

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

FIRE AND PUBLIC SAFETY COMMISSION

COUNTY OF MAUI

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

REGULAR MEETING

Held via BlueJeans, commencing at 10:03 a.m., on
December 16, 2021.

REPORTED BY: SANDRA J. GRAN, RPR/CSR #424

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ATTENDANCE

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

- Kyle Ginoza, Chair
- Gregg Lundberg, Member
- Dwight Burns, Member
- Donna Sterling, Member
- Makalapua Kanuha, Member

STAFF:

- Bradford Ventura, Fire Chief
- Gavin Fujioka, Deputy Fire Chief
- Michael Werner, Assistant Fire Chief
- Hanalei Lindo, Assistant Fire Chief
- George Dagan, Fire Captain
- Daniel Kunkel, Deputy Corporation Counsel
- Richelle Wakamatsu, Commission Secretary
- Herman Andaya, Maui Emergency Management Agency

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

(December 16, 2021, 10:03 a.m.)

* * *

CHAIR GINOZA: Good morning. Today is Thursday, December 16, 2021, and this is the Maui Fire and Public Safety Commission. My name is Kyle Ginoza, I'm the chair of the commission, and I'd like to call the meeting to order at 10:03. I'd like to start with roll call of commission members.

Lisa Vares, vice chair, is excused.

Gregg Lundberg.

COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Present.

CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Gregg.

Dwight Burns.

COMMISSIONER BURNS: Here.

CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Dwight.

Donna Sterling.

COMMISSIONER STERLING: Here, Chair.

CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Donna.

Punahеле Alcon, I believe, may join us later.

Max Kincaid Jr., I think he may join us later as well.

Dylan Andrion is unavailable.

And Makalapua Kanuha.

COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Present, Chair.

CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Makalapua.

1 So we have five members currently.

2 I'd like to start off with the approval of the
3 minutes from the last meeting from November 18th. I believe
4 everybody should have gotten the minutes in their packets and
5 have had a chance to review them. Does anybody have any
6 corrections?

7 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: I make a motion to --

8 CHAIR GINOZA: Can we have a motion to -- thank you,
9 Gregg.

10 COMMISSIONER BURNS: I'll second.

11 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you. So motion by Gregg,
12 second by Dwight. Could all in favor -- this is hard to see,
13 so, Gregg, approve or no?

14 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Approve.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Dwight.

16 COMMISSIONER BURNS: Approve.

17 CHAIR GINOZA: Donna.

18 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Approve, Chair.

19 CHAIR GINOZA: Makalapua.

20 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Approve, Chair.

21 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. And I approve.

22 So unanimously approve the minutes from the last
23 meeting.

24 Richelle, do we have anybody who's wishing to
25 testify from the public?

1 MS. WAKAMATSU: Not on my end.

2 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. Seeing nobody there, I don't
3 see anybody logged in, but is there anybody wishing to testify
4 from the public?

5 (No response.)

6 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none -- what I
7 forgot to do was recognize -- I'm sorry. Oh, okay. I forgot
8 to recognize the other people in attendance. So we do have
9 Herman Andaya from MEMA.

10 And, Chief Ventura, could you recognize who's in the
11 room with you?

12 CHIEF VENTURA: Sure. Good morning, everybody. I
13 have Deputy Chief Fujioka with us, Assistant Chiefs Werner and
14 Lindo in the back, and Captain Dagan to do the presentation
15 when we get there.

16 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. Excellent.

17 So I'd like to move over to Maui Emergency
18 Management Agency, MEMA. Herman, you have the floor.

19 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Mr. Chair, Members. Oh,
20 sorry.

21 CHAIR GINOZA: Good morning.

22 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Good morning. It's been a
23 pretty busy month for us, so the first thing I wanted to bring
24 up is the TTX that we had, active shooter TTX, and we had this
25 with -- in conjunction with the DOE. We had about a hundred

1 or so principals and vice principals of various DOE schools at
2 this TTX, and it was -- it was very -- I thought it was -- it
3 went very well. It got people thinking about their plans in
4 the event of an active shooter. And, you know,
5 coincidentally, this occurred the day of the Oxford, Michigan,
6 school shooting, so -- so it was very -- it was very timely.
7 I want to thank the fire department for being there. We had a
8 number of first responders that were there, and the fire
9 department sent some of their personnel as well, so it was
10 good to have their perspective and their expertise there as
11 well, so I want to -- I want to thank them for that.

12 And then the next thing that occurred is the
13 flooding. And our EOC was activated, and, again, we had the
14 fire department there, so I want to thank them for being in
15 the EOC as well as a number of our first responders. Right
16 now, we are collecting information for -- for a damage
17 assessment, and we're hoping to apply for FEMA assistance. So
18 you probably heard on the news and everything, we're asking
19 the public to call in or fill out a form online -- it's at
20 mauicounty.gov/emergency -- and to report in damages. And so
21 we're hoping to go -- to get individual assistance from FEMA
22 and then also public assistance. Public assistance is
23 infrastructure, damages to infrastructure, and so that we're
24 pretty confident that we will be getting, but with respect to
25 individual assistance, we're still trying to collect more

1 data. And once we get that, then it goes through FEMA; FEMA
2 then decides whether or not this was a big enough disaster to
3 warrant a president's declaration. Once they do that, then it
4 goes to the president, and then he will then decide, decide
5 whether he wants to declare this a disaster. So,
6 interestingly, this will be the second presidential declared
7 disaster if it's -- if he signs it, so that's two in one year,
8 plus the ongoing COVID, so all together, three in one year.

9 So, anyway, that's -- that's all I have, Mr. Chair,
10 unless there's any questions from the commissioners.

11 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Herman.

12 Does any commissioner have any questions?

13 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Mr. Chair, I've got a quick
14 question.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Go ahead, Gregg.

16 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Yeah. Herman, were you
17 happy overall with the response of the county and all the
18 departments? Was there learnings where you compared notes on
19 what worked and what didn't work and -- and this was a pretty
20 severe storm that nobody was really prepared for, just curious
21 what your take was on the county's reaction and -- and
22 whatnot.

