

**SALARY COMMISSION
MINUTES
January 14, 2022
Meeting Site: Online via Blue Jeans**

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

The meeting was called to order by Chair Abbott at 8:30 a.m.

Present:

Clark Abbott, Chair
Dawnalyn Fujiwara, Vice-Chair
Edwin Misaki
Tambara Garrick
Scott Parker
Andy Ho
Peter Martin joined meeting at 9:11am

Excused:

Grant Nakama
Stanford Lantias

Staff:

Kristina Toshikiyo, Deputy Corporation Counsel
Stacy Takahashi, Administrative Officer
Rochelle Ines, Secretary
LeeAnn Nomura Matsui, Secretary

2. Public Testimony

Chair Alice L. Lee of Maui County Council testified on item #5.

Mr. David Raatz testified on her behalf at the last meeting.

Maui County Council's duties and workload, which is comparatively greater than the other counties. In 2021 on the low-end, Hawaii County held 11 council meetings, 1 committee meeting and 17 joint meetings for a total of 29 meetings. On the high side, Hawaii County had 27 Council Meetings and 120 Committee Meetings for a total of 147 meetings. The Maui County Council held 36 council meetings and 177 Committee meetings for a total of 213 meetings. The Council did not waste any time adapting to virtual meetings and revising protocols due to the impacts of COVID-19. We were determined to not only maintain high public participation in our meetings and activities, but to take it to a new level. This speaks to our high commitment to civic engagement and transparency. We do not follow the other Counties. We leave the State in this realm. Chair Lee appreciates your favorable consideration on a salary increase for the Maui County Council. Mahalo.

Chair Abbott thanked Chair Lee and said he appreciates her input and information.

Public testimony closed.

3. Approval of the Minutes of the November 12, 2021 and December 10, 2021 meeting.

Meeting Minutes of November 12, 2021.

Commissioner Garrick made the motion to approve the minutes. It was seconded by Commissioner Ho. The motion was unanimously passed.

Meeting Minutes of December 10, 2021

Commissioner Parker made the motion to approve the minutes. It was seconded by Commissioner Garrick. The motion was unanimously passed.

4. Review and clarification on 2% salary increase for the Mayor, Council Chair, and Councilmembers previously awarded on March 13, 2020, deferred by the Salary Commission in December 2020, and deferred again by the Salary Commission in December 2021.

Deputy Corporation Counsel Toshikiyo was standing in for Deputy Corporation Counsel Christie Trenholme.

Deputy Corporation Counsel Toshikiyo - This is on the agenda because in last month's meeting, Salary Commission Members voted to defer on this matter until 2023. We want to get clarification on if there was a certain date in 2023. Because Salary Commission Members voted on 2023, it would be an amendment. You can provide a more specific date or month.

Commissioner Misaki said the intent was January 2023. Chair Abbott agreed with Commissioner Misaki. Chair Abbott asked Commissioners if they want to discuss to make it sooner or hold it until 2023.

Commissioner Misaki - We cannot make it sooner because, didn't we vote on this? Corporation Counsel Toshikiyo replied yes. You voted on 2023 and we went back and reviewed the minutes as well as the video. We want to make sure if you are going to set a month within 2023, that should be an amendment so we can reflect it. A letter will be sent out. Commissioner Misaki - remembers the intent was January 2023. Chair Abbott - we're making an amendment to January 2023.

Deputy Corporation Counsel Toshikiyo said there should be a motion to amend your previous decision and if it's going to be January 2023. We need a motion, a second and a vote.

Chair Abbott - may I have a motion to amend? Commissioner Misaki - moved to amend the motion to reflect to January 2023. Commissioner Parker seconded the motion. 5 ayes (Fujiwara, Garrick, Ho, Parker and Misaki) motion carried.

5. FY 2022 salary reviews for the Mayor, County Council Members, Department Directors, Department Deputy Directors, and the County Auditor.

Chair Abbott announced of a change in presentations. Department of Police and Department of Fire and Public Safety will present today. The Fire and Public Safety Commission, Department of Liquor Control, and Liquor Control Commission have been deferred until the February meeting. Is that my understanding, Kristina?

