

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

FIRE AND PUBLIC SAFETY COMMISSION

COUNTY OF MAUI

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

REGULAR MEETING

Held via BlueJeans, commencing at 10:04 a.m., on
October 20, 2022.

REPORTED BY: SANDRA J. GRAN, RPR/CSR #424

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ATTENDANCE

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

- Kyle Ginoza, Chair
- Lisa Vares, Vice Chair
- Dwight Burns, Member
- Punahеле Alcon, Member
- Max Kincaid, Jr., Member

STAFF:

- Bradford Ventura, Fire Chief
- Gavin Fujioka, Deputy Fire Chief
- Jeffrey Gieseа, Assistant Fire Chief
- Hanalei Lindo, Assistant Fire Chief
- Daniel Kunkel, Deputy Corporation Counsel
- Richelle Wakamatsu, Commission Secretary
- Herman Andaya, Maui Emergency Management Agency

1 (October 20, 2022, 10:04 a.m.)

2 * * *

3 CHAIR GINOZA: Good morning, everyone. It is 10:04,
4 Thursday, October 20th, and I'd like to -- I apologize for the
5 delay in starting, but I'd like to call to order the
6 department of fire -- I'm sorry, the fire and public safety
7 commission meeting for today. My name is Kyle Ginoza, chair
8 of the commission. I'd like to start off by -- with roll
9 call.

10 Vice Chair Lisa Vares.

11 VICE CHAIR VARES: I am in attendance, and I'm in my
12 mobile office in Honokowai.

13 CHAIR GINOZA: Great. Thank you, Lisa.

14 VICE CHAIR VARES: And I'm alone.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Dwight Burns.

16 COMMISSIONER BURNS: Here, and I am in my vacation
17 rental in Kona by myself.

18 CHAIR GINOZA: Great. Thank you, Dwight.

19 Punahale Alcon.

20 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Here in my office alone on
21 Molokai.

22 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Punahale.

23 Max Kincaid, Jr.

24 COMMISSIONER KINCAID: (Inaudible.)

25 CHAIR GINOZA: Where did he go? Max?

1 COMMISSIONER ALCON: I think he's on mute.

2 COMMISSIONER KINCAID: I'm here.

3 CHAIR GINOZA: Oh.

4 COMMISSIONER KINCAID: At home in my office, and I
5 have my wife as backup.

6 CHAIR GINOZA: Great. Thank you, Max.

7 Makalapua mentioned that she's not able to make it,
8 and I don't think Gordon is able to make it, so we have five
9 members, and so we have quorum. And I am alone at my house in
10 Wailuku.

11 So before we go to the minutes, is there anybody
12 wishing to testify from the public about our minutes?

13 Richelle, anybody signed up to testify?

14 MS. WAKAMATSU: Not in person.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, good. And if anybody has
16 any -- wants to testify from the public, he or she may do so
17 or be recognized at this time.

18 (No response.)

19 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, let's just
20 move on to the item. So for the September 15 minutes from our
21 last meeting, I trust everyone has had a chance to review the
22 minutes, and I'd like a motion to accept the minutes from last
23 month.

24 COMMISSIONER BURNS: Motion to accept the minutes.

25 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Dwight. And a second?

1 COMMISSIONER KINCAID: I'll second.

2 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Max.

3 And so since we have bare quorum, let's -- I'll do a
4 roll call vote on each item. So unless anybody has any
5 comments, Lisa, are you in favor?

6 VICE CHAIR VARES: (Inaudible.)

7 CHAIR GINOZA: Yes? Okay.

8 VICE CHAIR VARES: Okay, yes. Sorry, I couldn't hit
9 the button. Yes, I'm in favor.

10 CHAIR GINOZA: Dwight.

11 COMMISSIONER BURNS: Aye.

12 CHAIR GINOZA: Punahale.

13 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Yes.

14 CHAIR GINOZA: Max.

15 COMMISSIONER KINCAID: Yes.

16 CHAIR GINOZA: And I approve as well.

17 So the minutes from the last meeting are approved.

18 The next item is -- sorry, you know what I forgot to
19 do at roll call -- I keep forgetting -- is to recognize who
20 else we have as resources. So, Chief Ventura.

21 CHIEF VENTURA: Aloha, good morning. We are here at
22 Kahului Fire Station conference room. In the room with me are
23 Chief Fujioka, Chief Lindo, Chief Giese, and off-camera
24 Richelle Wakamatsu.

25 CHAIR GINOZA: Great. Thank you, Chief.

1 And we have Dan Kunkel. Thank you, Dan, for joining
2 us.

3 MR. KUNKEL: Yes, aloha, and I'm sorry I was late at
4 the last meeting. Sorry about that. (Inaudible.)

5 CHAIR GINOZA: No problem. Thank you so much.

6 And I don't think we have Herman yet, so let's move
7 on to -- I know we just had this, but let's move on to actual
8 public testimony from the public on any agenda item. And as I
9 mentioned in previous meetings, I'll ask for public testimony
10 throughout, but this is the more formalized portion of public
11 testimony.

12 So, Richelle, unless somebody signed up in the last
13 15 seconds, I assume no one's there to testify.

14 MS. WAKAMATSU: No.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, thank you.

16 Anyone on the call wishing to testify?

17 (No response.)

18 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, public
19 testimony is closed for that item.

20 And, Herman, are you on?

21 (No response.)

22 CHAIR GINOZA: I don't see him, so let's skip the
23 MEMA portion of our meeting and move on to the fire
24 department. Before I call on Chief Ventura, if there's anyone
25 wishing to testify, please be recognized.

1 (No response.)

2 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, Chief
3 Ventura.

4 CHIEF VENTURA: Aloha, good morning, Commissioners.
5 Thank you all for being here today. I know your time is
6 valuable. I apologize, we do have quite a lengthy agenda
7 today, and I have a lot to go over with you.

8 So first, with my handouts, I'll just kind of give
9 it a cursory review and see if there's any questions from you
10 as a commission. One thing we did notice is the dip in fire
11 calls this past month due to a little bit of rain, and with
12 last night's weather forecast being shared with us from the
13 National Weather that we're supposed to have a wetter than
14 normal winter, we're looking for the county greening up a bit
15 more and our brush fires subduing for the season.

16 Training, we're still staying busy with training.
17 Chief Lindo will go over some of the specifics, but our
18 recruit class is doing well. They're coming out of a few
19 different disciplines right now, and upcoming is their
20 wildland and auto extrication training. Their graduation is
21 still set for the first week of December. We also have our
22 ocean safety recruit class going on, and they are active as
23 well in various beach locations this week.

24 Turning our attention to the monthly update, which
25 is the two-pager, and, you know, we're just trying to keep as

1 much open lines of communication with our members regarding
2 the budget, regarding the recruitments and promotions, those
3 are all things that are really important to our ocean safety
4 officers and firefighters, so if they have questions, that's
5 what prompts us to put things on this monthly update so that
6 I'm sure if one person has a question, others have questions.

7 Page 2 of that is a picture review of our
8 lifeguard -- our junior lifeguard program this year. It was
9 the first year since COVID that we've kind of got it going
10 again, and next year we think it's gonna hopefully grow to the
11 more remote locations that -- we gave space to those remote
12 locations this year, Hana, Molokai, Lanai because we
13 understand that COVID was still cause for concern in that
14 area. So, yeah, we had a good turnout here in the Maui area,
15 and the kids had a great time this summer.

16 The memorial flier that's in there for our Captain
17 Jeff Robson, who passed away September 5th. We were able to
18 support the family, and we had a wonderful celebration of life
19 on September 23rd for him at Hope Church of Kihei Community
20 Center was an all-day affair. There were several -- there was
21 a couple hundred firefighters, police officers, lifeguards in
22 attendance, so it was very, very nice to see everybody, even
23 though the occasion was very sad.