23 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Gregg, thank you for --
24 Commissioner Lindberg -- Lundberg, rather, thank you very much
25 for that question. Overall, you know, when we activated the

1 EOC, we did have many of our partners, you know, come to the
2 EOC or participate virtually. The challenge for us is, of
3 course, this COVID world. And, you know, typically, as you
4 know, our EOC is usually filled with people, usually, it's 60
5 to 80 in a thousand-square-foot room. But because of COVID,
6 we could not fill the room up, you know, with that many
7 people, so we tried doing things virtually and that -- that
8 proved to be a challenge, so that was -- that was -- that kind
9 of hampered our ability. But with respect to response, I
10 mean, we're -- we're very blessed, I believe, on Maui that we
11 have partners and, you know, these partners include state,
12 federal, nongovernment organizations, and they all came
13 together. We all came together and, you know, they got -- you
14 know the phrase where it takes a village, it really does in
15 the emergency world as well. It takes everybody coming
16 together and helping out.

17 And the public works department, I have to say, they
18 did an outstanding job trying to clear our roads. People were
19 putting debris out into the roadway, and they were picking --
20 picking it up. They were trying to open roads as quickly as
21 possible and, really, you know, our unsung heroes. I mean,
22 people don't really see that, people don't understand that
23 unless -- unless their road is closed, then -- then it becomes
24 an issue, but they don't know that -- all the work that goes
25 -- that goes on behind the scenes.

1 The same can be said with the water department, you
2 know. Where the water -- water breaks occurred, it was in
3 remote areas that typically you would helicopter in equipment;
4 you would helicopter in these heavy pipes, which they couldn't
5 do that night because of the high winds. And so what these
6 workers, department -- water department workers did was they
7 hand-carried these pipes into the remote areas, you know,
8 that's the kind of dedicated employees we have in the county.

9 And, you know -- and the stories go on and on.
10 There's a lot of people who really stepped up to the plate and
11 did the best they could to help our community. Right now, I'm
12 working with one of the community organizations here, Team
13 Rubicon I'm not sure if you've heard about these, you know,
14 but they help with debris removal, they help out with cleaning
15 up homes, mud, you know, mud in the homes and everything. And
16 so they're bringing in a team of people from the mainland here
17 to assist with that, to assist the community. And, of course,
18 you know, there's other organizations out there -- American
19 Red Cross, Salvation Army, VOAD. So, anyway, I don't mean to
20 -- I mean, but there's a lot to tell, you know, and we're very
21 fortunate here in Maui County that we have a lot of partners
22 involved.

23 So thank you very much, Commissioner Lundberg, for
24 that -- that question.

25 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Yeah. And, Herman, on

1 behalf of myself and my family, thank you. I lived in Kula, I
2 live in Kula, in one of the hardest hit, and we were -- my
3 wife was trying to get home on the night of the storm, and the
4 police had all the roads blocked. And, you know, it's
5 frustrating, you know, get all the way home, and you can't go
6 home. Come to find out in the morning, half of our road, half
7 of Route 377, Kula Highway, was gone; it was a sheer cliff.
8 So, yeah, they -- the county works people did a heroic job, so
9 I just wanted to say thank you.

10 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Thank you, Commissioner.

11 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Gregg. Thank you, Herman.

12 Does any other commissioner have any questions?

13 (No response.)

14 CHAIR GINOZA: I was thinking, Herman, perhaps at a
15 future meeting you could kind of go over the different
16 organizations that get involved in more detail so that people
17 kind of understand the resources that become available. Like
18 fortunately for Gregg, he's well versed in what happens, but
19 perhaps you could kind of -- we can talk about it later, but
20 like explain more about Team Rubicon others. So maybe we'll
21 have a discussion after this that maybe you can present
22 something like that.

23 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Oh, I would -- I would love
24 that. Thank you, Mr. Chair. Yes.

25 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. Thank you.

1 Seeing no other questions for Herman, thank you very
2 much, Herman.

3 And before I move on to the fire department, I
4 forgot to recognize our new corporation counsel, who is
5 replacing Gary Murai, who is retiring at the end of the year.
6 So we have Dan Kunkel and welcome, Dan, to the commission and
7 thank you for helping us out.

8 MR. KUNKEL: Thank you. Aloha, I can -- I hope I
9 can be of help and serve you.

10 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, great. Thank you.

11 So let's move on to the fire department. Chief
12 Ventura.

13 CHIEF VENTURA: Aloha and good morning, everybody.
14 So looking at the agenda, the first item that I have today
15 here -- and I know we're under a time constraint, so I won't
16 talk about my own briefing, but I did want to cover a few
17 things. The first item is the Kahuola and Kahu`aina Awards.
18 These awards are given by the commission. These awards are
19 also located on our county website, and so if you did want to
20 see the definitions of these awards, I would advise you to go
21 look there. It also will show you past recipients of the
22 awards. And what had happened is back in about 2012 or so,
23 2010, the -- the commission was active wanting to, you know,
24 reward the community for doing things outside of the norm.
25 And so we do have one request that I'm gonna present to you

1 next month, but before we get there, I want to kind of --
2 sorry, I'm gonna give you guys some homework to go review what
3 these -- what these awards are about. That way, next month,
4 when I present to you the actual nomination, which is a
5 medical case out in Napili, you can decide as a group if this
6 person shall be given this award.

7 So just to give you a little personal background on
8 this award, we feel, as an administration, that firefighters
9 who are on duty are doing their job, anybody else who's, you
10 know, involved in the emergency incident and is working for
11 the county at that time is doing their job. This award is not
12 for them, but if it was an off-duty firefighter or if it was
13 somebody of the public who had heroic efforts to save a life
14 or save land, then we are totally in support of recognizing
15 them as best as we can. So that's just to give you a little
16 bit of background on how we feel about this award and how we
17 should recognize the people in our community that are going
18 above and beyond.

19 So if you have time this month, just take a look at
20 the Maui County website under the commission, fire commission,
21 you'll see the awards, and then it has a little definition.
22 And then next month, we'll go over, actually, the case that is
23 being nominated for the award, and you guys can decide if it
24 warrants a congratulations.

25 Any questions about that agenda item?

1 CHAIR GINOZA: Any commissioner have any questions
2 about the award or the homework assigned to review the history
3 of the award?

4 (Laughter.)

5 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Oh, I love homework.

6 (Laughter.)

7 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: I'm gonna give you folks one
8 homework too, because I'm looking at Kahuola and Kahu`aina, so
9 I see that in Kahu`aina, we have an apostrophe, but it should
10 be one `okina, just FYI.

