

**MAUI PLANNING COMMISSION  
REGULAR MINUTES  
APRIL 28, 2020**

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

The regular meeting of the Maui Planning Commission was called to order by Chairperson Lawrence Carnicelli at approximately 9:09 a.m., Tuesday, April 28, 2020, online via BlueJeans; Meeting ID: 945 093 330.

Mr. Carnicelli: It is 9:09 a.m., on Tuesday April 28, 2020 and we will go ahead and call the Maui Planning Commission meeting to order. My name is Lawrence Carnicelli, I'm the Chair. Also with us is Vice-Chair Christian Tackett.

Mr. Tackett: Good morning, Chair.

Mr. Carnicelli: Good morning. Stephen Castro.

Mr. Castro: Good morning, Chair.

Mr. Carnicelli: Good morning. P Denise La Costa.

Ms. La Costa: Aloha Chair.

Mr. Carnicelli: Aloha. Kellie Pali.

Ms. Pali: Aloha kakahiaka.

Mr. Carnicelli: Aloha. Dale Thompson.

Mr. Thompson: Good morning, Chair and Staff.

Mr. Carnicelli: Good morning. And Kawika Freitas.

Mr. Freitas: Good morning, Chair.

Mr. Carnicelli: Good morning. Good morning. Also, Corporation Counsel Michael Hopper I believe is still on the line and then Director Michele Chouteau McLean. So, I guess to just start off the meeting for everybody that's here, for those of you watching or listening whether you plan to testify or not, please mute your mic on BlueJeans or your phone just for the sake of echoing and everything and like that, I think that everybody's done that. Also, for those of you that would like to testify on anything, within the chat function please do a direct chat to Director McLean, to Michele McLean in the direct chat. She will then get a line up of who it is that wants to speak and who wants to testify on that particular item. We're gonna do, testimony after each item just like we normally do, and for those of you that are on the phone and cannot direct chat then what we'll do is we'll just open up and we'll take you people after we have those people that have signed up. And then also, please do not chat directly if you're a member of the public or even within ourselves don't chat directly with committee members or commission members. And then I guess at this point, I'll just go ahead and hand the agenda over to the Director unless there's something you need to add that I missed.

Ms. McLean: No, I think you got it covered Chair.

Mr. Carnicelli: Did we lose P Denise again.

Ms. McLean: No, she's still on, she muted her video.

Mr. Carnicelli: Oh, okay.

## **B. NEW BUSINESS**

### **1. Continuation of Training for conducting board business using the videoconferencing platform BlueJeans**

#### **a. Sample presentations**

Ms. McLean: So, the first item on the agenda is continuation of training for conducting board business using a video conferencing platform BlueJeans and I will start by giving a presentation and then Mr. Croly has graciously volunteered to also give a presentation. So, I'm gonna go ahead and start and I'm gonna do the share screen function and let's see, are you seeing the beginning of a PowerPoint slide?

Mr. Carnicelli: Yes.

Ms. McLean: So, a sample department presentation. And remember you can use the function down on the lower left of your screen to slide to make the presentation larger and the video images smaller or vice versa. So, are you guys seeing this, slide one, here's some sample text on a really boring background and we have a discussion of using more interesting templates because it would be good to know if the templates matter to the commission, and how information is conveyed to the commission. To me, reading word for word gets kind of boring. It's better for the presenter to highlight the most important information from the slide. Does that make a difference to the commission? And slide two, doing a sample slide with imagery. So, this just testing out to see how you can see PowerPoint. It's interesting because I can see it on my computer screen but not on my BlueJeans screen. So that's...that will be a little bit challenging for applicants, we can work on refining that. So, that concludes my very highly technical presentation. Are there any questions. Well, thank you, Director. I believe at this point in time we can open up the floor for testifiers. So, has anybody direct messaged you who want to testify on this wonderful presentation.

Ms. McLean: Yes, we have one testifier, Jacky Takakura.

Mr. Carnicelli: You want to ...okay, there's Jacky. So, hi Jacky, you will have up to three minutes to testify on this particular item.

