

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MAUI COUNTY BOARD OF ETHICS

STATE OF HAWAII

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

REGULAR MEETING

Held via BlueJeans video conference, commencing at
12:31 p.m., on August 19, 2020.

REPORTED BY: SANDRA J. GRAN, RPR/CSR #424

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

CHAIR: WILLIAM CURTIS, JR.
VICE CHAIRPERSON: DAVID WEISS
RACHEL PHILLIPS
DONNA CLAYTON
GERALDINE LEWIS
SEWARD AKAHI
TRAVIS THOMPSON
SHANNA WILLING

STAFF PRESENT:

DEPUTY CORPORATION COUNSEL: KRISTINA TOSHIKIYO
COMMISSION SECRETARY: CORY-LYNN VICENS

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

(August 19, 2020, 12:31 p.m.)

* * *

CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Calling the Board of Ethics August 19th meeting to order. We will do the roll call. David.

VICE CHAIR WEISS: Yes.

CHAIR CURTIS: Is here. Seward.

MEMBER AKAHI: Here.

CHAIR CURTIS: Donna.

MEMBER CLAYTON: Here.

CHAIR CURTIS: Here. I'm here.

Geri.

(No response.)

CHAIR CURTIS: No Geri.

Linda is excused.

Rachel.

MEMBER PHILLIPS: Here.

MEMBER LEWIS: Hi. I'm sorry.

VICE CHAIR WEISS: Geri's on now.

CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. And Shanna.

MEMBER WILLING: Here.

CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So the first agenda item is any public testimony.

MS. VICENS: Chair, this is Cory. We do have some -- besides our members, we do have some visitors who have

1 not stated whether they are giving any public testimony. I
2 see Mr. Raatz is participating. We did receive written
3 testimony from him.

4 Mr. Raatz, will you be providing testimony today?

5 MR. RAATZ: No, I won't be. I'm here to observe or
6 if there are any questions, I'd be happy to answer them for
7 the board. Thank you.

8 MS. VICENS: All right. Thank you.

9 Is there anyone else that will be giving testimony
10 today, please identify yourself, on any of the items?

11 (No response.)

12 MS. VICENS: Chair, nobody has identified themselves
13 as giving testimony, so we are ready to proceed.

14 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. I believe we have Madge
15 Schaefer, but that will be when the agenda item comes up.

16 MS. VICENS: Yes, sir.

17 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay, all right. So first can I have
18 a motion to approve the minutes of -- or to review the minutes
19 of June 24th?

20 MEMBER PHILLIPS: So moved. Rachel.

21 MEMBER CLAYTON: Second. Donna.

22 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Any comments on the June 24th
23 minutes?

24 MEMBER THOMPSON: Mr. Chair.

25 CHAIR CURTIS: Yes.

1 MEMBER THOMPSON: Could I suggest that they cross-
2 reference the minutes to the agenda? In other words, when
3 you -- when I read the minutes, it would help to have, you
4 know, Roll Call, Call to Order, Old Business, and so on in the
5 body of the minutes. If that would -- that's not a change to
6 the minutes, but it would be a welcome addition --

7 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

8 MEMBER THOMPSON: -- for the person that reads
9 (inaudible) or so.

10 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. That it?

11 MEMBER THOMPSON: Thank you.

12 CHAIR CURTIS: And any comments on the body of the
13 minutes?

14 (No response.)

15 CHAIR CURTIS: If not, could we have a motion to
16 accept it as submitted?

17 MEMBER THOMPSON: So moved.

18 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I think you need a second.

19 CHAIR CURTIS: And did I get a second? Have we got
20 a second?

21 MEMBER CLAYTON: Second. Donna.

22 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. And second Donna. Okay. How
23 about a motion for the minutes of July 8th --

24 MS. TOSHIKIYO: You need to vote on it.

25 CHAIR CURTIS: Oh, I'm sorry. So call a vote to

1 accept the minutes of June 24th. All in favor, say aye or
2 raise your hand on the screen.

3 (Response.)

4 CHAIR CURTIS: Any opposed, raise your hand or say
5 aye.

6 (No response.)

7 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Seeing none, the minutes are
8 accepted.

9 Okay. Motion to enter the minutes of the July 8th
10 meeting?

11 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I make a motion that we enter in
12 the minutes of the July 2020 meeting into the record.

13 CHAIR CURTIS: There's a motion. Is there a second?

14 MEMBER PHILLIPS: Second. Rachel.

15 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Any discussion on the July 8th
16 minutes?

17 VICE CHAIR WEISS: The same transcript -- the
18 same --

19 MEMBER THOMPSON: The same --

20 VICE CHAIR WEISS: -- comments --

21 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

22 VICE CHAIR WEISS: -- would carry over.

23 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes, yes.

24 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Okay.

25 CHAIR CURTIS: Travis.

1 MEMBER THOMPSON: Make a motion for the approval of
2 the July 8th minutes as submitted.

3 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. There is a motion. Do we have
4 a --

5 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I'll second.

6 CHAIR CURTIS: Second. All in favor of accepting
7 the minutes of July 8th, say aye or raise your hand.

8 (Response.)

9 CHAIR CURTIS: All opposed?

10 (No response.)

11 CHAIR CURTIS: Seeing none, it's accepted.

12 Okay. Old Business, Financial Disclosure
13 Statements: None.

14 Communication Items: None.

15 Review of Advisory Opinion 20A-02 regarding Peter
16 Martin. Does everyone have that in their packet?

17 (No response.)

18 CHAIR CURTIS: Just -- we need a motion to review
19 this advisory opinion.

20 MEMBER THOMPSON: I make a motion to accept the
21 advisory opinion as submitted.

22 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Motion to accept it as
23 submitted. Is there a second?

24 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I'll second.

25 MEMBER CLAYTON: Second. Donna.

1 CHAIR CURTIS: Second Dave and Donna. Okay. Any
2 discussion?

3 (No response.)

