the motion that's before us right now is to reduce the \$150,000 for security at the Waikapu Baseyard. So, I'm going to call for the question.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair? I think we...that motion failed, and the motion on the floor is to move the funds to Public Works.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Public Works. Mahalo, because you were the maker of the motion.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so the motion that we have before us . . . *(laughing)*. . . is moving the \$150,000 to Special Maintenance under Public Works. So, I'll call for the question.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair? Sorry.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: I don't want to complicate things. But if you're going to consider putting the Safety Specialist under the Department of Management, then I would suggest putting the monies for the security system also under the Department of Management. So, the Security Maintenance Contract that you had was \$220,000 in Risk Management, that should be moved along with the Waikapu and the Wailuku Baseyard monies because then that's the purpose of creating that position. Just my thoughts, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for piecing it all together for us.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, so you make the motion then.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Well, I have to ask the maker of the motion to withdraw.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I can withdraw. I mean this thing is getting so convoluted. I don't really even understand where we're going with it so I'm happy to withdraw.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I think Ms. Lee...I think Chair Lee should make the motion. . . *(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I can try.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I would pretty much repeat what Michele just said.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I'm not sure what she said because she keeps changing...the story keeps changing, so.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so in order to make the motion, we'll first have to reconsider Account B. 'Cause I think we're on C, right? Are we on B? I've lost track already.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We're on C.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: We're on C.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We are on C, right. Okay, so we have to reconsider for B so that we can make all the motion together if that's something that the Members would like to do. Is there any objection to the direction that we're going which is moving that whole package of items to Management, instead of leaving it in Corporation Counsel? Are there any objections?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No objections.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I don't have any objection, Chair, but isn't that also Account A because we...that one, there's a position.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so we need to reconsider...

VICE-CHAIR KING: A, B, and C.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: A, B, and C.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We already cut the position from A so we don't need to do anything with A over here.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right. So, A is already pau. So, we'll have to...we have to...Ms. Yoshimura, is it the same amount for the position under Management?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yes, it would be the same amount.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair? Isn't that...if we're talking about that 220, that was a contract, that wasn't a position.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, she's talking about the Safety Specialist.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, I thought she was talking about moving that 220 which is managing all the security...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Was also talking about that 220.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so I'm just very confused what's going on.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, I'm not confused. I've got it. I'll make the motion, and then I'll entertain someone moving. Okay. So, the motion that I will entertain will include several parts. First will be from Account A, a Safety Specialist position for eight months for \$39,744 to be moved to Department of Management, Account A.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can we call it Loss Control?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: For...hold on, Member Paltin. Let me finish this before I...before I become confused too. Okay, so the other item...Member Paltin, I'm going to mute you. Okay. Two-hundred-twenty-thousand dollars for the Annual Security Maintenance Contract to be removed from Account B in Corporation Counsel, and to Department of Management Account B for Professional Services; and to move the \$150,000 for Security for Equipment at Waikapu and the \$45,000 for Security Systems for Wailuku Baseyard to Department of Management, Account C.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So moved

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: So moved. Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Moved by Member Paltin, seconded by Member Sinenci. And I'll just make sure with Ms. Yoshimura that I got all of that correct.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair? One more request.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, one more, okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: So, sorry. So, if you look at Page 1-8 in the Budget Details...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Which one?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Page 1-8 of the Budget Details, Index Code 905022B, County Facilities Security, there was \$16,000 for electrical parts and supplies, Sub-Object --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

MS. YOSHIMURA: --6016 --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: --and also 6221, that \$30,000, if that can also be moved to the Department of Management with the security program.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I have a question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --Member Sugimura, do you have a proposal for Account C?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I don't know if I missed this, but the eLearning that was \$75,000.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: It'd be great to set up.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, that provides Countywide training for all the employees. Did you...if you cut it out, I think...oh, if you leave it in, I think we'll save money in the long run for that. Did it already come out?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Did I miss it?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: We voted on that, yeah. Didn't we vote on that?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We voted on that because it came from the Department as a recommendation to reduce.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Okay, thank you. Missed it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: If you want to move for reconsideration, you're welcome to.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Well, I think that there's benefit just with everything going on and...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You want to move for reconsideration?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, okay, I'll move for reconsideration.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, is there a second? Okay, hearing no second, we're going to move forward.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay. So, there aren't any priority proposals under Corporation Counsel. That means that we've completed our

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

review of Corporation Counsel A, B, C, and there aren't any CIPs. Okay. So, because we...reopened up...reconsidered Account B, I'll just ask for the entire department, is there consensus on the entire department of Corporation Counsel?

COUNCILMEMBERS: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, and then I'll ask Staff to bring up Exhibit "1" so we can, you know, have a look at it together, and the public can also have a look at it. And to answer Member Sugimura's question about Exhibit "1" being available on Granicus, it is. It's item 82. Yeah, I have to check with Staff. Ms. Espeleta? Okay, there we go.