Ms. Jacky Takakura: Thank you. That was a wonderful presentation. I wanted to provide some testimony. This is practice especially regarding apocalypse and subdivision development and

I'm just going to read you a little bit of research information. According to research conducted at the University of Washington by Zoologist Gordon Orion, most people's ideal dwelling location consists of a home, set on a rise of ground, offering long views over parklike terrain planted with large trees with broad crowns. Harvard Biologist, E. O. Wilson has observed...I love the view, thank you P Denise...it hasn't set this...(inaudible)...sits a tropical Savannah of the kind prevailing in Africa where humanity evolved for several million years. Primitive people living there are thought to have been more secure in open terrain where the wide vista allowed them to search for food while watching for enemies. Possessing relatively frail bodies early humans also needed cover for retreat with trees to climb in if pursued. That's my testimony, thank you very much.

Mr. Carnicelli: Thank you, Jacky. Do we have any questions for the testifier? I guess wave your hand or something like that if you have any questions for the testifier? Thank you very much Jacky. We appreciate it.

Ms. Takakura: Thank you.

Mr. Carnicelli: Is there anybody else that would like to testify on this particular time?

Ms. McLean: Yes, Chair. John Rapacz has indicated he wishes to testify.

Mr. Carnicelli: Okay, Mr. Rapacz.

Mr. John Rapacz: Thank you, Chair and good morning, and aloha Commission Members. I'm the Administrator of the Zoning Administration and Enforcement Division also called ZAED. And I'm just going to fill up my time with reading to you from the 2019 Annual Report of the Planning Department and this is the section on the Zoning Division. I know you folks probably don't hear much about us except regarding typically vacation rental enforcement and then you may hear us mentioned also when you are presented with a settlement of SMA violations. But we do a lot more than those two things. I'll read from the report.

The Zoning Administration and Enforcement Division obviously administers and enforces all applicable state and county land use laws and rules, and that is very large, large set of government regulations. We are also the Department's primary advisor and information source to residents regarding interpretation and application of all of those regulations. So, we are the primary contact for members of the public and for other members of government agencies, state and county to provide advice on what applicable...what laws and regulations apply to particular properties, how do we interpret those, what is the most current version of those. So, much of what we do is public contact with advice and education.

We also support the Board of Variances and Appeals which hears applications for variance from the Zoning Code and other codes, so if people discover or build a portion of their house in the setback and they want to be able to keep it, they'll apply for a variance and the Board will decide whether they meet the criteria. And the Board also hears appeals of decisions made by the Director that are not related to SMA or shoreline. So, those are the other types of appeals that we deal with. We do what are called use determinations which means if someone says, can I

do this on my property or if we have a complaint that someone is doing something on their property that the complainant thinks is illegal then we ultimately make that determination.

Then sort of the second part of what we do involves the enforcement end which is dealing with complaints and internal questions about whether the laws are being complied with or possibly violated—

Ms. Takayama-Corden: Three minutes.

Mr. Rapacz: And we deal with the enforcement process that follows that with Notices of Warning and Notices of Violation, and as I mentioned earlier, the most common ones you'll hear about are vacation rental violations. We've focused on that and as I think probably most of you know we have...we work with an outside service provider that helps us constantly monitor the internet.

Mr. Carnicelli: John, is your three minutes is up, so if you could just wrap that up that would be great.

Mr. Rapacz: I'm not even close to being finished so I'm gonna need at least another ten minutes if that's okay with everybody.

Mr. Carnicelli: No.

Mr. Rapacz: And what I wondered was in terms of screen share will you be allowing testifiers to do screen share?

Mr. Carnicelli: Oh, good question.

Ms. McLean: I don't think so, 'cause we don't do that now. We don't take testimony by PowerPoint or anything like that.

Mr. Rapacz: But for example, a testifier attending the meeting might want to hold up a site plan or something for the commissioners to see, I guess that would be allowed just on, on camera rather than screen share is that how it would work?

Ms. McLean: Yeah.

Mr. Rapacz: Okay, thanks. The reason I'm asking folks is 'cause we're doing a trial BlueJeans meeting with the Board of Variances and Appeals on Thursday so I'm trying to get trained up for that and thank you for your patience.

Mr. Carnicelli: Thanks John. Does anybody have any questions for the testifier? Seeing none, thank you John, we appreciate it.

Mr. Rapacz: Thank you.

Mr. Carnicelli: Director, who is next.

Ms. McLean: Chair, those are all the video testimonies that we received. There may be individuals who wish to testify by phone.

Mr. Carnicelli: I do believe that I see in the everyone chat that Avis actually wants to testify via phone. If you look at the chat you can maybe unmute her or she can unmute herself.

Ms. McLean: I will unmute her phone. Chair, do you want to call her to testify?