Deputy Corporation Counsel Toshikiyo - The Fire and Public Safety Commission and the Liquor Control Commission haven't had an opportunity to meet and discuss this item. They are requesting a deferral to the February agenda in order to provide testimony information. The Department of Liquor Control have also made a request to defer to next month due to staffing shortages. They haven't been able to put together a presentation for you. It is up to this body to determine whether or not you want to defer to the next agenda. The Department of Police and Department of Fire and Public Safety have confirmed and will be ready to present to you today.

If there is no objection from the Commissioners, you can defer to the February agenda. There were no objections by the Salary Commissioners. Chair Abbott said we will move the three departments to the February meeting.

Commissioner Parker asked if we are at the end of the presentations?

Stacy Takahashi – Department of Police, Department of Fire and Public Safety and Department of Liquor Control, these are the last departments. We have Civil Service Commission and Police Commission scheduled for the February meeting. We will add the other two commissions and Department of Liquor Control.

a. Presentation by Department of Police, Chief John Pelletier
Chief John Pelletier submitted a presentation which was emailed to the Commissioners.

Police Chief Pelletier briefly discussed the following:

Current Salaries – FY22 Base Salary

Refer to Presentation_Department of Police Salary Commission Meeting_2021v3.pdf – page 2

Assistant Chiefs that work directly for the Office of the Chief are making much more money than the Chief and those individuals are able to work overtime and have certain options, where the Chief and Deputy do not. Those below with less responsibility are making more money.

FY 2022 Budget

- The Police Chief have the largest budget on responsibility of anyone in Maui County

- Between \$64,000,000-\$63,000,000
- Percentage of salaries and wages for the department were only increased by 0.1% over last year

Organization

Refer to Presentation Department of Police_Salary Commission Meeting_2021v3.pdf – page 4

Cost of Living (information shared by Chief Pelletier)

- Hawaii has the highest cost of living in the United States at 196.3, which means that the cost of living is 96.3% higher than the U.S. average. Maui County cost of living is 161.9.
- Numbers reflect a 7% increase over last year
- The cost of living index is based on a U.S. average of 100 (housing 30%; groceries 15%, transportation 10%; utilities 6%; healthcare 7%; misc. expenses such as clothing, services, entertainment – 32%). Taxes are not included.
- One of the main factors in determining the cost of living is housing. The median sales price of a single-family home is currently \$1 million.

Salary Comparisons

Refer to Presentation Department of Police_Salary Commission Meeting_2021v3.pdf – page 6

Salary Comparisons - California 2019 (refer to presentation submitted)

Comparison provided to compare salaries earned by chiefs with like-sized agencies, populations and cost of living.

Refer to Presentation Department of Police_Salary Commission Meeting_2021v3.pdf – page 7

The Chief made the following Police Chief salary comparisons of California cities that are similar in size to Maui County:

- Richmond - \$235,000;
- Santa Clara - \$223,000;
- Inglewood - \$216,000; and
- Haywood - \$232,000.

Large California cities such as Los Angeles or San Francisco were not used in this comparison due to the sizes of their resident population and police force. Taking into consideration the cost of living in Hawaii versus the continental United States, the equivalent salary should be \$196,000.

Visitor Volume - Table 11: Major Economic Indicator Summary – Maui County Baseline Forecast - *(Refer to Presentation Department of Police_Salary Commission Meeting_2021v3.pdf – page 8)*

In addition to the resident population of 165,000, MPD is also responsible for the more than 300,000 visitors that arrive here annually. The visitor numbers are projected to increase even more over the next several years.

Chief of Police Responsibilities

- The administrative head of the department
- Responsible for the preservation of the public peace, preventing crime, detection and arrest of offenders against the law, protecting rights
- Traffic safety
- Maintaining equipment
- Other powers and responsibilities that are deemed fit assigned by the Mayor, prescribed the law.