MS. ESPELETA: Madam Chair, if you could...I just made the changes reflected in Corp. Counsel. I do have to make additional changes to Management. So, I'll go ahead and make that later. But can you confirm that this is what the Committee had decided on.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, we deleted the Safety Specialist for \$39,000. Aw, shucks, your double click to zoom is blocking the second one. Oh, there. Okay, reduce electric parts by \$16,000; reduce Miscellaneous Costs by \$30,000. Yes, that's correct. Guards, security for \$200,000. We're moving the \$220,000. The eLearning by \$75,000. The...so this actually will be the entire Wellness Program. And that was \$31,500. And the security equipment for \$150,000...oh, sorry, travel. Travel is \$41,813. Okay, perfect. Okay, and then that's the \$150,000, and then that's the \$45,000. I believe this was everything. Does any Member see something that was missed?

MS. DESJARDINS: Chair? Can I say something?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Desjardins?

MS. DESJARDINS: Yeah, I know there was a discussion about the Board of Ethics scanning project.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. DESJARDINS: And I think it got separated out. Did that get appropriated properly? I thought originally...something happened with that. Sorry, I wasn't following exactly, but you separated out the \$7,000 for the Board of Ethics and then didn't take it back up, I think. I'm not sure that got resolved.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so if we didn't delete it, then it remains in the Budget.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

MS. DESJARDINS: Okay, so originally there was some talk about deleting it, and then you decided to leave it in. Is that right?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The Department transmitted the proposal to delete the \$7,000 for the Board of Ethics' webpage and scanning. And I --

MS. DESJARDINS: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --requested that we separate the \$7,000 out, and that was approved. So, therefore, the \$7,000 item remained in the Budget.

MS. DESJARDINS: Awesome. Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. DesJardins. Okay, Members, any...okay, hearing no one speaking up, so we've achieved consensus on Department of Corporation Counsel. And this is what the amendments look like. Mahalo, Ms. Espeleta.

EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AGENCY

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so the next department is Emergency Management. Okay. All right. We received two...oh, okay. We didn't receive. Okay, so we'll get started on Emergency Management. We didn't receive recommendations from the Department.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair? Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you. That was one of the ones that came in this morning with the County Clerk. So, it's...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. I see it.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I have it in paragraph form. But you said you had a different format. So, you probably have a better format.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, okay. So, there's nothing in Account A that was proposed by the Department.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I have a...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Members have a proposal for Account A in MEMA? Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. One of my priorities, and I really worry about this Department because it's...

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: In the phrasing of a motion.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay. I move that we increase the Account A by three Specialist III positions and increase the two Specialist I positions in the Mayor's budget to Specialist III.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Could she repeat what she just said?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so you know, after working with...closely with the Emergency Management, my proposal is to change the two Specialist I positions in the Mayor's Budget to Specialist III positions 'cause we have people that are way overqualified. And then I did put a proposal to add three Specialist III positions at the request of the Manager because of how understaffed we are on that department.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, two Specialist II which is currently in the proposed budget, but you're moving it up from one to two and three Specialist III?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No, no. There's two Specialist I positions that are already in the budget that are hired that need to be moved to Specialist III positions because they're overqualified for Specialist I.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so that's the two that's already in there. And the other positions that you're adding?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Would be three expansion positions, Specialist III positions.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, is there a second first?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second for discussion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Committee Vice...oh sorry, Chair Lee. I'm going to allow Committee Vice-Chair King to speak to her motion first, and then I'll call on you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so upgrading the current EM Specialist I to EM Specialist III is...would entail \$24,442.60, that's with the fringe benefits. And upgrading the other EM Specialist I to EM Specialist III for eight months would be...would add an additional

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

\$8,730. So, the...actually the Department Manager, Herman Andaya, had told us in committee several times that he needs like ten positions. But, so, I'm just requesting for him three additional EM position III, Specialist IIIs for eight months, which with fringe benefits would come out to \$180,774.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, and then my turn. Ms. Yoshimura? Ms. Yoshimura, can you make a comment on that, please, since Herman's not here.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, well, the staff is...it's a small staff in Emergency Management. We are giving them two positions in the Mayor's proposed budget. If you want to reallocate a position from a I to a III, if the position is already filled, we need to make sure that they are qualified to be at that III level. But I guess then you would be looking at five expansion positions for Fiscal Year 2021 by adding three more to the already two that's been proposed. That's it. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, are you in favor? I mean have you talked with...talked it over with Herman? And are you in favor of this proposal?