4 CHAIR CURTIS: I guess we've accepted it as is. So
5 vote on the Peter Martin advisory opinion, all those in favor,
6 say aye or raise your hand.

7 (Response.)

8 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. All opposed?

9 (No response.)

10 CHAIR CURTIS: Seeing none, it looks like a
11 unanimous acceptance there.

12 Next agenda item: The Advisory Opinion for Chana
13 Makale'a Dudoit Ane of February 28th. Do we have a motion to
14 review -- to --

15 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I'll make a motion to accept this
16 as presented.

17 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Can I get a second on the
18 motion to accept it as presented?

19 MEMBER PHILLIPS: Second. Rachel.

20 CHAIR CURTIS: Second. Okay.

21 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Take a vote.

22 CHAIR CURTIS: All right. So vote, all in favor of
23 accepting it as submitted, say aye.

24 (Response.)

25 CHAIR CURTIS: All opposed? Any opposed?

1 (No response.)

2 CHAIR CURTIS: Dispose of that one. Okay.

3 Continuation of a June 24th meeting -- for
4 discussion of a Request For Advisory Opinion from Gwen Hiraga.
5 We had a previous opinion on this and I believe we have to
6 amend it to correct -- or to add some additional clarity on
7 this. Is that correct?

8 (No response.)

9 CHAIR CURTIS: So I guess we have to have a motion
10 to review this to get to discussion on this.

11 VICE CHAIR WEISS: So moved.

12 MEMBER CLAYTON: So moved. This is Donna.

13 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Second. Dave.

14 Do we have corp. counsel on?

15 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah. Cory or Corp. Counsel, do we
16 want to chime on this one?

17 MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes. This is Kristi now. When I
18 was working on the opinion, I did review Ms. Hiraga's letter
19 again and noticed that a big part of her request was whether
20 or not she can participate in the MRA's discussions on the, I
21 guess, proposed amendments. So we did talk about and decided
22 on the projects that she is working on with the ARC of Maui as
23 well as with Munekiyo Hiraga, but that one specific question
24 had not been discussed. So that's what today's --

25 VICE CHAIR WEISS: If I recall -- so if I recall,

1 there's two issues: 1) Can she vote on the general plan and
2 if the general plan included the ARC of Maui in that general
3 plan and the other question was when something that dealt with
4 the ARC of Maui specifically, and I think that's where we were
5 going provide advisory.

6 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah. And I believe we discussed
7 that if it was part of the larger whole --

8 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Right, if it's general plan. If
9 that was -- if ARC of Maui is included in the general plan,
10 that she could participate, but if it was specifically about
11 the ARC of Maui, that's where she has to recuse herself.

12 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah.

13 MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes. I -- her specific -- yes. Her
14 specific request, though, in her March 4th letter is guidance
15 whether or not she can participate in the review of proposed
16 amendments to the Wailuku Redevelopment Area zoning and
17 development code.

18 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. And that affects the entire
19 project district --

20 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Right.

21 CHAIR CURTIS: -- not her --

22 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Not ARC of Maui. And I think
23 that's -- I think she should be able to do that.

24 CHAIR CURTIS: Yes.

25 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Is my opinion.

1 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah.

2 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yeah.

3 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Anybody else? (Inaudible.)

4 CHAIR CURTIS: So let's -- discussion? I believe
5 that did fall under what we discussed previously.

6 MEMBER THOMPSON: It may have been an oversight, but
7 my feeling was that that was something we had all kind of
8 agreed to and perhaps we just missed that in terms of specific
9 requests she made, but we were in agreement with her
10 participation with the exceptions that were noted.

11 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

12 MEMBER THOMPSON: That was my understanding.

13 CHAIR CURTIS: Are there any other board members
14 that feel different from that or is that the general
15 consensus?

16 MEMBER CLAYTON: I agree. This is Donna.

17 MEMBER PHILLIPS: I agree as well. Rachel.

18 CHAIR CURTIS: So can I entertain a motion to amend
19 this advisory opinion to add this language?

20 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yeah. I would like to make a
21 motion for Gwen's continued participation in the review of
22 proposed amendments to the Wailuku Redevelopment Area zoning
23 and development code.

24 MEMBER CLAYTON: Second.

25 CHAIR CURTIS: There's been a motion.

1 MEMBER CLAYTON: Donna.

2 CHAIR CURTIS: Donna second. Okay. Any additional
3 discussion or should we -- feel ready to vote?

4 VICE CHAIR WEISS: That advisory already included --
5 and, again, correct me if I'm wrong, that if it's specifically
6 about the ARC of Maui, she should recuse herself.

7 CHAIR CURTIS: Right. But it was the overall --

8 VICE CHAIR WEISS: If it was the general -- if it
9 was the general plan or development plan that included
10 interests of the ARC of Maui, that she could participate.
11 That's right.

12 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah.

13 MS. TOSHIKIYO: And then she also is employed with
14 Munekiyo Hiraga, so that was also part of her original
15 request.

16 CHAIR CURTIS: And we did say that she did need to
17 recuse herself on that. I don't think that language would
18 change at all. Just adding the language --

19 MEMBER THOMPSON: My understanding was this was just
20 to expand what we had previously decided to include the more
21 general thing about her Wailuku Redevelopment Area zoning.

22 CHAIR CURTIS: That's my understanding as well.

23 MEMBER THOMPSON: Good.

24 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So if there's any other -- no
25 other discussion, can we have a -- or did we have a motion

1 already to amend the language?