24 I also want to make sure, and I believe Richelle
25 sent out to everybody the annual report. A lot of many months

1 of data collection and effort goes into creating this product
2 that comes out every September. If you peruse through it and
3 you have questions, please feel free to reach out to us. If
4 you do see things that are not in there and you do want to see
5 in there in the future, then please let us know that as well,
6 and we can add pages or modify charts or such to make sure
7 you're seeing what parts of the department you want to see.

8 Those are the handouts. I'll get into my report
9 now; two pages there for you. We have a lot of budget stuff
10 going on this month and next month as we prepare next fiscal
11 year's budget. So meetings with the mayor and the budget
12 director have both been centered around next year's budget,
13 but we've also had meetings with the mayor in regards to our
14 CIP projects that Chief Gieseck will go over later. Probably
15 one of the recent milestones is that the notice to proceed was
16 given on Lanai so that they can start the construction of that
17 apparatus bay behind the current station, so that's -- that's
18 good.

19 Again, budget, like I said, I'll talk a bunch about
20 that. I'm also gonna ask for some input from the
21 commissioners, from some commissioners today as we prepare our
22 budget. We have a new software system that the budget office
23 is using this year called Finance Enterprise, and historically
24 we would provide paper documentation to the budget office, and
25 they would install it into the software; well, this year,

1 that's falling on our department, so our finance and our HR
2 sections are gonna be responsible for inputting into this new
3 software. It's brand new, there has been training on it, and
4 they're working out quite a few glitches right now to try to
5 make sure it works as best as it can for the county, but the
6 budget office has all the answers every time we have
7 questions, so that's been very good.

8 We are attending community budget meetings which are
9 ongoing from about two weeks ago through the end of the month
10 at various locations. This week Monday, we were in Kihei
11 Community Center; Tuesday night, we were at Pukalani; next
12 week Wednesday, we'll -- Thursday, we'll be in Paia; two weeks
13 ago, we were in Wailuku, and it's an opportunity for us to
14 give an overview of our department, meet with members from the
15 community, and if they have any input for our department
16 regarding budget items or suggestions, then that's their
17 opportunity to communicate with us in a face-to-face forum so
18 that they can provide input to the county's budget system. So
19 we've had good conversations, but not really a lot of requests
20 from the community as far as increasing, you know, certain
21 specific items in our budget, but we've had a lot of support
22 from the community there.

23 Looking at the council interactions, the -- Tamara
24 Paltin, council member, had some questions about Olowalu and
25 that fire station, as well as there's a neighborhood being

1 built right now off of Keawe Street on the north side, and
2 there was some questions regarding egress for that
3 neighborhood. So wildfire concerns are legitimate concerns
4 out there on the west side of Maui, and some of these
5 neighborhoods being built, we're looking for two points of
6 egress for every neighborhood in case a wildfire impacts the
7 neighborhood. And so since they couldn't get a second
8 entry/exit point in this neighborhood, we're working with her
9 to see if we need to create an agreement with a private
10 landowner next to this neighborhood so that we can provide an
11 exit for those neighbors if something ever happens at the
12 entry of their -- of their neighborhood. And again, like I
13 said, this is just groundbreaking off of Keawe Street. Right
14 now, they're doing all the earthwork.

15 Councilmember Sinenci reached out to us regarding a
16 structure fire that happened out in Hana and had some
17 questions regarding some of the events that took place. We
18 were able to answer his questions satisfactorily. I also
19 called his office to follow up to make sure they didn't have
20 any additional questions and provide any support, and they
21 were -- they were happy with our answers and -- to their
22 questions.

23 I also attended an evening Zoom meeting for Hana,
24 and that was hosted by Councilmember Sinenci and just to see
25 what the public had to say in regards to a lot of topics going

1 on out on Hana, but the potential of fire department expansion
2 and lifeguard expansion did come up out there, so
3 Councilmember Sinenci is asking the community to provide
4 testimony in support so that they can try to make it an
5 initiative in the future if there's enough community desire
6 for something like that.

7 Our fire code is currently with the Maui County
8 Council Infrastructure Transportation Committee. It's gone
9 through first reading. I sat in on the meeting with our fire
10 prevention bureau and answered questions that council members
11 had. Basically what happens is the state adopts the fire
12 code, and then the counties put on their own amendments.
13 Every county has a different fee schedule; every county has
14 different rules. We have separate rules for our fireworks
15 shows because we have shows on Lanai and possibly Molokai, so
16 we have different rules than Honolulu, Big Island, or Kauai
17 would have, so those are amendments that were made, and that
18 is going through its approval process right now in council.

19 Sticking with the budget theme, I'd like to ask --
20 it has come up in our commission meetings and as we prepare
21 our budget for next year, instead of being reactive and
22 hearing from you after we -- I give my presentation next month
23 on the budget, while we put the budget items in in the next
24 two weeks and we prepare, there's been talks about Pukoo Fire
25 Station will eventually move to Ualapue and to make it a

1 three-man station versus a two-man station. I would like to
2 provide data to you all, and then you can either email
3 Richelle support for or against it, or we can talk about it
4 here, whatever the body decides to do. But you currently know
5 that Pukoo Fire Station is a two-man fire station, it has a
6 captain and a driver as soon as we get the reallocations
7 complete and the reorgs done this year that's in progress
8 right now with the managing director's office and the mayor's
9 office. But there was talk about increasing the number of
10 firefighters there to three by a testifier as well as
11 Commissioner Alcon, so I want to honor that as she suggested
12 earlier and see if it is something that you guys would like us
13 to put in this coming year's budget for an additional
14 firefighter out there. We believe right now, the house and
15 the way it's set up can have another firefighter fit in there.

16 So that data behind that, just to share with you
17 guys, the Pukoo Fire Station currently runs about 106 calls
18 per year, about nine calls a month that comes out to, and in
19 the last 22 months, they had about 21 fires that they
20 responded to. Most were probably in their district, some of
21 them may have been support to Kaunakakai and fires in their
22 district, but those are the numbers. If we are looking at
23 adding an additional firefighter 1 per watch, we're looking at
24 hiring three additional firefighters and with salary and
25 premium pay, guaranteed overtime, all the things that go into

1 their -- the budget item for their salary, we're looking at
2 about \$66,000 a year per firefighter, so that just kind of
3 gives everybody an idea.

4 My perspective, our administration's perspective on
5 more stations, more lifeguard towers, more firefighters is
6 it's always gonna make it safer for everybody, including the
7 first responders and the community, so we'll always be in
8 support of it. But the only time that we'll kind of cry wolf,
9 or we'll speak up is when we see a negative effect or impact
10 on operations or safety of our members, and then we'll speak
11 up and say we need an additional station or we need additional
12 personnel to just be more compliant and safer for our
13 community.

14 So before I go any further, does anybody have any
15 questions or comments regarding that so I can make sure I try
16 to answer them?

17 VICE CHAIR VARES: (Gesturing.)

18 CHAIR GINOZA: Any commissioner have any question?

19 VICE CHAIR VARES: I've got one, Chief.

20 CHAIR GINOZA: Lisa. Lisa.

21 VICE CHAIR VARES: Hey. Yes, I do. Thank you. Can
22 you hear me?

23 CHAIR GINOZA: Yes.

24 VICE CHAIR VARES: Yeah, okay. Good morning, Chief.
25 Thank you, first of all, for taking Chair Ginoza and I over to

1 Molokai and letting us actually talk one on one with the
2 members at all those fire stations on Molokai; that was really
3 enlightening. And then specifically about this station, we
4 wanted to know, just talking to them, what the -- what the
5 benefit of -- or how they felt about getting a third on board
6 or the benefit was, and I believe -- I can't remember the
7 gentleman's name, he mentioned how the bulk of their calls are
8 medical and that the bulk of their calls are obviously about
9 40 minutes away usually, and that if it's something like CPR,
10 you know, there's just two of them running CPR on someone
11 that, you know, help is about an hour away and it's usually
12 someone you know and that it just can be a very difficult task
13 to do when you're kind of running on a small crew like that.
14 If you do give us the information -- while you are giving us
15 the information about that specific station, could you break
16 it down into medical calls versus fire calls and that kind of
17 thing?