MS. YOSHIMURA: I believe when the Emergency Manager came to...or put in his proposal with Mayor, he asked for three positions. So, I don't if the three positions that Councilmember King is asking for already includes the two that we've included. So, there's only one more that's needed. But I can verify that if it's a total of three, or he wants three on top the two that's already proposed. I can get that clarification.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, yes, it's a total of three, plus upgrading the two Specialists I's. We did hear from Director Andaya that those two Specialist I positions that are filled right now, are highly overqualified. And we had a discussion in Committee about it, you know, they're...I think they're...I believe, and I wish he was here to verify because I believe they both have PhDs. as well. One of them is Dr. Joyce who's done some pretty high-level presentations to our Committee. But there...there was, you know, there was six in the Department, the entire Department, and I guess they hired one. I've just been told they hired one halfway through. Ms. Yoshimura, you probably know about that. So, I think if they get...it would be great to get at least two more. If they could get three more, that would be awesome. But the...this is the one Department I think that is going to be facing a lot of expansion...expansion work, not just because of the COVID-19 but because of the climate change issues and the climate-related disasters we're experiencing.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, thank you. I don't have any more questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay, Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, just couple of things if maybe Budget Director can help us get some responses before final decision. Would this be under the current COVID Federal dollars reimbursable under FEMA for, let's say, limited term

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

considerations that...for the additional personnel? Is my first question. And then the second one is, from what I understand collective bargaining, would MEMA need to send in a reorganization request to the union because now you're looking at adding, potential, either a supervisor or some kind of manager in between these people and Mr. Andaya? So, is this a reorg requirement? Would be my next question. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . .mahalo, Member Hokama. Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, depending on how the structure is set up, it may require a reorganization within the Emergency Management Agency. Whether this is going to be COVID reimbursable, I would have to check to see if we add new positions on a limited-term basis if it can be paid for through COVID funds. But if we're looking at putting these positions in as permanent positions, then we would also need to see if a portion of the position can be COVID funds. If you look on Page 1-...or 4-3 of the Budget Details, there is one position that is a Specialist I that is currently funded for Fiscal Year 2020. That is the position that I'm assuming Councilmember King wants to upgrade to a III. The other EM Specialist I is a proposed position that we're asking for. So, they'll probably make that a III instead of a I from the start, and then adding on one more position. So, I went back to look at what the...what Mr. Andaya had submitted to us for Fiscal Year 2020, and he did request the positions, two positions, an EM Specialist I and a CD...the Civil Defense Specialist IV. So, those are the two positions we added. So, if you want another position, it'll be a EM Specialist III at a SR-20.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Pro Temp Kama? And then Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Chair...thank you, Chair. So, question for Budget Director, so if we increase the staff at Emergency Management, does the staff going to have to need support such as how about a desk, a place, or a space? Or what other...other ancillaries that they might need?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Councilmember Kama, so the...for every position that you include in the budget, you would need to add probably computer costs or...and a desk or office furniture for the person. So, we've been putting in about \$4,000 per expansion position, \$2,000 for the desks and \$2,000 for the computer.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Budget Chair. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Oh. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . .okay. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. So, I got a little hard time with this because I had a bunch of questions that never got answered. I don't know if they were transmitted or not. My issue is we have people doing the job, and we're...it's like we're proposing

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

this big raise. I think that if we want to add those Specialist III positions, we should let the people in the Specialist I positions apply for the Specialist III positions and keep some Specialist I positions because, you know, something like too many cooks in the kitchen. You need people on all the different levels would be my suggestion. And as to the equipment, you know how we're having these crises back-to-back, maybe we can have people, you know, coming in shifts like how, you know, you have the fire in the middle of the night. So that you have like A Watch, B Watch, and C Watch, or something like that. So, we have people manning it 24/7. Those would be my comments. I thought...my team and I came up with a lot of good questions, and I would've liked to have seen the answers before making this decision. But it is what it is. Any comments on that, Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Councilmember Paltin, I apologize. But we did not get a second set of questions. So, the responses that was provided from the Emergency Management office was the only set of questions that we did get. If you were looking at like a shift schedule in Emergency Management, that would require probably consultation with the union to establish different work hours, including like Saturdays and Sundays, if anything. So, something that we could explore. But it would take union consultation because of the change in work schedules.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I mean to me that's what Emergency Management is about. We don't have Monday through Friday, 8 to 4:30 emergencies. And then, I mean...okay. Thank you.

