

**URBAN DESIGN REVIEW BOARD  
REGULAR MEETING  
APRIL 6, 2021**

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

The regular meeting of the Urban Design Review Board (Board) was called to order by Mr. Clayton Yoshida, Planning Program Administrator, with the Planning Department, at approximately 10:00 a.m., Tuesday, April 6, 2021, online via BlueJeans Meeting No. 698 314 183.

A quorum of the Board was present (See Record of Attendance).

Mr. Clayton Yoshida: I'd like to call the meeting of the Maui County Urban Design Review Board to order. I have Leilani Ramoran-Quemado, the board secretary, with me, as well as Tara Furukawa. And from the Department of the Corporation Counsel, we have Keola Whittaker.

First of all, we'll start with the roll call. So if you're here, indicate that you're here. Caryl Hitchcock-Sprinzel?

Ms. Caryl Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Here.

Mr. Yoshida: Marie Kimmey? Okay, Stuart Marlowe?

Mr. Stuart Marlowe: Here.

Mr. Yoshida: Darren Okimoto? Okay, Peter Niess?

Mr. Peter Niess: Here.

Mr. Yoshida: Is Mandy Saito here?

Ms. Mandy Saito: Here.

Mr. Yoshida: Darren Unemori?

Mr. Darren Unemori: Here.

Mr. Yoshida: Paul Areus?

Mr. Paul Areus: I'm here.

Mr. Yoshida: Morgan Gerdel?

Mr. Morgan Gerdel: Here.

Mr. Yoshida: So we have a quorum here. And we like to state that public testimony will be taken when each agenda item is discussed. Testimony will be limited to a maximum of three minutes. Testifiers will be called to offer their testimony, are asked to mute their audio and video when they are not testifying. Testifiers via video are asked to sign up using the chat function, providing your name and the item you're wishing to testify on. Testifiers via phone will be called by the Chair after the video testimony is finished. Commissioners shall not be contacted by chat function.

## **B. ELECTION OF CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR FOR THE 2021-2022 TERM**

So we're starting a new board year, and the first item is election of Chair for the 2021-2022 term. So the floor is open for nominations for Chair. Any of the members want to make a nomination for Chair?

Ms. Marie Kimmey: I would. This is Marie. I will nominate Caryl again. I think she's done a wonderful job, if she's willing to serve.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Thank you. That's very kind, Marie. Yes, I would.

Ms. Kimmey: Oh good. Thank you.

Mr. Yoshida: Okay, is there a second?

Mr. Okimoto: I'll second that.

Mr. Marlowe: Seconded.

Mr. Yoshida: Any other nominations for Chair? Okay, seeing in none, all those in favor of Caryl Hitchcock-Sprinzl as the UDRB Chair please signify. Well, let's go roll call again. Marie Kimmey?

Ms. Kimmey: Aye.

Mr. Yoshida: Stuart Marlowe?

Mr. Marlowe: Aye.

Mr. Yoshida: Darren Okimoto?

Mr. Okimoto: Aye.

Mr. Yoshida: Peter Niess?

Mr. Niess: Aye.

Mr. Yoshida: Mandy Saito?

Ms. Saito: Aye.

Mr. Yoshida: Darren Unemori?

Mr. Unemori: Aye.

Mr. Yoshida: Paul Areus? Morgan Gerdel?

Mr. Gerdel: Aye.

Mr. Yoshida: And Caryl Hitchcock-Sprinzel?

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Aye, I guess.

Mr. Yoshida: Okay, so thank you. Congratulations Caryl, re-elected as Chair of the UDRB. Now you can proceed with the election of your Vice-Chair.

**It was moved by Ms. Marie Kimmey, seconded by Mr. Darren Okimoto, then unanimously**

**VOTED: To elect Ms. Caryl Hitchcock-Sprinzel as Chair of the UDRB for the 2021-2022 term.**

*(Assenting: P. Areus, M. Gerdel, C. Hitchcock-Sprinzel, M. Kimmey, S. Marlowe, D. Okimoto, P. Niess, M. Saito, D. Unemori)*

*(Excused: J. Circle-Woodburn)*

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you so much Clayton, and thank you to the other board members. I'll do my best to, to do a good job for you. So thank you for your support. I appreciate it very much.

So the next order of business would be to elect the Vice-Chair. So if we have a nomination for Vice-Chair? Clayton, am I allowed to make a nomination?

Ms. Kimmey: Caryl, I'll save you on that. This is Marie. I'll nominate Peter Niess.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: And I would second that. Great, are there any other nominations for Vice Chair? So, if not, then we'll do a roll call. Please state either yes, or in favor, or oppose. So it would be Marie?

Ms. Kimmey: Yes.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: And Stuart?

Mr. Marlowe: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Darren Okamoto?

Mr. Okimoto: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Mandy Saito?

Ms. Saito: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: And Darren Unemori?

Mr. Unemori: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Paul Areus?

Mr. Areus: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you Paul. And Morgan?

Mr. Gerdel: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you. Well, congratulations, Peter. Another year as Vice-Chair. I look forward to serving with you. Thank you.

**It was moved by Ms. Marie Kimmey, seconded by Ms. Caryl Hitchcock-Sprinzel, then unanimously**

**VOTED: To elect Mr. Peter Niess as Vice-Chair of the UDRB for the 2021-2022 term.**

*(Assenting: P. Areus, M. Gerdel, M. Kimmey, S. Marlowe, D. Okimoto, M. Saito, D. Unemori)*  
*(Excused: J. Circle-Woodburn)*

## **C. COMMUNICATIONS**

- 1. MRS. KARI LUNA NUNOKAWA, of MUNEKIYO HIRAGA, on behalf of Catholic Charities Housing Development Corporation, is requesting design review of the proposed Hale Pilina Family Affordable Rental Housing Project. The project will consist of four three-story buildings,**

**consisting of 178 rental units, a Resident Manager's Unit, a mail room, office, parking, a park, landscaping, and related infrastructure improvements. The rental units will be one to two-bedrooms and range from 442 to 683 square feet. Hale Mahaolu will serve as the property manager. The project is to be located at 150 Puunene Avenue in Kahului, Maui, Hawaii at Tax Map Key: (2) 3-7-013:026 (EAC 2020/0014) (T. Furukawa).**

**The Board may provide its comments on design aspects of this project. Comments are to be transmitted to the Maui County Council for consideration for Chapter 2.97 approval.**

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: All right. So we have a busy morning. It looks like we have quite a few items on the agenda. And so the first communication was from Mrs. Kari Luna Nunokawa . . . (*Chair Hitchcock-Sprinzel read the above project description into the record.*) . . . And the planner is Tara Furukawa, who I would like to turn it over to her now to introduce the presenters.

Ms. Tara Furukawa: Good morning Commissioners. This item has come to you for review because the consultant Munekiyo Hiraga will be preparing a Final Environmental Assessment (E.A.) on behalf of Catholic Charities Development Corporation. And your feedback will be incorporated into the document. We note that the Draft E.A. was filed with the Office of Environmental Quality Control on December 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2020. The project consultant Kari Luna Nunokawa, of Munekiyo Hiraga, will present the project and she and other consultants can answer any questions you might have regarding the proposal.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you.

Ms. Kari Luna Nunokawa: Good morning Commissioners. Thanks, Tara. My name is Kari Luna Nunokawa from Munekiyo Hiraga. And if it's okay I'd like to share my screen.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Yes.

Ms. Nunokawa: All right. Can everyone see my screen?

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Yes, very clearly. Thank you.

Ms. Nunokawa: Wonderful. So thank you so much for the opportunity to present to the Board the Hale Pilina Family Affordable Rental Housing Project. It is a 100 percent family affordable housing opportunity in the heart of Kahului.

So I'd like to take this opportunity to introduce the project team and those members on the call today who will be presenting and can also help to answer any questions or address comments at the end of the presentation. The applicant for the project is Catholic Charities

Housing Development Corporation, a subsidiary of Catholic Charities Hawaii. Michael Magaoay was not able to be with us today. He's the board president. But we do have with us on the call Thelma Akita-Kealoha from Catholic Charities Hawaii Maui, and she's the community director. The architect and engineer of the project are from M & A Hawaii. We have architect Steve Wong and engineer Chad McDonald. The landscape architect is Aolani Yamasato-Gragas from AGY. And the project manager are Gary and Jeff Furuta from GSF. The contractor for the project is also on the call, Tommy Arisumi, from Arisumi Brothers. And as I introduced myself earlier, my name is Kari from Munekiyo Hiraga.

So the main reason we're here today is to provide you with information on the proposed project. The Draft Environmental Assessment was published with OEQC on December 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2020. And we're kindly collecting comments from you for the proposed Hale Pilina rental housing project designs.

So this, this slide, I'd like to take this opportunity to orient you to the project site, outlined in yellow here. If you can see my cursor kind of outlining the yellow polygon here. So to the north, the project is bound by South Puunene Avenue and -- I'm sorry, to the east -- and then to the west is Kaulawahine Street. And just about half a block north of the project is Kamehameha Avenue. Outlined in red is the just broke ground newly Central Maui Bus hub. So as you can see, it's a really short walking distance, just about five minutes away from the project site. We have Queen Kaahumanu Shopping Center here, Maui Mall in this area here, so it's really close to businesses, commercial, and already existing infrastructure.

This is a closer look at the project site map, so you can kind of get a closer view of where it is in relationship to some of the surrounding area. So you can see the Coach Spencer Shiraishi Memorial Pool is right adjacent to the property. The Salvation Army here, Kahului post office here, and we have South Puunene Avenue to the east. And as you can see, there's Walgreens, Bank of Hawaii, McDonald's, the Old Kahului Shopping Center, and Maui Mall. And just off this direction is the Central Maui Bus hub. And of note, right along Kamehameha Avenue is a bus stop and also dedicated bike lane. And surrounding the project are already built sidewalks.

Here's an existing project site view. The top photo shows if you are standing on South Puunene Avenue, looking into the project site. So as you can see here, the cursor is moving right across the Coach Spencer Shiraishi Memorial Pool. Off to the right would be the Kahului post office. And off to the left here are residential homes on the Alehela Street.

Further down, this next view is if you're standing on Kaulawahine Street looking into the property. So there are some trees here and it used to be surrounding tennis courts. So back in the day, this used to be overflow parking for the Maui County Fairgrounds. This also most recently was -- it hasn't been used for a few years -- but the Kahului Swap Meet used to be in this area as well. So you used to be able to come over here, there's these tents all set up, things like that. But from this angle, this is where the tennis courts used to be. So off to the

left is the Coach Spencer Shiraishi Memorial Pool, and then off to the right are the residences on Alehela Street.

So as mentioned in the introduction, the project is proposing four three-story residential buildings, 108 one-bedroom units, 70 two-bedroom units, and one two-bedroom unit that will be dedicated to the resident manager. It will be available to households earning up to 60 percent of the area median income. And this is -- this will be managed by Hale Mahaolu, who they don't always just manage retirement living facilities. They do manage other family home rental home units as well. So, Hale Mahaolu will be the property manager.

This next slide is to just give you an indication if the project were ready to be, you know, was ready to go, people were ready to be moved in and already built out. Back in 2020, last year, this is just to give you an idea of the limits of 60 percent area median income, and the type of household income levels that people would be -- this project is targeting. And this is the max gross rent and these are all set by the U.S. Housing and Urban Development. So of course it will change once the project is built out and ready to be occupied. But this is just to give you an idea of the income limits if the project were built out, ready to go in 2020. And just to give everyone an idea of the type of jobs, careers that could possibly live in this area -- beginning teachers, bank tellers, educational assistants, dental assistants, those, those types, hotel, restaurant workers. Those are the type of people that this project is targeting.

One thing to note with the max gross rent here is that families will also qualify for a utilities allowance. So back in 2020, I believe one-bedroom units, they're allowed \$129 per month, and two-bedroom units were allowed \$179 per month. So again, this is the max gross rent, and not what people would actually pay. But this is just to give everyone an idea of the limits.