Mandated Boards & Responsibilities

- Director of Public Safety when there is emergency management activation.
- (GCOC) Governor's Committee on Crime.
- Statewide Automated Victim Information and Notification System (SAVIN)
- Police Officer Standard Training (POST)
- Hawaii Opioid Initiative
- Private Detective & Guard Board
- High Intensity Drug Trafficking Areas Program (HIDTA). Attended a meeting on January 11, 2022. Using federal funds, 600 Narcan kits were ordered for the County. It is hoped that these kits will help to save lives here in the County.
- Joint Terrorism Task Forces (JTTF) – Executive Board
- Coroner of the County
- Issue firearm permits for residents of Maui County

Deputy Chief of Police Responsibilities

Using corporate labels, a Police Chief is the CEO of the Police Department. The Deputy Chief of Police is the equivalent of a COO who is responsible for the overall daily administration and operations of the department. The Deputy Police Chief's salary is a percentage of the Police Chief's

History of MPD and Impacts

MPD has been in existence for over 80 years and is at the forefront of change. The job always comes with risks, liability, the responsibility to keep moving forward. The next several years will be challenging.

The Chief has been on the job for 28 days since being sworn in and doesn't want to be seen as asking for a pay raise so soon and made the following statements:

- Believes the base salary request of \$195,000 is fair, reasonable and appropriate for the job since no raises were awarded in 2021. Felt that

the salary compensation could have been settled prior to him taking the position. He has relocated to Maui and it is now his responsibility.

- Understands that his salary comes from taxpayer's dollars.
- There are other positions whose salaries are not negotiable and will be an advocate for equitable compensation.

Q&A

Chair Abbot

- You've been on the job not quite a month, is that correct?

Police Chief Pelletier

- That is correct. Tomorrow (1/15/2022) will be a month.

Commissioner Ho

- Commented on his appreciation to Chief Pelletier's dedication to his job and not just looking for the money. He understands that this is problem throughout all the Counties in Hawaii and the cost of living is a big problem.

Commissioner Misaki

- We always get the comparison of the salaries of comparable departments. From the presentation, we know the size of MPD, but we don't know what the size of Santa Clara. Additional information would help our Commission look at things fairly.

Police Chief Pelletier

- Good point. That certainly can be provided.

Commissioner Misaki

- Thank you and congratulations on your hiring.

Commissioner Parker

- Welcome aboard Chief and thanks for stepping into the role.

Police Chief Pelletier

- Mahalo, I really appreciate. Thank you.

Chair Abbott

- I appreciate all your help and your information and a very good presentation. It helps us make a decision and if you could get us the additional information that would help as well.

Police Chief Pelletier

- He will update the power point with the employees or the commissioned for each of those agencies and send as an addendum.

b. Presentation by Department of Fire & Public Safety, Fire Chief Bradford

Ventura

Fire Chief Brad Ventura submitted a presentation which was emailed previously to the Commissioners.

Fire Chief Ventura briefly discussed the following:

Department Goals

(Refer to 2022 Salary Commission Presentation.pdf – page 2)

Duties and Responsibilities

The duties and responsibilities are in the charter, so it's available for review if you need.

As mentioned, making sure equipment, training, service to the community is always readily available, and that there's no lapse in service to our people during COVID. We've all had challenges and were all hoping that this is behind us. We continue to work through COVID and protecting our employees and community from further risks.

Fire Code, fire prevention, education to the public, training needs, equipment management are all part of responding to the needs of the community.

What You Already Know

(Refer to 2022 Salary Commission Presentation.pdf – page 4)

Comparables

(Refer to 2022 Salary Commission Presentation.pdf – page 5)

The two companies from Washington and California are comparable to Maui. Whether it be residence size or call volume, their statistics are shown in red on the presentation chart.

In comparison to Maui, the two companies in Washington, although much smaller have a \$10,000 - \$20,000 higher range in salaries for the Chief.

In Chino Valley, California with 140 full-time employees, they manage seven stations, their resident population and call volume is similar to ours with a higher pay scale for the Chief and Deputy Chief.

The attached chart shows there are many statistics to compare to Maui: calls for service, residence calls, the number of employees and square miles.