MS. YOSHIMURA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think it got lost in the shuffle because I coded it CD instead of EMA when I turned it in. I was going off of your little code over here in Budget Details. It was CD and I didn't know what the code was to be when I turned it in. But I didn't turn it late.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, sorry, Member Paltin. That's right.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Can I just respond to one of the questions?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, I just wanted to respond that when I, you know, when I discussed this with Director Andaya and I asked him if he would need extra workspace, and he said we'll make it work. So, it was kind of that same idea that Ms. Paltin had is that, you know, people come in and out during these emergencies. But I'm disappointed that he's not here to answer directly. So, you know, I understand that Members have problems because they're not getting their questions answered. I did meet the people that he was talking about as far as the upgrades go. So, that's probably my biggest concern is making sure we keep those high-level people on.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Members, any last questions or comments on this motion? If not, I will call for the question and the motion is to...I don't know.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, can I...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair, I think you're going to have to repeat the motion because there's been some suggested amendments to the motion.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I just wondered if I could break it down into two motions so that it would be easier for people to assimilate. Like the one motion to upgrade the two EM Specialist I...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Do you want to withdraw your motion first?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, I'll withdraw my motion. I know it's kind of confusing.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, go for it. Motion.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. So, I move to...for the Emergency Management Department to increase the two Specialist I position in the Mayor's Budget to Specialist III.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member...Ms. Yoshimura said that there's only one expansion position EM Specialist I.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well, those were the...those were positions that are existing right now according to Mr. Andaya that need to be upgraded to...they are people that are overqualified for the EM Specialist I that need to be upgraded to EM Specialist III.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, there's one EM Specialist I that is currently on staff, and the Mayor has proposed another EM Specialist I so there's --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --one currently on staff, and then there's one expansion position.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, well, let's just do the one then. I mean this was information that was given to me earlier and a lot of this, you know, was proposed before the COVID-19 stuff came up. But so, you know, I'll withdraw that one...just say let's, you know, my motion is to upgrade the EM Specialist I to EM Specialist III.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The one expansion position?

VICE-CHAIR KING: The one that is currently in there, not the expansion one. Because this is a person who's already working there and he came in at entry level. But he's really high-level and deserves to be an EM Specialist III. That's...well, I do not want to say the

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

name. I guess I'm not supposed to say who that is. But this is a person who had done presentations, you know, high-level. He's a climatologist.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, the motion is to upgrade the current EM Specialist I, which is at a SR-16C to an EM Specialist III which would be step SR-20. Is that correct, Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, yes and that would be redesccribing the position then from a I to a III. And provided that the incumbent qualifies to be a III.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Correct. I was...yeah, I was assured he does.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Is there a second? Okay, seeing no second, there is no motion on the floor. Okay, Committee Vice-Chair King, you had a second motion.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, my second motion, Chair, would be to upgrade the EM Specialist I that's proposed as a new position to EM Specialist III.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, moved by Committee Vice-Chair King, seconded by Chair Lee. I think we discussed this enough, yeah. Okay, I'll call for the question. All those in favor of the motion, please say "aye" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And then all opposed, please say "no" and raise your hand. Okay, so motion passes 6-3, Pro Temp Kama, Member Hokama, and Member Sugimura voting no, okay.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Lee, Molina, Paltin, and Sugimura.

NOES: Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, and Sugimura.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so, the EM Specialist I that is proposed will now be an EM Specialist III at SR-20, and the increase will be...Ms. Yoshimura, what will be the increase in cost?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, so the 8-month funding for a III would be \$32,632, which is an increase of \$4,728.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so the total will be \$32,632, and we'll be increasing the budget by \$4,028. And that's for eight months, yeah?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Correct.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: And then there's fringe to be added.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: At a later date, yeah, at a later time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, Members...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Members. I'm not going to pursue the other extra positions because I need the support of Mr. Andaya here to explain it, so.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Are there any other amendments to Account A? Seeing none, I'll ask for consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, next is Account B, and we received four proposed amendments from the Department in Account B to decrease by \$5,000, services and contracts. Decrease by \$5,000. I'm sorry. So, the first one is decrease \$5,000 of the \$10,000 for a new amount of \$5,000. Second is under electricity, decreasing by \$5,000, the proposed \$17,597 for a new amount of \$12,597. Telephone which is proposed at...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'd like to separate...electricity, separate it out.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Twenty thousand, decrease by \$4,156 for a new amount of \$15,844; and registration and training fees, \$2,922 from the \$6,500 for a new amount of \$3,578.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, is there a request for separating electricity out. Is there any...are there any objections?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. I'd like to separate out the telephone cost too. I'm a little worried about that.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Are there any objections to separating out the telephone, the \$4,156?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No objections.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. All right. So, I'll entertain a motion to decrease services and contracts by \$5,000, and to decrease registration and training fees by \$2,922.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: So moved.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So moved.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: So moved. Second.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Moved by Member Sinenci, seconded by Member Molina. All those in favor, please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Aye.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, any opposed? Motion passes unanimously.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Molina, Paltin, Sinenci, and Sugimura.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right. Are there any proposals from the Members for Account B?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have a proposal.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to decrease B by \$5,000. This is Page 4-5 of the Budget Details, Index Code 912014B-6101 under advertisement. I guess they partner with a non-profit, they can get free PSA's out, there's social media.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You said \$5,000?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Five-thousand-dollar decrease.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Members, the motion is to decrease the proposed \$10,000 item for advertising by, in half for a new total of \$5,000. Is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, seconded by Member Sinenci. Moved by Member Paltin, seconded by Member Sinenci. Member Paltin? Two minutes.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. I just, you know, advertising, there's so much ways to get the word out that I don't think that we should be paying, or that MEMA should be paying out of their budget for advertising in these pandemic times. Pau.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Sinenci, you have one minute as the seconder.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second for discussion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. And, Chair Lee, I saw your hand up for discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes. I'll be voting against the motion because this advertising is needed. It's essential. They have no idea when emergencies will arise. And they have to get the word out quickly either by radio or by print. And a lot of times if you do it by radio, PSAs are on a space-available basis. And quite frankly, I just purchased a PSA, well, announcements on behalf of the Council because I felt it was important that people heard the Councilmembers. As leaders of this community, that they would be reassured by hearing each one of you. And we paid \$3,000 for that and the radio station paid \$8,000. So, we did partner with them. But I wanted to be assured that we were going to be. . . *(timer bell ringing)*. . . heard, not at 12:00 midnight, but during regular hours. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay, Committee Vice-Chair King, followed by Member Hokama, and then Member Sugimura.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. I agree with Chair Lee. And one of the things that I, you know, over the past, I think three-and-a-half years that this has been one of the main things that we've been harping on, Emergency Management on, is getting the word out. You know, getting a wider network of communication. So, I look forward to them putting this money to good use because we've all been stuck in those emergencies where we don't know what's going on and there's nobody tracking it. There's not one communication method. So, I'm hoping that this is going to be put to good use. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Member Hokama, then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. Five-thousand is not going to break the County budget for me, Chair. But I just need us to have a better understanding and maybe Mr. Andaya, in the future, can send us the information. But if we are entering any type of emergency or hazard, under the Emergency Broadcasting Law, I mean the government is going to take over the airwaves anyway to get the public informed and out of harm's way. So, I just need to be clear if the government imposes the emergency, we're going to take over the media, and to, you know, until the emergency is over. So, I don't have a problem giving them some advertising money, but I just need to, you know,