11 CHIEF VENTURA: Thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Yeah, Maui Popo. Yeah,
13 everybody understands the `okina, yeah. 'Cause I see the
14 apostrophe this way, but it should be the `okina, like the 6
15 flipped. Just FYI, but thank you.

16 CHIEF VENTURA: Mahalo.

17 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Makalapua.

18 Any other questions about the award?

19 (No response.)

20 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. Seeing none, continue, Chief
21 Ventura.

22 CHIEF VENTURA: Okay. So my normal report out to
23 you folks consists of the three attachments that we've given
24 you:

25 It covers our training for the month, which has

1 nearly 2,000 trainings taking place last month. So we're
2 trying to push out, you know, a good pace of training for our
3 department, and with, hopefully, COVID getting behind us, we
4 can increase these numbers as we move into 2022.

5 The monthly update, which we put out right after the
6 commission meeting, just gives everybody kind of a quick
7 glance at what's going on in our department.

8 And then the incident log, which is the one with the
9 yellow on there. We're kind of on pace for about the 12,000
10 or so calls this year, 13,000 by the end of December. We
11 anticipate a little bump in December because of the lift in
12 tourism that we anticipate coming in with the holidays.

13 Moving on to my report you have before you; I'm
14 gonna just highlight a few of the items here. You know, we
15 have lots of meetings and conversations with various people,
16 but the council has approved the purchase of the house in the
17 Pukoo area for our new fire station location. Tomorrow,
18 Friday, is final reading with the council, so I'll be paying
19 attention to that to make sure it goes completely through, but
20 they did ask us all their questions, and we were able to
21 answer them, and they were in support of purchasing the
22 property.

23 And then on the back of my report is that United
24 States Coast Guard search and rescue exercise. You know, our
25 goal is to build relationships with all of these different

1 organizations. If we have relationships built upfront, then
2 when there's an emergency, the operations will go much
3 smoother. So this was a very successful exercise that we did
4 with the Coast Guard. And Commissioner Kincaid is not with us
5 today, but he had mentioned a few meetings ago about an
6 incident that happened with the Coast Guard and a boat that
7 sank, and so we just wanted to, you know, make sure he is
8 aware as well that, you know, we're trying to always work with
9 them to better our operations with them so that we have a good
10 working relationship.

11 There are a few other things on here that are gonna
12 come up. I'm kind of gonna ask for a go-back here. I
13 actually thank Chief Werner. Just to bring everybody's
14 attention to it, this is his last meeting as he is retiring at
15 the end of December. So we told him he couldn't retire until
16 he got the mobile data terminals put on all of the fire
17 trucks, and so he got that done, so I've gotta let him go, I
18 have to stick to my word. So that project has been literally
19 a ten-year project that he was able to diligently work every
20 single day nearly on it for the last year with IT, with our
21 department, with contractors and vendors to get that done.
22 And so, just as of three weeks ago, we got the computers on
23 all of our trucks, so kudos to him and the team he worked
24 with. And he'll be leaving us in December, the end of
25 December, and we will miss him.

1 Thank you.

2 CHIEF WERNER: Thank you.

3 CHIEF VENTURA: So unless there's other questions, I
4 know we're on a little time constraint today; I want to cede
5 the floor to any questions from the commissioners.

6 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. Any questions from
7 commissioners for Chief Ventura's report?

8 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Chief, I just have one.

9 CHAIR GINOZA: Commissioner Makalapua.

10 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Oh, Chair, thank you.

11 Chief, I'm looking at the incident in fire loss for
12 the calendar of 2021. Do you have any data on districts?
13 'Cause I know that we had, like, building fires or trash
14 fires, do you have any data on where was the fires, what was
15 the locations, or where was the locations?

16 CHIEF VENTURA: Yeah. So we can -- this report that
17 we ran on our MAPPS, which is our record management system, is
18 done broadly across the county. We can break it down for you
19 per district if you want us to do it. Would you like us to do
20 one for the year since we're coming up on December?

21 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: You know, that would be so
22 helpful. Appreciate that.

23 CHIEF VENTURA: Yeah. We'll provide that report in
24 our next commission meeting. We'll do it based on district,
25 we'll do volume of calls and loss of property estimate.

1 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Thank you. You are so
2 awesome.

3 CHAIR GINOZA: Great. Any other questions from
4 commissioners?

5 (No response.)

6 CHAIR GINOZA: I have a question. Where do we stand
7 on the next fiscal year's budget? Did you have meetings with
8 the mayor or did it get approved?

9 CHIEF VENTURA: So -- thanks, Chair. So the
10 meetings with the mayor are anticipated to start this month.
11 He has not called us for a specific budget meeting yet, and so
12 -- but we did have a meeting with him about a week and a half
13 ago, and we did try to sneak our budget in the conversation so
14 that he's aware of all of our projects, but to have a more
15 formal budget discussion meeting with him and the budget
16 director has not been scheduled yet. We're waiting on their
17 office.

18 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, great. Thank you.

19 If there are no questions, Chief Fujioka.

20 DEPUTY CHIEF FUJIOKA: Good morning, Commissioners.
21 I'll just go over my report for this month. Department
22 Interviews and Promotions: So, at the last meeting, we talked
23 about our captain test and assessments. This was completed on
24 the 19th of November. It was a successful long day. The next
25 thing will be congratulations to Chief Hanalei Lindo, our

1 operations chief, who was promoted effective 12/6 of this
2 month. Also, with our retirees and promotions, we have
3 battalion chief vacancies which were posted, and we are
4 scheduled for interviews next week Monday for three vacant
5 battalion chief positions. Captain interviews, I know on the
6 notes here, was tentatively scheduled for December 13th
7 through the 16th. Unfortunately, we are waiting on department
8 of personnel services, so we are looking at probably sometime
9 in January now for the captain interviews.

10 Let's see. Department Improvement Committees: We
11 had a SOG sent out to our members regarding how to write a
12 to/from, and we're currently working on a SOG for American
13 flag guidelines just so we can standardize what -- how we put
14 up the flag and just a standard guideline for department
15 members.

16 Mental Behavior and Psychological Health: We
17 brought on board Dr. Alicia Rodrigues to provide support for
18 our members with anything to do with mental, behavioral, and
19 psychological health, so she -- we scheduled a meet and greet
20 for all of our members just this past week.