So the project area is in the urban district boundary by -- determined by the State Land Use Commission. It's designated as Park in the Wailuku-Kahului Community Plan. Maui County zoning has it zoned as P1-public/quasi-public. And the project area is not located in the Special Management Area.

The project has been in consultation with the State Historic Preservation Division. A previous A.I.S was completed back in 2004 and was accepted by the SHPD in 2005. However, SHPD did request a more robust evaluation of the project site, and so the field work for the new A.I.S was completed in February of 2021. And like the original A.I.S, it did not find any historical or cultural artifacts. In fact, the report is now called an archaeological assessment and not an A.I.S. because there were no historical or cultural artifacts found.

As mentioned earlier, the Draft E.A. was published in an Environmental Notice on December 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2020. And the project is getting ready to file the Final E.A. in the coming months. As a 100 percent affordable housing effort, the project is also seeking a Chapter 2.97 affordable housing approval from the Maui County Council, and has presented to the

Affordable Housing Committee in anticipation of that. If all goes well, the target construction date for phase one of the project is late 2022, early 2023.

At this time I'd like to pass the presentation onto our architect Steve Wong from M & A Hawaii to take you through the site plans and designs of the project.

Mr. Steve Wong: Hi, can everyone hear me?

Mr. Nunokawa: Yeah.

Mr. Wong: Yeah, this is Steve Wong. I'm the architect on this project. Nice meeting all of you. Yeah, so I'm going, I'm going to explain the architectural plans coming up. What you see here is the overall type site plan of the project. It's a little -- it's a little rotated from the location map just to get you oriented. South Puunene is up at the top. Kaulawahine Street is at the bottom. Kamehameha Avenue is on the left. And the residential area is on the right.

So this overall site plan consists of four widely spaced three-story, mid-rise buildings. Again, like we said, it's a total of 178 family affordable units. One residential manager's unit. And we kind of spaced the buildings apart to take advantage of a lot of the prevailing trade winds to give a lot of airflow and ventilation to the buildings. There's a lot of setbacks between the property lines and the buildings. In fact, let me see, on, on -- I'm sure if we can see it -- on the, on the right side is Building A, along South Puunene Avenue is Building B, on the left is Building D, and parallel to Kaulawahine is Building C. There's four buildings, with parking. We plan to build Building A and B and some of the parking in, in a phase one. Building C and D will be built and parking will be built in phase two project. And I'd like to point out we also have a large park area on the south east corner. It's about 32,000 square feet for use by the residents. 32,000 square feet; big park.

Total parking we're providing is 250 stalls. Each building will have its own separate loading zone. Building A, we already received comments from various -- the residential, and we've attempted to -- actually there's a large setback between, and buffer zone, between that building and their property line, between 40 to 50 feet.

Okay so there are two -- there's two access points and entry points. One coming in from the top, South Puunene Avenue, and one from the rear of the property along Kaulawahine Street.

So that's, that's an overview of the, of the overall site plan. If you have any questions later, you can ask me.

Okay, this is a typical plan of the first building for Building A, which was, yeah, on the plan, if you remember, he was on the right side. It's situated on the east side of the property. This building has -- I'll explain the colors. The, the green is the -- the green area is the one-

bedroom unit. The light-blue, the light-blue on the top are the two-bedroom units. The tan color, the area on the ground floor is the resident manager's unit. And the lighter, lighter-green area -- well, the lighter-tan area is the multipurpose in that building. There is a lobby, office at the lobby. On the second and third floor, we have laundry facilities for that building. So Building A will have a total of 43 total units.

This is a typical building. The other three buildings, B, C and D are all typical. So again, the green, the green color is the one-bedroom unit. The blue color is the all the two-bedroom units. So yeah, the top, the top floor plan is actually two floors, the second and third floors. So yeah, we have three floors of units. And again, the second and third floor will contain the laundry facilities.

This is an example of what we envision the exterior elevation to be. We're using a variety of different colors. Well, I'll get to it when I show you the color board. This is like a typical building. Three-stories. Our overall height is not higher than 35-feet at the top ridge. So it's a very nice mid-rise structure.

We plan to use some wood siding textures. It's like a cottage type design. Go back to that elevation. Yeah, cottage type design. A mixture of wood siding textures, accent colors, trim, you know, articulated trimmed windows, and maybe some Hawaiian motifs on the building.

Next slide is the, is the, like, a section through the building. We're thinking of a framed type of construction. Okay, the next slide.

This is this, is the plan of the roof plan. So it's, it's a shingled roof. With, with -- we're breaking up the roof with some gables and different forms, and the gable ends and yeah. There's some gabled structures.

Okay, the next slide we show some of our materials we're using. We're using some high quality -- although it's an affordable project, we always try to use some very nice vinyl products like the vinyl composition style sheet vinyl, a lot of laminate. We are using some solid surface countertops. And we use a lot of different types of accent colors on our buildings just to break up the massing and the features of the building. The roof, we are looking at an heirloom silver. It's a little lighter roof, more sustainability. And we plan -- it's all low VOC materials we use for sustainability.

Okay the next slide shows some of our -- what we envision as the renderings to just to give you a feel of how the buildings will look. So this view is from looking into the site from South Puunene Avenue. So Building B is on the left and that, that's looking toward the lobby. This doesn't show the --. Yeah, it's still got to be worked on. We do plan to have some roof overhangs and stuff at the lobby entrance which is not shown. But the building on the right is Building D. So it's looking towards Kaulawahine into the site.

Next slide. This rendering is looking from the parking out towards South Puunene. So in front of you, on the right, is Building B, and on the left is Building D on the left.

Last slide. So this is a typical entry view of Building C. So you can see some of the textures we using; wood siding, trim windows, some designs, Hawaiian motifs, that kind of thing, yeah. So it's a very residential feeling for this, this -- these structures.

And we have -- we're planning some ground signs, you know, some nice ground signs at both entrances. But this is, this is showing the, the ground sign, the construction.

So visual impact, yeah, what we've considered this four three-story buildings consistent with the urban surrounding. It's not in the designated scenic corridor. There is a private park for the residents. And with step back and landscaping will provide the buffer between the project and family residences. And we are not asking for any exemptions from the Maui Code, County Code, yeah. So we're meeting all code requirements on setbacks and giving additional setbacks from the buildings.

So that completes my presentation for the architectural features. If you have any questions, you can ask me later. Oh, sustainability, yeah, that's a big part. We will be going for the LEED certified building. Some of our -- all of our lighting fixtures shall be Energy Star in each units and common areas, the exterior lighting. Energy Star appliances, Energy Star low . . . (inaudible) . . . roofings for the entire roof. And we, we are using locally sustainable source materials, water conserving plumbing fixtures, and we will talk more about the -- we are using different types of energy, energy strategy, yeah, and one of them will be the photovoltaic panels.

Ms. Nunokawa: Great. Thank you Steve.

Mr. Wong: Okay, thanks.

Ms. Nunokawa: Thanks so much. And he'll be on the call at the end of the . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Wong: I wish I could come in person, someday.

Ms. Nunokawa: Yeah, so at this time, I'd like to call upon the project engineer, Chad McDonald to talk to you through the drainage for the property.

Mr. Chad McDonald: Good morning. Thank you, Kari, and good morning, Commissioners. Again, this is Chad MacDonald, civil engineer for the project. So what was shown on the screen here is just an existing drainage map which identifies the existing drainage pattern for the 4.9 acre site. Again, we have South Puunene toward the top of the sheet, and Kaulawahine towards the bottom of the sheet. Currently, there is no existing drainage

system onsite and utilizing sheet flow to drain, drain the surface runoff towards the street right-of-ways. Next slide.

The proposed drainage plan shown on the screen here is a preliminary look at what we're proposing in terms of the drainage system. The site ranges from about elevation six to about elevation eleven, so over 4.9 acres, it's considered relatively flat. So what we anticipate using is a series of underground drainage system, drainage inlets, drainage filters, as well as a series of detention basins to address the County's requirement, for accommodating the increase in 50-year, one hour storm.

So these are just sub areas. And again, this is preliminary. We're looking at some of the drainage numbers in terms of the runoff that would need to be stored. And preliminarily, we have identified about almost 27,000 cubic feet of storage that will need to retain on site as a result of development. Next slide, Kari.

And this final slide here identifies the drainage detention basin areas which we are currently looking at and working with the contractor, utilizing potentially some low profile drainage chambers within the parking lot, as well as, the park areas. So these drainage chambers are going to need to accommodate that increase in that 50-year, one hour storm as required by the County of Maui. I think that's it right there.

Ms. Nunokawa: Okay, thank you. So next, we have Aolani Yamasato-Gragas to talk through our conceptual landscape plans.

Ms. Aolani Yamasato-Gragas: Good morning, Board members. The landscape design for both phases of the Hale Pilina Family Affordable Rental Housing Project will provide a simple landscape providing access to nature in an urban setting. The plant materials provide the diversity and environmental benefits as recommended in the Maui County Planning Plan. The landscape will provide a healthier, more comfortable and more attractive environment, increasing shade and reducing air pollution. Native plants are also incorporated into the project, so residents will be more accustomed to see native plants in the built environment. All of the trees were selected from the Maui County Planting Plan as shown on the proposed landscape. And most of the shrubs and ground cover were also selected from the plant plan.

The number of trees on the property and the screening from adjacent lots will adhere to all County Code requirements. And in addition, best management practices regarding fertilizing and pruning affecting native sea birds, bats or moths will also be included in the construction documents and specs.

The irrigation design for Hale Pilina will utilize water conservation to best promote healthy growth of the plant material. All landscaped areas will be irrigated with an automatic underground irrigation system, and the following water conservation practices will be

implemented as well. There will be automatic irrigation controllers will be installed to provide a more precise control of water application, which is better than manually controlled irrigation systems. Plants are grouped together according to their watering requirements for each irrigation zone to eliminate excess water runoff as well as prevent leaching of nutrients, pesticides and fertilizers beyond the root zone. Sprinkler heads will be selected to have match precipitation rates that do not exceed the infiltration rate of the soil. Drip irrigation systems wherever practical will be installed in non-lawn areas. Trees will be watered with a root watering irrigation system. Fixed spray pop up heads will be used in smaller planting areas and gear driven rotor heads will be used in larger lawn areas. Sprinkler heads will be designed and installed with the uniform distribution pattern and adjusted after installation to minimize overspray onto buildings, walkways and roads. To reduce the amount of wind drift, low angle nozzles will be used in high wind areas. Pressure compensating and or regulating devices will also be used to reduce water loss due to . . . (inaudible) . . . Mulch beds and weed barrier fabrics will be installed to inhibit the growth of weeds and grasses, reduce pesticide use, conserve moisture and buffer the soil temperature. The irrigation systems will also be operated during the evening and early morning hours to minimize water loss due to evaporation. Station run times will be monitored to prevent over watering, which can lead to disease, runoff, and leaching of nutrients and pesticides. Rain and moisture sensors with automatic shutoff systems will also be part of the project's irrigation system.

So this shy -- this slide shows the conceptual landscape plan without PV carports. And as Steve mentioned earlier, the next slide shows the landscape plan with the PV carports.

That's all for the landscape. Thank you.

Ms. Nunokawa: Thank you, Aolani, Steve, and Chad. We're very appreciative for allowing the Hale Pilina Family Affordable Rental Housing Project to present to you today. And we're respectfully requesting comments from the UDRB regarding the design of the project. And at this time, this concludes our presentation and we can take any comments or questions.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Thank you so much, Kari. At this time, I'd like to open the meeting to public testimony. I know we received, Mr. Yoshida, you have some written testimony that I believe you've distributed.

Mr. Yoshida: Oh, yes, we have received letters of support from Stephen Kealoha and Greg Peros, and we have circulated those to the board members. We have one person who signed up to testify on this item; that's Thelma Akita-Kealoha.

Ms. Thelma Akita-Kealoha: Good morning. I am very --. I'm Thelma Akita-Kealoha. I work for Catholic Charities Hawaii, and I am very excited about this project. I'm really happy to be here this morning. And I am very grateful to Catholic Charities Hawaii to put that effort out to focus on family housing. We, we did do senior housing earlier, but really my heart is in family housing, and I was really glad that we could provide this opportunity.

