

TRANSCRIPTION

Council of the County of Maui on 2023-04-26 6:00 PM - Public Hearing

[GAVEL] >> THE PUBLIC HEARING ON THE PROPOSED REAL PROPERTY TAX RATES FOR THE COUNTY OF MAUI EFFECTIVE JULY 1ST, 2023 WILL NOW COME TO ORDER AND MS. CLERK, PLEASE PROCEED WITH ROLL CALL. >> COUNCIL MEMBER PRO TEMPORE TASHA KAMA? >> HERE. >> VICE-CHAIR OF THE COUNTY COUNCIL YUKI LEI SUGIMURA. >> GOOD EVENING. >> COUNCIL MEMBER TAMARA PALTIN.\r\n\r\n>> ALOHA, AHI AHI KAKOU. >> COUNCIL MEMBER GABE JOHNSON. >> ALOHA, CHAIR, COUNCIL MEMBERS, COMMUNITY MEMBERS, THERE'S NO TESTIFIERS AT THE LANA'I DISTRICT OFFICE. >> THANK YOU. >> COUNCIL MEMBER KEANI RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ. >> ALOHA AHI AHI KAKOU. MOLOKA'I DISTRICT OFFICE ALSO HAS NO TESTIFIERS.\r\n\r\n\r\nMAHALO. >> COUNCIL MEMBER TOM COOK. >> GOOD EVENING, PRESENT. >> COUNCIL MEMBER NOHELANI UU-HODGINS. >> ALOHA. >> COUNCIL MEMBER SHANE SINENCI. >> IS HE ON?\r\n\r\n\r\nI SEE HIM. >> ALOHA KAKOU. >> COUNCIL CHAIR ALICE LEE >> ANYONE AT YOUR DISTRICT OFFICE, MEMBER SINENCI? >> I HAVE GOT AT THE OFFICE, CHAIR - I'M NOT AT THE OFFICE, CHAIR. SO FOR NOW, NO TESTIFIERS AT THE DISTRICT OFFICE. THANK YOU. >> THANK YOU.\r\n\r\n\r\n\r\nGOOD EVENING EVERYBODY. THIS IS ALICE LEE COMING TO YOU LIVE AND DIRECT FROM OVER HERE. [LAUGHTER] >> CHAIR, THERE ARE NINE MEMBERS PRESENT, A QUORUM IS PRESENT TO CONDUCT THE BUSINESS OF THE COUNCIL. FOR THE RECORD, I'M COUNTY CLERK MOANA LUTEY AND ALSO PRESENT FROM THE OFFICE OF THE COUNTY CLERK IS DEPUTY COUNTY CLERK RICHELLE THOMSON AND LEGISLATIVE DIVISION STAFF, JOYCE MURASHIGE, LAUREN SALDANA AND DELL YOSHIDA AND JOINING MEETING THE MEETING FROM THE OFFICE OF COUNCIL SERVICES, TRACI FUJITA AND DAVID RAATZ, KRISTINA TOSHIKIYO AND THAT IS EVERYBODY. >> OKAY. WONDERFUL. THEN I HAVE THIS LONG NARRATIVE.\r\n\r\n\r\n\r\nBEFORE WE PROCEED WITH PUBLIC HEARING, MAY I PLEASE REQUEST THAT EVERYONE KEEP THEIR MICROPHONE MUTED UNLESS IT'S YOUR TIME TO SPEAK. DECORUM SHALL BE MAINTAINED AT ALL TIMES. WE'LL BE ENFORCING RULES OF DECORUM IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE COUNCIL'S RULE 6A5 AND ROBERT'S RULES CHAPTER 61. ANY PERSON WHO BEHAVES IN A MANNER THAT DISRUPTS, DISTURBS OR IMPEDES THE ORDERLY CONDUCT OF ANY COUNCIL MEETING CAN AT THE DISCRETION OF THE PRESIDING OFFICER OR A MAJORITY OF COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT BE EJECTED, OR BANNED FROM COUNCIL MEETINGS, OR IF PARTICIPATING REMOTELY, MUTED OR DROPPED FROM THE MEETING. EXAMPLES OF DISRUPTIVE BEHAVIOR INCLUDE, BUT ARE NOT LIMITED TO HECKLING, SHOUTING, USE OF PROFANITY, THREATENING OR SLANDEROUS REMARKS MADE TO ANY MEMBER OF THE COUNCIL, STAFF OR GENERAL PUBLIC. EACH TESTIFIER WILL BE ALLOWED TO SPEAK FOR UP TO THREE MINUTES. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC MAY TESTIFY IN-PERSON IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBER, OR AT COURTESY TESTIMONY SITES. INDIVIDUALS PARTICIPATING REMOTELY MAY SIGN UP TO TESTIFY IN THE MEETING CHAT.\r\n\r\n\r\n\r\nINSTRUCTIONS ARE POSTED IN THE CHAT, ALONG WITH A LINK TO THE TESTIFIER LOG. IF YOU WISH TO TESTIFY ANONYMOUSLY, YOU MAY INDICATE THAT WHEN YOU SIGN UP TO TESTIFY IN THE CHAT, OR WHEN YOU SIGN UP AT THE DESK OUTSIDE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBER. YOUR SCREEN NAME WILL MATCH THE NUMBER YOU HAVE BEEN GIVEN TO TESTIFY ANONYMOUSLY. PLEASE DO NOT CHANGE YOUR SCREEN NAME FROM THE ANONYMOUS NUMBER ASSIGNED TO YOU. AS A REMINDER, THE CHAT SHOULD BE USED ONLY TO SIGN UP FOR TESTIMONY, AND NOT FOR PUBLIC COMMENTARY ON THE MEETING. IT WILL BE CONSIDERED A BREACH OF DECORUM FOR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC TO USE THE CHAT FOR ANYTHING OTHER THAN TESTIMONY SIGN UP. MS.\r\n\r\n\r\n\r\nCLERK, PLEASE PROCEED. >> >> THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR. THE FIRST TESTIFIER IS MICHAEL WILLIAMS, FOLLOWED BY THOMAS CROLE. >> MR. WILLIAMS, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE. >> ALOHA, AND GOOD EVENING CHAIR LEE, AND COUNCIL MEMBERS. >> ALOHA.\r\n\r\n\r\n\r\n>> I AM THE IMMEDIATE PAST CHAIR OF THE COST OF GOVERNMENT COMMISSION. MY CHAIR ENDED LAST MONTH, AND WHILE I WAS CHAIR, WE DID AN EXTENSIVE INVESTIGATION AND REVIEW OF THE PROPERTY TAX POLICIES OF THE COUNTY, AND

ISSUED A REPORT IN OCTOBER OF LAST YEAR THAT I HOPE ALL OF YOU HAVE SEEN. IF YOU HAVEN'T SEEN IT, I URGE YOU TO READ IT. BUT I WANT TO SUMMARIZE THE HIGH POINTS OF IT: THE FIRST IS THAT MAUI COUNTY IS UNIQUE IN THE SENSE THAT IS THE WEALTHIEST COUNTY OR MUNICIPALITY, OR CITY, IN THE COUNTRY IF YOU MEASURE WEALTH BY TAXABLE REAL PROPERTY VALUE PER CAPITA. THE SECOND THING IS THAT IT'S NO LONGER APPROPRIATE FOR ANYBODY TO REFER TO A TYPICAL MAUI COUNTY TAXPAYER. THE CURRENT COUNTY PROPERTY TAX SYSTEM CREATES 12 CLASSIFICATIONS OF PROPERTY OWNERSHIP, AND WITHIN MANY OF THOSE CLASSIFICATIONS, IT CREATES THREE VALUE TIERS. SO THERE IS NO TYPICAL COUNTY TAXPAYER.