21 Union Interactions: We did have a couple of union
22 interactions with our HFFA regarding voluntary unpaid basis
23 for training, if we should pay our members for training that
24 is on a voluntary basis or not considered requirements at
25 their job position. And we also consulted with them for

1 paying members to travel for promotional exams, so the
2 personnel from Molokai and Lanai. And then, with our HGEA,
3 our rescue watercraft MOU was implemented on 12/1.

4 And the Transmittals From the Public: We did have
5 an email that was sent, a letter that was sent from the
6 Launiupoko Firewise Committee and Mahanalua Nui HOA Fire
7 Prevention Committee. So our fire prevention bureau and our
8 Lahaina station personnel worked with this community here to
9 basically check out their neighborhood, check the surrounding
10 area as far as the brush and what they could do to make their
11 community a Firewise community and just help prevent the brush
12 fires from impacting their subdivision. And I believe you
13 guys have the letter that's submitted with that, and I believe
14 Chief Ventura wants to expand on that a little bit.

15 CHIEF VENTURA: So one of the things that we
16 discussed was, you know, making sure we reach out to various
17 districts, and so -- especially our rural areas that are
18 wildfire-prone. And so we reached out to the Launiupoko area,
19 we sent prevention out there, we sent operations out there,
20 and we worked with Hawaii Wildfire Management Organization to
21 basically create a model that the rest of the state is going
22 to follow. So it was such a success, this meeting and this --
23 you see the letter and appreciation from the community, that
24 the other prevention bureaus in the state are looking at our
25 model to try to help with wildfire mitigation in their

1 counties, so that was very promising. So kudos to all of our
2 guys who were involved in that. And since we've completed the
3 Launiupoko one, we've also started one on the lower slopes of
4 Haleakala here in the Pulehu area, which can be dry, prone to
5 drought and stuff, and there's neighborhoods in that area as
6 well, so we started conversations with them to do similar
7 things. So just trying to get out there and meet with the
8 community and meet their worries and needs.

9 DEPUTY CHIEF FUJIOKA: That's all I have for you
10 guys. You guys got any questions, I'll be happy to try to
11 answer them.

12 CHAIR GINOZA: Great. That's excellent.

13 Does any commissioner have any questions?

14 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Chair, I've got a question.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Yes, Gregg. Go ahead.

16 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: And I don't know, Chief, if
17 it's for you or who, but are the retirements outpacing the new
18 additions to the team? Are you losing ground or making
19 ground? I know staffing is so important to you and to our
20 community, I'm just curious how that's going.

21 DEPUTY CHIEF FUJIOKA: Thanks, Chair. Thank you.

22 We will always have manpower issues towards the end
23 of the year as our retirees build up on us. What we try to do
24 is if we can get commitment from retirees next year, then we
25 can put those vacant -- we can fill those vacancies in our

1 recruit class. So we're not falling behind at this point in
2 the race, but right now in the year is gonna be when we're
3 hardest hit. November, we had six or seven retirements, and
4 in December, we have eight or nine retirements coming up. So
5 that is a big depletion when you're looking at, if you count
6 ocean safety, 400 employees and you count, you know, just the
7 fire side, 300. And so those are pretty healthy numbers that
8 we do struggle with at the end of the year, but our recruit
9 class graduates January 7th, so we'll get 15 people come right
10 in.

11 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Great. Thank you for the
12 update, Chief.

13 CHAIR GINOZA: Great. Thank you.

14 Any other questions from commissioners?

15 (No response.)

16 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, let's move
17 over to Chief Lindo. Congratulations.

18 ASSISTANT CHIEF LINDO: Thank you, Chair.

19 Good morning, Commissioners. Basically, you guys
20 have my report in front of you guys discussing the operational
21 side of things and -- and you can look at it. And it may seem
22 technical and, basically, from -- I'm new to the position, so
23 a lot of what I do is basically taking the continuity of
24 operations, making sure that our response package and the
25 training all lines up with the vision and the strategic vision

1 of the chief and looking that it's fiscally sound, yeah, that
2 the finances that we're using, everything is lining up. And
3 that's why we have these guidelines and -- and standard
4 operating guidelines and putting them all together. So I see
5 myself -- and you guys see what's happening with the chiefs
6 and with the manpower, so a lot of what I do to maintain the
7 continuity of operations is to make sure that everything
8 aligns, yeah, so that way with guys going out, we put in the
9 proper personnel in the positions to maintain operational
10 readiness for our trucks, for our stations, for our personnel,
11 delivering the right type of training from the recruit all the
12 way up to the incumbent personnel. And then taking into
13 account not only our fire department but ocean safety as well.

14 So this is pretty much the overview, so I'd just
15 like to hit the main things that we are doing. Of course, you
16 see the major incidents that we had. Not very many in the
17 month of November. The big thing is Engine 2 that is being
18 completed early 2022 to help out our operational apparatus and
19 then the mobile data computer stuff that Chief Werner is
20 working on getting our personnel trained and those computers
21 operating the way it should for personnel online.

22 And then two big things on the ocean safety, yeah,
23 opening up Makena, which probably a lot of our incidents
24 dealing with tourists and people getting hurt and injured,
25 that was a huge thing. And then the work in getting on the

1 website Black Rock or Puu Kekaa opened and possibly ready. So
2 those are some of the huge things as we're looking into
3 things, and my job moving forward is to -- is to bridge a lot
4 of those gaps, yeah, so input from you guys and from the
5 community is gonna be used.

6 That's all I have. Thank you. Any questions?

7 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Chief Lindo.

8 Does any commissioner have any questions for Chief
9 Lindo?

10 (No response.)

11 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, let's move
12 on to our short-timer, Chief Werner. Congratulations on your
13 retirement.

14 CHIEF WERNER: Thank you. Thank you very much. I
15 just wanted to quickly thank all of you for all that you guys
16 do. We as a group really appreciate, you know, especially
17 your recent task, which was to select our new fire chief. I
18 know that that was quite, quite an undertaking. And you
19 selected the right person. I don't think anybody will ever
20 know how hard this man works and his vision and the team that
21 he's putting together to make that vision happen. So thanks
22 again for doing that.

23 As far as my report goes, I'll touch briefly because
24 I really want to get to Captain Dagan's presentation that he
25 has for you. Captain Dagan is one of the people that work

1 under me, another very dedicated, hardworking person. Proud
2 to have him heading up the health and safety bureau.