Also, I did --. I'm going to read my testimony because I'm getting off course here. So our Catholic Charities Housing Development Corporation is making Maui a priority and focusing in affordable housing for our residents. They are proposing to build 178 units for low income families that will house folks that are within 30 and 60 percent of the area income. The project will absolutely help increase Maui's affordable rented -- rental inventory, but more importantly, it will help people get into rental housing that they can afford to pay. Hale Pilina will remain affordable for many years, which will ensure truly affordable rental housing for many years to come for these families.

You know, Catholic Charities Hawaii was part of the CARES, the Statewide CARES funding, the Federal funding that came down for rental and mortgage assistance. We got 10,000 applications for Maui County alone. With this Covid-19 pandemic, our families are getting laid off, they're losing their jobs, and they're all struggling to pay for their rent and for their mortgages. And this threatens their ability to stay in a home and in a unit. You know, I'm really grateful to the Governor for putting that eviction moratorium up so people don't get ejected from their homes. But I did want to say that we believe that affordable housing is surely a fundamental solution to homelessness, really. So help us build affordable housing. That's what we want to do.

Also, I did want to quote a woman who couldn't make it today and she couldn't get her testimony in. Her name is Sandra Aki, and I appreciate her willingness to let me share. She said when my husband died, I was left worrying about how I was going to continue paying for rent. They had a two income family, and she was reduced to one. It took both of our incomes to pay for rent, bills, food, gas, etcetera. I knew without his income I couldn't afford to live where I was, which was a big concern because I had nowhere else to go. And that meant I could get evicted and become homeless at any time. There are many widows where I live that are struggling.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thelma, I'm not sure if Leilani is, is sounding the alarm, but you'll have about thirty seconds to wrap up.

Ms. Akita-Kealoha: Okay. Just her testimony -- I mean, just her quote, and then I'm done. There are many widows who live with -- where I live who are also struggling to pay for rent. We don't have enough affordable housing. And I mean truly affordable for me and these other widows that they can afford. It's not what is on the market now. This project will be an answer to prayers for those whose income is between 30 and 60 percent of the area median income. Right now, there is a shortage of places to rent. And Hale Pilina will bring a 178 truly affordable units for struggling people like me. Thank you.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you so much, Thelma. And I do love your project's name, the Hale Pilina, that's based on the Hawaiian culture value of Pilina, making connections

and relationships. And so I think that's a wonderful name for the goal of your project, so thank you for your testimony today. Mr. Yoshida, is there anyone else who is waiting?

Mr. Yoshida: There were --. Ms. Akita-Kealoha was the only member who signed up to testify. I don't know if the Chair wants to call for any other person who wants to testify.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Is there anyone else who would like to testify at this time? If you can use the raise your hand or unmute yourself and identify? I don't hear anyone speaking, so at this point then public testimony will be closed. And we will move on to the questions and discussions by the Board on the project. So we do this usually as a round robin, and I know my Vice-Chair doesn't like to go first.

Mr. Niess: I can go first, but one time.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: You would? Okay, awesome.

Mr. Niess: I'll go first.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you, Peter.

Mr. Niess: Overall, this really is the answer to affordable housing is affordable rentals. It's -- this is -- we need this badly. And then with my UDRB hat on, there's a couple of things that I would like to comment on or suggest.

One of them would be the addition of something over the windows on the south and west sides. If, if the tenants are paying for electricity, if you can just add something to lessen the solar heat gain. And it's also be an aesthetic advantage as well. Something like awnings or if you look in North Kihei -- forget the name of the project -- but they did a couple of things that gave the windows, which used the . . . (inaudible) . . . and also add some pizzazz and shadow lines to the mass of the structure. So that would be one thing.

Doing what you can to soften to the -- to protect the existing residents that you're putting these massive structures up against. I don't see any -- there's any fencing along there. And there seems to be some, some landscaping, but just making sure that they're happy as it can be, and I'm sure they're not super excited. But if you could put a fence or something to deaden the noise between the existing residential portion, which is only along one side, along with any hedging or anything to stop headlights and noise from going into the property.

On the elevations, you have -- it's a little bit confusing. There's -- it's like a Romeo and Juliet balcony type lanai. You can't really tell. It looks like there's like a swamp cooler air-conditioning unit that sticks out through the wall in the living room spaces. Maybe you can clarify whether that's a wall mounted unit. And then there's either there's not any type of --

there's not any real lanai space and maybe that's just out of the budget. That would be one way you could break up the lanai or break up the mass of the structure would be to make that an actual lanai space, cantilevered out. It doesn't have to be big. Or maybe that just becomes part of heat gain shade for the unit below. I would like clarification if those aren't a swamp cooler, those boxy window units, A/C units. If Mr. Wong has a comment on that. Steve Wong? Alright, those are --

Ms. Nunokawa: There he is.

Mr. Wong: Yeah. I really like your comments about the window overhangs and that so I'll --. I mean, that can easily be incorporated. I'm going to have to talk to our, our contractor. I mean, you know, it does help with day-lighting and sun lighting. Yes.

The soften -- the fencing, yeah, I think we, I think we can, we can address that, you know, on our future design as a progresses. There is not really on lanai. It's a little ledge, but we brought out the bedrooms just to break up the massing, yeah. So the bedrooms are, if you look at the plan -- if we can go to the plan, Kari. Kari, can you go to our typical plan, floor plan?

Mr. Niess: Page 10.

Mr. Wong: Yeah, yeah. On the, on the top, the top, yeah, so that the bedrooms are out and then there's a little ledge or something, that could be a -- yeah, to hide --. It's not really a ledge. They can't get out there. It's more of a maintenance, a maintenance ledge. It's kind of insets the, the windows for protection, that kind of thing. But I like the idea of the, of the -- actually we call it window sunscreens or, yeah, for more protection. That really is a good feature to this buildings. I think, yeah, I think I've seen other projects in Maui with using that. And I forgot your fourth comment. Oh yeah, more, more about the lanai, yeah. So we can work on all your comments. I like your comments.

Mr. Niess: Since that's not a lanai, are those, the boxes in the living room that protrudes through the walls, is that their air conditioning window unit?

Mr. Wong: Gary, can you --? Yeah, I think that's a window unit.

Mr. Niess: Right.

Mr. Justin Furuta: This is Justin Furuta. Right now, we're looking A/C units, but they will be PV A/Cs. And they will not be window mounted. They will actually be inside the units.

Mr. Niess: Okay.

Mr. Wong: Yeah, so maybe split system, yeah? I think that's . . . (inaudible) . . . I don't know. Yeah. Yeah.

Mr. Furuta: Correct.

Mr. Niess: Just the look of those, 18-inch by 18-inch window units through the wall, please don't do that right at the beginning. There's better more efficient systems, I think, that could be used.

Mr. Furuta: Okay.

Mr. Wong: Yeah, I agree. Yeah. Peter, thanks, that was a great comments, yeah.

Mr. Niess: I'm almost done. Sorry. Few more things.

Ms. Nunokawa: Mr. Niess, would I be able to just address your comment about the fencing?

Mr. Niess: Yeah.

Ms. Nunokawa: So along Alehela, the residences, most of those residences actually have CMU walls up along that, their property line. So this is -- there are existing walls there. And we did hold community meetings for the project with residences. And one of the comment in earlier version of the site plan -- I'll just go back to that real quickly -- but they had asked for a bigger setback from the Building A which is along Alehela, running parallel along Alehela Place. And so that's one of the design things that the architect did incorporate was to include a much bigger buffer and much bigger setback. And also, the residents did ask about fencing around the private park area and so that will be incorporated as well. So I just wanted to address those for you.

Mr. Niess: Perfect. We don't need to make an official comment then. Then I would say with the landscaping, it looks like she's already doing it. You're putting a variety of heights so there's going to be a bunch of windows looking down the backyards. So just provide as much privacy as possible to people that have been living there for a long time.

And then my other comment is, I'm sure you either have to go through this, but traffic on Puunene in afternoon is terrible. I don't think this project, I don't want to put it on an affordable project to have to spend things on traffic lights or whatnot, but just be aware that it's pretty bad on Puunene. And I think the County might be doing something with it. But I want to point that out.

Ms. Nunokawa: Mr. Niess, we do have Tyler Fujiwara who did --

Mr. Niess: Okay.

Ms. Nunokawa: He's the traffic engineer and he's on the call and he can speak to that as well.

Mr. Niess: I don't actually have a real comment.

Ms. Nunokawa: Okay.

Mr. Niess: Yeah. Not for this project to fix. Lastly would be for Chad McDonald, the water at six feet, are there any possible problems with hitting the water table or any tsunami inundation issues here? I know that it's . . . (inaudible) . . . stones in the 50's that seen fish on this lot from a tsunami washing up Puunene. It's not an official UDRB comment, but just question . . . (inaudible) . . . considered for the footing . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. McDonald: Well, in terms of the FEMA flood maps, the, the, the project site is identified as Zone X, which is outside the 500 year flood. With regards to the water table, we have yet to get a geotechnical investigation done. I think it's currently being scheduled. But, you know, we're assuming to your point that the water table, we're going to be hitting it when we're three or four feet down. So that's a reason why, you know, I had mentioned when we look at the whole drainage system, the drainage chamber, it's going to have to be some type of low profile system to stay above that water table. So point, point taken, and, yeah, we are we are well aware of the situation and the challenge of keeping everything above the water table.

Mr. Niess: Okay. That's, that's all I have. I see Tom Arisumi, you guys building it, so they'll make sure it comes out quality.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Okay, thank you so much, Peter. So I guess we can move on to ask Marie for her comments.

Ms. Kimmey: Yeah, I'll, I'll preface it by saying I am really all for these what I would consider a 100 percent affordable housing projects. And kudos to all the people who have obviously been working for many years, looks like over 15 years to get this one done right. I'm really all in favor of that.

I think Peter, as usual, has covered most of my thoughts on this. I did agree that I think we need some fencing and it sounds like that's already part of the setup, at least for the park area to keep those kids safe when they play out there.

I did like the concept of some Hawaiian motifs. I know it's a little bit extra fancy, but not that much extra. And I see it's on some of the plans and not all. I'd like to make sure that that does get incorporated in the, in the final project. Gosh, I just say kudos for the people

putting this together. And I'm sure it sounds like they're open to the comments people have given already, so I'm good. I'm good.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Thank you so much, Marie. Yes. It's always nice to have the community input and feedback that we can hear just already done and ready to go. Stuart, comments or recommendations?

Mr. Marlowe: Just a question. Have all of the A.D.A requirements been met on these plans for access to the buildings? And I saw on the plan that there was some consideration regarding, in the parking area, but what about A.D.A. rules, etcetera, for entering the building, getting to the second floor, and so on and so forth? It's just a question.

Mr. Wong: Oh, yeah, all -- we are required to be fully accessible. So we have a number of -- we have to meet that 2010 A.D.A. And I'm pretty familiar because we, we did the Kahulani -- got approvals on Kahulani, fully accessible. We got A.D.A. approval. We got solar system. So yes, you are correct, everything will meet A.D.A., including the number of accessible units, for full mobility and hearing provided and in each of the buildings. And access from, throughout the site to the entries and to wherever, yeah. So we will meet fully accessible requirements.

Mr. Marlowe: And access to the second and third floor. Is that only the stairwell and steps or is there elevators or things like that?

Mr. Wong: Yeah, we are required to have elevator. So we have an elevator in each building.

Mr. Marlowe: Okay. Thank you.

Mr. Wong: Yeah. We've got everything covered, hopefully. Yeah.

Ms. Kimmey: This is Marie. Real quick. I'll interject. The Federal Fair Housing also would be applicable here, but I'm looking at the sizes of your kitchens and your restrooms. It looks like you, you have that covered as well. Just, just a comment. That's A.D.A plus Federal Fair Housing.

Mr. Wong: Yeah. The other thing we also do is, the ones that are not accessible, they are fully adaptable. So it can be.