2 MEMBER CLAYTON: Yes.

3 CHAIR CURTIS: We're just waiting for a second.

4 MEMBER THOMPSON: And we had a second.

5 CHAIR CURTIS: And we had a second. Okay. All in
6 favor of --

7 Kristina, are you clear as to what -- from us what
8 we should add?

9 MS. TOSHIKIYO: I just wanted to double-check with
10 Ms. Hiraga that that is what her request is.

11 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

12 MS. HIRAGA: Yes. Good afternoon, Chair and
13 Members. This is Gwen Hiraga. That is my request
14 specifically on the larger issues and I had said at the last
15 meeting that, of course, whenever it came to any items that
16 directly affected the ARC of Maui or something that my
17 employer is working on, I would not be voting on it, but just
18 on, you know, general development code and other matters that
19 are generally under the purview of the MRA, but not specific
20 projects.

21 CHAIR CURTIS: And I believe we concur with you on
22 that.

23 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

24 CHAIR CURTIS: So if that language is enough, we'll
25 amend our advisory opinion and get it out to you next month,

1 but understand that we've reached this decision today if you
2 need to act accordingly.

3 MS. HIRAGA: Okay. Thank you very much for your
4 time and review.

5 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

6 MEMBER THOMPSON: Have a vote.

7 CHAIR CURTIS: Let's have the vote. All in favor in
8 amending the language, say aye.

9 (Response.)

10 CHAIR CURTIS: Any opposed?

11 (No response.)

12 CHAIR CURTIS: Seeing none, it's unanimous. Okay.

13 Thank you, Ms. Hiraga.

14 MS. HIRAGA: Thank you.

15 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Agenda Item F, Update from the
16 Board Temporary Interaction Group regarding the progress of
17 the Maui Gifts Quick Guides. Donna had most of the legwork on
18 this and I did a little bit.

19 Do you want take the lead on this, Donna?

20 MEMBER CLAYTON: Thank you, Bill.

21 So all of you, I believe, had a chance to review our
22 draft for the County of Maui Quick Guide on Gifts protocol
23 that Cory sent out and this is -- our goal is to have
24 something very simple to understand, that, you know, we want
25 to eliminate confusion for people and just make it really easy

1 to understand so nobody has to come before the board of
2 ethics, you know, because they misinterpreted something. And
3 so we've gotten this far. Matt Macario, our former chair,
4 chimed in from afar and gave us his thoughts, so they are
5 included in here. And I -- we're now ready for your thoughts
6 on it to see if you -- first of all, from my point of view,
7 I'd like to know if you feel that if you were a new member of
8 the county and you got this, would you understand it, would
9 there be any things that you were vague on, and -- and any
10 additions or changes, we welcome. We're just -- wanted to
11 give you a good start.

12 CHAIR CURTIS: And it also includes some items that
13 came up over and over and over again and we thought if we put
14 it in this quick guide, we would eliminate some of the
15 questions about sporting events tickets and alcohol and other
16 items that have generally come up and we've generally --

17 MEMBER THOMPSON: If I may.

18 CHAIR CURTIS: Go ahead, Travis.

19 MEMBER THOMPSON: Donna, what I -- what I've seen, I
20 like. The simpler, the better. The straight -- the more
21 straight forward, the better.

22 MEMBER CLAYTON: Right.

23 MEMBER THOMPSON: I think it certainly is something
24 that would be operational if I was a person that had to
25 operate to this. I think it would be very good, so well done.

1 MEMBER CLAYTON: Thank you.

2 CHAIR CURTIS: Thank you, Donna. And Gerri was
3 involved in this as well; right?

4 MEMBER CLAYTON: Yeah. Everybody, our TIG.

5 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. The state board of ethics had
6 a similar one-page guide that they issued a couple years ago
7 and so we're kind of taking that example and modifying it for
8 the county items that came up for us on a frequent basis, but,
9 yeah, I --

10 MEMBER CLAYTON: And also at the bottom it says,
11 Contact for clarification, so we need to figure out who that
12 would be.

13 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah. My thoughts on that were
14 contact your supervisor within the county, 'cause that's how
15 we -- a lot of these issues come up, we ask the employee if
16 their supervisor thinks that there's a conflict or not, and
17 that might be the first --

18 MEMBER LEWIS: I think this is a great
19 clarification. I think we did a great job. Good job, guys.

20 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So I guess, do we need to put
21 this -- do we need to have a motion to put this on the agenda
22 for next month so we can actually issue it, Cory?

23 MS. VICENS: Hi, Chair. So, yeah, we can take that
24 and then we'll refine it to its final document. There has
25 been discussion that we would look to the Hawaii State, which

1 had a -- kind of a flowchart as it regarded the different
2 scenarios that may present itself when it became -- when it
3 came to gifts and whether you could accept or you couldn't
4 accept. So I just want clarity and some direction if that is
5 the way the board wants to move forward with this and then I
6 can work with Donna in helping create that layout.

7 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. I kind of liked different than
8 the flowchart, just the written description we have that kind
9 of follows the flowchart, but it's formatted in a different
10 way. Any other thoughts from anybody on modifying?

11 MEMBER THOMPSON: I think the words that were
12 written are very straightforward and very clear and I -- the
13 flowchart just made me have to think trying to -- where are we
14 going with this and which arrow do I follow? I just like --
15 it's straightforward, it says, Use your conscience, use your
16 judgment, and that's the right way to go.

17 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Anyone else think we can
18 exclude the flowchart and just keep the verbiage as is?

19 MEMBER PHILLIPS: Yeah. Hi, this is Rachel. I
20 agree, keep it simple. I like the way it's written, it's not
21 overly complicated.

22 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I agree.

23 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Any other comments on my
24 suggestion of adding supervisor in the blank spot on that
25 form, that's the one last -- as a -- for the employee of the

1 county, as a first person to contact regarding a potential
2 conflict of interest.

3 MEMBER PHILLIPS: The only thing with that, Bill,
4 what if it's, say, for example, a -- you know a county
5 official, like a council member or, you know, or other elected
6 official, I don't know if supervisor would be necessarily the
7 right person to ask.