18 CHIEF VENTURA: Certainly. So I can break it down a
19 little further for you. The period that we researched was
20 January of 2020 to October of 2022, so about 21 and a half
21 months or so. During that period, it was 194 EMS calls, 21
22 fires, about 67 what we consider like service or good intent
23 calls, so those sometimes can be we just showed up, and there
24 was actually no emergency and we left, and then nine hazardous
25 condition calls, so that can be -- that could be anything.

1 That's the breakdown. Then they have two false alarms here.
2 So that's the breakdown from fire to EMS, which is -- which is
3 the trend through the rest of the department, about 70 to 80
4 percent is medical responses.

5 VICE CHAIR VARES: Okay, excellent. Thank you. And
6 then the new location will also have room for three if a third
7 is brought on staff, correct?

8 CHIEF VENTURA: Yeah, we'll be able to fit three
9 there.

10 VICE CHAIR VARES: Tight, but you can do it. Okay,
11 thank you. Thanks for offering to provide all that
12 information for us. That's all I've got. Thank you.

13 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you.

14 Did you say that it's from January 2020 until last
15 month or this month?

16 CHIEF VENTURA: Correct. So we ran the report from
17 January 1st, 2020, to October 10th, 2022.

18 CHAIR GINOZA: So isn't that not 22 months, but like
19 34 months?

20 CHIEF VENTURA: Correction, sorry, yes. The notes
21 here are wrong.

22 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, just clarifying.

23 Does any --

24 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Yeah, I have a question.

25 CHAIR GINOZA: Go ahead, Punahale.

1 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Can we pull stats from
2 pre-COVID? Because from a hospital perspective, our visits
3 went way down during the period of COVID just because people
4 were hunkering down at home and stuff, so perhaps we could get
5 maybe a 24-month period of stats pre-COVID to compare them
6 with the COVID period that you reported on. From a hospital
7 perspective, we went from 25-30 visits per day to the majority
8 of the days during COVID less than ten visits in our ER, so I
9 just kind of want to gauge were there -- was there more calls
10 pre-COVID, less calls during that COVID period? It's really
11 hard to gauge what the volume really is.

12 CHIEF VENTURA: Certainly. We'll do that, and then
13 I'll have Richelle send it out to everybody.

14 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Yeah, thank you. And you
15 think, I think, you know, the eastern area of Molokai is
16 really remote, and we ran a really small staff here at the
17 hospital, and it is hard to respond to medical calls. At
18 night we only have one doc, two nurses, and a CNA on, so I can
19 imagine how difficult it might be down at the east end to
20 respond to medical calls coming in. My coworker took her
21 husband, they were camping down on the east end, and he had an
22 episode, and she drove him to the fire station at Pukoo. And
23 they did the best that they can, but I would imagine if they
24 had a third person on, they could have responded better while
25 they waited for EMS to get down to the east end. The issue

1 was EMS drove so slowly because they were trying to avoid deer
2 banging with their ambulance, so to her, it took forever for
3 them to come and pick him up. Just something to think about.

4 CHIEF VENTURA: Definitely. Yeah, the deer issue on
5 Molokai has been real.

6 COMMISSIONER ALCON: It's ridiculous.

7 CHIEF VENTURA: Our firefighters have had deer
8 strikes with the engines.

9 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. Thank you for that insight.

10 CHIEF VENTURA: If it's okay with you, Chair, I'll
11 move on to the back page of my notes for everybody.

12 (Inaudible.)

13 CHAIR GINOZA: Real quick, can you -- can you just
14 kind of explain the process of when you are meeting with the
15 mayor and when it's kind of due? Because I know we -- I
16 believe we provide the kind of final approval before you
17 submit it to the mayor, so I just want to make sure -- I think
18 you said that next month we would be kind of looking at
19 everything, but could you just kind of go over that real
20 quick?

21 CHIEF VENTURA: Certainly. So the budget process is
22 we get the directions, the written directions, basically in
23 October. We've gone over them, we've asked our questions, and
24 the -- we have to package everything up and input it into the
25 new software by November 17th, which, unfortunately, is before

1 our next commission meeting. So normally what we do is we ask
2 the mayor's office -- and it's always granted because we have
3 a commission -- that we will -- we have to present our budget
4 to the commission, and per charter, it says that the
5 commission should review and send the budget to the mayor. It
6 doesn't put a lot of burden on you all to create or build or,
7 you know, document; it's just to review it. And so, in next
8 month's meeting, then, I'll create a presentation that will
9 cover all of the items that we're suggesting for this upcoming
10 budget and at that point, if you guys have suggestions, then
11 what we can do is I've already talked to the budget office,
12 we'll bring those suggestions directly to the budget office,
13 and they will input it into the software because the software
14 is gonna be locked on November 17th.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. So you'd appreciate some input
16 prior to the next meeting, but we still would have ample
17 opportunity to provide input at that meeting for future
18 consideration?

19 CHIEF VENTURA: Absolutely.

20 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

21 CHIEF VENTURA: We just want to be as proactive as
22 we can. If we can put it in the budget already --

23 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

24 CHIEF VENTURA: -- we're one step ahead. But if
25 things pop up and -- after our presentation next month and

1 you're -- you have things we haven't thought about, then we
2 can ask the budget office to add it to the budget.

3 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, great. Thank you. So, yeah,
4 why don't you finish off your report? And I noticed Herman
5 joined us, so after you're finished with yours, then let's
6 kind of pause this agenda item and have Herman go, go forward.
7 Thank you.

8 CHIEF VENTURA: Okay. So the back page of my report
9 covers a variety of miscellaneous items. It's been a really,
10 really busy month. We've been all over the place. State fire
11 council, which meets once a quarter, is meeting back in person
12 again, so we were in Honolulu. At that time, the governor did
13 a proclamation for Fire Prevention Week, and so we met with
14 the governor as well as all the fire chiefs on that day.

15 September 11th has come and gone, so we had a bell
16 ceremony here at Station 10. Our plan over the next couple of
17 years is just to have nice concise ceremonies to remember
18 those who lost their lives that day, and then on the larger
19 years, 25th anniversary, 30-year anniversary, then maybe a
20 larger event. We also talked with ARF about doing a
21 combination event. If you recall, the tax on 9/11 created
22 the -- basically created the TSA department, so at the
23 airport, when they do a 9/11 ceremony, a lot of the TSA
24 employees do come and partake in the ceremony. So we're just
25 trying to work together to, you know, be more supportive of

1 each other and continue to move this ceremony on years after
2 years.

3 We went to the county board of ethics for an
4 opinion. The Olowalu Fire Station, as you all know, they're
5 gonna be doing fund-raising, and they would like to include
6 firefighters and the fire chief's office at these fundraisers
7 so that if people have questions, that they can -- we'll be
8 there in person to ask them. So because a lot of these
9 fundraisers include food, a free meal, we took it to the board
10 of ethics to get an opinion if we are able to attend or not.
11 And just last week, we did get an official in writing from the
12 board of ethics supporting our activity and attendance at
13 these events, both for chief officers and for firefighters.
14 And I had suggested to them if they wanted to not include
15 chief officers, that's okay. If the firefighters were able to
16 go, they could just split us in half, but they approved
17 everybody to go. So this Sunday, Olowalu Point will be having
18 a brunch fundraiser to kind of kick off their campaign to
19 raise funds for that station.

20 The airport access road here, right behind our
21 station, received a new name dedication. We attended that
22 ceremony, and it's now named the Mayor Elmer F. Carvalho Way.
23 And so that was a nice ceremony with his family, and a lot of
24 state leaders were there that day.