Ms. Kimmey: Good. Right.

Mr. Wong: Yeah, we have more than enough accessible units and we have the adaptable. Every, every unit --

Ms. Kimmey: Become accessible.

Mr. Wong: Okay.

Ms. Kimmey: Right. Excellent.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you, Marie and Stuart, for those good questions. That's very important. So Darren Okimoto?

Mr. Okimoto: You know, thank you for a great presentation. I agree with everyone what everyone's saying. It's a great project, in a great location. An infill project in Central Maui, close to jobs, amenities, bus stops. I also appreciate the fact that you did already go to the community and get feedback from the residents in the area. And I do like the fact that you're adding kind of a dense hedge, areca palms, along that southern side to kind of block the visual, and also, I assume, for down attenuation and things like that.

I had a question on the parking. I noticed it's one parking stall per bedroom. Through the affordable housing process, is the project going to get an exemption from the code for the parking?

Ms. Nunokawa: Thanks for the questions, Darren. So the parking is going to be one stall per one-bedroom unit, and two stalls for every two-bedroom units. So it's a total 250 stall. But we are asking for a slight, I guess a little bit of a, exemption from that.

Mr. Okimoto: Okay. As part of the 2.97 process?

Ms. Nunokawa: Yes.

Mr. Okimoto: Okay. Yeah, I think just the concern is that making sure there's enough parking so cars don't spill out to the residential streets and things like that. Okay.

Ms. Nunokawa: Great.

Mr. Okimoto: Okay. And then my other question -- or more a comment. I know Tyler is the traffic engineer, but if we can just look for measures, like Peter had pointed out, Puunene is five lanes with the center turning median. And just if the project can look at measures that could help to prevent vehicles from making the left out onto Puunene. It could be, you know, just for a safety factor. So just something for the project to look at.

Ms. Nunokawa: Yeah. And right now it's just a right in, right out. Force right in, force right out onto South Puunene Avenue. And so, yeah, looking at how we can mitigate that turn, middle turning lane of people using that to try to make that left into. Yeah, because that won't be allowed.

Mr. Okimoto: And then even for the residents not being able to turn left out to Puunene. Trying to cover that many lanes is just a safety thing, so it's just a comment to look at.

Ms. Nunokawa: Exactly.

Mr. Okimoto: That's all I have. Thanks.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Great. Thank you so much, Darren. So I'd like to invite Mandy for her comments.

Ms. Saito: So, yeah, I agree with everyone that this is a great project for this area. The presentation was done very nicely. I just wanted to circle back to maybe the comment about the, I guess the buffer to the adjacent residential area on the south east corner of the site. Is there a reason why that, that particular building is closer than the other building? Because it looks like it's about 15 to 20 feet the setback. And it could just be maybe just the size of the exhibit that I'm looking at. But it's where the existing entrance I think currently is being -- the existing driveway. That building.

Ms. Nunokawa: So, Building B, yeah Mandy, this one right here?

Ms. Saito: Yeah. Building B.

Ms. Nunokawa: Yeah, so this does not --. On this side, there are no -- the units do not look over into the property.

Ms. Saito: Okay. Okay, I see. Okay, that makes sense. The other question I had regarding that area and considering the traffic, is there a reason why the, I guess the driveway was realigned for that, Puunene Ave? Because it looks like there's an existing entrance already being used. I think it's a vacant lot right now. It seems like there's a driveway there currently. Was there a reason for the shift from the opposite side of the parcel?

Ms. Nunokawa: Maybe Chad or Steve could address that.

Mr. McDonald: Hi. This is Chad. Yeah, I think it's more from the standpoint of efficiency of the site. So we actually have been working with the State of Hawaii, Department of Transportation on relocation of the Puunene access because you may know that South Puunene is under the jurisdiction of State Highways. So we can't arbitrarily just pick and choose where we want these driveways. So we have been working with the State DOT on requesting a relocation of that access. And again, you know, and Steve, you can correct me if I'm wrong, is more efficiency of the site, and the layout of the buildings in the parking. And to be honest, to get the amount of parking stalls within the site was a bit of a challenge.

Ms. Saito: Okay, thank you. I appreciate all the planning efforts that have been made with the community and with the different departments.

Mr. McDonald: Thank you.

Ms. Saito: And I also do like the option that the PV carports that's included in the design, I think would be nice feature if you're able to actually do it successfully with the available funds. That's all I have.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Great. Thank you, Mandy. And Darren Unemori.

Mr. Unemori: Okay, thank you very much. Okay, I just have a couple of questions. During the discussion it was, I think, Steve Wong had mentioned early on, there were no exceptions taken buildings setback. Kari mentioned there was a -- there's going to be a parking exemption. Is the project taking any other exemptions under 2.97 relating to improvements? Building height, or anything like that?

Ms. Nunokawa: Steve, did you want to talk about that?

Mr. Unemori: I'm just -- I just wanted to clarify whether there are any exemptions that were taking that UDRB ought to speak to?

Ms. Nunokawa: So --

Mr. Wong: No, that I --.

Ms. Nunokawa: Sorry. Go ahead, Steve.

Mr. Wong: Yeah, none. No, we're meeting the height, the 35 feet.

Mr. Unemori: Okay.

Mr. Wong: But, yeah --

Ms. Nunokawa: The main -- the main exemption that we're really seeking is for the general plan and community plan for land use designation, and change in zoning.

Mr. Unemori: Okay, right. But as far as physical improvements, parking is the only exemption you're seeking.

Ms. Nunokawa: And we're also seeking an exemption to improvements to public streets for the undergrounding of utility lines.

Mr. Unemori; Okay, so existing -- existing lines, right?

Ms. Nunokawa: Yeah.

Mr. Unemori: Okay, that's a good one. Okay, the only other question I have was actually related to PV. I'm looking at slide 22, and showing the PV canopy locations. If the project decides to go ahead with PV, are the -- is the presence of the canopies going to have any impact on the residents on the second or third floors?

Ms. Nunokawa: So you're looking at this slide, yeah?

Mr. Unemori: Right, right. And I'm presuming the canopies are going to be roughly one-story tall, right?

Ms. Nunokawa: Yeah, so Steve?

Mr. Unemori: And I'm thinking about the reflectivity of the panels and the visual -- the common objections.

Ms. Nunokawa: Steve, can you address that comment, please? Thanks.

Mr. Wong: You're, you're asking if they will have any visual impact.

Mr. Unemori: Well, basically, does it -- will it have a negative impact on the livability of the second or third floor facing the canopies?

Mr. Wong: Truthfully speaking, yeah, they'll --. I don't know maybe Jeff can answer that, but they will be looking at the top of the PV.

Mr. Jeff Furuta: Hi. This is Jeff Furuta. We have other projects that we've installed PV carports for, similar to Hale Pilina, were two, three story buildings. And there has -- I mean you will see the carports. But as far as negative impacts, we haven't heard of any so far.

Mr. Unemori: Okay. So glare and things like that won't be a problem then?

Mr. Furuta: Right.

Mr. Unemori: Okay. Very good. Thank you very much. Those are all my questions.

Mr. Furuta: Thank you.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Great. Thank you, Darren. Paul Areus?

Mr. Areus: Hi. How's it going? So yeah, I'm very strongly in support of this affordable housing. It looks, looks great. And I feel like the other members pretty much addressed a lot of the comments that I was considering. When I looked at the -- I don't know if there's a landscape architect here today. Is there? Okay.  
That is --?

Ms. Nunokawa: Aolani is here with us today.

Ms. Yamasato-Gragas: Hi, I'm here.

Mr. Areus: Okay. That's a member of our Board?

Ms. Yamasato-Gragas: Oh, no, I'm with the, with the project.

Mr. Areus: Oh, thanks. Cool. Yeah, so I do have what I actually wouldn't consider very strong feedback because I think that you guys have worked this out pretty well. But when I initially looked at what is page 21 of the packet that was provided, it's the landscape plan, L-001.01. My initial comment when I first looked at that was like, you know, there's not a lot of plantings in the middle of the development where the parking is. Not as many as there could be. But then, then I saw that there is photo voltaics in that center area. So I was like, wow, well that actually looks like there's probably -- I wasn't even aware that you could put the trees there where they're located. And I was curious, curious about that, you know, like, if you can have the trees right at the same location where the photo voltaics are located.

Ms. Yamasato-Gragas: No, no, no. So they had a -- Jeff has a PV consultant that we worked with, and he told me where I can place the trees based on the PV locations. Because any kind of shade will block the efficiency of the PV panels. So there's no trees with the PV. It's two separate plans. So on the PV plans, there's no trees in that parking area.

Mr. Areus: Okay.

Ms. Yamasato-Gragas: And, and also there's also a lot of storm retention. I don't know if you can see all the storm retention kind of areas on the ground.

Mr. Areus: Yeah. Yeah, I can.

Ms. Yamasato-Gragas: So that's why I can't really put any -- too many trees in the parking area because they're using it for water storm retention.

Mr. Areus: Okay. Well, thank you for clearing, clarifying that. That was a question I had when I looked at those different layers. I couldn't see really how they were relating to each other. But I'm really also happy that you guys are putting that much PV parking in, and

those parking spots are always the best parking. And the fact that you're also able to get that many trees in, interspersed and it will work with the PV, it's pretty cool. So, yeah, I think it's, it's a really well conceived project. It's in an excellent location. It will increase the density of that area and hopefully, you know, help, help to enable a lot of people there, hard-working people to be able to live more affordably in Maui.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Great. Thank you so much, Paul. And then finally, Morgan, please?

Mr. Gerdel: Oh, yeah. I just want to thank the developer. It's a good plan. I think it's well thought out. Getting all these affordable homes, it's a great thing for Maui. I just have a couple of comments. I was looking at the exterior elevations with the dormers on the roof, and my thought is they may want to leave more space for, for PV, for the future, for solar hot water. The dormers may limit that. And I guess I kind of agree with Peter that they may be better served introducing shading devices for the windows. So I think that would be a better design move than the dormers, at least for me.

Also, I would recommend -- they may have this planned already, but a pedestrian walkway connecting from the units to the sidewalks on the exterior. I'm not sure if there's only a roadway, but, or they're saying pedestrian sidewalks planned for that. And I noticed they had some bike racks included, and I guess it will include bicycle storage for the residents. I'd recommend it be enclosed or covered so they can leave their bikes there full time, not have to worry about rain or theft or anything like that. So those are my comments.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you so much. That's great. I think we've covered everyone. So then I would ask -- and I, I really love the idea that you've preserved the park in a mini form so I'm positive the residents will enjoy that very much. And thank you so much for the really thoughtful presentation and all the work that you've done on this.

So, so Tara, do you want to try to summarize the recommendations or comments from the Board that we can put forward?

Ms. Furukawa: Sure. So overall, you guys were supportive of the project and the PV will be a nice feature if you can do it. So you wanted to add windows shading especially to the south and west side of the elevations of the structures. Fencing to attenuate noise and exterior light. Maintain the Hawaiian motif for the project. Look at measures to prevent left turns onto Puunene Avenue. Leave more space for the solar, for solar hot water heaters eventually to be added. Add pedestrian walkways from the units to the roads and include enclosed bike storage. And I can refer to the minutes also.

Mr. Niess: Can I add one thing? Sorry.

Ms. Furukawa: Okay. Oh, and fencing, sorry. Oh, no, I mentioned it earlier that actually.

Mr. Niess: Fencing is taking care of so you don't . . . (inaudible) . . . Appropriate site lighting for safety if they --. I'm sure it will be dealt with, but just consider appropriate site light so it feels safe.

Ms. Furukawa: Okay, got it.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Okay, great. Well thank you Tara. So with that then if I could ask for a motion to approve the comments on the design aspects of this project.

Mr. Okimoto: Caryl, can we add one more? Just more of a supportive thing that we appreciate the project reaching out to the community and actually incorporating changes into the project prior to coming to see us. That's something great that the project did. So we -- if we can add that as commending them for doing that.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you, Darren.

Ms. Furukawa: Okay.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: And the LEED design as well. I think that is awesome so -- and including all the photovoltaics. So many nice things about this project. Super. So back to the motion.