8 CHAIR CURTIS: Or supervisor or board of ethics?

9 VICE CHAIR WEISS: The only concern I would have
10 with it being a supervisor is that I would then become
11 responsible if it was the wrong decision. I think that's
12 placing probably too much onus on -- just my opinion. If
13 there's really -- if they think it's a conflict, they should
14 probably submit it to the board.

15 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

16 MEMBER PHILLIPS: I would agree with that.

17 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Any more --

18 MEMBER CLAYTON: I think that's good too, yeah. I'm
19 Donna. Okay. So contact the board of ethics, yeah.

20 VICE CHAIR WEISS: All right.

21 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Let's -- we have a motion to
22 put this on the agenda for next month to -- to vote on and
23 may -- to possibly issue to the -- prior to the election?

24 MEMBER THOMPSON: So moved.

25 CHAIR CURTIS: Any second?

1 MEMBER PHILLIPS: Second. Rachel.

2 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So can we -- let's vote on
3 moving this out of the TIG group and on to the agenda for the
4 full body of the board of ethics next month. All in favor?

5 (Response.)

6 CHAIR CURTIS: And all opposed?

7 (No response.)

8 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Seeing it's unanimous, let's
9 move to the next agenda item. Financial Disclosure
10 Statements, Elected and Appointed Officials. Under New
11 Business we have a Matthew Mano.

12 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Yeah. I was a little confused.

13 Hey, Cory, there's a lot of cross -- so we're
14 assuming that everything crossed out and date -- everything's
15 crossed out and dated, so which one's --

16 MS. VICENS: Let me --

17 VICE CHAIR WEISS: -- the actual one?

18 MS. VICENS: Let me give you a little bit of
19 background on this. Mr. Mano submitted -- Mr. Mano sits on a
20 board and when he submitted his original this to the clerk, he
21 did not check the right boxes when he originally submitted it.
22 It was discovered later on when his -- we saw his name on the
23 ballot that he was running. We contacted him, he came in and
24 rectified the form, and that's how you see all the different
25 changes. So he originally submitted under -- as a board -- as

1 his commission, but he was really -- his intent was to do it
2 as a candidate. So it's a little behind --

3 CHAIR CURTIS: Are we allowed to have --

4 MS. VICENS: And it's behind, the primary has
5 occurred, it's -- you know, it's post, but for all intent and
6 purposes and legalities, we need to see it as well.

7 CHAIR CURTIS: Are we allowed to accept a financial
8 disclosure that has both a commission member and a candidate
9 on the cover sheet or should we have two separate ones?

10 MS. VICENS: He -- we have another one for his
11 commission and then we -- which was approved previously.

12 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

13 MS. VICENS: This is for his candidacy.

14 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

15 VICE CHAIR WEISS: And so we have -- candidate for
16 public office is the -- that's what he's submitting now?

17 MS. VICENS: Yes.

18 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Okay. That makes sense.

19 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So that's the -- any other
20 comments on the body of the disclosure, getting beyond the
21 cover sheet here?

22 MEMBER THOMPSON: Do we just table his disclosure,
23 Mr. Chair, or -- it seems like it doesn't need consideration.
24 He's already done it for the police commission, apparently.

25 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So can we have a motion to

1 accept it as filed?

2 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I make a motion to accept his
3 financial disclosure as filed.

4 CHAIR CURTIS: And now -- now it's received.

5 MEMBER THOMPSON: Second.

6 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. All in favor of acknowledging
7 receipt of the -- Mr. Mano's financial disclosure, say aye.

8 (Response.)

9 CHAIR CURTIS: Opposed?

10 (No response.)

11 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. That's unanimous.

12 Next agenda item, Communications: None.

13 Lobbyist Registrations and Resignations: None.

14 An Informal Hearing on Complaint 19-07 by a member
15 of the public, Madge Schaefer, against Councilmember Kelly T.
16 King, alleging a violation of the Revised Charter of County of
17 Maui Code of Ethics as amended. So, everybody, we -- there
18 was a large package that went out because half of our board, I
19 think, is -- or almost half of our board is new and might not
20 be familiar with the background on this. Did all the new
21 members get to review the background and do any of the new
22 members have any questions on this or could we proceed
23 straight into the agenda item?

24 (No response.)

25 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So we --

1 MEMBER WILLING: I don't have -- this is Shanna. I
2 don't have any questions.

3 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. And, Seward, I believe --

4 MEMBER AKAHI: I have none.

5 CHAIR CURTIS: You have no -- and Kay isn't here.

6 MEMBER THOMPSON: No. That's okay.

7 CHAIR CURTIS: All right. So what we've done in the
8 past, these are informal hearings. The board will ask
9 questions of the complainant and the respondent. We ask you
10 to mute your -- your video when you're not being spoken to and
11 we don't -- as we've had in the past, sometimes there's been
12 talk between the two, but these are questions that are just to
13 be directed to the board members themselves. I'd ask
14 Ms. Schaefer and Ms. King to just address us and not each
15 other, if that is understandable.

16 We'll start with the complainant. Ms. Schaefer,
17 could you like to add anything to the -- what you've written
18 or do you -- does that stand on its own?

19 MS. SCHAEFER: No. I would -- I do have some
20 testimony I'd like to read into the record.

21 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Please proceed.

22 MS. SCHAEFER: Well, my name is Madge Schaefer.
23 First, I'd like to congratulate the new members. This board
24 serves an important role as the conscience of the county and I
25 am appreciative of your willingness to serve.

1 So briefly to recap, this complaint was originally
2 filed together with the complaint regarding Councilmember
3 King's advocacy for her company, Pacific Biodiesel, during tax
4 rate hearings. The board determined there was advocacy. King
5 asked that this portion of the complaint regarding the use of
6 county personnel for other than public activity or purpose to
7 be separated so that, quote, services attorney could submit a
8 written response. King continues to use county employees
9 instead of her staff at Pacific Diesel on matters related to
10 this complaint that includes several requests for
11 continuances. In keeping with past practices, for example,
12 when the ethics complaint was filed against then Chair --
13 Council Chair Mike White charging that he had a conflict --
14 had a -- he had a conflict because he was the GM of a hotel,
15 he retained private counsel and did not use his county offices
16 or staff to respond. There are other examples in your records
17 as well. So here we are.