Mr. Carnicelli: Yeah, Avis if you would like to testify, you have up to three minutes. I cannot hear you, if you're there. Okay, my screen says that she's talking about I don't hear her, like the little thing that says, you know, phone number is talking but I couldn't hear her.

Ms. McLean: Right, I can't hear either.

Mr. Carnicelli: Is her phone muted?

Ms. Avis Teshima-Wong: Can everyone hear me now?

Ms. McLean: Yes.

Ms. Teshima-Wong: Oh, good, okay. This testimony that I have pertains to the BlueJeans training item, and here we go. The brains of older or rather more mature people are slow because they know so much. People do not decline mentally with age, it just takes them longer to recall facts because they have more information in their brains scientists believe. Much like a computer struggles as the hard drive gets full, so too, do humans take longer to access information when their brains are full. Researchers say this slowing down process is not same as cognitive decline. The human brain works slower as we get older said Dr. Michael Ramscar, but only because we have stored more information over time. The brains of older people do not get weak, on the contrary, they simply know more. Also, older people often go to another room to get something and when they get there, they stand there wondering what they came for, it is not a memory problem, it is just nature's way of making older people do more exercise. So, there, now when you reach for a word or a name or struggling with BlueJeans training, don't say I'm having a senior moment, simply say, my disk is full, and thank you, that concludes my testimony.

Mr. Carnicelli: Thank you, Avis. Any questions for the testifier? Ms. La Costa.

Ms. La Costa: I've been trying to convince people of this for years.

Mr. Carnicelli: Anybody else? Thank you, Avis.

Ms. Teshima-Wong: Thank you.

Mr. Carnicelli: Is there anybody else that would like to come forward and testify on this particular item? Okay, then seeing none, we'll go ahead and close public testimony and at this point, we will then open up the floor for questions, comments for the Director on her presentation. Is there anybody that would like to speak to the Director's presentation. I will.

Ms. McLean: I know, it was so full of information it's hard to process.

Mr. Carnicelli: No, it's one of my pet peeves is people that read PowerPoints. I have to completely agree with you. It's just like you put all the words up there and then you're just reading to me, it's like okay, no I don't need you to do that. At least spice it up a little bit, do something. And pretty pictures is always good.

Mr. Castro: Did we order lunch?

Mr. Carnicelli: Yes, it's being delivered. You just wait there. Does anybody else have any questions for the Director? All right, seeing none, then I guess we'll go to the next presentation is that what we're gonna do, Director.

Ms. McLean: Yep.

Mr. Carnicelli: I believe that's you Mr. Croly.

Mr. Tom Croly: All right, do I have to be officially introduced as an agenda item first?

Mr. Carnicelli: Sure, go ahead, Director.

Ms. McLean: Thank you, Chair. This is, we're still under New Business Item 1A, Sample Presentations and thank you very much to Mr. Croly for offering to give us another trial run.

Mr. Croly: Thank you, Director. I'm happy to be here to work out the bugs in this system and to learn it myself. I decided that I would do a presentation that might be topical for the day. It's unfortunate that today we have now experienced a million Covid cases in the United States, so my presentation is going to be about Covid-19 and Maui and how it's affecting us here. And I encourage anyone to ask me questions during the presentation, just jump in because again we're just kinda testing this out to see how it works and I think there's times when you have presenters and they present something and you're not sure so if, if you will, just ask a question or two. I also noticed that when the Director was doing her presentation and you have that little slider over once I get into this that it was very useful to put the slider of the third button and then you saw the presentation on top and you saw the people on the bottom which I thought was kind of helpful to do. So, I'm going to go into my presentation, let's see if this works, share screen, and I've got a PowerPoint presentation open, let's go there and let's say slideshow, view slideshow, so hopefully everyone is seeing my Covid-19 Maui County Update slide. If you could respond positively that would be helpful.

Mr. Carnicelli: Yep.

Ms. McLean: Yes.

Mr. Croly: Thank you. So, Covid-19 Maui County Update-Luck You Live Hawaii. Hopefully this will make you feel a little better about being in Hawaii during this time of Covid-19. This slide came from the mayor's presentation yesterday when he informed us that there was one new case countywide and that brings us up to a total of 113 cases and that 78 people have been released from isolation and that unfortunately there have been five deaths in Maui County. But there is some good news on this page if you kinda do a little calculation. There's a 113 total cases and 78 released and five deaths that 83 cases that means we only have 30 currently active Covid cases that have been identified in Maui and I think that's, you know, a reasonable number at this point in as to where we are.