Mr. Niess: I so move.

Mr. Okimoto: I'll second that.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Okay, thank you Peter. And a second is Darren Okimoto?

Mr. Okimoto: Yes.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Okay, wonderful. Thank you. So then we'll just do the roll call of in favor or oppose. So, Peter, as you -- I assume, in favor.

Mr. Niess: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Marie?

Ms. Kimmey: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Stuart?

Mr. Marlowe: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Darren Okimoto?

Mr. Okimoto: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Mandy Saito?

Ms. Saito: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: And Darren Unemori?

Mr. Unemori: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Paul Areus?

Mr. Areus: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: And Morgan?

Mr. Gerdel: In favor.

**It was moved by Mr. Peter Niess, seconded by Mr. Darren Okimoto, then unanimously**

**VOTED: To approve the comments on the designed aspects of the project, as discussed.**

*(Assenting: P. Areus, M. Gerdel, M. Kimmey, S. Marlowe, P. Niess, D. Okimoto, M. Saito, D. Unemori)*

*(Excused: J. Circle-Woodburn)*

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: So it's, it's unanimous. Thank you so much folks for the wonderful presentation. We wish you all the best with your project.

Ms. Nunokawa: Thank you so much.

Mr. Wong: Thank you.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you Kari and team.

- 2. MRS. GWENDOLYN RIVERA of MUNEKIYO HIRAGA on behalf of BRE RC MAUI KAPALUA, LLC, is requesting design review of the proposed Ritz-Carlton Kapalua Resort Mohala Project. The project will involve various improvements and upgrades to resort facilities and grounds to better enhance guest experience. The project is to be located at 1 Ritz Carlton Drive in Kapalua, Maui, Hawaii at TMKs: (2) 4-2-004:014, 21 and 047 (SM1 2020/0014) (T. Furukawa).**

**The Board may provide its recommendations to the Maui Planning Commission on the design aspects within its purview based on the Special Management Area Use Permit provided for the project.**

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Okay, so moving on to our second communication . . . (*Chair Hitchcock-Sprinzel read the above project description into the record.*) . . . And the planner this time again is Tara so good to have you back.

Ms. Furukawa: Okay, so this item has come to you for review because the applicant, BRE RC Maui Kapalua, LLC, is seeking design comments that will be forwarded to the Maui Planning Commission for approval of a Special Management Area Use Permit and Project District Phase Two Approval. The project consultant Gwen Rivera of Munekiyo Hiraga will present the project, and she and the other project consultants can answer any questions that you might have regarding the proposal.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you Tara.

Ms. Gwendolyn Rivera: Okay, good morning. My name is Gwen Rivera. Is it all right if at this time I share my screen?

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Yes, please. Thank you.

Ms. Rivera: Okay. Sure.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Gwen, we're getting a poor network message error. I don't know if you have another team member or someone else who can run the slides for you.

Mr. Mark Higa: I'll go ahead and put the slides up here.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you, Mark. Okay, wonderful. We can see them now. Thank you so much for doing that.

Mr. Higa: Gwen is still . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Robert Hale: Looks like she's joining right now.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Fine. We'll give her a moment to reconnect.

Ms. Rivera: Hi. Sorry about that. I had a connectivity issue. Can you hear me okay now?

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Yes. Yes, we can. Welcome back.

Ms. Rivera: Oh, thank you so much. And let's see, do we have the presentation up? There we go.

Mr. Higa: And I'm actually sharing right now so I could move through the slides as you go.

Ms. Rivera: Okay, that's fine. Thank you so much. So thank you for your patience. We're here to present for your review the Mohala Project at the Ritz Carlton Kapalua Resort. And on behalf of the whole project team, I'd like to thank all of you on the Board for taking the time to review this project. Let's go on to the next slide, and I'll introduce the project team at this time.

So representing the applicant and the owner, BRE Hotels and Resorts, is Mr. Rob Hale with us today. We also have Mr. Clifford Nae'ole here on behalf of the resort. The architectural consultant is WCIT. We have Mark Higa and Robert Iopa. Robert Iopa will be presenting the project plans to you today. The engineer is Mike Silva with Fukumoto Engineering. Tanya Lee-Greig is here as the project's architectural -- I'm sorry, the archaeological consultant from 'Aina Archaeology. We have Trisha Kehaulani Watson here from Honua Consulting, the cultural consultant. And for planning, Karlynn Fukuda and I are here from Munekiyo Hiraga. Following the presentation, the team members would be happy to answer any questions you may have about the project. Next please.

So our presentation objectives -- in a moment, I will give, I'll ask Robert Hale of BRE to give you some background, a high level overview on the Mohala Project, which involves improvements to a number of areas at the resort. And then, as I mentioned, Robert Iopa will be presenting the, the design package. And we're requesting your comments in connection with the SMA Use and Project District Phase two applications, which have been submitted in October of last year. Next, please.

In a moment, we'll see a location map which shows you the location of the project at the Ritz Carlton Resort in Kapalua. Orienting you, the resort is located off Office Road. Access is coming off a Honoapiilani Highway which is running kind of diagonally. Yes, there. The project affects five parcels which are at and around the Ritz Carlton Kapalua Resort. The existing hotel and parking area are shown by the two large shaded areas in parcel 21. There is also some work in the areas fronting Office Road, which you can see in parcels 52 and 53. These are primarily landscaping and entryway improvements. And to the east of the project, in parcel 47, is an area with existing -- where the existing tennis courts and the current Cousteau building are.

Now parcel 14, which is makai of the resort is the Honokahua burial preserve where as a part of this project, the resort has consulted with cultural representatives and stakeholders, and proposes to make amendments to better preserve and protect this area. Next slide, please.

So and parcel 14, as well as parcels 21 and 47 where the hotel and the sports field are located those are owned by BRE, Ritz Carlton Maui Kapalua. The two parcels fronting Office Road, 52 and 53, those two are owned by T.Y. Management Corporation and MLP. Next, please.

So regulatory considerations, as we discussed, the permits involved in this are a Special Management Area Use Permit, Project District Phase Two. In addition, the Hawaii HRS SHPD review, State Historic Preservation Division reviewing the project. Shoreline setback assessment is not required for this project, as all the improvements are at least 150 feet from the shoreline. Construction date we estimate to start later in calendar year, 2021, and the duration of the project would be approximately 18 months. Okay, next slide.

All right, so at this point I would like to ask Mr. Robert Hale to, to give you an overview of the project on behalf of BRE. After which Rob Iopa can share the design package with you. Mr. Hale?

Mr. Robert Hale: Thank you Gwen. Aloha to the Board. Thank you so much for taking the time to see what we've been working on for about two and a half years now. So just to give you a little bit of background, I mean, kind of the first thought when, when we purchased the property is that, you know, this is your kind of classic 1980's Ritz Carlton, where they decided that the Ritz Carlton was the Ritz Carlton, and wherever they put it, it was a Ritz Carlton. And, you know, nowadays we look at things a little differently. And just giving this a little more sense of place and having it more grounded in where we're at is important to us. So as you can see, we're not adding rooms, we're not adding restaurants, we're not doing any of that. A lot of the improvements are really to kind of bring a little more sense of Hawaii to the place, to give it a better Hawaiian experience for the guests that come. We're trying to get guests outside a little bit more, which, you know, the last year has taught us is, you know, there's a lot of good reasons for that or whatever to do that. And we've also just with respect to the, to where we're at and the location. I mean, we've had a lot of consultation literally over the last two and a half years with dozens and dozens of local practitioners and cultural advisors, and we've hired just, I think, for me, the all-star team or whatever to work on this.

So I hope you'll see the same things in there. You'll see that we're trying to have some common things like wood and stone and things like that that we're bringing into the building a little bit more throughout, and even on our PV. So we have a large PV portion of the project, which is about and hopefully will give us about 50 percent of our power. But you'll see that we even are trying to be careful to make sure that it's appropriate and it fits. And it also gives you a little bit of that, that's more of a Hawaiian feel. So thank you again. Mahalo for taking the time. I'm going to leave it to the team who've done a wonderful job to get us here, and hopefully you'll enjoy what we're looking to do. Thank you.

Ms. Rivera: Thank you so much, Rob. Rob Iopa, are you able to now present the design package?

Mr. Rob Iopa: Yes I am. The next Rob on the team. Aloha mai kakou. Rob Iopa, WCIT Architecture. I am here to run you through the design components of the project, along with my partner Mark Higa, who jumped in early, to pop up sides. We also have our landscape architect, Matt McCloud, and Mike Silva, our civil engineer, as part of our team members that will jump in and help as necessary as we go through the project. First slide, please.

We'll start within an overall orientation plan that gives you some extent of where our work is going to happen. Obviously, left is makai, and right is mauka. North is, is left in this plan for orientation purposes. Generally speaking, the areas that are highlighted in color, over the Google Earth background, are the areas that we are looking for renovations and improvements as part of this project. Starting at our arrival drive, and we'll, we'll highlight each one of these components in more detail. But we have some landscape improvements coming in through the arrival drive off of Office Road leading to our porte cochere and our arrival experience. That's one segment of work.

To plan right is our existing parking area where Rob Hale had described our new photovoltaic system going into place. So you'll see the canopies and some of the location Rob talked about, near 50 percent of our power generation, ideally through this new inclusion. Moving to the lower segment of the plan, we'll go through the improvements at the Aloha Pavilion and the existing structure that houses outdoor events. Generally kind of a butler building of sorts, a glorified butler building of sorts. So we're looking to kind of soften its exterior and interior look for greater gathering purposes.

As we head makai along that area, we have guest wing improvements primarily in this wing alone that add some ground floor, outdoor environments, new trellis areas. We call this area the spa suites. I just bypassed it. But there's some existing meeting rooms and a little club that we're doing some exterior lanai improvements to, as highlighted by the cursor.

As we go further makai just up from the existing pool is a Banyan Tree restaurant and our new proposed Kolea pool. We have some support additions to the Banyan Tree restaurant to house the new water features and pool, along with some new bathrooms that would support the pool activities.

I'll jump up plan north or to the top edge of this sheet to the Huina Experience. Really, we're generally converting an area that's primarily been focused on sporting events more to cultural activities. As I'm sure you're all aware, the culture activities at the Ritz Carlton, led by Clifford Nae'ole are some of the most significant around and this will allow to support those activities and more moving forward.

And then finally speaking, we'll go into the area in and around preservation and conservation easement. Our intentions along the easement are to remove elements that have encroached on the easement over time and to solidify protection of this easement for the cultural activities that happen within.

So with that, I'll start to jump into arrival and then kind of move our way in and around site. Existing conditions, as you approach the hotel off of Office Road, you know, the Cook Pines are kind of the most significant landscape element in it along here. In and along the entry drive, our proposal is to include six new fire braziers, fire pits as you're coming in and along the road, in and amongst the median strip, and the inclusion of some Loulu palms in and around the side areas as you're coming in as well.

Moving then into our porte cochere, for all intents and purposes, the architectural structures remain. We have a covered entry environment at the porte cochere, and a covered walkway leading to the lobby. Those will remain. We have an existing water feature at, right at the lobby entry that we're looking to modify and make a little more substantial tied into some of the cultural stories of the area, and a little bridge aspect that crosses there. We have a few new pathways in and along the landscape median, in and around an existing koi pond. The intention is to hang a few hammocks of sorts, right, to, to allow people day beds, to allow people to kind of gather and use the space. And then the inclusion of some new native landscaping material in and around the area.

So we move back away from the porte cochere and -- Sorry. So a few renderings of this, most of the architectural structures in this area are existing. As you may know and see on the bottom left, their style of architecture of the time was modeled off of a territorial style, heavy plaster walls, dark or green kind of tiled roofs. Our intention really along this area is just to provide for some softening of the heavy plaster walls. So the inclusion of some new trellis elements, the inclusion of Kapalua stone is kind of the defining feature the resort area along our base. So just some softening Hawaiian architectural elements.