18 I would like to speak to the letter dated
19 August 13th, 2020, from David Raatz to this board. While the
20 list of questions presented was interesting, none of those
21 questions related to the subject of this complaint, which is
22 directed at King's advocacy for Pacific Biodiesel and the use
23 of county personnel for other than public activity or purpose.
24 It begs the question: Did David Raatz read the complaint or
25 listen to the video of the hearing before he proffered help in

1 research and drafting a response to my complaint? Did he
2 explain the prohibitions of Section 10.4 to King? Apparently,
3 it was decided to ignore King's expressing her opinion as to
4 what a tax on biodiesel would do to her business, which is in
5 direct violation of Section 107.4C and which -- and which the
6 board of ethics ruled was violated many times during those
7 meetings.

8 Quite frankly, I find this puzzling. I have known
9 David Raatz for years and find him to be congenial and helpful
10 when I've sought information from council services. I hold
11 him in high regard. He has a tough job with many masters. By
12 this letter, he has injected himself in the complaint in a
13 manner that provides no new information except an attempt to
14 justify why his office became involved originally, thus taking
15 the blame for King's actions. Finally, his declaration that
16 no assistance in responding to this complaint, this particular
17 complaint has been provided to Councilmember King is
18 appropriate; however, she has continued to use her office
19 staff in this manner.

20 If I may, Chair Curtis, respectfully request that my
21 right to rebuttal be recognized should I wish to use it.
22 Thank you so much.

23 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Thank you.

24 Miss King or Mrs. King, I'm sorry. Ms. King.

25 MS. KING: That's okay. Thank you, Chair. So,

1 yeah, I think -- I'm glad to finally be here because it did
2 get put off a few times and then the COVID, there was a
3 cancelation of meetings, one the month that I was hoping to
4 have this, but -- and I -- and I appreciate also that
5 Mr. Raatz is on. I'm not sure if he's sharing his video or
6 not, I don't see him, but --

7 I do want to say that there has not been a formal
8 ruling by this board. I think there was a suggestion to me to
9 not discuss my business on the council. I was responding -- I
10 was not advocating for my business, as it's been suggested,
11 but I was responding to questions from other council members,
12 which I was told I was well within my rights to do as long as
13 I wasn't voting, and I did recuse myself from voting on that
14 issue up front. So I appreciate the previous board of
15 ethics' -- I know there's a lot of new members now, but
16 position on this to just -- you know, to give a warning.

17 And the complaint that I'm getting today from
18 Ms. Schaefer, which is a continuation of other complaints, has
19 to do with office of council services writing a letter to the
20 board of ethics regarding the previous complaint and I really
21 think that Mr. Raatz needs to talk to you about this. I know
22 you received a letter from him. When I went back and asked
23 him what his position on it was, did he feel that this was
24 improper, he said no. And he reminded me that he had asked
25 me, you know, that this was something that came to me as a

1 member of the council, I would not -- were I not a member of
2 the council, this issue would not have come up and that he had
3 offered that they -- this is what they do, they support
4 council's work this way. It was no -- there was no even
5 initial request from me to him to write the letter, but this
6 is -- this is a common practice of office of council services.
7 And as a new council member, I accepted that and I accepted
8 his help.

9 I think it's --

10 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

11 MS. KING: -- going to be difficult for -- going
12 forward if these lines are drawn, not just for the council,
13 but for all members who are serving the public if they cannot
14 get -- if they get accused of something while serving the
15 public and they cannot use the support that's offered them
16 through the county if they're working for the county. It's
17 going to be really difficult to get people to step up.

18 But I also -- I know Mr. Raatz is on this call, so
19 if you wanted to ask him any questions, I think he be willing
20 to answer as well.

21 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. If that concludes your
22 statement, Mr. Raatz, would you -- and, again, I believe the
23 issue is specifically the four hours that were used to write
24 this letter, that's the nut of this -- the other complaint was
25 addressed and it's done.

1 MS. KING: Correct.

2 CHAIR CURTIS: All we're talking about today is this
3 particular letter that took four hours of the council time to
4 prepare.

5 MS. SCHAEFER: Mr. Chair.

6 CHAIR CURTIS: Yes.

7 MS. SCHAEFER: This is Madge Schaefer. On September
8 13th, 2019, the board of ethics issued an advisory opinion on
9 the issue of advocacy.

10 CHAIR CURTIS: Yes. Understood, Ms. Schaefer, but
11 that's not the question that we have in front of us today.
12 We've -- we've addressed that.

13 MS. SCHAEFER: I understand, but Ms. King said that
14 there was no opinion.

15 MS. KING: There was no formal opinion, correct.

16 CHAIR CURTIS: No. We did issue an opinion.

17 MS. TOSHIKIYO: Um -- okay.

18 MS. SCHAEFER: Thank you.

19 CHAIR CURTIS: But, again, that's -- that's not what
20 today's agenda item is, it's -- this letter from Mr. Raatz is
21 what we're discussing today.

22 Is Mr. Raatz available?

23 MR. RAATZ: Absolutely.

24 MS. TOSHIKIYO: Hello, Chair. It is Kristina. I
25 just wanted to see if Mr. Raatz is going to be testifying as

1 witness (inaudible) going to be using him to ask follow-up
2 questions later as like a resource.

3 CHAIR CURTIS: So, Mr. Raatz.

4 MR. RAATZ: Thank you. You ready?

5 CHAIR CURTIS: Can you give us some background on
6 the -- this letter that took four hours to generate?

7 MR. RAATZ: Chair, I think it was covered in my
8 letter to the board. I don't have anything to add beyond that
9 unless you have specific questions for me, which I'd be happy
10 to address them.