25 Ualapue Station, we have two sets of consultations

1 happening right now on that property: G70 and they are doing
2 the environmental assessment, archaeological work; and then
3 the architects, a separate agency, the Nishikawa Architects
4 firm, is doing the planning and the design of the remodel
5 portion of the project. So those are both working in tandem
6 on the same project, so they've actually been on the property,
7 and they'll be accessing the property, actually, today. They
8 were there again today.

9 Department of forestry and wildlife, this was a
10 great mutual aid fire that we had on Molokai. We were able to
11 help them immensely by actually flying in their personnel on
12 our aircraft. So as you all know and we've talked about for a
13 year now, the aircraft holds nine people, so they were able to
14 fly in six or seven personnel plus all their equipment on one
15 flight and insert them into the very, very, you know,
16 mountainous regional area where otherwise people would have to
17 hike into. So they were -- that was a good fire that we
18 worked on together and were able to help them getting them in
19 and off of Molokai.

20 Once a year, our annual captains' meeting happens.
21 It's quite the day because we take all 51 of our captains,
22 overtime and off the line, and we meet and discuss any issues
23 or topics that they would like clarity on, provide, you know,
24 policy clarification. We're able to kind of get people kind
25 of realigned and on the same page. So that meeting happened

1 on June -- or September 22nd, and that was a -- that was a
2 really good, good day, good meeting for all of our chief and
3 captain officers.

4 As Vice Chair Vares mentioned, we did a tour of
5 Molokai fire stations. The firefighters were very receptive,
6 and they enjoyed seeing the commissioners and the chiefs and
7 kind of just talking story and being -- you know, being able
8 to have their voices heard, so that's always good. We always
9 support that at any station with any of you. It doesn't have
10 to be overly organized. If any of you want to go to a station
11 at any time, just let us know, we will -- we'll meet you
12 there.

13 The lifeguard towers, we have had three of the
14 towers' mural projects completed, and Vice Chair Vares has
15 been helping me with that project. She has connections in the
16 community with muralists and local artists. And so next month
17 what we're gonna see in the monthly report is you're gonna see
18 the three pictures of the murals, and so that's -- that's just
19 a great way -- we've had great feedback from the ocean safety
20 officers. Of course, the artists love the project. And
21 they're very unique to the beaches and districts that they're
22 in, so it turned out -- it turned out pretty cool.

23 Commissioner Gillis is not with us today, but one of
24 the things he does on the side is with the Red Cross. And I
25 recently, flying back from Honolulu, was approached by some

1 people who wanted to volunteer, so I talked to them about our
2 CERT program, and I also talked to them about Red Cross. And
3 I put them in contact with Jenny Worth, who's the Maui
4 director, and so that, hey, anybody -- everybody's always
5 looking for volunteers, and if these people are willing to do
6 it, then that's great that we can be the conduit to these
7 nonprofits.

8 As I take a quick glance, I think that concludes
9 everything I have for you in my report.

10 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Chief Ventura.

11 Any commissioners have any questions for the chief?

12 (No response.)

13 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, thank you so
14 much.

15 Before we move on to Chief Fujioka, Herman, are you
16 there?

17 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Mr. Chair, yes, I'm here.

18 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. If you don't mind, can we go
19 over your item at this time?

20 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Yes. Thank you very much for
21 taking --

22 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you.

23 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: And I'm sorry for signing in
24 late. I was in another meeting. Actually, we were planning
25 the civil support team National Guard exercise for next year,

1 and we lost track of time, so I apologize for signing in late.

2 CHAIR GINOZA: No problem. Thank you.

3 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Thank you.

4 With respect to our operations -- and I do want to
5 thank Chief Ventura for mentioning CERT. CERT is the
6 community emergency response team, and our hands-on class
7 starts tonight, actually. So we've had many students who have
8 signed up to become volunteers for CERT, and we're doing
9 what's called a -- it's a hybrid class right now because of
10 COVID. So half the class is done online and then the other
11 half, once you have done -- completed the online course, then
12 you can do the -- the hands-on course, and that way we're
13 trying to limit, you know, contact and whatnot. So that is a
14 class that's put on -- that's taught by the fire department,
15 and so I want to thank the fire department for their support
16 of this program. And like I've mentioned before, our goal is
17 to have a thousand active members of CERT throughout --
18 throughout the county and specifically in our remote areas:
19 Molokai, Lanai, and Hana. The whole purpose of CERT is, you
20 know, we embed these emergency response volunteers in these
21 communities because we know that it's gonna be difficult
22 getting help to these communities. Say they become isolated,
23 so we want to have these volunteers in the community so that
24 they can assist their -- the members of their community during
25 a disaster. So I'd like to encourage -- as Chief Ventura has

1 done, encourage all of you to please help us look for
2 volunteers in your respective communities so that we can grow
3 this program.

4 We've been working with the DOE with respect to
5 active shooter planning and whatnot. So we meet with them
6 monthly, and we are planning to do an exercise at some point
7 with them. And our role is to support the police department,
8 and this is done through creating a family assistance center.
9 So as we saw in Uvalde, the shootings in Uvalde, we have a lot
10 of parents that go to the -- go to the school. They're very
11 concerned about their children and all of that, and that --
12 that's where we want to be able to redirect them to another
13 facility where they can get this information, and they can
14 still -- you know, they can keep away as the police then can
15 do their work. So that's something that we've been working
16 with the DOE and the American Red Cross on creating.

17 We've been seeing a lot of earthquakes lately.
18 There's some on the Big -- some of it's from the Big Island,
19 so we've been monitoring that, keeping a close watch on that.
20 And, you know, our fear is tsunamis, you know, so we're
21 keeping an eye on that. There was one this morning in Panama;
22 in fact, we were up at two o'clock in the morning watching
23 this. There was an earthquake there, and there was a possible
24 threat of a tsunami so -- but at some point, they determined
25 that there was no tsunami generated, so -- but, you know, just

1 to give you an idea, you know, we do monitor and keep an eye
2 on these things.

3 We have new employees at MEMA, and for the first
4 time, we are fully -- fully staffed. So this is after I can't
5 remember how many -- it's been years, but we are finally fully
6 staffed. And so we just brought on board Joshua Aquinde.
7 Joshua is a former MPD officer. He's also the commander of
8 the National Guard unit here on Maui, so he's an army officer,
9 a captain, and so -- and he's also a planner. So we have him
10 on board.

11 We also hired Darryl Takeda. Darryl Takeda is a
12 mechanical engineer by training, but he also has a graduate
13 degree in intermodal transportation, so he's gonna be very
14 helpful for us with respect to logistics, the delivery of
15 supplies and other things to areas impacted by disasters.

16 And finally, we got Gaye Gabuat. Gay is our
17 secretary, but she is also very much involved with, like, for
18 instance, our social media presence, and so you -- I think
19 some of you are seeing now more posts coming out from our --
20 from our offices.

21 And I do want to thank the fire department, whoever
22 does your social media. Every time we put out a post, fire is
23 very quick to share our posts and amplify our messaging, so I
24 want to thank the fire department for doing that. And we try
25 to do the same as well. Whenever the fire department puts out

1 a post, we try to -- we share to our followers as well, so --
2 but thank you for that.

3 You probably heard on the news yesterday FEMA did
4 obligate 1.4 million reimbursement for COVID response. And
5 that's just a partial allocation, there's much more, but we
6 did get obligated \$1.4 million.

7 And then we had one of our employees recently go to
8 Molokai to install ham radio there. We also did it on Lanai
9 as well. And then also he was there to check on our FEMA
10 supply container, so he made a list of things that need to be
11 replaced, and we'll be doing that soon as well. Also, there
12 were supplies that went out to Molokai, Lanai, and Hana as
13 well.

14 That's all I have, Mr. Chair, pending any questions.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Herman.

16 Are there any questions from commissioners?

17 COMMISSIONER ALCON: I have a question.

18 CHAIR GINOZA: Punahеле, go ahead.

19 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Herman, you know for the
20 Molokai supply container?