\r\n\r\nAND AS AN EXAMPLE OF THAT I WANTED TO EMPHASIZE IF ANYONE WANTS TO SAY THAT THE COUNTY TAXPAYERS CAN'T AFFORD TO PAY MORE MONEY BECAUSE WE'RE GOING TO EXCEED A ONE BILLION DOLLAR THRESHOLD, THEY DON'T UNDERSTAND THE COUNTY TAXPAYER SYSTEM, BECAUSE THE TOP -- THE OWNERS OF THE TOP ONE-THIRD OF SECOND HOMES, WHICH WE'RE NOT SURE WHERE THAT NUMBER IS, ALTHOUGH MARCI MARTIN CAN TELL YOU. SOMEWHERE AROUND A MILLION, 3-4. THE OWNERS OF THOSE HOMES CAN EASILY AFFORD TO PAY MORE MONEY. AND YOU CAN EVEN USE THAT EXTRA -- IS THAT MY THREE MINUTES ALREADY. >> 30 SECONDS. >> WHAT? >> I'M AFRAID SO, MIKE. YOU CAN HAVE ANOTHER 30 SECONDS TO CONCLUDE.\r\n\r\nAND THEN YOU MAY HAVE QUESTIONS. >> WELL, MY POINT IS THAT THERE ARE TAXPAYERS IN THIS COUNTY THAT COULD EASILY AFFORD IF THEY DON'T LIVE HERE, THEY DON'T VOTE HERE, AND THEY'RE VERY WEALTHY. THOSE TAXPAYERS CAN AFFORD TO PROVIDE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND I BELIEVE EVEN -- EVEN CHILD-CARE EXPENSES FOR THE WORKERS OF OUR COUNTY. THE OTHER THING, THERE ARE A FEW THINGS YOU NEED TO CONSIDER AS YOU MOVE INTO THE LEGISLATIVE SESSION LATER THIS YEAR, YOU NEED TO REFORM EXTENSIVELY THE LONG-TERM RENTAL EXEMPTION, IN SEVERAL WAYS, WHICH I OUTLINED IN MY WRITTEN TESTIMONY I HAVE SUBMITTED. AND WHICH IS IN THE REPORT WE WROTE. AND YOU ALSO NEED TO ALLOW THE COUNTY ASSESSORS TO USE THE INCOME APPROACH. THIS YEAR THE HOTELS ARE CHALLENGING OVER \$2 BILLION IN VALUE OF THE ASSESSED -- WHAT THE COUNTY ASSESSOR SAID THEIR HOTELS ARE WORTH.\r\n\r\nAND IF THE COUNTY ASSESSORS HAD THE ABILITY TO ASK THOSE HOTELS FOR THEIR INCOME AND EXPENSE INFORMATION, IT WOULD BE A LOT EASIER FOR THEM TO OVERCOME THOSE CHALLENGES. >> THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MEMBERS, DO YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS FOR MR. WILLIAMS? APPARENTLY NOT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR TESTIFYING.\r\n\r\nNEXT TESTIFIER. >> CHAIR THE NEXT AND CURRENTLY LAST TESTIFIER SIGNED UP IS THOMAS CROLE. IF THERE'S ANY OTHER TESTIFIERS ON LINE OR IN THE GALLERY, PLEASE, GO AHEAD AND SIGN UP AT THE DESK DIRECTLY OUTSIDE OF THE CHAMBER. MR. CROLE. >> ALOHA, CHAIR LEE, AND COUNCIL MEMBERS. I WOULD BE REMISS IF I DIDN'T THANK YOU FOR THE HARD WORK YOU ALL PUTTING IN THE BUDGET.\r\n\r\nTHIS YEAR I HAVEN'T BEEN FOLLOWING IT CLOSELY AS I HAVE IN THE LAST 15 YEARS. BUT I KNOW THAT YOU ARE ALL GIVING IT YOUR ALL. I SAW THE FLOOD OF DOCUMENTS THAT YOU ARE GOING THROUGH. SO KEEP UP THE GOOD WORK. TONIGHT I AM TESTIFYING ON MY OWN BEHALF IN MY OWN BEHALF, AND ONLY FOR ME. WELL, I SUPPOSE ALSO FOR THE 160 OTHER BED & BREAKFAST OPERATORS LIKE MYSELF, WHO LIVE IN OUR HOMES, FULL-TIME, WE'RE REQUIRED TO. WHO ARE ALLOWED TO USE A ROOM OR WOULD IN OUR HOMES TO WELCOME BED & BREAKFAST FOLKS AND FIND OURSELVES IN THE COMMERCIALIZED RESIDENTIAL TAX CLASSIFICATION.