11 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. And Ms. King and Ms. Schaefer,
12 you did receive copies of Mr. Raatz's letter?

13 MS. KING: Yes.

14 MS. SCHAEFER: Yes.

15 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I have a question, Chair.

16 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

17 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I do have a question for
18 Mr. Raatz. The last sentence of the letter says you did not
19 work on this letter -- you just provided in the body of the
20 letter some information to Ms. King, but you did not work on
21 drafting or any -- any part of the response dated June 3rd,
22 2019, is that -- 'cause that's what this is about; right? Can
23 I get a clarification? This is Dave Weiss.

24 MR. RAATZ: Chair, if I may.

25 CHAIR CURTIS: Yes, please.

1 MR. RAATZ: Our office did assist in then Council
2 Chair King's response to the board in regards to Complaint
3 19-3, we haven't provided any assistance in regards to
4 Complaint 19-7.

5 CHAIR CURTIS: Which is the issue that's before us
6 right now.

7 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Okay. That's the clarification.
8 Thank you. That clarifies that.

9 MEMBER CLAYTON: Bill, can I say -- I'd like to say
10 something. This is Donna.

11 CHAIR CURTIS: Go ahead, Donna.

12 MEMBER CLAYTON: Thank you.

13 From my reading of everything, it seems to me that
14 Councilmember -- Council Chair at the time King was challenged
15 on her role as a council member; in other words, the complaint
16 came against her behavior in her role as a council member and
17 as a -- rather than the -- I know the background was the
18 subject matter she was talking on and so it's a very close
19 call, I can see how that could be, but I really think that
20 help from the council's -- the legal department, the county
21 legal folks on her behavior as a council chair or councilwoman
22 or on behavior of anybody, I mean, we have to think about
23 county workers in general, when it pertains to how they're
24 handling their duties in that position, I think really it is
25 fair to have the corp. counsel help. I don't know how all the

1 employees could hire -- I mean, it's not all, but any, you
2 know, employees could hire their own counsel if somebody
3 questioned how they were doing their job. I think -- I kind
4 of thought that's what the role of corp. counsel was, in part,
5 which I believe you said in your letter that this was --

6 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I would -- I would agree, 'cause
7 after reading this, the OCS, it seems like standard protocol.
8 Did Mr. Raatz --

9 MEMBER THOMPSON: He's there. He's on.

10 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Oh. So according to this letter,
11 assisting council member in their -- if there's a complaint in
12 the -- in their normal duties is standard protocol from your
13 office to assist in preparation of a -- of the response to --
14 dated June 3rd; is that correct?

15 MR. RAATZ: It's not uncommon, as I mention in my
16 letter. Typically, during each council term, in my
17 experience, there's an occasion for one or more council
18 members to interact with the board of ethics in one form or
19 another, whether it's responding to a complaint or seeking an
20 advisory opinion, and we do have experience in assisting on
21 those occasions.

22 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah. And my concern is this -- it's
23 having corporate counsel be able to assist employees of the
24 county in questions like this. I mean, this could also apply
25 to board members, volunteers.

1 MEMBER THOMPSON: Point of order (inaudible).
2 David, I think, is office of council services and I think that
3 is a distinct function from corp. counsel and I think you need
4 to keep that separate.

5 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay, okay.

6 MEMBER THOMPSON: Because office of council services
7 is, as he pointed out, here to serve the council itself.

8 CHAIR CURTIS: That's right.

9 MEMBER THOMPSON: So corp. counsel has a --

10 CHAIR CURTIS: Is a separate (inaudible).

11 MEMBER THOMPSON: (Inaudible) included in this.

12 Okay?

13 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

14 MEMBER THOMPSON: I hope that's --

15 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Okay.

16 MS. TOSHIKIYO: Chair.

17 VICE CHAIR WEISS: And after thoroughly reading
18 this, it does seem like it's not -- it's not an anomaly --
19 it's. Go ahead.

20 MS. TOSHIKIYO: Chair, if I could please interrupt.
21 Sorry. Since we still have the parties available and
22 Mr. Raatz as well, if you had any additional questions for
23 them before you move into deliberations.

24 CHAIR CURTIS: I don't believe I've got any
25 questions. Does any other member have any questions of the

1 testifier -- or the respondent or the complainant or
2 Mr. Raatz?

3 Donna.

4 MEMBER CLAYTON: Thank you. I -- now, I'm -- since
5 that new subject was brought up of corp. counsel and council
6 services issue, so when we're writing a response to this, do
7 we want to -- I think -- I don't know what we want to say, but
8 if we want to say that it's appropriate for council members to
9 work with council services or do we say also corp. counsel?
10 I'm not sure, but it seems to me they're different, but I'm
11 not -- I'm not really sure of what their different roles are,
12 so I'm not sure -- just so -- you know, I'm trying to keep
13 things really clear when we do -- you know, so people know
14 what's what, so if I'm confused, others may be.

15 CHAIR CURTIS: Well, for this particular complaint,
16 maybe we focus on council services, because that's the
17 question, 'cause we're responding to the specific complaint.

18 MEMBER THOMPSON: The complaint was to -- against --

19 CHAIR CURTIS: Council.

20 MEMBER THOMPSON: -- use of county employees;
21 namely, specifically council services, as I understand it.

22 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah.

23 MS. TOSHIKIYO: Maybe if someone wants to pose a
24 question to Mr. Raatz about the role of council services, that
25 might help clarify their role.

1 MEMBER CLAYTON: Yeah, please do, David Raatz.

2 MEMBER THOMPSON: I thought -- I thought his letter
3 was very clear.

4 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah. I believe his letter -- unless
5 there's -- his letter is very clear as to what -- what
6 functions they perform on a regular basis.

7 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I believe I have enough
8 information.

9 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah. And I believe I have enough
10 information. If anyone else has any questions or we could
11 close the testimony?