This next slide, the blue part of the slide here shows the cases as they have added over time. And that blue part is kind of scary because you see it's going up and up and up and it keeps getting bigger and bigger and that makes us all feel like this problem's getting worse, but if you look at the bottom of the slide, the yellow ones, that's how many cases each day have been reported. So, if we go all the way back to March 15 where there were zero cases, March 16<sup>th</sup> when the first case was reported through the end here, where yesterday there was one new case and the day before there were zero and the day before that zero, and the day before that zero, and two cases on April 23<sup>rd</sup>, you can see that we've kinda worked through the up and down of this and we are definitely on the down side now and that's a good thing—

Mr. Carnicelli: Tom, I'm gonna interrupt you just because you asked us too.

Mr. Croly: Yep.

Mr. Carnicelli: Is do you have a slide that also, 'cause you know how you said, okay, we had a 113 minus 83 is 30, do you have that graph as well that shows like okay, we had one new active but one less cured or something like that? Do you have—

Mr. Croly: No, I don't have a slide that shows that, but you're right that would be very useful information for them to be reporting every day, how many active cases we have so then people can instead of watching a number go up, they can watch a number come down right, and that might make people feel better about things. Thank you for that question.

This next slide is a state slide, this came from the Department of Health's presentation yesterday and these are all the cases that have been reported on a state basis again, going all the way back to February 17<sup>th</sup>, and you might say, well, February 17<sup>th</sup> there weren't any cases in Maui, but what this slide is actually showing is when the first person first exhibited symptoms. So, before you get tested, I guess as part of testing they ask a questionnaire when did you start having these systems, and then if you turn out to be positive, they put it on this chart based on when your symptoms began. So, this chart runs from February 17<sup>th</sup> to April 17<sup>th</sup> and in this last column here it says illnesses that began within the past ten days may not have been reported. So, they're saying in the past ten days these were people that reported having the systems, some kind of symptom came up. If you look, there have been none in the last four or five days that are shown here, but of course, if their symptoms just started showing up, they wouldn't

have been tested yet, so they wouldn't be on this chart yet. But again, this chart shows relatively good news, the chart peaked out here, with people whose systems began around March 18<sup>th</sup>, and it's now come way down even if we go back ten days to where we have very few new symptoms being reported. So again, this is on a statewide basis and not just Maui County. It also shows the blue bars are ones where they were able to track the person's contact Covid to travel and in most cases, these are residents who went traveling and then when they came home, they contracted the Covid while they were traveling and when they came home, they you know, they got tested and found out their got it. The lighter blue is travel associated contacts and, in most cases, these are going to be people who maybe live with the person who traveled or worked with the person who traveled and caught it from them. And then the red ones are community contact, that's where there was no travel history by the individual who got Covid and there were no obvious immediate contacts of them that traveled, so they identify that as we contacted it in the community, and then the gray bars at the top and the ones now down here are the ones that they haven't identified. They're not sure how the person got it. Any questions on this slide?

Okay, this slide is maybe the only bad news slide of all of these with respect to Maui and this shows the number of cases by each island. The green is the Big Island, the yellow is Kauai, the purple one is Maui, and the blue one is Oahu and you'll see you know, when the cases were, when there were just a few cases they were all tracking very similar with the Big Island kind of down and then there was this spike that happened to Maui and this spike was the cluster at the hospital when we saw a jump up there, but again, in all of these of these you can see they've all flattened out, that's what they mean by flattening out the curve, these have all become very flat at the end here. Maui does have a higher incident rate than the other islands at this point because of this spike that we had at the hospital otherwise, we were tracking very similar to all the islands.

Another good new slide, in Maui in Covid testing we've done 5,409 tests as of yesterday and that's more than three percent of the county's population that has been tested and of those 5,409 tests, the 113 have been positive and that is only, if I can use that word, only two percent of the tests that have been positive but if you compare that to the national average of 18 percent, you can see we have a much lower incidence of Covid here in Maui than nationally. Also, at three percent of Maui's population having been tested that's the highest per capita of all the other islands. So, it is possible that here on Maui we have captured more of the tests, more of the positive cases because we've done twice as much testing as on Honolulu and Kauai and 50 percent more testing than they have done on the Big Island.