\r\n\r\nTHAT IS A SMALL CLASS. THERE'S 176 PROPERTIES IN THAT CLASS. AND I THINK 160 OF THEM ARE FOLKS LIKE ME, WHO HAVE A BED & BREAKFAST HOME. AS THE COUNCIL KNOWS, TWO YEARS AGO, YOU ENACTED A 3% TAT. SO 3% OF THE REVENUES THAT MY BED & BREAKFAST COME STRAIGHT TO THE COUNTY AND YOU HAVE BECOME A PARTNER IN MY BUSINESS IN THAT 3%. WHEN THE CLASSIFICATION WAS FIRST COME UP WITH, THE COMMERCIALIZED RESIDENTIAL FOR THE B&B GUYS, IT WAS KIND OF THE COUNTY SAYING WELL, WE SHOULD DESERVE SOME OF THE INCOME FROM THAT. NOW YOU ARE GETTING IT A DIFFERENT WAY, AND I WOULD ARGUE THAT WE SHOULD GO BACK INTO THE HOMEOWNER CLASS, AND THE COUNTY SHOULD BE GETTING THEIR EXTRA

REVENUE THROUGH THAT 3%. THAT IS NOT GOING TO HAPPEN. IT'S WHAT IT IS RIGHT NOW.\r\n\r\nBUT RIGHT NOW, THERE'S PENALTY THAT I HAVE TO PAY PERSONALLY OF AROUND \$3500 MORE THAN WHAT I WOULD HAVE TO PAY IF I WAS A HOMEOWNER. IF I DIDN'T HAVE A PERMIT, AND I WAS A HOMEOWNER, MY TAXES WOULD BE \$3500 LESS. AND THIS YEAR, MY TAXES ARE GOING TO GO UP BY 15%, BECAUSE THAT IS HOW MUCH THE VALUE OF MY PROPERTY GOES UP. SO I'M GOING TO ASK THE COUNCIL FOR SOME CONSIDERATION HERE. YOU ARE PROPOSING OR THE MAYOR IS PROPOSING -- I DON'T KNOW IF THE COUNCIL IS GOING TO GO ALONG WITH IT, A REDUCTION IN THE HOMEOWNER TAX RATES. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE A REDUCTION IN THE RATE THAT APPLIES TO THE COMMERCIALIZED RESIDENTIAL. RIGHT NOW IT'S SET AT \$4.40. THAT WAS THE RATE LAST YEAR.\r\n\r\nTHE RANGE THAT YOU JUST PUBLISHED WAS \$4 AND UP, AND I THINK THAT MEANS YOU CAN'T SET IT AT LESS THAN \$4. IF THAT IS THE CASE, I WOULD ASK YOU TO SET IT AT \$4. IF THAT IS NOT THE CASE AND I WOULD ASK FOR IT TO BE SOMETHING LIKE \$3. BECAUSE AGAIN, I WANT TO MAKE THE POINT THAT WE'RE HOMEOWNERS. WE LIVE IN OUR HOMES FULL-TIME. THAT IS THE PRIMARY USE OF OUR PROPERTIES. YET, WE DON'T GET AN EXEMPTION AS OTHER HOMEOWNERS DO. WE DON'T GET THE ADVANTAGE OF THE LOWER HOMEOWNER TAX RATE, AND YOU'RE SHARING IN OUR BUSINESS AS BUSINESS PARTNERS GETTING 3% OF EVERYTHING THAT WE GET. SO THE COUNTY IS GETTING ENOUGH OUT OF THE B&B GUYS. GIVE US A LITTLE BREAK THERE.\r\n\r\nTHAT IS ALL I'M ASKING FOR. THAT IS ALL I HAVE TO SAY. THANK YOU, CHAIR. >> THANK YOU, TOM. ANY QUESTIONS, MEMBERS? MEMBER TOM COOK. >> THANK YOU, TOM.