We move out to the existing parking structure, you see the locations of our photovoltaic canopies that will be over the existing parking lot. This extends to Village Road on the most mauka side and then abuts near the existing ballroom on plan left. To support this, we have a small proposed PV equipment room, and we are also adding some buffering landscaping, primarily the Loulu palms in and around, in and around the parking lot. You see the elevations here, essentially a center post. These are steel structures that would be painted and clad to make wood like, single support with a pitched roof.

Here's a blow up area of the proposed photovoltaic equipment room just shy of 2,500 square feet abutting an existing structure. And we have some topography that we're kind of nestling this building into. Essentially an equipment room, so ventilations, screens, and an access door, shielded by landscaping. And a few renderings of this area.

Materials, again, it's a, it's a steel structure, painted and clad in areas to make look more wood like. And the base treatment includes a small base of Kapalua stone.

As we move on, we're at the existing Aloha Pavilion, substantial free span structure that's used for gathering. Our intention here is really to just make it more welcoming and environment -- a more welcoming environment, and to include a little stronger sense of a Hawaiian place.

Left here, we have the inclusion of a new water feature. This water feature, we expect to have taro or kalo planted in plants and displayed here as an internal connection to the hotel. In and around this area, we have a new and renovated restroom to support the Aloha pavilion and an extension of the kitchen to provide service to the Aloha pavilion. We have an extended trellis area that comes off of the front or facing the garden area here that will serve as a pre-function for activities that happen in the pavilion. And then to the right, we have what we're calling a Hapu'u garden, a substantial outdoor space that can spill from the pavilion into the garden area. We have the inclusion of, of some walkways to experience the garden and to access various parts of the pavilion for service and for guest use.

In the elevations, essentially the roof structure and the plaster walls are effectively what is there now. We're building a trellis element out of the front and look to populate that with, with plants on both sides of the building. Also the introduction of some Kapalua stone base to the columns. In our rendering, this would be our porte cochere is to the left of this area. That little lawn and garden that's off to the front, to the right, would be the walkway coming from the lobby, past the water feature back to the front of Aloha pavilion. Again, serving, this trellis area is serving as a pre-function to the activities that happen within.

Inspired by the Halau Wa'a, or our canoe house. You see a rendering on the bottom, second from the left that uses lashing and thatched types of elements to kind of hearken back to that inspiration. Real wood trellis here to mimic some of the things that are happening at the porte cochere, and then Kapalua stone again as the base to most of our column elements.

And some of the landscape features. So, again, the kalo as a kind of element as you're coming in along the water features. We have the Hapu'u Garden so the idea of having the Hapu'u ferns kind of nestled within the Cooke Pines. Some introductions of fire pits and then some other resort type planting like the Plumeria and other flowering Hawaiian resort environment type landscaping.

*(Mr. Peter Niess excused at approximately 11:40 a.m.)*

Just makai of this area is the area that we described, key plan on the bottom right. But this is the Ritz Carlton Club. There's existing lanai that you see in the three photos on the right. The plan on the left depicts an extension of one of those lanai that would include two fire

pits and a new trellis element that would cover this and the existing lanai just to the top left up there.

Many of our architectural features that we're adding are really kind of just softening that hard plaster look with, with wood elements. So this is the elevation on top, side elevation bottom left, and the existing condition, the bottom right. So over time, there's been some kind of fabric canopies and other things that have covered these areas and appealing those -- peeling off some of the heavy plaster columns and doing a lighter wood treatment with the Kapalua stone base. A rendering. Similar materials, I think the only new inclusion in this area is, is the glass windscreen. For the most part, we're trying to keep everything clear, views clear, and the glass windscreen helps protect wind in this area.

We moved on to the guest wing lanai suites, so everything essentially on the west side of the wing, on the west side of the property, on south. The ground level units we're -- we're extending the lanais, producing trellises off the lanais, and creating little gathering spaces for each one of the ground level units. We call them spa suites.

The most makai edge of this building we -- those units will be enhanced a bit more so the trellis elements that you'll see upcoming in section on the top. But we also have three spa elements that we're introducing here as well.

Part of these -- this wing includes a few entry doors that connect us back into the central courtyard and pools, and out to this kind of western edge of the property. We're replacing the doors and replacing the kind of arc fabric canopies with the trellis element for consistency.

We are dealing with topography in this area, so generally speaking, everything starts to slope gently and then more dramatically in areas back towards the ocean. So this is a, this is an elevation looking at the western elevation. You see the new trellis elements at ground level and some of the inclusions of new retaining walls facing Kapalua stone to provide for those flat areas outside some of these, some of these lanais. So you got a sense here of what that might feel like. On the rest of the architecture, right, is the railings, the plaster, those are all in place. What are inclusions as part of this project would entail is an expansion of the ground level terrace areas, a -- the new trellis here, aluminum, but wood-like aluminum, which has been done very well. And then some of the retaining walls. Here just shown is flat, but the intention is to, is to mix Kapalua stone in here as well.

The Honokahua Preservation and Conservation easement is obviously a historic place and of significant cultural value of importance. Over time what's happened here is that there's been encroachments to the easement, which is essentially defined by the property line. Some of those encroachments include a pathway that leads down to the beach. It's also an emergency access pathway on kind of the eastern border. We have some hedge. There's Hao hedge that's in place that just happened over time that didn't necessarily exist at the, at

the furthest extent of the conservation. But through this project, we're looking to correct these issues. I'll show you a few details of that.

This is the eastern edge. You know, I think it's E, depicts kind of a dashed line in the white area that shows where the existing Hao edge is. And our intention is to take that Hao hedge and push that back out of the conservation easement. So that's represented in the darker curved line there. You also see D, which is the existing emergency access path, also serves as a path that public and guests use to get down to the beach. That over time had encroached into the easement as well. So our intention is to push that outside the easement onto resort property and to allow for the easement and the preservation components to be undisturbed. To do so, there's an existing tennis court. You see kind of the dashed line at F. So we're modifying a tennis court, pulling it back and allowing for kind of a half of court's worth of sports court activity.

On the western edge of the plans, bottom, we're doing some improvements here as well. So, again, the hedge had encroached into the property. There's kind of multiple hedge boundaries here which make it confusing on where the boundary might be. There's also very important for culture and public use easement that leads down into the ocean to the point here. So our new thought is to include two new hedges located at D and E, that separate you from the golf course, separate you from the preserve, but still allow for a pathway leading down into the ocean. There's a small vehicular access at A that allow for parking, for access for maintenance and cultural practices to the preservation site.

All of these discussions and potential modifications have been planned with great consultation with stakeholders and cultural leaders within the area. Clifford Nae'ole has led that activity, but also in close consultation and working with Tanya Lee-Greig from 'Aina archaeology, Trisha Kehau Watson of Honua Consulting, and Charlene Kauhane of Kauhane Inc.

The last component that I'll take you to -- well, two more -- sorry. So this is the existing Banyan Tree restaurant. We are adding a new pool. We called it the Kolea pool, and we do have the need for some pool equipment. And so we're attaching some structure to the back of the existing restaurant in and around the existing pump room and equipment room that service the existing restaurant and the existing pools. And then on what would be a pool level, we're renovating and adding some restrooms and a covered walkway that will be accessible from the pool as well. You'll see these in elevation. So the top is the elevation looking back at the entry, and that walkway that leads you to the new restrooms, which is labeled as D. The material here is wood. The plaster of the new restroom extension and the existing grayish concrete tile that matches the existing restaurant. The bottom elevation is the trellis walkway that leads you to the bathrooms from the pool.

Here is a bit of topography. So we fall away here on the makai side. So the top elevation is mislabeled. That's actually the north elevation. Oh, no, no. Sorry, that is the south

elevation. Oh, no, sorry, it is the north elevation. But this is the elevation looking towards back from makai, looking towards the building. So there's a little trellis lanai on the top and second floor. Just below that is some of the equipment area that we have a new trellis. And then down below you see that same area. Trellis shielded by landscape and then a little, a little lanai off of the restroom.

Kolea Pool. So the existing pool is just to the right. The existing Banyan Tree is just to the top. And then kind of everything from the letter L, left, is the new proposal. This is zero edge, bermed front pool. So a nice landscape berm there. It is a sloped bottom pool that conforms to the existing topography. Our intention here is to minimize any ground disturbance and to build on existing grade, sand bottom. The beach is, you're well aware, that Flemming's can be difficult at times, so this provides for another kind of beachy like environment without going down to the resource of the ocean, and well separated from the public shoreline path here that leads down to the beach and even further separated from the preservation conservation easement.

Cross section on top, and then section taking it mauka makai down below. So you see how that slope bottom pool contouring to existing topography and the landscape bermed edge. The -- just to the, to the gridline D, vertical gridline D or point, you see the existing walkway. And then G denotes the hedge from the cultural preserve.

Rendering from the lobby looking back down. So existing pool in the foreground and then proposed pool in the background. These are some of the inspirational images and kind of material. So a few fire features along the way, waterfall edges, stone kind of coping, and sand bottom.

Lastly we'll move to the area for cultural activities. So there are -- they mentioned a modified sports court. That's the one on the bottom there. You see the dashed line showing where we minimize that sports court to allow for the relocation of the beach and emergency access path. Then existing Cousteau structure. So we're calling it the Punana 'Ike building moving forward. Our intention there is to transition that building to more cultural based uses. It had some environmental and ocean based focus in the past. Obviously from cultural perspectives, those are equally of importance, but maybe framed just in a little different way. So we're providing some outdoor trellis again, here for allowing for gathering for, for educational purposes.

And then on the top edge of this area, we are proposing a new storage building that would house some of the equipment and necessary things to provide for the cultural activities in our lawn areas, and three traditionally inspired structures. We propose Halau Wa'a and one Halau Halawai.

The right part of this plan depicts the existing interior of the building, which we'll renovate for more cultural purposes in and along the idea of Punana 'Ike imparting knowledge. And then

the left shows kind of a terrace amphitheater and trellis area that we're building off the front of the structure. Existing -- so probably most apparent is the bottom left with that kind of terrace structured amphitheater. And then the proposed, looking to add again the trellis elements at the front, more native based landscaping in the foreground, and Kapalua stone base to make the -- and a structured amphitheater blend in with the rest of the architectural sidewalk features. A rendering. In palette and materials used throughout.

And then just the last few buildings here, this is the storage at the Huina Experience. We've taken even on the storage structure, concrete tile roofs to match the other kind of pitched roof structures along the area. We have a concrete tile breeze block at the top for ventilation. Plaster walls, Kapalua stone base and kind of wood treatment at our corners.

Proposed . . . (inaudible) . . . plan. Two Halau Wa'a structures traditionally inspired and then Hale Halawai. It's kind of a gathering meeting house, maybe even more traditionally inspired architecturally.

Synthetic thatched, wood clad. So you see the Halau Wa'a, the two structures that are of the smaller type, the Halawai structure, more traditionally A-framed. And the rendering of such.

That concludes the architectural presentation. I just would end with a couple of kind of just overall comments and I'll share that we have our consultants here that can speak in greater detail.

So storm water -- this storm water and drainage plan not exceed current conditions. Any new storm water generated will be retained on site and an areas. We have the expansion of a few existing drainage basins and the new pool is designed towards the storm water volume that would be created by its, by its proposal. Mike Silva is here to answer these storm water issues.

On the landscaping side, we are using as many native species as possible and then also just continuing with the same landscaping plan that is there in place, Hawaiian resort, resort character type planting. We are using Kapalua stone for our site walls as much as possible to kind of create privacy and pockets, reminiscence of kind of the Kapalua area. And our lighting, exterior lighting will comply with the County's outdoor lighting ordinance, fully shielded primarily to enhance, create safe way finding, allow for some nighttime activities and highlight landscaping, all while minimizing noise, lighting noise. Energy efficient fixtures used extensive and where, where at all possible.

I'll end my presentation. Like I said, we have the team here. I appreciate your time. I tried to move as quickly as possible through a project that has many different components on a very large site, but are here to answer any questions you might have. Thank you very much.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you, Gwen, and the two Robs for an interesting presentation. So at this time, I'd like to open the public testimony. Mr. Yoshida, is anybody signed up or waiting to testify on this project?