21 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Yes.

22 COMMISSIONER ALCON: In the event of an emergency,
23 is some -- does someone on Molokai have the key to get into
24 the container?

25 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Yes, Commissioner. It is our

1 commander on Molokai.

2 COMMISSIONER ALCON: And who is that?

3 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: The police commander on
4 Molokai.

5 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Okay.

6 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Yeah. So he has -- he has the
7 key. We also, in case for whatever reason he's not able, you
8 know, he's not able to respond, or he's not -- you know, if
9 he's -- if something happened to him, we also -- what we did
10 was we put in a combination, you know, it's a combination lock
11 and key. So in the event that, you know, like say, you know,
12 we can't -- he can't find the key or whatever, whatever it is,
13 you know, we can ask someone -- give them the combination, and
14 they can go and open it, so we have that contingency.

15 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Okay, thank you.

16 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Thank you, Commissioner.

17 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you. Any other quick --

18 COMMISSIONER KINCAID: Herman.

19 CHAIR GINOZA: Oh, go ahead, Max.

20 COMMISSIONER KINCAID: Herman, who would be the ham
21 operator on Lanai?

22 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: You know, I don't have that
23 person's name, but I understand there's somebody -- oh, I'm
24 sorry. We have another person, Tessie Morimoto, so she's
25 been -- not Morimoto.

1 COMMISSIONER KINCAID: That's her name.

2 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Tessie from -- used to work
3 for MPD. And I believe she just -- she just moved to another
4 job, but she will continue to be our ham radio operator on
5 Lanai. So she has been participating -- we've been having
6 exercises, regular exercises, and so she's been the one who
7 has been calling in, so we know for sure that we have that
8 ability to communicate with Lanai if need be. And then, of
9 course, we're seeking for other ham radio operators as well,
10 so if you know someone or -- you know, that's interested,
11 please have them contact our office and, you know, we'll be --
12 we'll be glad to have them, you know, be on board. The test,
13 it's just a test that you have to take in order to become a
14 ham radio operator. I've taken the test, I'm licensed, so if
15 I can do it, anybody can.

16 COMMISSIONER KINCAID: Okay. Thank you, Herman.

17 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Thank you. Thank you,
18 Commissioner.

19 CHAIR GINOZA: Any other questions from
20 commissioners?

21 (No response.)

22 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, thank you so
23 much, Herman.

24 MEMA OFFICER ANDAYA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25 CHAIR GINOZA: Let's move on to Chief -- oh, is

1 there anybody wishing to testify on any agenda item at this
2 time from the public?

3 (No response.)

4 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, let's move
5 on to Chief Fujioka's report, please.

6 DEPUTY CHIEF FUJIOKA: Good morning. Thank you,
7 Chair. Good morning, Commissioners. We'll go over my report.
8 Pretty short and sweet this month. We did complete our
9 interviews for our storekeeper 1 positions. We're currently
10 in the process of having them go through their pre-employment
11 paperwork.

12 For the department improvement committees, we met
13 with Dr. Alicia Rodrigues on developing a more comprehensive
14 mental health program for our department and seeing what other
15 items she can offer for our members.

16 We're also in the early stages of developing our own
17 Maui Fire website, which is gonna be separate from the county
18 website. So we would like to have you guys, if you have any
19 input, please send any recommendations to Richelle 'cause
20 we're definitely in the early stages of it.

21 For apparatus, we did have our OS, ocean safety,
22 equipment bids come in. I believe for the -- our UTVs, ATVs,
23 and rescue watercrafts, we have all -- I think we're all
24 contracted now, so that -- that completes our ocean safety
25 equipment procurement for this FY '23 budget as part of the

1 larger -- larger equipment, so those are all contracted.

2 Some union interactions. HGEA, we had a step one
3 grievance with one of our employees. That hearing or meeting
4 was completed in September, and we got that worked out. HFFA,
5 we had a meeting with the HFFA president and board members
6 here and discussed multiple items. We also consulted with
7 HFFA on a promotion process regarding our 40-hour bureau
8 positions, and that is in the works, and we've got some
9 agreement with that.

10 And, you know, transmittals from the public, just a
11 bunch of appreciation emails and letters from the public with
12 the professionalism of our members. One crew was out
13 training, and I believe one of the crew took the time to show
14 his kids the fire truck and show them -- take them around the
15 truck, show them the equipment, so he was real happy about
16 that. Multiple letters stating about our crews and how
17 they're showing their professionalism at calls. And there was
18 an appreciation letter in the Maui News about one of our crews
19 that responded to -- actually, several of our crews that
20 responded to a structure fire in Lahaina, so that was good.

21 But I mean, that's pretty much, basically, all I
22 have for you guys this month. If you guys got any questions,
23 I'll be happy to answer.

24 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Chief Fujioka.

25 Any questions from commissioners?

1 (No response.)

2 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, thank you.

3 Let's move on to Chief Lindo.

4 ASSISTANT CHIEF LINDO: Good morning, Chair. Good
5 morning, Commissioners; always good to see you guys. My
6 report, starting off with major incident summaries, you can
7 see for fire and ocean safety, as we get into this season, we
8 see the amount of brush fires scaling down, but we did see an
9 uptick in structure fires, one being a structure fire on
10 September 3rd that Fire Chief Ventura talked about.

11 (Inaudible) and we notice we have a Kahuola Award nominee that
12 came out of that that he's gonna discuss a little bit later.
13 A brush fire on Molokai on September 20, we were able to
14 utilize our Air One helicopter with the DOFA. Absolutely
15 wonderful and doing what it's designed to do. Ocean safety
16 has been busy taking care of our community with the amount of
17 calls that they have.

18 On the second page, as far as our training bureau in
19 the fire department, we are closing up -- we began CPR
20 refreshers, and we're coming down to the end this month. We
21 also had the hazmat technician course. Recruit class
22 continues to build. We're in the meat and bones of their
23 training, you know, getting them on the absolute and the --
24 all the skills that they learn, putting it together and doing
25 the hands-on portion, yeah, so we look forward as they're

1 nearing their ending in December. Ocean safety, September 1st
2 was the first day of training for our six recruits. It's
3 going along fine. We hope to graduate them on November 18th.

4 On September 26th and 27th, ocean safety, we had the
5 initial performance tests for OS1 recruits. Out of those, we
6 had 27 people who passed, and currently, we have about 17
7 openings right now, so hopefully, we can get to that point.

8 September 30th, OS1 Kayama was on vacation, he was
9 able to go down, and you heard Chief Ventura kind of mention
10 the discussions. One being talking with the Hana residents
11 about possibly putting lifeguards in there. I was able to do
12 a report for over ten years, from 2012 to 2022, just on the
13 fire side to get an idea of how much responses we go to deal
14 with ocean rescues, and throughout that ten-year span, we got
15 roughly about 50 calls, so, you know, data drives decisions,
16 so --

17 That's pretty much all I've got. You guys got any
18 questions that I can answer?

19 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Chief Lindo.

20 Any questions from commissioners?

21 (No response.)

22 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, thank you,
23 Chief Lindo.

24 Chief Giese.

25 ASSISTANT CHIEF GIESEA: Yes. Good morning,

1 everybody.

2 CHAIR GINOZA: Good morning.

3 ASSISTANT CHIEF GIESEA: My report should be short
4 as well today. We'll start with the fire prevention bureau.
5 You can see in the highlights there, that second bullet point,
6 this is something they have in common with the other bureaus
7 in our department as well as many of our supervisors is they
8 were working on submitting their request forms. As Chief
9 Ventura mentioned, we are deep into preparations for the
10 fiscal year '24 budget. Part of that process is we ask each
11 of our bureau heads, as well as our fire captains and
12 battalion chiefs, to submit budget request forms for special
13 items that they would like us to include in the next year's
14 budget. In a lot of cases, we're actually able to accommodate
15 their requests more quickly. We may have funds remaining in
16 this year's budget. And for things that they want, and we
17 agree are important, we will be including those in priority
18 order in the fiscal year '24 budget, so we've been processing
19 those.