3 But real quick, I'll touch on fire prevention.
4 Chief went over that community risk reduction that happened in
5 Launiupoko, that was a huge success. I got a chance to talk
6 with the captain this morning that he attended a meeting with
7 the Hawaii Wildfire Management Organization and as the chief
8 already touched on, they want to use what they came up with as
9 a model for the entire state, so it was a big success.

10 Our new inspector started there November 1st and has
11 been training, getting up to speed with all of that. Our
12 captain there, Captain Otsubo, he's very systems-oriented, as
13 I touched on before, and he's got a system now in place to
14 really bring these people up to speed where they're able to
15 get out there and do inspections on their own within a pretty
16 short amount of time, so kudos to him.

17 I'll skip over the health and safety report because
18 Captain Dagan is gonna touch on that and just move on to the
19 budget planning and appropriations committee. The FY '22
20 budget, as you know, was submitted, and as the chief touched
21 on, we're waiting to hear back for our chance to meet with the
22 mayor and go over that.

23 The AFG grant, I have it here as being prepared. It
24 was prepared and actually turned in. We requested just under
25 a quarter of a million dollars towards advanced physicals for

1 firefighting, and we're really hopeful that we'll get that.
2 As you guys know, we're exposed to a lot, a large number of
3 our people are exposed to chemicals and different things that
4 cause us to have cancer, so this advanced screening will
5 hopefully catch things early on and give those guys a better
6 chance of survival.

7 As far as our FY '22 budget, we're on track with all
8 of our procurements in both the B and C accounts.

9 Yeah, that's it. So if you have any questions, I'm
10 happy to answer them.

11 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Chief Werner.

12 Any questions from commissioners?

13 (No response.)

14 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, thank you.

15 And we'll -- I don't know if, Chief Ventura or you
16 would like to introduce Captain George Dagan, but please
17 either of you, feel free.

18 CHIEF VENTURA: All right. So our presentation
19 today is with Captain George Dagan. He is currently the lead
20 in our health and safety bureau. And when we discuss our
21 health and safety bureau, you'll see in his PowerPoint how
22 vast their responsibility is to serve our nearly 400 employees
23 and how many responsibilities they have there, so I don't want
24 to steal any of his thunder.

25 I will share screen here, and I will go to the

1 PowerPoint so you'll be able to see. Everybody see the
2 PowerPoint at this point?

3 CHAIR GINOZA: Yes.

4 CHIEF VENTURA: Then I'll turn it over.

5 CAPTAIN DAGAN: Good morning, Commissioners. I just
6 want to say thank you for giving me the opportunity to come in
7 here and give a little overview of our health and safety
8 bureau here. A lot goes on behind the scenes, and these guys
9 are a big part of it right here and, you know, getting us the
10 ability to do what we need to do to get our, you know, fire
11 department in a better place as far as being healthy and safe
12 out there.

13 So without further ado, I'm just gonna jump into
14 this real quick, and then at the end, if you guys have any
15 questions, let me know. Okay?

16 Okay. So, first off, I just want to give you like
17 an overview of the personnel that are involved. So I'm the
18 captain, I just oversee two firefighter 3s that are beneath
19 me, and they have specialized tasks that each of them
20 concentrate on, but they're familiar with pretty much
21 everything in the bureau, so they can fill in for one another,
22 but they specialize in certain tasks.

23 We have a warehouse tech, and he is super good.
24 Dexter, he takes care of everything in our warehouse, that
25 goes from ordering the stuff, purchasing, filling the orders,

1 stocking, organizing, inventory. So he plays a huge part in
2 this, and he's very, very valuable. We couldn't do it without
3 him.

4 And then we also have an SCBA tech. Currently, that
5 position is vacant. We just interviewed last week, so
6 hopefully, we'll have this filled very soon, but this is also
7 a very important part. We have a lot of compressors that fill
8 our, you know, self-contained breathing apparatus bottles and
9 our packs that go along with that, and then he does a lot as
10 far as our turnouts and our personal protective equipment, and
11 then repairs and maintenance as well. So we're looking
12 forward to getting them into -- another person into that
13 position to help us out.

14 So this next one this just kind of shows you an
15 overview of what our health and safety bureau consists of and
16 how, as I was mentioning before, how each person has
17 specialized tasks. Kind of take a look, I mean, I don't want
18 to -- I know you guys have it in front of you, so instead of
19 me just going down and reading everything that they do, you
20 guys can go ahead and take a look at a lot of these tasks.

21 And then for me, for my job, I just go ahead and,
22 you know, I want to make sure that we're OSHA compliant, I
23 want to make sure that we're trying to adhere to National Fire
24 Protection Association and all the standards that they have.
25 We have research and development, as I mentioned before, the

1 warehouse, and then the risk management and safety committee.
2 You know, we have safety steering meetings with our risk
3 management department as well trying to keep us on track as
4 well as other specialized projects that take place.

5 And moving forward, I'm gonna -- these are some
6 important initiatives that we're focussing on. We have many
7 more than these, but these are just a few just so that I can
8 keep within a timeframe here. But I'll just read down the
9 list here: Infectious disease, implementing safety officer
10 awareness and operations -- I have slides that are gonna go on
11 each one of these, so I'll go into a little bit more detail --
12 fire ground decontamination, medical monitoring and
13 rehabilitation, advanced inspection and cleaning for
14 structural PPE, and then warehouse software implementation.

15 So the first one, you know, for infectious disease,
16 I mean, obviously, COVID is a huge thing. You can see here on
17 the right this picture, I mean, if we're -- if we have a call
18 that is a highly suspected COVID response, then this is what
19 we're gonna be looking like when we go into, you know, if we
20 have a CPR case or something like that. We have created a
21 document in our fire department, a 15-page document. We try
22 and follow the CDC, the WHO guidelines, you know. We have our
23 -- not only do we have a PPE that we're supposed to wear when
24 we respond, but then when we come back to the station, you
25 know, we've gotta disinfect and decontaminate as well, so we

1 don't bring that in. And then also, another huge thing that
2 we have to do at health and safety is making sure that we have
3 enough of this PPE to keep us, you know, allowed to send that
4 out to all of our fire departments because, you know, with all
5 of these different variants coming along and with the shortage
6 in the -- in the supply chain that's been having -- been
7 happening, you know, we need to make sure we've got enough on
8 hand to keep all of our guys safe, so that's a huge part of it
9 as well.