12 MS. SCHAEFER: Mr. Chair, I'd like a moment.

13 CHAIR CURTIS: Go ahead, Ms. Schaefer.

14 MS. SCHAEFER: So from what I'm surmising, you're
15 saying that although the -- the complaint was about personal
16 business, not council, not legislative business, that the use
17 of county personnel as outlined as prohibited is allowed. Is
18 that -- am I understanding that correctly? Because these two
19 complaints were intertwined, without -- there wouldn't be the
20 second complaint if there hadn't been the first one. And
21 so --

22 MS. KING: Point of order, Mr. Chair. Point of
23 order.

24 MS. SCHAEFER: Excuse me.

25 (Multiple speakers.)

1 MS. KING: There's a discussion going on that the
2 complainant is inserting herself into.

3 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah. You're talking over each
4 other, we can't hear either one of you. So, Ms. Schaefer,
5 please mute and, Ms. King, please.

6 MS. SCHAEFER: Mr. Chair, I was not finished. I was
7 interrupted.

8 MS. KING: I was -- yeah, I was making a point of
9 order, which is allowed at any time. But just the point of
10 order was that this body, if it's in discussion -- if it's in
11 question mode, generally the respondents wait for a question.
12 If it's in deliberation mode, then it's not appropriate for
13 those of us who aren't being questioned to insert ourselves
14 into your debate or your discussion.

15 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Understood.

16 MS. SCHAEFER: The -- however, the discussion is
17 still open.

18 CHAIR CURTIS: Can you please --

19 MS. SCHAEFER: We haven't -- you haven't closed the
20 hearing.

21 CHAIR CURTIS: Correct.

22 MS. SCHAEFER: And the discussion is as the
23 complainant, I'm seeking clarification. So the clarification
24 that I'm seeking is on one hand, you're saying that by the
25 formal opinion that was issued on September 13th, 2019, there

1 was advocacy, but you're saying now that that advocacy using
2 county personnel, that using county personnel was appropriate
3 for that advocacy.

4 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Does that conclude your
5 comments?

6 MS. SCHAEFER: I'm asking the question: Is that
7 what is on the table?

8 CHAIR CURTIS: We're not -- we ask questions of you,
9 Ms. Schaefer, and so --

10 MS. SCHAEFER: Okay.

11 CHAIR CURTIS: -- we're just asking for your
12 testimony and we will meet and then discuss.

13 MS. SCHAEFER: The -- I'm sorry, Donna, your last
14 name is not on the -- up on the screen, so I don't mean to
15 address -- address you informally, but that's the only name
16 that I have. The -- the point that was made was -- if I
17 understand it, and I'm just seeking understanding, was that
18 it's okay to use county personnel for issues of advocacy that
19 are not permitted.

20 CHAIR CURTIS: We will have to -- once we're
21 complete with the testimony, we will be discussing this and in
22 the opinion if that is required to clarify, we will have that
23 in the opinion.

24 MS. SCHAEFER: I appreciate that and that's what I'm
25 seeking, is clarification, Mr. Chair.

1 CHAIR CURTIS: Does that -- does that conclude your
2 testimony?

3 MS. SCHAEFER: I think you've made it clear it does.

4 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

5 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Do we discuss in public?

6 CHAIR CURTIS: And I think we have -- typically, we
7 have a closed session --

8 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Yeah.

9 CHAIR CURTIS: -- when we discuss these issues,
10 that's when we leave these people.

11 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Yeah, I've got -- I personally
12 have all the information I need to make the -- to provide my
13 opinion.

14 CHAIR CURTIS: Any other members have any other
15 questions prior to us going into closed session?

16 MEMBER LEWIS: No questions.

17 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Seeing none, I think we can
18 close the public -- or the testimony on this.

19 Cory, with the BlueJeans, how do we go to closed
20 session?

21 MS. VICENS: Chair, we can ask Ms. King and
22 Ms. Schaefer to just step out of the meeting and they can
23 return after a determined amount of time that you will need to
24 deliberate this matter. And once they do that and any other
25 individual who is not a board member steps out, I will lock

1 the room.

2 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Would this be easier just to
3 carry over to the executive session, just because of the
4 BlueJeans situation?

5 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Can we do that? Because they're
6 going to --

7 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah.

8 VICE CHAIR WEISS: -- they're going to come back on
9 for the opinion.

10 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah. Could we close -- would that
11 be appropriate?

12 MS. VICENS: So, Chair.

13 CHAIR CURTIS: So we have the discussion in
14 executive and then we can return to regular session.

15 MS. VICENS: Chair, you can.

16 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

17 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Okay.

18 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Just because of the
19 BlueJeans -- normally we would not do this in executive, we
20 would just -- people would leave the room, we'd lock the door,
21 we'd discuss and we would remain in open session, but for
22 technology, I think it's -- it just might be easier if we --
23 and, in fact, this is the last agenda item under the --

24 MS. VICENS: Okay.

25 CHAIR CURTIS: Or have -- can I have a motion to

1 adjourn regular session and --

2 MEMBER THOMPSON: Well, do you need a motion to move
3 this item to the executive session or -- I'm asking.

4 CHAIR CURTIS: Possibly. Motion to move the
5 discussion of the item that's normally in closed --

6 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Chair, I'll make a -- I'll make a
7 motion to carry this item into executive session and provide
8 an opinion after executive session.

9 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. And then when we adjourn the
10 executive session, we'll go back to regular --

11 VICE CHAIR WEISS: And invite the respondent and the
12 complainant back in.

13 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah.

14 MEMBER THOMPSON: Second.

15 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah. Now --

16 MEMBER THOMPSON: Call for the vote.

17 CHAIR CURTIS: So call for a vote on this. And what
18 I believe we'll do is we will go to executive, only discuss
19 this, come back to regular so we can conclude this matter, and
20 then we would go back into executive to finish out the balance
21 of those items.