20 We're also working on updating our budget narrative.
21 So when we submit our budget to the mayor, there's two general
22 parts, there's the budget narrative, and then there's the
23 budget detail. So the budget narrative is where we describe
24 all of our programs, lay out specifically what they do, and
25 includes our performance measures throughout the fiscal year.

1 So we've been working on updating those descriptions, updating
2 our goals and objectives, and performance measures for the
3 budget narrative.

4 With respect to the prevention bureau, again, you
5 can see they've been very active with their training and
6 public education, doing quite a bit of fire extinguisher
7 training as well as participating in job fairs and some other
8 fire safety education as well as training their own personnel.

9 Moving on to the health and safety bureau, as Chief
10 Fujioka reported, we did have a meeting with our department
11 psychologist Dr. Rodrigues. We also had a meeting with
12 representatives from other fire departments throughout the
13 state who work on their mental wellness and peer support
14 programs. So what we've initiated, and we've just had one
15 meeting, and we got another one scheduled in November, is
16 we're initiating some sort of statewide consortium, if you
17 will, and exactly what form that will take has yet to be
18 determined, but there's a desire to just share resources,
19 share experiences, help each other out with providing better
20 mental health services to our emergency responders and other
21 personnel. So that's really encouraging, and we're getting
22 together with, you know, state fire, each of the county fire
23 departments, federal fire, all sharing experiences, resources,
24 and help to upgrade our mental health programs.

25 As was reported when Captain Patao was here, and,

1 you know, the firefighter suicide nationwide is outpacing
2 other causes of death for firefighters. It's a major issue.
3 And there are other mental health issues as well that are
4 faced by all of our emergency response employees, so we're
5 really renewing our efforts and putting more and more energy
6 into developing our programs and making sure we're doing what
7 we need to for our personnel to live happy, healthy lives well
8 into retirement.

9 We also for the -- it's not the health and safety
10 bureau specifically, but our health and safety bureau works
11 very closely with our warehouse technician. So we did
12 interview two new -- or for two new store clerk positions, and
13 we're hoping the personnel we selected will start November
14 1st. One of those positions we hope to transition back into
15 the SCBA technician that does a lot of our respiratory
16 protection compliance work, fixing SCBA components, doing fit
17 testing so we know our personnel have masks that fit them
18 appropriately. So that's exciting, and it's gonna take a lot
19 of workload away from our current personnel. That's the big
20 news for the health and safety bureau.

21 Chief Ventura already mentioned a fair amount about
22 our CIP projects. Just a few quick updates. The professional
23 facility assessments, I've mentioned that in previous reports,
24 those are getting started. So we should be getting our first
25 report shortly about Kaunakakai Fire Station, and, of course,

1 we'll share with you what we find out from that. We've been
2 getting lots of submittals coming in for various components
3 out of that project out on Lanai, as Chief Ventura mentioned,
4 in order to proceed to go out for that. We've been reviewing
5 some updated plans for the Haiku Fire Station, which is one of
6 our, you know, long, longstanding projects we're hoping to
7 keep making progress on. And I think we've already talked a
8 fair amount about the relocation of Pukoo and how we've got an
9 architectural firm selected to help with the architectural
10 design for the remodel there.

11 And the other thing I'd report is we've got some
12 vendors selected to begin painting some fire stations. So
13 that was an item for a long time, was listed as a we're
14 working on it, we're working on it, we'll let you know later,
15 and now we've got some good positive movement on that, so
16 that's -- that's good news.

17 Any questions?

18 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Chief Giese.

19 Any questions from commissioners?

20 (No response.)

21 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, thank you.

22 ASSISTANT CHIEF GIESEA: Thank you.

23 CHAIR GINOZA: Chief Ventura, did you want to speak
24 on the Kahuola Award in further detail now, or was this just
25 for our indulgence for next meeting, or how did you want to

1 proceed with that?

2 CHIEF VENTURA: Okay. I can -- I can do it now if
3 we wish. I'm prepared to do that. And basically, what we're
4 looking for here is not necessarily a vote, but this award,
5 the Kahuola Award, is a fire commission award, so I'm just
6 looking for you folks' support in saying that these were
7 significant-enough events that you guys support the Kahuola
8 Award, and then we will do what we did last time per your
9 recommendation is we'll order the plaques, we'll set up the
10 meetings, we'll get the lei, we'll go out to the best location
11 to present to the recipient.

12 So that being said, I have two steps here to
13 (inaudible). Let's look first at the Four Seasons Maui cover
14 letter, which is a fax cover letter. To give you the gist of
15 this is we know there's no lifeguard tower there. This beach
16 area sits in front of Four Seasons and the Grand Wailea, and
17 it has thousands of visitors a year. During occasional large
18 surf on the south shore, the beach attendants that work for
19 those hotels, this one being the Four Seasons, they actually
20 perform rescues, and they help tourists out of the water and
21 they -- there's numerous occasions. There was too many to --
22 too many, they said, to remember and document. They just go
23 do it, and then they get on with their day. Sometimes it
24 leads to a 911 phone call; sometimes it doesn't. But
25 basically, the director of security at the Four Seasons has

1 kind of nominated his beach team, which is the whole group of
2 them. Which if you're okay with it, we can present a Kahuola
3 Award to a group of people for their efforts there at Wailea
4 Beach in front of Grand Wailea and Four Seasons. We feel that
5 it has merit, and we would like to support it if the
6 commission feels the same way.

7 CHAIR GINOZA: Does any commissioner have any
8 comment or disagree?

9 COMMISSIONER ALCON: I read their write-up. That
10 was awesome what they did.

11 CHAIR GINOZA: Yeah, I'm in support of it as well.
12 So, I mean, unless anybody -- any commissioner has any issue
13 with that, I would suggest that we just approve and go forward
14 with that one.

15 CHIEF VENTURA: Okay.

16 VICE CHAIR VARES: I think we should do it too.

17 CHAIR GINOZA: 'Cause I don't think you need like a
18 roll call vote, just kind of a -- yeah, okay. So, yeah, why
19 don't you proceed with that one? Thank you.

20 CHIEF VENTURA: Okay, perfect. We will work on
21 that.

22 The second Kahuola Award nominee is for the
23 structure fire that happened in Hana, and, you know, it's a
24 small community out there. People who were just sitting, you
25 know, enjoying their normal day recognized the smoke and

1 jumped into action. From the time people see smoke to a fire
2 starts to the fire department responds sometimes definitely
3 feels like forever, and so people take action into their own
4 hands. On this day, Kaheola Oliveira, Daryl Kawaiaea, and
5 Derek Kawaiaea were all in the area, and they all just kind of
6 jumped into action. They basically assisted the lady out of
7 the house who was an elderly lady, and I spoke -- you know,
8 this nomination that you have here comes from the acting
9 lieutenant from Hana PD, and they had a lot of obvious
10 positive things to say. We also received input from the
11 actual fire captain who arrived on scene that day as well
12 after, you know, taking care of the fire, talking with the
13 community, said, Man, these guys did an amazing job that day
14 stepping up. The heat was intense; they were actually -- one
15 of them received burns, but they still pushed through it to
16 help this elderly lady out of the house. So to us, this is
17 a -- also a very no-brainer, and we'd like to present three
18 awards to the three gentlemen on that day if the commission
19 supports it.

20 CHAIR GINOZA: Thank you, Chief.

21 I support it. Does anybody not support or --

22 COMMISSIONERS: (Thumbs up.)

23 CHAIR GINOZA: It looks like we all are in support,
24 so why don't you go ahead and award them as well? Thank you
25 for bringing it up.

1 CHIEF VENTURA: Certainly, we'll do that.

2 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Do you guys ever see, you know,
3 people with these acts of bravery and reach out to them and
4 say, Hey, have you ever thought about trying to take the test
5 to become a firefighter?