\r\n\r\nYOU SAID THERE'S 160 IN YOUR B&B CATEGORY, BUT THERE'S 176 TOTAL IN COMMERCIALIZED RESIDENTIAL. >> LET ME EXPLAIN THAT. THERE WAS SOME EXTRA FOLKS THAT WERE THROWN INTO THAT CATEGORY A NUMBER OF YEARS BACK TO TRY TO GIVE SOME TAX RELIEF TO A FEW INDIVIDUAL PROPERTIES. THAT TAX RELIEF HAS KIND OF BEEN GIVEN TO THE FEW ADDITIONAL PROPERTIES THAT THEY WANTED TO, BUT A FEW EXTRA PEOPLE ENDED UP GETTING INTO THE CATEGORY BECAUSE OF THE HELP THAT THEY WERE TRYING TO DO FOR THESE OTHER FOLKS. LAST YEAR, THE COUNCIL TOOK ACTION TO MOVE THOSE OTHER FOLKS OUT OF THE COMMERCIALIZED RESIDENTIAL TAX CATEGORY. AND I WAS -- I WAS DISAPPOINTED WHEN I SAW THAT THEY WEREN'T THERE, BUT WHEN I WENT BACK AND LOOKED AT IT, THEY MADE THE EFFECTIVE DATE OF THE ORDINANCE JANUARY 1ST, AND YOUR CATEGORIZATION HAPPENS ON JANUARY 1ST, OR ON DECEMBER 31ST. SO THOSE GUYS WERE STILL LEFT IN THERE.\r\n\r\nSO YES, THERE ARE A FEW FOLKS, I DON'T KNOW THE EXACT NUMBER, BUT THERE'S A FEW FOLKS THAT THE COUNCIL INTENDED TO REMOVE FROM THAT CATEGORY, YET, I SEE PALTIN TELLING ME IT'S 3. THAT ARE STILL IN IT. EVERYBODY ELSE THAT IS IN THAT CATEGORY IS A HOMEOWNER. THE OTHER FOLKS WILL BE REMOVED NEXT YEAR, BECAUSE AGAIN OF THAT DATING OF THAT PARTICULAR CHANGE IN THE ORDINANCE. BUT YEAH, THERE'S A FEW FOLKS THAT ARE IN OUR CATEGORY THAT DON'T BELONG THERE. THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION. MEMBER COOK YOU HAVE A FOLLOW-UP QUESTION. >> I HAVE A FOLLOW-UP QUESTION, PLEASE.\r\n\r\nSO MR. CROLE. IS THERE A B&B ASSOCIATION OR SOMETHING? AND I'M JUST CURIOUS, LIKE, BED & BREAKFASTS ARE IT'S OWN LITTLE NICHE, YOU LIVE IN THE HOME. IT'S A WHOLE MORE MANAGEABLE DEAL THAN THE TRANSIENT VACATION RENTALS THAT ARE SORT OF UNMANAGED, AND MORE DETRIMENTAL. I'M CURIOUS THE 160 BED & BREAKFASTS, ARE THERE ANY -- ARE THEY BEING MANAGED? ANY COMPLAINTS ABOUT YOUR GROUP?\r\n\r\n>> THERE'S NOT AN ASSOCIATION DIRECTLY OF THE BED & BREAKFAST GUYS. BUT ALL OF US HAVE PERMITS THAT GET RENEWED EITHER AFTER THREE YEARS OR FIVE YEARS. I JUST WENT THROUGH MY RENEWAL THIS YEAR AND THEY INSPECT IF YOU HAVE ALL OF THE SAFETY EQUIPMENT ON-BOARD? ARE YOU OPERATING WITHIN THE CONDITIONS OF YOUR PERMIT? ARE THERE ANY NEIGHBOR COMPLAINTS THAT CAME ABOUT? THAT IS HOW THEY MANAGE KEEPING THOSE IN CONTROL IS THAT THE PLANNING DEPARTMENT HAS US RENEW OUR PERMITS AND WHEN THEY DO, THEY CHARGE US ANOTHER FEE TO PAY TO THE COUNTY WHEN WE RENEW OUR PERMITS AND CHECK TO MAKE SURE THAT YOU ARE OPERATING IN FULL COMPLIANCE. THE MAUI VACATION RENTAL