Mr. Yoshida: Thank you, Madame Chair. It's good to see Rob Iopa, Iopa again after looking well after a couple of years. The same spiel that I gave two hours ago, public testimony will be taken when each agenda item is discussed. Testimony will be limited to a maximum of three minutes. Testifier will be called to offer their testimony and are asked to mute their audio and video when they are not testifying. Testifiers via video are asked to sign up using the chat function, providing your name and the item you're wishing to testify on. Testifiers via phone will be called by the Chair after the video testimony is finished. For the record, the Department has received no written testimony on this item, and no one has said -- asked to testify, offer to testify via the chat function. I don't know --

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you so much Mr. Yoshida. So, then, I guess we can close public testimony and open the questions or comments recommendations from the Commissioners. So we'll do our round robin again. Peter, do you want to start again, please? Okay, Peter might have stepped away, so we'll just go on to Marie.

Ms. Kimmey: Alright. Very good. I'm, I'm -- it's an extensive project and I appreciate how swiftly you, Rob, went through it. But I did have some questions. The, the fire pits, I know, I see you've got a lot now of fire pits from the entry on in and some of the individual units. Are those going to be gas powered? How are you going to --? Is that a propane system? What is the plan on those?

Mr. Iopa: Yeah, the intent is they're gas powered and piped.

Ms. Kimmey: Okay. And that's an electrical switch to turn on. I'm just curious how it functions. It's quite an extensive bunch of fire pits.

Mr. Iopa: Yeah. So the ones that are controlled by the resort would be controlled by resort operations. Like the ones in and around the pools and or the entry drive, those typically are on timers, right, like, like other kind of nighttime activities. The ones on the individual lanais are on switch. They would be akin to a gas fireplace that one might have in a residential, residential applications.

Ms. Kimmey: Yeah. Okay, that was just a question. Interesting. I had some questions then about the preservation area. Is that -- is, is that open to public use? I mean, I see you have a little parking lot with maybe about eight stalls. How is that operated or, I guess -- I guess that's my question. Is it open to the public?

Mr. Iopa: It's open to cultural and lineal descendants and practitioners. We do have Clifford Nae'ole who's been the caretaker and steward of, of the preservation area since its, since

its discovery, if you will. And he can speak more to that if you'd like a greater, greater definition.

Ms. Kimmey: No, no, that's okay. Go ahead, then that would be good.

Mr. Clifford Nae'ole: I was going to say real quick. I'm sorry that the parking lot is for cultural practitioners, those wanting to proceed with ceremony protocol. It also provides space for traditional fishermen to get down to . . . (inaudible) . . . point to conduct their exercise, whether it be diving, fishing or gathering limu, etcetera.

Ms. Kimmey: Excellent.

Mr. Hale: And the parking lot --.

Ms. Kimmey: Go ahead.

Mr. Hale: That's the existing parking, so no change.

Ms. Kimmey: Yeah, it is existing. Yeah, I understood that. And I've been down there. It's a very small little parking area. Is there signage now? Is there a locked gate? How is that maintained?

Mr. Nae'ole: At this point in time, there is, there is, there is some signage. However, with the improvements that we intend to proceed with, it will create a funnel that will keep the people off of the burial site itself, and funnel them down towards the ocean. So there's -- it really further delineates the sacred sites from the golf course and from the traditional trail going down to the ocean. Because with the addition of the two new hedges that creates that that pathway that they cannot go right or left. They have to go along the leveled path lines to get to what they want to do.

Ms. Kimmey: That's why the double hedges. Thank you for explaining that. That makes it much more clearer. That's, that's great. And then I guess the new pool, you say that's a sandy bottom pool?

Mr. Iopa: Yeah, the structure of the pool is actually shot crete so the bottom of the pool is effectively a solid surface. But the texture that's laid over the top includes sand. So it's kind of a sand walk up.

Mr. Hale: Yeah, there's a sand -- there's a sand beach adjacent to it. So it's -- there's separate filter system to break the two. So that we filter a little bit of the sandy water, and then there's a typical pool beyond. But it gives you the impression that you're at a beach.

Ms. Kimmey: And you said the zero edge. Is that essentially the infinity edge concept?

Mr. Hale: So the zero edge is for walk in. So on the walk in side, you walk in, you don't have to step down steps. It's zero edge to zero edge. Infinity is the other side where you, you appear to look off into infinity over the edge of the water.

Ms. Kimmey: And that's also the case in this pool, correct?

Mr. Hale: It's similar to that in that because we have a wall that the -- that is holding up the that edge of the pool. But it's not a, not a -- if, if you ask our pool consultant, it's not exactly an infinity edge, but it's much like one. So it's --

Ms. Kimmey: Okay. Very good, very good. As far as architectural concerns, I, I like the use of the wood and, and the wood type aluminum. I think -- I think you've done a good job there. I guess I don't have any real comments to add in terms of what we would ask you to do in addition to what you're already planning. So I believe that's all I had. Thank you.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Thank you, Marie. And Stuart?

Mr. Marlowe: Just a wonderful, wonderful project. Can't wait to see it completed. And congratulations to all the designers and for the parent company authorizing it.

Mr. Hale: Thank you.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Thank you so much, Stuart. And Darren Okimoto.

Mr. Okimoto: Yeah, thank you for a very thorough presentation. There's quite a lot of small features to this, and you touched on all of them, so thank you. I appreciate the fact that you did reach out to, and you said multiple cultural practitioners in the area, especially with the preservation easement there. I had a question. Who owns and maintains the preservation easement, the hedges, and keeping it cut and things like that?

Mr. Hale: So the, the property owner has maintained that and we're only the recent property owner. But over time, it's maintained by the property owner. So we own the site. It's, it is an easement and it was granted. And we've maintained it with Haiku Landscaping recently, whose is also the one that would be doing all the planting, and any of the work on the property, so the same ones who maintain it. So I can give Clifford Nae'ole credit for helping to make sure that this has been done properly for 30 years. And so we intend to keep doing it.

Mr. Okimoto: Okay, great. For the PV system in the parking lot, I do appreciate that the design details from the hotel are carried there with the, you know, wood looking trellises, the Kapalua stone bases and some of the columns. The existing trees that are in those medians, will those be removed with the installation of the PV?

Mr. Hale: They will. Yeah, we're replacing with a -- actually, we have more trees we're adding than we're taking away. So there's some monkey pod trees that are there now. They're also causing a lot of problems over the parking lot. As you know, as they get older, they create all kinds of havoc. They grow into the sewage, the drainage system, etcetera, so those will be coming out. You can see we've added a lot of Loulu Palms. At the entry, we've added a lot along the edges, and then throughout the property, we're adding a lot of landscape. So the net is more trees than what, what's there now.

Mr. Okimoto: That's great that you're replacing those trees that you are moving. I guess one of the comments would be if you could reach out to cultural practitioners or local artisans to see if they can use the wood. I think would be a great way, a sustained, sustainability way . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Hale: Yeah, we . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Okimoto: . . . (inaudible) . . . to mitigate.

Mr. Hale: We've thought --. Yeah. So we've already had some thought. We've talked about . . . (inaudible) . . . potentially in some of our projects overall, so, but good comment.

Mr. Nae'ole: I'm going to add on that. Besides any tree that will be removed, we'll be reaching out to local schools, wood workers, etcetera to repurpose wood, and maybe use a wood as part of our interior decor as well. And whatever we remove, we have a partnership with Pu'u Kukui Watershed that we will provide native trees up in the forest as its replacement as well. So it's a win-win situation for everybody.

Mr. Okimoto: No, that's really great. I'm glad the owners, the team, have thought about that, so thank you.

Mr. Hale: Thank you.

Mr. Okimoto: Actually, that's all I had. Thank you.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you so much, Darren. And Mandy?

Ms. Saito: I don't really have any comments other than that this is a really well done presentation again. And I like the finishes and the upgrades in the path lighting that they did. It gives a really warm feel and still providing some safety in those dark areas. But that's all I have.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you, Mandy. Darren Unemori?

Mr. Unemori: I also thought it was . . . (inaudible) . . . presentation. I don't have any specific comments that have already been given. Most of them have already been answered, so no further questions for me.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Thank you, Darren. And Paul?

Mr. Areus: Hey. Yeah, so again, I'm really excited to see about -- to see the improvements that they're going to be making to the Ritz Carlton. My wife actually used to work there for many years and I've spent a lot of time in Kapalua. It's a really special place.

I do have a couple pieces of feedback for you guys to consider. I like -- also like the PV parking quite a bit. And I think the idea of using the metal material that, you know, is painted to look like wood is a really good idea. And it might be worth considering extending that to other exterior wood elements because the climate there is really wet and windy. So wood could potentially weather poorly in that area.

Mr. Hale: I think in general -- in general, we have -- we're predominantly using aluminum that looks like wood. There's a special process that's being done to make it. It's pretty amazing what it looks like, actually. So we've, yeah, we've already thought of that for the longevity of . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Areus: Great. Definitely a good thing to consider. And then looking at the presentation, which was really nicely presented and the, the drawings are beautiful to look at as well. I really like the new pool area that you created, particularly the proposed slide pool. And kind of having a larger pool seems like a really good idea, too, because there's a lot of kind of smaller pools at the Ritz Carlton.

One comment I might add is that it is, again, it's breezy there. So that little pool may, maybe less used on those really breezy days because it's kind of pushed out away from the, the building a bit more as you get closer to the ocean. That's something to consider.

The -- on that Punana 'Ike building -- so that was page 48. Was it 48? Page 49 of the presentation. So these look like really good improvements to the building. One thing, one thing that I noticed with the trellis is that it's, it's kind of raised above the building. And a lot of times when trellises raised above, it looks like an add on. And if it was, it should just be brought down a little bit, you know, be independent structurally, but look like it's tied together a bit more. You know, it could look like something that was there originally. That's a suggestion. And it sounds like he'll be also using the, the metal trellis, metal wood trellis for that.

Mr. Hale: Yes. Yes.

Mr. Iopa: I think it's, you know, that is more residential scale building, so kind of trying to maintain kind of head height. But we'll definitely take your comment and look for the right transition from the trellis to the eaves line.

Mr. Areus: And then the final thing I just wanted to look at is the Huina Experience. So that was page 48 of the presentation. I really like the native Hawaiian structures that you're starting to incorporate into, into this area. I think that's really special and it's going to be a really special experience for the visitors and maybe even some of the community members that are practitioners, native Hawaiian practitioners.

The existing sports courts or tennis courts, and I've been in that area before. They used to do Easter egg hunts there that the community was invited to. And when you walk behind the sports courts to the areas, Q and H, it looks like there's like trellises -- terraces being added in the flat area. And then also the Hale . . . (inaudible) . . . And the last time I visited there, there was like a food garden, and it was like an edible food garden. And there was a lot of work that had been put into creating, I guess, a culinary experience where guests could even be able to harvest some of the food and then prepare it. It is a pretty special place back there. It looks like you are also creating a special place that's replacing that special place. But that's just something that I would note is that, you know, I haven't been there in a number of years and might be in disrepair at this point. It might not actually be that that food garden that was there before. But that was that was really nice. And I guess would be my hope that if it is still in use, that that the people that have been maintaining that it looked like there might have been some community maintenance of that space, that they would be consulted about that.

Mr. Hale: Yeah. So if I can, I can answer on that one. Really what we're doing is accentuating that space. So it is still intended to be that same garden. We're actually trying to make it a more of a destination for people to go. And we're trying to create a space so that you could have an event there, so you could have a nice pre-wedding reception or something like that, or a meet and greet or something like that where people can enjoy it when they find that place. So the stone walls and some things like that, to bring a more traditional feel to it. But the intent is still to have the native plants and the food garden. So it's just making it better than it is now, to be honest.

Mr. Areus: Oh, great. Thank you. Thanks for explaining that. It's, it's a beautiful plan that you guys are creating to improve the Ritz Carlton. Thanks for your . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Hale: Thank you.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Thank you so much, Paul. And then Morgan, please.