6 CHIEF VENTURA: It's definitely an easy conversation
7 to have when we're with them, for sure.

8 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Right.

9 CHIEF VENTURA: Yeah. We'll jump on it and then go
10 meet with them, and we'll provide -- once that happens, which
11 sometimes takes a couple of months 'cause everybody's schedule
12 has to align, we'll provide you guys with pictures of the
13 presentations and such.

14 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. Thank you very much.

15 And that's it for the fire department on that agenda
16 item. Before we move on to the next agenda item, which is the
17 fire chief's annual evaluation, I'd like to see if anybody
18 from the public wishes to testify at this point on this item
19 or any other items on the commission agenda. Please, please
20 note so we can -- you can be recognized.

21 (No response.)

22 CHAIR GINOZA: All right. Seeing none, so the
23 reason why we have this agenda item as part of our agenda
24 today is because one of our tasks as the fire and public
25 safety commission is to annually review the fire chief. So

1 per the charter, we need to annually review and evaluate the
2 performance of the fire chief and submit a report to the mayor
3 and the council. So what I would ask for commissioners today
4 is you had received the evaluation forms that -- in your
5 packet, and we had asked for you to basically do a self -- an
6 evaluation of the chief yourself. And what I would propose
7 and what I would like to do is that we go over the six items
8 that we have and then an overall evaluation after that. And
9 unless commissioners would object, I would ask at the -- at
10 the end of this for -- for your permission to be able to just
11 summarize it and provide a report to the mayor and the
12 council.

13 So what I would request is that I'll read through
14 each of the six items, and we can just have a discussion on,
15 you know, how you -- how we all would like to just kind of
16 make a collective rating, and then, you know, we can provide
17 comments on, you know, some good points or even some
18 constructive criticism or, you know, some opportunities for
19 Chief Ventura to perhaps improve or -- you know, it's
20 basically provide an evaluation. So unless commissioners have
21 any objections to that -- or if they do, please, please let me
22 know right now; otherwise, that was how I intended to proceed
23 for this agenda item.

24 (No response.)

25 CHAIR GINOZA: Punahale, you have a question?

1 COMMISSIONER ALCON: I'm fine --

2 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

3 COMMISSIONER ALCON: I'm fine with it, but did you
4 guys send us any of that information ahead of time? I mean, I
5 got the form; I didn't know what to do with the form, but was
6 what you just explained ever sent to us ahead of time?

7 CHAIR GINOZA: No. So if you're not comfortable
8 kind of going over it now, I mean, we can schedule it for the
9 next meeting.

10 COMMISSIONER ALCON: No, no, I'm fine. I just
11 wanted to know if I missed something. I was like -- I got the
12 paper, but I didn't know what you wanted us to do with it.

13 CHAIR GINOZA: Yeah. It's hard -- you didn't.
14 What's hard is I cannot really communicate to people
15 without -- because of Sunshine Law. So, unfortunately, last
16 meeting, I didn't explain it. So you didn't miss anything; it
17 was just on my part I didn't give you guys kind of a
18 forewarning of what I would hope that we could do at this
19 meeting. So if a commissioner is not comfortable, then we can
20 either have a discussion and, you know, I can bring up -- I
21 can summarize and have commissioners approve or -- my
22 reference is just, you know, we discuss and, you know, kind
23 of -- and I summarize and just send it on the commission's
24 behalf with your approval.

25 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Okay.

1 CHAIR GINOZA: So why don't we just kind of go over
2 it and if -- if commissioners don't feel comfortable for me to
3 kind of just aggregate the information that we discuss and
4 send it out myself, and they want to see -- get another crack
5 at it, I can schedule it for the next meeting. So either way.

6 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Okay.

7 CHAIR GINOZA: So let me just read the first item.
8 "Reliability in achieving goals. Measures the fire chief's
9 performance in completing assignments in a timely manner,
10 ability to work effectively with little direction, keeping
11 commitments, accepting responsibility, being flexible, and
12 when requested, adjusting to varying job situations. Measures
13 the fire chief's performance in achieving program measures --
14 measurements, goals, and objectives."

15 So does anyone have a suggestion for what they feel
16 Chief Ventura exemplifies for this item?

17 VICE CHAIR VARES: Kyle.

18 CHAIR GINOZA: Lisa.

19 VICE CHAIR VARES: I have a quick question.

20 CHAIR GINOZA: Sure.

21 VICE CHAIR VARES: When was the last time we did one
22 of these, by the way? I remember doing one for Thyne.

23 CHAIR GINOZA: So we did -- the last one we did was
24 for Thyne, and then Chief Ventura came on last year and so --
25 as chief, and so we're doing one this year.

1 MR. KUNKEL: This is Dan Kunkel.

2 CHAIR GINOZA: Oh.

3 MR. KUNKEL: Deputy corporation counsel chiming in.
4 And just so you're aware, Section 8-7.2 of the Maui Charter
5 asks that the commission annually review and evaluate the
6 performance of the fire chief and submit a report to the mayor
7 and the council, so at least this asks that you do it
8 annually, anyway.

9 VICE CHAIR VARES: And is there any direction on --
10 like when we did it for Thyne, I do remember it was just the
11 commissioners in the room.

12 CHAIR GINOZA: Yeah.

13 VICE CHAIR VARES: It was a little more -- a little
14 more -- I mean, a little less public.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Yeah, okay. So that's --

16 COMMISSIONER BURNS: I can --

17 CHAIR GINOZA: Oh. Go ahead, Dwight.

18 COMMISSIONER BURNS: I believe we did one in
19 executive session for that, if I'm not mistaken.

20 CHAIR GINOZA: Yeah. So, actually, that's a good
21 point. I mean, we can decide if we wanted to -- we would like
22 to do it executive session instead, but we can't do it for
23 this meeting because we didn't notice it as perhaps an
24 executive session. The reason why I had it this way was just
25 because of all the kind of hili hewa about things just not

1 being in the open that perhaps commissioners would like to
2 just do it in the open. But I mean, either way is fine. I
3 personally agree with kind of having it more like an executive
4 session-type scenario, and so it's an excellent point. So it
5 is something that, yeah, I would be supportive of if that's
6 what this body would recommend. Is that -- is that what I'm
7 hearing?

8 VICE CHAIR VARES: I'd like to ask for that.

9 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

10 VICE CHAIR VARES: Just because I think we could
11 have a little more -- especially since our commission's
12 findings as a whole are going to be wrapped up onto one
13 report, I think I'd like us to be able to kind of talk openly,
14 and freely --

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

16 VICE CHAIR VARES: -- and discuss things in
17 executive session. And also, I'd love to have this -- we've
18 got bare quorum today; I'd like to have more -- more help and
19 more voices if possible. If not, I'm ready to go. It's
20 signed, it's filled out.

21 CHAIR GINOZA: No, that's --

22 VICE CHAIR VARES: But I'd kind of like to have it
23 in executive session.

24 CHAIR GINOZA: Sure. And sounds like people are
25 supportive of that. And you're right that because we have

1 bare quorum, it would be better to at least receive the
2 comments from the other commissioners so that when we do
3 discuss this, we have a fuller understanding of the full
4 commission.

5 So, Dan, I just want to kind of confirm with you
6 that that direction of actually having an executive session
7 for this type of action would be okay and that as long as we
8 fulfill the duty of transmitting something to the mayor and
9 the council, this methodology would be acceptable.

10 MR. KUNKEL: Yes, I agree. The authority that I
11 would be citing for this is Subsection 2 of HRS 92-5A, which
12 authorizes executive session for evaluating an officer or
13 employee. And, yeah, I think you could. And you need to do
14 the two-thirds vote, of course, to authorize it.

15 CHAIR GINOZA: Yeah, okay.

16 MR. KUNKEL: I think you can do it.

17 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, great.