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

be clear that when the emergency hits, we're not going to wait to pay, and they're not going to wait for us to contract to get public informed. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I think that Member...or Chair Lee gave a good example that when you buy advertising, it's way better than having a PSA which is free. And they do air whenever they have free airtime. Emergency Management has an advertising emergency system set up, and I think I can see why they probably couldn't really work on it a lot if he only had, you know, like only \$2,000 or \$1,000 in the past. But I agree with this increase because I think it's important, and we've seen more and more emergencies. And I would like them to manage the message. So, I think this will help them manage the message. So, I'm sorry, Tamara, but I'm going to not vote for the reduction.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I won't take it personal.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, I believe that Mr. Andaya also uses these monies to take out ads to...for emergency preparedness to alert the public on how to prepare for hurricanes or, you know, that type of events. And so, that's part of his advertising monies where he has to buy ad space to put in the newspapers or on the radio.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Yoshimura. That was actually going to be my question. So, mahalo for answering my question before I asked it. So, I. . .*(inaudible)*. . .be voting for the motion. But...what's that? Was that you, Member Paltin? When we did have MEMA before us in the Council Chambers, that was something that I requested of the Department to do more, which was to be more proactive in getting more education out. So, I won't be voting for the motion. So, I'll call for the question. All those in favor, please say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Aye.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, I see two people. And then all those oppose, raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Aye.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Nay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, nay.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Well, we were wondering where we should put it. It was for...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Fifty thousand.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Fifty thousand for container repair and some equipment for the Hāna HEPT, emergency team on East Maui, and so we weren't sure if was a grant, come under grants.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I don't remember what he said. What did he say when he was before us?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: He said that we couldn't use the million dollars from the...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right. So, where would this go?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: He didn't make any...so our question was, where would we put it? Would it be under the same place where they get the Red Cross Grants? But I don't know if that...Red Cross is under...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura, do you know where the \$50,000 for the Hāna Emergency Preparedness Team would go?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Chair, so the...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: One moment. Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, sorry. Councilmember Sinenci's question was \$50,000 for container repair and other equipment? Whether it could be from a grant?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: So, we had a...for our container, we have a repair, paint and build roof over three containers located at Hāna School. They were former FEMA containers that was turned over to the County. And then we were going to...well, paint emergency supply container, provide the roof, purchase preparedness supplies for the containers including medical PPE, a small generator, and some other necessary supplies. We were also...the group also wanted to purchase preparedness supplies for the containers...well, distribute handouts regarding disaster preparedness for the East Maui community.

MS. YOSHIMURA: So, Chair, Page 4-5 of the Budget Details.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. YOSHIMURA: You could put...depending on the amount of the equipment, the cost of the equipment, \$1,000 or lower, will go under the B Account. You could also put your medical and safety supplies in that area too. So, the \$50,000, if you're not buying any equipment in excess of \$1,000, then you could put all the funding in

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

Index Code 912014B. And then break it up according to the Sub-object, medical supplies, equipment, that sort of categories.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci, is your intention to give the \$50,000 to the Hāna Emergency Preparedness Team?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura, does that make a difference in where it's located at?