10 So the next thing, initiative, we're trying to get
11 safety officers on a lot of our, you know, structure fires,
12 our brush fires, and a lot of our training incidents. You can
13 see this picture right here kind of as a good depiction
14 because we had a -- all of our firefighters go through an
15 eight-hour awareness class. So the guys in the background
16 over there that you can see, I mean, when you go into these
17 incidents, it's easy to get tunnel vision and, you know,
18 you're trying to get your task done, right, so this awareness
19 class points out all of these dangers so that all of these
20 firefighters are capable. Oh, hey, there's a downed power
21 line or, hey, you know, we've got this other thing going on,
22 hey, Cap, you know, be aware of this, right? So we're
23 implementing that.

24 And then you can see the guy with the yellow vest
25 with the safety officer right there; we want to get an

1 on-scene safety officer because the battalion chief or the
2 captain or the incident commander, they've got so many other
3 tasks with trying to get all of this stuff done that it's hard
4 for them to focus on all of these other things, so you get
5 this other set of eyes. And so that's what we're -- we've got
6 this operations level, and we're trying to instill our
7 drivers' and captains' level so that we can implement this on
8 our emergency calls.

9 So the next one, fire ground decontamination, you
10 can see that picture on the left. You know, this guy's just
11 coated with these combustion products, and all of these have
12 massive carcinogens that are in there. So, you know, the best
13 thing we can do is to get rid of those things on scene and get
14 that away from us so that we're not absorbing it into our
15 skin. It's been proven that, you know, firefighters have
16 higher rates of cancer than other professions, and this is one
17 of the major things. If one of these guys doesn't decon, and
18 then he jumps back into the rig, now all of that stuff's in
19 our truck. The guys come on the next day, they sit in that
20 fire truck, and then they're getting all of this stuff all
21 over them. So we're trying to make this a mandatory thing on
22 scene where they decontaminate. We have buckets on our
23 trucks, they have the brushes on there, the soap, and we even
24 have videos that show exactly how to do this. So this is a
25 big huge initiative that we're trying to do right now.

1 Medical monitoring and rehabilitation, so you can
2 see the picture on the left, it's one of our bigger brush
3 fires. You can see some tables on the side there. We set up
4 these tables; we do medical evaluations, you know, we make
5 sure that their vitals are all good, take their blood
6 pressures and whatnot. We rotate crews in and out so that
7 they come in; they can get a break. This is on brush fires
8 and structure fires. You can see, like, heat exhaustion,
9 heatstroke, heart attack, all that kind of stuff is way more
10 prevalent, so we want to be up and up on that so that we're
11 not getting any firefighters that go down. You can see, you
12 know, we get meals for them. We provide electrolyte drinks,
13 water, things of that nature. So that's another thing, too;
14 when we're on scene, we want to make sure that these guys are
15 doing. It's a mandatory thing, just like the decontamination.

16 So advanced inspection and cleaning of our PPE, you
17 can see up top with these pictures, we have to send our -- our
18 gear in once a year for professional cleaning. We use Hawaii
19 PPE on Oahu, but they go through all tests, they repair the
20 PPE, they advance clean it, and then they send it back to us.
21 And also, you can see down there it says current extractors;
22 right now, we just added 2, 11, and 13. We have everything
23 except 1, 6, 9, and 12, and currently, on order, we're
24 ordering 1 and 6 now. So we've only gotta go for 9 and 12
25 coming up, and then everyone will have an extractor so they'll

1 be able to clean their PPE and to be able to -- if we get
2 calls, be able to throw it right in there and get those
3 contaminants off right away. Also, this administration has
4 pushed to get two sets of turnouts for everybody. Right now,
5 we're working on some loaner cache system so, you know, we've
6 got to lend out turnouts in our cache, but if everyone had
7 their own set, we could easily go to our clean set while we're
8 washing the other one.

9 So moving forward, this warehouse software, we just
10 recently implemented this. It's a software system that tracks
11 our inventory. When we start to get low, it gives us
12 warnings; we can go ahead and put in new orders. We know
13 exactly how many firefighters are ordering what, what
14 stations, how much each station is going through, so it allows
15 us to really streamline our process and allows us to save
16 money. It also allows us to not have to go out into the
17 warehouse every time and count our inventory and go through
18 boxes and stuff like that, so it's another big initiative
19 that's moving forward.

20 So the goals, the overall goal is we're trying to
21 just create and maintain a healthier, safer working
22 environment for all of our firefighters. You know, we try to
23 provide critical programs and services to address all of this
24 stuff. As these guys mentioned before, Dr. Alicia Rodrigues
25 from a mental aspect, bringing that in, and also physical

1 health as well we find, you know, very important trying to
2 implement those. Research and plan for the future for new
3 trends, technology that's gonna help us improve our health and
4 safety. And then just strive to be OSHA compliant and abide
5 by the NFPA standards so that we can better prevent accidents
6 and reduce liability.

7 So if you guys have any questions, feel free.

8 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Captain Dagan. That was
9 very informative.

10 Does any commissioner have any questions for Captain
11 Dagan?

12 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: I do not. Thank you.

13 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, thank you
14 very much.

15 CAPTAIN DAGAN: Thank you, guys.

16 CHAIR GINOZA: And I'd like to move on to Dan Kunkel
17 to go over our -- what's been happening with the Sunshine Law
18 and how it affects our future meetings.

19 MR. KUNKEL: Sure, yeah. Forgive me if -- you know,
20 for any of you who have already heard of this, if I'm
21 repeating information. But as some of you might recall that
22 your commission used to meet in a physical room prior to the
23 COVID-19 emergency for your regular meetings. The reason why
24 you're able to meet remotely right now is not because of any
25 particular law that's in effect; it's just that the governor

1 and the mayor have suspended the Sunshine Laws temporarily.
2 And as I understand it, they're going to terminate that
3 suspension, you know, as of January 1st, 2022. Meanwhile,
4 this past year, the Hawaii Legislature has enacted a law that
5 -- well, it's gonna make it able for you to do remote meetings
6 if you choose to do it that way. It says, for one thing, that
7 each county department has to provide a physical room
8 available for the meetings as of January 1st, the way that you
9 used to do it. You have a choice, though. You can either
10 meet the way you did prior to COVID-19, meet in the physical
11 room that your department provides for you, or you can do a
12 so-called hybrid remote meeting. So you'll be able to appear
13 remotely like you are, but you will have to have that room
14 available, and it has to have internet access.