ASSOCIATION IS AN ASSOCIATION THAT A LOT OF BED & BREAKFAST OPERATORS EITHER WERE OR MEMBERS ARE, BUT THAT DOESN'T NECESSARILY COVER EVEN, BECAUSE THAT IS AN INDEPENDENT ASSOCIATION THAT PEOPLE CAN JOIN OR NOT JOIN AS THEY MAY WISH.\r\n\r\n>> DID I SEE ANOTHER HAND? MEMBER PALTIN. >> THANK YOU, MR. CROLE. I WAS JUST INQUIRING THE TAT, OR YOU PASS IT ON? >> WE PASS IT ON, BUT I MEAN, YOU'RE EATING IN THAT THERE'S A MAXIMUM AMOUNT THAT SOMEONE IS GOING TO PAY; RIGHT? AND RIGHT NOW, IF I WANT TO CHARGE \$200 FOR A ROOM, BY THE TIME THEY PAY ALL OF THE TAXES AND SO FORTH, THAT ROOM IS \$250; RIGHT?\r\n\r\nSO MY REVENUE IS REDUCED TO SOME DEGREE BUT WHAT THE PUBLIC IS WILLING TO PAY AT THE MAXIMUM. >> SO YOU'RE SEEING A DECREASED OCCUPANCY PRIOR TO THE TAT ENACTMENT, COVID NOTWITHSTANDING? >> NO, HERE IS WHAT I WILL SAY, DURING THE YEAR OF COVID, WHEN I GOT NO TAX RELIEF AT ALL I HAD ZERO -- ZERO PERCENT OCCUPANCY AND I'M NOT COMPLAINING IN ANY WAY, SHAPE OR FORM OF THE OCCUPANCY. >> IF WE DISCOUNT THE COVID YEAR, IF WE GO TO PRIOR YEARS, WHEN YOU HAD OCCUPANCY NOT COUNTING THE COVID YEARS, WHEN THERE WAS NO TAT ON BED & BREAKFASTS? >> RIGHT. >> AND NOW THAT THERE IS TAT, ARE YOU SEEING A DIFFERENCE IN YOUR OCCUPANCY? >> NO, I WOULDN'T SAY -- I WOULDN'T WE ABLE TO SAY THAT MY OCCUPANCY DURING 2022 LAST YEAR VERSUS MY OCCUPANCY OF 2019, THEY WERE PRETTY CLOSE TO THE SAME.\r\n\r\nI WOULDN'T SAY THERE WAS A BIG KNOCKOFF, BUT THE QUESTION WOULD BE I COULD HAVE CHARGED MORE; RIGHT? PROBABLY RELATIVE TO THE COMPETITION I COULD HAVE CHARGED MORE, IF I DIDN'T HAVE TO PAY THE 3%. THAT'S ALL. >> BUT ALL OF THE COMPETITION HAS THE 3%. SO IT'S NOT -- >> EXCEPT FOR THOSE THAT ARE ILLEGAL AND THOSE THAT DON'T DECLARE THEIR INCOME AND SOME OF THOSE FOLKS ARE MY COMPETITION IN MY END OF THE BUSINESS, TO BE HONEST. >> DO YOU REPORT THEM? >> YOU KNOW, IT'S NOT MY ROLE, IT'S NOT MY PLACE TO BE TURNING PEOPLE IN, NOT THAT I NECESSARILY KNOW THEM. WHEN I GO THROUGH AIRBNB, I SEE IF THEY HAVE A PERMIT NUMBER LISTED? NO, I GUESS THEY ARE NOT LEGAL.\r\n\r\nI DON'T KNOW. >> THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR SHARING. I APPRECIATE IT. >> ANYONE ELSE WITH QUESTIONS? MEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ? >> MAHALO, CHAIR. ALOHA, MR.\r\n\r\nCROLE, MAHALO FOR YOUR TESTIMONY. >> ALOHA. >> I JUST WANTED TO QUICKLY CLARIFY, YOUR RESPONSE TO MEMBER PALTIN. I KNOW THE COUNTY HEARS A LOT ABOUT ALL OF THESE UNPERMITTED, ILLEGAL SHORT-TERM RENTALS, B&BS, BUT IF THE COMMUNITY DOESN'T HELP IN REPORTING, I DON'T KNOW HOW THEY EXPECT THE COUNTY TO KNOW IF WE'RE NOT A PARTNER IN THAT WAY. >> OKAY. WELL, WE'RE GOING OFF-TRACK HERE, BUT I HELP THE COUNTY IN SELECTING A VENDOR THAT HELPS THEM FIND -- >> RIGHT. >> ONLINE.