MS. YOSHIMURA: So, if it's going to be given to the team, then you might want to do a grant to them. If they have an organization, then we could grant them the \$50,000, and they would then purchase whatever needs to be purchased. So, depending on who's going to be purchasing all of the equipment, or who's going to be maintaining the containers actually.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci, who will be maintaining the containers?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: The HEPT team, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so, Ms. Yoshimura, would it go under 6317, County Grant Subsidy?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yes, that would be appropriate.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Go ahead and make your motion. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I move to increase under grants...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Six-three-one-seven, County Grants Subsidy by 50,000.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, Page 4-7.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Second.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair? Sorry.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, do want to it to be a line item, Councilmember Sinenci? And it would have then read, grant to and then the agency's name. Or if you want it generic then it'll just go under...on Page 4-6 under 912014B-6317 Sub-object. And then it'll just be a grant subsidy with no specific organization.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Director...

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I would...the line item to go to the Hawai'i Emergency...Hāna Emergency Preparedness Team.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Moved by Member Sinenci and seconded by Member Molina. Okay, Members, questions? I see a question from Member Hokama, Chair Lee, and Pro Temp Kama. Member Hokama, one minute.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you. Mr. Sinenci, so these are FEMA containers that is now under the jurisdiction of the school or the Hāna Preparedness Team?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Member Hokama. It looks like it was formerly FEMA containers, but it was turned over to the County.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay. So, knowing the County, I don't know, Ms. Yoshimura, if you capitalize it and depreciate it out, the value of the containers. So, if he did, is...and the container has currently no book value, does it make sense for us to repair it? Because we already basically in one sense wrote it off. So, I don't know how the...*(timer bell ringing)*...County is counting it on the inventory because I wouldn't know why we wouldn't get FEMA money to replace the old FEMA container.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Councilmember Hokama, we would need to look into whether it's on the County's inventory or what the status of the containers are. And then we can get back to you on that.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Oh, yeah, and again, yeah, Chair, real fast, because it impacts the container on Lāna`i, the FEMA container on Lāna`i eventually. So, I would like to know...or Moloka`i, so I'd like to, yeah, get the status eventually. Thank you.

MS. YOSHIMURA: We'll report back.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Chair Lee, and then Pro Temp Kama. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Do they have a 501(c)(3), Mr. Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes, they do, Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, so how have they been receiving their funding up until now?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: You're muted, Shane.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: The team was formed this year, sorry. And we've got a lot of different professional EMTs. We have a fireman. We have several local doctors that's part of the HEPT team. And they've been --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: --helping with the COVID testing as well. Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. I was just going to ask early on in the beginning when we first started conversation if that was...if what Mr. Sinenci was talking about is something that the American Red Cross could take care of under their grant for \$50,000. Knowing that we just...if that was something American Red Cross does. That's all I was going to ask. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I'm not aware. I would refer to the Director.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, sorry. Could you repeat that question?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Keani, you're muted.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. So, the question is could this. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . .go under the...could the American Red Cross do this work? Is that what you asked, Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And so...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. And Member Sinenci doesn't know the answer and asked if you would know the answer. And I said that you would likely not know the answer because the Red Cross operations are their own operations.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yeah, but I could find out from Mr. Andaya and get back to you on that response.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Yoshimura.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Oh, Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Clarification. So, you're adding it to 912061B?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Okay, so that specifically to the Red Cross, yes?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, sorry, no.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Okay, if you're going to create a line item, there's not going to be an Index Code until July 1. But it'll just read, grant to, and then the agency's name, the Hāna Emergency Preparedness Team.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo --

MS. YOSHIMURA: And then...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --for that clarification, Ms. Yoshimura. So, strike the Index Code. No Index Code until it's been adopted, okay. Okay, Members, I...are there any other proposals for B? I see Member Paltin with two priority proposals.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I have a motion to decrease.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, motion to reduce?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to decrease from Page 126, travel by \$9,000 and...if I get a second, I'll make the discussion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Members.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, moved by Member Paltin, seconded by Pro Temp Kama. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You have two minutes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I'm just decreasing the change amount which was an increase by \$14,000 for Fiscal Year '21. But I subtracted the \$5,000 for the training travel that we had already voted on. And so then, that brings it to \$9,000 instead of the \$14,000

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

increase from Fiscal Year '20. And just because, you know, the situation of travel, how it is right now and...yeah. So, it's not a 50 percent decrease but it's the increase of...from Fiscal Year '20 to Fiscal Year '21, proposing to eliminate that entirely.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Pro Temp Kama, you'd like to speak to the motion?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I support that. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Members, any other questions or comments? Okay, I'll call for the question. All those in favor, please say "aye" and raise your hand. Okay, okay, and all those opposed, please say "no" and raise your hand.