15 I infer from all of this that the Hawaii Legislature
16 was concerned about people who have no internet access. They
17 want the public to be able to participate in these meetings,
18 so the room will need to have at a minimum some -- you know, a
19 computer with a microphone and a speaker so that someone from
20 the public or any of you commissioners could show up in that
21 room and participate actively in the meeting. And this, of
22 course, has a lot to do with each department, the department
23 that your commission is under, whether they have the means to
24 do that or not. They definitely have to provide a physical
25 room, but the question is: Can they provide the internet

1 access? Every department is different, aren't they? They
2 have different resources.

3 And you commissioners have a choice to make whether
4 you want to go back to the old way where you meet only in
5 person in that room the way you used to, or whether you want
6 to do the remote hybrid meetings. There's a few additional
7 requirements if you choose the remote version. You know, a
8 lot of people have just assumed, oh, yeah, of course, we're
9 gonna go with the remote version because a lot of people
10 really like it. I think particularly commission/board/agency
11 members who might have to appear from Molokai or Lanai, but --
12 since that requires so much traveling for them, but there are
13 some people who really hate the remote meetings, and they want
14 -- you know, they're entitled to have their opinion heard as
15 well. Some of them, they want to have the in-person meetings.
16 It's something for each commission/agency/board to decide for
17 yourselves.

18 I'll go over just some of the really quick
19 requirements of the law. It requires a physical location
20 where the public can testify and watch the meeting. Audio/
21 video must be maintained with all participating members and
22 the physical meeting location. Board members can be present
23 physically in that room at the required meeting location, or
24 they can appear by remote as you're doing right now. The
25 board members who are appearing remotely must state who is

1 present in the room with you at your remote location. It's
2 okay to have someone with you; you just need to disclose who
3 that is. If it's a family member, friend, it's okay; you just
4 need to disclose it.

5 A quorum of the members must be visible. A lot of
6 times, a lot of us like to cover our faces and sort of mute
7 the video portion of this, but a minimum of a quorum of you,
8 so in your case, five of you will need to show your faces at
9 all times. It's just part of the law. I really don't really
10 understand that one, but it's part of the law.

11 Let's see. More alternative public locations can be
12 provided, but the agenda must specify where those locations
13 are so that anybody from the public can know where to show up.
14 If there is an interruption due to technology, the meeting
15 recesses for up to a maximum of 30 minutes while there's an
16 attempt made to restore the visual. If it can be restored,
17 the meeting continues; if it cannot be restored within 30
18 minutes, then the meeting is discontinued, and you either
19 announce that you'll continue it again at another date and
20 time or just cancel it from there. But you have 30 minutes to
21 correct the technical problem.

22 For virtual, when you members appear by remote, the
23 -- whenever you do votes, the votes need to be done by roll
24 call. I guess there's been concern about clearly everybody
25 expressing their vote either yes or no, and then it's clearly

1 recorded.

2 During executive session meetings, board members
3 shall be audible to the other authorized participants, but
4 they will not be required to be visible during executive
5 session. The chair will publicly state the names and titles
6 of all the authorized participants. All participants in an
7 executive session meeting must confirm to the presiding
8 officer, the chairperson, that no unauthorized person is
9 present or able to hear them during the executive session
10 meeting since that is confidential. Let's see. The clerk or
11 person organizing the interactive conference technology shall
12 confirm that no unauthorized person has access to the
13 executive session meeting since the confidentiality is very,
14 very important.

15 That's about it. I don't know, has your commission
16 decided which way you want to go in this?

17 CHAIR GINOZA: We haven't. We basically did
18 following the remote whereby the fire department has a
19 location, our previous area, to invite the public to be able
20 to testify.

21 MR. KUNKEL: Yeah.

22 CHAIR GINOZA: So I think unless commission members
23 would rather see each other in person, continuing the remote
24 hybrid works for everyone. But I think those on the phone,
25 Donna and Makalapua, are the ones that maybe I'd rather hear

1 -- well, I'd rather hear from every member, but particularly
2 from them because they're the ones that -- of the people on
3 the call now would be most impacted.

4 So, Makalapua.

5 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Unmute.

6 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Okay. Mahalo, Chair. I'm
7 fine with remote.

8 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

9 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Just moving forward, doing
10 what we're doing right now, I'm okay with it.

11 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, excellent.

12 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Yeah. Mahalo.

13 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you.

14 What about you, Donna?

15 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Hi, everybody. You know
16 when -- when I got this in the packet on this amendment, Mr.
17 Kunkel, I was -- it addresses my issue here at Kahikinui.
18 Specifically, we've had a major issue with Sandwich Isles
19 Communication statewide, which serves all of the homestead
20 areas. We have had for the last year intermittent dropping of
21 landlines/internet to the point where I had to let chair know
22 at our fire meeting, be aware that my -- at ten to the hour
23 and 20 after the hour, 21, my line's gonna drop. So I've had
24 to go to Ulupalakua Ranch during the selection for our chief
25 and nominees and -- because it was a guaranteed straight line

1 in this -- in the town. But I definitely am for a physical
2 meeting. I'm for this amendment with the legislature because
3 it does address some of the remote areas, and I just happen to
4 be in that area. And it's been difficult to vote; make sure
5 we talk fast and we vote because, at the last meeting, I
6 couldn't vote because my landline dropped.

7 So I welcome this amendment and bill. I think it's
8 an option we all have to look at, whether -- no matter where
9 you're from, but I would come physically to the meeting and
10 make sure that, you know, our votes were counted and follow
11 the new protocol. But good job, this is -- I like this. It
12 impacts me. Thanks.

13 CHAIR GINOZA: So, Donna, the way we have it now
14 doesn't preclude you from going and joining the members -- the
15 fire department where they're sitting there.

16 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Oh.

17 CHAIR GINOZA: What we're asking for is if --
18 there's kind of two options, as I understand from Dan. And we
19 only have a couple minutes before Gregg has to leave, so I
20 just want to make it kind of quick. That with the current
21 scenario that we have, any -- any commissioner is more than
22 welcome to join the fire department in our old room, but right
23 now, it affords us the ability to be able to have remote
24 access --

25 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Oh.