18 COMMISSIONER ALCON: I have a question.

19 CHAIR GINOZA: Go ahead, Punahale.

20 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Dan, in the charter, I can't
21 remember, does it specifically state the elements of the
22 performance evaluation? For example, can we request before
23 the executive session that the goals be given to us to measure
24 him against? Because the first question refers to goals.
25 Would it be possible to have the chief do a self-eval to help

1 us in determining the final evaluation?

2 MR. KUNKEL: You've got a lot of leeway on how you
3 do it. Some -- I know some -- I think commissions have done
4 that, asked the subject of the review to do a self-evaluation
5 and then come back, and then you review that person's
6 self-evaluation with them. It's -- yeah, there's a lot of
7 leeway. I don't think the charter is very really specific on
8 how you're to do this. It just wants you to evaluate the
9 performance, and I don't -- I really don't see specifics. So
10 I think it's however you commissioners want to do it,
11 basically.

12 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Because sometimes I find when
13 we do our evaluations where I work, over the year, we kind of
14 forget everything that that person has done. So when they do
15 the self-eval, it kind of brings back to us, you know,
16 highlights of the things that they've accomplished over the
17 year, and it makes the performance evaluation on our part a
18 little bit easier instead of us trying to go back and think,
19 okay, when is one time that this person excelled at, you know,
20 communicating, when is the time that this person excelled at,
21 you know, doing A, B, C, D, and E. And it doesn't have to be
22 formal, just something simple.

23 MR. KUNKEL: Yeah. I think you have broad
24 discretion, you commissioners. I myself, I was evaluated by
25 my boss through one of those, incidentally. You know,

1 self-evaluation first, and then she went over it, but -- but
2 it's all up to you. You have very broad discretion, I think.

3 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, yeah. So what I read and what
4 Dan read is basically all of the guidance that is provided for
5 from the charter, so we as a commission could really decide
6 how we'd want to do it. So there isn't a requirement that the
7 chief has to annually give us goals and such; it's, you know,
8 whatever we had established throughout the year and whatever
9 self -- whatever measurement we'd want to give him.

10 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Okay.

11 CHAIR GINOZA: Dwight, do you have a question?

12 COMMISSIONER BURNS: Yeah, I just wanted for -- what
13 if we go back to when we did the interviews for the chiefs,
14 and then I remember Chief Ventura submitted like a resume with
15 his goals if he became the chief so we could kind of, like,
16 take that? 'Cause I'm pretty sure all of us do have that
17 material. And kind --

18 CHAIR GINOZA: Sure.

19 COMMISSIONER BURNS: -- of use it as one gauge
20 moving forward --

21 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

22 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Okay.

23 COMMISSIONER BURNS: -- of what he accomplished so
24 far.

25 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

1 COMMISSIONER BURNS: If that's okay with you guys.

2 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Yeah.

3 VICE CHAIR VARES: Kyle.

4 CHAIR GINOZA: Lisa, you have a question?

5 VICE CHAIR VARES: I kind of agree with that too.

6 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

7 VICE CHAIR VARES: I was just gonna wait. And I
8 think reading over this whole thing, we've had enough
9 interactions with Chief Ventura that I was comfortable
10 responding to all of this based on both -- everything that we
11 got during the interview process and the resume, and then just
12 also this is just what it's like interacting and seeing him,
13 you know, how -- how is he really performing these, these
14 duties. And, yeah, I don't know that I -- I mean, I would
15 love to ask for a self-evaluation, sure, but I don't think
16 it's -- I personally don't think it's necessary. I think we
17 can knock it out with the information we've got.

18 COMMISSIONER BURNS: Yeah.

19 CHAIR GINOZA: I would like him to have kind of be
20 prepared with a statement of how he feels he's doing. I mean,
21 at least that -- I don't know if our form really -- I mean, I
22 agree with you, Lisa, that our form doesn't necessarily --
23 it's not really conducive to doing a self-evaluation, but just
24 kind of maybe he can just kind of give an overview of his
25 first year on the job and what challenges he's faced and he'd

1 like to improve upon.

2 VICE CHAIR VARES: Yeah.

3 CHAIR GINOZA: That kind of -- that kind of
4 self-evaluation rather than filling out the same form.

5 VICE CHAIR VARES: There you go, something like
6 that. Like, hey, listen, so after a year of doing this, this
7 is where I think my strengths have grown.

8 CHAIR GINOZA: Yeah.

9 VICE CHAIR VARES: This is where I've realized that
10 I've got some work to do, and this is what I -- where I think
11 I am. That would be -- just a little statement would be
12 great.

13 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay.

14 VICE CHAIR VARES: That would be a nice combination
15 of both ideas.

16 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay. And so my next question is so
17 the next meeting might be somewhat lengthy because we need to
18 go over the budget as well as this. And so I'm fine with
19 having, you know, a longer meeting, but the alternative is to
20 either -- we cannot table the budget one, but whether we have
21 a special meeting for the evaluation or we have a longer
22 meeting or we just -- we have it in December. I'm flexible
23 with either option. I mean, either of the three options. But
24 I think Punahale is the one that's always time-constrained, so
25 perhaps -- I mean, you folks can weigh in on that.

1 COMMISSIONER ALCON: I can go a long meeting, or if
2 you tell me, like now, the date, I can try to block.

3 CHAIR GINOZA: So my preference would be a long
4 meeting.

5 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Okay.

6 CHAIR GINOZA: But if people are not up for that,
7 then, you know, that's -- that's fine too, we can do another
8 date.

9 VICE CHAIR VARES: I'm happy --

10 COMMISSIONER BURNS: (Inaudible) long meeting.

11 VICE CHAIR VARES: -- if we know that it's coming,
12 yeah.

13 COMMISSIONER ALCON: Yeah.

14 CHAIR GINOZA: Okay, yeah. And so what we can do is
15 some of the kind of more routine discussions that we have in a
16 typical meeting, maybe we just at the next meeting try to
17 truncate it or really consolidate it or make it more concise
18 so that we can really concentrate on budget and the
19 evaluation. So I don't foresee it like being much longer, but
20 because we typically only have one item, it will be, I
21 anticipate, a little bit longer. So why don't we do that,
22 then, if -- unless anybody opposes, that Chief Ventura be
23 prepared to give kind of a -- when we do go into executive
24 session, kind of an opening statement about where he was, he's
25 at, and some strengths and challenges and, you know, what he

1 sees going forward. And that'll kind of help establish when
2 we do the evaluation next year, kind of set that, that path.
3 So excellent points from commissioners.

4 And then we'll go through our -- our discussions in
5 executive session, or we'll do that in executive session as
6 well. So what I'll do is for the next agenda, we'll have the
7 budget and opportunity for executive session for fire chief
8 evaluation. So thank you very much, all, for your input
9 because I was kind of struggling with how we would get this
10 done when, yeah, it's somewhat of a sensitive matter as well.
11 But what it also does is it affords the public the opportunity
12 between now and the next meeting to provide us as
13 commissioners or even to testify at the next meeting for any
14 kind of -- on any kind of input and evaluation themselves. So
15 I really appreciate the planning and basically the
16 recommendations that you all have provided. So why don't we
17 do that, as we just mentioned, as we just discussed?

18 So unless anybody else has any other items for
19 today, the next meeting is November 17th, and the main focus
20 will be the budget and the evaluation. And as Chief Ventura
21 had mentioned, if commissioners are able to, within the next
22 few weeks before the next meeting, provide some input to the
23 chief on items that any of us would like to see in the --
24 contemplated in the budget, please feel free to contact the
25 chief directly, and we'll go from there and have a further

1 discussion next month on the budget and the evaluation.

2 So unless anybody has anything else, I'd like to
3 adjourn the October meeting of the fire and public safety
4 commission. It is 11:23 a.m., and the meeting is adjourned.
5 Thank you so much, everyone, for your time.

6 (The proceedings were adjourned at 11:23 a.m.)

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