VICE-CHAIR KING: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, I see two "noes," Committee Vice-Chair King and Mem...Chair Lee, and, Member Hokama, I'm going to guess that you voted "yes." Okay. Okay, so the motion passes 2-7, Committee Vice-Chair King and Chair Lee in opposition.

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, and Councilmembers
Hokama, Kama, Molina, Paltin, Sinenci, and
Sugimura.**

NOES: Vice-Chair King and Councilmember Lee.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Any other proposals to reduce Account B? Okay, so now, Members, priority proposals for Account B. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I don't think I had a proposal for Account B. Environmental Management.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, sorry. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Not Emergency Management.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Emergency Management, okay, okay, sorry. My bad. Okay, anything else for Account B? If not, I'll ask for consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And we're now on Account C. Any proposals for Account C? Okay, seeing none, I'll call for consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That is everything for Department of Emergency Management, sorry, Emergency Management Agency, okay. Oh, okay, we have...Ms. Espeleta is on it. Mahalo. Okay, so we have Exhibit "1" before us. We have the...aw, shucks. Ms. Espeleta, would you mind moving your mouse? Oh, okay. All right.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Can she make it bigger?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Miss...okay. There, okay. There we go. Okay, so the agency may upgrade one...oh, too big. One EM Specialist I position to EM Specialist III for a difference of \$4,780...sorry, \$28, and we will add the fringe to Countywide after. Reduce service contracts by \$5,000. Reduce registration and training fees by \$2,922. And reduce travel by \$9,000.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Point of information.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I thought that when we were making our cuts based on the Department's recommendation, their recommendation was to decrease travel for training by \$5,000. And then I proposed another \$9,000 for a total of \$14,000 which was the increase from Fiscal Year '20. But I only see a \$9,000 reduction for travel.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, yeah, no, that's what I understood your motion to be. Did anyone understand that --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That...that's what it is.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --to be different? Okay, that's what everyone voted on. Okay, so I'll just do this last one which was the grant to Hāna Emergency Preparedness Team for \$50,000. Okay, and then we'll...Member Paltin, if you would like to move for reconsideration on the reduction of the travel item.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, did I say it...I said it wrong?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I asked if everyone understood that we were reducing it by \$9,000 and...I saw everyone nodding their head. That was my understanding as well.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, not \$9,000 on top of their recommendation?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, that's not what I understood, but if you would like to move for reconsideration.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, I'll move for reconsideration. My motion had meant to be to bring travel to Fiscal Year '20 levels. And I subtracted \$5,000 from it because...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Hold on. Yeah, so your move is for reconsideration, and if you get a second, then you can explain.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We got a second from Member Sinenci. Okay, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I just had meant to reduce the travel levels to Fiscal Year '20 amounts based on the pandemic and the stopping of travel and no foreseeable start to it. That's it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess I said it wrong last time.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, maybe instead of...so, just say the numbers because you...I repeated your motion to everyone, and it was to reduce travel by \$9,000, and that's what everyone voted on. So, just say reduce travel by \$14,000. And then that's what I'll repeat, and then it'll be clear what it is that we're voting on.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, sorry, my bad.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so it's...let's see. So, we're going to vote for reconsideration of...I guess the entire budget since we...the entire Department budget since we came to consensus on the entire budget, and it'll be based on reducing travel by \$14,000 instead of \$9,000. So, if that is what you would like to do, then that is why you will vote for reconsideration. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You want me to say so moved, or no?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, I already said moved by Member Paltin, seconded by Member Sinenci. I'm clarifying for Members what it is that we're doing right now. And that is moving for reconsideration of the consensus we achieved for Emergency Management Agency, and then you can make your motion to decrease the travel by \$14,000 instead of \$9,000. But Members know that if they're going to vote for reconsideration now, then that means that they'll likely, or they will be voting for your motion of reducing travel by \$14,000, and not \$9,000, okay. And, Ms. Espeleta, you can stop sharing the screen now. Mahalo. Okay, Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. I speak against the motion because, you know, I really worry about this agency. It's a very...it has a pretty small budget already. But it's a very small agency compared to their duties, and they're tasked to address emergency management. And I think especially, even though I'm in favor of most of the departments reducing their travel, that if anyone's going to be traveling, it's probably going to be this agency. You know that it's going to know how to travel during this COVID-19. But, you know, I'm...I was worried about doing any cuts to this agency, and we've done a few which I'm okay with. But I think we need to stop where we're at. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. And I forgot to ask Member Sinenci as a seconder of the motion if you want to speak to the motion.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just for clarification, Chair. So, the \$14,000 includes the \$5,000 that the department had originally said decrease travel for training?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. So, it would be 5,000, plus an additional \$9,000 for a total of \$14,000. So, if you...