22 MS. TOSHIKIYO: Chair, I just wanted to clarify that
23 this is actually going to be a closed session so that you can
24 deliberate, but due to all of our logistical issues, that
25 we're going to actually use the executive session BlueJeans

1 link so that you can deliberate there. Just so that it's
2 easier for everyone than having to pop in and go back out.

3 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah, that's what I'm thinking would
4 be best. Is there anybody else in executive session? It's
5 just the board members; right?

6 VICE CHAIR WEISS: It's us.

7 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah.

8 VICE CHAIR WEISS: And we'll take care of all of it
9 at once and then after executive session, then have that.

10 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So why don't we -- motion to
11 move to executive session to discuss this.

12 MEMBER THOMPSON: Made and seconded. Vote.

13 CHAIR CURTIS: And can we have a vote on that?

14 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Sure. Yeah.

15 CHAIR CURTIS: All in favor of moving to executive
16 session, say aye.

17 (Response.)

18 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. And then what we -- can we
19 reach out and contact Ms. King and Ms. Schaefer when we
20 conclude the session and let them know the answer?

21 MS. VICENS: Actually, Chair, and we appreciate
22 Ms. King and Ms. Schaefer for their time and any other
23 parties, Mr. Raatz; if you don't mind just hanging out here,
24 keeping this regular session, open session on mute and just
25 check back, and then there isn't anybody having to jump in/

1 jump out. This meeting will stay open until we return.

2 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Sounds good.

3 MS. KING: That's it. That's excellent.

4 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So let's adjourn regular
5 session and enter executive session. The time is 1:19.

6 (Pause in Proceedings: 1:19 p.m.-1:52 p.m.)

7 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So we're resuming our regular
8 session. Rachel, we need to -- the motion that was in closed
9 session, we need to repeat that for the open session. Would
10 you be able to repeat your motion?

11 MEMBER PHILLIPS: Yes, I can. So the motion was to
12 dismiss the complaint on the basis that it did not violate any
13 provisions of Section 10.4D -- or it didn't prove any
14 violation of Section 10.4D.

15 CHAIR CURTIS: And is there a second to that motion?

16 MEMBER LEWIS: I second it. This is Geri.

17 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. And just so we have the vote
18 in the open session, all in favor of the motion, say aye.

19 (Response.)

20 CHAIR CURTIS: Or raise your hand.

21 All opposed, say no or raise your hand.

22 (No response.)

23 CHAIR CURTIS: Seeing none, the motion passes
24 unanimously. And I think we can move on to the next session.

25 Thank you, Ms. King and Ms. Schaefer.

1 MS. KING: Thank you, folks. I'm going to head back
2 to the council now.

3 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay.

4 MS. KING: Trying to get an affordable housing
5 project passed.

6 MEMBER LEWIS: Thank you.

7 MEMBER CLAYTON: Thank you.

8 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So that, I believe --

9 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Now we have to go back in the --

10 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So I guess we can adjourn to
11 executive session and then we can give the announcements and
12 the schedule when we return to regular session.

13 MS. SCHAEFER: I want to get out of here.

14 VICE CHAIR WEISS: (Inaudible) finish that up in
15 regular session and then we go into --

16 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. Okay. So the last agenda item
17 is reminder on the campaign restrictions for all county -- oh,
18 that was the memo that was sent out as -- and I'm told that we
19 do this on every election cycle, we send out that reminder.

20 MEMBER THOMPSON: We can still contribute to a
21 candidate; is that correct, Mr. Chair?

22 CHAIR CURTIS: Yeah. No, this was a reminder to --
23 to the -- yes, yes. We are officers as board members. It's
24 just a reminder not to use the public phones, public copy
25 machines, any of the county equipment for conducting your

1 campaign. What you do in your private life is --

2 MEMBER THOMPSON: Thank you.

3 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. And then the next -- oh, we
4 have to come back to adopt all -- so let's adjourn to
5 executive session now. Can I have a motion for that?

6 VICE CHAIR WEISS: I'll make a motion to adjourn
7 regular session.

8 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. And the -- a second on that?

9 MEMBER CLAYTON: Second. Donna.

10 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So at 1:55 we can -- let's do
11 a five-minute break and get water, stretch, whatever.

12 MEMBER LEWIS: Thank you.

13 CHAIR CURTIS: We'll have -- two o'clock we'll start
14 the executive session.

15 (Pause in Proceedings: 1:55 p.m.- 2:18 p.m.)

16 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. So we have left the executive
17 session and we're now returning to the regular session of the
18 August 19th board of ethics meeting at 2:18. Can I have a
19 motion to approve all decisions made in executive session?

20 MEMBER THOMPSON: So moved.

21 CHAIR CURTIS: So moved. Is there a second?

22 VICE CHAIR WEISS: Second.

23 CHAIR CURTIS: Second. Okay. Can we vote on that?
24 All in favor of approving actions taken in executive session,
25 say aye.

1 (Response.)

2 CHAIR CURTIS: All opposed?

3 (No response.)

4 CHAIR CURTIS: Okay. And so next meeting will be
5 September 9th at 12:30 and, again, I want to thank everybody
6 for moving their schedule to this week from last week so we
7 could wrap up some items and thank you for putting up with me
8 as I stumble through this. And we'll see you all soon, next
9 month.

10 (The proceedings were adjourned at 2:19 p.m.)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF HAWAII)
) SS.
COUNTY OF MAUI)

I, Sandra J. Gran, Certified Shorthand Reporter for the State of Hawaii, hereby certify that on August 19, 2020, at 12:31 p.m., the proceedings was taken down by me in machine shorthand and was thereafter reduced to typewritten form under my supervision; that the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings had in the foregoing matter.

I further certify that I am not an attorney for any of the parties hereto, nor in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED this 27th day of August, 2020, in Maui, Hawaii.



Sandra J. Gran, RPR
Hawaii CSR 424