This slide kinda shows how we might compare nationally and I was curious, I wanted to put this slide up because I wanted to see if you folks would be able to read these small numbers on here. The top line of this is the USA's total showing that the total cases is over a million cases now, and the total deaths in the United States is 56,803, active cases is 814,000 and the total cases per million population is 3,053. In moment I'll show you how that compares to here in Hawaii and what the good news is, and the deaths per million people is 172 and the total tests per million population is 17,200. At the top of this are the states that have the most cases, New York with almost 300,000 cases and 1,153 deaths, New Jersey with 111,000 cases, and you look down here and you say, well where is Hawaii on this, and the good news is, this next slide,



the whole chart has been flipped and now we're looking from the bottom up and the Hawaii has the least number of total cases, active cases, 98. Montana has a few less of 83, but there's far less people Montana than there are in Hawaii, so our total cases per million population is only 427, and again, I want to go back to the previous slide and show you that the total cases per million population in New York was 15,190, so our 427 compares very favorably to the high incidents that have in other parts of the country. And our 11 deaths per million population is the lowest in the entire country. And our tests of 20,000 per million is not one of the best in the whole country but Maui's testing at three percent is close to one of the best in the country so we're doing a good job in testing and we're having very low incidents.

So, finally if I haven't bored you, here's the take aways, Hawaii has the lowest incidents of Covid-19 of any state. In Hawaii it's one in 2,341 people that has contracted Covid. Nationally, it's one in 327 people, so that's seven times less incidents in Hawaii than nationally. Maui has tested at a rate that is twice the national average, three percent of our population has been tested compared to about one and half percent of people nationally, and Maui has had only five new cases in the past week, and only one new case in the past four days so we're definitely down on the lower end of this, of this curve if you will. And then finally, although we have had, you know our share of deaths, Hawaii has had the least Covid deaths per capita of any state.

So, that's a few things that to just say, lucky you live Hawaii, and Chair, that's the end of my presentation. Let's see if I can end share screen.

Mr. Carnicelli: Thank you Mr. Croly for...thanking you for taking us away from daily life and giving us that presentation on Covid and death.

Mr. Croly: I hope it wasn't about death.

Mr. Carnicelli: I guess at this point in time, we will open up the floor for public testimony. So, Director, do we have anybody that has signed up to testify on this subject?

Ms. McLean: Yes, Chair. We have one testifier and that's Jacky Takakura again.

Mr. Carnicelli: Okay.

Ms. McLean: Jacky, you need to unmute your mic.

Ms. Takakura: Sorry, about that. Okay, thank you for that presentation. It was very good. Thank you.

Mr. Carnicelli: Thank you, Jacky you have up to three minutes.

Ms. Takakura: John already took my quota, so I'll give that back.

Mr. Carnicelli: Any questions for the testifier? Seeing none, thank you, Jacky. Is there anybody that would like to come forward and testify on this item? Going once, going twice, okay we'll

close public testimony if there's no objections. And then from the commission, do you guys have any questions for Dr. Croly? Ms. Pali, followed by Ms. La Costa.

Ms. Pali: Hi, thank you, Mr. Croly for your wonderful information it appears to be pretty factual. Can you cite your resources, and can you also have those handouts available to us if we wanted to get a copy, is that something you can send to us later?

Mr. Croly: Thank you for that question. Yeah, my sources for this include the mayor's presentation was one, the Hawaii Department of Health website was the other, and then that last slide where I had all the statistics is a website called, World Meters and I've been watching that site for a number of weeks now just seeing how things go. That's a good question that you asked about presenting this thing like I could turn this into an email and email it if I had each of your emails, but I don't have that, I guess in advance of the presentation, I could have sent it to Carolyn and Carolyn could have distributed in advance, but that's a good question as to if someone's going to make a presentation, maybe you want to have it in advance, you know, in some type of hard copy so you can look at. Question for you, were you able to read all those numbers on that last slide? Yes? Thank you.

Mr. Carnicelli: For me, Tom, I had to just move the slider over and go to the bigger and then I could read it, and if I went back to like that third notch like you talked then it wasn't as easy to read, but if I expanded it, I could.

Mr. Croly: Great.

Mr. Carnicelli: Ms. La Costa, I believe you had a question for Dr. Croly.

Ms. La Costa: Thank you, Chair. Yes, Dr. Croly. My question is are any statistics broken down as far as tourist versus locals and the rates of infection and cures?