\r\n\r\n>> IF THE OTHER SOFTWARE DOESN'T, AND COMMUNITY MEMBERS KNOW OF ILLEGAL UNPERMITTED RENTALS, WE WOULD HOPE THAT THEY WOULD LET US KNOW, THE COUNTY. >> I DON'T NECESSARILY KNOW WHERE THEY ARE. HERE IS WHAT I CAN SAY, I FIND AN AD ONLINE AND VRBO, AND IF HE HAS A PERMIT NUMBER AND DOING EVERYTHING RIGHT AND THE TMK NUMBER IS THERE AND I CAN LOOK UP THE TAXES AND SO FORTH. IF THEY ARE NOT DOING SOMETHING RIGHT AND THERE IS NO PERMIT NUMBER AND NO TMK NUMBER AND I HAVE NO ONE TO TURN IN PER SE, OTHER THAN MAYBE TO SAY TO THE COUNTY, THERE'S AN AD HERE THAT IS NON-COMPLIANT. YOU DO HAVE A COMPANY THAT YOU HAVE HIRED TO DO THAT FOR THE COUNTY. >> MAHALO, MR. CROLE, MAHALO, CHAIR.\r\n\r\n>> ALOHA. >> ANYONE ELSE? IF NOT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. >> CHAIR? >> MR. SINENCI HAS A QUESTION. >> THANK YOU, CHAIR.\r\n\r\nREALLY QUICKLY FOR CLARIFICATION, ALOHA, MR. CROLE. >> ALOHA. >> YOU MENTIONED A DECREASE FOR BED & BREAKFAST OWNERS. DOES THAT INCLUDE THE 'OHANAS THAT BED & BREAKFAST MIGHT OWN, OR JUST THE MAIN DWELLING THAT THE OWNERS LIVE IN? >> SO THE BED & BREAKFAST ORDINANCE ORIGINALLY ALLOWED PEOPLE TO RENT OUT EITHER ROOMS IN THEIR HOME, OR AN ADDITIONAL DWELLING ON THE PROPERTY. SINCE THEN, IT'S BEEN CHANGED, AND I THINK YOU KNOW THAT NO LONGER CAN SOMEONE GET A PERMIT TO RENT OUT AN 'OHANA DWELLING ON THEIR PROPERTY.\r\n\r\nTHAT IS NO LONGER PART OF THE BED & BREAKFAST ORDINANCE. NOW THERE

ARE SOME FOLKS, AND I'M INCLUDED IN THAT, WHO GOT PERMITS, YOU KNOW, YEARS AGO, AND WE STILL ARE ALLOWED TO CONTINUE THAT USE. BUT THERE ARE NO NEW ONES THAT CAN GET PERMITS FOR RENTING OUT AN 'OHANA DWELLING AS A B&B OR AS A SHORT-TERM RENTAL. >> THANK YOU. THANK YOU, CHAIR. >> ANYONE ELSE? IF NOT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH MR.\r\n\r\nCROLE. >> ALOHA. >> ALOHA. >> CHAIR, AT THIS TIME, THERE'S NO ONE TO TESTIFY. SO WE'LL GIVE LAST CALL FOR TESTIMONY. ANYONE WISHING TO TESTIFY, PLEASE UNMUTE, IF YOU ARE ONLINE, OR LET STAFF KNOW. AGAIN, LAST CALL, AND COUNT DOWN, 3, 2, 1. CHAIR, THERE IS NO ONE TO TESTIFY.\r\n\r\n>> OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THIS IS UNUSUAL, BUT NICE SEEING ALL OF YOU. IT'S BEEN A WHILE, AT LEAST AN HOUR. AND WE'LL SEE YOU TOMORROW WITH CHAIR SUGIMURA, AT 9:00 SAME PLACE, SAME STATION AND FOR TONIGHT, THIS PUBLIC HEARING IS OVER AND THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [GAVEL]