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, great, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, anyone else wishing to speak to the motion? Chair Lee?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I will vote no also for all the reasons that were expressed by Member King. This is a small agency. They need the funds.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Oh, I was happy that we're going to leave something to travel. But the reconsideration makes me have to revert back to, you know, voting no on this motion. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Seeing no one else wishing to speak to the motion, I will also be voting against the motion. Okay, I'll call for the question for reconsideration of the consensus we achieved for the Emergency Management Agency. All those in favor, please say "aye" and raise your hand. All those opposed, please say "no" and raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No.

VICE-CHAIR KING: No.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, eight "noes," one "yes," the motion fails. Member Paltin voting in favor of the motion, okay.

VOTE:	AYES:	Councilmember Paltin.
	NOES:	Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, Vice-Chair King, and Councilmembers Hokama, Kama, Lee, Molina, Sinenci, and Sugimura.
	ABSTAIN:	None.
	ABSENT:	None.
	EXC.:	None.

MOTION FAILED.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. . .*(timer bell ringing)*. . . Okay. Sorry, that's our time. All right, good night, folks. . .*(laughing)*. . .

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Good night. Dinner time. There goes the dinner bell.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, this is such an important department and the work that they do. I agree. And Mr. Sinenci, because he's so far away, you know, it's really important that...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I'm sorry, Member Sugimura. We've already achieved consensus on the Department. We're done discussing...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I have a question about the consensus. So, I have a question about that. So, if I just could put this out there.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, the agency that he said...I mean we already approved it, and that's fine. I just want to make sure that they're ready to accept the grant, and they're viable, and they're ready to go. That's all. I just wanted to know, as a non-profit.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: That's my question.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you. Thank you, Ms. Sugimura. Yes, that team had a quick turnaround, specifically for the COVID testing that we had this last Friday and the Friday...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci, yes or no.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Fiscally.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I don't mean can they do the work.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes or no.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Can they accept money from the County? Are they a viable...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, Member Sinenci said yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: It was a request...yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Members. Okay, so those were all the departments that we had for today. I was hoping that we could take up one more department, maybe Finance. So, it's 6:45.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, how many people have questions? How many people have questions?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: It's not the questions. It's how many people have --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, let me put it this way.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: --amendments.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Ms. Tamara, do you have questions? Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Amendments. Amendments, Alice.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Amendments.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: In each category, A, B, and C, in Finance.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I know if there aren't that many questions, you know, we could take it up, I suppose, right?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Famous last words.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, I don't see Member Paltin anymore. I do see Member Sugimura's hand and Member Molina's hand. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Your call, Chair. But I basically took Director Teruya's letter and made that, you know, for the reduction. So, it's pretty much what he said.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Member Molina? Oh, I'm sorry. Were you still speaking, Member Sugimura? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, Madam Chair, with Finance, I mean I don't know how deep you want to take this into the night, but I got one Finance proposal and also two considerations for a budget reduction. So, I'm just throwing that out there. It might generate some long discussions, so I don't know if we want to...we have the energy for it. But I prefer to start fresh tomorrow. That's my feeling. Thank you.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. All right. I think that would be my preference as well. And so, if there are no objections, we will take up Department of Environmental Management, Department of Finance, Department of Fire and Public Safety, and Department of Housing and Human Concerns tomorrow.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No objections.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, are we going to take up Countywide?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That is under Finance.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Great.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: All right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any objections?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay then, it's 6:47. I'll...let me just check with Staff really quickly. Staff, did I miss anything before we adjourn?

MS. ESPELETA: No, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, Members, it's 6:48 on April 20th, and the...oh, I'm sorry. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I just was going to ask, is your Staff going to give us whatever adjustments they already made to Exhibit "1" so that we can have something with us if the Member chooses 'cause I would like to be able to print out a Exhibit "1" updated draft, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. So...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Is it on Granicus?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It...well, the entire Exhibit "1" is on Granicus. It's Item 82.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, no, but the changes that were being made on...in real time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so that is on Excel on Ms. Espeleta's spreadsheet. So, I can have those changes to the Members tomorrow morning.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, good.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. That will help me cut the millions.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Is there a way that we can maybe increase the font just a little bit on the spreadsheet that she sends to us so I don't have to get my magnifying glass?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so there's a way to print the spreadsheet if you...we'll send a PDF for everyone, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Perfect. Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And it'll just be the amendments because you already have the rest.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes, yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And the rest has not changed. It's only what we worked on today, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Great. I'm glad we're clear.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, any last comments before I adjourn?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Move to adjourn. . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. Good job.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Chair.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's 6:50 on April 20th and the Economic Development and Budget Committee is now adjourned. . . .(gavel). . . .

ADJOURN: 6:50 p.m.

APPROVED:

Keani Rawlins-Fernandez

KEANI N.W. RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ, Chair
Economic Development and Budget Committee

edb:min:200420:rlk

Transcribed by: Reinetta L. Kutz

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 20, 2020

CERTIFICATE

I, Reinette L. Kutz, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED this 9th day of June 2020, in Makawao, Hawai'i.


Reinette L. Kutz