Mr. Croly: Yeah, the Department of Health website, the slide that showed with the whole curve from the top down, at the top of that it says 80 percent of the reported cases were local people traveling and bringing the virus back. They did not break down the remaining 20 percent as to how many of those were visitors versus not. But they did report that 80 percent of the cases were local people who had traveled to the mainland and brought the virus back with them. I do know from the reports that there were two cases of visitors who came here with the virus and later passed away, so there were at least visitors who brought the virus to Hawaii and then never went home, but they didn't give any more statistics about were there visitors who came here, dropped off the virus and then went home, you know, they didn't give any information about that.

Mr. Carnicelli: Anybody else have any questions for Mr. Croly? Is it in your tracking worldwide statistics, where's Sweden?

Mr. Croly: Where is Sweden? That tracking was the United States. I could go back and look up where Sweden was, but from what I heard recently they weren't way off of America's numbers, like the average American numbers. They're way higher than ours because our

number are you know, seven times lower. Where we've compared very close to was New Zealand, who yesterday declared that they had defeated the virus. Hawaii's numbers are actually less than those of New Zealand, but the New Zealand Prime Minister made a declaration yesterday we've done it, we've gotten rid of the virus and then I compared their statistics to ours and it's like, well, we actually have less cases than they do overall and less cases in the last ten days than they do overall, so Hawaii is doing about as well as the country who has declared that they won.

Mr. Carnicelli: Yeah, but I recall a certain president standing on an aircraft carrier declaring a win at some in time too...

Mr. Croly: Yeah, don't declare victory too soon.

Mr. Carnicelli: Be careful what you predict there, so okay, any other questions for Mr. Croly? Kawika.

Mr. Freitas: I've been watching that Corona Virus World Meter also and I have the answer for your Sweden country stat, what did you want to know. They're at 19,020 cases, did you want to know...what else do you want to know? I got it on my computer.

Feedback from multiple mics being open.

Mr. Carnicelli: That's okay, I'll go look it up. Thanks, Kawika. Any other questions for Mr. Croly, then I guess—

Mr. Croly: So, Chair can you vote now?

Mr. Carnicelli: Yes.

Mr. Croly: If my presentation made you all feel good enough that we can all go outside, can you vote on that? I think only the mayor can.

Mr. Carnicelli: Okay, let's see, I need a motion to, let's see...is I'll entertain a motion to end the quarantine.

Ms. McLean: I hope Mike Hopper is going to chime in about your authority here.

Mr. Hopper: Do you really need me to give you advice on the Planning Commission authority with respect to Corona Virus? I mean, I'd be happy to write a lengthy memo on that if you want.

Mr. Carnicelli: That's okay, thanks.

Mr. Croly: Actually though, it brings up a question in that, when you invoke Mr. Hopper oftentimes is because you have to go into executive session. I don't think this forum would allow you to go into executive session, would it?

Ms. McLean: I don't think so. I think that BlueJeans Events might allow that. So yeah, that's a very good point.

Mr. Hopper: I think we discussed this at the last meeting though, I think maybe what you'd want to do is have a separate dial in number set up for a contested case situation just in case. I don't know what the Council's done because they've been having a lot of meeting. I don't know if they've had an executive session, but I think that would be an option, but you can check with them. One option would be to have all the members hang up, leave the meeting, keep the meeting going, dial into a different meeting, you know, discuss there, you'd still need to keep the minutes, and then go back. But we did discuss that, we've discussed that in our office and that might be the best way to do it.

Mr. Carnicelli: Thanks Michael.

Ms. McLean: Chair, to Commissioner Pali's earlier question, if Dr. Croly wants to PDF the PowerPoint, he can email it to Carolyn and then she can distribute to the members.

Mr. Carnicelli: Okay. So, I guess we'll need a motion of some kind within our authority.  
Ms. La Costa.

Ms. La Costa: I move that the presentation created and done by Mr. Croly is distributed to all members of the planning commission.

Mr. Castro: Second.

Mr. Carnicelli: Okay, moved by Commissioner La Costa, seconded by Commissioner Castro. Would anybody like to speak to the motion? Ms. La Costa.

Ms. La Costa: I would just like to say thank you Tom for doing the research and for your presentation, it was very professional and very informative.

Mr. Carnicelli: Good job. Okay, Director.

Ms. McLean: Chair, the motion is for the presenter to forward his presentation to the commission.

Mr. Carnicelli: All those in favor please raise your hand. Okay, P Denise stuck her hand in there over this, so it's unanimous.