Mr. Gerdel: Oh, yes, I want to say thanks for putting together such a detailed presentation and made it easy to follow with so many projects, including the renovation. And yeah, I don't have any other questions or comments, but thank you for providing so much detail.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you, Morgan. I agree. It was a superb presentation and I'm really excited to see the focus on the Hawaiian culture and developing this sense of place. As an educator in the schools, we're trying to develop the sense of place and through not . . . (inaudible) . . . with the Hawaiian children. So honoring our host culture is, is very exciting. I hope -- my question is, do you have a partnership with schools so that kids can come and see this amazing stuff?

Mr. Nae'ole: Do you want me to answer that? Presently, we don't have partnerships with schools. However, our partnership is with Pu'u Kukui Watershed and with Hui Wa'a Kaunoa to represent mauka makai. Any time, and I mean any time the schools would like to participate, to learn, to share what we have in store for them, or what they have in store for us, they are welcome. This is not something that is bound for guests only. This is a community sharing project, so please feel -- you can rest assure that this will be a sharing experience for all, for everybody to learn as long as you want to go to a special place, as you all know. So I can promise you that that will be acceptable, and it will be accessible to all schools, halau, practitioners, artists, etcetera.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Yes, the buildings look so beautiful. I you know, I hope that the children would be able to appreciate the construction and the thought that went into that, and the historical significance as well. So thank you so much for that. That is really awesome. Wonderful presentation. Thank you so much. So then if Tara can go ahead and review the, the recommendations that you noted.

Ms. Furukawa: Okay. So overall, overall you guys like the project. You like the use of wood, or and wood type elements, and the design detail that extended out to the PV area. You like the finishes and the path lighting. It provided a warm feel. One of the suggestions was to use more of the wood type materials rather than real wood for material longevity. You just wanted to comment that the lowest, the lower pool may be less used when it's windy, so maybe consider maybe alterations to that.

For Punana 'Ike -- the Punana 'Ike building, to lower the trellis so that it aligns with, with the roof. For Huina Experience, you like the use -- the different structures being built because it provides a special experience for visitors. And then the sports court area, you like the food gardens; you wanted to maintain that. And then -- yeah, just that you're excited to see the development of the sense of place to honor the host culture. That's all I have.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Great. Thank you, Tara. So if, if we're all in accord, then if I could have a motion to --

Ms. Furukawa: Wait, sorry.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: More? Okay.

Ms. Furukawa: I was going through and then because some of them were a little bit similar. Okay, so reach out to the cultural practitioners and local artisans for the use of the wood, repurposing the wood, and also possibly replanting of the trees to be removed from the parking lot area. And I think that's it.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: All right. Thank you, Tara. So again, if I could have emotion to forward the comments as read.

Mr. Marlowe: So moved.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you, Stuart. And a second?

Ms. Kimmey: This is Marie. I will second the motion.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you very much. And we'll do our round robin. So I guess we'll start with Marie.

Ms. Kimmey: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank you. Stuart?

Mr. Marlowe: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Darren Okimoto?

Mr. Okimoto: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Mandy?

Ms. Saito: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Darren Unemori?

Mr. Unemori: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Paul?

Mr. Areus: In favor.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: And Morgan?

Mr. Gerdel: In favor.

**It was moved by Mr. Stuart Marlowe, seconded by Ms. Marie Kimmey, then unanimously**

**VOTED: To forward the recommendations as discussed.**  
(Assenting: *P. Areus, M. Gerdel, M. Kimmey, S. Marlowe, D. Okimoto, M. Saito, D. Unemori*)  
(Excused: *J. Circle-Woodburn, P. Niess*)

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel All right. So it's unanimous. Thank you so much for the wonderful presentation, and we really look forward. I wish you the best of luck with your project, your renovation, and look forward to going and visiting this wonderful site one day. I used to fly into Kapalua a lot myself when I was working with the schools and have been there for a while. So I'll have to make an excuse to go. Thank you.

Mr. Hale: Thank you. We hope to see you there.

Ms. Rivera: Thank you so much.

Mr. Iopa: Thank you very much.

Mr. Marlowe: Caryl? Excuse me, Caryl?

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Yes Stuart.

Mr. Marlowe: Yes, I have a question for Rob. Do you know who the fabricator is for the aluminum wood like element?

Mr. Hale: Yes, that's the P1 Group that will be doing most of that, at least the ones that we've, we've contracted so for.

Mr. Marlowe: Are they --

Mr. Hale: If you look at Frank Gehry. I'm sorry?

Mr. Marlowe: Are they located here in Hawaii?

Mr. Hale: No, they're in there in Kansas City. If you, if you know, if you're familiar with the Frank Gehry buildings, the crazy metal buildings that that he does.

Mr. Marlowe: Yes.

Mr. Hale: They are the -- the person who did most of that work is the lead so they're very qualified and do wonderful work.

Mr. Marlowe: Alright. Thank you.

Mr. Hale: We spent a lot of time figuring out how to hide sprinkler heads and things like that inside of these things to make it look right.

**3. March 22, 2021 memorandum from the MAUI COUNTY CHARTER COMMISSION requesting submittal of proposed Charter Amendments and/or Recommendations from Maui County Boards and Commissions.**

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: So wonderful. Thank you. So we're onto our, our third item. I presume you folks want to press on because we -- this hopefully won't take a great deal of time because I noticed that reading --. Anyway, let me read the, the item into the record.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: So we're on to our third item. I presume you folks want to press on because we hopefully won't take a great deal of time. Because I noticed that reading --. Anyway, let me read the item into the record. There was a memorandum, dated March 22, 2021, from the Maui County Charter Commission, requesting a submittal of proposed charter amendments and, or recommendations from the Maui County Boards and Commissions of which we are one, under Chapter 8 of the Department of Planning.

So I presume there is no public testimony on this item. So if there are any questions or discussions by the Board, perhaps if you would just unmute your microphone and go ahead and make the recommendations. I noticed that there were no amendments in 2021, so the Charter is identical as to that from the previous year. So this is something I'm new too, so Keola will guide us no doubt on the proper procedure.

Mr. Keola Whittaker: I can add some context. I'm also advising the Charter Commission. And this is your chance to give comments to them to changes before the Charter. And there were some amendments so it was changed. In 2021, there were several changes that we voted on in the November elections. And so the Charter Commission is just getting started with their process. And you can submit your recommendation in a couple of way. If you would like to submit it as a Board, then that's something that you should vote on collectively. And so you may want to start off with suggestions today and then have something written for the next meeting if anybody would like to submit recommendation as a Board. You can also submit it as individuals. The Charter Commission is meeting about every two weeks in the evenings on Thursday nights from about 6:00 p.m. to 10:00 p.m. And they're taking public testimony at each of those meetings. And although they can't travel from geographic to geographic districts, they are attempting to reach out to each region for the meetings, and

will be doing that, again, at the end of their process. They have one year to complete their work, so they need to be done by February of next year. And so they'll be – they're just starting now and will be continuing that process. But I'm here to answer any of your questions about what that means for you, and how to submit your, your recommended changes.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Thank Keola. So over to members of the, of the Board for comments. Darren Unemori?

Mr. Unemori: I'd like to offer two suggested amendments through the UDRB. Section 8-8.4 Planning Commissions. Planning Commission, allow for alternate members. Section 8 point – 8-8.7 Board of Variances and Appeals, allow for alternate members. That's the end of my suggestion.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: I'm sorry. Again, I'm not --. My copy didn't have anything that I received in the mail didn't have any amendments on it so --

Mr. Unemori: No, no, no. I was offering that suggestion for amendments. And because the Planning Commission and BVA do not have alternate members, occasionally they have trouble meeting quorum. So, that function has proven very useful or that the alternates have proven very useful on UDRB. So my suggestion would be include the, the – include alternate members for both Planning Commission and BVA. . . . (inaudible) . . . worded in Section . . . (inaudible) . . . the comments were specifically for Section 8 -- Chapter 8.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: So if I got this right, to allow for alternate members to serve on the UDRB in order to facilitate meeting quorum.

Mr. Unemori: No, no. For the Charter, my suggestion is to allow for alternate members on the Maui Planning Commission as well as the -- as well as the Board of Variances.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: So to allow for the alternate members --

Mr. Unemori: So I'm not recommending --

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: I'm sorry.

Mr. Unemori: So I'm not recommending changes to the UDRB. These are suggestions for the, the two other commissions based on UDRB's example with having alternates.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzel: Okay, I got it. Now I understand what you're saying. Okay, sorry, it took me a while to get there, but I've got it now. So for the Molokai Planning Commission -- I mean, sorry -- the Maui Planning Commission and which other Commission?

Mr. Unemori: The Board of Variances, which is also in Section 8.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Board of Variances?

Mr. Unemori: Yes.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Okay. Very good. All right. Excellent. Okay, so that's one comment or recommendation. And I do agree that the alternate members really do help us to move forward and meet quorum. We've never had to abandon a meeting because we didn't have a quorum, so this is awesome. Plus our members have been totally awesome during this last year. The attendance has been, I think, pretty much nearly 100 percent, so kudos to you folks for, for all the time that you spent. Does anybody else have a recommendation...or comment?

Okay, so I'm not quite sure Keola what to do next in terms of closing out this. You heard the recommendation. I think there was only one unless other folks who, you know, want to add something now.

Mr. Whittaker: So what we can do is we can draft a letter that will come from you Caryl, and present it at the next meeting with the recommendation written out. And then if Darren likes the wording and everyone votes in favor of it, then that can be the recommendation of the Board.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Thank you. So that we would look at that at the next meeting of the Urban Design Review Board?

Mr. Whittaker: Yes. I believe the Charter Commission has given you until the end of May so that gives us sufficient time to write it out and have everyone look at it and then we can have the Board vote on that at the next meeting.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Wonderful. Thank you Keola. That's really helpful.

Mr. Whittaker: No problem.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: All right. So I know it's been a very long meeting. Thank you folks for your attention. Interesting projects. Really exciting things going on. So I'd like to turn it over to Mr. Yoshida for the Director's Report.

***The Board discussed and provided their recommendations. Department will draft a letter on behalf of the Board and the Board will take action on the written response at their next scheduled meeting.***

#### **D. DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

**1. Agenda items for the May 4, 2021 meeting.**

Mr. Yoshida: Thank you, Madam Chair, and congratulations again on your re-election as the Chair.

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Thank you, Marie and the rest of you for putting up with me.

Mr. Yoshida: Yeah, and also to Peter as the Vice-Chair. The next meeting is scheduled for May 4<sup>th</sup>. We don't have any definite items aside from this Charter Commission -- the recommendations to the Charter Commission due on May 28<sup>th</sup>. So we have that. But there are items that may pop up between now and May 4<sup>th</sup> that may go to the Board besides recommendations regarding the amendments to the Maui County Charter. Again, we want to thank the board members for their diligence today. It was a longer than normal meeting. Somehow that's the way it is, so thank you very much on behalf of the department.

**E. NEXT MEETING DATE: May 4, 2021**

**F. ADJOURNMENT**

Ms. Hitchcock-Sprinzl: Yes, thank you, everyone. So with that, then the meeting is adjourned, and we'll see you next time. Aloha.

There being no further discussion brought forward to the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 12:34 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by,

LEILANI A. RAMORAN-QUEMADO  
Secretary to Boards and Commissions II

**RECORD OF ATTENDANCE**

**PRESENT:**

Paul Areus (alternate)  
Morgan Gerdel (alternate)  
Caryl Hitchcock-Sprinzl, Chair  
Marie Kimmey  
Stuart Marlowe  
Peter Niess, Vice-Chair (excused at approximately 11:40 a.m.)

Urban Design Review Board  
Minutes -- April 6, 2021  
Page 50

Darren Okimoto  
Mandy Saito  
Darren Unemori

**EXCUSED:**

Joshua Circle-Woodburn

**OTHERS:**

Clayton Yoshida, Planning Program Administrator, Current Planning Division  
Tara Furukawa, Staff Planner  
Keola Whittaker, Deputy Corporation Counsel