1 CHAIR GINOZA: -- versus my understanding is if we
2 go the other direction, we all would have to meet in the room
3 like pre-COVID. So I would prefer that particularly for
4 people like Makalapua and Max and Punahale, that they have the
5 option to do remote; otherwise, everybody would have to go
6 like before.

7 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Okay.

8 CHAIR GINOZA: So that's -- I believe that's the
9 question that's being asked is: Are we okay with this remote
10 scenario where anybody's welcome to join the chiefs to be in
11 person and others are remote, or does everybody have to come
12 in physically?

13 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Oh, okay.

14 MR. KUNKEL: That's right.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Anyway, so --

16 COMMISSIONER STERLING: Okay.

17 CHAIR GINOZA: So we had bare quorum, so if -- so we
18 gotta -- so could I have a motion to see either way, so remote
19 or otherwise, so we can just kind of move this forward? And I
20 think we'll take the executive session portion at the next
21 meeting because Gregg has to go. But it would be nice to be
22 able to kind of determine which way we'll go for January
23 because the executive order will terminate before our next
24 meeting. But that's what I'm hoping, is that hopefully people
25 are okay with the current scenario and, you know, we --

1 anybody could go see the chiefs. But could I have a motion
2 either way to proceed?

3 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: I'll make a motion to proceed,
4 Chair.

5 CHAIR GINOZA: Proceed which way, hybrid or --

6 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: The way we're currently doing
7 it right now.

8 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

9 COMMISSIONER BURNS: I second the motion.

10 COMMISSIONER STERLING: I second.

11 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. So motion by Makalapua and
12 seconded by Dwight to have the remote hybrid method which we
13 currently use where any member is allowed to -- or any member
14 of the public as well is allowed to go to the room to
15 participate in person. So unless there's any other
16 discussion, can I see a raise of hands of who is in favor of
17 the motion?

18 (Response.)

19 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. So I see everyone, so the vote
20 is unanimous. So we will continue with the -- we will
21 implement the remote hybrid scenario. Thank you very much.

22 And like I said, we will -- I'll postpone the
23 executive session to approve the minutes from the November
24 18th meeting till the next meeting since Gregg needs to leave
25 and we need quorum.

1 The other thing I would like for the next meeting
2 for members to think about is I would like to implement the --
3 some site visits at stations if people are willing to go, and
4 we just have to have quorum to be able to participate at site
5 visits. So please think about that, and the next meeting, I'd
6 like to kind of lay out a calendar of our people who are
7 interested in doing site visits to visit stations or not, but
8 -- so I intend to put a calendar item on that.

9 COMMISSIONER STERLING: On the agenda.

10 CHAIR GINOZA: And so --

11 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: Mr. Chair.

12 CHAIR GINOZA: Oh, go ahead.

13 COMMISSIONER LUNDBERG: I'm okay for another five or
14 ten minutes, so if you want to do the executive session and
15 approve the minutes.

16 CHAIR GINOZA: Oh, okay. Okay, great. So for the
17 regular meeting, the last thing we have is the next meeting is
18 Thursday, January 20th of the new year at ten o'clock via
19 BlueJeans and in person as we had just discussed. So that is
20 the end of the regular meeting agenda other than for the
21 executive session. We will just be coming back from the
22 executive session to close -- to open and close the regular
23 meeting, so there really isn't a need for the public to --
24 anybody from the public to wait around for us to continue the
25 meeting. And so I'd like to see if I can have a motion to

1 recess --

2 CHIEF VENTURA: Chair. Sorry to interrupt. Sorry,
3 I was off. Chair, Richelle's off-camera, she wanted to make a
4 comment about the executive session.

5 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. Go ahead.

6 MS. WAKAMATSU: If there's no discussion or comments
7 that the commission would like to make on the executive
8 minutes -- because the executive minutes was only to approve
9 the last executive minutes.

10 CHAIR GINOZA: Yes.

11 MS. WAKAMATSU: So every time we hold an executive
12 meeting, I have to put another executive meeting in the next
13 meeting just to approve the executive meetings for the
14 previous meetings.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Oh, okay.

16 MS. WAKAMATSU: So if there's no discussion on the
17 last executive minutes, if we can keep it in regular session
18 to just approve it with no discussion, that would be better
19 than to go into executive meeting and have to do this again
20 next meeting.

21 CHAIR GINOZA: Oh, okay. Perfect.

22 MS. WAKAMATSU: That being said --

23 MR. KUNKEL: I agree, 'cause you won't need to
24 discuss anything that's confidential if you simply vote to
25 approve.

1 CHAIR GINOZA: Oh, okay.

2 MR. KUNKEL: If you do want to discuss, then it
3 would be a good idea to go into executive session.

4 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, great. Thank you both for that
5 input because I was wondering about that as well.

6 So unless anybody has anything that they need to
7 discuss about the minutes that we received, I agree; I'd like
8 to not go into executive session. So, could I have a motion
9 to approve the executive session minutes from November 18th?

10 COMMISSIONER STERLING: I make a motion to approve
11 the November 18th executive session, Chair.

12 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: I second.

13 CHAIR GINOZA: Great. Thank you, Donna. Do I have
14 a second?

15 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Second.

16 CHAIR GINOZA: Second by Makalapua?

17 COMMISSIONER KANUHA: Makalapua, yes.

18 CHAIR GINOZA: Yes. So no discussion -- I mean, I
19 guess there's no discussion, so all in favor, raise your hand.
20 One, two, three, four -- who am I missing? One, two, three --
21 oh, okay. So it's unanimous; all five approved the executive
22 session minutes.

23 Okay, great. Well, thank you, everyone, for --
24 that's the last item on our agenda. Thank you, everyone, for
25 your participation.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMISSIONER STERLING: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR GINOZA: Happy holidays.

COMMISSIONER STERLING: Merry Christmas.

CHAIR GINOZA: And congratulations to Chief Werner for -- on his retirement.

COMMISSIONER STERLING: We're gonna miss you, Werner. Congratulations.

CHAIR GINOZA: So, if there is nothing else, I would like to adjourn the meeting at 11:05 a.m. on Thursday, December 16th. Meeting is adjourned. Thank you very much.

(The proceedings were adjourned at 11:05 a.m.)