**It was moved by Ms. La Costa, seconded by Mr. Castro, then**

**VOTED: For the Presenter to Forward His Presentation to the Commission.  
(Assenting – P D. La Costa, S. Castro, C. Tackett, K. Pali, K. Freitas,  
D. Thompson, C. Carnicelli)  
(Absent – T. Gomes)**

So, thank you very much Mr. Croly, and if you would just go ahead, yeah, make that a PDF and shoot that over to Carolyn and then she'll distribute it to us. So, thank you. Thank you very much.

Also, just for the record, I didn't do this at the beginning when we did roll call and established quorum, but Ms. Gomes is absent, so just to have that on the record that she's not present here. Director, I believe we go to the next item?

Ms. McLean: Yesh, Chair next is Director's Report.

Mr. Carnicelli: Oh, wait, wait, wait, Kawika you had something before we move on?

Mr. Freitas: I had a few questions before we move on. We're still on this training yeah for BlueJeans. My first question to the commissioners, how many are on phone and how many are on laptop?

Mr. Carnicelli: I'm on both.

Mr. Tackett: I'm on the phone.

Mr. Freitas: You can be on both?

Ms. La Costa: I'm on laptop.

Mr. Freitas: Okay. So, it's just Chairperson and I on phone? Yeah, so when Mr. Croly had his presentation, I can't remember how to make that bigger and I didn't want to interrupt, so Chairperson said you have to slide something and I tried sliding and got everybody's faces, then I got only the small...(inaudible)...what did I do wrong.

Mr. Croly: Would you like me to put the presentation back up?

Mr. Carnicelli: Yes.

(Audio feedback...multiple mics on)

Mr. Freitas: Okay, even with my glasses I can't see those numbers, so what did you say I have to do?

Mr. Carnicelli: So, Kawika what I did...(inaudible)...screen, and then there's four little icons at the bottom. The one next to the red hang up, it's got the dot, dot, dot, touch that and then bottom left-hand if you

Mr. Castro: Sounds like you're getting a double feed.

Mr. Carnicelli: Yeah, 'cause he's got me on speaker. You know where I'm talking...(inaudible)...people view, speaker view or gallery view. Did that change it for you?

Mr. Freitas: No, I got share, audio, and people.

Mr. Carnicelli: Oh, I wonder if your...are you on your phone on the call in or are you on your phone in the BlueJeans app on your phone.

Mr. Freitas: Sorry, BlueJeans app.

Mr. Carnicelli: Okay, that's where I am too. So, but if I touch that dot, dot, dot thing it says more options, share screen, headphones, and don't know what the...invite or speaker view. So, I touched speaker view and then it gives me the layout. Although right now all I have is Tom presentation and little box of me. What do you see?

Mr. Freitas: I just have it right in the center. Tom's..

Mr. Carnicelli: Tom's presentation.

Mr. Freitas: Yes.

Mr. Carnicelli: Yeah, but it's definitely too small...on your phone.

Mr. Freitas: I'll figure out my laptop on the next one. That's fine.

Mr. Carnicelli: Okay, okay. Do you have any other questions, though, before we move on about that?

Mr. Freitas: I do, and it's not about...I think this system that we're doing, I appreciate that we're doing this practice. It's very hard to focus with everything going around, even though I'm in my house by myself, it's very different than actually being there, seeing the person live and feeling their presentation. But I think after these couple of practices I just gotta work harder on focusing and paying attention to what's being said, so I just want to thank you for having the practice sessions. Thank you.

Mr. Carnicelli: Hey Kawika if you want, once you set up your laptop, you download the app you know, onto your laptop, if you want, Michele and I can try to you know, just do one quick call in or something like that so you can see that it's working or something like, sorry to volunteer you there Michele, but I'd be willing to do that is just to make sure rather than we're doing it two weeks from now on a real call, I mean, on our, like "real meeting", but if you want to we can try to make sure that your laptop is...(inaudible)...

Mr. Freitas: Okay. In fact, I'm gonna try and get on my computer at the same time, my laptop during this meeting and see if I can get...thanks.

Mr. Carnicelli: Okay. Anything else before we move onto the next agenda item? Okay, Director.

**C. DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

**1. Discussion of Future Maui Planning Commission Agendas**

**a. May 12, 2020 agenda items**

Ms. McLean: Thank you, Chair, the next item is Director's Report where we have discussion of future commission agenda, and you should have received the email from Carolyn. I'll go ahead and share screen with the document. Can you see the memo from Mr. Yoshida?