The 389 full-time employees in Maui County Department of Fire and Public Safety includes lifeguards, firefighters, and civilian positions. We have 14 stations and 10 lifeguard towers throughout Maui County's three islands which makes Maui County demographically one of the most complex

situations.

MFD Salary Inversion

(Refer to 2022 Salary Commission Presentation.pdf – page 6)

The Deputy and Chief do not have the opportunity for standby overtime work and other things that fall into the contract for other chief officers in their department. This is why it puts them so far down on the salary list.

Future Recruitment

The last two recruitments for the fire chief:

2018 Recruitment for Maui Fire Chief – 4 candidates

2021 Recruitment for Maui Fire Chief – 2 candidates

When they talked to people who are qualified candidates for the position, it is all too often directly connected to salary. In 2018, there were 4 candidates and in 2021 there were 2 candidates. Being that everyone has bills to pay and families to feed, not all of them choose to put in for the position. Therefore, our candidate pool is getting smaller. To make it a better system, we're going to try and change the way we do business with education and training in the next few years.

Q&A

Commissioner Misaki

- Congratulated Chief Ventura and commented on the comparison, if he could have listed the salary of the MFD. This information would complete the comparison.
- He liked adding of the FTEs because it shows the larger the FTEs, the bigger the job.

Chief Ventura

- We sent in a large packet of information that Stacy was able to create a PDF. In the second section of that PDF, page 15 or 20, it shows three different charts. These charts show the comparable and the salaries listed for calendar year 21, 20 and 19.

Stacy Takahashi

- There were two items that were sent to all the Commissioners and that was Chief Ventura's PowerPoint presentation and other documents.

Commissioner Ho

- There was an inversion where the Chief and the Deputy make less than the people below them. Is that primarily because of the union contract, or is it because of other factors?

Chief Ventura

- There is still an inversion because we are on different pay scales. Our

salary is determined by the Salary Commission, whereas the firefighters and ocean safety officers have a contract negotiated by their union. Their salaries are determined separately from ours and their benefit package is different from ours. With the overtime and such, that's how the inversions created.

Commissioner Ho

- It makes a different dedication to see that you will be dedicated to your job, even though you make less than the people below you.

Commissioner Parker

- Thanked the Chief for his time and for the presentation

Chair Abbott

- Thanked Chief Ventura for his excellent presentation and appreciate all the information and will keep it under consideration and advisement.

Commissioner Martin joined the meeting at 9:11am.

6. 2022 Annual Update of Financial Disclosure Statement

Deputy Corporation Counsel Toshikiyo – Reminder to all Commissioners that your annual updates to your Financial Disclosure Statements are due by April 15th. The earlier the better so it allows the Board of Ethics to review and acknowledge receipt. The forms are available through the Board of Ethics website and your Commission staff will also be sending hard copies out to you.

Commissioner Misaki - After filling out the hard copy, can we scan it, and send it back, or do we have to mail it? Deputy Corporation Counsel Toshikiyo confirmed after you fill it out and sign it, you can scan it and email it to your Board/Commission staff.

7. Agenda Setting for Next Meeting

Civil Service Commission
Police Commission
Fire and Public Safety Commission
Liquor Control Commission
Department of Liquor Control

Commissioner Misaki asked why do we have to hear from the Commissions? Aren't they voluntary boards?

Deputy Corporation Counsel Toshikiyo – Within the Charter in Chapter 17 for the Salary Commission, the Salary Commission determines the compensation of elected officials and appointed Directors and Deputy Directors. However, in establishing the compensation of appointed department heads and their deputy, the Salary Commission shall consult with those Boards and Commissions which

have appointing authority. These Boards, the Commissions have appointing authority. For instance, over the Police, the Fire Chief and the Director of Liquor Control. You shall consult with them.

Stacy Takahashi – And also Department of Personnel Services

Chair Abbott – It's a good information tool

8. Announcements

The next meeting is scheduled for Friday, February 11, 2022 at 8:30am, online, via BlueJeans.

9. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 9:15 a.m.

DRAFT