On the next agenda we have election of officers and then three public hearing items, but because we're still working our way through BlueJeans, we scheduled relatively minor items. These are all initiated from within the Department. The first are proposed amendments to the Urban Reserve Zoning District which is not used very often. These are very minor changes. Changes to the chapter in the Code relating the accessory dwellings or ohanas, and that's just to make a clarification about fire access. This was done in coordination with the Fire Department, and then lastly is the rule amendment to your Rules of Practice and Procedure that you folks requested relating to attendance at meetings. So, those are the three public hearings we have for next time.

Then our Long Range Division will do an update on where they are with the West Maui Community Plan Update. We did email all of you to see your availability down the road for meetings on the West Maui Community Plan Update once it actually gets transmitted to you, so if you can please be sure to respond to that email with your availability and preferences on meetings to discuss that plan whether it's daytime, evening, Wailuku, Lahaina, we need to find to find out where the members and how we can get those meeting scheduled and then we can hopefully have a proposed schedule for you on the May 12<sup>th</sup> meeting. Not actual dates but just the concept, and that's it for the May12th meeting. Are there any questions on those?

Mr. Carnicelli: P Dee.

Ms. La Costa: Thank you, Chair. I think that it is important that commissioners come to the west side irrespective of that's where I live because the people who have been at every meeting, and there have been a solid 15 people core that have been at every single CPAC meeting. I think that it is incumbent upon us to go to them and hear what they have to say on their input rather than us expecting them to take time out of their day to come to us. So, I think it should be in the evening and on the west side at least one or two of the meetings.

Mr. Carnicelli: And if I could add, Michele and Pam and Jen and I had a call last week and we kinda talked about it, and we're looking at hopefully, crossing our fingers, our process to be six or seven meetings is all. You know, we're not going to be, I think CPAC's into pushing 30 meetings or something. That's not what we're gonna do, is we're gonna be focused and kinda...so it's not, you know whatever we're doing it's not gonna be saying okay, we're committing every Saturday for the next six years to this or something. But yeah, is if you would just respond to that email. Yeah, Kellie.

Ms. Pali: I just want to add in, I responded to the email already and I totally get what P Denise is saying I respect that perspective but I don't agree with it. I look at it that we're all volunteers and we're not getting paid, we're not elected officials, there's no salary and we all have to survive by committing our time elsewhere so that we can volunteer and so for me as a single mom, I don't think it's fair that I have to then pay for babysitters which I wouldn't do, and figure out more additional burdens on my schedule so that I can be more available to the public. And these public people are important, but I'm already going out of my way to volunteer as an appointed commissioner, so I think, I feel very comfortable with saying, I don't mind giving a lot more of my time to this as volunteer committed to a five-year term, but if you have testimony, I think it's quite all right that you get in your car and you drive to Wailuku and tell me how you feel. So, I think I respect her perspective, but I don't agree with it. And so, I've already just putting it out there, have said I'm not available in the evenings and I'm not available to go to Lahaina, just being transparent.

Mr. Carnicelli: Thanks, thanks Kellie. Anybody else want to weigh in. Kawika how you doing on your computer, were you able to download the app and get in at all? Not yet? Okay. I guess that's it for this particular item. Director.

Ms. McLean: Yep. Commissioner Freitas if you want to...if you feel like you have the program downloaded on your laptop, let me know and then we can try to schedule something as the Chair suggested, the three of us, just having our own BlueJeans meeting just to talk through and practice a few things.

Mr. Freitas: Okay.

Ms. McLean: So, that's it, Chair. Our next meeting is the regular meeting of May 12<sup>th</sup>, and that as far as I know will be by BlueJeans and then after that, who knows, maybe at some point soon we can get back to meetings in person.

Mr. Carnicelli: We should have had that motion to end the quarantine. Thank you very much everybody, greatly appreciate it. Thank you for your time and dedication, again. Really, really appreciate it, stay safe, we are blessed as Mr. Croly had said. So, meeting is adjourned.

**E. NEXT REGULAR MEETING DATE: MAY 12, 2020**

**F. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 10:03 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted by,

CAROLYN TAKAYAMA-CORDEN  
Secretary to Boards and Commissions II



**RECORD OF ATTENDANCE**

**Present**

Lawrence Carnicelli, Chair  
Stephen Castro  
Kawika Freitas  
P Denise La Costa  
Kellie Pali  
Christian Tackett, Vice Chair  
Dale Thompson

**Absent**

Tina Gomes

**Others**

Michele McLean, Director, Department of Planning  
Michael Hopper, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel